

Medical Council of India
New Delhi

Minutes of the meeting of the Board of Governors held on 12.12.2011 at 10.00 am in the Council office at Sector -8, Pocket-14, Dwarka, New Delhi -110077.

Following members were present:

- | | | |
|----|--------------------------------|---|
| 1. | Dr. (Prof.) K.K. Talwar | Chairman, Board of Governors |
| 2. | Dr. (Prof.) K.S. Sharma | Member, Board of Governors |
| 3. | Dr. (Prof.) H.S. Rissam | Member, Board of Governors |
| 4. | Dr. Rajiv Chintaman Yeravdekar | Member, Board of Governors |
| 5. | Dr. Purshotam Lal | Member, Board of Governors |
| 6. | Dr. Ashok Kumar Gupta | Member, Board of Governors |
| 7. | Dr. (Prof.) K Mohandas | Member, Board of Governors |
| 8. | Dr. (Prof.) Sangeeta Sharma | Secretary, Member Secretary, BOG meeting. |
| 9. | Dr. P.Prasannaraj | Additional Secretary |

At the outset the Board deliberated on the assessment procedure approved in the previous meetings and file notings and now finally decided to formulate a new team comprising Dr. S Mantha, Sh. Velukutty and Sh. Narender to initiate the process of assessment and this team would follow the procedure as below:

Assessment Protocol-UG

1. List of colleges to be assessed will be forwarded by the concerned section in-charge.
2. Short-listing of colleges and the date of assessment will be done by Dr. Mantha and his team
3. Names of assessor would be computer generated for the short-listed colleges
4. Eight to ten working days in advance an automated email and SMS alert goes to the assessor about the name of the college to be assessed. The assessor would be informed that the information is highly confidential and should not be shared with anyone including the college to be assessed. Once the defined sets of assessors are generated, Dr Mantha in consultation with member BOGs UG section will nominate the coordinator/ principal assessor. Conflict of interest declaration would be obtained from the assessors at this stage.
5. Seven (7) days prior to the scheduled date of assessment, the list of assessors for the relevant colleges will be forwarded to the Secretary, MCI. The office of the Secretary, MCI will then facilitate the following functions by delegating responsibilities to officers/sections as per requirement:
 - a. Formal letter of appointment to the assessor
 - b. Letter to travel agent for making necessary arrangements.
 - c. Two days before the assessment, the college will be intimated about the assessment by the assessment cell through email, and fax.
6. Critical decision including decisions about last minute dropouts and failure of assessor to conduct assessment will be made by the Secretary in consultation with concerned BOGs.
7. All "compliance assessments" will be surprise in nature

Assessment Protocol-PG

1. List of colleges with applied PG courses u/s 10A, and pending compliance verification will be forwarded by the concerned section in-charge.
2. Short-listing of colleges and the data of assessment will be done by Dr. Mantha and his team
3. List of assessors for all courses of a given college would be computer generated.

8. Eight to ten working days in advance an automated email and SMS alert goes to the assessor about the name and details of college. The assessor would be informed that the information is highly confidential and should not be shared with anyone including the college to be assessed. Conflict of interest declaration from the assessors will be obtained at this stage.
4. Seven (7) days prior to the scheduled date of assessment, the list of assessors for the relevant courses of a given college will be forwarded to the Secretary, MCI. The office of the Secretary, MCI will then facilitate the following functions by delegating responsibilities to officers/sections as per requirement:
 - a. Formal letter of appointment to the assessor
 - b. Contact the travel agent for making required arrangements.
 - c. Two days before the assessment, the college will be intimated about the details of assessment by the assessment cell through email, and fax.
5. Critical decision including decisions about last minute dropouts and failure of assessor to conduct assessment will be made by the Secretary in consultation concerned BOGs.
6. All “compliance assessments” will be of surprise in nature

1. Minutes of the BOG’s meeting dated 05.12.2011 - Confirmation of.

The Board of Governors confirmed the minutes of the meeting of the BOGs held on 5th December, 2011.

2. Continuance of recognition assessment – Regarding.

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition assessment.

