

No. MCI-5(3)/2016-Med.Misc./

MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA
NEW DELHI

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting of the Executive Committee held on 23rd August, 2016 at 11:00 a.m. in the Council Office at Sector 8, Pocket 14, Dwarka, New Delhi.

Present:

Dr. Jayshree Mehta	President Medical Council of India, Former Professor of Surgery, Govt. Medical College, Vadodara, Gujarat.
Dr. C.V. Bhirmanandham	Vice-President, Medical Council of India, Former Vice-Chancellor of Dr. M.G.R. Health University, Tamil Nadu
Dr. Anil Mahajan	Professor & HOD, General Medicine, Government Medical College, Jammu, J&K.
Dr. Baldev Singh Aulakh	Professor of Urology and Transplant Surgery, Head Transplant Unit, Dayanand Medical College, Ludhiana
Dr. G.B. Gupta	Vice-Chancellor, Ayush & Health Sciences University, Raipur, Chhattisgarh
Dr. K K Gupta	Principal, LLRM Medical College Campus, Garh Road, Meerut (UP)
Dr. Radha Madhab Tripathy	Professor and Head, Department of Community Medicine, MKCG Medical College, Berhampur.
Dr. Vijay Prakash Singh	Professor & Head, Department Of Gastroenterology, Patna Medical College, Patna, Bihar

Dr. Reena Nayyar, Secretary I/c.

1. Minutes of the Executive Committee Meeting held on 30th June, 2016 – Confirmation of.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that the minutes of the Executive Committee meeting held on 30th June, 2016 have been sent to Oversight Committee and comments/observations are awaited.

2. Minutes of the last meeting of the Executive Committee – Action taken thereon.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that in respect of item nos. 4,5,6,7,8,9,10,33,34,35,36,39,40,46,47,48,49,50 & 51 of the minutes of the Executive Committee meeting dated 15.06.2016 action has been taken in

accordance with the Oversight Committee communication dated 04.07.2016. Action on rest of the items of minutes dated 15.06.2016 as well as 30.06.2016 could not be taken since the comments/observations of the Oversight Committee are yet to be received.

3. Pending Items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the pending items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive Committee.

4. Minutes of the Academic Committee meeting held on 30th June, 2016.

Read: the matter with regard to Minutes of the Academic Committee meeting held on 30th June, 2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the minutes of the Academic Committee meeting held on 30th June, 2016 and observed as under:-

4. Agenda items of the March 4th, 2016 Academic Committee meeting referred back by Executive Committee to Academic Committee

Item 4: Course curriculum for renal Ultra sonography in Nephrology practice from Dr. RK Sharma, SGPGIMS

Approved.

Item 5a. Consideration of Minutes of the Implementation & Monitoring Committee meeting held on 26th November, 2015.

Approved.

Item 5 b. Minutes of the meeting of the expanded Expert Group to finalize preparation of Teacher Eligibility Qualifications (TEQ) and Minimum Standard Requirements (MSR) for MD in Laboratory Medicine, held on 9th February, 2016.

The members of the Executive Committee observed that perusal of the recommendations on Minimum Standard Requirement & Teachers' Eligibility reveals as under:

- (1) It is mentioned that it is mandatory to have department of Laboratory Medicine. However it is not clear that whether this would be a requirement only if the institute wishes to start M.D. (Laboratory medicine) course or not; otherwise if it is included in MSR Regulations, which are primarily for UG course, it would become mandatory even for those colleges which are only UG colleges or who do not wish to start M.D. (Laboratory Medicine) course.
- (2) It is mentioned that there should be minimum 300 bedded teaching hospital. It is not clear whether this course is intended to be permitted after the institute is recognized for MBBS degree (when the requirement of beds would be as prescribed for annual intake) or while the institute is still in the stage of permission like other pre & paraclinical subjects. This needs to be clarified & modified accordingly.
- (3) Minimum daily sample load is prescribed at 1000. It needs to be clarified whether this would be total number of samples for examinations or total number of individual samples.

- (4) Several equipment have been shown as “Desirable Equipment”. It should be clearly mentioned that whether they are Essential or not. There cannot be any category as “Desirable” as such a nomenclature leads to confusion & it cannot be enforced.
- (5) Similarly it is mentioned that it should desirably be accredited by a recognized accrediting agency. It should be clearly mentioned whether it is essential or not.
- (6) In the requirement of faculty, there is no mention of Tutors. This number has to be specified.
- (7) So far as TEQ recommendations are concerned, it was observed that this is a new specialty and therefore the qualification of M.D.(Pathology/Microbiology/Biochemistry) be made alternative qualification along with M.D. (Laboratory Medicine).

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to refer back the item with above observations to the Academic Committee.

Item 5c. Minutes of the meeting of the Standing Group to finalize the names of eligible participants to receive Fellowship in Medical Education (FIME), held on 17th February, 2016.

Approved.

Item 8. E-mail Letter from Dr. Nisar Chowdri, Member, Expert panel for M.Ch in Colorectal Surgery.

Approved.

Item 18. E-mail from Dr. OPS Kande requesting for criteria for promotion of medical teachers.

The Executive Committee noted that as the matter is still pending before Academic Committee, no decision can be taken at present and directed the Office to resubmit the item after appropriate decision is taken by Academic Committee.

Item 28. Office Note from PG Section regarding Grievances made by the interns and Post Graduate students for work pattern-Order of Hon'ble High Court of Madras-Clarification.

Approved.

Item 33. E-mail from Dr. Jitender Mohan Khunger regarding eligibility for clinical practice pursuing DM course in Haemato-pathology from AIIMS.

Approved.

Item 5: Guidelines, MSR & TEQ in (a) DM Virology (resubmitted), (b) MCh Gynecological Oncology (resubmitted) and (c) DM in Paediatric Hepatology (new).

Approved.

Item 6: Minutes of the meeting of the Expert Group to examine the need for ban of animal Experimentation in PG courses held on June 1, 2016.

Approved.

Further office was directed to circulate the letter of CPCSEA along with MCI notification dt. 18/03/2014 to all institutes emphasizing that animal house is not mandatory for the institutes running UG course only.

Item 7: Note from PG Section: Forwarding of statement of case for inclusion of DM courses in Aerospace Medicine in the schedule annexed to PG medical Education Regulations, 2000.

Approved.

Item 8: Letter from Dr. M. K. Aggarwal, Deputy Commissioner (UIP) – concept note on inclusion of concepts of vaccine safety, adverse events following immunization (AEFI) surveillance and casualty assessment in the MBBS curriculum and postgraduate curriculum: report of the Reconciliation Board

The Executive Committee of the Council referred back the item and resubmit the same with the Annexure 10.

Item 9: Request from Vice-Chancellor, KGMU, Lucknow for approval of course of MCh in Paediatric Orthopaedics.

The Executive Committee decided to place the matter before PG Committee of the Council.

Item 10. E-mail Query regarding Publication in Medical Education topics and journals from Dr. Patil Shrish, Associate Professor of Anatomy, BMC&H, Chitradurga, Karnataka.

Approved.

Item 11. Any other item with permission from Chair.

Sitting fee for members of Expert Groups, and Reconciliation Board constituted by the Academic Cell of the Council

The Executive Committee decided that the matter be placed before Finance Committee.

5. Permission to conduct FIME Programme in the MCI Nodal Centres.

Read: the matter with regard to permission to conduct FIME Programme in the MCI Nodal Centres.

After due deliberations, it was decided by the Executive Committee that in view of the decision of the General Body there cannot be any further FIME Programme and no permission can be granted for the same. Further, 3rd FIME Programme should be discontinued forthwith. Office is also directed to resubmit the item again after incorporating information as shown above.

6. Minutes of the Sub-committee meeting to examine Teacher Eligibility Qualifications (TEQs) in Super specialty and Broad Specialty courses held on 15th March, 2016.

Read: the matter with regard to minutes of the Sub-committee meeting to examine Teacher Eligibility Qualifications (TEQs) in Super specialty and Broad Specialty courses held on 15th March, 2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the minutes of the Sub-committee meeting to examine Teacher Eligibility Qualifications (TEQs) in Super specialty and Broad Specialty courses held on 15th March, 2016 and observed as under:-

(a) Allergy & Clinical Immunology:

The Executive Committee did not approve Allergy & Clinical Immunology and proposed that the academic qualification would be only Diploma while PG degree is required for faculty posts in all other subjects.

(b) Clinical Immunology & Rheumatology:

The Executive Committee approved Clinical Immunology & Rheumatology with modification that DM Clinical Immunology / DM Rheumatology be listed as essential qualifications throughout and not only in transition period.

(c) Critical Care Medicine:

The Executive Committee approved TEQ of Critical Care Medicine

(d) Virology:

The Executive Committee approved TEQ of Virology.

(e) Infectious Diseases:

The Executive Committee approved Infectious Diseases with modification that MD General Medicine / Tropical Medicine/ Paediatrics/ Pulmonary Medicine / Tuberculosis and Chest diseases would be eligible qualifications throughout & not only during transitional period. Further as infectious diseases already form a part of syllabus for these qualifications, no further training of 2 years is necessary.

(f) Neuro Radiology:

The Executive Committee approved TEQ of Neuro Radiology.

(g) Paediatric Neurology:

Approved with modification that (MD Pediatrics with D.M (Neurology) would be eligible qualification throughout & not only in transitional period.

(h) Paediatric Oncology:

The Executive Committee approved TEQ of Paediatric Oncology with modification that (MD Pediatrics with D.M (Medical Oncology) would be eligible qualification throughout & not only in transitional period.

(i) Gynaecological Oncology:

The Executive Committee approved TEQ of Gynaecological Oncology.

(j) Hepato Biliary Surgery:

The Executive Committee approved TEQ of Hepato Biliary Surgery.

(k) Reproductive Medicine:

The Executive Committee approved TEQ of Reproductive Medicine.

(l) Laboratory Medicine:

The Executive Committee approved Laboratory Medicine with modification that MD in Pathology/ Microbiology/ Biochemistry would

be eligible qualification throughout and not only in transitional period. As Laboratory training is already a part of syllabus of these qualifications, no further training is necessary.

(m) Marine Medicine:

The Executive Committee approved Marine Medicine with modification that 2 years training may be at any medical establishment under Navy and further if he has acquired Diploma in Marine Medicine along with M.D. (Medicine) / M.D. (Anaesthesiology) / M.S. (General Surgery), no further training of 2 years is necessary.

(n) Palliative Medicine:

The Executive Committee approved TEQ of Palliative Medicine.

(o) Traumatology & Surgery:

The Executive Committee approved TEQ of Traumatology & Surgery.

Further, it was decided that the following concerns of the Executive Committee be placed before Academic Committee for consideration:-

(a) The Executive Committee of the Council was of the opinion that for starting a new course/ department, the TEQ should be finalized with a roadmap on how the Institute should start the department as the course is yet to start and not existing in the country as on date and therefore where should the two year special training be undertaken (required for eligibility as a faculty member) and who would be construed as Senior Residents in the department.

