## No. MCI-5(3)/2016-Med.Misc./

### MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA NEW DELHI

### **EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

Minutes of the meeting of the Executive Committee held on 13<sup>th</sup> May, 2016 at 11:00 a.m. in the Council Office at Sector 8, Pocket 14, Dwarka, New Delhi.

### Present:

	1	
Dr. Jayshree Mehta	President Medical Council of India, Former Professor of Surgery, Govt. Medical College, Vadodara, Gujarat.	
Dr. C.V. Bhirmanandham	Vice-President, Medical Council of India, Former Vice-Chancellor of Dr. M.G.R. Health University, <b>Tamil Nadu</b>	
Dr. Anil Mahajan	Professor & HOD, General Medicine, Government Medical College, Jammu, J&K.	
Dr. Baldev Singh Aulakh	Professor of Urology and Transplant Surgery, Head Transplant Unit, Dayanand Medical College, Ludhiana	
Dr. G.B. Gupta	Vice-Chancellor, Ayush & Health Sciences University, Raipur, <b>Chhattisgarh</b>	
Dr. K K Gupta	Principal, LLRM Medical College Campus, Garh Road, <b>Meerut (UP)</b>	
Dr. Ravindra H.N.	Kalashree Nilaya, Krishna Nagar, Near Railway Station, Pandavapura Tq., Pandavapur, Mandya Dist., Karnataka.	
Dr. Radha Madhab Tripathy	Professor and Head, Department of Community Medicine, MKCG Medical College, Berhampur.	
Dr. Vijay Prakash Singh	Professor & Head, Department Of Gastroenterology, Patna Medical College, Patna, Bihar	
Dr. Viney N. Jindal	Medical Director & Consultant Neurosurgeon, Apollo Victor Hospital 18, GOMECO Housing Society, <u>Bambolim, Goa</u> .	

Dr. Reena Nayyar, Secretary I/c.

# 1. <u>Minutes of the Executive Committee Meeting held on 28<sup>th</sup> April,</u> 2016 – Confirmation of.

The Executive Committee of the Council while confirming the minutes of the Executive Committee meeting held on 28<sup>th</sup> April, 2016 decided to read the decision of the following item as under:-

#### Item No. 78. Request for change of name of University from Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur to Mahatma Gandhi University of Medical Sciences & Technology, Jaipur for the award of MBBS Degree in respect of Mahatma Gandhi Medical College, Jaipur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter dated 21/03/2016 from the Under Secretary, Ministry of Health & FW, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi forwarding therewith letter dated 19/02/2016 received from the Registrar, Mahatma Gandhi University of Medical Sciences & Technology, Jaipur and observed that the Executive Committee at its meeting held on June 1988 had decided as under:-

"No inspection is required where there is change of name and change of affiliation of the University or the college whose medical qualifications are already recognized and included in the 1st schedule to the IMC Act, 1956 unless the Executive Committee decided otherwise".

The Executive Committee of the Council further noted that Mahatma Gandhi Medical College, Jaipur is recognized medical college for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to approve the request of the Registrar, Mahatma Gandhi University of Medical Sciences & Technology, Jaipur with regard to the change of name of University from Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur to Mahatma Gandhi University of Medical Sciences & Technology, Jaipur

The Committee further decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

# Minutes of the last meeting of the Executive Committee – Action taken thereon.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the action taken on the minutes of the Executive Committee meeting held on 28<sup>th</sup> April, 2016.

#### 3. <u>Pending Items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive</u> <u>Committee.</u>

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the pending items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive Committee.

4. <u>Approval of the minutes of the Monitoring Sub-Committee meeting</u> held on 29.03.2016 – Regarding.

2.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the minutes of the Monitoring Sub-Committee meeting held on 29.03.2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the remarks of Monitoring Sub-Committee which read as under:

*"College has not provided Entrance Test Marks of 15 candidates under Management Quota because as per prospectus (attached) these students were not required to appear in the Entrance Test.* 

The college authorities have stated that Management category includes NRI students sponsored category & foreign nationals without clearly specifying how many are actually NRI.

As per order of Hon'ble Supreme Court only NRI students are exempt from appearing in Entrance Test hence other than NRI students all other students admitted under Management quota without Entrance Test should be discharged because their admission is not in accordance with GMER 1997. *Furthermore, the prospectus for 2014-15 admission states that students should seems 50<sup>th</sup> percentile in Entrance Test for category A & B. This is also incorrect and it should read as 50% as per the GMER 1997."* 

After detailed deliberations, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to approve the decision of the Sub-Committee to discharge all other students except NRI students admitted under management quota without Entrance Test. It was further decided that the Dean of the Institute be directed to discharge such students and submit compliance within 02 weeks. A copy of the communication be also sent to DME, University. Delhi Medical Council and the representative of Delhi on the MCI. It was also decided to approve the decision regarding minimum marks which have to be fixed as per Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 as amended and office was directed to intimate the institute accordingly.

#### 5. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Bhilai, Chhattisgarh by</u> <u>Shri Gangajali Education Society, Bhilai, Chhattisgarh with an</u> <u>annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Chhattisgarh Ayush</u> <u>and Health Sciences, University, Raipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act,</u> <u>1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Bhilai, Chhattisgarh by Shri Gangajali Education Society, Bhilai, Chhattisgarh with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Chhattisgarh Ayush and Health Sciences, University, Raipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (17<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) along with previous assessment report(15<sup>th</sup>&16<sup>th</sup> January, 2016) as well as letter dated 20/04/2016 received from the college authorities and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 6.35 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. It appeared that teaching faculty were just called for assessment. They are allotted staff quarters situated at their technical campus.
- 3. No doctor was available in Paediatrics ward, female General Medicine ward.
- 4. No Senior or Junior Resident was staying in the hostel. All the rooms were empty with a single bed, mattress & pillow. There was no other furniture.
- 5. Not a single Resident is staying in ResidentsqHostel.
- 6. OPD attendance was 340 till 12 noon on day of assessment. Most of OPD were empty till 09:30 a.m. after which patients were seen to be brought, most of whom were females. Genuineness of these patients is doubtful.
- 7. Bed occupancy is 37 % on day of assessment.
- 8. Patients of other specialties were found to be admitted in General Medicine & General Surgery wards. There were patients of low backache & knee joint problems in General Surgery. Patients of low backache were found in Gynaecology ward also. Many were such who did not require admission.
- 9. Data of Radiological & Laboratory investigations provided by institute appears to be exaggerated.
- 10. OPD: Optometrist is not available in Ophthalmology OPD. Dark room is not functional. IN ENT OPD, instruments & examination system is not proper.
- 11. There was only 1 Major operation planned on day of assessment but that was postponed; resultantly there was NIL Major operation on day of assessment. There was NIL Minor operation on day of assessment.
- 12. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.

- 13. Radiological & Laboratory investigation workload is grossly inadequate.
- 14. O.T.: There was no activity in O.T. I, III & IV on day of assessment. O.T. list was not in proper format.
- 15. ICUs: There were 3 patients in ICCU who were non-Cardiac patients. There was no referral for 2 of them. In PICU/NICU, 2 patients were admitted out of whom 1 did not merit admission. In MICU, out of 3 patients, 2 did not merit admission. There was NIL patient in SICU.
- 16. Casualty: There were 6 patients out of whom 4 were non-genuine.
- 17. MRD: It is partly computerized.
- 18. Speech Therapist is not available.
- 19. Residential Quarters: In the quarters for Non-teaching staff, there is no facility for cooking in quarters. Except in 5 quarters, there are common bath rooms.
- 20. Anatomy Department: NIL Specimens are available.
- 21. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Bhilai, Chhattisgarh by Shri Gangajali Education Society, Bhilai, Chhattisgarh under Chhattisgarh Ayush and Health Sciences, University, Raipur to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 6. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Deralakatte, Mangalore,</u> D.K., Karnataka by Kanachur Islamic Education Trust, Mangalore with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Deralakatte, Mangalore, D.K., Karnataka by Kanachur Islamic Education Trust, Mangalore with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (30<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) along with previous assessment report (07<sup>th</sup>& 08<sup>th</sup> January, 2016) as well as letter/representation dated 31/03/2016 received form the college authorities and a DO letter dated 27/04/2016 from Honople Vajubhai Vala, Governor of Karnataka forwarding therewith a representation dated 28/04/2016 received from the Chairman of the college and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 43.48 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. All Senior Residents are not staying within campus. None of the Senior Residents was able to provide proof of previous experience as Junior Resident. One Senior Resident of Skin & VD was doing private practice in evening which is not permissible.
- 3. OPD attendance was 548 against requirement of 600 on day of assessment.
- 4. Bed occupancy was 38.33 % against requirement of 60 % on day of assessment.
- 5. Wards: In the wards of General Medicine & General Surgery, Nursing Station is provided only on 1 side although wards are into 2 sides. Ancillary facilities are not available in many wards. Male patients of General Medicine and Tb & Chest and also female patients of General Medicine and Tb & Chest are kept together in the respective wards.
- 6. There was NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 7. ICUs: There was NIL patient in SICU.
- 8. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Deralakatte, Mangalore, D.K., Karnataka by Kanachur Islamic Education Trust, Mangalore under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 7. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Israna, Panipat, Haryana</u> by Shanti Devi Charitable Trust, Pitampura, New Delhi with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Pt. B.D Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Israna, Panipat, Haryana by Shanti Devi Charitable Trust, Pitampura, New Delhi with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Pt. B.D Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (1<sup>st</sup> April, 2016) along with previous assessment report (09<sup>th</sup> & 10<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) as well as letter/representation dated 11/04/2016 received from the college authorities and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 84.61 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 89.13 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. There is no Medical Superintendent in the affiliated hospital.
- 4. OPD was non-operational on day of assessment. OPD attendance was NIL when seen by assessors at 10:00 a.m. with no doctors and Nursing & other staff. Total OPD attendance was only 54 on day of assessment.
- 5. Bed occupancy was Zero on day of assessment.
- 6. Wards: Many wards were non-functional. Wards are not as per MSR Regulations.
- 7. There were NIL Major & Minor operations on day of assessment.
- There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 9. USG workload was NIL on day of assessment.
- 10. Laboratory investigations workload was NIL on day of assessment.
- 11. Ancillary facilities like ICUs, Blood Bank, Laundry are non-functional.
- 12. There is only 1 mobile X-ray machine against requirement of 2. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 13. No blood has been issued since last several weeks.
- 14. No record of drugs dispensed to patients is available.
- 15. Nursing, Paramedical & Other Non-teaching staff are grossly inadequate.
- 16. Residential Quarters for non-teaching staff are of dormitory type with 4 persons in a room which cannot be construed as quarters.
- 17. Anatomy department: Cadavers are not available. Catalogues of Histology slides are not available.
- 18. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Israna, Panipat, Haryana by Shanti Devi Charitable Trust, Pitampura, New Delhi under Pt. B.D Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 8. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Vadodara, Gujarat by</u> <u>Parul University with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under</u> <u>Parul University, Vadodara u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the</u> <u>academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Vadodara, Gujarat by Parul University with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Parul University, Vadodara u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (11<sup>th</sup> April 2016) along with previous assessment report (1<sup>st</sup>& 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Vadodara, Gujarat by Parul University with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Parul University, Vadodara u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 9. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Palakkad, Kerala by Royal</u> <u>Medical Trust, Palakkad, Kerala with an annual intake of 150</u> <u>students under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s</u> <u>10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Palakkad, Kerala by Royal Medical Trust, Palakkad, Kerala with an annual intake of 150 students under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (10<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (16<sup>th</sup>& 17<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) as well as a letter dated 10/02/2016 received from the Dean of the college and noted the following:-

- 1. OPD attendance was only 350 at 2 p.m. against requirement of 600.
- 2. Bed occupancy was 55.33 % against requirement of 60 % on day of assessment.
- 3. There were only 5 Major operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
- 4. Makeshift arrangements have been done in Orthopaedics OPD for Plaster cutting room & Dressing room. Deficiency is not fully rectified.
- 5. Audiometry & Speech Therapy rooms are not actually rooms but only partitions. Deficiency is not fully rectified.
- 6. Casualty: In Casualty, there were only 3 patients admitted upto 2:30 p.m.; these patients were such who did not really require admission in Casualty as they had minor complaints like abdominal pain, headache, Psychiatric observation, etc.
- 7. ICUs: 3 patients with insignificant complaints were admitted in ICU. 2 patients with insignificant complaints were admitted in MICU. 3 patients with insignificant complaints like Postoperative cataract surgery, old fracture implant removal, postoperative Haemorrhoidectomy were admitted in SICU. 3 recently delivered normal babies were kept in NICU. Only 1 patient in PICU was of Downg syndrome with no other complaint.
- 8. Wards: Most of the wards are not as per MSR Regulations. Ancillary facilities are not available inside the wards.
- 9. There was only 1 Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 10. Cytopathology workload was NIL on day of assessment.
- 11. In female ENT ward, female Psychiatry patients were admitted.
- 12. In Ophthalmology ward, patient with unrelated minor complaint like Headache was admitted.

- 13. In ENT male ward, one female patient by name of Shifa (IP # 44436/16, Hospital # 476/16) was admitted since 08/02/2016.
- 14. In Orthopaedics ward, admitted patients had minor complaints like backache, nonspecific limb pain.
- 15. In female General Medicine ward, patient named Thangamma, age 80 y, (IP # 44355/16, Hospital # 11315/16) was admitted on 05/02/2016 with complaint of Right Lower Limb pain evaluation with Diabetes & Hypertension. On examination, it was found that she can move both limbs.
- 16. In male General Surgery ward, patient named Abu Bacr Siddiqui was shown as having Head injury but on examination, she was found to have no complaint at all.
- 17. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Palakkad, Kerala by Royal Medical Trust, Palakkad, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 10. Establishment of new medical college at Jagatpura, Jaipur with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Jaipur National University, Jaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Jagatpura, Jaipur with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Jaipur National University, Jaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (11<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (1<sup>st</sup>& 2<sup>nd</sup> December, 2015) as well as letter dated 15/02/2016 received from the Principal of the college and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Jagatpura, Jaipur with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Jaipur National University, Jaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 11. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Nathdwara, Rajsamand,</u> Rajasthan by Ananta Charitable Educational Society, Udaipur with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Nathdwara, Rajsamand, Rajasthan by Ananta Charitable Educational Society, Udaipur with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (1<sup>st</sup>& 2<sup>nd</sup> December, 2015) along with letter dated 24/02/2016 received from the appointed team of Council assessors and noted the following:-

"After accepting the letter on behalf of assessors, the Principal, Prof (Dr.) Jitendra Kain & Medical Superintendent Dr. V.B Gaur refused the inspection process and gave a letter to the same effect. I requested the Principal to continue the inspection process in presence of other faculty if he was sick, but he refused.

We the assessor visited the hospital & college grossly on telephonic directions from Medical Council of India and taken the photograph in our own mobile. The brief report is as follows:-

1. Hospital bed occupancy is 28.33% (85 out of 300). Medicine patients: 28, Paediatrics: 10, Surgery: 12, Orthopaedics: 13, OB: 06, Gynae:07, ENT & Ophthalmology: Nil, NICU, PICU: Nil, casualty: 02 till 12.30 PM SICU:03.

2. Central laboratory: In Biochemistry register entries of 08 patients was 23.02.2016. On 24.2.2016 till 11.45 no entry of patient in the register.

3. In Histopathology register last date of entry was 17.2.2016. Register was not upto date. Fake entry was done in register. The patient with Hernioplasty with mesh repair name, Lalit Singh entered in the register for Histopathology. No specimen of the Patient, Lad Kumar was available in the laboratory.

4. Blood bank last consumption of blood was on 15.2.2016 (only one). No expiry date is mentioned in the blood bag. Only seven whole blood was stored on the day of inspection.

5. Library: No outside reading room was available. In digital library no electric connection was found at the time of inspection.

6. Anatomy, Physiology & Biochemistry department ear marked area available and construction work was going on during time of inspection in the College side. No wet specimen was displayed in the anatomy museum. Physiology laboratory was under process of construction.

7. All hostels & resident quarters are under construction. No residents are staying in the hostel.

8. Few faculties of Anatomy, Physiology & Biochemistry was present with the assessor during the time of inspection at 12.30PM.

9. At 9.45 AM during entry of assessors no patient was found in the OPD.

10. Two lecture theatres of 180 capacities are available.

Signature of Principal was not taken because he refused the inspection process.

The Executive Committee of the Council also perused the letter from Principal of the college to the Health Secretary, Govt. of India, which reads as under

"On this date 24.02.2016 MCI team of 3 assessors name Dr. Karabi Baral, Dr. Nina Das, Dr. M.K. Ramesh, MCI team has arrived at 09.45 am to Ananta Instt. Of Medical Sciences & Research Center to carry out the compliance verification assessment. But because of sickness of Principal, we are not ready for assessment. So in the capacity of Principal of the Institution, I Dr. Jitendra Kain of Ananta Instt. Of Medical Sciences & Research Center refused to submit our institution for assessment for MCI. This is voluntary on our part."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Nathdwara, Rajsamand, Rajasthan by Ananta Charitable Educational Society, Udaipur under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 12. Establishment of new medical college at Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh by Advance Medical Science and Educational Society with an annual intake of 150 students under Madhya Pradesh Medical University, Jabalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh by Advance Medical Science and Educational Society with an annual intake of 150 students under Madhya Pradesh Medical University, Jabalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (2<sup>nd</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (11<sup>th</sup>& 12<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) and letter dated 20/02/2016 received from Sh. Amitabh Agnihotri forwarding therewith a copy of Order dated 03/02/2016 passed by Honople High Court of Madhya Pradesh at Jabalpur in W.P. No.2110/2016 and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 29.23 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 43.47 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Most of Senior Residents are not residing in the hostel.
- 4. Bed occupancy was 20 % on day of assessment.
- 5. OPD attendance is only 446 which is inadequate.
- 6. In case of Dr. Rajesh Gattani, Professor of General Surgery, Dr. Preeti Gattani, Professor of O.G. and Dr. Vikas Trehan, Asst. Prof. of Anaesthesiology, it was observed that there was false signature in attendance sheet. They were absent during head counting.
- 7. In General Medicine, General Surgery, Orthopaedics, ENT wards, many non-genuine patients with minor complaints were admitted. Many patients did not have relevant complaints in case paper as well as treatment and investigation record.
- 8. Blood Bank is not functional.
- 9. Casualty: It was empty at 10:30 a.m. There were only 4 registered patients.
- 10. Wards: There are no Demonstration rooms, Pantry, Store room, Examination cum Treatment room Doctorsqduty room, Nursing station in many wards. Deficiency remains as it is.
- ICUs: ICCU, MICU & SICU has only 1 Ventilator. In PICU & NICU only basic equipment is available. There was only 1 patient in PICU, NICU on day of assessment. In PICU, operated patient of Hydrocele without any serious complication was kept. (Mr. P.N. Vishwakarma, IPD # 10633)
- 12. Intercom facility is not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 13. Central Clinical Laboratory has only OPD collection. There is no indoor collection.
- 14. There was only 1 Major & 1 Minor operation on day of assessment.
- 15. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 16. Radiological & Laboratory investigation workload is inadequate.
- 17. In Serology, Haematology, Cytopathology & Histopathology laboratories, false entry & reporting were observed.
- 18. Unit-wise bed distribution is not there.
- 19. CSSD had dispatched only 1 Drum & 3 Trays on day of assessment which is inadequate.
- 20. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh by Advance Medical Science and Educational Society under Madhya Pradesh Medical University, Jabalpur to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

The Executive Committee of the Council also decided to refer the matter to the Ethics Committee for necessary action in the matter.

#### 13. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh</u> by Prasad Education Trust, Uttar Pradesh with an annual intake of <u>150 students under Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Awadh University,</u> <u>Faizabad u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-</u> 2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh by Prasad Education Trust, Uttar Pradesh with an annual intake of 150 students under Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Awadh University, Faizabad u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (5<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (11<sup>th</sup>& 12<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 52.30 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 54.34 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy is 51.66 % (i.e. 155 out of 300 beds) on day of assessment which is inadequate.
- 4. ICUs: There was NIL patient in ICCU & only 2 patients each in PICU/NICU, SICU on day of assessment.
- Wards: Wards of Skin & VD, Ophthalmology, Tb & Chest, ENT are not as per MSR Regulations. There is no Nursing station, Examination room, Pantry, Store room, Duty room, Demonstration room inside the wards.
   Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh by Prasad Education Trust, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Awadh University, Faizabad to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 14. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Raipur, Chhattisgarh by</u> Lord Buddha Educational Society, Raipur with an annual intake of 150 students under Chhattisgarh Ayush and Health Sciences University, Raipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Raipur, Chhattisgarh by Lord Buddha Educational Society, Raipur with an annual intake of 150 students under Chhattisgarh Ayush and Health Sciences University, Raipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (5<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (3<sup>rd</sup>& 4<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) and noted the following:

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 73.84 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 67.39 % as detailed in the report. The list of Residents on night duty was provided to assessors after 11:30 a.m. i.e. after completion of signature during attendance.

- 3. At 09:45 a.m., OPD was closed. At 10:30 a.m., total number of patients in OPD was only 04.
- 4. Bed occupancy is 17 % on day of assessment.
- 5. There was NIL Major operation & 1 Minor operation on day of assessment.
- There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 7. There was NIL Histopathological & Cytopathological workload till 12 noon on day of assessment.
- 8. Workload of Radiological & Laboratory investigations on day of assessment was poor.
- 9. ICUs: There was only 1 patient in MICU & NIL in SICU, PICU, NICU on day of assessment. There is no Ventilator in NICU.
- 10. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
- 11. OPD: Specialty clinic rooms in Paediatrics OPD were locked at time of assessment.
- 12. Blood bank license is issued in the name of a person who has left the institute on 28/03/2014.
- Ophthalmology patients were kept in female General Medicine ward.
   Postoperative Hernioplasty patients were kept in male General Medicine ward.
- 14. Wards: Demonstration rooms are smaller than required. Deficiency is partially rectified.
- 15. ResidentsqHostel is yet to be completed. Presently they are staying in Studentsqhostel.
- 16. NursesqHostel is partially furnished.
- 17. Anatomy Department: Specimens are less. Cadavers are not available.
- 18. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Raipur, Chhattisgarh by Lord Buddha Educational Society, Raipur under Chhattisgarh Ayush and Health Sciences University, Raipur to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

# 15. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Kuttapuzha, Thiruvalla, Kerala by Believers Church India, Thiruvalla, Kerala with an annual intake of 100 students under the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Kuttapuzha, Thiruvalla, Kerala by Believers Church India, Thiruvalla, Kerala with an annual intake of 100 students under the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (10<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (16<sup>th</sup>& 17<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) as well as letter dated 10/02/2016 received from Dr. B.C Dutta, Co-ordinator and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Kuttapuzha, Thiruvalla, Kerala by Believers Church India, Thiruvalla, Kerala with an annual intake of 100 students under the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

#### 16. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Akathumuri, Varkala,</u> <u>Thiruvananthapuram by S.R Educational & Charitable Trust, Kerala</u> <u>with an annual intake of 100 students under Kerala University of</u> <u>Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the</u> <u>academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Akathumuri, Varkala, Thiruvananthapuram by S.R Educational & Charitable Trust, Kerala with an annual intake of 100 students under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (10<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (16<sup>th</sup>& 17<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) and noted the following:

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 8.62 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 31.11 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. OPD attendance was only 245 on day of assessment.
- 4. Bed occupancy was 36.33 % on day of assessment. Many admitted patients did not require admission.
- 5. OPD: There is no record in individual OPDs to cross verify with Central Record. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 6. General Surgery & ENT, General Surgery & Gynaecology, Orthopaedics & Ophthalmology, General Medicine & Tb & Chest & Skin & VD wards are combined.
- 7. O.T.: As per list, there were only 3 Major operations posted for the whole hospital on day of assessment; however, O.T. had not started till time of taking round in O.T.
- 8. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 9. Radiological & Laboratory investigations workload was inadequate on day of assessment.
- 10. Workload of Histopathology & Cytopathology is NIL on day of assessment.
- 11. Casualty: 2 patients kept in Casualty for observation did not have any serious indication.
- 12. ICUs: There is no ICCU. MICU & SICU had only 2 patients each. There is no Central Monitor. PICU had only 1 patient. NICU is not functional.
- Blood Bank: There were only 3 units in stock on day of assessment. NIL unit was issued on day of assessment.
- 14. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Akathumuri, Varkala, Thiruvananthapuram by S.R Educational & Charitable Trust, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 17. Establishment of new medical college at Devanhalli, Bangalore, Karnataka by Akash Education & Development Trust, Karnataka with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Devanhalli, Bangalore, Karnataka by Akash Education & Development Trust,

Karnataka with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (11<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) along with previous assessment report (7<sup>th</sup>& 8<sup>th</sup> January, 2016) and noted the following:

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 6.15 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. OPD attendance on day of assessment is 485 against 600 required.
- 3. Bed occupancy was 48 % on day of assessment.
- 4. Many patients who were not genuine and did not require admission were admitted in wards of General Medicine, General Surgery, O.G., Tb & Chest, Skin & VD and Orthopaedics.
- 5. In General Medicine ward, a patient named Satish (Reg.# 51007) was admitted on 24/02/2016 without diagnosis and treatment till 11/03/2016. He looked healthy.
- 6. ICUs: Nursing staff in ICUs is inadequate and is not properly qualified. Past record is not available.
- 7. Labour Room: There was no woman in labour room. There was NIL Normal Delivery till 4 p.m.
- 8. OPD: Examination rooms were vacant as the number of patients was very less at time of taking round as compared with data generated by computer.
- 9. Wards: In General Surgery, 1 Nurse is looking after 2 wards. Nursing stations are not as per norms. Many wards do not have Demonstration Rooms.
- 10. Nursing staff is inadequate.
- 11. It appears that some Residents are not staying in the campus.
- 12. Central Kitchen is not hygienic. No record of food trays dispatched is available.
- 13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Devanhalli, Bangalore, Karnataka by Akash Education & Development Trust, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

18. Establishment of new medical college at Manamai – Nellur, Tamilnadu by Ponnaiyah Institute of Medical Sciences & Technology Trust, Tamilnadu with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Manamai . Nellur, Tamilnadu by Ponnaiyah Institute of Medical Sciences & Technology Trust, Tamilnadu with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (10<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) along with previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) and noted the following:

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 38.46 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 26.09 % as detailed in the report.

- 3. OPD attendance on day of assessment is 371 against requirement of 600.
- 4. Bed occupancy on day of assessment is 12.66 %.
- 5. There was NIL Major operation on day of assessment.
- 6. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 7. Histopathology & Cytopathology workload on day of assessment is only 1 each which is grossly inadequate.
- 8. There was NIL patient in ICCU & all ICUs on day of assessment.
- 9. Blood Bank License is not available.
- 10. Casualty attendance was only 08 on day of assessment.
- 11. Radiological investigation workload is inadequate.
- 12. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Manamai . Nellur, Tamilnadu by Ponnaiyah Institute of Medical Sciences & Technology Trust, Tamilnadu under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 19. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Dewas, Madhya Pradesh</u> by Amaltas Education Welfare Society, Indore, M.P with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Madhya Pradesh Medical Science University, Jabalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Dewas, Madhya Pradesh by Amaltas Education Welfare Society, Indore, M.P with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Madhya Pradesh Medical Science University, Jabalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (17<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) along with previous assessment report (18<sup>th</sup>& 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) and noted the following:

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 20 % as detailed in the report. Many staff members as detailed in the report have done proxy signing but absent during headcounting.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 73.9 % as detailed in the report. Many Residents as detailed in report have done proxy signing but absent during headcounting.
- 3. OPD attendance was only 504 on day of assessment. Individual OPD records do not match with central registry record.
- 4. Bed occupancy was 56 % on day of assessment which is inadequate. Many non-genuine patients were admitted in General Surgery, General Medicine and Obstetrics & Gynaecology. Past record was not available.
- 5. Unitwise distribution of beds is not there in wards of General Medicine, General Surgery and Obstetrics & Gynaecology.
- 6. Birth register was not available.
- 7. Histopathology & Cytopathology workload is NIL on day of assessment.
- 8. There are NIL Special investigations.
- 9. ICUs: There was only 1 patient in ICCU. There was NIL patient in all other ICUs. There was no past record. Nursing staff is inadequate.
- 10. Blood Bank is non-functional. License is not available.
- 11. Central Photography Section: Photographer was not available on day of assessment.
- 12. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Dewas, Madhya Pradesh by Amaltas Education Welfare Society, Indore, M.P under Madhya Pradesh Medical Science University, Jabalpur to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

The Executive Committee of the Council also decided to refer the matter to the Ethics Committee for necessary action in the matter.