The Board of Governors considered the minutes of the UG committee meeting held on September 13, 2011 with regard to continuance of recognition assessment and decided

S. No	Name of college	Infra-structure	Equip-ment	Clinical Materials	Staff	Remarks of UG committee	Decision of the Board
2	Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of SCB Medical College, Cuttack against the increased intake i.e. from 107 to 150 under Utkal University, Bhubaneswar	Adequate	Adequate	Adequate	Adequate	Recommended for recognition	Recommended for recognition for increased intake from 107-150 seats
		Conduct of examinations - satisfactory					
3	Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of Government Medical College, Kottayam against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 under Mahatma Gandhi University, Kottayam	Adequate	Adequate	Adequate	Adequate	Recommended for recognition	Recommended for recognition for increased intake from 100-150 seats
		Conduct of examinations - satisfactory					

S. No	Name of college	Infrastructure	Equipment	Clinical Materials	Staff	Remarks of UG committee	Decision of the Board
4	Assessment of the teaching faculty, resident, clinical material, hostel and other infrastructural facilities at Santosh Medical College & Hospital, Ghaziabad - Compliance verification assessment thereof.	Deficiencies have been complied	Deficiencies persisting are: One 300 mA and one 600mA and two mobile units are deficient	Deficiencies have been complied	Deficiencies have been complied for deficiency of tutors, However resident doctors are deficient by 17%	BOG to take decision	Referred to the sub-committee appointed for examining the replies to show cause notices issued by MCI
5	Assessment of the teaching faculty, resident, clinical material, hostel and other infrastructural facilities at Basaveswara Medical College & Hospital, Chitradurga, Karnataka - Compliance verification assessment thereof.	Library seating is still 195 against requirement of 200	Adequate	Not complied: Bed occupancy is only 25% Complied: OPD attendance, RICU beds	Not complied: Only 15 senior residents against requirement of 44	Not recommended Note: Furthermore, BOG may take note of the Medical College being put on sale on 15.09.11, note sheet page no.23	Assessment of the college was carried out on the basis of CBI complaint forwarded through Ministry in March, 2011. In view of deficiencies observed the then BOG's had directed the college authorities to submit the compliance within two weeks, which was verified by way of assessment on 16.08.2011. The assessment report has been considered by the BOG and decided to obtain compliance from the college authorities within three months.
6	Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for recognition/approval of MBBS degree granted by Guru Ghasidas University, in respect of students being trained at Chhattisgarh Institute of Medical Sciences, Bilaspur	Exam hall is of 200 seating against 500 requirement and the auditorium for 700 is under construction. Interns hostel is for 24 against requirement of 100, residents hostel is for 28 against 85	US is one less	OPD attendance on the day of inspection is 539 against	Paramedical staff are 139, against 179, Nurses are 241 against requirement of 800. RICU are 2 against requirement of 5	Not recommended 247 (Two NS, one DNS, 5 ANS, 13 nursing sisters are deficient. Faculty are 33% deficient while residents are 54% deficient.	Not recommended for recognition and reiterate its earlier decision taken by the then Board of Governors on 12.10.2010 to recall the notification issued by the central Govt. for recognition of the college.

S. no	Name of the college	Infrastructure	Equipme nt	Clinical materials	Staff		Remarks of UG committee	Decision of the BOGs
7	Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Awadesh Pratap Singh University, Rewa, in respect of students being trained at S.S.Medical College, Rewa.	The assessors have submitted only a compliance report and standard format of form A is only on CD. Form A is not in proper format, and list of equipment is not given in Form A. A proper assessors report is necessary as the recognition for said college was withdrawn after the last inspection report on 27-28 th November, 2006. It is not possible for UG Committee to give opinion in this format.						To get details from the assessor before taking any decision
8	Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rani Durgawati Vishwavidyalaya, Jabalpur, in respect of students being trained at Netaji Subash Chandra Bose Medical College, Jabalpur.	Lecture theatre deficient – they have 4 LTs of 150 capacity against requirement of 4 of 180 capacity, and one LT of 350 is deficient. Resident hostel accommodation is less (72 against 119).			Paramedics are less, 128 against 182; nurses 0 DNS one less, ANS 11 less, NS 17 less Faculty shortage is 7.7% and residents are 16.32%.		Not recommended	Considered separately as agenda item no 8 in view of the court directions. Decision recorded on file.
9.	Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore, in respect of students being trained at M.S. Ramaiah Medical College, Bangalore.	Auditorium capacity is 400 against requirement of 750 Residential quarters are 35 against requirement of 66.	One fixed X-ray unit is less	Total beds are adequate but distribution is such that 10 are less in OBG department.	Paramedical staff are 120 against 182 Supervisory nursing staff are 2 less and nursing sisters are 18 against requirement of 45.		Not recommended in present form.	To revoke show cause notice issued to the college authorities with an advise to submit the compliance within three months.
10	Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Aligarh Muslim University in respect of students being trained at Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Aligarh.	1x350 LT less No RICU (5 beds needed)		OPD attendance : 1105/1200	Nurses less: 228/372	Compliance verification required		To revoke show cause notice issued to the college authorities with an advise to submit the compliance within three months.