(b) For starting newer super specialities greater insight on the entire perspective i.e. desirability, feasibility of the subject should be considered. Proper opportunity be provided to institute once started.

(c) Also for every State where new course/department is to be started (although the course may be existing in other colleges of the country) – 02 Govt. colleges may be given exemption regarding the transitory period for TEQ eligibility so that super speciality courses can be started.

7. Item 65: - referred back by Executive Committee meeting held on 27th November, 2015:- Letter from Sh. Amit Biswas.

Read: the matter with regard to Item 65, referred back by Executive Committee meeting held on 27th November, 2015:- Letter from Sh. Amit Biswas.

The Executive Committee observed that in the Agenda Note submitted along with this item, still, nothing is said about how to implement the task or how to formulate the plan of action for creating AIMAS. The Executive Committee therefore referred back the matter to Academic Committee with above observation.

8. Item 18 of the Minutes of the Academic Committee meeting held on 04th March, 2016: E-mail from Dr. OPS Kande requesting for criteria for promotion of medical teachers - referred back by Executive Committee meeting held on 28th April, 2016.

Read: the matter with regard to Item 18 of the Minutes of the Academic Committee meeting held on 04th March, 2016: E-mail from Dr. OPS Kande requesting for criteria for promotion of medical teachers - referred back by Executive Committee meeting held on 28th April, 2016.

After due deliberations, it was decided to approve the opinion of the Chairman, Academic Committee with the modification that the answer to Q. 2 should be revised as under:

Should a faculty member be re-examined for all the credentials for his promotion during subsequent inspections, if any faculty member is confirmed on the post of Associate Professor/ Professor by MCI during one inspection?

Ans: If the promotion is on the basis of publications which are not to be considered as eligible, such promotion cannot be accepted and considered even if such an incumbent was accepted in earlier MCI assessments. It is reiterated that all the subsequent communications are merely clarificatory in nature and the guidelines are in existence since 2010.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to communicate the same to Dr. O.P.S. Kande.

9. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Pramukhswami Medical College, Karamsad.

Read: the matter with regard to compliance verification assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Pramukhswami Medical College, Karamsad.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (14.07.2016) along with previous assessment reports (05.04.2016 & 7th & 8th December, 2015) and decided to revoke notice issued under clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 and amended on 18.03.2016.

10. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Rama Medical College, Hospital & Research, Kanpur.

Read: the matter with regard to compliance verification assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Rama Medical College, Hospital & Research, Kanpur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (20.07.2016) along with previous assessment report (30.03.2016, 22.01.2016, 21.08.2015, 7th May, 2015 & 19th & 20th September, 2014) and decided to revoke notice issued under clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 and amended on 18.03.2016.

11. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 150 MBBS seats at Deccan College of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada.

Read: the matter with regard to compliance verification assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 150 MBBS seats at Deccan College of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (15.07.2016) along with previous assessment report (31.03.2016 & 21st and 22nd January, 2016) and decided to revoke notice

issued under clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 and amended on 18.03.2016.

12. Recognition/approval of NRS Medical College, Kolkata for the award of MBBS degree granted by The West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of NRS Medical College, Kolkata for the award of MBBS degree granted by The West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (19.07.2016) along with previous assessment reports (27.04.2016, 10.03.2016 & 11.03.2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 14.1 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 11.7 % as detailed in the report.
3. Deficiency of inadequate teaching areas in OPDs remains as such.
4. Audiometry & Speech Therapy are still not available in ENT OPD.
5. Wards: Demonstration Room is not available in Skin & VD and Orthopaedics. Capacity of several Demonstration Rooms is < 30. Two corners in General Surgery were shown as Demonstration Rooms which is not adequate. Many Demonstration rooms are ill equipped, dirty & used for some other purpose.
6. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
7. Central Library: Air-conditioning work is not complete. Capacity of 2 Reading Rooms is < 200 each.
8. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve NRS Medical College, Kolkata for the award of MBBS degree granted by The West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

13. Approval of the minutes of the Registration & Equivalence Committee meeting held on 30th June, 2016.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the minutes of the Registration & Equivalence Committee meeting held on 30th June, 2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the minutes of the Registration & Equivalence Committee meeting held on 30th June, 2016 and observed as under:-

2. **Grant of Registration of Additional Qualification i.e. Membership of the College of Emergency Medicine (MCEM) in respect of Dr. Nagaraja D. M. u/s 26(1) of the IMC Act, 1956. (F.No. 16-100941).**

Approved.

3. **Grant of Registration of Additional Qualification i.e. Membership of the College of Emergency Medicine (MCEM) in respect of Dr. Kiran P.V u/s 26(1) of the IMC Act, 1956.(F.No. 16-100909).**

Approved.

4. **Grant of Registration for Additional Qualification i.e. Diplomate American Board of Internal Medicine in respect of Dr. Palla**

Chandra Mouli u/s 26(1) of the IMC Act, 1956. (F.No. 16-100848).(Agenda item no. 7)

Approved.

5. **Grant of Registration of Additional Qualification i.e. Fellowship of Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of Glasgow in respect of Dr. Parthiban Sabapathy u/s 26(1) of the IMC Act, 1956. (F.No. 16-100972) (Agenda item no. 8)**

Approved.

6. **Grant of Registration of Additional Qualifications i.e. (i) Degree of Podiatric Medicine awarded by Midwestern University & (ii) Residency Training Programme in Podiatric Medicine & Surgery 24 awarded by New York Medical College in respect of Dr. Manjula Janardhan u/s 26(1) of the IMC Act, 1956. (Agenda item no. 9)**

Approved.

7. **Grant of registration of Additional Qualification i.e. Membership of Royal College of Physicians of Ireland u/s 26 of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 (Agenda item no. 10)**

Approved.

8. **Grant of registration of Additional Qualification i.e. Fellowship of Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland in respect of Dr. Vijayshil Gautam u/s 26 of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956.**

The Executive Committee noted that while recording the decision, REC has not recommended whether Registration has to be granted or not. This be rectified and the matter be resubmitted.

14. **Recognition/Approval of Annapoorna Medical College & Hospital, Salem, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.**

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Annapoorna Medical College & Hospital, Salem, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report(29th July, 2016) along with previous assessment report(30th & 31st March, 2016) and the representation dated 29/07/2016 from the Dean, Annapoorna Medical College & Hospital, Tamilnadu and noted the following:-

1. Shortage of Residents is 5.88 % as detailed in the report.
2. Bed Occupancy on day of assessment was 43.7 %.
3. There was not a single patient in Ophthalmology on day of assessment & it was locked.
4. There were no proper counters for Registration. The facility is run on temporary basis on tables & chairs located at different points across a big hall.
5. Many patients admitted in Casualty did not merit admission.
6. There was NIL Normal Delivery & only 1 Caesarean Section on day of assessment.

7. There was NIL patient in NICU/PICU & only 1 in ICCU on day of assessment. Some of the patients did not merit admission in ICUs.
8. Data of operative work seems to be inflated as although 20 operations are claimed to have been performed on day of assessment, there was request for only 1 unit of blood.
9. None of the faculty & Residents could produce Form 16 for Assessment Year 2016-2017 even though last date of submission of Income Tax Returns (i.e. 31/07/2016) with just one day away.
10. Appointment orders issued to faculty & employees does not mention salary in them.
11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Annapoorna Medical College & Hospital, Salem, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

15. Recognition/Approval of Malda Medical College & Hospital, Malda for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata, West Bengal u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Malda Medical College & Hospital, Malda for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata, West Bengal u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (19th July, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (4th May, 2016 and 14th & 15th March, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 36.79 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 20.89 % as detailed in the report.
3. Radiodiagnosis department: Deficiency of 1 static machine remains as such.
4. Central Library: Available books are 5,184 against requirement of 7,000. Air-conditioning is partial. Available Journals are only 80 against requirement of 100.
5. Wards: Space between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. Beds are old & damaged without proper mattresses, pillows & bed sheets. On some beds there are 2 patients which is not as per norms. Paediatrics & O.G. wards are congested without proper ventilation. Facilities are inadequate in certain wards.
6. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Malda Medical College & Hospital, Malda for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata, West Bengal u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

16. Recognition/Approval of Rama Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Hapur, Ghaziabad, Uttar Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerut, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Rama Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Hapur, Ghaziabad, Uttar Pradesh for the

award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerut, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (20th July, 2016) along with previous assessment reports (19th April, 2016 and 18th & 19th March, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Rama Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Hapur, Ghaziabad, Uttar Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerut, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16th April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) ...

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

17. Recognition/Approval of Mahamaya Rajkiya Allopathic Medical College, Ambedkarnagar for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. R.M.L. Avadh University, Faizabad u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Mahamaya Rajkiya Allopathic Medical College, Ambedkarnagar for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. R.M.L. Avadh University, Faizabad u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (19th July, 2016) along with previous assessment report (11th & 12th April, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Mahamaya Rajkiya Allopathic Medical College, Ambedkarnagar for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. R.M.L. Avadh University, Faizabad u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16th April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) ...

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-

clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.”

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

18. Recognition/Approval of College of Medicine & Sagore Dutta Hospital, Kolkata, West Bengal for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 – Compliance Verification Assessment.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of College of Medicine & Sagore Dutta Hospital, Kolkata, West Bengal for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (20th July, 2016) along with previous assessment report (10th & 11th March, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of College of Medicine & Sagore Dutta Hospital, Kolkata, West Bengal for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16th April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) ...

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for ‘Renewal’ of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.”

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

19. Recognition/Approval of Major S.D. Singh Medical College and Hospital, Fatehgarh Farrukhabad for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Major S.D. Singh Medical College and Hospital, Fatehgarh Farrukhabad for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (19th July, 2016) along with previous assessment report (6th & 7th April, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 72.4 % as detailed in report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 88.05 % as detailed in the report.

3. Both Dean Dr. Suresh Prasad & Medical Superintendent Dr. C.S. Agarwal were not available on day of assessment.
4. OPD attendance on day of assessment was 318 against requirement of 800.
5. Hospital is practically non-functional since 11/07/2016.
6. Bed Occupancy was only 5 % on day of assessment. All the wards were deserted look. There were no patients in many wards.
7. Occupancy in Intensive Care Units was NIL on day of assessment.
8. There was NIL Major & NIL Minor operation on day of assessment. Last operation was done on 11/07/2016.
9. There was NIL Normal Delivery & Nil Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
10. CT Scan was not functional on day of assessment.
11. Workload of Special Investigations like Ba, IVP was NIL on day of assessment.
12. Radiological investigation workload is grossly inadequate.
13. Laboratory investigation workload is NIL on day of assessment.
14. Histopathology & Cytopathology workload was NIL on day of assessment. No record was available regarding samples under process in Histopathology laboratory.
15. Available USG machines are 2 against requirement of 3.
16. OPD: Colposcope is not available.
17. Casualty: There was NIL patient in Casualty.
18. Central Library: It is not fully air-conditioned.
19. Canteen facilities are inadequate.
20. Anatomy department: Available specimens are only 56. Capacity of cold storage bodies is not adequate.
21. Pathology department: Available specimens are only 63.
22. Microbiology department: All service laboratories are non-functional.
23. RHTC: It is partially functional. There is no clinical, Survey, Immunization, family Welfare & National Health Programmes. No record is available.
24. There was no display of name of Dean outside his office.
25. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Major S.D. Singh Medical College and Hospital, Fatehgarh Farrukhabad for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

20. Regarding completion of internship at Govt. Doon Medical College, Dehradun.

Read: the matter with regard to completion of internship at Govt. Doon Medical College, Dehradun.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that Doon Hospital has been recognized for Internship training since long time. Further LOP for establishment of new medical college to which this hospital is affiliated as teaching hospital has been granted by the Central Govt.