#### 20. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Vikarabad, Telangana by</u> <u>BMMT Institute of Education, Vikarabad, Telanagana with an</u> <u>annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Dr. N.T.R University of</u> <u>Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC</u> <u>Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Vikarabad, Telangana by BMMT Institute of Education, Vikarabad, Telanagana with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Dr. N.T.R University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (16<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) along with previous assessment report (06<sup>th</sup>& 07<sup>th</sup> January, 2016) and noted the following:

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 63.07 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 100 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. OPD attendance is < 400 on day of assessment. Data given by the college are highly inflated.
- 4. Bed occupancy was around 40 % on day of assessment. Many patients are not genuine or were kept longer than necessary to inflate bed occupancy.
- Radiological & Laboratory investigations workload is inadequate on day of assessment.
- 6. Radiodiagnosis department: Register of Radiodiagnosis department showed entry of 47 X-rays at time of assessment; however there was evidence of only 27 Plain X-rays performed at the time of visit. NIL contrast Radiology was performed on day of assessment.
- 7. Histopathology workload on day of assessment was only 03. Data given by institute are highly inflated.
- ICUs: There was only 1 patient in SICU on day of assessment. Several patients in ICCU, MICU & SICU were kept for longer periods than necessary.
- 9. Nursing staff: 153 Nurses are available against requirement of 175.
- 10. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Vikarabad, Telangana by BMMT Institute of Education, Vikarabad, Telanagana under Dr. N.T.R University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 21. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Unnao, Uttar Pradesh by</u> <u>Saraswati Educational Charitable Trust, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh</u> <u>with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Chhatrapati</u> <u>Shahuji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956</u> <u>for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Unnao, Uttar Pradesh by Saraswati Educational Charitable Trust, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Chhatrapati Shahuji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (20<sup>th</sup>& 21<sup>st</sup> January 2016) along with letter dated 18.03.2016 received from the appointed team of the Council assessors and noted the following:

"We reached principal's office at 9:30 AM. Principal Dr. Mathur was not in the office. Medical Superintendent Dr H S Nagar accepted the instructions given to principal at 9 30 AM. Accordingly we started the process. Dr Karabi Baral visited block B of Hospital building with MS. Dr Nimesh Verma visited block A with a Head Nurse and PRO of the hospital. Dr Nina Das waited in the principal's room for attendance of the faculty and resident doctors.

Principal came to the office at 10 AM and informed Dr Nina Das that they would not allow the inspection process as the college has declared holidays in view of Holi & Good Friday from 18-03-2016 to 27-03-2016. So, we are submitting the brief report of this institution, what we have seen till 10:30 AM.

Department	Available Beds	Patients
Medicine	72	05
Paediatrics	24	00
TB Chest	08	00
Skin& VD	08	00
Psychitry	08	00
General Surgery	90	10
orthopedics	30	06
Ophthal	10	01
ENT	10	00
ObGyn	40	15
	300	37

#### 1) Bed Occupancy

2) Labor Room one patient was in the LR, they claimed she has just delivered, but the baby was found not to be the newborn and case history sheet incomplete, no para/gravida mentioned in the case sheet. Photograph taken.
3) OT : . There are Five OTs and one septic OT on the first floor of A Block. No surgery was going on at 10 AM. Two patients were waiting to be operated to be hernia.

4) OPD :

A) Pharmacy: List of only 46 drugs available was given. In B block, Till 10 AM, only three patients reported there. In A Block Pharmacy, till 10 AM no patient reported.

*B)* Registration: Could not provide the printout of registrations done. Claiming two hundred registrations till 10 AM ,but at 9 :30 AM, when we entered in the hospital campus, few patients were found near the OPD block.

5) Casualty: Two patients were there in casualty ward, as The ICU was closed for fumigation, as per the staff working there. Surgery Minor OT was closed, as they claimed it is being fumigated.

6) Intensive Care: ICCU, SICU, MICU & PICU were locked. Two bedded NICU adjacent to Labor Room had one healthy baby.

7) Central Kitchen : At 10:30 AM, 3 staff were there. No kitchen register. Only one requisition for patient diet given to the assessor, where date overwriting was there. Only 15 patients from OBGYN Ward were there in the list.

No faculty and resident doctors came for signature on attendance sheet, hence they are not verified.

As Principal refused the inspection, his signature could not be taken on the report."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Unnao, Uttar Pradesh by Saraswati Educational Charitable Trust, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh under Chhatrapati Shahuji Maharaj University, Kanpur to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 22. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Udaipur, Rajasthan by</u> <u>American International Health Management Limited, Udaipur,</u> <u>Rajasthan with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under</u> <u>Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur u/s 10A of the IMC</u> <u>Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Udaipur, Rajasthan by American International Health Management Limited, Udaipur, Rajasthan with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (24<sup>th</sup> February, 2016) along with previous assessment report (18<sup>th</sup>& 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) as well as letter dated 25/02/2016 received from Dr. V. Vijaya Kumari, Bangalore (Co-ordinator) and letter dated 17.03.2016 received from the college authorities and noted the following:

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 43 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 100 % as none of the Residents are staying in the campus.
- 3. Bed occupancy on day of assessment is 57 % which is inadequate. Patients were kept without indication to inflate bed occupancy.
- 4. Many faculty/residents did not have residence proof. In the late evening some of them (5-6) produced telephone bill as proof of residence which were accepted. When similar bills were produced, it raised the suspicion of these as fake telephone bills. One of the faculty who came last, Dr. Dipak Ladda, Assoc.Prof. & HOD Pathology was confronted by asking him to dial his home number which did not have any response and it was not saved as Home on his mobile. When probed further, he confessed that it is a fake proof. Similar telephone bills as proof of residence were given by 4-5 faculty who were not available for confronting in this regards as they left the Institute. Remarks were not written on the fake certificate and on Declaration Forms of these faculty as it was packed and given it to courier person who came to institute for picking up the delivery of the parcel.
- 5. The Dean was requested to provide the allotment list for faculty who were allotted staff quarters and resident allotment in the morning which was mentioned in the letter which was given to him on after reaching the

institute. The request was made several times. Finally the list was produced in the evening. One of the Assessor verified the resident hostel in the morning and noted that no resident is staying in it. The Dean also confirmed the same. During resident verification, residents were claiming for staying in the hostel. Another Assessor alongwith Dean and Medicine Residents went to the hostel to verify the claim which turn out to be false. Residents confessed that they were asked to tell the lie to the Assessors during verification. Many residents gave in writing the Udaipur home address from where they are doing up-down.

- 6. There are two pieces of land which are divided by a wide public road having heavy traffic. On one piece of land college building, hospital building and a Cancer Hospital (not part of college) are located. On second piece of land student, resident and nurses hostels and staff quarters are present.
- 7. There were 05 Major operations & NIL Minor operations on day of assessment.
- 8. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 9. Data of Clinical Material, Radiological & Laboratory investigations provided by institute are inflated.
- 10. Histopathology & Cytopathology workload is inadequate on day of assessment.
- 11. ICUs: There was NIL patient in ICUs on day of assessment.
- 12. Blood Bank is not functional.
- 13. Studentsq Hostels: Mess, Visitorsq room, A.C. study room, Recreation room are not available.
- 14. Residentsq Hostels: Mess, Visitorsq room, A.C. study room, Recreation room are not available.
- 15. Gas line is not available & there is no provision for placement of Gas cylinders.
- 16. Cadavers are not available.
- 17. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Udaipur, Rajasthan by American International Health Management Limited, Udaipur, Rajasthan under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

The Executive Committee of the Council also decided to refer the matter to the Ethics Committee to take action against the above mentioned faculty/residents of the college.

#### 23. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Pennalur, Kancheepuram</u> <u>Dist., Tamilnadu by Sri Devi Karumariamman Educational Trust,</u> <u>Tamilnadu with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under The</u> <u>Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC</u> <u>Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Pennalur, Kancheepuram Dist., Tamilnadu by Sri Devi Karumariamman Educational Trust, Tamilnadu with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (10<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) as well as letter dated

08.03.2016 received from Dr. S. Peter, Joint Managing Trustee, Sri Devi Karumariamman Educational Trust, Chennai against Sri Devi Karumariamman Educational Trust, Chennai, a letter/representation dated 15/03/2016 received from the college authorities and a complaint dated Nil from Dr. Pragna B Dolia, Chennai against Annai Medical College & Hospital, Chennai and noted the following:

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 6.15 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 34.78 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Many Residents are not staying in the campus.
- 4. OPD: On interviewing persons standing in queue for registration it was observed that many had similar vague complaints for which people will not generally seek medical advice.
- 5. On random verification, it was observed that majority of admitted patients had minor complaints not warranting admission.
- 6. O.T.: It was not started till 10:30 a.m. on day of assessment. 3 O.T.s were not open. There was NIL Major & NIL Minor operation on day of assessment; 2 patients in O.T. dress were sitting since morning till the afternoon.
- 7. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 8. Radiological & Laboratory investigation workload was low on day of assessment.
- 9. ICUs: Out of admitted patients in ICCU & MICU, only 2 could be considered as MICU admissions; the rest did not have any indication for admission in ICU.
- 10. Blood Bank: Only 5 units were stored in Blood Bank. On an average, only 0-1 unit is dispensed in a day.
- 11. Workload of Histopathology & Cytopathology was NIL.
- 12. Casualty: There were only 2 patients at time of visit. Patients from different wards were shifted to Casualty whose case sheets were not available with Sister i/c. They did not have any emergency condition.
- 13. Data of OPD attendance, Laboratory investigations, etc. as provided by institute appear to be inflated.
- 14. StudentsqHostels: They are partially furnished. Deficiency remains the same.
- 15. ResidentsqHostel: It is partially furnished. Deficiency remains the same.
- 16. NursesqHostel: It is partially furnished. Deficiency remains the same.
- 17. Anatomy department: Cadavers are not available.
- 18. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Pennalur, Kancheepuram Dist., Tamilnadu by Sri Devi Karumariamman Educational Trust, Tamilnadu under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 24. Establishment of new medical college at Marikavalasa, Vishakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh by Gayatri Vidya Parishad Society, Andhra Pradesh with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Marikavalasa, Vishakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh by Gayatri Vidya Parishad Society, Andhra Pradesh with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (11<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) as well as letter dated 12/03/2016 received from the college authorities and noted the following:

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 28.26 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Some Senior Residents are not staying in the campus except on emergency day.
- 3. Bed Occupancy is 56.49 % on day of assessment.
- 4. Wards: Male Medicine ward, Skin & VD, Tb & Chest, Psychiatry, Paediatrics, O.G., Male & female General Surgery, Orthopaedics, Ophthalmology, ENT wards are not as per MSR Regulations, like, there is no Examination cum Treatment room, Pantry, Store Room, Demonstration, Duty room.
- 5. Most of the patients admitted in General Medicine wards did not require admission. They had minor vague complaints like Bodyache, weakness, etc.
- 6. Casualty: Central O<sub>2</sub> and Central Suction are not available. Pipeline was shown to assessors but it was not functional. Emergency Drug Tray is not available. Portable X-ray machine is not available. Patients admitted in Casualty had minor non-specific complaints like headache, weakness, etc.
- 7. ICUs: NICU is practically non-functional. There was only 1 patient in PICU.
- 8. O.T.: Septic O.T. is not functional.
- 9. Speech Therapy room is too small.
- 10. Nursing Staff: GNM Nursing students doing their internship are shown as Staff Nurses. Resultantly, deficiency of inadequate number of Staff Nurse remains.
- 11. Nursing Hostel: In 1 room, 5-7 Nurses are staying which is not as per Regulations.
- 12. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Marikavalasa, Vishakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh by Gayatri Vidya Parishad Society, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 25. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Patancheru, Medak Dist.</u>, <u>Andhra Pradesh by Alleti Shrunitha Educational Society,</u> <u>Hyderabad with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Dr.</u> <u>NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC</u> <u>Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Patancheru, Medak Dist., Andhra Pradesh by Alleti Shrunitha Educational Society, Hyderabad with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (16<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) along with previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) as well as letter dated 17.03.2016 received from the college authorities and noted the following:

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 100 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. All the assessors visited the Residentsqhostel & found that not a single resident was staying in the rooms.
- 3. Deficiency of faculty is 6.15 % as detailed in the report.
- 4. Bed occupancy was 43,33 % on day of assessment against requirement of 60 %.
- 5. OPD attendance on day of assessment was 584 against requirement of 600. There were not many patients at OPD counters around 10:25 a.m.
- 6. Wards: Wards of Tb & Chest, Skin & VD, Ophthalmology are not as per MSR Regulations as ancillary facilities are not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 7. There was only 1 Major & NIL Minor operation on day of assessment till 11:00 a.m. on day of assessment.
- 8. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 9. Radiological & Laboratory investigation workload is inadequate. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 10. Histopathology & Cytopathology workload is NIL on day of assessment.
- 11. Casualty: Patients in Casualty were having minor complaints like giddiness, bodyache, weakness which did not require admission in Casualty.
- 12. ICUs: There were only 1 patient in NICU & 2 in ICCU on day of assessment.
- 13. StudentsqHostels: rooms are not furnished.
- 14. Residential Quarters: They are not furnished.
- 15. Data of clinical material provided by institute are inflated.
- 16. In Orthopaedics ward, not a single patient with POP or Back slab was found. Many patients with minor complaints like fever, Bodyache were admitted in General Medicine, Paediatrics, Orthopaedics.
- 17. In Male General Surgery ward, patient name B. Raju, M/28, OPD # 1601314019, IPD # 16020809, admitted in Unit I was given fake diagnosis of Lipoma of Abdominal wall; on examination it was observed it was not a Lipoma at all.
- 18. Medical Superintendent does not have relieving order from previous institute.
- 19. Many wards are manned by Student Nurses.
- 20. Dean refused to sign SAF after reading the same.
- 21. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Patancheru, Medak Dist., Andhra Pradesh by Alleti Shrunitha Educational Society, Hyderabad under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 26. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Indore, Madhya Pradesh</u> by Shri Astha Foundation for Education Society, Indore, M.P with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Madhya Pradesh <u>Medical Science University, Jabalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956</u> for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Indore, Madhya Pradesh by Shri Astha Foundation for Education Society, Indore, M.P with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Madhya Pradesh Medical Science University, Jabalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017. The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (17 March, 2016) along with previous assessment report (07<sup>th</sup>& 08<sup>th</sup> January, 2016) as well as letter dated 21.03.2016 received from the College authorities and noted the following:

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 45.65 % as detailed in the report. All Senior Residents & Many Junior Residents are not staying in the campus regularly.
- 2. Bed occupancy was 47.33 % on day of assessment.
- 3. OPD attendance was 522 at 2 p.m. on day of assessment against requirement of 600. There were only a few patients in OPD at 10 a.m. on day of assessment.
- 4. Blood Bank is not functional as license is not available.
- 5. Approved plans for hospital buildings from competent authority are not available.
- 6. Casualty: There was only 1 patient in Casualty at time of assessment. No MLC case was registered during the entire week.
- 7. There was NIL Minor operation on day of assessment.
- 8. OPD: There is no proper flooring. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 9. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 10. Histopathology workload was only 2 on day of assessment.
- 11. Workload of Contrast Radiology was NIL on day of assessment.
- 12. Wards: Distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m in some wards.
- 13. Paramedical & Non-teaching staff: Only 48 Paramedical & Non-teaching staff are available against requirement of 101.
- 14. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Indore, Madhya Pradesh by Shri Astha Foundation for Education Society, Indore, M.P under Madhya Pradesh Medical Science University, Jabalpur to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 27. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Mathura, Uttar Pradesh by</u> <u>Shri Mohan Singh Shiksha Sansthan, Mathura, Uttar Pradesh with</u> <u>an annual intake of 150 students under Dr. B.R Ambedkar</u> <u>University, Agra u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year</u> <u>2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Mathura, Uttar Pradesh by Shri Mohan Singh Shiksha Sansthan, Mathura, Uttar Pradesh with an annual intake of 150 students under Dr. B.R Ambedkar University, Agra u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (06.05.2016) alongwith previous assessment report (18<sup>th</sup>& 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) as well as letter dated 06/05/2016 from the Director-Principal, K.M. Medical College & Hospital, Mathura and complaint dated 24.02.2016 from Shri Pawan Kumar S/o Shri Mehtap Singh, Mathura, UP and noted the following:

- 1. Deficiency of faculty was 86.15 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents was 89.13 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy is NIL. There was NIL patient in any ward.
- 4. OPD attendance was 230 on day of assessment which is inadequate.
- 5. OPD: Most of the OPDs did not have consultants. There were very few patients attending OPDs. Waiting area is inadequate. Injection room,

dressing room, Plaster room, Plaster Cutting room are not functional. Specialty clinics are not available in Paediatrics & OG OPD.

- 6. Wards: Demonstration rooms are small and congested.
- 7. Data of OPD attendance given by institute are highly exaggerated.
- 8. There was NIL Normal delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 9. Radiological & Laboratory investigation workload is inadequate.
- 10. Casualty: No doctor was available in Casualty.
- 11. ICUs: There was NIL patient in ICCU or any of ICUs.
- 12. Labour Room: Eclampsia room & Septic labour room are not functional.
- 13. Audiometry & Speech therapy rooms are available but non-functional.
- 14. Kitchen is not functional; Canteen is available but in bad shape.
- 15. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned.

28.

- 16. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls do not have wash room facility.
- 17. Studentsqhostels: they are partially furnished. Visitorsqroom are without fans & wash rooms.
- 18. Residentsq hostel: It is partially furnished. Toilets are not in working condition. Visitorsqroom is without working toilets.
- 19. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Mathura, Uttar Pradesh by Shri Mohan Singh Shiksha Sansthan, Mathura, Uttar Pradesh with an annual intake of 150 students under Dr. B.R Ambedkar University, Agra to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

Establishment of new medical college at Myana, Guna, Madhya Pradesh by Muskan Samajik Evam Shiksha Prasar Evam Prachar Samiti, Guna M.P. with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Madhya Pradesh Medical Science University, Jabalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Myana, Guna, Madhya Pradesh by Muskan Samajik Evam Shiksha Prasar Evam Prachar Samiti, Guna M.P. with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Madhya Pradesh Medical Science University, Jabalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (12<sup>th</sup>& 13<sup>th</sup> January, 2016) alongwith letter dated 30/03/2016 received from the appointed team of Council Assessors and noted the following:

*Wa/ith reference to above subject, we had visited the said institute for Compliance Verification for LOI/LOP for 150 seats u/s 10A of IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 under Madhya Pradesh Medical Science University Jabalpur at 9.45 am on 30<sup>th</sup> March, 2016.* 

We entered the college at 9.45 am on 30<sup>th</sup> March, 2016.

Vice principal denied the inspection.

In view of the intention of Surprise inspection, we took some photographs of the hospital. Apparently there were no patients in any wards, ICCU, ICU, SICU, PICU labor room, operations theatres etc. Whole O.P.D. and laboratories were also empty and no patients at all.

Simultaneously we took photography of the college as well hostel for UGs, residents and nursing staff, and non-teaching staff, they were also empty and vacant.

Dean, superintendent and other teaching staff and residents were not present.

Vice-principal named – Dr. Satya, Msc. Ph.D, Assistant Professor in Biochemistry, was only available and he received our letter for the assessment and gave us letter about denial to inspect on behalf of Dean..."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Myana, Guna, Madhya Pradesh by Muskan Samajik Evam Shiksha Prasar Evam Prachar Samiti, Guna M.P. under Madhya Pradesh Medical Science University, Jabalpur to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 29. Establishment of new medical college at Banthra, Shahjahanpur, Uttar Pradesh by Varunarjun Trust, Uttar Pradesh with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Mahatma Jyotiba Phule Rohilkhand University, Bareilly u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Banthra, Shahjahanpur, Uttar Pradesh by Varunarjun Trust, Uttar Pradesh with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Mahatma Jyotiba Phule Rohilkhand University, Bareilly u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (30<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) along with previous assessment report (12<sup>th</sup>& 13<sup>th</sup> January, 2016) as well as letter dated 30/03/2106 from the college authorities and noted the following:

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 23.1 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of residents is 56.52% as detailed in the report. Most of the Residents are not staying in the hostel. Occupancy list provided by Dean does not tally on verification.
- 3. Address proof of many faculty & Residents was not proper. Format was similar but Quarter number or Room number was not mentioned.
- 4. Bed occupancy was 46.33 % on day of assessment.
- 5. Most of indoor patients are not genuine. Many patients were asked to overstay. Many patients were admitted for trivial reasons. There were some instances of whole families having been admitted. Mother in Medical ward, Son & Daughter in Paediatrics ward without any obvious health issue. Many case papers did not have proper clinical notes.
- 6. OPD patients as observed by assessors were not genuine. Many families were brought in buses after assessors reached the institute.
- 7. Data of OPD attendance, Radiological investigations given by institute are highly inflated.
- 8. There was NIL Minor operation on day of assessment.
- 9. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 10. Genuine Radiological work is inadequate.
- 11. Workload of Histopathology & Cytopathology is NIL on day of assessment.
- 12. ICUs: There was only 1 patient each in ICCU, SICU & PICU/NICU and only 2 patients in MICU on day of assessment.

- 13. StudentsqHostel: One room has been converted into Study room which is inadequate.
- 14. Residential Quarters: 8 quarters do not have water connection; hence not functional.
- 15. Anatomy Department: Bone sets are not original and made of plastic.
- 16. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Banthra, Shahjahanpur, Uttar Pradesh by Varunarjun Trust, Uttar Pradesh under Mahatma Jyotiba Phule Rohilkhand University, Bareillyto the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 30. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Jupudi, Krishna Dist.</u>, <u>Andhra Pradesh by Nimra Educational Society, Hyderabad with an</u> <u>annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Dr. NTR University of</u> <u>Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the</u> <u>academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Jupudi, Krishna Dist., Andhra Pradesh by Nimra Educational Society, Hyderabad with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (11<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) as well as complaint dated 21/03/2016 received from Sh. P. Srinivasa Murthy, Hyderabad against the said college and noted the following:-

- On verification of admitted patients, some patients in General Surgery ward were admitted for very minor complaints like Gastritis, Urinary Tract infections, etc. Some patients were admitted for minor Surgical procedures. 8 patients were kept in the wards even after removal of sutures. In Orthopaedics ward, majority of patients were admitted for Implant removal, backache & Osteoarthritis. There were NIL patients in Psychiatry & Ophthalmology wards.
- 2. ICUs: There was only 1 patient in ICCU. Out of 4 patients in MICU, 3 did not require intensive care.
- 3. No patient was seen in Labour room during the round.
- 4. Data of clinical material provided by the institute appear to be inflated.
- 5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Jupudi, Krishna Dist., Andhra Pradesh by Nimra Educational Society, Hyderabad under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 31. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Jabalpur, Madhya</u> <u>Pradesh by Gyanjeet Sewa Mission Trust, Jabalpur with an annual</u> <u>intake of 150 MBBS students under Madhya Pradesh Medical</u> <u>Science University, Jabalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the</u> <u>academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Jabalpur, Madhya Pradesh by Gyanjeet Sewa Mission Trust, Jabalpur with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Madhya Pradesh Medical Science University, Jabalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (17<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) along with previous assessment report (7<sup>th</sup>& 8<sup>th</sup> January, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Although Bed occupancy is 60.66 % on day of assessment, more than 60-70 % patients were not genuine / fake as under:
  - (a) In medical male ward three patients named (1) Mr. Channu Thakur, M-45, IPD No. 302567 (2) Mr. Sukhram Thakur, M-42, IPD No. 302570 and (3) Mr. Sunny Thakur, M-25, IPD No. 302563 were shown as admitted. During round, on detailed inquiry, JR of Medicine Dr. Suhani Dubey has confessed and given written statement that these patients are not actually admitted. These 3 patients are fake admission.
  - (b) In female medicine ward, patient named Mrs. Seema Dhurve, F-40 years, IPD No. 2511, OPD No. 150009 was fake patient. Patient has said that she was admitted before 15 days but Resident doctor Preethi Yadav has said and as per case sheet record also, she was admitted on 15<sup>th</sup> March, 2016 before 2 day. No medicine, no attendants was there. As per record, she was admitted for anemia, but no blood report was available till 17<sup>th</sup> March. Patient said that she is residing in Rajasthan while in case paper address was Jabalpur.
  - (c) In Gynac. Ward, patient named Mrs. Shanti Ashok Dhurvey, F-30 years, OPD No. 302583, OPD No. 3170015 was fake. When inquired, patient said that she was admitted before one week, while staff nurse statement and case paper record shows that she is admitted on the day of assessment on 17.03.2016.
  - (d) In male surgery ward, patient named Mr. Laxman Patel, M-24 years, OPD No. 030008, IPD No. 2086 was not genuine. He was admitted before 13 days with only complaint of gastritis.
  - (e) In surgery female ward Dr. Kunal Rupre, JR in Surgery Department, has confessed that patient named Mrs. Dassobai was admitted before two days but no treatment was advised/given.
  - (f) In Gynae ward, patient named Mrs. Kallabai IPD No. 302575 was fake patient. Patient said that she was admitted before 5 days but as per staff nurse statement and case record, she was admitted before one day.
  - (g) More than 60% to 70% indoor patients were not genuine/fake. They have shown admitted but no medicine, no attendance, no any personal belongings and apparently looks to have been made for head count only. They are labour workers and class IV staff members. It seems that case sheet record were prepared earlier and on one day of assessment, at last moment, these labour workers and class IV staff members were lying down in the wards and shown as a patient. Case paper records do not match with these fake patientsqdetails/statements.

- 2. It appears that most of Residents had come for inspection purposes only as under:
  - (a) One doctor Ashish Patel JR in Surgery department joined the department before 8 months but he does not know name of other residents in the surgery department. He also does not know number of residents in his department.
  - (b) Dr. Sravya working JR in Obst. & Gynae. ward has given written statement that she does not know hand writing in case papers of patients admitted on Obst. & Gynae. ward.
  - (c) Dr. Mercy, JR in OBGY deptt. has given written statement that she did not write any case sheets of any patients in OBGY ward.
  - (d) In deptt. of Surgery, SR in General Surgery Dr. Neelkumar Suhang has given written statement that she does not know details of patients admitted in Surgery ward and he does not know also who has written all case papers of patients in Surgery ward.
  - (e) Dr. Vipin Singh, JR in Surgery deptt. room no.5in resident hostel has given written statement that his room partner Dr. Akhilesh Shroti SR is not staying in hostel campus.
  - (f) Dr. Omprakash Vishwakarma, JR in deptt. of Skin has given written statement that he is staying in room no.12 alone. In his room, nobody is staying while Dr. M. Narhari, JR in Medicine has given written statement that he is staying in room no.12.
- 3. Dr. N. Sandeep Reddy, Junior Resident in ENT department has appeared at MCI assessment at 3 medical colleges in the current academic year.
- 4. Casualty: Out of total 8 patients in Casualty, 3 patients had only low backache which does not warrant admission in Casualty.
- 5. There was NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 6. Histopathological workload was only 2 & Cytopathological workload was only 1 on day of assessment which is inadequate.
- 7. Male Nursing staff is posted in female wards. More than 60 % Nursing staff are males, most of whom are untrained. One Mr. Pankaj Patel, Male Staff Nurse was in charge of 4 wards . ENT & Ophthalmology male ward, ENT & Ophthalmology female ward, Tb & Chest male ward, Tb & Chest female ward.
- 8. Studentsq Hostels: There is no Visitorsq room, Study room & Warden room in both Boysq& GirlsqHostels. In some rooms minor civil work was pending. In most of the rooms, bath room door fittings are incomplete. No railing is available at staircase.
- 9. ResidentsqHostels: Many Residents are not staying in the hostel. There is no Visitorsqroom, Study room & Warden room in both Boysq& Girlsq Hostels. In some rooms minor civil work was pending. In most of the rooms, bath room door fittings are incomplete. No railing is available at staircase.
- 10. Residential Quarters: There are no proper teaching & non-teaching staff quarters available. In Male Residentsq Hostel building, 2<sup>nd</sup>& 3<sup>rd</sup> floor hostel rooms without kitchen are shown as teaching staff quarters which cannot be accepted. In another building, there 10 single hostel type rooms which also cannot be accepted as teaching staff quarters. In third building, there are 2 rooms without kitchen which also cannot be accepted as teaching staff quarters. In third building, there are 2 rooms without kitchen which also cannot be accepted as teaching staff quarters which cannot be accepted. For non-teaching staff, there are 19 hostel type single rooms in the building of Male Nursesq Hostel which cannot be accepted as non-teaching staff quarters. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 11. In Central Kitchen, no register showing diet supplied to patients was available.
- 12. Laundry equipment & workload is low.
- 13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Jabalpur, Madhya Pradesh by Gyanjeet Sewa Mission Trust, Jabalpur with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Madhya Pradesh Medical Science University, Jabalpur to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

The Executive Committee of the Council also decided to refer the matter to the Ethics Committee for necessary action in the matter.