S. no	Name of the college	Infrastructure	Equipment	Clinical materials	Staff		Remarks of UG committee	Decision of the BOGs
11	Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Allahabad University (now affiliated to Chhatrapati Shahuji Maharaj Medical University, Lucknow in respect of students being trained at Motilal Nehru Medical College, Allahabad	Central Library seating is 72 against 200 Journals only 30 against 100 required. No hostel for nurses. No pharmacovigilance committee.	No mention of minor OT, Paramedical staff are 53 against 179, Nurses 240 against 247 no supervisory nurses	Adequate	Residents shortage 14.1% faculty shortage - nil	Not recommended in present form		To revoke show cause notice issued to the college authorities with an advise to submit the compliance within three months.

The Board decided to consider the UG Committee report of 20th September in the next meeting.

3. Applications received for the academic session 2012-2013 with regard to Establishment of New Medical College – deficient in terms of Fees, Essentiality Certificate and Consent of Affiliation – reg.

Read: the matter with regard to applications received for the academic session 2012-2013 with regard to Establishment of New Medical College – deficient in terms of Fees, Essentiality Certificate and Consent of Affiliation.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to applications received for the academic session 2012-2013 with regard to Establishment of New Medical College – deficient in terms of Fees, Essentiality Certificate and Consent of Affiliation and considering the norms and the Board decided to reject the applications which are deficient in essential documents such as deficient in either essentiality certificate or consent of affiliation or both. In case of application, where essentiality certificate or consent of affiliation is not as per format/requirements of MCI, the college to be informed to submit these documents as per MCI requirements within 3 weeks. In cases where Essentiality certificate and consent of affiliation is more than 3 years old or validity not mentioned new essentiality certificate and consent of affiliation be submitted by the college within 3 weeks.

In case of applications which are otherwise complete with regard to Essentiality Certificate and Consent of Affiliation but were submitted without application fees, the board sought information from the UG Section regarding past practice in such cases. The section informed that fees had been sought last year alongwith other deficient documents such as land and financial details. Keeping in view the practice followed last year, it was decided to get fee from the colleges within 3 weeks. As regard request of the colleges for adjustment of fees as per Regulation fee is non-refundable and there is no provision for keeping the application pending for the next academic year, therefore, the Board decided to ask the colleges to submit fee with the current application within 3 weeks.

It was also decided in all such cases if documents and fee are not received within said time frame, their application will be rejected.

Further, the Board directed the section to process the applications fulfilling the qualifying criteria and documents are complete for appointment of assessors.

4. Applications received for the academic session 2012-13 with regard to increase of Seats – deficient in terms of Fees, Essentiality Certificate and Consent of Affiliation – reg.

Read: the matter with regard to applications received for the academic session 2012-13 with regard to increase of Seats – deficient in terms of Fees, Essentiality Certificate and Consent of Affiliation.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to applications received for the academic session 2012-2013 with regard to increase in seats – deficient in terms of Fees, Essentiality Certificate and Consent of Affiliation and considering the rule, the Board decided to reject the applications which are deficient in essential documents such as deficient in either essentiality certificate or consent of affiliation or both, however, applications which were submitted without application fee the same be sought from the colleges within 2 weeks. In case where essentiality certificate or consent of affiliation is not as per format/requirements of MCI, the college to be informed to submit these documents as per MCI requirements within 3 weeks. In cases where Essentiality certificate and consent of affiliation are more than 3 years old or validity not mentioned it was decided that new essentiality certificate and consent of affiliation be submitted by the college within 3 weeks.