In view of above, the Committee decided to permit the institute to continue Internship of 13 Interns who have already been admitted. It was also decided that it may be permitted to allow Interns training to continue till such time as the students admitted at Govt. Medical College, Dehradun to which this

hospital is affiliated pass III M.B;B.S. Part II examination and enter phase of Internship training.

21. Approval of the minutes of the Monitoring Sub-Committee meeting held on 30.06.2016.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the minutes of the Monitoring Sub-Committee meeting held on 30.06.2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the minutes of the Monitoring Sub-Committee meeting held on 30.06.2016 and observed as under:-

1. Admission of 1st year MBBS student at K.D. Medical College Hospital & Research Center, Mathura for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.

Approved. Further, it was directed that copy of discharge notice be issued. Copy of the discharge notice be also sent to Health Secretary, DME, University to which the institute is affiliated, State Medical Council & Nominee of Govt. of U.P. on MCI.

2. Sharing of information about the irregularities discovered in the case of M/s Sinhgad Technical Education Society (STES) – Regarding.

After due deliberations, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to obtain legal opinion on (i) issuance of discharge notice (ii) on which batch of students to be applied and (iii) whether MCI can issue discharge notice straightaway merely on basis of information received from I.T. department or fresh notice with an opportunity to explain has to be given.

3. Admission to MBBS at Maharishi Markandeshwar Medical College & Hospital, Kumarhati, Solan (HP) – regarding.

The Executive Committee noted that the Item has been deferred by Sub-Committee.

4. Admission of MBBS Student at Koppal Institute Medical Sciences (KIMS), Koppal for Academic year 2015-16 – regarding.

Approved.

5. Admission of MBBS Student at MVJ Medical College & Research Hospital, Bangalore for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.

Approved.

6. Admission of MBBS Student at Vijayanagar Institute of Medical Sciences, Bellary for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.

Approved.

7. Admission of MBBS Student at Shimoga Institute of Medical Sciences, Shimoga for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.

Approved.

8. Admission of MBBS Student at Employees State Insurance Corporation Medical College, Bangalore for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.

Approved.

9. Admission of MBBS Student at Raichur Institute of Medical Sciences, Raichur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.

Approved.

10. **Admission of MBBS Student at Gulbarga Institute of Medical Sciences, Gulbarga for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

11. **Fraud admissions by Sapthagiri Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore – regarding.**

The Executive Committee observed that the copy of the judgement of Hon'ble High Court is not attached. It is also not clear whether any appeal has been filed or not and if filed, its present status is not shown.

In view of above, the Committee decided to refer back the matter with above observations and to resubmit the item after rectification.

12. **Admission of MBBS Student at Shridevi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Hospital, Tumkur, Karnataka for Academic year 2015-16 – regarding.**

Approved.

13. **Admission of MBBS Student at Father Mullers Institute of Medical Education and Research, Mangalore for Academic year 2015-16 – regarding.**

Approved.

14. **Admission of MBBS Student K V G Medical College, Sulia for Academic year 2015-16 - Regarding – regarding.**

Approved.

15. **Admission of MBBS Student Sapthagiri Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

16. **Admission of MBBS Student Kempegowda Institute of Medical Sciences, Bangalore for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

17. **Admission of MBBS Student Al-Ameen Medical College & Hospital, Bijapur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

18. **Admission of MBBS Student Yenepoya Medical College, Mangalore for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

19. **Admission of MBBS Student A J Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Mangalore for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

20. **Admission of MBBS Student SDM Medical College, Dharwad for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

21. **Admission of MBBS Student Subbiah Institute of Medical Sciences, Shimoga for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

22. **Admission of MBBS Student at Chengalpattu Medical College, Chengalpattu for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

23. **Admission of MBBS Student at Government Sivagangai Medical College, Sivagangai for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

24. **Admission of MBBS Student at Hassan Institute of Medical Sciences, Hassan for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

25. **Admission of MBBS Student at Madras Medical College, Madras for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

26. **Admission of MBBS Student Coimbatore Medical College, Coimbatore for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

27. **Admission of MBBS Student Velammal Medical College Hospital & Research Institute, Madurai for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

28. **Admission of MBBS Student Dhanalakshmi Srinivasan Medical College & Hospital Perambalur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

29. **Admission of MBBS Student Theni Government Medical College, Theni for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

30. **Admission of MBBS Student SreeMookambika Institute of Medical Sciences, Kanyakumar for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

31. **Admission of MBBS Student Tagore Medical College & Hospital, Chennai for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved. Further, copy of the abovementioned letter be also sent to Health Secretary, DME, University to which the institute is affiliated & Nominee of Govt. of Tamil Nadu on MCI..

32. **Admission of MBBS Student IRT Perundurai Medical College, Perndurai for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

33. **Admission of MBBS Student Government Medical College, Omandurar for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

34. **Admission of MBBS Student at Mount Zion Medical College, Chayalode, EzhamkulamAdoor, Pathanamthitta, Kerala for the Academic Year 2014-15 – regarding.**

Approved.

35. **Admission of MBBS Student at Azeezia Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Kollam for Academic year 2015-16 – regarding.**

The Committee noted that the Item deferred by Monitoring Sub-Committee for next meeting.

36. **Admission of MBBS Student at Dr. Somervel Memorial CSI Hospital & Medical College, Karakonam, Thiruvananthapuram for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved. Further, it was decided that copy of the abovementioned letter be also sent to Health Secretary, DME, University to which the institute is affiliated & Nominee of Govt. of Kerala on MCI.

37. **Admission of MBBS Student at Travancore Medical College, Kollam for Academic year 2015-16 - Regarding**

Monitoring Sub-Committee has directed that the Principal, Travancore Medical College, Kollam should provide a copy of the Order declaring it as a minority institution.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations of the Monitoring Sub-Committee and directed that the matter be resubmitted after above information is received and appropriate decision is taken by Monitoring Sub-Committee.

38. **Admission of MBBS Student at Amala Institute of Medical Sciences, Thrissur for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved. It was further decided that copy of the abovementioned letter be also sent to Health Secretary, DME, University to which the institute is affiliated & Nominee of Govt. of Kerala on MCI.

39. **Admission of MBBS Student at SreeGokulam Medical College Trust & Research Foundation, Trivandrum for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

The Executive Committee of the Council referred back the item with above observation and directed to resubmit with present status..

40. **Admission of MBBS Student at M E S Medical College, PerinthalmannaMalappuram Dist. Kerala for Academic year 2015-16 - Regarding**

Approved.

41. **Admission of MBBS Student at Institute of Postgraduate Medical Education & Research, Kolkata for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

42. **Admission of MBBS Student at Medical College, Kolkata for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

Approved.

43. **Admission of MBBS Student at Employees State Insurance Corporation Medical College, Joka, Kolkata for Academic year 2015-16 – Regarding.**

After due deliberations, the Executive Committee of the Council approved the recommendations of the Monitoring Sub-Committee and directed that discharge notice Shri Menuin Al Qudire. Copy of the discharge notice be also sent to Health Secretary, DME, University to which the institute is affiliated, State Medical Council & Nominee of Govt. of West Bengal on MCI.

22. Approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meetings held on 7-8.06.2016, 23-24.06.2016 & 30.06.2016.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meetings held on 7-8.06.2016, 23-24.06.2016 & 30.06.2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meetings held on 7-8.06.2016, 23-24.06.2016 & 30.06.2016 and observed as under:-

1.	Appeal dated NIL filed by Sh. Gulab Singh against order dated 11.09.2015 passed by Delhi Medical Council & against several doctors of hospitals.	7 th & 8 th June, 2016
----	--	--

Approved.

2.	Appeal dated 08.04.2016 filed by Dr. Vishal Gajbhiye against order dated 30.07.2015 passed by Delhi Medical Council	7 th & 8 th June, 2016
----	---	--

Approved.

3.	Appeal dated 26.04.2016 filed by Smt. Tandra Das against Dr. Shyamal Sarkar @ Shyamal Ch. Sarkar of Dr. BRAM Teaching Hospital, Papania	7 th & 8 th June, 2016
----	---	--

Approved.

4.	Fake documents provided by various Medical Teachers at the time of assessment at NRI Institute of Medical Sciences, Vishakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh	23 rd & 24 th June, 2016
----	--	--

Matter pertains to submission of common telephone bill enclosed as proof of residence by 6 faculty members as detected during assessment on 16-17 December 2014. Regarding telephone bill common line of defence taken by these 6 faculty is that "There was catastrophic cyclone in our place in October 2014 which devastated the whole area and from then onward our telephone no. 0891281106 became erratic".

Ethics Committee has observed that the institute has purchased & installed 100 lines from BSNL which was badly damaged 2 months prior to MCI assessment. But telephone bills have been manipulated into individual names and addresses by college authorities. It has further observed that fake telephone bill provided as proof of residence was infact put along with D.F. by college authorities & not by faculty.

Accordingly Ethics Committee has recommended as under:

- (a) No action be taken against 6 faculty;
- (b) Name of Principal Dr. K.S.N. Rao be removed for 1 year.

After due deliberations, the Executive Committee of the Council approved the decision of Ethics Committee in respect of Principal Dr. K.S.N. Rao. With regard to 6 faculty members, it was observed that they are responsible for any document which is submitted as a proof alongwith their Declaration Forms and

the claim that it has been put in by the college administration and not by the faculty cannot be accepted and considered. Further, the faculty knew very well what is the proof of residence being submitted with D.F. as the list of documents attached with D.F. is signed by the faculty in the D.F.

The Executive Committee further decided to refer back the matter to Ethics Committee in respect of 6 faculty with above observation to take appropriate decision.

5.	<i>News published in Times of India dated 30.11.2014 regarding "medical college submitting fake form – 16 and residence proof.</i>	<i>23rd & 24th June, 2016</i>
----	--	---

Approved.

6.	<i>Submission of fake experience certificate by Dr. Praful Kumar Arya and Dr. Muktanjali Arya</i>	<i>23rd & 24th June, 2016</i>
----	---	---

After due deliberations, the Executive Committee of the Council approved the proceedings of the Ethics Committee with the modification that the punishment of Dr. P.K. Arya be also same as that award to others – i.e. his name be removed from IMR for 3 years & debarred from any teaching or administrative post.