#### 32. <u>Misbehavior of Management trustee during UG assessment of the</u> physical and other teaching facilities available for establishment of a new medical college at Jabalpur, Madhya Pradesh by Gyanjeet Sewa Mission Trust, Jabalpur(150 seats) on 7<sup>th</sup>& 8<sup>th</sup> of Jan., 2016.

Read: the matter with regard to Misbehavior of Management trustee during UG assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for establishment of a new medical college at Jabalpur, Madhya Pradesh by Gyanjeet Sewa Mission Trust, Jabalpur(150 seats) on 7<sup>th</sup>& 8<sup>th</sup> of Jan., 2016.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the letter dated 11/03/2016 of the Chairman, Sukh Sagar Medical College & Hospital and decided to issue warning to the Institute and to the Chairman not to repeat such occurrences in future and to treat the matter as closed.

#### 33. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Silvassa, Union Territory</u> of Dadra & Nagar Haveli by UT of Daman & Diu of Dadra & Nagar Haveli with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Veer Narmad South Gujarat University, Surat u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Silvassa, Union Territory of Dadra & Nagar Haveli by UT of Daman & Diu of Dadra & Nagar Haveli with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Veer Narmad South Gujarat University, Surat u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter dated 16/03/2016 & 13.04.2016 from the Director, Union Territory of Dadra & Nagar Haveli, informing therein as under:-

"....as informed earlier the UT Administration of Dadra & Nagar Haveli is establishing a medical college on Public Private Partnership. The UT Administration has appointed a transaction adviser, the RFP and Concession Agreement has been tenderized and the tender is likely to be finalized in a month's time. Once the private partner is finalized the work of medical college will start.

You may recall the notification No.MCI-34 (1) (UG) (Gen.) /2015/167018 dated 16/02/2016 in which the MCI has allowed the district hospital to enter into an MoU with a private player to start a Medical College in PPP mode.

In view of the above the UT Administration would request you to grant us more time so that we could comply with the observations of MCI."

The Committee further noted that the Council vide its various letters requested the college authorities to submit the detailed point-wise compliance with the documentary evidence failing which, it will be presumed that the college authorities has no further comments to offer in the matter and the MCI will recommend to the Central Govt. for disapproval of their scheme for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Committee further observed that the time schedule prescribed under Establishment of Medical College Regulations with regard to last date prescribed under Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 as amended from time to time reads as under:

No.	Stage of processing	Last Date	
1.	Receipt of applications by the Central Govt.	From 1st August to 31st August (both days inclusive) of any year	
2.	Receipt of applications by the MCI from Central Govt.	30th September	
3.	Recommendations of Medical Council of India to Central Government for issue of Letter of Intent	15th December	
4.	Issue of Letter of Intent by the Central Government.	15th January	
5.	Receipt of reply from the applicant by the Central Government requesting for Letter of permission.	15th February	
6.	Receipt of Letter from Central Government by the Medical Council of India for consideration for issue of Letter of Permission.	1st March	
7.	Recommendation of Medical Council of India to Central Government for issue of India to Central Government for issue of Letter of Permission.	15th May	
8.	Issue of Letter of Permission by the Central Government.	15th June	

It was further observed that these Regulations being Statutory Regulations are mandatory and binding in character and are required to be strictly adhered to by all the authorities. The operative part of the order of Honople Supreme Court in Mridul Dharos case is as under:

"1-13. .....

14. Time schedule for establishment of new college or to increase intake in existing college, shall be adhered to strictly by all concerned.

15. Time schedule provided in Regulations shall be strictly adhered to by all concerned failing which defaulting party would be liable to be personally proceeded with."

The relevant operative part of the order of Honople Supreme court in Priya Gupta's case is as under:

Thus, the need of the hour is that binding dicta be prescribed and 30. statutory regulations be enforced, so that all concerned are mandatorily required to implement the time schedule in its true spirit and substance. It is difficult and not even advisable to keep some windows open to meet a particular situation of exception, as it may pose impediments to the smooth implementation of laws and defeat the very object of the scheme. These schedules have been prescribed upon serious consideration by all concerned. They are to be applied stricto sensu and cannot be moulded to suit the convenience of some economic or other interest of any institution, especially, in a manner that is bound to result in compromise of the above- stated principles. Keeping in view the contemptuous conduct of the relevant stakeholders, their cannonade on the rule of merit compels us to state, with precision and esemplastically, the action that is necessary to ameliorate the process of selection. Thus, we issue the following directions in rem for their strict compliance, without demur and default, by all concerned.

*i)* The commencement of new courses or increases in seats of existing courses of MBBS/BDS are to be approved/recognised by the Government of India by 15th July of each calendar year for the relevant academic sessions of that year.

*ii)* The Medical Council of India shall, immediately thereafter, issue appropriate directions and ensure the implementation and commencement of admission process within one week thereafter.

iii) After 15th July of each year, neither the Union of India nor the Medical or Dental Council of India shall issue any recognition or approval for the current academic year. If any such approval is granted after 15th July of any year, it shall only be operative for the next academic year and not in the current academic year. Once the sanction/approval is granted on or before 15th July of the relevant year, the name of that college and all seats shall be included in both the first and the second counseling, in accordance with the Rules.

*iv)* Any medical or dental college, or seats thereof, to which the recognition/approval is issued subsequent to 15th July of the respective year shall not be included in the counseling to be conducted by the concerned authority and that college would have no right to make admissions in the current academic year against such seats.

v) The admission to the medical or dental colleges shall be granted only through the respective entrance tests conducted by the competitive authority in the State or the body of the private colleges. These two are the methods of selection and grant of admission to these courses. However, where there is a single Board conducting the state examination and there is a single medical college, then in terms of clause 5.1 of the Medical Council of India Eligibility Certificate Regulations, 2002 the admission can be given on the basis of 10+2 exam marks, strictly in order of merit.

vi) All admissions through any of the stated selection processes have to be effected only after due publicity and in consonance with the directions issued by this Court. We vehemently deprecate the practice of giving admissions on 30th September of the academic year. In fact, that is the date by which, in exceptional circumstances, a candidate duly selected as per the prescribed selection process is to join the academic course of MBBS/BDS. Under the directions of this Court, second counseling should be the final counseling, as this Court has already held in the case of <u>Ms. Neelu Arora & Anr. v. UOI & Ors.</u> [(2003) 3 SCC 366] and third counseling is not contemplated or permitted under the entire process of selection/grant of admission to these professional courses.

vii) If any seats remain vacant or are surrendered from All India Quota, they should positively be allotted and admission granted strictly as per the merit by 15th September of the relevant year and not by holding an extended counseling. The remaining time will be limited to the filling up of the vacant seats resulting from exceptional circumstances or surrender of seats. All candidates should join the academic courses by 30th September of the academic year.

viii) No college may grant admissions without duly advertising the vacancies available and by publicizing the same through the internet, newspaper, on the notice board of the respective feeder schools and colleges, etc. Every effort has to be made by all concerned to ensure that the admissions are given on merit and after due publicity and not in a manner which is ex-facie arbitrary and casts the shadow of favouritism.

*ix)* The admissions to all government colleges have to be on merit obtained in the entrance examination conducted by the nominated authority, while in the case of private colleges, the colleges should choose their option by 30th April of the relevant year, as to whether they wish to grant admission on the basis of the

merit obtained in the test conducted by the nominated State authority or they wish to follow the merit list/rank obtained by the candidates in the competitive examination collectively held by the nominated agency for the private colleges. The option exercised by 30th April shall not be subject to change. This choice should also be given by the colleges which are anticipating grant of recognition, in compliance with the date specified in these directions.

31. All these directions shall be complied with by all concerned, including Union of India, Medical Council of India, Dental Council of India, State Governments, Universities and medical and dental colleges and the management of the respective universities or dental and medical colleges. Any default in compliance with these conditions or attempt to overreach these directions shall, without fail, invite the following consequences and penal actions:-

a) Every body, officer or authority who disobeys or avoids or fails to strictly comply with these directions stricto sensu shall be liable for action under the provisions of the Contempt of Courts Act. Liberty is granted to any interested party to take out the contempt proceedings before the High Court having jurisdiction over such Institution/State, etc.

b) The person, member or authority found responsible for any violation shall be departmentally proceeded against and punished in accordance with the Rules. We make it clear that violation of these directions or overreaching them by any process shall tantamount to indiscipline, insubordination, misconduct and being unworthy of becoming a public servant.

c) Such defaulting authority, member or body shall also be liable for action by and personal liability to third parties who might have suffered losses as a result of such default.

d) There shall be due channelization of selection and admission process with full cooperation and coordination between the Government of India, State Government, Universities, Medical Council of India or Dental Council of India and the colleges concerned. They shall act in tandem and strictly as per the prescribed schedule. In other words, there should be complete harmonisation with a view to form a uniform pattern for concerted action, according to the framed scheme, schedule for admission and regulations framed in this behalf.

e) The college which grants admission for the current academic year, where its recognition/approval is granted subsequent to 15th July of the current academic year, shall be liable for withdrawal of recognition/approval on this ground, in addition to being liable to indemnify such students who are denied admission or who are wrongfully given admission in the college.

f) Upon the expiry of one week after holding of the second counseling, the unfilled seats from all quotas shall be deemed to have been surrendered in favour of the respective States and shall be filled thereafter strictly on the basis of merit obtained in the competitive entrance test.

g) It shall be mandatory on the part of each college and University to inform the State and the Central Government/competent authority of the seats which are lying vacant after each counseling and they shall furnish the complete details, list of seats filled and vacant in the respective states, immediately after each counseling.

h) No college shall fill up its seats in any other manner.

In view of above and in view of mandatory and binding character of Statutory Regulations, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Silvassa, Union Territory of Dadra & Nagar Haveli by UT of Daman & Diu of Dadra & Nagar Haveli under Veer Narmad South Gujarat University, Surat to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 34. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch of 150 MBBS</u> <u>students at Kamineni Academy of Medical Sciences & Research</u> <u>Centre, Hyderebad, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of</u> <u>Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the</u> <u>academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at Kamineni Academy of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Hyderebad, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (19<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (6<sup>th</sup>& 7<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup>batch of 150 MBBS students at Kamineni Academy of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Hyderebad, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

### 35. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS</u> <u>students at Viswabharathi Medical College, Kurnool, Andhra</u> <u>Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada</u> <u>u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at Viswabharathi Medical College, Kurnool, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (18<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (26<sup>th</sup>& 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) as well as letter dated 19/02/2016 received from the Principal of the college and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 7 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 12.24 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Residents were questioned about senior faculty & patients in their wards. Those who were not knowing about them were rejected.
- 4. Clinical material is inadequate. Deficiency persists.
- 5. There were only 2 Major & NIL Minor operations on day of assessment.
- 6. There was NIL Normal Delivery on day of assessment.
- 7. Although total 7 units of Blood were dispensed on day of assessment, they were issued to patients of Oncology not required for UG teaching or for trivial reasons.
- 8. OPD: Very few patients were seen in OPD at time of assessment. Data of OPD attendance at 776 given by institute appears to be inflated as healthy people were brought in for statistics.
- 9. Many patients were kept in wards for many days without indication. Oncology patients were kept for inflating occupancy. Many other cases were admitted for trivial reasons. Majority of patients in Orthopaedics ward were of back pain.
- Wards: It is not possible to visualize all the patients from Nursing Station in some wards. Deficiency remains as it is. Wards of Tb & Chest, Psychiatry and Skin & VD are small rooms with 3-4 beds with only partial or NIL ancillary facilities.

- 11. ICUs: ICCU & MICU are combined. PICU & NICU are combined. There were only 2 patients each in ICCU & NICU on day of assessment.
- 12. There was only 1 Major & NIL Minor operation on day of assessment.
- 13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at Viswabharathi Medical College, Kurnool, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 36. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Karpagam Faculty of Medical Sciences & Research, Coimbatore, Tamil Nadu under The Tamilnadu Dr. M.G.R Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Karpagam Faculty of Medical Sciences & Research, Coimbatore, Tamil Nadu under The Tamilnadu Dr. M.G.R Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (19<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (2<sup>nd</sup>& 3<sup>rd</sup> November, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. As per O.T. & Ward records in Surgical & allied branches, Radiodiagnosis and Obstetrics & Gynaecology, full time working of many faculty members in the rank of Professors and Asso. Prof. could not be verified.
- 2. Many patients were admitted with minor ailments without any major problem. The occupancy was tailor made to suit assessment. E.g. One referred patient from Ophthalmology was lying in medical ward.
- There were only 4 Major operations & 3 Minor operations on day of assessment.
- 4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup>batch of 150 MBBS students at Karpagam Faculty of Medical Sciences & Research, Coimbatore, Tamil Nadu under The Tamilnadu Dr. M.G.R Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 37. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS</u> <u>students at Heritage Institute of Medical Sciences, Varanasi, Uttar</u> <u>Pradesh under Mahatma Gandhi Kashi Vidyapith University,</u> <u>Varanasi u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-</u> <u>2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at Heritage Institute of Medical Sciences, Varanasi, Uttar Pradesh under Mahatma Gandhi Kashi Vidyapith University, Varanasi u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (16<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (19<sup>th</sup>& 20<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at Heritage Institute of Medical Sciences, Varanasi, Uttar

Pradesh under Mahatma Gandhi Kashi Vidyapith University, Varanasi u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 38. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of The Oxford Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Bangalore under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of The Oxford Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Bangalore under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (12<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) as well as letter dated 12/02/2016 received from the Principal of the college and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 10.4 % as detailed in the report. Senior Residents in General Medicine, Paediatrics, Tb & Chest and Skin & VD are not staying in the campus except during emergency duty which is not permissible.
- 2. Bed occupancy is 52 % on day of assessment which is inadequate.
- 3. Wards: Deficiency remains as it is. In Chest & Tb ward, patients having COPD were admitted but O<sub>2</sub> delivery services are not available. Pantry is non-functional in many wards.
- 4. There was NIL Normal Delivery & only 1 Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 5. Casualty: There were only 4 patients in Casualty at time of verification. Crash cart was not fitted with O<sub>2</sub> cylinder on day of assessment.
- 6. ICUs: There were only 1 patient in NICU & only 2 patients each in ICCU, MICU, SICU & PICU each on day of assessment. One patient with congestive cardiac failure with anaemia was admitted in ICCU but in case ticket note was given that symptomatically he is better. Patients in SICU were actually postoperative patients of total Hysterectomy.
- 7. In Microbiology department, a lot of culture reports were entered. On cross verification with respective departments, it was found that they were not ordered by respective clinicians.
- 8. In Histopathology, for some of the reports entered in the departmental register, specimens, tissue blocks, copy of requisition and detailed report could not be found.
- 9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup>batch of 150 MBBS students at The Oxford Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Bangalore under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 39. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of</u> <u>Velammal Medical College Hospital & Research Institute, Madurai,</u> <u>Tamil Nadu under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University,</u> <u>Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-</u> <u>2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Velammal Medical College Hospital & Research Institute, Madurai, Tamil Nadu under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017. The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report(5<sup>th</sup> February, 2016) along with the previous assessment reports (28<sup>th</sup>& 29<sup>th</sup> October, 2015 & 1<sup>st</sup> December, 2015) as well as the letter dated 11/02/2016 received from the Dean of the college and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Velammal Medical College Hospital & Research Institute, Madurai, Tamil Nadu under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 40. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Mayo Institute of Medical Sciences, Barabanki, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Ram Manohar Lohiya Awadh Univeristy, Faizabad, U.P. u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Mayo Institute of Medical Sciences, Barabanki, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Ram Manohar Lohiya Awadh University, Faizabad, U.P. u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (6<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (20<sup>th</sup>& 21<sup>st</sup> January, 2016) as well as letters dated 06.04.2016 and 10.04.2016 received from Dr. Karabi Baral, Bankura (Co-ordinator) and letters dated 9<sup>th</sup> April, 2016 and 15.04.2016 received from the college authorities and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 6.06 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 8.23 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy is 42.46 % on day of assessment.
- 4. Many Residents are not staying in the campus.
- 5. Most of the patients were admitted on day of assessment without any genuine health problems. Most of Bed Tickets were incomplete.
- 6. In Obstetrics ward, 15 patients were present; but bed tickets of none of these did not show gravida, para, BP measurement, expected Date of Delivery. In General Surgery & allied specialties, many patients had appeared in socks, jeans & T shirts and neither did they appear as patients nor did they have any acute problem meriting admission.
- 7. OPD: At 10 a.m. when assessors entered the college, very few patients were seen in OPD. In General Surgery, many kids were found playing in front of OPD; however authorities claimed 85 patients in General Surgery OPD.
- 8. NIL Major operation was posted in General Surgery, Orthopaedics & O.G. on day of assessment as verified during morning visit and again in the afternoon. During morning visit 1 patient of Cholecystectomy was kept but operation was not performed till 3 p.m. There was only 1 Major operation each in Ophthalmology & ENT. There was only 1 Minor operation on day of assessment.
- 9. ICUs: There were only 2 patients in SICU on day of assessment.
- 10. MRD: It is manual & computerized. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 11. Data of OPD attendance, Casualty attendance, Bed Occupancy, Number of Major & Minor operations, number of Deliveries, Radiological & Laboratory investigations appear to be inflated.
- 12. Workload of CT scan was NIL on day of assessment.
- 13. In Histopathology, specimen of Vaginal Hysterectomy purportedly done on 05/04/2016 was not available. Technician could not produce 11 specimens of previous day in front of assessors. Specimen & Block of a patient operated on 12/02/2016 also could not be produced.
- 14. PNDT certificate is issued in the names of Dr. D.P. Agrawal & Dr. Sishir Gupta, both of whom have left the institute. Hence there is no valid PNDT certificate on date.

- 15. RHTC: Residential accommodation is not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 16. The members of the Executive Committee also perused the observation of assessors & findings of the office in respect of the following faculty:
  - (a) Dr. Shyam Sunder Keshary, Professor of Pharmacology;
  - (b) Dr. Priyanka Kesharwani, Asso. Prof. of Community Medicine;
  - (c) Dr. A.K. Srivastava, Professor of Community Medicine.
- 17. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup>batch of 150 MBBS students at Mayo Institute of Medical Sciences, Barabanki, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Ram Manohar Lohiya Awadh Univeristy, Faizabad, U.P. u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council also decided to refer the matter to the Ethics Committee for necessary action in the matter.

### 41. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>Apollo Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Hyderabad,</u> <u>Telangana under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences,</u> <u>Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the</u> <u>academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Apollo Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Hyderabad, Telangana under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (11<sup>th</sup> March 2016) along with previous assessment report (10<sup>th</sup>& 11<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) as well as the letter dated 18/04/2016 received from the college authorities and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 64.1 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Many Residents do not stay in campus. Some Residents stay in the city and come only on call.
- 3. Laboratory investigations still appear to be inadequate. Space for the collection center is inadequate. Transportation of samples to central laboratory is improper.
- 4. CT Scan is not functional.
- 5. There were only 4 Major operations on day of assessment.
- 6. Histopathology workload is only 7; out of these, 3 were of circumcision & 2 were Pap smear.
- 7. Cytopathological workload is inadequate.
- 8. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP is NIL
- 9. Studentsq Hostels: Total accommodation available is 258 against requirement of 375. Even out of these, some rooms are 4 seaters which is not as per Regulations. Complex III is outside college campus.
- 10. Residential Quarters: NIL quarters are available for non-teaching staff.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup>batch of 100 MBBS students at Apollo Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Hyderabad, Telangana under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 42. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of</u> <u>P.K. Das Institute of Medical Sciences, Palakkad, Kerala under</u> <u>Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of</u> <u>the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of P.K. Das Institute of Medical Sciences, Palakkad, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (22<sup>nd</sup> April, 2016 along with previous assessment reports (29<sup>th</sup> March, 2016 & 4<sup>th</sup>& 5<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) as well as the letter dated 22/04/2016 received from the college authorities and letter dated 23/04/2016 from the appointed team of Council Assessors and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 26 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 20 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. OPD attendance as observed by assessors was only 300-400 on day of assessment. When the assessors entered the OPD complex, there were few patients only.
- 4. Bed occupancy was 39.33 % on day of assessment. Many patients were shifted from Superspecialty hospital in the campus to inflate bed occupancy. There was NIL patient in male & Female Tb & Chest wards, Male & Female Skin & VD wards, Female Ophthalmology ward.
- 5. There was 1 Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 6. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP was NIL on day of assessment.
- 7. Workload of Histopathology & Cytopathology is not shown in the chart of clinical material provided by institute & signed by Dean.
- 8. ICUs: There was only 1 patient in ICCU & total 5 patients in PICU/NICU on day of assessment.
- 9. Data of OPD attendance, Major operations provided by institute are inflated.
- Workload of CT Scan was only 06 on day of assessment. There was NIL workload from admitted IPD.
- 11. There is no Resident Hostel in the campus. No Resident is staying in the campus.
- 12. Residential Quarters: Non-teaching staff quarters are not available in the campus.
- 13. Autopsy block was not shown.
- 14. The following fake patients were detected:
  - (a) Patients have minor complaints which generally did not required hospitalization like E.G. Body ache, fever etc. admitted in the Medicine, Paediatric ward.
  - (b) Patients have minor complaints which generally did not required hospitalization like E.G. Body ache, Joints pain etc. admitted in the Orthopedics ward.
  - (c) In Orthopaedic ward not a single patient with plaster POP or back slab on any patients, so it suggest that this ward was filled only for bed occupancy purpose.
  - (d) In many wards admitted patients were having insignificant (nonspoecific) problems that not required admission. They were not carrying any personal belongings items with them. The complaints like for which they were admitted were upper abdominal pain, cough, bodyache, etc. During the assessment, no one give any statement in written that the patients have only minute complaints.

- 15. Dr. Shahjehan, Asst. Prof. in department of Paediatrics has come for purpose of head counting during assessment only. He does not know any of the residents in the department.
- 16. The following Residents are fake Residents as observed by assessors:
  - (a) Many of the SR/JR do not know each other and as well they do not know their own duty hours. Nobody given the written statement about this.
  - (b) There is no Mess facility for the student/nurses/residents.
- 17. In OPD Registration counter, when asked orally, the person at the counter that total 08 patients were registered; but when he was asked to provide a printout, the printout given by him showed 348 patients. At that time about 10-20 patients were seen in the OPD.
- 18. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

The Executive Committee of the Council further noted the letter of the appointed team of Assessors dated 23.04.2016 which reads as under:-

"As per your directions, we, namely, Dr. Nina Das, Professor of Pharmacology, Nil Ratan Sircar Medical College, Kolkata (Coordinator), Dr. Dharmendra Gohil, Professor of Emergency Medicine, PDU Medical College, Rajkot and Dr. Asim Das, Dean, ESIC Medical College, Faridabad have conducted surprise compliance verification assessment of P.K. Das Institute of Medical Sciences, Palakkad, Kerala on 22<sup>nd</sup> April 2016.

We are constrained to bring to your attention that we were subjected to physical intimidation, aggressive and unruly behaviour during the course of inspection by the management of P.K.Das Institute of Medical Sciences, Palakkad, Kerala. Following specific instances are brought to your notice:

In the morning after our entry in the premises of the P.K. Das Institute of Medical Sciences there were barriers at three places where we were asked to introduce ourselves. We tried not to divulge our identity, however, to enter the academic block we were made to sign the register and state the purpose of our visit. Two of us had entered our names and signed the register. Finally, when we reached the Principal's office, certain people who claimed to be part of the Management of the Institute were also present in the Principal's office. It appears to us that they had reached there on coming to know of our presence for MCI Inspection purpose. We asked the Principal to sign documents stating the requirements that he has to furnish within the mentioned time-line. Those claiming to be from the Management interfered stating that we cannot hold inspection as it is within two days of national festival, i.e., Mahavir Jayanti on 20<sup>th</sup> of April. We requested them that we will speak to the Principal only which annoyed them. They said the Principal will have to seek their permission and directed him to produce the notification in regard to inspection before or after holiday. When we asked the Principal to give in writing that they do not want to hold inspection because of the aforesaid reason, he sought permission to leave the Chamber for sometime. He came back and agreed telling us that we had reached late, though we had reached the Institute at 9:45 AM. The persons from Management were continuously interfering with our work and indulging in acts to provoke us. However, we maintained our composure.

At around 3:00 PM while Dr. Dharmendra Gohil was verifying the signatures of Faculty in the Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology and scrutinizing the Declaration Form of one Dr. P. Thulsi holding the designation of Associate Professor in the Institute, he noticed that the professional experience including publications stated in the Declaration Form does not entitle her to be designated as Associate Professor. Therefore, she was accepted as Assistant Professor. This infuriated the management, and consequently, more than 40 persons violently barged in the Room where scrutiny of the Declaration Forms was being carried out by us. Some of them from their looks appeared to us to be musclemen brought by the management with the purpose to physically intimidate us. One of the key persons of the Management started banging and shouted foul language called the Press and the photographers directing them to

record the proceedings. We were told by this aggressive person that this Dr. Thulsi was his sister and she had to be accepted by us as Associate Professor. He aggressively said that as she was his sister he had all the right to speak on her behalf. They all alleged that we were misbehaving with their senior faculty and not accepting them as Faculty on flimsy grounds. Seeing the situation turning ugly the Coordinator was forced to make an apology. At the same time the persons from the Institute manhandled the Assessors and snatched away the mobile phone telling that the Assessors were recording the situation. We were forced to consider not only Dr. P. Thulsi as Associate Professor, but also many others, even though they had not reported for the assessment within the time limit to avoid any disrespectful, discourteous as well as physical aggression and intimidation. They also told that they know whom we were talking to over the Mobile phone. They were recording all the discussion amongst the Assessors. It seems to us that they were also continuously keeping a track on the calls made by our mobile. We were repeatedly reminded that as per MSR and guidelines to Assessors we should have reported at 9:00 AM. In spite of repeated requests to give us documents related to the inspection they did not come with complete set of documents at any point of time and would take back the document after showing in piecemeal.

At the end, at around 8:00 PM when scrutiny of the Declaration Form was complete we requested them to give three pen drives for downloading soft copies and papers for printing. They gave the pen drive but not the blank papers for printing. At last when they were sternly told that we would leave without printing the Management entered with Musclemen at around 9:00 PM and told that as per Assessor Guideline we should have completed the assessment by 6:00 PM and they would not allow us to print the documents until it was shown to them. When we insisted that it is the Principal only who should be going through the documents after printing, they insisted that "where is it written that the Management will not be shown the Report" and since their Institution is at stake they would not allow us to go without handing over all the soft copies and documents, including Declaration Form as these were the Institution's property. At this point the one of the Administrators removed the CPU from which the A-3 Report / documents was being prepared and took it to another room. We also have strong reasons to suspect that all the Computers were linked through network and whatever work we were doing on the computer was getting known to the Management. They then came and informed the Management about the contents of the report. The Management then asked us to handover the soft copies including all the other papers pertaining to the Institution that were with us. Having done that we were asked to sign the Memorandum which they wanted to submit and ultimately allowed us to leave only around 10:00 PM.

In sum and substance, the attitude of the Management towards us was abusive, threatening, intimidating and aggressive throughout the one-day assessment process. We call upon you to take stern action against the Management of this Institute so that such behavior is not repeated and the Assessors can discharge their responsibilities without any fear to their physical safety and well-being. ‰

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup>batch of 150 MBBS students at P.K. Das Institute of Medical Sciences, Palakkad, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 and to issue show cause notice to the college authorities.

The Executive Committee of the Council also decided to refer the matter to the Ethics Committee to take action against the above mentioned residents of the college.

The Executive Committee of the Council also decided to issue show cause notice to the Dean and management of the college for the misbehaviour with assessors.