In case of applications which are otherwise complete with regard to Essentiality Certificate and Consent of Affiliation but were submitted without application fees, the board sought information from the UG Section regarding past practice in such cases. The section informed that fees had been sought last year alongwith other deficient documents such as land and financial details. Keeping in view the practice followed last year, it was decided to get fee from the colleges within 3 weeks. As regards request of the colleges for adjustment of fees as per Regulation fee is non-refundable and there is no provision for keeping the application pending for the next academic year, therefore, the Board decided to ask the colleges to submit fee with the current application within 3 weeks.

It was also decided in all such cases if documents and fee are not received within said time frame, their application will be rejected.

Further, the Board directed the section to process the applications fulfilling the qualifying criteria for appointment of assessors.

5. Application received after the cut-off date – (Establishment of New Medical College & Increase of Seats) – reg.

Read: the matter with regard to application received after the cut-off date – (Establishment of New Medical College & Increase of Seats).

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to application received after the cut-off date – (Establishment of New Medical College & Increase of Seats) and decided to reject the applications which are received either in MCI office or MOHFW after the cut-off date i.e., September 30, 2011 and return these applications as there is no provision for keeping applications pending for the next year.

6. Application received for increase of seats for the academic year 2012-13 which are permitted but not recognized - in terms of qualifying criteria.

Read: the matter with regard to application received for increase of seats for the academic year 2012-13 which are permitted but not recognized - in terms of qualifying criteria.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to application received for increase of seats for the academic year 2012-13 which are permitted but not recognized - in terms of qualifying criteria. In view of the matter being sub-judice the Board decided to get legal opinion before taking any decision.

7. **Applications for increase of seats for 200 / 250 where OPD attendance as per essentiality certificate do not meet the eligibility criteria as per “The Opening of a New or Higher Course of Study or Training (including Postgraduate Course of Study or Training) and increase of Admission Capacity in any Course of Study or Training (including a Postgraduate course of Study or Training) Regulations, 2000”– reg.**

Read: the matter with regard to application for increase of seats for 200 / 250 which do not meet the eligibility criteria.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to applications for increase of seats for 200 / 250 where OPD attendance is not as per Eligibility criteria as per “The Opening of a New or Higher Course of Study or Training (including Postgraduate Course of Study or Training) and increase of Admission Capacity in any Course of Study or Training (including a Postgraduate course of Study or Training) Regulations, 2000” and decided to reject these application as they do not fulfill the prescribed eligibility criteria.

8. **Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose Medical College, Jabalpur – Consideration of Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition –Court orders regarding.**

Read: the matter with regard to Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose Medical College, Jabalpur – Consideration of Assessment report with regard to continuance of recognition –Court order regarding.

In view of the urgent nature of the matter i.e., the case being listed on 09.01.2012 the Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose Medical College, Jabalpur – and decided that the deficiencies pointed out in the assessment report be communicated to the college authorities requesting them to submit the compliance within 15 days from the date of issue of the letter. It was further decided after receiving the compliance it should be verified by way of assessment in the first week of January 2012 and thereafter the decision of the Board would be communicated to the Court.

9. **Combined assessment of increase of seats (LOP/Renewal of Permission) along with Periodical assessments due in 2011-12 – regarding.**

Read: the matter with regard to combined assessment of Increase of seats (LOP/Renewal of Permission) along with Periodical assessments due in 2011-12 – regarding.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to combined assessment of increase of seats (LOP/Renewal of Permission) along with Periodical assessments due in 2011-12 and the Board decided as per previous year’s practice the assessment for periodical assessment be combined with the assessment for LOP for increase of seats or renewal of permission.

10. **Location of R.H.T.C. at a distance from City.**

Read: the matter with regard to location of R.H.T.C. at a distance from City.

The Board of Governors considered the letter dt. 07/10/2011 received from the Director, K.J. Somaiya Medical College & Research Centre, Sion, Mumbai with regard to location of R.H.T.C. at a distance from City so as to serve the tribal area as their trust has a 40 bed hospital in the area which is 120 Km from the college and even other colleges in Mumbai face this problem to provide rural training to their interns within a distance of 40 Km as required by MCI. Since it required amendment in the notification, the Board decided to refer the matter to the Academic Council for consideration along with revision of Minimum Standard Requirements.

11. Recognition of PG courses at Rohilkhand Medical College, Bareilly.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition of PG courses at Rohilkhand Medical College, Bareilly.

The item was deferred for next meeting.

12. Status of NEET-UG and NEET-PG

Read: the matter with regard to status of NEET-UG and NEET-PG.