7.	<i>Appeal dated 21.02.2015 filed by Mrs. HashbanKhatun against Order dated 08.09.2014 passed by Odisha Council of Medical Registration</i>	<i>23rd & 24th June, 2016</i>
----	--	---

Approved. It was further decided that, the communication be sent to all State Medical councils concerned, DMEs concerned & State Health Secretary.

8.	<i>Appeal dated 05.06.2015 filed by Sh. Vijender Kumar Pandey against Order dated 07.05.2015 passed by Uttar Pradesh Medical Council.</i>	<i>23rd & 24th June, 2016</i>
----	---	---

Approved.

9.	<i>Appeal dated 16.06.2015 filed by Sh. Sanjeev Kumar against Dr. R.P. Singh, Pancham Hospital, Ludhiana</i>	<i>23rd & 24th June, 2016</i>
----	--	---

Approved.

10.	<i>Appeal dated 20.07.2015 filed by Dr. BabuLalSethi against Order dated 23.06.2015 passed by Rajasthan Medical Council</i>	<i>23rd & 24th June, 2016</i>
-----	---	---

Approved.

11.	<i>Appeal dated 06.07.2015 filed by Sh. Mahender Kumar Sharma against Order dated 19.06.2015 passed by Rajasthan Medical Council</i>	<i>23rd & 24th June, 2016</i>
-----	--	---

Approved.

12.	<i>Appeal dated 24.05.2016 filed by Sh. Utpal Mukherjee against order dated 06.01.2016 passed by West Bengal Pradesh Medical Council</i>	<i>23rd & 24th June, 2016</i>
-----	--	---

Approved.

13.	<i>Complaint dated 22.08.2014 filed by Sh. Navin Kumar Malhotra against Dr. Monika Thapar, New Medical Centre, Moti Nagar</i>	30 th June, 2016
-----	---	-----------------------------

Approved.

14.	<i>Appeal dated 27.04.2015 filed by Sh. TarunKanti Sarkar against Dr. Mrityunjoy Pal of Medinipur Medical College and Hospital, Kolkata</i>	30 th June, 2016
-----	---	-----------------------------

Approved.

15.	<i>Appeal filed by Dr. Anant Sharma against order dated 30.07.2015 passed by Delhi Medical Council</i>	30 th June, 2016
-----	--	-----------------------------

Approved.

16.	<i>Appeal filed by Dr. V. Jagadeesh against order dated 30.07.2015 passed by Delhi Medical Council</i>	30 th June, 2016
-----	--	-----------------------------

Approved.

17.	<i>Appeal filed by Dr. Arvind Kumar Pandey against order dated 30.07.2015 passed by Delhi Medical Council</i>	30 th June, 2016
-----	---	-----------------------------

Approved.

18.	<i>Complaint dated 18.06.2015 filed by Sh. PradipNitwane, Nagpur against Dr. Ribha Chawla</i>	30 th June, 2016
-----	---	-----------------------------

Approved.

19.	<i>Appeal filed by Sh. Ram Singh Panwar against order dated 30.07.2015 passed by Delhi Medical Council</i>	30 th June, 2016
-----	--	-----------------------------

Approved.

20.	<i>Appeal dated 24.09.2015 filed by Sh. JitenderTandon against doctors of LalaHarbhagwanDass Memorial &Prem Hospital, Panipat</i>	30 th June, 2016
-----	---	-----------------------------

Approved.

21.	<i>Appeal filed by Smt. Deep Shikha Sharma against order dated NIL passed by Uttarakhand Medical Council</i>	30 th June, 2016
-----	--	-----------------------------

The Executive Committee observed that noting is not clear. In the Agenda Note it is written that the complaint filed in MCI was referred to Delhi Medical Council vide letter dt. 29/08/2014. In the next paragraph, reference is made to order of Uttarakhand Medical Council without specifying how the complaint got transferred to UMC. Again in the next paragraph, reference is made to order of Delhi Medical Council.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council referred back the proceedings of the Ethics Committee to rectify the minutes and resubmit the same.

22.	<i>Appeal filed by Ms. KarunaGoel against order dated 11.09.2015 passed by Delhi Medical Council .</i>	<i>30th June, 2016</i>
-----	--	-----------------------------------

Approved.

23.	<i>Appeal filed by Sh. Tarun Mukherjee against Dr. Soumitra Chandra & his team of Woodland Multispecialty Hospital, Kolkata</i>	<i>30th June, 2016</i>
-----	---	-----------------------------------

Approved.

24.	<i>Appeal dated 11.1.2013 filed by Mr. Mohd. Jeeshan, Amroha, UP against Order dated 28.10.2013 passed by Uttar Pradesh Medical Council</i>	<i>30th June, 2016</i>
-----	---	-----------------------------------

Approved with the modification that the period of removal of name from IMR would be 01 year as originally decided by Ethics Committee on earlier two occasions.

23. Approval for the engagement of various personnel by Supreme Court mandated Oversight Committee.

Read: the matter with regard to approval for the engagement of various personnel by Supreme Court mandated Oversight Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Secretary of Oversight Committee vide its various letters has conveyed the approval of the Supreme Court mandated Oversight Committee regarding engagement of various personnel, as per details given:-

Sl. No.	Date of letter of OC	Name & Designation	Remuneration (inRs.)	Date of Engagement	Tenure
1.	05/07/2016	Dr. R.N. Salhan, Technical Consultant	1,25,000/- per month	16/06/2016	6 months
2.	05/07/2016	Ms. Shalini Solanki, Research Associate	50,000/- per month	01/07/2016	6 months
3.	05/07/2016	Sh. Raj Kumar Choudhary, P.S. to Members	15,000/- per month	23/05/2016	6 months
4.	12/07/2016	Dr. Rakesh Aggarwal, Part-time Expert	5,000/- per day	16/07/2016	1 month
5.	02/08/2016	Dr. Y.K. Gupta, Part-time Expert	5,000/- per day	02/08/2016	2 months
6.	02/08/2016	Ms. Manie Ahuja, Research Associate	50,000/- per month	02/08/2016	3 months

The Secretary, Oversight Committee has further conveyed that the remuneration decided by the Oversight Committee to the above personnel may be paid by MCI.

In this regard, the Committee observed that payment of various personnel recruited by MCI on similar posts is as under:

#	Post	Remuneration
1	Chief Consultant	Rs.60,000/- p.m.
2	Consultants	Rs.60,000/- p.m.

It was further observed that experts, coordinators, etc. when invited by MCI for any work are paid remuneration of Rs. 5,000/ day. Members of MCI are paid remuneration of Rs. 3,000/ day for attending any meeting or for any work of MCI.

In view of above, it was decided to approve the payment of various personnel engaged by Oversight Committee be paid as under:

Sl.No.	Name & Designation	Remuneration(inRs.)	Date of Engagement	Tenure
1.	Dr. R.N. Salhan, Technical Consultant	Rs.1,25,000 per month	16/06/2016	6 months
2.	Ms. Shalini Solanki, Research Associate	Rs.50,000/- per month	01/07/2016	6 months
3.	Sh. Raj Kumar Choudhary, P.S. to Members	Rs. 15,000/- per month	23/05/2016	6 months
4.	Dr. Rakesh Aggarwal, Part-time Expert	Rs. 5,000/- per day	16/07/2016	1 month
5.	Dr. Y.K. Gupta, Part-time Expert	Rs. 5,000/- per day	02/08/2016	2 months
6.	Ms. Manie Ahuja, Research Associate	Rs. 50,000/- per month	02/08/2016	3 months

In view of above, the Executive Committee decided to also enhance the pay of MCI Consultants working in the Council Office from existing Rs. 60,000/- to Rs. 90,000/- per month.

The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.

24. Minutes of the meeting of Departmental Promotion Committee held on 05/08/2016 for considering promotion to the post of Stenographer Grade – II.

Read: the matter with regard to minutes of the meeting of Departmental Promotion Committee held on 05/08/2016 for considering promotion to the post of Stenographer Grade – II.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Departmental Promotion Committee meeting held on 05.08.2016 recommending that Mrs. Manju Rani and Mrs. Swati Oberoi be promoted to the post of Stenographer Grade – II in accordance with the Recruitment Rules of the Council.

The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.

25. Consideration of Compliance Verification Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Bharat University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sri Lakshmi Narayana Institute of Medical Sciences, Puducherry.

Read: the matter with regard to Consideration of Compliance Verification Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Bharat University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sri Lakshmi Narayana Institute of Medical Sciences, Puducherry.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (25.07.2016) along with previous assessment report (9th & 10th May, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 40 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 66 % as detailed in the report.
3. Bed Occupancy on day of assessment is 14 % (i.e. 96 genuine patients out of 680 beds).
4. OPD attendance on day of assessment was 377 which is grossly inadequate.
5. There is no admission in NICU since 15/05/2016 – i.e. more than 2 months. Occupancy in ICCU and also in PICU/NICU was NIL on day of assessment. Although Ventilator was available, there was NIL patient on Ventilator.
6. Only 5 patients have died in the whole hospital in 2016 indicating very low turnout of serious & difficult patients.
7. There are only 15 deliveries in 2016 till date – i.e. 2-3/month which is grossly inadequate. Last Normal Delivery was on 18/07/2016 (i.e. before 1 week) & last Caesarean Section was on 14/07/2016 (i.e. before 10 days).
8. Laboratory Investigations data provided by the institute do not corroborate with available clinical material.
9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to recommend continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Bharat University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sri Lakshmi Narayana Institute of Medical Sciences, Puducherry and further decided that the institute be asked to submit the compliance after rectification of the above deficiencies within one month.

The Committee further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 and amended on 18.03.2016, which reads as under:-

8(3)(1).....

- (c) Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.”

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year

(2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956, alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

26. Continuance of Recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinayaka Mission's University, Salem in respect of students being trained at Aarupadai Veedu Medical College and Hospital, Puducherry.

Read: the matter with regard to Continuance of Recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinayaka Mission's University, Salem in respect of students being trained at Aarupadai Veedu Medical College and Hospital, Puducherry.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (25th July, 2016) alongwith previous compliance verification assessment reports 27th April, 2016 and decided to revoke notice issued under clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), dated 16th April, 2010.

In view of the above decision of revoking the Clause 8(3)(1)(c), the Executive Committee of the Council decided that the continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinayaka Mission's University, Salem in respect of students being trained at Aarupadai Veedu Medical College and Hospital, Puducherry be continued restricting the number of admissions to 100 (One hundred) students per year and the same be placed before the General Body of the Council.

27. Consideration of Periodical Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada in respect of students being trained at Mamata Medical College, Khammam, Telangana.

Read: the matter with regard to Consideration of Periodical Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada in respect of students being trained at Mamata Medical College, Khammam, Telangana.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (21st & 22nd July, 2016) along with complaint dated 18.05.2016 received from Shri Mandadapu Sudhakar, Khammam, Telangana and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada in respect of students being trained at Mamata Medical College, Khammam, Telangana be continued restricting the number of admission to 150 (One Hundred Fifty) students.