# 43. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>Hamdard Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, New Delhi</u> <u>under Jamia Hamdard (Hamdard University) u/s 10A of the IMC</u> <u>Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Hamdard Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, New Delhi under Jamia Hamdard (Hamdard University) u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (25<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (19<sup>th</sup>& 20<sup>th</sup>November, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 12.38 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 19.40 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Many Residents, as detailed in the report are not staying in the campus. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 4. Bed occupancy is 60.63 % against the requirement of 75%.
- 5. OPD: Plaster room & Plaster cutting room are still common. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 6. There was NIL Normal Delivery till 11:30 a.m. on day of assessment.
- 7. Casualty: At 11:30 a.m., 6 patients were available in Casualty. There was NIL Trauma patient.
- 8. Printout of Biometric attendance of 15/01/2016 revealed that names of a few faculty did not match with attendance sheet & Biometric attendance on 25/02/2016.
- 9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup>batch of 100 MBBS students at Hamdard Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, New Delhi under Jamia Hamdard (Hamdard University) u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

## 44. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of</u> <u>Rajshree Medical Research Institute, Bareilly, Uttar Pradesh under</u> <u>MJP Rohilkhand University, Bareilly u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956</u> <u>for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of Rajshree Medical Research Institute, Bareilly, Uttar Pradesh under MJP Rohilkhand University, Bareilly u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (5<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (05<sup>th</sup>& 06<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at Rajshree Medical Research Institute, Bareilly, Uttar Pradesh under MJP Rohilkhand University, Bareilly u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 45. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of</u> <u>Pacific Medical College & Hospital, Udaipur, Rajasthan under</u> <u>Pacific Medical University, Udaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for</u> <u>the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of Pacific Medical College & Hospital, Udaipur, Rajasthan under Pacific Medical University, Udaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (5<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (28<sup>th</sup>& 29<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at Pacific Medical College & Hospital, Udaipur, Rajasthan under Pacific Medical University, Udaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 46. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of</u> <u>F.H Medical College, faizabad, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Bhimrao</u> <u>Ambedkar University, Agra u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the</u> <u>academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of F.H Medical College, fzabad, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Bhimrao Ambedkar University, Agra u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (4<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (05<sup>th</sup>& 06<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at F.H Medical College, fzabad, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. Bhimrao Ambedkar University, Agra u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

### 47. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>Integral Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Lucknow under</u> <u>Integral University, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the</u> <u>academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Integral Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Lucknow under Integral University, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (5<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (5<sup>th</sup>& 6<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) as well as letter of the Central Government dated 20<sup>th</sup> April, 2016 forwarding a copy of complaint dated nil received from Ankita Mishra, Lucknow against the college and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup>batch of 100 MBBS students at Integral Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Lucknow under Integral University, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 48. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>Hi-Tech Medical College & Hospital, Rourkela, Orissa under</u> <u>Sambalpur University u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the</u> <u>academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Hi-Tech Medical College & Hospital, Rourkela, Orissa under Sambalpur University u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (5<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (05<sup>th</sup>& 06<sup>th</sup> October,, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 13.33 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 17.91 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. O.T.s: Only 6 O.T.s are in working condition against requirement of 7.
- 4. ICUs: In ICCU, only 4 beds are available against requirement of 5. There was NIL patient in SICU on day of assessment. Only 3 beds are available in NICU & NIL beds are available in PICU against requirement of 5 beds each.
- 5. Only 3 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 4.
- 6. Only 1 USG is available against requirement of 3.
- 7. Capacity of available Examination Hall is only 100 against requirement of 250.
- 8. Lecture Theaters: Only 3 Lecture Theaters are available against requirement of 4. Hospital Lecture Theater is not completed and is non-functional. E class facility is not available.
- 9. Central Library: Only Internet room is air-conditioned. Reading areas are still not air-conditioned. Staff Reading room is not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 10. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls are not separate. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 11. Central Photography Section: Staff & Equipment are not available.
- 12. Studentsq Hostels: Ancillary facilities like furniture, tables, chairs are inadequate in many rooms.
- 13. Nursesq Hostel: 6 Nurses are accommodated in a room which is impermissible. Atmosphere is clumsy.
- 14. Residential Quarters: 18 quarters for Non-teaching staff are available against requirement of 36.
- 15. No register of Speech Therapy is available.
- 16. Central Kitchen: It is only a small room of 200 sq.ft. area which is grossly inadequate. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 17. MRD is partly computerized.
- 18. Central Research Laboratory: Equipment are inadequate. Some old equipment, not in working order are placed under lock & key.
- 19. Anatomy department: Number of specimens are still inadequate at 74. A small room was designated as locker room but no locker was found on day of assessment. Half size Dissection tables are not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 20. Pathology Department: Only 59 mounted specimens are available which is inadequate. NIL catalogue is available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 21. Microbiology Department: Service Laboratories are not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 22. Pharmacology Department: In Museum, NIL models are available. Catalogues are not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 23. RHTC: It functions only from 9 a.m. to 5 p.m. in rented premises which are also being used by private X-ray clinic & medicine shop. Students do not attend regularly. There is no documentation of attendance of Specialistsq visits. Cold chain equipment is not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 24. UHC: It is a polyclinic with advertisement of an Orthopaedic Surgeon. No facilities for Antenatal checkup are available. There is no documentation of attendance of Specialistsqvisits.
- 25. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup>batch of 100 MBBS students at Hi-Tech Medical College & Hospital, Rourkela, Orissa under Sambalpur University u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 49. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>Indian Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Jalna,</u> <u>Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences,</u> <u>Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-</u> <u>2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Indian Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Jalna, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (4<sup>th</sup> February 2016) along with previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup>batch of 100 MBBS students at Indian Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Jalna, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 50. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS</u> students at Pacific Institute of Medical Sciences, Umarda, Girwa, Udaipur, Rajasthan under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at Pacific Institute of Medical Sciences, Umarda, Girwa, Udaipur, Rajasthan under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (2<sup>nd</sup> March, 2016) along with previous assessment report (19<sup>th</sup> & 20<sup>th</sup> Nov., 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at Pacific Institute of Medical Sciences, Umarda, Girwa, Udaipur, Rajasthan under Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 51. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch (150 seats)</u> of K.D Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Mathura, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. B.R Ambedkar University, Agra u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch (150 seats) of K.D Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Mathura, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. B.R Ambedkar University, Agra u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (24<sup>th</sup> February, 2016) alongwith a letter dated 05/02/2016 received from the appointed team of Council assessors enclosing therewith a brief report of assessment and assessment report (19<sup>th</sup>& 20<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 35.10 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 38.29 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy was 39 % on day of assessment.
- 4. Majority of patients admitted in the wards of General Medicine, General Surgery, Orthopaedics, O.G. & Psychiatry did not require admission and could have been managed on OPD basis. Case sheets were not written properly. Many patients were non-genuine.

- 5. There were NIL patients in Post-operative ward.
- 6. Data of clinical material and investigations provided by institute are inflated. These data did not match with indoor patient data.
- 7. There was only 1 Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 8. Workload of Histopathology was only 01 & of Cytopathology was only 02 on day of assessment.
- 9. There was NIL patient in Casualty during assessment.
- 10. There was only 1 patient in ICCU & 2 in PICU/NICU. Patients admitted in MICU & SICU did not merit intensive care.
- 11. During assessment, it was observed that the patients from the lower floor wards were brought to upper floor beds; this was verified from indoor registers & treatment register.
- 12. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup>batch of 150 MBBS students at K.D Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Mathura, Uttar Pradesh under Dr. B.R Ambedkar University, Agra u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 52. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of DM Wayanad Institute of Medical Sciences, Wayanad, Kerala under Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of DM Wayanad Institute of Medical Sciences, Wayanad, Kerala under Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (4<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (4<sup>th</sup>& 5<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) as well as letters dated 22.02.2016 & 04.03.2016 of the Dean of the college and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 7.69 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 29.57 % as detailed in the report.
- Many Residents are not staying in the campus. Many of the Residentsq Quarters are locked and in some other rooms, students of Nursing were found residing.
- 4. Bed Occupancy was 41 % on day of assessment.
- 5. Some indoor patients had minor, vague complaints like Bodyache, Joint pain, etc. which does not require admission or hospitalization. Many patients were not having any medicines or treatment, IV lines, belongings or any relatives. It looks as if they have been made patients for enhancing bed occupancy.
- 6. OPD: Separate Plaster Cutting room is not available. One of the examination room has been shown as Plaster cutting room which is not permissible. Even so, it seems it is not in use.
- 7. Patients were brought to OPD some time after assessors reached the institute; on interviewing it was observed that many had similar vague complaints for which generally people will not seek medical advice.
- 8. Wards: Tb & Chest and Skin & VD patients are kept in General medicine ward. One ward of General Surgery is common for males & females. Ophthalmology patients are kept in General Surgery ward. ENT patients are kept in Orthopaedics ward. A ward labelled as ‰emales General+ was shown as Obstetrics ward but it was closed and non-functional. Deficiency remains the same. Nursing stations in the wards are common. Distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. Ancillary service rooms are empty and seem to be not in use.
- 9. Workload of Contrast Radiology was NIL.

- 10. Workload of Cytopathology was only 3 on day of assessment.
- 11. Data of Clinical Material, Radiological & Laboratory investigations workload provided by institute is inflated. Patients attending OPD, patients admitted and investigations do not tally with each other.
- 12. Casualty: Total 25 beds are available in Casualty . 19 in General Casualty & 6 for Obstetrics. During assessment it was observed that male patients were admitted in Obstetrics Casualty; resultantly separate Obstetrics facility is not available.
- 13. ICUs: Out of 4 patients in ICCU, 2 were non-Cardiac patients. Patients admitted in MICU & SICU do not merit ICU care.
- 14. Central Research Laboratory: Equipment are inadequate & non-functional.
- 15. There were only a few patients at OPD Registration counters at time of taking round. Waiting area near OP counters was empty.
- 16. O.T. list is prepared by Anaesthetist but not signed by HOUs or HODs.
- 17. Total O.T. statistics do not match with Laboratory & Blood Bank statistics and are inflated.
- 18. Many non-operative procedures like suture removal are written as Minor O.T. to enhance & inflate total number of operations.
- 19. Demonstration rooms in the hospital are congested, not fitted with light and seem not to be used at all.
- 20. Many rooms of consultants seem not to be used at all as the furniture like chair, table was coated with dust.
- 21. StudentsqHostels: Computer & Internet are not available.
- 22. ResidentsqHostel: It does not have mess.
- 23. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup>batch of 150 MBBS students at DM Wayanad Institute of Medical Sciences, Wayanad, Kerala under Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 53. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS</u> <u>students at GITAM Institute of Medical Sciences and Research,</u> <u>Vishakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh under Gandhi Institute of</u> <u>Technology and Management(GITAM) (Deemed to be University)</u> <u>u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at GITAM Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Vishakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh under Gandhi Institute of Technology and Management(GITAM) (Deemed to be University) u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (11<sup>th</sup> March 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (27<sup>th</sup>& 28<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup>batch of 150 MBBS students at GITAM Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Vishakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh under Gandhi Institute of Technology and Management (GITAM) (Deemed to be University) u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 54. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 6<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>ICARE Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Haldia, West</u> <u>Bengal under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata</u> <u>u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 6<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ICARE Institute of Medical Sciences & Research,

Haldia, West Bengal under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (19<sup>th</sup> February 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (5<sup>th</sup>& 6<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) as well as letter dated 19/02/2016 and 14.03.2016 received from the Principal of the college and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 67 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 85 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy was only 08 % on day of assessment which is grossly inadequate. Many wards were closed.
- 4. OPD attendance was only 250 on day of assessment which is grossly inadequate.
- 5. Casualty attendance was only 09 on day of assessment. No Casualty Medical Officer was present on day of assessment.
- 6. There was NIL Major & NIL Minor operation on day of assessment.
- 7. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 8. Radiological & Laboratory investigation workload is inadequate. Separate register for Laboratory investigation is not available.
- 9. Histopathology & Cytopathology workload is NIL on day of assessment.
- 10. ICUs: ICCU beds are not available. MICU & ICCU are common.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 6<sup>th</sup>batch of 100 MBBS students at ICARE Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Haldia, West Bengal under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 55.

Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Shridevi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Hospital, Tumkur, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Shridevi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Hospital, Tumkur, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (17<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30th October, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 15.2 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 22.54 % as detailed in the report. 13 Residents were found to be not staying in the campus.
- 3. OPD attendance was around 750 as observed by assessors. When the assessors reached institute, there were very few patients seen at Registration counters. However, around 12:30 p.m., many healthy people were brought in claiming to be *Camp patients*." Data provided by institute are inflated.
- 4. Bed occupancy is 58.4 % on day of assessment.
- 5. There were only 08 Major operations on day of assessment for the whole hospital.
- 6. Radiological & Laboratory investigations workload is inadequate. Data given by the institute are inflated.
- 7. Workload of CT Scan is only 05 on day of assessment.

- 8. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 9. Wards: Demonstration rooms are not available in some wards. In some wards like O.G., Nursing Station was not functional or it was placed in such a way that Nurses were not in a position to see all the patients. Skin & VD and Psychiatry wards are cubicles of 2-3 beds each and Nursing station is far away which is not as per norms. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 10. StudentsqHostels: Available accommodation is 404 against requirement of 452. Lift is not available either in Boysqor GirlsqHostels even though they are G+5 structures. In Boysqhostel, A.C. is not working in Study room. There is no Broadband or Internet. In GirlsqHostel, Visitorsqroom is outside the hostel and not at all suitable. There is no Broadband or Internet.
- 11. ResidentsqHostel: Mess is not functional. There is no Visitorsqroom.
- 12. NursesqHostel: Separate Nursesqhostel is not available.
- 13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup>batch of 150 MBBS students at Shridevi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Hospital, Tumkur, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 56. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>Mount Zion Medical College, Pathanamthitta, Kerala under Kerala</u> <u>University of Health & Allied Sciences, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of</u> the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (100 seats) of Mount Zion Medical College, Pathanamthitta, Kerala under Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (29<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (4<sup>th</sup> & 5<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) as well as letter dated 29/03/2016 received from the appointed team of Council Assessors and letter dated 4.1.2016 from the Registrar, Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 39.3 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 58.3 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. On random verification it was observed that there are no Residents staying in the Residentsqhostel. These rooms were occupied by patientsq relatives, Nurses & trainee Dentists.
- 4. OPD: OPD area in the morning showed very few patients in the morning time; however OPD desk registration computer showed 547 patients at 11:30 a.m.
- 5. Bed occupancy as verified by assessors on taking round along with Dean was 42.33 % on day of assessment against requirement of 60 %.
- 6. NIL patient in General Surgery wards had IV fluids or injectable medicines being administered. General Surgery & Orthopaedics wards did not have any post-operative patients.
- 7. Many patients are admitted with minor complaints. In many cases, investigations are not mentioned in case sheets. There were many fake admissions as observed by assessors during verification.
- 8. No record of Minor operations is available.
- Labour room record showed 4 deliveries on 28/03/2016. On verification of the records in O.G. wards, Paediatrics wards & NICU, there were no such patients available just 1 day after delivery. This implies that records of Labour Room & Birth Register are fictitious.

- 10. Registers of Histopathology & Cytopathology are fictitious as samples of appendix & tonsils shown as having been received on 28/03/2016 in the laboratory could not be shown to us.
- 11. Data of Casualty attendance provided by institute appear to be inflated as no case papers are kept in Casualty and hence cannot be matched with computer data.
- 12. ICUs: PICU was closed for fumigation. There was only 1 patient in NICU & 2 in SICU on day of assessment.
- 13. Wards: Psychiatry, Skin & VD and Tb & Chest wards are makeshift arrangement and not as per MSR Regulations. Pantries in all wards had only table & chair.
- 14. Central Research Laboratory: Facilities are not adequate. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 15. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup>batch of 100 MBBS students at Mount Zion Medical College, Pathanamthitta, Kerala under Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 57. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>Lord Buddha Koshi Medical College & Hospital, Saharsa, Bihar</u> <u>under B.N Mandal University, Madepura u/s 10A of the IMC Act,</u> <u>1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Lord Buddha Koshi Medical College & Hospital, Saharsa, Bihar under B.N Mandal University, Madepura u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (6<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) alongwith letter dated 24/11/2015 submitted by the Council Assessors at the time of previous assessment and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 98 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 100 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Whole Hospital & college were closed.
- 4. As the hospital was closed, there was NIL patient in OPD or in the wards. No other clinical activity was observed.
- 5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup>batch of 100 MBBS students at Lord Buddha Koshi Medical College & Hospital, Saharsa, Bihar under B.N Mandal University, Madepura u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 58. <u>Recognition/Approval of Annapoorna Medical College & Hospital,</u> <u>Salem, Tamilnadu the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted</u> <u>by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of</u> <u>the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/Approval of Annapoorna Medical College & Hospital, Salem, Tamilnadu the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment reports (18<sup>th</sup> February, 2016) and (30<sup>th</sup> - 31<sup>st</sup> March, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 17.42 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 45.88 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy was 22 % on day of assessment. Some wards did not have a single patient.
- 4. OPD: Separate Registration counters for male/female are not available. Counters for OPD/IPD are not separate. There is no person available at Enquiry Desk.
- 5. Wards: Male & female wards are common for ENT, Ophthalmology, Psychiatry & 1 General Surgery ward. Ancillary facilities are not being utilized.
- 6. Data of OPD & Casualty attendance, Minor Operations, Radiological investigations given by the institute are highly inflated. Majority of patients admitted in Casualty did not merit admission.
- 7. There was NIL Normal Delivery & 1 Caesarean Section on day of assessment. There was no woman in labour room during the rounds.
- 8. ICUs: Patients admitted in ICCU & ICUs did not merit admission in Intensive Care.
- 9. Provision of Special Diet is not available.
- 10. Data for drugs dispensed to patients are not available in Pharmacy.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Annapoorna Medical College & Hospital, Salem, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree granted by Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 150 MBBS students at Annapoorna Medical College & Hospital, Salem, Tamilnadu under Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

59. <u>Recognition/approval of Dhanalakshmi Srinivasan Medical College</u> <u>& Hospital, Perambalur, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS</u> <u>degree(150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical</u> <u>University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Recognition/approval of Dhanalakshmi Srinivasan Medical College & Hospital, Perambalur, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree(150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment reports (18<sup>th</sup> February, 2016) and (11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 57.78 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 74.12 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. During verification Faculty & Residents have produced photocopy of telephone bill which were found to be fake. Nobody produced original bill. They were not knowing their own number, confessed that Institute had given this to them today. Dean has not signed on these in most of the forms. These faculty and residents were not considered.
- 4. Resident hostel was visited by all assessors on 2<sup>nd</sup> day in the morning. No male residents except one (SR of Emergency Medicine) were staying in room. Only 19 ladies residents were found to be staying. However, this was also doubtful as no water cooler on any floor, no lift for a G+5 floors building, no mess (only small dining area).

- 5. Many faculty members and residents are commuting from villages/towns which are 35 km to 60 kms from institute. Their daily presence and work in institute is questionable.
- 6. OPD attendance as verified by assessors was 350 on day of assessment against requirement of 1,200. When assessors reached the institute, there were hardly 10-15 patients in the whole of OPD block. Afterwards, institute brought healthy people for inflating OPD statistics.
- 7. Bed occupancy was 46.6 % on day of assessment against 75 % required. There was unnecessarily prolonged admission in many cases.
- 8. There were only 6 Major & NIL Minor operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment. There was NIL operation in Orthopaedics, Ophthalmology.
- 9. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 10. Data of OPD attendance, Casualty attendance, Number of patients admitted, Laboratory investigations workload provided by institute are highly inflated.
- 11. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP was NIL on day of assessment.
- 12. Workload of CT Scan was only 02 for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
- 13. Casualty: There is only 1 CMO available against 4 required. Disaster trolley is not available.
- 14. Central Clinical Laboratory is under control of Medical Superintendent & not under control of a department.
- 15. O.T.: Equipment like Defibrillators, Infusion Pumps are inadequate.
- 16. ICUs: There were only 2 patients in SICU. All healthy persons were kept in MICU & PICU. There was no admission after 06/04/2016, implying the patients were kept for prolonged period without need of ventilator.
- 17. Labour Room: One patient was kept in Eclampsia room without any indication.
- 18. Central Research Laboratory: Facilities & Equipment are inadequate.
- 19. Central Library: One of the Reading Room (Outside) is not airconditioned. Capacity of Reading Room for Residents is only 16 against 50 required.
- 20. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls are empty without furniture. Toilet in GirlsqCommon Room needs repair.
- 21. Central Photography Section: There is no staff or equipment. 3 persons with video camera & still camera were present but they did not have photo ID of the institute. College did not provide videography or still photography during assessment.
- 22. StudentsqHostels: Rooms are smaller than required. Triple seated rooms are 21-22 sq.m. against 27 sq.m. required @ 9 sq.m./student. Double seated rooms are 14.58 sq. m. against 18 sq.m. required.
- 23. Nursesq Hostel: Available accommodation is for 72 Nurses against 75 required.
- 24. Wards: Ancillary facilities are non-functional in many wards. Toilets are dirty & choked up.
- 25. Pathology Department: Service laboratories are not available.
- 26. Microbiology Department: Only 2 Service laboratories are available against requirement of 7.
- 27. RHTC: Posting register of students was not available. Mess is non-functional.
- 28. UHC: Posting register of students was not available. There is no proper registration for Specialty clinics.
- 29. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Dhanalakshmi Srinivasan Medical College & Hospital, Perambalur, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree granted by Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to

submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 150 MBBS students at Dhanalakshmi Srinivasan Medical College & Hospital, Perambalur, Tamilnadu under Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council also decided to refer the matter to the Ethics Committee for necessary action in the matter.

#### 60. <u>Recognition/ approval of Melmaruvathur Adhiprasakthi Institute</u> of Medical Sciences & Research, Melmaruvathurfor the award of <u>MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical</u> <u>University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/ approval of Melmaruvathur Adhiprasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Melmaruvathur for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report(12<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report(29<sup>th</sup> December, 2015, and 3<sup>rd</sup> August, 2015) and noted the following :-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 27.9 % on day of assessment.
- 2. No faculty is available in the department of Radiodiagnosis.
- 3. Shortage of Residents is 34.5 % on day of assessment.
- 4. Bed occupancy is 42.1 % at 11 a.m. on day of assessment.
- 5. Data of OPD attendance, Number of admissions, Laboratory investigations, Major & Minor operations as provided by institute are inflated.
- 6. Casualty attendance was 09 at the time of assessment in the morning. NIL patients were admitted in Casualty at that time. At 4 p.m., only 3 patients were present. Data provided by the institute are inflated.
- 7. Number of Radiological investigations reported does not match with actual OPD & IPD workload in the institute. Also, these investigations are performed in absence of faculty in Radiodiagnosis department.
- 8. Nurses: Number of Nurses were inadequate in most of the wards.
- There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 10. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Melmaruvathur Adhiprasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Melmaruvathur for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 150 MBBS students at Melmaruvathur Adhiprasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Melmaruvathur, Tamilnadu, under Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 61. <u>Recognition/Approval of Madha Medical College and Hospital,</u> <u>Thandalam, Chennai, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree</u> (150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, <u>Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/Approval of Madha Medical College and Hospital, Thandalam, Chennai, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter dated 22/04/2016 received from the appointed team of the Councilos assessment report (18<sup>th</sup>& 19<sup>th</sup> March 2016) and noted the following :-

"With reference to above, we had gone to the Madha Medical College, Chennai for carrying out the Compliance Verification Assessment of Madha Medical College & Hospital, Thandalam for the purpose of Recognition/Approval for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956, 22<sup>nd</sup> April 2016.

We reached the institute at 9.45 A.M. Dean after consulting with their management conveyed to us that they don't want the Assessment to be conducted today as most of the faculty & Residents were on leave after the holiday on Mahaveer Jayanti on Wednesday -20 April 2016 (Letter signed by Dean attached). Coordinator informed on mobile telephone to Dr. Bark in this regard.

One of the Assessor visited the hospital –There were very few patients in the OPD area, and before he could go to the wards, Dean followed him and requested him to come to the office, as they do not want assessment to happen. Few Photographs taken from Mobile camera are enclosed in Pen-Drive."

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Madha Medical College and Hospital, Thandalam, Chennai, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 150 MBBS students at Madha Medical College and Hospital, Thandalam, Chennai, Tamilnadu, under Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 62. <u>Recognition/Approval of Major S.D. Singh Medical College and</u> <u>Hospital, Fathegarh, Farrukhabad for the award of MBBS degree</u> (100 seats) granted by Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, <u>Kanpur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/Approval of Major S.D. Singh Medical College and Hospital, Fathegarh, Farrukhabad for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (2<sup>nd</sup> March, 2016 and 6<sup>th</sup>& 7<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) and noted the following :-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 70.75 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 89.55 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Medical Superintendent Dr. C.S. Aggarwal was not available on both days of assessment.

- 4. OPD attendance on day of assessment was 552 against requirement of 800.
- 5. Bed occupancy was 24.46 % on day of assessment.
- 6. There was NIL Major operation & 02 Minor operations on day of assessment.
- 7. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 8. CT Scan is not functional.
- 9. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP was NIL on day of assessment.
- 10. Radiological investigation workload is grossly inadequate.
- 11. Histopathology workload was only 03 & Cytopathological workload was only 04 on day of assessment.
- 12. Labour Room: Labour Register is not available. There is no sister i/c.
- 13. Radiodiagnosis Department: Only 2 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 4. Only 3 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5. Only 2 USG machines are available against requirement of 3.
- 14. OPD: Plaster room & Plaster Cutting Room are common. Cancer Detection clinic is non-functional.
- 15. Casualty: Reception counter in Casualty is non-functional and laden with dust.
- 16. MRD: Staff is inadequate.
- 17. Wards of Tb & Chest, Skin & VD & Psychiatry are common for males & females.
- 18. CSSD: Staff is not adequate. I/c Nurse/Technician is not available.
- 19. Central Library: It is not fully air-conditioned. Studentsq reading Room (Inside), Staff Reading Room, Residentsq reading Rooms are not air-conditioned. Internet connection is not available.
- 20. Central Photography Section is not functional.
- 21. Studentsq Hostels: Visitorsq room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet, Recreation room are not available.
- 22. Internsq Hostel: Visitorsq room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet, Recreation room are not available.
- 23. Residentsq Hostel: Visitorsq room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet, Recreation room are not available.
- 24. Canteen facilities are inadequate.
- 25. Anatomy Department: Specimens available are only 80. Cadavers are not available. Capacity of cold storage for dead bodies is inadequate.
- 26. Pathology department: Only 80 specimens are available.
- 27. Microbiology Department: Only 1 Service Laboratory is available against requirement of 7.
- 28. Community Medicine Department: Demonstration room has capacity of only 30 which is inadequate.
- 29. RHTC: It is non-functional. It is just labeled & located in a college campus. There are no clinical, survey, Immunization, family welfare or National Health Programme activities. No record is available.
- 30. UHC: It is not available. A private nursing home was shown as UHC which is not permissible. No manpower is available. There are no clinical, survey, Immunization, family welfare or National Health Programme activities. There is no record.
- 31. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Major S.D. Singh Medical College and Hospital, Fathegarh, Farrukhabad, for the award of MBBS degree granted by Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of freshbatch of 150 MBBS students at Major S.D. Singh Medical College and Hospital, Fathegarh, Farrukhabad, under Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 63. <u>Recognition/approval of Chintpurni Medical College & Hospital,</u> <u>Pathankot for the award of MBBS degree(150 seats) granted by Baba</u> <u>Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot u/s 11(2) of the I.M.C. Act,</u> <u>1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Chintpurni Medical College & Hospital, Pathankot for the award of MBBS degree(150 seats) granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot u/s 11(2) of the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that on receipt of the college authorities request u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956, the assessments to assess the standard of examination held by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot and to assess the physical and the other teaching facilities available for Recognition/Approval of Chintpurni Medical College & Hospital, Pathankot for the award of MBBS degree(150 seats) granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot u/s 11(2) of the I.M.C. Act, 1956 were carried out by the Council assessors on 16<sup>th</sup> December, 2015 , 25<sup>th</sup>& 26<sup>th</sup> February, 2016 and 16<sup>th</sup> March 2016. The assessment report (16<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) and assessment reports (25<sup>th</sup>& 26<sup>th</sup> February, 2016 & 16<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) were considered by the Executive Committee of the Council at its meeting held on 22/03/2016 and it was decided as under:-

"The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment reports (16<sup>th</sup> December, 2015, 25<sup>th</sup>& 26<sup>th</sup> February, 2016 and 16<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) alongwith various complaints received from Sh. Ramesh Kumar through e-mail and noted the following :-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 100 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 100 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Dr. N.S. Sharma, Principal & Dr. D.L. Jangral, Medical Superintendent were absent at time of assessment.
- 4. Till 11 a.m. no faculty & Residents appeared for assessment.
- 5. OPD attendance was NIL on day of assessment.
- 6. Bed Occupancy was NIL on day of assessment.
- 7. There was NIL admission & NIL discharge on day of assessment.
- 8. Casualty attendance was only 01 on day of assessment.
- OPD: Only 2 staff were present at Registration Counters at 10 a.m. on day of assessment. Most of OPD rooms were closed during assessment. There is no Immunization after 26/02/2016.
- 10. There is no Speech Therapist. Speech Therapy room was locked.
- 11. No Doctors were present in OPD except 1 faculty from ENT.
- 12. Wards: Most of the wards were kept locked during assessment. Orthopaedics& O.G. wards are on top floor of hospital building with asbestos roof and without any light, fan.
- 13. There was NIL Major & NIL Minor operation on day of assessment.
- 14. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 15. Radiological & laboratory investigations workload was NIL on day of assessment.
- 16. Casualty: Pulse Oxymeter, Crash Cart, Defibrillator are not available. At 12: 45 p.m., all the beds in casualty were occupied by non-genuine & healthy patients without any case papers and entry in Casualty register& treatment book.
- O.T.s: Most of O.T.s are not equipped. Some O.T.s were locked and appear to be non-functional. No register was available. NIL patient was available on Preoperative & Postoperative beds.
- 18. ICUs: PICU is not available. There was NIL patient in ICCU or MICU, SICU, NICU.
- 19. Labour Room: No Birth register was available. Only 2 Nursing staff with civil dress were present.
- 20. AERB approval letter & PNDT Certificates were not provided.
- 21. Blood Bank: It is non-functional. No record was available.
- 22. CSSD: No record is available.
- 23. MEU: Details of work carried out by MEU are not provided.
- 24. CME: Details of CME programmes conducted by institute are not provided.