The Board of Governors considered the matter with regard to status of NEET-UG and NEET-PG. Consultant Examination briefed the Board about the status of NEET. As regards NEET-PG, he informed that an interlocutory application was filed by MCI on 22nd Nov 2011 in Hon'ble Supreme Court 380 of 2009 titled as "Simran Jain vs. Union of India" explaining the reasons for inability to conduct NEET-PG from 2012 onwards. MoHFW, Govt. of India has informed AIIMS (Ref 1 Supra) to hold All India PG Medical Entrance Examination (AIPGMEE) for 50% of seats for the year 2012. The MCI website www.mciindia.org still has the information that NEET-PG will be held in Jan/Feb 2012 along with other relevant information. "NEET-PG will be held from 2013 onwards. Further details will be available in the due course"

Regarding status of NEET-UG an interlocutory application was filed by MoHFW, Govt of India in Hon'ble Supreme Court 380 of 2009 titled as "Simran Jain vs. Union of India" explaining the reasons for inability to conduct NEET-UG from 2012 onwards.

He also apprised the Board about the legal Status of NEET-UG and NEET-PG after 22nd July 2011 and that Tamil Nadu, Andhra Pradesh High Courts, has granted stay against NEET-UG. AP High Court also granted stay against NEET-PG for management seats. Four cases in the State of Karnataka challenged against NEET-UG and NEET-PG and decision is pending.

After discussion the Board decided the following:

1. Information about NEET-PG on MCI website replaced as follows: "NEET-PG will be held from 2013 onwards. Further details will be available in the due course".
2. Syllabus information related to NEET-UG will be retained.
3. Decisions are yet to be made regarding MCI filing counter affidavits in the cases where stay has been granted against NEET examinations.

13. Bachelor of Rural Health Care (BHRC) course – regarding.

Read: the matter with regard to Bachelor of Rural Health Care (BHRC) course.

The item was deferred.

14. Incorporation in amendments to the Pre-Conception and Pre-Natal Diagnostic Techniques (Prohibition of Sex Selection) (PC & PNDT) Act, 1994 (as amended in 2003).

Read: the matter with regard to incorporation in amendments to the Pre-Conception and Pre-Natal Diagnostic Techniques (Prohibition of Sex Selection) (PC & PNDT) Act, 1994 (as amended in 2003).

The item was deferred for next meeting.

15. Approval of P.G. Committee minutes held on 4th November, 2011.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of P.G. Committee minutes held on 4th November, 2011.

The item was deferred for next meeting.

16. Regarding excess admission at J. N. Medical College, Aligarh during the academic year 2009-10.

Read: the matter with regard to regarding excess admission at J. N. Medical College, Aligarh during the academic year 2009-10.

The item was deferred for next meeting.

17. Starting of Postgraduate course at Dr. Somervell Memorial CSI Medical College & Hospital, Thiruvananthapuram u/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to starting of Postgraduate course at Dr. Somervell Memorial CSI Medical College & Hospital, Thiruvananthapuram u/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The item was deferred for next meeting.

18. Consideration of the matter with regard to conversion of D.Ortho. seats to MS(Ortho) at Sancheti Institute for Orthopaedics & Rehabilitation, Pune, Maharashtra.

Read: the matter with regard to consideration of the matter with regard to conversion of D.Ortho. seats to MS(Ortho) at Sancheti Institute for Orthopaedics & Rehabilitation, Pune, Maharashtra.

The item was deferred for next meeting.

19. Application form for financial assistance for CME programmes/ workshop/post graduate course in India.

Read: the matter with regard to application form for financial assistance for CME programmes/ workshop/post graduate course in India.

The item was deferred for next meeting.

20. Consideration for grant of registration to the candidates of Xavier University, School of Medicine, Netherlands Antiles - reg.

Read: the matter with regard to consideration for grant of registration to the candidates of Xavier University, School of Medicine, Netherlands Antiles.

The item was deferred for next meeting.

(Dr. P.Prasannaraj)
Addl.Secretary

(Dr. (Prof.) Sangeeta Sharma)
Secretary

(Dr.(Prof.) K.S. Sharma)
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) H S Rissam)
Member

(Dr. Rajiv C Yeravdekar)
Member

(Dr. Purshotam Lal)
Member

(Dr. Ashok Gupta)
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) K Mohandas)
Member

(Dr. (Prof.) K.K. Talwar)
Chairman