28. Consideration of Periodical Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Saurashtra University in respect of students being trained at Pt. Deen Dayal Upadhyay Medical College, Rajkot.

Read: the matter with regard to Consideration of Periodical Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Saurashtra University in respect of students being trained at Pt. Deen Dayal Upadhyay Medical College, Rajkot.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (21st & 22nd July, 2016) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Saurashtra University in respect of students being trained at Pt. Deen Dayal Upadhyay Medical College, Rajkot be continued restricting the number of admission to 100 (One Hundred) students.

29. Pre-PG Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at School of Medical Sciences, Greater Noida under Sharda University for the academic year 2017-18.

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at School of Medical Sciences, Greater Noida under Sharda University for the academic year 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (19th & 20th July, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Students' Hostels: There are no separate hostels for medical students/interns/Residents. In the same hostel, Medical & Dental students (of MDS & BDS) are accommodated. Random checking revealed that the following Dental students/Interns are allotted rooms in hostels meant for Medical students: (P. 31)
 - (a) In Girls' hostel, in room # 320, Ms. S. Fathima & Ms. Reshma, both BDS students;
 - (b) In Girls' hostel, in room # 408, Ms. Divya;
 - (c) In Girls' hostel, in room # 810, Dr. Nandani (Intern);
 - (d) In Boys' hostel, in room # 903, Dr. R. Calvin & Dr. T. Singh (MDS students);
 - (e) In Boys' hostel, in room # 710 & 602, Rohit Korkam & Rahul Narula (BDS students).
2. There is no proper waiting room in both the hostels.
3. There are no separate Residential Quarters for Non-teaching staff.
4. OPD: Registered patients in OPD did not tally with OPD attendance in individual OPDs. E.g. Orthopaedics registration was 86 patients but OPD attendance was only 40 & 05 patients in waiting area making total of 45. In DVD, registration was 60 patients but OPD attendance was only 42 with NIL patient in waiting area. This was common for almost all the OPDs.
5. Histopathology workload was only 03 on day of assessment.
6. Casualty: There were only 04 patients in Casualty on day of assessment at 12:00 p.m.
7. Occupancy in ICCU was only 01 on day of assessment.
8. Anatomy department: Tutors' room is not available.
9. Pathology department: Tutors' room is inadequate.
10. Community Medicine department: Tutors' room is not available.
11. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned.
12. RHTC: Cold Chain Equipment is not available. It is registered by CMO as Nursing Home / Hospital & not as RHTC as such. Number of deliveries is only 1-2/month. Interns did not have any log book. Paramedical staff like Health Educator are not available.
13. UHC: Cold chain equipment is not available. It is running in a leased house, located in market area and not easily approachable. Paramedical staff are not as per MCI norms.
14. There is no signature board of School of Medicine & Research in the University campus.
15. Canteen: Staff canteen is under construction. Students' canteen is not available.
16. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to grant 01(One) month time to the institute to submit the compliance on rectification of deficiencies to the Council

30. Consideration of Compliance Verification Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sree Mookambika Instt. of Medical Sciences, Kanyakumari, Tamil Nadu.

Read: the matter with regard to Consideration of Compliance Verification Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sree Mookambika Instt. of Medical Sciences, Kanyakumari, Tamil Nadu.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (21.07.2016) along with previous assessment report (9th & 10th May, 2016) and decided to revoke notice issued under clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), dated 16th April, 2010.

In view of the above decision of revoking the Clause 8(3)(1)(c), the Executive Committee of the Council decided that the continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sree Mookambika Instt. of Medical Sciences, Kanyakumari, Tamil Nadu be continued restricting the number of admissions to 100 (One hundred) students per year and the same be placed before the General Body of the Council.

31. A.C.S Medical College and Hospital, Chennai under the ambit of Dr. M.G.R Educational and Research Institute, (Deemed to be University) Chennai – Renewal of permission for admission of 150 MBBS students for the academic year 2017-2018.

Read: the matter with regard to A.C.S Medical College and Hospital, Chennai under the ambit of Dr. M.G.R Educational and Research Institute, (Deemed to be University) Chennai – Renewal of permission for admission of 150 MBBS students for the academic year 2017-2018.

The Executive Committee observed that on the recommendation of the MCI, the MH & FW, Government of India had issued notification No. U.12012/670/2015-M.E-I dated 16.05.2016 granting for renewal of permission for admission of Fresh Batch of 150 M.B.B.S students for the academic year 2016-2017 at A.C.S. Medical College and Hospital under Dr. M.G.R. Educational and Research Institute, (Deemed to be University), Chennai, Tamilnadu. Further, the permission was valid for one year and for admitting only one batch of 150 students during the academic session 2016-2017. The next batch of 150 students in M.B.B.S. course will be admitted in the college only after permission of Central Government for renewal/recognition.

Accordingly, the Council vide its letter dated 18.07.2016 requested the Dean/Principal, A.C.S Medical College & Hospital, Chennai to submit the C.D./D.V.D. with regard to standard inspection forms and declaration forms etc. for assessment for renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of 150 MBBS students at ACS Medical College & Hospital, Chennai for the Academic Session 2017-18.

In reply, the institute vide letter dt. 21/07/2016 has represented as under:

".... Under the above circumstances, we humbly request the Medical Council of India,

- a) To recommend to MH & FW to remove the term "2009-10 ONLY" mentioned in the recognition order dated 01.04.2016.
- b) To recommend to the MH & FW to recognize the institution A.CS Medical College and Hospital continuously from the year 2008-09 and beyond and remove the term "Fresh Batch" in their order dated 16.05.2016.
- c) Exempt us from applying for "renewal of permission for 2nd batch" as mentioned in your letter dated 18.07.2016, in as much as our college has to be treated as a recognized college for the above mentioned reasons.
- d) The instructions issued in the MCI letter 3rd cited may be revised accordingly."

It was also observed that in this connection, opinion from Ld. ASG was obtained earlier; the operative part of the opinion dt. 25/02/2016 reads as under:

".....22. It is in this background that the querist has sought my opinion regarding the status of the students of the medical college who were admitted in academic year 2009-10. As far as the students admitted in academic session 2009-10 are concerned, their rights have been protected by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in its judgement dated 11.02.2015 in para 45.3, wherein it has been categorically held that on qualifying in the final examination conducted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, the students may be allowed to begin their internship program and on successful completion of the same, they be awarded their MBBS degrees subject to the final decision in the case of Viplav Sharma. Therefore, I am of the view that the students who were admitted in the academic session 2009-10, after successfully qualifying the final examination conducted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences and who have now completed their internship, be granted registration by the appropriate State Medical Council where after an appropriate entry in this regard be made in the Indian Medical Register.

23. In respect of the second issue regarding the status of the medical college, I am of the view that since no permission was granted to the applicant medical college during the academic sessions 2010-11, 2011-12, 2012-13, 2013-14, 2014-15 & 2015-16, **it would be appropriate if the querist found that the medical college has now been able to fulfil the minimum infrastructural requirements as per the regulations of the querist, applicant medical college can be considered for grant of permission for admitting fresh batch of students for the academic year 2016-17 where after the medical College shall be eligible to be considered for recognition at the time of the final MBBS examination of the batch of 2016-17."**

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to obtain further opinion of Ld. ASG in the matter on the specific issues raised by the institute in its letter dt. 21/07/2016 mentioned above.

32. Issuance of Eligibility Certificate to the Indian Nationals/Overseas citizen of India who desirous to take admission in MBBS or equivalent course in a medical university/institution outside India.

Read: the matter with regard to issuance of Eligibility Certificate to the Indian Nationals/Overseas citizen of India who desirous to take admission in MBBS or equivalent course in a medical university/institution outside India.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Eligibility Section is receiving numerous calls, representations, RTI applications etc. from the applicants/parents seeking the stand of the Medical Council of India with regard to the issuance of Eligibility Certificate/acceptance of application forms for Eligibility Certificate in respect of students who have already taken admission in MBBS or equivalent medical course in various medical

universities/institutions outside the country from May, 2013 till the Academic year 2015-16.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to approve the opinion of Law Officer for re-starting the issuance of Eligibility Certificate and act accordingly.

33. To consider grant of the permission to Atal Bihari Vajpayee Hindi Vishwavidyalaya, Bhopal to provide the medical education in Hindi as a medium of instruction.

Read: the matter with regard to grant of the permission to Atal Bihari Vajpayee Hindi Vishwavidyalaya, Bhopal to provide the medical education in Hindi as a medium of instruction.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Vice Chancellor of Atal Bihari Vajpayee Hindi Vishwavidyalaya in his letter requesting for permission to provide medical education in Hindi as a medium of instruction has also stated *inter alia* as under:

"It is to be mentioned here specifically that the Gross Enrolment Ratio (GER) in the field of Higher Education is approximately 19 to 20 percent. In the field of medical education, it is even lesser. One reason of less gross enrolment ratio is conducting all the courses through English medium. Today, there are many students in rural and urban areas who possess talent of medical but due to hindrance of language, they cannot come in medical field."

It was also observed that no valid statistics have been provided as to how such a conclusion has been arrived at.

In view of above, the Committee decided that Vice Chancellor of Atal Bihari Vajpayee Hindi Vishwavidyalaya be requested to provide the basis and detailed statistics for arriving at such a conclusion. It was further decided that he may also be requested to provide a list of the medical books, journals and other reading material translated/written in Hindi.

34. Compliance Verification assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at Late Shri Baliram Kashyap Memorial NDMC Govt. Medical College, Jagdalpur under Ayush & Health University, Raipur for 50 MBBS Seats.

Read: the matter with regard to compliance verification assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at Late Shri Baliram Kashyap Memorial NDMC Govt. Medical College, Jagdalpur under Ayush & Health University, Raipur for 50 MBBS Seats.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (14th July, 2016) along with the previous assessment report (11th & 12th April, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 10.71 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 24.07 % as detailed in the report.
3. Wards: Distance between 2 beds is still < 1.5 m required as per Regulations.
4. There are only 05 Major operations on day of assessment.
5. Casualty: Central O₂ and Central Suction are not available.
6. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 2 Static & 3 Mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5 & 4 respectively.

7. CT Scan is outsourced.
8. Lecture Theaters: Hospital lecture Theater is not of Gallery type.
9. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP is NIL on day of assessment.
10. Workload of Histopathology & Cytopathology is only 03 & 05 respectively on day of assessment which is inadequate.
11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give an opportunity to the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

35. Recognition/approval of Dhanalakshmi Srinivasan Medical College & Hospital, Perambalur, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree(150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Dhanalakshmi Srinivasan Medical College & Hospital, Perambalur, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree(150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration of the matter to the next meeting.

36. Recognition/approval of Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (29th July, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (12th April, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16th April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) ...