- 25. College Council: Details of meetings of College Council & their minutes are not provided.
- 26. Pharmaco Vigilance Committee: Details of meetings of Pharmaco Vigilance Committee & their minutes are not provided.
- 27. Examination Halls: They are light, temporary structures. There are no lights & fans. Tables & Chairs are stacked in one hall.
- 28. Lecture Theater: Capacity of 4<sup>th</sup> Lecture Theater is less than required. E class facility is not available. E class facility is available in only 2 Lecture Theaters.
- 29. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned. Capacity of Students' Reading room (Outside) & Students' Reading Room (Inside) is 50 & 140 respectively against requirement of 150 each. Residents' Reading room is not available. 32 Internet Nodes are available against requirement of 40.
- 30. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is total 127 rooms of which a few are triple seated. Hence it is inadequate against requirement of 565. A few rooms are not furnished. Visitors' room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet & Recreation Room are not available.
- 31. Interns' Hostel: Available accommodation is 50 against requirement of 150. Rooms are not fully furnished. Visitors' room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet & Recreation Room are not available.
- 32. Residents' Hostel: Total 40 rooms are available against requirement of 85. Rooms are partially furnished. Visitors' room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet & Recreation Room are not available.
- 33. Nurses' Hostel: It is outside the campus.
- Residential Quarters: Only 5 quarters are available for teaching faculty against requirement of 26. NIL quarters are available for Non-teaching staff in the campus.
   Gender Harassment Committee is not constituted.
- 36. Central Kitchen was closed at time of taking round during assessment.
- 37. Nursing Staff: Very few Nurses were seen in wards & OPD.
- 38. Technicians are very poor in number in all the departments.
- 39. Anatomy Department: NIL Cadavers are available.
- 40. Physiology Department: Preparation rooms are not available.
- 41. Pathology Department: Museum facilities are inadequate.
- 42. Pharmacology Department: Audio Visual aids are not available.
- 43. Community Medicine Department: Practical laboratory is not equipped.
- 44. RHTC & UHC: No data were provided.
- 45. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend not to recognize/approve Chintpurni Medical College & Hospital, Pathankot for the award of MBBS degree(150 seats) granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot u/s 11(2) of the I.M.C. Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 2(two) weeks for further consideration of the matter."

The above decision of the Executive Committee was communicated to the Central Govt. vide this office letter dated 22/03/2016 and copy to the college authorities with the request to submit the compliance report.

In response to above, the Council Office had received a letter dated 05/04/2016 from the Authorized Signatory, Chintpurni Medical College & Hospital, Pathankot, Punjab stating therein as under:-

"That Chintpurni Medical college and Hospital after receiving the letter of permission No-MCI-34(41)/2011-Med/20706 dated 30.06.2011 admitted 150 students as its first batch in the session 2011-12 for the MBBS course. The students of the above said first batch have completed their MBBS course and are now undergoing their internship period since 1<sup>st</sup> January, 2016. The college as well as the students were awaiting the grant of recognition for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) to the Chintpurni Medical college & Hospital under section 11(2) of the Indian Medical council Act, 1956.

However to our utter shock, the Executive Committee of the Medical council of India has recommended not to recognize / approve Chintpurni Medical college & Hospital, Pathankot for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Baba Farid University of health Sciences, Faridkot under section 11(2) of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 and has asked for submission of compliance by showing unwanted deficiencies.

This is to bring to your kind notice that the Medical Council of India conducted 3 surprise inspections in the college to assess the standard of examination held by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot and to assess the physical and other teaching facilities available for Recognition / approval of Chintpurni Medical College & Hospital, Pathankot for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot under Section 11 (2) of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 on 16.12.2015, 25 and 26.02.2016 and 16.03.2016. However, in the MCI letter No-MCI-34(41)(Gen)(UG)/2015-Med/151905-152480 Dated - 30.11.2015 It was clearly mentioned by the MCI that the recognition was to be awarded to the college after inspection in 2 independent parts, i.e. the part (1) to evaluate the process of conduct of examination by the examining university. This first part inspection was carried out on 16.12.2015 by 2 MCI inspectors namely (1) Dr. R.N. Mandal (Co-ordinator), Director Professor Deptt. of Pediatrics, Maulana Azad Medical College New Delhi (2) Dr. Jibeswar Thakuria. Prof. Head Medicine, Fakhruddin Ali Ahmed Medical College Barpeta, Assam during the Practical exams of MBBS final year Part-II.

Part-II was related to the compliance to minimum standard requirements as prescribed by the Council for the award of recognition. The 2<sup>nd</sup> inspection was therefore conducted by a new set of three MCI inspectors namely (1) Dr. Brij Kumar Das (Co-ordinator) Deptt. Of ENT, Otorhinolaryngology Fakhruddin Ali Medical college Barpeta, Assam (2) Dr. Debasis Bhattacharya (Assessor) Principal & Professor, Deptt. Of Obstetrics & Gynecology, Nilratan Sircar Medical College, Kolkata, West Bengal(3) Dr. Surajit Kumar Mukhopadhyay(Assessors), Professor, Deptt. of Physiology, Medical College, Kolkata, West Bengal on 25<sup>th</sup> and 26<sup>th</sup> Feb 2016.

These were surprising in nature. The dates were kept secret by the MCI and never conveyed to the college. It is pertinent to point out herein that the assessment reports dated 16.12.2015, 25 and 26.02.2016 of the Council assessors had not pointed out any deficiency in the college and clearly found the college as eligible with faculty, infrastructure and other necessary requirements to be recognized for the award of MBBS degree under Section 11(2) of the Indian Medical Council Act 1956 But these reports never placed before the executive committee of MCI till 15.03.2016 due to reason best known to them. However for the third time the Council Assessors came on Inspected the College for the few Minutes and submitted the assessors report written and prepared by them in the MCI office in there on ways and methods to the executive committee of the MEDICAL Council of India with the deficiencies pointed out in your letter.

Perusal of the deficiencies show that the deficiencies pointed out are Illusory as is states 100% deficiencies in Faculty and Residents which is inconceivable in a Medical College with an attached hospital. The college is taking appropriate legal action against the Medical Council of India regarding the same as the College has complete infrastructure, well equipped and fully functional and the same has been repeatedly confirmed by the MCI inspectors in their various reports. Hence in the Circumstances, I request your good self to rely on the earlier 2 inspection reports dated 16.12.2015 and 25 and 25.02.2016 and grant recognition / approval of Chintpurni Medical College and Hospital, Pathankot for the award and MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot under Section 11(2) of the Indian Medical Council Act,1956. "

In reply, the Council vide its letter dated 13/04/2016 requested the college authorities to submit the detailed point-wise compliance as sought by the Council vide letter dated 22/03/2016 alongwith the demand draft of Rs. 3.00 lakhs (softcopy-in editable word format with C.D. also) with the documentary evidence to the Council office **within one week** from the date of dispatch of the letter for further necessary action in the matter.

In response to above, the Dean Chintpurni Medical College & Hospital, Pathankot, Punjab vide his letter dated 16/04/2016 has submitted the same representation which has been submitted by the them vide letter dated 5/04/2016 as quoted above with the request to give a chance to explain whole gambit in person. It was observed that there is no detailed pointwise compliance incorporated in this letter.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate the earlier decision dt. 22/03/2016 to recommend not to recognize/approve Chintpurni Medical College & Hospital, Pathankot for the award of MBBS degree(150 seats) granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot u/s 11(2) of the I.M.C. Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 2(two) weeks for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of freshbatch of 150 MBBS students at Chintpurni Medical College & Hospital, Pathankot under Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 64. <u>Recognition/approval of Katuri Medical College & Hospital, Guntur</u> for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. N.T.R. University of <u>Health Sciences, Vijayawada against the increased intake i.e. from</u> 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Katuri Medical College & Hospital, Guntur for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. N.T.R. University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment reports (12.02.2016 and 18 & 19 April, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Katuri Medical College & Hospital, Guntur for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. N.T.R. University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

#### 8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for  $\pounds$  enewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.+

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 100 to 150 MBBS students at Katuri Medical College & Hospital, Guntur for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 65. <u>Recognition/approval of National Institute of Medical Sciences &</u> <u>Research, Jaipur for the award of MBBS degree granted by NIMS</u> <u>University, Jaipur against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150</u> <u>seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur for the award of MBBS degree granted by NIMS University, Jaipur against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment reports (14.03.2016) and (21.04.2016 & 22.04.2016) as well as letter dated 22.04.2016, 27.04.2016 and 12.05.2016 from the Council assessors Dr. Karabi Baral, Bankura (Co-ordinator) and letter dated 22.04.2016 from the Registrar, NIMS University, Jaipur and noted the following:-

- 1. Lecture theaters: Hospital lecture Theater is not available.
- 2. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls could not be verified.
- 3. Hostels: Details of Studentsq Internsq Residents, NursesqHostels could not be verified till 8 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 4. Residential Quarters: Details of Residential Quarters could not be verified till 8 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 5. OPD: Registration counters are not separate for males/females. In Orthopaedics OPD, separate Plater Cutting room is not available. In Ophthalmology OPD, Dark Room & Refraction Room are common. All Dressing Rooms are common for Males/Females. Minor O.T. is not adequate.
- 6. OPD attendance was only 253 till 1 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 7. Bed occupancy was only 29.88 % -i.e. 257 out of 860 beds which is grossly inadequate.
- 8. There were only 5 Major operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
- 9. There were only 2 Normal Deliveries & Nil Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 10. Audiometry & Speech therapy rooms are common. Audiometry room is not soundproof. A single person is appointed as Audiometrist & Speech therapist which is not as per norms.
- 11. Wards: Wards are not as per MSR Regulations. ENT and Skin & VD wards are within a single room and partitioned. Wards have > 30 beds. In a corner of female ENT ward, a partitioned pantry is available but non-functional. Many beds in Skin & VD ward were not covered by bed sheets. Available pantry was non-functional.
- 12. In Paediatrics ward, 2 patients of 18 years of age were admitted. NIL post-operative patients were available in Surgery wards. Many patients admitted in Orthopaedics ward were for Physiotherapy. Most of the patients were non-genuine.
- 13. Data of Radiological & Laboratory investigations could not be verified.
- 14. In Haematology section of Central clinical laboratory, at 11:45 a.m. at time of visit register showed 114 blood samples but could not produce same number of samples on demand.
- 15. No data of Histopathology & Cytopathology workload were provided by the hospital till 8 p.m.; hence it could not be verified.
- 16. Casualty: No triage facility is available. Duty roster of doctors is not available.
- 17. O.T.: Preoperative/Preanaesthetic room is not available. In Orthopaedics O.T., patient came in his own dress changed the dress just near the O.T.
- 18. AERB approval for X-ray machines was not provided till 8 p.m. on day o assessment.
- 19. PNDT approval for USG was not provided till 8 p.m. on day o assessment.

- 20. Blood Bank: Only 2 units were dispensed upto 1 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 21. CSSD: Quality evaluation system is not in place. Only 3 persons are working. Register showed 20 Autoclaved Bins are distributed to Superspecialty O.T. but not for any ward or theater.
- 22. Details of Intercom facilities are not provided.
- 23. Nursing staff: majority were male Nurses. Registration number was not worn by Nursing staff.
- 24. Anatomy department: Only 50 mounted specimens are available.
- 25. RHTC facilities could not be verified.
- 26. UHC facilities could not be verified.
- 27. Shortage of Residents is 6.97 % as detailed in the report.
- 28. The assessor could not conduct the assessment on 22.4.2016 because of some serious problems happened on 21.04.2016. The verified declaration forms except the form of Surgery are with the college authority. No annexures and SAF and B forms provided by the institution on 21.04.2016. Photographs were taken by assessors in there own mobile as college authority did not arrange photographer during hospital visit.
- 29. Gender Harassment Committee: Details of Gender Harassment Committee could not be verified till 8 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 30. MEU: Names of faculty affiliated to MEU were not provided till 6 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 31. CME: Details of CME programmes were not provided till 8 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 32. College Council: Minutes of College Council meetings were not provided till 8 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 33. Institute did not arrange for photographer during the visit of assessor.
- 34. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

The Executive Committee of the Council also perused the letter from assessors which reads as under:

".....We reached the institute on 21.04.2016 at 10.20 a.m. Principal came to the administrative block and received the appointment letter, schedule of inspection process and annexures check list at 10.40 a.m.

She took in her office at the academic building. Dr. Jayalal started to visit the Surgery & Allied wards, OTs, OBGY & LR with Medical Superintendent.

As per direction of the Principal Dr. Gupta, Prof. of Anatomy accompanied to hospital visit for Medicine & Allied wards. Dr. Mohanty was engaged to take attendance of faculties & resident doctors in college lecture theatre till 11.30 a.m.

During hospital visit Dr. Mohanty called for some problems. Immediately from Central Clinical Laboratories, I went to LT. No photographers were provided during hospital visit. So we took photographs by our own mobile camera.

In the LT management person who are also faculties of different departments were present there. They asked me about the process of inspection whether it is right or wrong. Took photograph of me in personal mobile of him and recorded. Blamed us that MCI officials screwed us and taught us before sending their institution. Conversation between me and MCI Officials recorded by them. Attendance part was going on till 12.40 p.m.

Then we visited college side also and after lunch around 3.30 pm during physical verification of faculties and resident doctors in big conference hall in administrative block, some interference of management persons continued. In every steps their hot conversation and interference disturbed us to continue the inspection process.

Few parts of college and hospital side could not verified by us for these disturbances. They called the news channel. In every steps, we were humiliated, insulted and disturbed. All verified declaration forms except few forms from surgery department was with us which we sent to Council. Rest of declaration forms are kept with the college authority. On 21.04.2016 around 9 pm when we left the college, no annexures as per check list were submitted to us except library documents, central research lab. Document which were provided to me during visit of respective area. No SA-I and B forms provided to us on 21.04.2016.

After returning to hotel at Jaipur, we decided to avoid the institute on 22.04.2016 because we did not want to face further same or more severe incidences. We all were mentally severe depressed and insulted in every step. Hence, we could not visit the college on  $2^{nd}$  day i.e. 22.04.2016.

During hospital visit or college visit, they did not provide any videographer. But in LT during attendance and during physical verification process the photogrtaphers/videographers taken photos of the process."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognize/approve National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur for the award of MBBS degree granted by NIMS University, Jaipur against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18.03.2016, which reads as under:-

8(3)(1)õ ..

#### (c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956, alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 100 to 150 MBBS students at National Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Jaipur under NIMS University, Jaipur, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to issue show cause notice to the Dean and management for non cooperation and misbehavior with the assessors.

# 66. <u>Recognition/approval of Dr. Rajendra Prasad Govt. Medical</u> <u>College, Tanda for the award of MBBS degree granted by Himachal</u> <u>Pradesh University, Shimla against the increased intake i.e. from</u> <u>50 to 100 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Dr. Rajendra Prasad Govt. Medical College, Tanda for the award of MBBS degree granted by Himachal Pradesh University, Shimla against the increased intake i.e. from 50 to 100 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (25.04.2016), previous assessment report (14.03.2016 & 15.03.2016) as well as a representation dated 27/04/2016 received from the Principal of the college and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Dr. Rajendra Prasad Govt. Medical College, Tanda for the award of MBBS degree granted by Himachal Pradesh University, Shimla against the increased intake i.e. from 50 to 100 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for  $\pounds$  enewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.+

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 50 to 100 MBBS students at Dr. Rajendra Prasad Govt. Medical College, Tanda for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 67. <u>Recognition/approval of Govt. Medical College, Kota for the award</u> of MBBS degree granted by Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Govt. Medical College, Kota for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (26.04.2016) along with previous assessment report (14.03.2016 & 15.03.2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of Faculty is 13.63 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Examination Halls: They are not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 3. Studentsq Hostels: Available accommodation is for 512 against requirement of 565.

- 4. Internsq Hostel: Available accommodation is for 96 Interns against requirement of 150.
- 5. NursesqHostel: Available accommodation is for 52 against requirement of 75.
- 6. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned. There is no Librarian. Available area is 1,200 sq.m. against requirement of 2,400 sq.m. Deficiency of inadequate capacity of StudentsqReading Room (Outside) & Studentsq reading room (Inside) persists. Deficiency of Staff reading room persists.
- 7. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Govt. Medical College, Kota for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajasthan University of Health Sciences, Jaipur against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Committee considering the undertaking of Principal Secretary, Medical, Health & Medical Education, Govt. of Rajasthan, dated 13.05.2016 decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of increase of seats from 100 to 150 at Govt. Medical College, Kota for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 68. <u>Recognition/approval of D.Y. Patil Medical College, Kolhapur for</u> the award of MBBS degree granted by D. Y. Patil Education Society (Deemed University) Kolhapur against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of D.Y. Patil Medical College, Kolhapur for the award of MBBS degree granted by D. Y. Patil Education Society (Deemed University) Kolhapur against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (20.04.2016) along with previous assessment report (16.02.2016 & 17.02.2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. In the last assessment, one remark was *Record of Obstetrics* & *Gynaecology OPD does not match with Central registry…*" In the present assessment, at 11:30 a.m. the OPD figures registered in the Central registry was New 56 & Old 2 = Total 77. On verification in the O.G. department, the record of O.G. department showed only 49. Deficiency of mismatch of data remains as it is.
- 2. There was discrepancy in the record of Central registry & Departmental OPD figures in several other departments as well as observed during 11:40 a.m. -12:15 p.m. in the present assessment as under:

#	Department	OPD figures in Register	
		Central	Departmental
1	General Medicine	191	61
2	General Surgery	162	124
3	Orthopaedics	88	61
4	Paediatrics	81	38
5	Ophthalmology	79	123
6	DVL	62	42
7	Psychiatry	57	48

- 3. Bed occupancy was 71.69 % on day of assessment.
- 4. There was only 1 Minor operation on day of assessment.

- 5. There were only 2 patients under observation in the Casualty at the time of taking round.
- 6. The following fake patients were found in present assessment:
  - (a) In Surgical ward, one admitted patient did not have case paper;
  - (b) In Dermatology ward, one patient of Vestibulitis was admitted but he had no Skin problem at all;
  - (c) In Ophthalmology ward, 2 patients did not have case files.
- 7. A large proportion of patients in Paediatrics ward did not merit admission and appeared to be admitted for minor complaints.
- 8. Occupancy of ResidentsqHostels is only 20 %. Deficiency still persists.
- 9. Shortage of Residents is 18.39 % as detailed in the report.
- 10. Demonstration rooms of General Surgery, ENT & Ophthalmology departments had capacity less than required.
- 11. Lecture Theater in Hospital is not of Gallery type.
- 12. Nursing Hostels: They are of Dormitory types where the Nurses are living in cramped style.
- 13. Wards are not as per MSR Regulations. They are contiguous, communicating with one another. Beds are placed head on.
- 14. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognize/approve D.Y. Patil Medical College, Kolhapur for the award of MBBS degree granted by D. Y. Patil Education Society (Deemed University) Kolhapur against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of from 100 to 150 MBBS students at D.Y. Patil Medical College, Kolhapur under D. Y. Patil Education Society (Deemed University) Kolhapur, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Committee further decided to continue the application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18.03.2016.

# 69. <u>Recognition/Approval of T.D. Medical College, Alappuzha for the</u> <u>award of MBBS degree granted by Kerala University of Health &</u> <u>Allied Sciences, against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150</u> <u>seats.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/Approval of T.D. Medical College, Alappuzha for the award of MBBS degree granted by Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (25.04.2016) along with the previous assessment reports (12.02.2016, 28.04.2015, 04.09.2014 & 7<sup>th</sup>, 8<sup>th</sup>& 9<sup>th</sup> August, 2012) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 13.72 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Two Lecture Theaters in college are not of gallery type as required.
- 3. Central Library: No recent journals are purchased for last 2 years.
- 4. Central Library is partly air-conditioned.
- 5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve T.D. Medical College, Alappuzha for the award of MBBS degree granted by Kerala University

of Health & Allied Sciences, against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Committee considering the undertaking of the Secretary (Health), Govt. of Kerala dated 13.05.2016 decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of increase of seats from 100 to 150 at T.D. Medical College, Alappuzha for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 70. <u>Recognition/approval of NRS Medical College, Kolkata for the</u> <u>award of MBBS degree granted by The West Bengal University of</u> <u>Health Sciences, Kolkata against the increased intake i.e. from 150</u> <u>to 250 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of NRS Medical College, Kolkata for the award of MBBS degree granted by The West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (27.04.2016) along with previous assessment reports (10.03.2016 & 11.03.2016) as well as a representation dated 09/05/2016 from the Principal of the college and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 15.6 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. OPD: Teaching areas are small with inadequate capacities. Injection room is common for males/females. There is no emergency tray in injection room. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 3. Audiometry & Speech therapy are not available in ENT OPD.
- 4. Wards: There are NIL Demonstration rooms in Psychiatry & Dermatology wards. Capacity of Demonstration rooms in many wards is < 30. That in Surgery ward is not furnished.
- 5. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
- 6. Central Library: It is still not air-conditioned.
- 7. Capacity of StudentsqReading room (Inside) is 200 against requirement of 250. Staff Reading Room capacity is 30 against requirement of 50.
- 8. GirlsqCommon Room is unfurnished.
- 9. Residentsq Hostels: 40 rooms are 4 seater which is not permissible. Resultantly, available accommodation is less than required.
- 10. Capacity of Demonstration Rooms of Anatomy, Physiology, Biochemistry Departments is less than required. Deficiency remains the same.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve NRS Medical College, Kolkata for the award of MBBS degree granted by The West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Committee considering the undertaking of Principal Secretary, Health & F.W. Deptt., Govt. of West Bengal, dated 13.05.2016 decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of increase of seats from 150 to 250 at NRS Medical College, Kolkata for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 71. <u>Increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at Jhalawar</u> <u>Medical College, Jhalawar for the academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at Jhalawar Medical College, Jhalawar for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (22.04.2016) along with previous assessment report (7<sup>th</sup>& 8<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for increase of MBBS seats from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Jhalawar Medical College, Jhalawar under Rajasthan Universityfor the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 72. <u>Increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at MNR Medical</u> <u>College & Hospital, Sangareddy for the academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at MNR Medical College & Hospital, Sangareddy for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (20.04.2016) along with previous assessment report (16<sup>th</sup>& 17<sup>th</sup> February, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 63.20 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 47.05 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy as observed by assessors is 35.34 % at 10 a.m. on day of assessment.
- 4. Wards: Distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m in several wards.
- 5. Patients admitted in Paediatrics, Skin & VD, Tb & Chest wards were not genuine.
- 6. Admission records are not maintained properly. Deficiency of mismatch of data between admission register & patients admitted in wards remains as it is.
- 7. Data of OPD attendance, Major & Minor operations given by the institute are highly inflated. Only 1 patient was operated & 1 was on table.
- 8. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 9. Deficiency of inadequate capacity of Residentsqhostel remains as it is.
- 10. Central Research Laboratory: Facilities are inadequate. Deficiency remains the same.
- 11. Website: Information uploaded is sketchy. Deficiency remains the same.
- 12. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of scheme for increase of seats from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 at MNR Medical College, Sangareddy, Andhra Pradesh under NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada for academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

The Committee further observed that the deficiencies of faculty, Residents and bed occupancy are still continuing in excess permissible limits u/s 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations for 100 MBBS admissions and accordingly decided to continue the application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18.03.2016.

#### 73. <u>Increase of seats in MBBS course from 125-200 at Rural Medical</u> <u>College, Loni, Mahrashtra for the academic session 2016-17 and</u> <u>Continuance of Recognition for 125 MBBS seats.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to increase of seats in MBBS course from 125-200 at Rural Medical College, Loni, Mahrashtra for the academic session 2016-17 and Continuance of Recognition for 125 MBBS seats.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (27 & 28.04.2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for increase of MBBS seats from 125 to 200 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Rural Medical College, Loni, Mahrashtra under Pravara Institute of Medical Sciences (Deemed University), Ahmednagar for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee further decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Pravara Institute of Medical Sciences (Deemed University), Ahmednagar in respect of students being trained at Rural Medical College, Loni, Mahrashtra be continued restricting the number of admission to 125 (One Hundred and Twenty five) students.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for  $\pm$ Renewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.

The Committee decided to place the matter regarding continuance of recognition before the General Body of the Council.

74. Increase of seats in MBBS course from 50-100 at Maharaja Agrasen Medical College, Agroha u/s 10A of the IMC Act 1956 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to increase of seats in MBBS course from 50-100 at Maharaja Agrasen Medical College, Agroha u/s 10A of the IMC Act 1956 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (01.04.2016) along with previous assessment report (26<sup>th</sup>& 27<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 12.96 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Deficiency of faculty is 5.49 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. CT Scan is 2 slice against requirement of 16 slice.
- 4. AERB approval is not available.
- 5. OPD: Child Welfare Clinic & Child Rehabilitation clinic are not available.
- 6. Wards: Most of the wards do not have pantry. All wards are small, partitioned with bed capacity ranging from 2 . 8. Nursing station is outside the ward & common between wards. In some wards, male & female patients are kept in a single room.

- 7. OPD: Registration is not computerized. Data provided by institute are inflated.
- 8. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP was less on day of assessment as observed by assessors.
- 9. Central Library: ResidentsqReading room is not available. Internet Nodes are only 10.
- 10. Lecture Theater: Hospital Lecture Theater is not of gallery type; its capacity is only 50 which is inadequate.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of scheme for increase of seats from 50 to 100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 at Maharaja Agrasen Medical College, Agroha under Pt. B.D. Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak for academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

#### 8(3)(1)õ ..

#### (c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

# 75. <u>Increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at Saraswathi</u> <u>Institute of Medical Sciences, Hapur u/s 10A of the IMC Act 1956</u> <u>for the academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at Saraswathi Institute of Medical Sciences, Hapur u/s 10A of the IMC Act 1956 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (18.03.2016 and 12.05.2016) along with assessment report (9<sup>th</sup>& 10<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 24.06 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 62.85 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. There is deficit of 19 teaching beds as 541 beds are available against 560 required.
- 4. Bed occupancy is 16.25 % on day of assessment.
- 5. In Orthopaedics ward, out of 20 admitted patients, case files of only 09 patients were available. Rest of the patients did not have any record in the ward. 3 Female patients were accommodated in Male ward.
- 6. Statistics of Clinical Material provided by institute are highly exaggerated.

- 7. Details of patients admitted in ICUs on day of assessment are not provided.
- 8. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of scheme for increase of seats from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 at Saraswathi Institute of Medical Sciences, Hapur under Chaudhary Charan Singh University, Meerutfor academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

8(3)(1)õ ..

(c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

# 76. Increase of seats in MBBS course from 70-100 at Dayanand Medical College & Hospital, Ludhiana u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic session 2016-17 and Continuance of recognition for 70 seats.

Read: the matter with regard to Increase of seats in MBBS course from 70-100 at Dayanand Medical College & Hospital, Ludhiana u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic session 2016-17 and Continuance of recognition for 70 seats.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment reports (29.02.2016) along with previous assessment report (30<sup>th</sup> November, 2015 & 1<sup>st</sup> December, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for increase of MBBS seats from 70 to 100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Dayanand Medical College & Hospital, Ludhiana under Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee further decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot in respect of students being trained at Dayanand Medical College & Hospital, Ludhiana be continued restricting the number of admission to 70 (Seventy) students.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

#### 8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for  $\pm$ Renewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.