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

37. Recognition/approval of Malabar Medical College & Research Centre, Calicut, Kerala for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Malabar Medical College & Research Centre, Calicut, Kerala for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report(29th July, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (06th May, 2016) as well as letter/representation dated 04/08/2016 received from the college authorities and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Malabar Medical College & Research Centre, Calicut, Kerala for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16th April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) ...

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

38. Approval of the minutes of the Finance Committee meeting held on 9th August, 2016.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the minutes of the Finance Committee meeting held on 9th August, 2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the minutes of the Finance Committee meeting held on 9th August, 2016 and observed as under:-

Item 3: Implementation of 7th Central Pay Commission

The Members of Executive Committee further noted the comments of the Consultant Finance on the implementation of recommendations of 7th Pay Commission – fixation of pay and payment of arrears – instructions and decided to approve the proposal.

The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.

Item 4: Grant of Special Allowances to Employees of the Council:

Minutes are incomplete. While it is recorded that "The Committee came with the opinion that the matter be placed before the Executive Committee bringing out the fact that allowances sanctioned by Executive Committee in its meeting held on 16/03/2015 is not covered in the existing Rule. The continuance / rationalization of allowances to these employees and amount of allowance needs to be reconsidered/reviewed", it is not brought out how the decision of Executive Committee dt. 16/03/2015 was arrived at. It is also not shown whether the abovesaid decision of the Executive Committee was pursuant to recommendation of Finance Committee or any other Sub Committee or not. It was also observed that no specific recommendation/proposal has been made by Finance Committee for review/reconsideration.

The Executive Committee of the Council referred back with above observation to take appropriate decision.

Item 5: Grant of Conveyance Allowance to officials for attending office on Holidays:

Minutes are incomplete. While it is recorded that "The Committee after going through the issue and taking cognizance that point also has been under audit objection, decided that the matter be placed before Executive Committee for consideration, devising a methodology/procedure defining the scope of facility of granting conveyance allowance to staff for attending office on Saturday, Sunday & Holiday", it is not brought out what is the audit objection and whether any reply has been given for such an objection. It was also observed that no specific recommendation/proposal has been made by Finance Committee for devising a methodology/procedure defining the scope of facility of granting conveyance allowance to staff for attending office on Saturday, Sunday & Holiday.

The Executive Committee of the Council referred back with above observation to take appropriate decision.

Item 6: Investment of FDRs:

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the investment of FDRs.

39. Proposal to amend Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

Read: the matter with regard to proposal to amend establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the proposal of the Ministry of Health & F.W. and directed the office to prepare draft amendment accordingly for Government of India approval.

40. Matter with regard to holding of meeting of Raghavan Committee.

Read: the matter with regard to holding of meeting of Raghavan Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the opinion of Law Officer, operative part of which reads as under:

"....I respectfully disagree with the view of the Administration and Grievance Committee that "there is no precedence of holding such kind of meeting with different organizations which do not fall under the protocol of the Council. The menace of Ragging is serious and is required to be curbed with stringent measures. Consultation with stakeholders, that may be different organizations, would be conducive to enhancing the anti-ragging mechanism laid down in

Council Regulations. Therefore I am of the considered view that the Executive Committee as part of the Council's measures to curb ragging in Medical Colleges consider the proposal of Raghavan Committee to hold such a meeting favourably."

After due deliberations, the Committee decided to approve the opinion of Law Officer and directed the office to convene a meeting of Raghavan Committee at the earliest in consultation with Ministry of HRD & UGC.

41. **Amendment in the MSR(Minimum Standard Requirements Regulations for 50/100/150/200/250 annual MBBS admissions and Phasewise Requirements for LOP and Renewals.**

Read: the matter with regard to amendment in the MSR(Minimum Standard Requirements Regulations for 50/100/150/200/250 annual MBBS admissions and Phasewise Requirements for LOP and Renewals.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that with regard to Clause 4 of Part I & II, Central Government vide letter dt. 18/07/2016 has proposed the following changes:

Clause	Present Provision	As proposed by the Council	As approved in the Ministry
4 of Part-I	Applications found complete in all respects shall be registered by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and forwarded to the Council within 30 days from the date of receipt of it for evaluation and recommendations.	Applications found complete in all respects shall be registered by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare and forwarded to the Council within time limit prescribed under the Regulations for evaluation and recommendations	Applications received in prescribed proforma along with requisite fee shall be registered by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and forwarded to the Council within time limit prescribed under the Regulations for evaluation and recommendations.
4 of Part-II	Applications found complete in all respects will be registered by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and forwarded to Council within 30 days from the date of receiving it all for evaluation and recommendations.	Applications found complete in all respects shall be registered by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare and forwarded to the Council within time limit prescribed under the Regulations for evaluation and recommendations	Applications received in prescribed proforma along with requisite fee shall be registered by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and forwarded to the Council within time limit prescribed under the Regulations for scrutiny, evaluation and recommendation.

In this connection, it was observed that the words “**found complete in all respects**” were inserted in the proposed amendment pursuant to Order of the Hon’ble Supreme Court in Royal Trust & D.Y. Patil cases.

The Committee further noted the following relevant portion of the *Hon’ble Supreme Court judgment dated 20/08/2015 in W.P.(C) No. 705/2015-Royal Medical Trust(Regd.) and Another Vs. Union of India and Anrs.:-*

“.....(A) Initial assessment of the application at the first level should comprise of checking necessary requirements such as essentiality certificate, consent of affiliation and physical features like land and

hospital requirement. If an applicant fails to fulfill these requirements, the application on the face of it, would be incomplete and be rejected. Those who fulfill the basic requirements would be considered at the next stage...."

The Committee further noted the following relevant portion of the Hon'ble Supreme Court judgment dated 20/08/2015 in SLP.(C) No. 15043/2015- Padmashree Dr. D.Y. Patil Medical College Vs. Medical Council of India & Anr...:-

16. In W.P. (C) No.705/2014 – Royal Medical Trust (Regd.) and Anr. V. Union of India & Anr. decided on 20.8.2015, this Court has observed that the Schedule must take care of following aspects:

"(A) Initial assesment of the application at the first level should comprise of checking necessary requirements such as essentiality certificate, consent for affiliation and physical features like land and hospital requirement. If an applicant fails to fulfill these requirements, the application on the face of it, would be incomplete and be rejected. Those who fulfill the basic requirements would be considered at the next stage.

(B) Inspection should then be conducted by the Inspectors of the MCI. By very nature such inspection must have an element of surprise. Therefore, sufficient time of about three to four months ought to be given to the MCI to cause inspection at any time and such inspection should normally be undertaken latest by January. Surprise inspection would ensure that the required facilities and infrastructure are always in place and not borrowed or put in temporarily.

(C) Intimation of the result or outcome of the inspection would then be communicated. If the infrastructure and facilities are in order, the concerned Medical College should be given requisite permission/renewal. However if there are any deficiencies or shortcomings, the MCI must, after pointing out the deficiencies, grant to the college concerned sufficient time to report compliance.

(D) If compliance is reported and the applicant states that the deficiencies stand removed, the MCI must cause compliance verification. It is possible that such compliance could be accepted even without actual physical verification but that assessment be left entirely to the discretion of the MCI and the Central Government. In cases where actual physical verification is required, the MCI and the Central Government must cause such verification before the deadline.

(E) The result of such verification if positive in favour of the Medical College concerned, the applicant ought to be given requisite permission/renewal. But if the deficiencies still persist or had not been removed, the applicant will stand disentitled so far as that academic year is concerned."

It is apparent from the aforesaid decision and the regulations that the application at the first instance is required to be complete and incomplete applications are liable to be rejected. Thereafter, there has to be an inspection and other stages of decision-making process."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to place factual matrix once again before Central Government requesting Central Govt. to approve the amendment as proposed by MCI.

42. Recognition/ approval of Melmaruvathur Adhiprasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Melmaruvathur for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/ approval of Melmaruvathur Adhiprasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Melmaruvathur for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (2nd August, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (12th April, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 77.5 % as detailed in the report.
2. No faculty was available in the department of Radiodiagnosis on day of assessment.
3. Shortage of Residents is 78.6 % as detailed in the report.
4. Bed occupancy was 30.61 % on day of assessment at 12 noon.
5. Radiological & Laboratory investigation workload were grossly inadequate on day of assessment.
6. Although institute provided a list of 372 Nursing staff, only about 60 were observed to be working in the wards on day of assessment.
7. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL LSCS on day of assessment.
8. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Melmaruvathur Adhiprasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Melmaruvathur for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

The Committee further decided that the decision with regard to applying clause 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16th April, 2010 against Melmaruvathur Adhiparasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Tamilnadu for two academic years i.e. 2016-2017 and 2017-2018 be continued.

The Committee noted the email dated 22.08.2016 received from the Director of Medical Education, Chennai informing that the local holidays are declared by the Collector of the District for religious functions for administrative reasons. These holidays will be compensated by a State or Central declared holiday which will thence be declared as a working day. The DME has enclosed Order of the District Collector, Kancheepuram District which states that due to mela at Sri Vedagivishwavar temple at Kancheepuram, all the Govt. Offices and Educational Institutions will remain close on 2.8.2016 and for compensating the same, the offices and educational institutions will remain open on 13.8.2016.

In view of above, the Committee decided to conduct the compliance verification inspection of the institute.

43. **Recognition/approval of Career Instt. of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Lucknow for the award of MBBS degree(100 seats) granted by Dr. RML Avadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the I.M.C. Act, 1956.**

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Career Instt. of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Lucknow for the award of MBBS degree(100 seats) granted by Dr. RML Avadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (2nd August, 2016) along with previous assessment report(22nd April, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Career Instt. of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Lucknow for the award of MBBS degree(100 seats) granted by Dr. RML Avadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of

Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16th April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) ...

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

The Executive Committee further noted that clause 8(3)(1)(d) as recommended by the Ethics Committee at its meeting dated 3rd & 4th May, 2016 and approved by the Executive Committee on 15.06.2016 had been applied against the college. The said clause reads as under:-

8(3)(1)(d):

(d) Colleges which are found to have employed teachers with faked / forged documents:

If it is observed that any institute is found to have employed a teacher with faked / forged documents and have submitted the Declaration Form of such a teacher, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission / recognition for award of M.B.B.S. degree / processing the applications for postgraduate courses for two Academic Years – i.e. that Academic Year and the next Academic Year also....."

In view of above, the Committee decided that the Institute be directed not to admit fresh batch of students for the academic year 2016-17 and 2017-18.

44. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur.

Read: the matter with regard to compliance verification assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (25.07.2016) along with previous assessment report (21.04.2016 & 22.04.2016) as well as letter dated 26.07.2016 from the MCI assessors which reads as under:

1. "The afore stated MCI assessment was scheduled for 25/7/16. It was rescheduled to 26/7/16 in an e.mail received by us.
2. We reached college gate at 9.40 am. The guard on duty got into our car and escorted us to dean's office, as we had requested him to direct us there, but he chose to accompany us in our car.
3. We handed over the letter of assessment arrangement to the individual who introduced himself as Dean. However, he then told us he is Dean, faculty, NIMS University & the Principal, NIMS will be coming over to his office & did not sign the acknowledgment.
4. However despite 15 minutes of waiting the Principal did not arrive.

5. Then 2 assessors (Dr. Saple & Dr. Prasad) proceeded towards Principal's cabin.
6. The 3rd assessor was escorted by a college employee & introduced to Prof. of Surgery (Dr. Srivani)
7. She assessed bed occupancy at 10 am of Surgery, Orthopaedics, ENT, Ophthalmology, OB&GY. Each ward was not as per MCI norms. Each ward had 54 beds or 100 beds, 108 beds. (Each unit can have >30 beds but each ward has to be max. 30 beds as per MSR). Each ward did not have pantry, demo room, store room, duty room as per requirements.
8. (a) Dr. Saple & Dr. Prasad then proceeded to Principal's cabin. There was not one there. Nor was there anywhere any faculty or staff in college building. Then Dr. Saple met 3 Asst. Prof. in Biochemistry. She requested them to help with assessment. One of them accompanied her for assessing bed occupancy.
- b. Principal eventually arrived 10.13 am & accepted the letter or arrangement.
9. Bed occupancy was assessed in Medicine, Chest & TB, Psychiatry, Dermatology, Pediatrics.
Wards were of 108 beds not as per MCI norms, some wards had no nursing station (video & photos enclosed).
A person putatively the Superintendent refused to put his signature & snatched the phone out of co-ordinators hand while filming & tried to throw it down.
10. The signatures of nurses on duty were also enclosed.
11. Attendance with signatures of all residents & faculty was taken till 11 am.
12. The management people were interfering with the work of assessment and were yelling and abusing & refused to listen to the Principal.
13. The co-ordinator and assessors then left the building and waited outside to building to call the third assessor & then the MCI office.
14. As we were waiting outside the Principal called us to her office for discussion.
15. Along with the Principal Management people who said they were also faculty were also in the room & they insisted that this should be an assessment for 150 seats.
16. Dr. Saple called the MCI office & doubly confirmed that the assessment was of 100 seats only.
17. On informing the same, the Principal stated that they would not want to continue the inspection.
18. The Principal stated that she would a letter to that effect. However, despite waiting till 3 pm no letter of refusal was provided. Only a letter stating facts not directly related to assessment was given.
19. No printer was provided at any time.
20. Duty roster, records as per request letter were also not provided.
21. There was no internet facility in college building/Principal office/chamber.
22. There was no computer/photocopier etc. also in Principal's chamber.
23. So, as the Principal refused further assessment, due to interference by management, on their verbal statements the assessors left the campus.
24. The Management once they realized the bed occupancy & attendance was extremely low put forth. The reason at 11.30 am re.150 vs 100 admissions."

Additional points

- There were 412 patients shown in wards at 10 am in 762 beds in Surgery, Medicine, Paediatrics, Orthopaedics, ENT, Ophthalmology, OBGY, Skin, Psychiatry & Chest & TB wards shown to us which is 54%.
- As number P.G. units, were not divulged to us this occupancy is based on beds shown & patients shown to us.
- Attendance sheets were used for signatures. But there was interference from Management all along.

- Despite requests residents, faculty & management did not leave the lecture hall after putting in their signatures.
- Hence, faculty deficiency cannot be commuted upon as verification process did not take place as assessment was suspended, as later on the college authorities refused to cooperate & stated they did not want further inspection.

The Committee recalled that on an earlier occasion also, similar problems had taken place recorded hereunder:

Dated: 22.04.2016

To

The Secretary (UG Section)
Medical Council of India
New Delhi-110 077.

Sub: Problem faced by the assessors during inspection of National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur (NIMS&R, Jaipur).

Respected Madam,

I am Dr. Karabi Baral, Professor of Anatomy, BS Medical College, Bankura; Dr. S. Mohanth, Professor of FMT, MKCG Medical College, Berhampur & Dr. J.A. Jayalal, Professor of Surgery, Kanyakumari Govt. Medical College visited National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur vide No.MCI-37(1)(UG)/2015-Med./ for 100 to 150 seats and continuance of recognition of 100 MBBS seats.

We reached the institute on 21.04.2016 at 10.20 am. Principal came to the administrative block and received the appointment letter, schedule of inspection process and Annexures check list at 10.40 AM.

She took us in her office at the academic building. Dr. Jayalal started to visit the Surgery & allied wards, OTs, OBGY and LR with Medical Superintendent.

As per direction of Principal Dr. Gupta, Professor of Anatomy accompanied me to hospital visit for Medicine & allied wards. Dr. Mohanty was engaged to take attendance of faculties and resident doctors in college lecture theatre till 11.30 a.m.

During my hospital visit Dr. Mohanty called me to LT for some problems. Immediately from central clinical laboratories I went to LT. No photographers were provided during hospital visit with us. So we took photographs by our own mobile camera.

In the LT management persons who are also faculties of different departments were present there. They asked me about the process of inspection whether it is right or wrong. Took photograph of me in personal mobile of his and recorded. Blamed us that MCI officials screwed us and fought us before sending their institution. Conversation between me and MCI officials recorded by them. Attendance part was going on till 12.40 p.m.

Then we visited college side also and after lunch around 3.30 pm during physical verification of faculties and resident doctors in a big conference hall in administrative block same interference of management persons continued.

In every steps their hot conversation and interference disturbed us to continue the inspection process.

Few parts of college and hospital side could not verified by us for these disturbances. They called the news channel.

In every step we were humiliated, insulted and disturbed. All verified declaration forms except few from surgery department was with us which we

sent to Council. Rest of the declaration forms are kept with the college authority.

On 21.04.2016 around 9 pm when we left the college no annexures as per check list were submitted to us except library documents, central research lab documents which were provided me during visit to respective area. No SA-I & B forms provided to us on 21.04.2016.

After returning to hotel at Jaipur we decided to avoid the institute on 22.04.2016 because we did not want to face further same or more severe incidences. We all were mentally severe depressed and insulted in every step. Hence, we could not visit the college on 2nd day i.e. 22.04.2016.

During hospital visit or college visit they did not provide any videographers. But in LT during attendance & during physical verification process the photographers/videographers taken photos of the process.

This is for your kind information.

Sd/-
(Dr. Karabi Baral)

Sd/-
(Dr. S. Mohanty)

Sd/-
(Dr. J.A. Jayalal)

In view of above and as the Institute is repeatedly not allowing assessments to be completed, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the General Body for withdrawal of recognition of MBBS degree granted by NIMS University, Jaipur in respect of students being trained at National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur u/s 19 of Indian Medical Council Act.

45. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Medicit Institute of Medical Sciences, Ghanpur.

Read: the matter with regard to compliance verification assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Medicit Institute of Medical Sciences, Ghanpur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (03.08.2016) along with previous assessment report (02.03.2016) and noted the following:-

1. Bed occupancy was 69.90% on day of assessment.
2. ICUs: Occupancy in ICCU, SICU was only 2 in each.
3. There was NIL patient in O.T. at time of taking round. Data of 18 Major operations given by the institute is exaggerated.
4. Data of Minor operations as 37 given by the institute is exaggerated. There was NIL Minor operation observed on day of assessment.
5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision regarding apply of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 and amended on 18.03.2016 which reads as under:-

8(3)(1).....

(c) Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from

such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.”

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956, along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses and further decided that the institute be asked to submit the compliance of rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

46. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 130 MBBS seats at Sri Siddhartha Medical College, Tumkur under Siddhartha University, Tumkur.

Read: the matter with regard to compliance verification assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 130 MBBS seats at Sri Siddhartha Medical College, Tumkur under Siddhartha University, Tumkur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (04.08.2016) along with previous assessment report (05.04.2016) and noted the following:-

1. Shortage of Residents is 12.79 % as detailed in the report.
2. In Obstetrics & Gynecology department, antenatal, postnatal, postoperative, Gynecological operated and non-operated patients were all admitted in the same room. There are no separate antenatal, postnatal, postoperative Gynaecological wards.
3. In Orthopaedics wards, it was observed that review cases and post-operative cases were declared as discharged. Cases operated for Major operations like Lap cholecystectomy were declared as discharged the very next day.
4. The consent forms of operated patients were signed in English in Capital letters and USG reports were similar for many patients. Many admitted patients were having only Ulcers and Wounds. In Surgery, Orthopaedics& ENT wards, admissions were more on the day of assessment and the previous day. There were many patients of abscesses admitted in the wards.
5. In Paediatrics wards, overwriting was seen in the admission register.
6. In ENT, Paediatrics& General Surgery post-operative wards, there was overwriting of the admission registers, especially date of admission on day of assessment and previous day.
7. As per records submitted by Medical Superintendent, there was NIL Minor operation on day of assessment.
8. OPD: Diagnosis of patients is not mentioned in OPD register.
9. Casualty: There were 7 patients at 10:00 a.m. By 12:45 p.m. the number of patients had swelled upto 38. None of patients admitted in 10:00 a.m. & 12:45 p.m. merit admission. Date of admission is not mentioned either

- in OPD record or in the case sheet. Data of Casualty attendance provided by institute are inflated.
10. There was mismatch between signs, diagnosis and treatment. One patient was afebrile but provisional diagnosis was made of ? Acute febrile illness, etc.
 11. No treatment was mentioned in OPD record or Case sheet; however, nurses treatment mentioned injectable given. Doctors' treatment chart did not mention dosage to be given.
 12. There is only 1 Casualty Medical Officer doing duty on all days without any break from 8 a.m. to 9 p.m. There was no CMO for night duty.
 13. Names of Nursing staff did not match with duty roster. Proper duty roster for Nursing staff is not maintained. At time of visit to Casualty, Nursing staff were seen shifting drug trolleys to wards. The drug trolleys were empty.
 14. ICUs: There was only 1 patient needing ICCU care was found. Rest of beds were empty. Cases kept for observation and conservatively managed abdominal trauma cases, cellulitis cases with sepsis were seen in ICUs.
 15. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 & amended on 18.03.2016 and to give an opportunity to the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

47. **Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3rd batch (150 seats) of RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Jatkhedhi, Bhopal, M.P. under earlier Barkatullah University and now Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan University, Bhopal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 in pursuance of Hon'ble Supreme Court Order dated 15.07.2016 passed in SLP(C) No. 14729/2016.**

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3rd batch (150 seats) of RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Jatkhedhi, Bhopal, M.P. under earlier Barkatullah University and now Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan University, Bhopal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 in pursuance of Hon'ble Supreme Court Order dated 15.07.2016 passed in SLP(C) No. 14729/2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (20th & 21st July, 2016) carried out in pursuance of the Hon'ble Supreme Court Order dated 15.07.2016 passed in SLP(C) No. 14729/2016 as well as letter dated 01/08/2016 received from the college authorities. The Committee also perused the letter from assessors dt. 20/07/2016 which reads as under:

"10.00 a.m. - We reached college at 10 a.m. Dean was not available in Dean's Chamber. No staff was present in Administrative office. Co-coordinator waited in Dean's office and the person from the management was informed to call all the teaching staff and residents for attendance, except the staff who were washed up in OT, labour ward and casualty.