The Committee decided to place the matter regarding continuance of recognition before the General Body of the Council.

# 77. Increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Latur u/s 10A of the IMC Act 1956 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Latur u/s 10A of the IMC Act 1956 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (01.03.2016) along with previous assessment report (30<sup>th</sup> November, 2015 & 1<sup>st</sup> December, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Most of the patients in Skin & VD and Paediatric wards did not merit admission. Good number of patients were admitted on a day prior & on day of assessment. Not a single patient was available in Psychiatry ward.
- 2. Only 3 Major operations . 1 each in ENT, Eye & O.G. . were being performed at time of visit at 10:30 a.m. on day of assessment.
- 3. O.T.: Ophthalmology O.T. has 3 tables in 1 room which is not as per norms.
- 4. ICUs: Combine ICCU & MICU has only 09 beds against total 10 beds required.
- 5. ICUs: In PICU, 2 out of 3 admissions were such who did not merit admission in PICU.
- 6. Elderly Senior Residents are not staying in the campus.
- 7. ResidentsqHostel: Half of two blocks are shared by Nursing staff & Nonteaching staff and by Residents. Accommodation available for Residents is 56 against requirement of 67. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 8. Residential Quarters: Quarters for non-teaching staff are not available in the campus. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 9. Anatomy Department: Cadaver lift facility is not yet available. Cold storage facility is shared with Forensic Medicine department. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 10. There is no kitchen in the hospital.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of scheme for increase of seats from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 at Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Latur under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik for academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 78. <u>Increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at Pramukhswami</u> <u>Medical College, Karamsad u/s 10A of the IMC Act 1956 for the</u> <u>academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at Pramukhswami Medical College, Karamsad u/s 10A of the IMC Act 1956 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (05.04.2016) along with previous assessment report (7<sup>th</sup>& 8<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) as well as additional information through emails dated 11.05.2016 from Dr. Abhimanyu Basu, Kolkata (Co-Cordintor), Dr. Narsingh G. Herekar, Miraj and Dr. Sankar Kurli, Andhra Pradesh and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 11.59 %.
- 2. Bed occupancy is 62.64% as against required 75%.
- 3. Workload of CT Scan is only 10 on day of assessment which is inadequate.
- 4. Histopathology workload is only 07 & Cytopathology workload is only 06 on day of assessment which is inadequate.
- 4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of scheme for increase of seats from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 at Pramukhswami Medical College, Karamsad under Sardar Patel University, Gujarat for academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

8(3)(1)õ ..

# (c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

#### 79. <u>Increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at Aarupadai</u> <u>Veedu Medical College & Hospital, Puducherry for the academic</u> session 2016-17 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at Aarupadai Veedu Medical College & Hospital, Puducherry for the academic session 2016-17 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (27.04.2016) along with previous assessment report (21<sup>st</sup>& 22<sup>nd</sup> January, 2016) as well as a representation dated 09/05/2016 received from the Dean of the college and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 12.4 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 8.8 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy is 53.8 % on day of assessment.
- 4. Wards: Male Tb & Chest ward has no pantry & no Demonstration room. Skin & VD female ward has no Demonstration room, Pantry, Store Room. There was no register present in the ward.
- 5. Operative workload data appear to be inflated as Histopathology laboratory had only 2 & 4 samples from O.T. on 2 prior working days.
- 6. Workload of Radiological & Laboratory investigations is grossly inadequate.
- 7. No operation was being performed in ENT O.T. at the time of taking round.
- 8. Data of Casualty attendance provided by institute appear to be inflated.
- 9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of scheme for increase of seats from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 at Aarupadai Veedu Medical College & Hospital, Puducherryunder Vinayaka Missions University, Salemfor academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

8(3)(1)õ ..

#### (c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

#### 80. <u>Mahatma Gandhi Institute of Medical Sciences, Wardha - Renewal</u> of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 65-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Mahatma Gandhi Institute of Medical Sciences, Wardha - Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 65-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (05.02.2016) along with assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) as well as letter dated 05.02.2016 received from the Dean of the Institute and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 65-100 in respect of Mahatma Gandhi Institute of Medical Sciences, Wardha under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nasik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 81. <u>Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Narketpally, Nalgonda –</u> <u>Renewal of Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS</u> <u>students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the</u> <u>academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Narketpally, Nalgonda . Renewal of Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (06.02.2016) along with assessment report (3<sup>rd</sup>& 4<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 in respect of Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Narketpally, Nalgonda under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawadau/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

### 82. <u>Prathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Karimnagar – Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session</u> <u>2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Prathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Karimnagar . Renewal of Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (08.02.2016) along with assessment report (1<sup>st</sup>&

2<sup>nd</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 in respect of Prathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Karimnagar under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawadau/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 83. <u>Smt. Kashibai Navale Medical College & General Hospital, Pune -</u> <u>Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS</u> <u>students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the</u> <u>academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Smt. Kashibai Navale Medical College & General Hospital, Pune - Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (08.02.2016) along with assessment report (8<sup>th</sup>& 9<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of Smt. Kashibai Navale Medical College & General Hospital, Pune under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashiku/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 84. <u>Ruxmaniben Deepchand Gardi Medical College, Ujjain – Renewal</u> of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Ruxmaniben Deepchand Gardi Medical College, Ujjain . Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (12.02.2016) along with assessment report (11<sup>th</sup>& 12<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of Ruxmaniben Deepchand Gardi Medical College, Ujjain under Vikram University, Ujjainu/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 85. <u>Sree Balaji Medical College and Hospital, Chennai – Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session</u> <u>2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Sree Balaji Medical College and Hospital, Chennai . Renewal of Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (12.02.2016) along with assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Most of the patients admitted in General Medicine ward had minor ailments not necessitating admission.
- 2. Though MRD is computerized, all IPD admission tickets are hand written.
- 3. In General Surgery, very few post-operative patients were found in Surgical wards. Only a few IV drip sets were seen. O.T. list for 11/02/2016 collected from O.T. does not match with post-operative

patients. Out of 16 post-operative patients, only 5 were found in wards & post-operative care unit.

- 4. In Orthopaedics, most of admitted patients had minor ailments. Very few post-operative patients were found in wards. Only a few IV drip sets were seen. O.T. list for 11/02/2016 collected from O.T. does not match with post-operative patients. Out of 12 post-operative patients, only 7 were found in wards & post-operative care unit.
- 5. InternsqHostel: It is still under repair.
- 6. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 in respect of Sree Balaji Medical College and Hospital, Chennai under Bharath University, Chennaiu/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 86. <u>Sree Balaji Medical College and Hospital, Chennai – Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session</u> <u>2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Sree Balaji Medical College and Hospital, Chennai . Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (12.02.2016) along with assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of Sree Balaji Medical College and Hospital, Chennai under Bharath University, Chennaiu/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 87. <u>Kannur Medical College, Kannur – Renewal of Permission for</u> admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Kannur Medical College, Kannur . Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (01.03.2016) along with assessment report (28<sup>th</sup>& 29<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Bed occupancy was 69 % on day of assessment against 75 % required.
- 2. Wards: Male & Female ENT ward is common. Beds for male & female Ophthalmology patients are common in one single hall. Washroom facilities are common. For 30 beds of female Ophthalmology/ENT, there is only 1 bathroom & latrine.
- 3. Majority of patients are admitted on 28<sup>th</sup>& 29<sup>th</sup> February 2016. There are large number of patients with trivial complaints admitted for no reason. Many patients in O.G. ward were not pregnant and admitted with complaints not related with pregnancy & conception. Patients of ENT are admitted in General Surgery ward. One ward in Orthopaedics was totally vacant.
- 4. Data of OPD attendance given by institute is unreasonable & highly inflated. OPD attendance, as observed by assessors is around 600 which is inadequate. At 9:00 a.m., computer showed around 70 patients when OPD starts at 9:00 a.m. Number of patients in individual OPDs

- 5. O.T.: On day of assessment, on verification it was observed that there were 3 patients in O.T. & 8 in Preoperative ward . i.e. total 11 cases; however, O.T. list showed 42 operations scheduled. There is Data mismatch.
- 6. Blood bank has issued only 3 units on day of assessment.
- 7. There was only 1 Normal Delivery on day of assessment.
- 8. ICUs: In PICU/NICU, patients are admitted who do not require intensive care.
- 9. Radiodiagnosis Department: 1 static X-ray machine of 300 mA is not working since long; resultantly there is deficit of 1 static X-ray machine.
- 10. Central Library: It is only partly air-conditioned. Second reading room for students, staff reading room, computer room with Medlar & Internet & other areas are still not air-conditioned.
- 11. CSSD: Issue of sterilized material appears to be less on day of assessment.
- 12. USG: Data supplied by institute shows total 68 patients examined for USG; however at the time of visit in the morning hours, only 1-2 patients were seen.
- 13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of Kannur Medical College, Kannur under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

#### 8(3)(1)õ ..

(c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

#### 88. <u>Mediciti Institute of Medical Sciences, Ghanpur – Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session</u> 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Mediciti Institute of Medical Sciences, Ghanpur . Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (02.03.2016) along with assessment reports (16<sup>th</sup>&17<sup>th</sup> November, 2015&4<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Bed occupancy is 36.39 % on day of assessment.
- 2. Deficiency of faculty is 7.05 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Shortage of Residents is 5.75 % as detailed in the report.
- 4. Data of OPD attendance provided by institute are not matching with actual observation of assessors.
- 5. Radiological workload was less on day of assessment.
- 6. Histopathology workload is only 06 & Cytopathology workload is only 04 on day of assessment.
- 7. ICUs: There was only 1 patient in ICCU on day of assessment.
- 8. Nursing staff: Only 335 Nurses are available against 372 required.
- 9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of Mediciti Institute of Medical Sciences, Ghanpur under Dr. NTR University of Heath Sciences, Vijaywada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

8(3)(1)õ ..

(c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made

for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

### 89. <u>Pondicherry Institute of Medical Sciences, Pondicherry - Renewal</u> of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Pondicherry Institute of Medical Sciences, Pondicherry - Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (11.03.2016) along with assessment report (4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> January, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. There is very less number of patients in different wards. It was observed that true medical or surgical cases are few in respective Medical or Surgical wards as under:
  - (a) Patient Mr. Thomas . Reg No. 1259047, Bed No. 51(MMW-2) admitted with pseudophobia for refraction.
  - (b) Patient . Iyyadurai, 40/M-Reg.No. 1259481, Bed No. . 77(MMW-3) admitted with Myalgia/muscle pain.
  - (c) Patient in Bed No. 25 in Male Medical Ward was admitted with accident and injury in left hand.
  - (d) Patient in Bed No. 26 in Male Medical Ward was admitted with low backache.
  - (e) Patient in Bed No. 53 in Male Medical Ward was admitted with swelling in the popliteal region.
  - (f) Patient in Bed No. 40 in Male Medical Ward was admitted with postoperative Cholecystectomy.
  - (g) Patient in Bed No. 47 in Male Medical Ward was admitted with Sputum positive Pulmonary Tuberculosis.
  - (h) Patient Mrs. Rani-Reg No. 1259145, Bed No. 43 (FMW) admitted on 10.3.2016 with Right leg, hand and shoulder pain for 2 months.
- 2. One patient Mr. Harikrishnan, Regn. # 1259479, Bed # 81 was admitted with complaint of epigastric pain on 09/03/2016; however no advice was given till 11 a.m. on 11/03/2016.
- 3. One patient Mr. Arumugam Regn. # 1240099, Bed # 88 was admitted for Heamarrhoidectomy and was discharged on 07/03/2016. But he was still in his bed at time of round during assessment on 11/03/2016.
- 4. On random verification it was found that Major Operations in General Surgery varied from NIL to 3 during 3 month period. Daily average was 1.5 which is inadequate.
- 5. Out of 13 post-operative cases, 8 were of Diabetic Ulcer only implying thereby poor variety of teaching material.
- 6. While checking Bed Head ticket / Indoor patient files, it was observed that there is no OPD sheet or Emergency sheet with provisional diagnosis or advice on admission in most of admitted cases. In many cases provisional diagnosis or treatment was not written even after 2 days.
- 7. PG course is running in Ophthalmology; however unit faculty complement is incomplete as there is no Asso. Prof.

- Data of Bed Occupancy given by the institute are inflated. Although 76 % bed occupancy is claimed, 35 % of beds in General Medicine (i.e. 49 out of 140) & 31 % (i.e. 41 out of 131) of beds in General Surgery were vacant at time of taking round.
- 9. Residential Quarters: Nil Residential Quarters are available for nonteaching staff. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 10. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

The Executive Committee of the Council further perused the following remarks from the letter of assessors dt. 11/04/2016:

"Though the overall bed occupancy is about 76% (471 out of 620), as mentioned in page-8 of A-III form, the number of patients in Surgery wards and Medicine wards was low (only 91 patients found out of 140 beds in General Medicine wards & only 90 patients found out of 131 beds in General Surgery wards, PIMS).

2. Moreover, there is lack of proper clinical materials in those wards on the day of assessment, as mentioned in sl.no.- 4 & sl.no.- 6 of A-III form (like- patients with photophobia for refraction, myalgia/muscle pain, with low backache, postoperative cholecystectomy, right leg, hand and shoulder pain etc. were found admitted in different wards of General Medicine department, PIMS)."

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of Pondicherry Institute of Medical Sciences, Pondicherry under Pondicherry University u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to place the matter before the Postgraduate Committee of the Council.

#### 90. <u>School of Medical Sciences & Research, Noida – Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session</u> <u>2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to School of Medical Sciences & Research, Noida . Renewal of Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment reports (11.03.2016) along with previous assessment reports (20<sup>th</sup> and 21<sup>st</sup> January, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of School of Medical Sciences & Research, Noida under Sharda University, Noida u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 91. <u>Sree Gokulam Medical College & Research Foundation,</u> <u>Trivandrum – Renewal of Permission for admission of 6<sup>th</sup> Batch of</u> <u>MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-150 for the</u> <u>academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Sree Gokulam Medical College & Research Foundation, Trivandrum . Renewal of Permission for admission of 6<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (17.03.2016) along with assessment report (4<sup>th</sup>& 5<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) as well as letter dated 22.03.2016 from the Principal of the college and noted the following:-

- 1. On actual physical verification, it was found that bed occupancy was 54 % at 10 a.m. on day of assessment. (i.e. 369 out of 680 beds).
- 2. No emergency operation was performed during the period of 24 hours from 11 a.m. 16/02/2016 till 11 a.m. 17/02/2016.
- 3. Dean refused to sign the assessment report after reading the same.
- 4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 6<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-150 in respect of Sree Gokulam Medical College & Research Foundation, Trivandrum under Kerala University of Heath & Allied Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

#### 8(3)(1)õ ..

#### (c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

## 92. <u>Rohilkhand Medical College & Hospital, Bareilly – Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session</u> <u>2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Rohilkhand Medical College & Hospital, Bareilly . Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (30.03.2016) along with previous assessment report (28<sup>th</sup>& 29<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 9.30 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. On random verification, it was observed that at least 4 Senior Residents are not staying in the campus. Many other Senior Residents who are above 60 y of age are also not staying in the campus.
- 3. OPD data provided by institute are highly inflated. Assessors visited OPD at 10 a.m., 12 noon & 1 p.m. and very few patients were seen in OPD during all 3 visits. Actual OPD attendance on day of assessment was around 750 on day of assessment against requirement of 1,200.
- 4. Bed occupancy was 45 % on day of assessment.
- 5. Many patients were admitted on 28/03/2016 & 29/03/2016 as verified from case sheets. In many patients who were admitted day before assessment, complaints did not match with treatment mentioned on case paper. In General Surgery ward, 20 patients were admitted the day before with trivial complaints and had not received even oral drugs and post admission investigations were not carried out.
- 6. Total number of Major operations on day assessment is only 06 which is inadequate.
- 7. Total number of Minor Operations as verified by assessors was only 01; however, the register showed 05 Minor operations.
- 8. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 9. Data of Clinical Material, Radiological & Laboratory investigations as provided by institute are inflated.
- 10. Emergency O.T. is non-functional.
- 11. Facilities in Central Research Laboratory are inadequate.
- 12. Patients in Paediatrics ward were of adult age and case sheets did not match with complaints & treatment.
- 13. Nursing stations are not in proper places in many wards.
- 14. Medical files of many admitted patients have similar wordings in the Nursing notes. One such file is of patient named Jyoti.
- 15. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP was NIL on day of assessment.
- 16. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of Rohilkhand Medical College & Hospital, Bareilly under M.J.P Rohilkhand University, Bareilly u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

#### 8(3)(1)õ ..

#### (c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that

institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956, alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

#### 93. <u>Shri Guru Ram Rai Institute of Medical Sciences, Dehradun –</u> <u>Renewal of Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS</u> <u>students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the</u> <u>academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Shri Guru Ram Rai Institute of Medical Sciences, Dehradun . Renewal of Permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (05.04.2016) along with previous assessment report (16<sup>th</sup>& 17<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of Shri Guru Ram Rai Institute of Medical Sciences, Dehradun under Hemwati Nandan Bahuguna Garhwal University, Srinagar u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 94. <u>GSL Medical College, Rajahmundary– Renewal of Permission for</u> admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016.

Read: the matter with regard to GSL Medical College, Rajahmundary. Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (26.04.2016) along with previous assessment report (13<sup>th</sup>& 14<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 34.69 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of residents is 31.85 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. OPD attendance was 1,854 on day of assessment which is less than minimum 2,000 required as Qualifying Criterion.
- 4. Bed occupancy as verified by assessors on day of assessment at 10 a.m. was 24.85 % (i.e. 261 out of 1050 beds) which is grossly inadequate.
- 5. Data of Clinical material, Laboratory investigations given by institute are inflated.
- 6. There was only 1 Normal Delivery & 1 Caesarean Section on day of assessment till 1:30 a.m.
- 7. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup>Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 in respect of GSL Medical College, Rajahmundary under the Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

8(3)(1)õ ..

#### (c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

# 95. <u>Rajendra Institute of Medical Sciences, Ranchi – Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 6<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 90-150 for the academic session</u> <u>2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Rajendra Institute of Medical Sciences, Ranchi . Renewal of Permission for admission of 6<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 90-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (16.03.2016), assessment report (22<sup>nd</sup> and 23<sup>rd</sup> January, 2016) along with an undertaking of the Principal Secretary, Health & F.W. and Medical Education Govt. of Jharkhand dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 6<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 90 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Rajendra Institute of Medical Sciences, Ranchi under Ranchi University, Ranchi for the academic year 2016-17.

#### 96. <u>Govt. Medical College, Akola – Renewal of Permission for</u> admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Govt. Medical College, Akola . Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (22.04.2016) along with previous assessment report (14<sup>th</sup>& 15<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of Govt. Medical College, Akola under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashiku/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 97. <u>Chhattisgarh Institute of Medical Sciences, Bilaspur – Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session</u> <u>2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Chhattisgarh Institute of Medical Sciences, Bilaspur. Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (25.04.2016), previous assessment report (5<sup>th</sup>& 6<sup>th</sup> Fesbruary, 2016) along with an undertaking of the Secretary, Medical Education, Government of Chhattisgarh dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Chhattisgarh Institute of Medical Sciences, Bilaspur under Chhattisgarh Ayush & Health Sciences University, Raipur for the academic year 2016-17.

#### 98. <u>Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other</u> teaching facilities available for 150 MBBS seats at Deccan College of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada.

Read: the matter with regard to compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 150 MBBS seats at Deccan College of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (31.03.2016) along with previous assessment report (21<sup>st</sup> and 22<sup>nd</sup> January, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 42.35 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Wards: Wards are not as per MSR guidelines. Many wards have 60-90 patients with 1 functional Nursing station. Examination cum Treatment room, Store room, Duty room Pantry are not available in many wards. Demonstration rooms are common between wards.
- 3. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 & amended on 18.03.2016 and to give an opportunity to

the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

#### 99. <u>Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other</u> teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Rama Medical College, Hospital & Research, Kanpur.

Read: the matter with regard to compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Rama Medical College, Hospital & Research, Kanpur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (30.03.2016) along with previous assessment report (22.01.2016, 21.08.2015, 7<sup>th</sup> May, 2015 & 19<sup>th</sup> & 20<sup>th</sup> September, 2014) as well as letter dated 30.03.2016 received from the Principal of the college and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 30.47 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 60.60 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Principal was not in his office even by 10:30 a.m.
- 4. OPD attendance was only 333 on day of assessment.
- 5. Bed occupancy was 35.10 % (i.e. 165 out of 470 beds) on day of assessment.
- 6. Many patients in General Medicine, Paediatrics, Tb & Chest, Skin & VD, Psychiatry are admitted with minor, vague complaints as verified from case sheets. In many cases, history, medicines, investigations and signature of doctors were not available.
- 7. In Post-operative ward, there were 07 beds where mattresses were not covered with bed sheets and NIL patients.
- 8. Casualty: Crash cart was not available.
- 9. In Paediatrics ward, many kids did not have any attendants.
- 10. Radiological investigations like Plain X-rays was less on day of assessment. Workload of CT Scan was only 06 on day of assessment.
- 11. Workload of Histopathology was only 08 on day of assessment.
- 12. Data of clinical material as provided by institute are grossly inflated.
- 13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give an opportunity to the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

8(3)(1)õ ..

(c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by the institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

#### 100. <u>Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other</u> teaching facilities available for 130 MBBS seats at Sri Siddhartha Medical College, Tumkur under Siddhartha University, Tumkur.

Read: the matter with regard to Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 130 MBBS seats at Sri Siddhartha Medical College, Tumkur under Siddhartha University, Tumkur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (05.04.2016) along with previous assessment report (20<sup>th</sup> August, 2015, 7<sup>th</sup> May, 2015 & 20<sup>th</sup>& 21<sup>st</sup> January, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Bed occupancy was 72 % (i.e. 512 out of 710 beds) on day of assessment. Data provided by institute are inflated.
- 2. 40% of patients in Orthopaedic wards had minor complaints of backache, joint pain and arthritis and did not merit admission. 20% of patients in Surgical wards had minor complaints such as abdominal pain, UTI, epidydymorchitis, anal fissure and did not merit admission. In O.G. ward 10% of patients did not merit admission. In ENT wards more than 50 % patients did not merit admission.
- 3. On examination of 2 patients of Epidydymorchitis there were no clinical features of the same. In the Surgical wards the proportion of operated patients was very small.
- In Pediatrics ward in some cases the name of the patient did not tally with the patient records sheet.
- 5. In Dermatology ward, there are only 20 beds against requirement of 30 beds as it is a postgraduate department.
- 6. In some wards there was an effort to change the date of admission of the patient by Overwriting.
- 7. Data of Minor operations provided by institute are inflated.
- 8. Casualty: There were 8 patients in the casualty at 1.00 p.m.; of them only 4 patients were admitted on 5<sup>th</sup> April. Rest were admitted more than 24 hours before with admission date varying from 13/03/2016 to 4/04/2016 and diagnosis ranging from giddiness and diabetes and chronic liver disease. One patient had been transferred from the medical ward.
- 9. ICUs: There were only 2 patients in ICCU. Majority of patients admitted in ICUs did not merit admission in Intensive care. There is only 1 split A.C. in SICU which is inadequate; the rest did not have air-conditioning.
- 10. Deficiency of Static & Mobile X-ray machines remains as such as detailed in the report.
- 11. CT Scan is not in working order.
- 12. Wards: All the wards had capacity of 5, 10, 20 beds. O.G. & ENT wards did not have Nursing stations within the wards. Ancillary facilities are not as per MSR guidelines in many wards as detailed in the report.
- 13. Shortage of Residents is 11.62 % as detailed in the report.
- 14. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 & amended on 18.03.2016 and to give an opportunity to the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

#### 101. <u>Recognition/approval of Subharti Medical College, Meerut for</u> <u>awarded of MBBS degree granted by Swami Vivekanand Subharti</u> <u>University, Meerut against increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150</u> <u>seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Subharti Medical College, Meerut for awarded of MBBS degree granted by Swami Vivekanand Subharti University, Meerut against increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment reports (11.05.2016 &19.04.2016) along with assessment reports (21.09.2015 & 16<sup>th</sup>& 17<sup>th</sup> March, 2015) as well as letters dated 19.04.2016 and 23.04.2016 from the Principal and Dr. Mukti Bhatnagar, Subharti Medical College, Meerut and noted the following:-

- 1. Data of Clinical material, Casualty attendance provided by institute appears to be inflated as on practical verification in OPD, only a few patients were available in O.G., Skin & VD, Psychiatry OPDs.
- 2. There is discrepancy/mismatch in data of laboratory investigations provided by institute and Central clinical laboratory as under:

	#	Investigation	Number of Investigation		
74			Data provided by Institute	Record in CCL Register at 2 p.m.	
	1	Haematology	1,007	51	
	2	Biochemistry	1,121	70	
	3	Microbiology	179	07	

- 3. Teaching beds are deficient by 25 no. as under:
- (a) General Medicine: 06;
- (b) Skin & VD: 01;
- (c) Psychiatry: 02;
- (d) General Surgery: 02;
- (e) Ophthalmology: 08;
- (f) ENT: 06.
- 4. In most of the wards, many of the patients admitted had trivial complaints like Generalized mild backache, neck pain, abdominal pain, leg pain, loose stools (without IV drip). In O.G. ward, a patient was admitted for vaginal discharge only. In Orthopaedics ward, patients were admitted for Low backache, Cervical Spondylitis. In General Surgery ward, patients were admitted with abdominal pain.
- 5. O.T.s: Both the Ophthalmology O.T.s are having 2 tables each which is not permissible. O.T. in Labour Room was smelling badly suggestive of not being used for long time. There was NIL post-operative patient or register in post-operative room of O.G. O.T.
- 6. O.T. lists showed 8 cases posted for Minor operations but none had started till 10:30 a.m.
- 7. Casualty: In triage room, only 1 bed was occupied out of available 7 beds.
- 8. Casualty: Partitions still persist; hence all patients are not visible from one Nursing Station.
- 9. In Tb & Chest ward, ward # 11, Nursing station remains blank without any medicine or papers at time of assessment. 2 male patients of Tb & Chest ward were kept in female Tb & Chest ward.

- 10. Wards are partitioned and all the corners are not visible from Nursing Station. Sterilized treatment trays are not available in all the wards.
- 11. In Paediatrics ward 3, on duty sister told the assessors that 2 patients were on leave. This is not permissible. Either the patient has to be in the ward or be discharged.
- 12. Although baby weighing machine is calibrated in Kg. & Gms., baby weights of newborns are written in Pounds.
- 13. No sister duty register was available in labour room. There were no autoclaved trays.
- 14. Boundary of Medical college campus appears to be partial.
- 15. Dr. P. Bansal, Senior Resident, General Surgery provided as residence proof his BSNL bill; on enquiry on phone, owner of that number turned out to be of one Mr. Subhash.
- 16. Principal has refused to sign the report after reading the same.
- 17. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Subharti Medical College, Meerut for the award of MBBS degree granted by Swami Vivekanand Subharti University, Meerut against increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided to grant 01 month time to the institute to submit the compliance on rectification of deficiencies to the Council for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of from 100 to 150 MBBS students at Subharti Medical College, Meerut under Swami Vivekanand Subharti University, Meerut, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to place the matter before the Ethics Committee of the Council.

#### 102. <u>Recognition/approval of Sri Aurobindo Institute of Medical</u> <u>Sciences, Indore for the award of MBBS degree granted by Devi</u> <u>Ahilya vishwavidyalaya, Indore against the increased intake i.e.</u> <u>from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Sri Aurobindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indore for the award of MBBS degree granted by Devi Ahilya vishwavidyalaya, Indore against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment reports (14.03.2016) and (27.04.2016 & 28.04.2016) as well as letter dated 28.04.2016 of the Dean of the college and a complaint letter dated Nil from Dr. Rajesh Singh, Noida and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 6.96 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 11.49 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy is 55.34 % on day of assessment as observed by assessors.
- 4. Histopathology workload of 34 on day of assessment does not match with number of operations.
- 5. Cytopathology workload provided by institute appear to be inflated.
- 6. Casualty: Separate Casualty for O.G. is not available. There was only 1 patient in Casualty at time of visit.
- 7. ICUs: ICCU is shared with C.T. Surgery & is managed by Cardiology department.
- 8. Wards: In some wards, distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. Pantries were not clean in some wards.