10.25 a.m. – Dean arrived after about 15 minutes and was informed regarding attendance of the faculty and residents once again. She was also informed to make arrangements for computer with internet and printer facility and to keep ready Form-A, Form-B of all the Departments, Annexure as per requirements Form-A of Birth and Death records. Dean was shown MCI order for assessment on cell phone while printer arrangement was awaited.

10.10 a.m. – One of the Assessor visited the facilities on the ground floor and found that the OPD registration counter, waiting area, OPD consultation rooms had no patients, only in OBG OPD three doctor's were present who stated they had not seen any patient since morning. Then in OT complex no surgery was on, OT list was not available of any day in July, 2016. In casualty no doctors were present, there were only 16 beds, 3 patients were there. There was no separate OBG casualty. Staff in OT and wards were said that they were instructed by management not sign any evidence sheets (photos and videos enclosed.)

In the pharmacy no records of any day were available (either manual or computerized). No documents was available regarding distribution of drugs to OP/IP patients.

10.10 a.m. – At the same time, other Assessor went to first floor to visit wards. In OBGY, there were no patient and no delivery in the month of July, 2016. In ENT ward (female) only one patient has ENT complaint, rest were having back ache/pain abdomen. There was no separate female surgical ward, none of the patients genuine verification they had no surgical complaints, not even one patient had any dressing or operative sign. Two patients in surgery were in bed without any case sheets. ICU, ICCU & SICU were not separate and there was only one patient of diarrhea in ICU. There were no patients in NICU/PICU and ventilators not available.

10.25 a.m. – Attendance of faculty and residents was started and all those who came till 11.00 a.m. and signed their attendance, then left for their departments.

11.00 a.m. – All faculty and residents who came after 11 a.m. were asked to sign and put the time in their own hand writing. This continued till 11.50 a.m.

11.50 a.m. – All three Assessors left for visit to various deptts. There was no attendance register of faculty or Biometric attendance. There was no duty roaster. Blood Bank - No blood was issued since 8th July, 2016. There were five units of whole blood and there was no facility for component separation. During visits to the Deptt. of Anatomy, Physiology, Biochemistry, Pharmacology, Pathology, Microbiology and Forensic Medicine, faculty rooms were small and congested.

MRD – There was only one computer operator available and three computers. All patients in surgery ward were stated to be on IV medication as per case sheet but not even one patient had received either oral or IV medication since admission, case sheets did not have date of admission/name of doctor or deptt. Needle and syringe disposal facility was not available in any wards. In casualty no entry was made between 6th July and 17th July, 2016. Patients when asked told the Assessor that they were all brought in three buses from their homes predominantly from Indrapura around 11.30 a.m.

12.50 noon – After repeated requests printer was made available, only then we were able to give the hard copy of MCI order for assessment and UG check list. Labs investigations were less (evidence sheet enclosed).

2.00 p.m. – Verification of declaration forms was started. Owing verification to check the residence proof of a senior Resident of ENT Deptt. , the Assessor was accompanied by the SR and 20 people from management side, not even one person from college, Assessor (Dr.Pallavi Saple) was constantly verbally abused and noticed along the way. There was no mess facility in the resident hostel. Residents accommodation list provide and their actual occupance did not mark. The library had no records after December, 2015. Books available in the Deptt. Library are less. There was no internet facility available. There were only sin demo rooms in the hospital. No patient was admitted for more than one day.

3.00 p.m. – Management people, particularly the Chairman's son and CEO had been interfering in the process of assessment of all three Assessors since morning. They were pressing staff to state things as per their orders and were putting word in their mouth. Despite repeated requests to the Dean, they were not moving away from the assessment. Realizing that the assessment report may not be favourable to them, the management people now took on abusive

and obsessive stand. Chairman's son started threatening the Assessors. He yelled that he will get the permission through Court and higher powers. Threats and abusive in continued and Dean did nothing to stop this wrong doing. Fearing our safety we picked up our assessment material and started moving towards our vehicle. We were unable to enter the vehicle as mob of around 150 surrounded us, most of them did not appeared to faculty/residents/students when we could manage to enter the vehicle, the mob surrounded the vehicle and continued abusing. We called for the Dean to come down, we asked her if she would help us in carrying out the assessment but she also appeared to be under the instructions of the management and she gave us no guarantee of our safety and the further assessment. So, we were forced to abandon the assessment for our safety. While returning to the hotel we noted one red Santro car followed us and when we stopped for tea, one of the Assessors sighted management people including Chairman's son in the car.

Additional information

- *There were 280 beds available in the hospital against the required 300 beds.*
- *Bed occupancy at the time of assessment in 30.33% i.e. 91 out of 300 or 32.50% i.e. 91 out of 280 beds.*
- *Faculty deficiency was 59% i.e. 59 out of 100.*
- *Resident deficiency was 93.87% i.e. 46 out of 49.*
- *Even if all those who signed after 11 a.m. and assuming all residents stay in campus were included, even then.*
- *Faculty deficiency would have been 45% i.e. 45 out of 100.*
- *Resident deficiency would have been 46.1% i.e. 23 out of 49.*

9.30 a.m. – Receiving no further intimation regarding guarantee of our safety and further assessment from the Dean, we choose to leave Bhopal and proceeded to MCI office to brief the untoward happenings.

11.13 a.m. – Received remarks from the Dean through SMS which appears to have been sent after confirming that we have left Bhopal.”

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch (150 seats) of MBBS students at RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Jatkhedhi, Bhopal, M.P. under earlier Barkatullah University and now Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan University, Bhopal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

48. Extension of services of Dr. M. Rajalakshmi, Chief Consultant (Academic Cell).

Read: the matter with regard to extension of services of Dr. M. Rajalakshmi, Chief Consultant (Academic Cell).

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to extend the contractual services of Dr. M. Rajalakshmi, Chief Consultant (Academic Cell) for a further period of six months.

49. Request for change of name of the affiliating University from M.P. Medical Science University, Jabalpur to Malwanchal University, Indore from 2015-16 batch in respect of students being trained at Index Medical College H & RC, Indore.

Read: the matter with regard to request for change of name of the affiliating University from M.P. Medical Science University, Jabalpur to Malwanchal University, Indore from 2015-16 batch in respect of students being trained at Index Medical College H & RC, Indore.

After due deliberations, the Executive Committee of the Council decided that the students are admitted under a particular University, upto the stage of

passing III MBBS Part II examination, they remain in that University. Hence such a request cannot be entertained and the question of seeking views of MP Medical Sciences University does not arise. Students can be admitted under Malwanchal University only from 2016-2017 batch.

50. Formation of Uttar Pradesh University of Medical Sciences (Formerly UP Rural Institute of Medical Sciences and Research) Saifai, Etawah (U.P.).

Read: the matter with regard to Formation of Uttar Pradesh University of Medical Sciences (Formerly UP Rural Institute of Medical Sciences and Research) Saifai, Etawah (U.P.).

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 13.07.2016 received from the Vice Chancellor, Uttar Pradesh University of Medical Sciences, Saifai, Etawah informing about formation of "*Uttar Pradesh University of Medical Sciences, Saifai, Etawah*" (Formerly UP Rural Institute of Medical Sciences and Research) Saifai, Etawah (U.P.).

51. Approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meeting held on 19th & 20th August, 2016.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meeting held on 19th & 20th August, 2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meeting held on 19th & 20th August, 2016 recommending removal of name of Dr. B.S. Tomar, Chairman, National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur from the Indian Medical Register for a period of 05 years.

52. Digital Mission Mode Project (DMMP-MCI) by Medical Council of India.

Read: the matter with regard to Digital Mission Mode Project (DMMP-MCI) by Medical Council of India.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the status of DMMP project and approved the minutes of the meeting with State Medical Council representatives held in the Council Office on 19.08.2016.

53. Minutes of the Coordinators/Assessors Workshop held in the Council Office on 11th and 12th August, 2016 regarding assessment process for the academic year 2017-18.

Read: the minutes of the Coordinators/Assessors Workshop held in the Council Office on 11th and 12th August, 2016 regarding assessment process for the academic year 2017-18.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Coordinators/Assessors Workshop held in the Council Office on 11th and 12th August, 2016 regarding assessment process for the academic year 2017-18.

Dr. Reena Nayyar recused herself from the meeting.

54. Review of suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary (U/s) by Review Committee held on 23/08/2016 at 10.30 a.m.

Read: the matter with regard to review of suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary (Under Suspension).

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Review Committee meeting dated 23.08.2016 to continue the suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary (U/s) for a further period of 90 days w.e.f. 17/09/2016.

The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.

55. Review of suspension of Dr. Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (U/s) by Review Committee held on 23/08/2016 at 10.45 a.m.

Read: the matter with regard to review of suspension of Dr. Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (U/s).

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Review Committee meeting dated 23.08.2016 to continue the suspension of Dr. Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (U/s) for a further period of 90 days w.e.f. 24/09/2016.

The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.

56. Review of suspension of Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj, Deputy Secretary (U/s) by Review Committee held on 23/08/2016 at 10.15 a.m.

Read: the matter with regard to review of suspension of Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj, Deputy Secretary (U/s).

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Review Committee meeting dated 23.08.2016 to continue the suspension of Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj, Deputy Secretary (U/s) for a further period of 90 days w.e.f. 20/09/2016.

The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.

Dr. Reena Nayyar rejoined the meeting.

57. International Association of Medical Regulatory Authority (IAMRA)- Conference on "Medical Regulation-Making a Difference" from 20-23 September, 2016 at Melbourne, Australia.

Read: the matter with regard to International Association of Medical Regulatory Authority (IAMRA)- Conference on "Medical Regulation-Making a Difference" from 20-23 September, 2016 at Melbourne, Australia.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the contents of an email received from International Association of Medical Regulatory Authority (IAMRA) requesting Dr. Jayshree Mehta, President, MCI to attend the 12th Conference on "Medical Regulation-Making a Difference" from 20-23 September, 2016 at Melbourne, Australia.

The Executive Committee of the Council ratified the decision of the President nominating Dr. Reena Nayyar, Secretary I/c to accompany her to attend the International Association of Medical Regulatory Authority (IAMRA) Conference.

The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.

58. **Regulations of Minimum Standard Requirements for the medical colleges for 50/100/150/200/250 MBBS admissions – Amendments in the Equipment List regarding.**

Read : the revised Equipment List submitted by the Sub-Committee for amendment in the Regulations of Minimum Standard Requirements for the medical colleges for 50/100/150/200/250 MBBS admissions.

The Executive Committee considered the revised Equipment List submitted by the Sub-Committee and decided to approve the same.

The minutes of the above item were read and confirmed in the meeting itself.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

New Delhi, dated
23rd August, 2016

(Dr. Reena Nayyar)
Secretary I/c

APPROVED

(Dr. Jayshree Mehta)
President