- 9. There were NIL patients in Emergency ward at 10:00 a.m. At 1:00 p.m. there were patients but on enquiry it was found that they were cold patients not requiring any emergency treatment. No IV fluids or drugs were being given to them.
- 10. OPD: Demonstration rooms are congested.
- 11. Anatomy Department: Number of Dissection tables is inadequate. 3 small Dissection tables were kept in another room & not in use. There were decomposed cadavers kept in 2 tanks, poorly maintained with fungus around it.
- 12. Biochemistry department: Laboratory facilities are inadequate as detailed in report.
- 13. Pathology Department: There is no 2<sup>nd</sup> Demonstration room. A room was shown with cloth partition & sharing with practical laboratory which cannot be accepted.
- 14. RHTC: Specialistsq visits are not organized. Cold Chain equipment is inadequate. Residential accommodation is available but not in use. It is unhygienic. MCH & FP registers are not available.
- 15. UHC: Specialistsqvisits are not organized. MCH & FP registers are not available. It is congested & not as per MSR Regulations.
- 16. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Sri Aurobindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indore for the award of MBBS degree granted by Devi Ahilya vishwavidyalaya, Indore against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of from 100 to 150 MBBS students at Sri Aurobindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indore under Devi Ahilya vishwavidyalaya, Indore, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

#### 8(3)(1)õ ..

(c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of

the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

#### 103. <u>Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other</u> teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Sri Aurobindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indore, Madhya Pradesh under Devi Ahilya Vishwa Vishwa Vidyalaya, Indore.

Read: the matter with regard to compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Sri Aurobindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indore, Madhya Pradesh under Devi Ahilya Vishwa Vishwa Vidyalaya, Indore.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (27<sup>th</sup>& 28<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) along with previous assessment reports (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> December, 2014) as well as complaint letter dated Nil from Dr. Rajesh Singh, Noida and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 10.14 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Wards: In some wards, distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. Pantries were not clean in some wards.
- 3. Admission & Discharge data provided by institute appear to be inflated.
- 4. Histopathology workload of 34 on day of assessment does not match with number of operations.
- 5. Cytopathology workload provided by institute appear to be inflated.
- 6. OPD: Demonstration rooms are congested.
- 7. Pathology Department: There is no 2<sup>nd</sup> Demonstration room. A room was shown with cloth partition & sharing with practical laboratory which cannot be accepted.
- 8. Casualty: Separate Casualty for O.G. is not available. There was only 1 patient in Casualty at time of visit.
- 9. ICUs: ICCU is shared with C.T. Surgery & is managed by Cardiology department.
- 10. Wards: In some wards, distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. Pantries were not clean in some wards.
- 11. There were NIL patients in Emergency ward at 10:00 a.m. At 1:00 p.m. there were patients but on enquiry it was found that they were cold patients not requiring any emergency treatment. No IV fluids or drugs were being given to them.
- 12. Anatomy Department: Number of Dissection tables is inadequate. 3 small Dissection tables were kept in another room & not in use. There were decomposed cadavers kept in 2 tanks, poorly maintained with fungus around it.
- 13. Biochemistry department: Laboratory facilities are inadequate as detailed in report.
- 14. RHTC: Specialistsq visits are not organized. Cold Chain equipment is inadequate. Residential accommodation is available but not in use. It is unhygienic. MCH & FP registers are not available.
- 15. UHC: Specialistsqvisits are not organized. MCH & FP registers are not available. It is congested & not as per MSR Regulations.
- 14. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated  $16^{th}$  April, 2010 & amended on 18.03.2016 and to give an opportunity to the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

The Committee further decided that the decision with regard to applying Section 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April, 2010 which was taken in earlier meeting dt. 13.01.2015 be continued.

#### 104. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of</u> <u>Al-Azhar Medical College and Super Specialty Hospital,</u> <u>Thodupuzha, Kerala under Kerala University of Health & Allied</u> <u>Sciences, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic</u> <u>year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of Al-Azhar Medical College and Super Specialty Hospital, Thodupuzha, Kerala under Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (21<sup>st</sup> April, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (4<sup>th</sup>& 5<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) as well as the letter dated 15/01/2016 received from the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 79 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 79.55 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Most of the Residents are not staying in the hostels.
- 4. OPD: Very few patients were seen in OPD. No Consultants or Residents were present in most of the departments.
- 5. Bed occupancy was 06.67 % (i.e. 020 out of 300 beds) on day of assessment which is grossly inadequate. Institute has provided data of Bed occupancy @ 61 % which is false & highly inflated. There were healthy persons lying on beds without any case papers.
- 6. Although equipment has been procured, Histopathology & Cytopathology workload has not yet started.
- 7. There was NIL Major & Minor operation on 21/04/2016. All O.T.s were closed. Out of 3 patients operated on 20/04/2016, only 2 of them were available.
- 8. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section from 17/04/2016 to 19/04/2016. There was only 1 Normal Delivery on 20/04/2016.
- 9. ICUs: There was NIL patient in ICCU, SICU. Only 1 child was kept in PICU for observation without any documentary evidence. In MICU, 1 patient was admitted for Hypertension for 2 days, without any anti-hypertensive drug being given !
- 10. Only 2 Static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 3. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 11. Central research laboratory: It is not adequately equipped & not functional.
- 12. OPD attendance was 125 as observed & verified by assessors. Institute data are grossly inflated.
- 13. Data of Clinical Material, Major & Minor operations, Radiological & Laboratory investigations as provided by institute are grossly inflated. Hospital is practically non-functional.
- 14. Very few Nursing & Paramedical staff are available in the wards.
- 15. Blood Bank: Since 16/04/2016, no stock of usable blood was available. Five expired blood units were found which contrary to Regulations.
- 16. Examination hall: capacity of 2<sup>nd</sup> Examination hall is 200 against requirement of 250. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 17. Lecture Theaters: Hospital lecture Theater is not of gallery type. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 18. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls are smaller than required.
- 19. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of Al-Azhar Medical College and Super Specialty Hospital, Thodupuzha, Kerala under Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 105. <u>Recognition/approval of Career Instt. of Medical Sciences &</u> <u>Hospital, Lucknow for the award of MBBS degree(100 seats)</u> <u>granted by Dr. RML Avadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s</u> <u>11(2) of the I.M.C. Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Career Instt. of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Lucknow for the award of MBBS degree(100 seats) granted by Dr. RML Avadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (22<sup>nd</sup> April, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (18<sup>th</sup>& 19<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) as well as an email dated 22/04/2016 from the Principal of the college and noted the following:-

- 1. 80 % of the patients in Surgical wards had no investigation records. In other wards, some admitted patients non-specific minor ailments which actually did not need any admission. (E.g. 40 % of patients in Medical departments were admitted for minor complaints. Most of the admitted patients had similar diagnosis like PUO, UTI, AUB, Pain in Abdomen, Osteoporosis, etc.
- 2. Although Bed occupancy was 77 %, some patients were admitted for many days & with minor complaints not requiring admission.
- 3. College students were made to stand in OPD queue.
- 4. Data of clinical material provided by institute are highly inflated.
- 5. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 6. There were total only 09 patients in O.T. lists of all departments combined.
- 7. ICUs: 3 patients admitted in ICCU did not merit intensive care. There was NIL patient in SICU.
- 8. Internsq Hostel: Deficiency of inadequate Study room & Recreation in female internsqhostel remains as it is.
- 10. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Career Instt. of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Lucknow for the award of MBBS degree(100 seats) granted by Dr. RML Avadh University, Faizabad, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

The Committee further decided that the decision with regard to applying Section 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April, 2010.which was taken by it by circulation on 07.10.2015 be continued.

#### 106. <u>Recognition/Approval of Chirayu Medical College & Hospital,</u> <u>Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh the award of MBBS degree (150 seats)</u> <u>granted by Barkatullah University, Bhopal u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,</u> <u>1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/Approval of Chirayu Medical College & Hospital, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Barkatullah University, Bhopal u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment reports (12<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) and (20 & 21 April, 2016) as well as letters dated 21/04/2016 and 26/04/2016 from the college authorities and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 82.92 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Most of the Residents are not staying in the campus.
- 3. There is no mess facility in Residentsqhostel.
- 4. Genuine OPD attendance was 500-600 against requirement of 1,200. Data of OPD attendance given by the institute are highly inflated.
- 5. Bed occupancy on day of assessment at 10 a.m. is only 30 %. Data of bed occupancy @ 76 % given by the institute are highly inflated.
- 6. O.T.: At time of taking round, there was NIL patient in Ophthalmology & ENT O.T. There was only 1 patient in O.G. & Orthopaedics O.T. each & 2 patients in General Surgery O.T. There was no signature of any faculty in planned O.T. list of O.G. & Ophthalmology.
- 7. In Pathology & Radiodiagnosis department registers, some entries of patients are fake & data are inflated.
- 8. MRD: ICD X classification of diseases is not followed for indexing.
- 9. ICUs: There is no SICU. 2 patients of General Surgery were admitted in RICU. Another 4 bedded RICU was non-functional. There was NIL patient in ICCU.
- 10. Nursing staff: In many wards, instead of Nursing staff, B.Sc. (Nursing) students were posted.
- 11. Casualty: Dr. Hardeo Singh, CMO, did not know the details of Casualty patients. There were only 5 patients in last 24 hours before assessment.
- 12. In USG room of O.G. department, there is no USG machine, no patient, no staff, no Nurse & no register at time of taking round.
- Regarding complaint about super specialists faculty, complaint is 13. genuine. All 12 super specialist doctors have been doing private practice. Some of them are absent on the day of assessment. Some of them are part time. One Oncologist Dr. T.P. Sahu is full time. These Specialist M.Ch/DM Super faculty are shown in General actually Medicine/General Department but their clinical work/department/wards/beds are separate as their concern super speciality. They consult only on super speciality patients. In hospital records and register their department/wards are shown as Oncology department/Cardiology department/Urology department etc. So they cannot be counted for undergraduate inspection.
- 14. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

The Executive Committee of the Council also considered the letter from the Ministry of Health & F.W. dated 13.05.2016 received by fax stating that the college had been assessed on 20.04.2016, Mahavir Jayanti, declared holiday by the Central Government. The Committee was however informed that in the list of holidays received from State Govt. of Madhya Pradesh, holiday for Mahavir Jayanti was on 19<sup>th</sup> April, 2016. This was also confirmed from the D.M.E., Madhya Pradesh. The Committee further noted that in this case the clause 8(3) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 which states that õ õ .. Council shall ensure that such inspections are not carried out at least 2 days before upto 2 days after the important religious and festival holidays declared by the Central/State Government+õ . cannnot be applied since Mahavir Jayanti is not a major religious festival like Christimas, Eid, Diwali, Holi, Ganesh Chaturthi etc.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Chirayu Medical College & Hospital, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Barkatullah University, Bhopal u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the

compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 150 MBBS students at Chirayu Medical College & Hospital, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh under Barkatullah University, Bhopal,u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 107. <u>Recognition/approval of Dr. V.R.K Women's Medical College,</u> <u>Aziznagar, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100</u> <u>seats) granted by Dr. N.T.R University of Health Sciences,</u> <u>Vijayawada u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Dr. V.R.K Womencs Medical College, Aziznagar, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. N.T.R University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (20<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report(11<sup>th</sup> March, 2016, 27<sup>th</sup> January, 2016, 25<sup>th</sup> Aug. 15, 16<sup>th</sup> April, 15 and 13<sup>th</sup>& 14<sup>th</sup> February, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Government for recognition/approval of Dr. V.R.K Women**c** Medical College, Aziznagar, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. N.T.R University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

#### 8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for Renewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.+

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch 100 MBBS students at Dr. V.R.K Womenons Medical College, Aziznagar, Andhra Pradesh for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 108. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats)</u> of Fakhruddin Ali Ahmed Medical College, Barpeta, Assam under Srimanta Sankaradeva University of Health Sciences, Assam u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Fakhruddin Ali Ahmed Medical College, Barpeta, Assam under Srimanta Sankaradeva University of Health Sciences, Assam u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017. The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (3<sup>rd</sup> February 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) along with an undertaking of the Secretary, Health Department, Govt. of Assam dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Fakhruddin Ali Ahmed Medical College, Barpeta, Assam under Srimanta Sankaradeva University of Health Sciences, Assam u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 109. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Joka, Kolkata under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Joka, Kolkata under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment reports (2<sup>nd</sup> May, 2016 and 17<sup>th</sup> March, 2016), previous assessment report (8<sup>th</sup>& 9<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) along with an undertaking of the Financial Commissioner, E.S.I.C. (HQ), Ministry of Labour, Govt. of India, dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Joka, Kolkata under West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 110. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch of 150 MBBS</u> <u>students at GMERS Medical College, Valsad, Gujarat under Veer</u> <u>Narmad South Gujarat University, Surat u/s 10A of the IMC Act,</u> <u>1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at GMERS Medical College, Valsad, Gujarat under Veer Narmad South Gujarat University, Surat u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (7<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (17<sup>th</sup>& 18<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) alongwith previous assessment report (8<sup>th</sup>& 9<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) along with an undertaking of the Secretary & Commissioner, Health, Govt. of Gujarat dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at GMERS Medical College, Valsad, Gujarat under Veer Narmad South Gujarat University, Surat u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 111. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of</u> <u>GMERS Medical College, Dharpur, Patan, Gujarat under</u> <u>Hemchandarya North Gujarat University, Patanu/s 10A of the IMC</u> <u>Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of GMERS Medical College, Dharpur, Patan, Gujarat under Hemchandarya North Gujarat University, Patanu/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (6<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report(17<sup>th</sup>& 18<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) along with an undertaking of the Secretary &

Commissioner, Health, Govt. of Gujarat dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of GMERS Medical College, Dharpur, Patan, Gujarat under Hemchandarya North Gujarat University, Patanu/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 112. <u>Recognition/approval of Punjab Institute of Medical Sciences,</u> Jalandhar, Punjab for the award of MBBS degree(150 seats) granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Punjab Institute of Medical Sciences, Jalandhar, Punjab for the award of MBBS degree(150 seats) granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (22<sup>nd</sup> April, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (15<sup>th</sup>& 16<sup>th</sup> February, 2016) as well as letter/representation dated 13.05.2016 received from the authorized signatory, Punjab Institute of Medical Sciences, Jalandhar and noted the following:-

- 1. On actual physical verification of wards it was observed that only 396 beds out of 650 beds were occupied implying Bed Occupancy of 61 % on day of assessment.
- 2. Wards in the hospital have small multiple rooms in some specialties like General Medicine, General Surgery, O.G., Orthopaedics, Paediatrics in a large area designated as ward and there is Nursing Station at one end. Bed capacity of such rooms is from 2 onwards.
- 3. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Punjab Institute of Medical Sciences, Jalandhar, Punjab for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 150 MBBS students at Punjab Institute of Medical Sciences, Jalandhar, Punjab under Baba Farid University of Health Sciences, Faridkot, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 113. <u>Recognition/Approval of Rajiv Gandhi Institute of Medical</u> <u>Sciences, Ongole for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats)</u> <u>granted by Dr. N.T.R. University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada,</u> <u>Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/Approval of Rajiv Gandhi Institute of Medical Sciences, Ongole for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. N.T.R. University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (25<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (14<sup>th</sup>& 15<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 13.3 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 22.38 % as detailed in the report.

- 3. Only 4 Static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 4. ETO Sterilizer is not yet available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 5. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP continues to remain NIL. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 6. ICCU is not available.
- 7. Central Library: Only 5,578 books are available against requirement of 7,000. Seating capacity is inadequate. Deficiency of inadequate Internet Nodes remains as it is.
- 8. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls do not have attached toilets.
- Central Photography Section is not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
   No Interns are residing in hostels. Internsphostel is locked. Deficiency of
- inadequate ancillary facilities in Studentsqhostels remains as it is.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Rajiv Gandhi Institute of Medical Sciences, Ongole for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. N.T.R. University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Committee considering the undertaking of Principal Secretary, Health & Medical Education, Govt. of Andhra Pradesh decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 100 seats at Rajiv Gandhi Institute of Medical Sciences, Ongole u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 114. <u>Recognition/Approval of Rama Medical College, Hospital &</u> <u>Research Centre, Hapur, Ghaziabad, Uttar Pradesh for the award of</u> <u>MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Ch. Charan Singh University,</u> <u>Meerut, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/Approval of Rama Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Hapur, Ghaziabad, Uttar Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerut, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (19<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report(18<sup>th</sup> & 19<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 29.41 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Majority of Senior residents are not staying in the hostel.
- 3. Data of OPD attendance given by the institute are inflated. Hardly any patients were seen when assessors visited OPD.
- 4. Many of admitted patients had only vague complaints & did not require admission.
- 5. There was only 1 Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 6. Workload of CT Scan was NIL on day of assessment.
- 7. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP is NIL on day of assessment.
- 8. Histopathology workload on day of assessment is only 04.
- 9. Separate Septic O.T. is not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 10. Blood Bank: Only 3 units were dispensed on day of assessment.
- 11. StudentsqHostels: All rooms were locked. Keys were not available with warden or Hostel Superintendent.
- 12. InternsqHostel: A.C. study room with Computer & Internet and recreation room are not available.

- 13. RHTC: Cold chain equipment is not available. It is run in a building taken on lease from Apex Hospital & trauma Center.
- 14. UHC: it is run in a building taken on lease from Dr. Namita Agrawal.
- 15. Dean has refused to sign assessment report.
- 16. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Rama Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Hapur, Ghaziabad, Uttar Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerut, Uttar Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 150 MBBS students at Rama Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Hapur, Ghaziabad, Uttar Pradesh under Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerut, Uttar Pradesh, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 115. <u>Recognition/approval of Sapthagiri Institute of Medical Sciences &</u> <u>Research Centre, Bangalore for the award of MBBS degree(150</u> <u>seats) granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences,</u> <u>Bangalore u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Sapthagiri Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore for the award of MBBS degree(150 seats) granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (01<sup>st</sup> April, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (17<sup>h</sup>& 18<sup>th</sup> February, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of residents is 100 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. With regard to Residents, no bank account details or hostel possession letter were provided. On verification of hostel rooms, most of the Residentsqbelongings were not found in the rooms.
- 3. Bed occupancy on day of assessment is 62 % as observed on factual verification.
- 4. OPD attendance provided by institute is only computer generated data which do not match with different OPD registers. E.g. In Dentistry, 41 OPD was shown but register showed only 20. In Casualty, Central Registry showed 22 patients at 10 a.m. but on verification, it was found to be only 11.
- 5. Central Clinical laboratory: There is no central collection center and no central report distribution system.
- 6. Central Registry was unable to give Unitwise admission & discharge data.
- 7. There was NIL Normal Delivery & 1 Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 8. There were only 6 Major operations on day of assessment.
- 9. StudentsqHostels: Boysqhostel computer room is not air-conditioned.
- 10. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Sapthagiri Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 150 MBBS students at Sapthagiri Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 116. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats)</u> of SMBT Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, <u>Nandihills, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health</u> <u>Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic</u> <u>year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of SMBT Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Nandihills, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (22<sup>nd</sup> April, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (17<sup>th</sup>& 18<sup>th</sup> February, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup>Batch (150 seats) of MBBS students at SMBT Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Nandihills, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 117. <u>Recognition/Approval of Srinivas Institute of Medical Sciences &</u> <u>Research Centre, Mangalore for the award of MBBS degree (150</u> <u>seats) granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences,</u> <u>Bangalore u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/Approval of Srinivas Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Mangalore for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (20<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report(24<sup>th</sup>& 25<sup>th</sup> February, 2016) as well as the letter dated 25/04/2016 received from the college authorities and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 33.33 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 60 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Many of the Senior / Junior Residents do not know each other and they do not know their duty hours.
- 4. Discrepancy in salary --
  - (a) There is wide variation in the salaries of professors e.g. which do not commensurate with the years of experience in the same post or in the same college. These suggest some of the professors are not attending the institution on regular basis.
  - (b) There is discrepancy in the salary offered at the time of appointment and the present pay which is less. These suggest some of the professors are not attending the institution on regular basis.
  - (c) Tutors are paid Rs. 15000/- only whereas JR with same qualification are paid for Rs.40,000/-. There are many tutors who are MBBS only and above the age of 50 years. This implies that these Tutors have been kept for head count at the time of assessment.
- 5. Bed occupancy is 31.23 % at 10 a.m. on day of assessment.

- 6. Wards: Most of the Demonstration Rooms are small & cramped. Examination cum treatment room is not available in Ophthalmology and Tb & Chest wards. Tb & Chest ward has no Pantry, Store room, Duty room. Female Tb & Chest ward does not have Demonstration room. Dermatology ward does not have Pantry & Duty room. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 7. Data of Clinical material, OPD attendance, Major & Minor operations, Radiological & laboratory investigations provided by college are grossly inflated.
- 8. Majority of the patients in all the wards were not genuine, having been admitted for minor complaints like Cough, Backache, Abdominal Pain, etc. & did not merit admission.
- 9. There were only 08 major operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
- 10. Data of Histopathology workload as provided by institute are inflated and mismatched.
- 11. There was mismatch in the date of admission of patients and the entries in the ward register. In a male Medical ward, 16 patients were shown as being admitted a few days back, but actually there were no such patients in the ward at all.
- 12. In Orthopaedics ward, there were only 2 patients with POP or Back slab.
- 13. Patients admitted with insignificant complaints, 2 pairs of siblings admitted with different residential address of siblings, fake patients, etc. -
  - (a) In many wards admitted patients were having insignificant (non specific) problems that not required admission. They were not carrying any personal belongings its with them. In paediatric ward there were at leat two pair of patients were siblings of same parents were admitted with different residential address, originals case sheet submitted.
  - (b) Dean has signed the attendance sheet of the faculty members of various disciplines who had marked the attendance before 11 am and also the verification of the faculties members that was carried out. At the time of submission of report, when he found faculty deficiency was 33.33% and residents deficiency 60% he stated, that due to mahavir jayanti and vacation of children of the faculty there is less attendance. He suggested that attendance of faculty who were on leave should be considered. It may be noted that institution had not declared any holiday on 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> April, 2016 and were running all facilities on the mentioned date.
  - (c) In some ward, there were no entries in the ward register of patients shown as having been admitted 3-4 days prior suggesting patients were kept on day of assessment with intentional manipulation in the date of admission (same things happen in medical wards and other wards.)
- 14. In many wards, Nursing students were shown as Staff Nurses.
- 15. Casualty: There were 12 patients in casualty but only 2 of them were genuine.
- 16. StudentsqHostels: Ancillary facilities are inadequate as detailed in the report.
- 17. Residentsq Hostel: Most of the rooms were locked and in spite of repeated calling, nobody turned up for verification.
- 18. Separate block of Residential quarters for Non-teaching staff are not available in the campus. Only a few blocks are available on 5<sup>th</sup>& 6<sup>th</sup> floor of faculty block; there is no lift upto VI floor.
- 19. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Srinivas Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Mangalore for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute

be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 150 MBBS students at Srinivas Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Mangalore under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 118. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of</u> <u>Subbaiah Institute of Medical Sciences, Shimoga, Karnataka under</u> <u>Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of</u> <u>the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Subbaiah Institute of Medical Sciences, Shimoga, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (18<sup>th</sup>& 19<sup>th</sup> February 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (11<sup>th</sup>& 12<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup>Batch (150 seats) of MBBS students at Subbaiah Institute of Medical Sciences, Shimoga, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 119. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>Tezpur Medical College & Hospital, Tezpur, Assam under Srimanta</u> <u>Sankaradeva University of Health Sciences, Guwahati u/s 10A of</u> <u>the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (100 seats) of Tezpur Medical College & Hospital, Tezpur, Assam under Srimanta Sankaradeva University of Health Sciences, Guwahati u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (5<sup>th</sup> February 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) along with an undertaking of the Secretary, Health Department, Govt. of Assam dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup>batch (100 seats) of Tezpur Medical College & Hospital, Tezpur, Assam under Srimanta Sankaradeva University of Health Sciences, Guwahati u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 120. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>Vardhman Institute of Medical Sciences, Pawapuri, Nalanda, Bihar</u> <u>under Aryabhatta Knowledge University, Patna u/s 10A of the IMC</u> <u>Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Vardhman Institute of Medical Sciences, Pawapuri, Nalanda, Bihar under Aryabhatta Knowledge University, Patna u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (27<sup>th</sup> April, 2016), previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 31.25 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 25.42 % as detailed in the report.

- 3. Bed occupancy was only 24 % on day of assessment.
- 4. OPD: Separate Registration counters for OPD/IPD are not available. There is only 1 Examination room in each OPD against requirement of 4.
- 5. Teaching beds are deficient by 80.
- 6. There were only 07 Major operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
- 7. Radiological workload is inadequate. USG is non-functional.
- 8. Workload of Microbiology, Serology, Histopathology, Cytology is NIL on day of assessment.
- 9. MRD: it is manual. ICD X classification of diseases is not followed for indexing.
- 10. Casualty: Central O<sub>2</sub>& Central Suction are not available. Defibrillator, Ventilator are not available.
- 11. O.T.s: 4 O.T.s are available against requirement of 5. Preoperative & Postoperative beds are not available.
- 12. ICUs: ICCU, MICU, SICU are not available. PICU/NICU has only 2 beds.
- Only 1 Mobile X-ray equipment is available against requirement of 2. Only 1 Static X-ray machine is available against requirement of 3. Only 1 USG is available against requirement of 2 & that too is not functional.
- 14. Audiometry & Speech therapy are not available.
- 15. Wards: Pantry is still not available. Ancillary facilities are shared between departments.
- 16. CSSD is not available.
- 17. Only 1 unit of Blood was dispensed on day of assessment.
- 18. Intercom is not available in the hospital.
- 19. Central Library: Books available are only 2,200 against 4,000 required.
- 20. Central Research Laboratory is not available.
- 21. Nursing staff: Only 54 Nurses are available against requirement of 198.
- 22. Anatomy Department: Cold storage facility is not available.
- 23. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Councildecided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Vardhman Institute of Medical Sciences, Pawapuri, Nalanda, Bihar under Aryabhatta Knowledge University, Patna u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 121. Establishment of new medical college at Nahan, Sirmour, Himachal Pradesh by Govt. of Himachal Pradesh with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Himachal Pradesh University u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Nahan, Sirmour, Himachal Pradesh by Govt. of Himachal Pradesh with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Himachal Pradesh University u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (11<sup>th</sup> May, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (8<sup>th</sup>& 9<sup>th</sup> Jan., 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Dean is not available. Dr. K.K. Sharma, professor of Biochemistry has been given additional charge of Dean.
- 2. Deficiency of faculty is 37.93 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Shortage of residents is 20 % as detailed in the report.
- 4. Bed occupancy is 52 % on day of assessment.
- 5. OPD: teaching areas are not available.
- 6. There were NIL Major & 2 Minor operations on day of assessment.
- 7. Workload of Histopathology was NIL & of Cytopathology was only 01 on day of assessment.
- 8. Casualty: Separate Casualty for O.G. is under construction. Central O<sub>2</sub> and Central Suction are not available.

- 9. Central Clinical laboratory: it is not available.
- 10. O.T.: Only 2 Major O.T.s are functional against requirement of 4. NIL Minor O.T. is available as both are under construction.
- 11. ICUs: MICU, SICU are not available. NICU is non-functional.
- 12. Labour room: Eclampsia room & Septic labour room are not available.
- 13. CSSD: it is not available.
- 14. Nursing Staff: 149 Nurses are available against requirement of 175.
- 15. MRD: it is manual. ICD X classification of diseases is not followed for indexing.
- 16. Administrative office of the hospital is not as per norms.
- 17. Preclinical departments of Anatomy, Physiology, Biochemistry are still under construction and non-functional.
- 18. College building, Central library, Lecture theaters, are under construction.
- 19. Studentsq Hostels are not available. One hostel building outside the campus is taken on lease which is not as per Regulations.
- 20. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Nahan, Sirmour, Himachal Pradesh by Govt. of Himachal Pradesh under Himachal Pradesh University to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 122. <u>Continuance of Recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinayaka</u> <u>Mission's University, Salem in respect of students being trained at</u> <u>Aarupadai Veedu Medical College and Hospital, Puducherry.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinayaka Mission University, Salem in respect of students being trained at Aarupadai Veedu Medical College and Hospital, Puducherry.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (27<sup>th</sup>April,2016), previous compliance verification assessment report (16<sup>th</sup> February, 2016, 14<sup>th</sup> July, 2015) & previous assessment report (26<sup>th</sup>August, 2014) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 12.4 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 8.8 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy was 53.8 % as verified by assessors at 10 a.m. on day of assessment.
- 4. OPD attendance figures provided by institute appear to be inflated. In Paediatrics OPD, only 6 children immunized in 2 days.
- 5. Data of Clinical material, Radiological & Laboratory investigations provided by institute appear to be inflated.
- 6. In Histopathology no sample was received on 26<sup>th</sup>& 27<sup>th</sup> April 2016.
- 7. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision not to recommend continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinayaka Mission (s University, Salem in respect of students being trained at Aarupadai Veedu Medical College and Hospital, Puducherry and further decided that the institute be asked to submit the compliance of rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month.

The Committee further decided to continue the application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April, 2010.

#### 123. <u>Compliance Verification assessment of the physical and other</u> teaching facilities available at Late Shri Baliram Kashyap Memorial NDMC Govt. Medical College, Jagdalpur under Ayush & Health University, Raipur for 50 MBBS Seats.

Read: the matter with regard to compliance verification assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at Late Shri Baliram Kashyap Memorial NDMC Govt. Medical College, Jagdalpur under Ayush & Health University, Raipur for 50 MBBS Seats.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (11<sup>th</sup>& 12<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) along with the previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup> December, 2015 & 10<sup>th</sup> July, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 24 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 30.50 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Distance between 2 beds is < 1 m. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 4. Workload of Histopathology & Cytopathology on day of assessment was 2 each which is inadequate.
- 5. There are only 7 Major & 3 Minor operations on day of assessment.
- 6. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP is NIL on day of assessment.
- 7. Casualty: Central  $O_2$  and Central Suction are not available.
- 8. Only 2 Static & 2 Mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5 & 4 respectively.
- 9. Workload of Radiological & Laboratory investigations is inadequate.
- 10. CT Scan is not functional since September 2015. It is outsourced but details of MOU are not available.
- 11. Hospital Lecture Theater is not of Gallery type. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 12. OPD: 3 Examination rooms are available in General Medicine OPD & 2 in General Surgery OPD against requirement of 4 each.
- 13. Intercom is not available.
- 14. RHTC & UHC are still under the control of DHS & not under control of Dean.
- 15. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give an opportunity to the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

#### 124. <u>Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by NIMS</u> (Deemed Univ.) in respect of students being trained at National Instt. of Medical Sciences, Jaipur.

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by NIMS (Deemed Univ.) in respect of students being trained at National Instt. of Medical Sciences, Jaipur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (21<sup>st</sup> and 22<sup>nd</sup> April, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Lecture theaters: Hospital lecture Theater is not available.
- 2. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls could not be verified.
- 3. Hostels: Details of Studentsq Internsq Residents, NursesqHostels could not be verified till 8 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 4. Residential Quarters: Details of Residential Quarters could not be verified till 8 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 5. OPD: Registration counters are not separate for males/females. In Orthopaedics OPD, separate Plater Cutting room is not available. In

Ophthalmology OPD, Dark Room & Refraction Room are common. All Dressing Rooms are common for Males/Females. Minor O.T. is not adequate.

- 6. OPD attendance was only 253 till 1 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 7. Bed occupancy was only 45 % -i.e. 257 out of 570 beds which is grossly inadequate.
- 8. There were only 5 Major operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
- 9. There were only 2 Normal Deliveries & Nil Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 10. Audiometry & Speech therapy rooms are common. Audiometry room is not soundproof. A single person is appointed as Audiometrist& Speech therapist which is not as per norms.
- 11. Wards: Wards are not as per MSR Regulations. ENT and Skin & VD wards are within a single room and partitioned. Wards have > 30 beds. In a corner of female ENT ward, a partitioned pantry is available but non-functional. Many beds in Skin & VD ward were not covered by bed sheets. Available pantry was non-functional.
- 12. In Paediatrics ward, 2 patients of 18 years of age were admitted. NIL post-operative patients were available in Surgery wards. Many patients admitted in Orthopaedics ward were for Physiotherapy. Most of the patients were non-genuine.
- 13. Data of Radiological & Laboratory investigations could not be verified.
- 14. In Haematology section of Central clinical laboratory, at 11:45 a.m. at time of visit register showed 114 blood samples but could not produce same number of samples on demand.
- 15. No data of Histopathology & Cytopathology workload were provided by the hospital till 8 p.m.; hence it could not be verified.
- 16. Casualty: No triage facility is available. Duty roster of doctors is not available.
- 17. O.T.: Preoperative/Preanaesthetic room is not available. In Orthopaedics O.T., patient came in his own dress changed the dress just near the O.T.
- 18. AERB approval for X-ray machines was not provided till 8 p.m. on day o assessment.
- 19. PNDT approval for USG was not provided till 8 p.m. on day o assessment.
- 20. Blood Bank: Only 2 units were dispensed upto 1 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 21. CSSD: Quality evaluation system is not in place. Only 3 persons are working. Register showed 20 Autoclaved Bins are distributed to Superspecialty O.T. but not for any ward or theater.
- 22. Details of Intercom facilities are not provided.
- 23. Nursing staff: majority were male Nurses. Registration number was not worn by Nursing staff.
- 24. Anatomy department: Only 50 mounted specimens are available.
- 25. RHTC facilities could not be verified.
- 26. UHC facilities could not be verified.
- 27. The assessor could not conduct the assessment on 22.4.2016 because of some serious problems happened on 21.04.2016. The verified declaration forms except the form of Surgery are with the college authority. No annexures and SAI and B forms provided by the institution on 21.04.2016. Photographs taken by assessors own mobile as authenticity did not arrange photographer during hospital visit.
- 28. Gender Harassment Committee: Details of Gender Harassment Committee could not be verified till 8 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 29. MEU: Names of faculty affiliated to MEU were not provided till 6 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 30. CME: Details of CME programmes were not provided till 8 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 31. College Council: Minutes of College Council meetings were not provided till 8 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 32. Institute did not arrange for photographer during the visit of assessor.

33. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

The Executive Committee of the Council also perused the letter from assessors which reads as under:

".....We reached the institute on 21.04.2016 at 10.20 a.m. Principal came to the administrative block and received the appointment letter, schedule of inspection process and annexures check list at 10.40 a.m.

She took in her office at the academic building. Dr. Jayalal started to visit the Surgery & Allied wards, OTs, OBGY & LR with Medical Superintendent.

As per direction of the Principal Dr. Gupta, Prof. of Anatomy accompanied to hospital visit for Medicine & Allied wards. Dr. Mohanty was engaged to take attendance of faculties & resident doctors in college lecture theatre till 11.30 a.m.

During hospital visit Dr. Mohanty called for some problems. Immediately from Central Clinical Laboratories, I went to LT. No photographers were provided during hospital visit. So we took photographs by our own mobile camera.

In the LT management person who are also faculties of different departments were present there. They asked me about the process of inspection whether it is right or wrong. Took photograph of me in personal mobile of him and recorded. Blamed us that MCI officials screwed us and taught us before sending their institution. Conversation between me and MCI Officials recorded by them. Attendance part was going on till 12.40 p.m.

Then we visited college side also and after lunch around 3.30 pm during physical verification of faculties and resident doctors in big conference hall in administrative block, some interference of management persons continued. In every steps their hot conversation and interference disturbed us to continue the inspection process.

Few parts of college and hospital side could not verified by us for these disturbances. They called the news channel. In every steps, we were humiliated, insulted and disturbed. All verified declaration forms except few forms from surgery department was with us which we sent to Council. Rest of declaration forms are kept with the college authority.

On 21.04.2016 around 9 pm when we left the college, no annexures as per check list were submitted to us except library documents, central research lab. Document which were provided me during visit of respective area. No SA-I and B forms provided to us on 21.04.2016.

After returning to hotel at Jaipur, we decided to avoid the institute on 22.04.2016 because we did not want to face further same or more severe incidences. We all were mentally severe depressed and insulted in every step. Hence, we could not visit the college on 2<sup>nd</sup> day i.e. 22.04.2016.

During hospital visit or college visit, they did not provide any videographer. But in LT during attendance and during physical verification process the photogrtaphers/videographers taken photos of the process."

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to recommend continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by NIMS (Deemed Univ.) in respect of students being trained at National Instt. of Medical Sciences, Jaipur and further decided that the institute be asked to submit the compliance after rectification of the above deficiencies within one month and apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18.03.2016, which reads as under:-

#### 8(3)(1)õ ..

(c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission

in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to issue show cause notice to the Dean and management for non cooperation and misbehaviour with the assessors.

# 125. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Vidyagiri, Satara,</u> <u>Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences,</u> <u>Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Vidyagiri, Satara, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed as under:

The assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Institute of Sciences & Research, Vidyagiri, Satara, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 was carried out by the Council Assessors on 6<sup>th</sup>& 7<sup>th</sup> November, 2015. The assessment report 6<sup>th</sup>& 7<sup>th</sup> November, 2015 was considered by the Executive Committee of the Council at its meeting held on 27/11/2015 and it was decided as under:-

"The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) alongwith letter/representation dated 09/11/2015 of the Dean, Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Vidyagiri, Satara, Maharashtra and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 57.14 % as detailed in report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 80.59 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Form 16/TDS Certificates were not attached by any faculty.
- 4. OPD attendance is only 416 against requirement of 800.
- 5. Bed occupancy is 13.19 % on day of assessment.
- 6. Teaching beds are deficient as under:

#	Department	Beds			
		Required	Available	Deficit	
1	General Medicine	120	90	30	
2	Paediatrics	60	30	30	
3	General Surgery	120	90	30	
	TOTAL			90	

- 7. There was only 01 Minor operation on day of assessment.
- 8. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 9. Radiological & Laboratory investigation workload is inadequate.
- 10. CT Scan is not available.
- 11. Casualty: Crash Cart, Disaster Trolley, Defibrillator, Ventilator, Minor O.T. are not available.
- 12. ICUs: There was NIL patient in PICU/NICU & SICU on day of assessment.
- 13. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 2 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 4. Only 1 static X-ray machine is available against requirement of 5. CT Scan is not available.
- 14. CSSD: Receiving & Distribution points are not separate.
- 15. Central Research Laboratory is not available.
- 16. Examination Hall cum Auditorium: It is not available.
- 17. Lecture Theaters: Lecture Theater of 250 capacity is not available. Hospital Lecture Theater is not of gallery type. E class facility is not available.
- 18. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is 318 against requirement of 375. Visitors' room, A.C. study room with computer & Internet, Recreation room are not available.
- 19. Residents' Hostel: A.C. study room with computer & Internet, Recreation room are not available.
- 20. Residential Quarters: Only 12 quarters are available for faculty against requirement of 21. NIL quarters are available for non-teaching staff.
- 21. Nursing Staff: Only 185 Nurses are available against requirement of 246.
- 22. Academic activities: Integrated teaching programme is not conducted. CPC is not held.
- 23. Anatomy department: Only 32 specimens are available. NIL Disarticulated sets are available.
- 24. RHTC: It is in rented premises. Separate accommodation for Boys & Girls is not available. Cold chain equipment is not available.
- 25. UHC: It is in rented premises.
- 26. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup>batch (100 seats) of MBBS students at Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Vidyagiri, Satara, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017."

The above decision of the Executive Committee was communicated to the Central Govt. vide this office letter dated 03/12/2015 and copy to the college authorities with the request to submit the compliance report.

Since, the compliance was not received from the college authorities within the stipulated time of 01 month as granted by the Council, the Council vide its reminder dated 06/01/2016 requested the college authorities to submit the compliance within 10 days from the date of dispatch of the letter, failing which, it will be presumed that the college authorities has no further comments to offer in the matter and the MCI will recommend to the Central Govt. for disapproval of your scheme for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Committee further observed that in response to above, the Council office received a letter dated 11/01/2016 from the Authorised Signatory, Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Satara stating therein as under:-

- "1. Our College /Institution has filed Civil Suit No. 14 of 2016 in the court of Civil Judge, Junior Division Vaduj, Dist. Satara, Maharashtra State on 6<sup>th</sup> January, 2016, against Medical Council of India & Ors., interalia praying for declaration of MCI Inspection Report dated 6<sup>th</sup>& 7<sup>th</sup> November, 2015 as null and void.
- 2. The Hon'ble Court was pleased to issue notice to the defendants for filing their Written Statement returnable on 6<sup>th</sup> February 2016. A copy of the Suit and order is enclosed for your perusal.
- 3. Since the matter is sub-judice and pending before the Hon'ble Court, we request you to keep our matter pending till the final orders from the Hon'ble Court."

In this regard, the Council Office has received an email dated 28/04/2016 from the Council Advocate at Bombay stating therein that Civil Suit No.14/2016 filed by Shri Chhatrapati Shivaji Educational Society was on board before the Hondple Court of Civil Judge, Junior Division, Vaduj at Satara on 27/04/2016 for Order. The Hondple Court vide its order dated 27/04/2016 was pleased to allow the application under Order VII Rule 11 of C.P.C. preferred by the Medical Council of India and rejected the aforesaid suit.

Till date, the Council Office has not received compliance from the Dean/Principal, Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Satara as sought by the Council vide its letter dated 03/12/2015 and 06/01/2016.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate earlier decision to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of MBBS students at Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Vidyagiri, Satara, Maharashtra under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 126. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>Sardar Rajas Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Jaring,</u> <u>Kalahandi, Odisha under Sambalpur University, Sambalpur u/s 10A</u> <u>of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Sardar Rajas Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Jaring, Kalahandi, Odisha under Sambalpur University, Sambalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the opinion of Law Officer of the Council which reads as under:

"I have perused the correspondence dated 19.01.2016 received from the Principal, Sardar Rajas Medical College, Kalahandi. Pursuant to the orders dated 08.01.2016 and 12.01.2016 in SLP (C) No. 35075-35076/2015 and SLP (C) No. 35212/2015 124 students of the Sardar Rajas Medical College has been shifted to Hi-tech Medical College and Hospital, Bhubaneshwar, KIMS, Bhubaneshwar, and IMS & Sum Hospital. These orders are kept on file and a copy of the same may be sent to Monitoring Cell for their information and record.

2. Vide its order dated 12.01.2016, in the aforesaid mattes, the Hon'ble Supreme Court has inter alia directed that the "liability of Selvam Educational Trust shall be considered on next date of hearing" and the

*"culpability of the trust" shall be assessed by the Hon'ble Apex Court a later dated. The matter is to be now listed for hearing on 14.03.2016.* 

1. Thus, it is clear that the issue of culpability of the Selvam Educational Trust – the promoter of Sardar Rajas Medical College is pending before the Hon'ble Supreme Court. The issue of renewal of permission is not pending before the Hon'ble Apex Court. Therefore, in case, the College does not furnish the compliance as sought for in time vide Council letter dated 03/12/2015 and 06/01/16, it loses its claim for renewal of permission. Therefore, at this juncture, it would be appropriate to await the outcome of proceedings before the Hon'ble Supreme Court on 14.03.2016, and thereafter with the decision of the Hon'ble Supreme Court and compliance if received the matter may be placed before the Executive Committee for making recommendation to the Central Government".

The Committee further observed that till date, the Council Office has not received any compliance from the Principal, Sardar Rajas Medical College, Kalahandi, Orissa as sought by the Council vide its letters dated 03.12.2015, 06.01.2016 and 22.01.2016.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate earlier decision to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup>batch (100 seats) of MBBS students at Sardar Rajas Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Jaring, Kalahandi, Odisha under Sambalpur University, Sambalpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 127. Establishment of new medical college at Dehradun, Uttarakhand by Govt. of Uttarakhand with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Hemwati Nandan Bahuguna Medical University, Dehradun u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Dehradun, Uttarakhand by Govt. of Uttarakhand with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Hemwati Nandan Bahuguna Medical University, Dehradun u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (5<sup>th</sup> May 2016), previous assessment report (5<sup>th</sup> & 6<sup>th</sup> January, 2016) along with an undertaking of the Principal Secretary, Medical Education, Govt. of Uttrakhand dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Dehradun, Uttarakhand by Govt. of Uttarakhand with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Hemwati Nandan Bahuguna Medical University, Dehradun u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 128. <u>Recognition/approval of Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences,</u> <u>Kadapa, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats)</u> <u>granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada,</u> <u>Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report(12<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) alongwith the previous assessment reports (27<sup>th</sup> Jan., 2016, 12<sup>th</sup> September,15 06<sup>th</sup> May 2015 & 9<sup>th</sup> July, 2015 and 26<sup>th</sup>& 27<sup>th</sup> February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 8.57 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 11.47 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. OPD attendance was only 723 on day of assessment against requirement of 800.
- 4. Bed occupancy was 72.76 % on day of assessment.
- 5. There is mismatch in IPD data provided by institute (392 out of 470 beds) & observed by assessors (342 out of 470).
- 6. Casualty: patients admitted in casualty were not of serious nature. There were only 8 patients comprising of watering of eye, Nasal injury, Hypoglycaemia, Diarrhoea, Generalized weakness, Acute Pneumonia, COPD & Diabetic neuropathy.
- 7. Many patients in wards were admitted for minor complaints which would not merit admission.
- 8. ICUs: Patients admitted in ICUs did not require intensive care. In SICU, there were 2 patients of Appendicectomy, 1 of Fistulectomy, 1 of Incisional hernia Repair who did not merit admission in ICU. None of the patient in ICUs was on Ventilator.
- 9. On random checking in Paediatrics ward, some patients had minor complaints not requiring admission.
- 10. There were very few post-operative or trauma patients admitted in General Surgery / Orthopaedics ward. Majority of patients in Orthopaedics ward comprised of Osteoarthritis, Backache, Hemiplegia, Spondylitis not meriting admission. In Surgical wards, majority of patients comprised of abdominal pain, renal colic, Haemorrhoids, Gastroenteritis. Patients diagnosed as having hernia or Hydrocele did not have such condition on clinical examination. In other Surgical branches there were very few post-operative patients.
- 11. There are some fake patient records as under:
- (a) 2 patients with same name & registration numbers were found to have been admitted on different days with different diagnosis such as Renal Colic & Epigastric hernia in the same ward, with overwriting on case paper.
- (b) On random verification of O.T. records, there was record of 2 patients operated for Hysterectomy on 06/04/2016 (Shankaramani Regn # 108497 & Rihana 108514); however post-operative gross specimens were not available in the laboratory though the register showed receipt of same.
- 12. There was no record of any Gynaecological Surgery after 06/04/2016 in O.T. register.
- 13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 150 MBBS students at Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 129. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of</u> <u>A.C Subba Reddy Govt. Medical College, Nellore, Andhra Pradesh</u> <u>under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of</u> <u>the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch (150 seats) of A.C Subba Reddy Govt. Medical College, Nellore, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (2<sup>nd</sup> May 2016) along with previous assessment report (28<sup>th</sup>& 29<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 15 % as detailed in report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 38.77 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. OPD: Waiting area is not adequate.
- 4. Wards: There are no separately designated beds for Skin & VD, Psychiatry departments.
- 5. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP is NIL on day of assessment.
- 6. Histopathology facility is not available.
- 7. Workload of CT Scan is NIL on day of assessment.
- 8. Workload of Ba, IVP is NIL on day of assessment.
- 9. Workload of Histopathology on day of assessment is NIL.
- 10. Casualty: There is no Defibrillator, Ventilator, Monitors, Mobile X-ray machine.
- 11. NICU is not available. Equipment is inadequate in PICU.
- 12. Only 1 Static X-ray machine is available against requirement of 3.
- 13. There is no CSSD.
- 14. MRD: It is manual. ICD X classification of diseases is not used.
- 15. Examination Hall: There were 150 tables without any chair.
- 16. Lecture Theater: Hospital Lecture Theater is not available.
- 17. Central Library: It is not air-conditioned. Seating capacity is inadequate as detailed in the report. Only 08 chairs were available in Staff reading room which is inadequate. There is no resident reading room. Internet facility is not available. Regarding E library, there is only a room without any equipment or furniture. Available books are 3,025 against requirement of 4,000.
- 18. Central photography Section is not available.
- 19. StudentsqHostel: III & IV Floors are used as Nursing college.
- 20. Central Research Laboratory is available but not functional.
- 21. Academic Activities: Integrated teaching is not available.
- 22. Anatomy department: There are no Lockers. MRI & CT films are not available in the Museum.
- 23. Physiology department: There are no beds or seating arrangements available in Human Physiology laboratory.
- 24. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students at A.C Subba Reddy Govt. Medical College, Nellore, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 130. Establishment of new medical college at Amausi, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh by Vedic and Futuristic Edutech, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Dr. Shakuntala Misra National Rehabilitation University, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Amausi, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh by Vedic and Futuristic Edutech, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Dr. Shakuntala Misra National Rehabilitation University, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (2<sup>nd</sup> May 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (11<sup>th</sup>& 12<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) as well as a complaint dated 03/05/2016 from Dr. Mohd. Ahmad, Lucknow against the said college and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Amausi, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh by Vedic and Futuristic Edutech, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Dr. Shakuntala Misra National Rehabilitation University, Lucknow u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 131. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch (150 seats) of</u> <u>Hind Institute of Medical Sciences, Ataria, Sitapur, Uttar Pradesh</u> <u>under Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 10A of</u> <u>the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch (150 seats) of Hind Institute of Medical Sciences, Ataria, Sitapur, Uttar Pradesh under Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (4<sup>th</sup> May 2016) along with previous assessment report (16<sup>th</sup>& 17<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) as well as a letter dated 04/05/2016 from the appointed team of Council Assessor¢ and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup>batch of 150 MBBS students at Hind Institute of Medical Sciences, Ataria, Sitapur, Uttar Pradesh under Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 132. <u>Regarding shifting of 9 MBBS students of first batch (2011)</u> <u>Chintpurni Medical College, Pathankot left for shifting alongwith</u> <u>141 already shifted for the same batch.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to shifting of 9 MBBS students of first batch (2011) Chintpurni Medical College, Pathankot left for shifting alongwith 141 already shifted for the same batch.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed as under:

In pursuance of the Order dated 15/02/2016 passed by the Honople High Court of Punjab and Haryana at Chandigarh In COCP No. 173 of 2015 and Order dated 10/03/2016 passed by the Honople Supreme Court in SLP © No. 6832-6833/2016, the matter alongwith letter/proposal dated 31/08/2015 received from the Director, Directorate of Medical Education & Research, Punjab with regard to shifting of 141 MBBS first batch (2011) students from Chintpurni Medical College, Pathankot, Punjab to other Medical Colleges in Punjab was considered by the members of the Executive Committee and the decision of the members of the Executive Committee is as under:- "The members of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter/proposal dated 31/08/2015 received from the Director, Directorate of Medical Education & Research, Punjab with regard to shifting of MBBS first batch (2011) students from Chintpurni Medical College, Pathankot, Punjab to other Medical Colleges in Punjab in pursuance of the Order dated 15/02/2016 passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Punjab and Haryana at Chandigarh In COCP No. 173 of 2015 and Order dated 10/03/2016 passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court in SLP © No. 6832-6833/2016 and decided to accept the proposal of the State Govt. for shifting of MBBS first batch (2011) students from Chintpurni Medical College, Pathankot, Punjab to other Medical Colleges in Punjab."

The above decision of the members of the Executive Committee was communicated to the Central Govt. vide this office letter dated 15/03/2016 with the request to allow the State Govt. of Punjab to shift the 141 MBBS students of 2011-12 batch to other medical colleges of the State of Punjab as per letter dated 31.08.2015 of the Govt. of Punjab. The copy of the said letter was also marked to the DME of Punjab.

In view of above, as the earlier batch of 141 students was shifted pursuant to earlier decision of E.C., the Executive Committee of the Council decided to approve shifting of 09 students as proposed by DME, Punjab.

#### 133. Increase of seats in MBBS course from 100 to 150 at Lokmanya <u>Tilak Municipal Medical College and General Hospital, Mumbai u/s</u> 10 A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to increase of seats in MBBS course from 100 to 150 at Lokmanya Tilak Municipal Medical College and General Hospital, Mumbai u/s 10 A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the letters dated 06/05/2016, 08/05/2016 and 9/05/2016 received from the Dean, Lokmanya Tilak Medical College & General Hospital, Sion, Mumbai, Mr. Rahul Shewale, Member of Parliament (Lok Sabha), New Delhi and Mr. Neelam Sonker, Member of Parliament (Lok Sabha), New Delhi.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the opinion of Law officer which reads as under:

"The file of Lokmanya Tilak Medical College and General Hospital, Mumbai for increase of seats in MBBS from 100 to 150 has been referred for my opinion in context of letter dated 08.04.16 of the Central Government. Briefly stated the facts are that the applicant LNTM Medical College and Hospital had made an application to the Central Government on 11.08.15 and thereafter when the College enquired the status of the processing of its application it was found that the application was not traceable. Accordingly, the Ministry had sent on 18.02.16 the copy of the application that was returned by the Council as the application had been received after the cut-off date. In this regard the Ministry has stated in its letter that:

The Ministry is of the opinion that the application deserves consideration on merits as the records of the Ministry suggest receipt of the application/documents from the College before the closing date and the last date for making recommendation by MCI is not yet over.

I shall be grateful if you could consider the matter and make necessary recommendation to the Ministry on the scheme submitted by Lokmanya Tilak Municipal Medical College and General Hospital, Sion, Mumbai. Additional documents/details, if any, may be sought from the College. 2. It may be noted that the time-schedule for application for increase in admission capacity in MBBS is same as that laid down in the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 and as per that the last date for Council to make its recommendation to the Central Government is 15<sup>th</sup> May. In order to make its recommendations, the Council firstly scrutinizes the application; and secondly, if the application is found in order physical verification of facilities is carried out by conducting assessment; and thirdly, if required compliance verification assessment is carried out. This whole exercise commences from 1<sup>st</sup> of October onwards. Therefore, at this juncture, when the application processing schedule has reached completion processing of an application afresh, i.e., the process that ought to have started on 01.10.2015 is not advisable.

3. Furthermore, it is noted that the consent of affiliation dated 23.06.15 issued by the Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik is for the academic session 2015-16 and on this ground the Council cannot process /consider the application for the academic year 2016-17.

4. In this regard, the Hon'ble Supreme Court in its judgment dated 20.08.15 in Royal Medical Trust & Anr. vs. Union of India & Anr. reported in (2015) 10 SCC 19 has in paragraph 27 of the judgment laid down the mode and manner in which the application for establishment of new Medical College, renewal of permission of existing and increase in intake capacity has to be processed, at all stages. It reads as under:-

27. The MCI and the Central Government have been vested with monitoring powers under Section 10A and the Regulations. It is expected of these authorities to discharge their functions well within the statutory confines as well as in conformity with the Schedule to the Regulations. If there is inaction on their part or non-observance of the time Schedule, it is bound to have adverse effect on all concerned. The affidavit filed on behalf of the Union of India shows that though the number of seats had risen, obviously because of permissions granted for establishment of new colleges, because of disapproval of renewal cases the resultant effect was net loss in terms of number of seats available for the academic year. It thus not only caused loss of opportunity to the students' community but at the same time caused loss to the society in terms of less number of doctors being available. The MCI and the Central Government must therefore show due diligence right from the day when the applications are received. The Schedule giving various stages and time limits must accommodate every possible eventuality and at the same time must comply with the requirements of observance of natural justice at various levels. In our view the Schedule must ideally take care of:

(A) <u>Initial assessment</u> of the application at the first level should comprise of checking necessary requirements such as essentiality certificate, consent for affiliation and physical features like land and hospital requirement. If an applicant fails to fulfill these requirements, the application on the face of it, would be incomplete and be rejected. Those who fulfill the basic requirements would be considered at the next stage.

 Further, the Hon'ble Supreme Court in its recent judgment in the case of Medical Council of India vs. V.N. Public Health & Educational Trust & Anr. in Civil Appeal No. 3964 of 2016 (arising out of SLP (C) No. 5326 of 2016) dated 18.04.16 has held as under:

14. In this context, we may profitably refer to the decision in D.Y. Patil Medical College v. Medical Council of India & Anr 2015 (10) SCC 51 wherein the controversy had arisen due to rejection of the

application of the institution on the ground that Essentiality Certificate was not filed along with the application form. The Court dwelled upon the principles stated in

Educare Charitable Trust v. Union of India & Anr AIR 2014 SC 902: (2013) 16 SCC 474, Royal Medical Trust (supra) and various other decisions and, after analyzing the scheme of the Act, has held:-

"It is apparent from the aforesaid decision and the regulations that the application at the first instance is required to be complete and incomplete applications are liable to be rejected. Thereafter, there has to be an inspection and other stages of decision-making process."

15. The impugned order passed by the High Court is to be tested and adjudged on the anvil of the aforesaid authorities. The application for grant of approval was filed with the Essentiality Certificate which was a conditional one and, therefore, a defective one. It was not an Essentiality Certificate in law. In such a situation, the High Court could not have directed for consideration of the application for the purpose of the inspection. Such a direction, we are disposed to think, runs counter to the law laid down in Educare Charitable Trust (supra) and Royal Medical **Trust** (supra). We may further proceed to state that on the date of the application, the Essentiality Certificate was not in order. The Schedule prescribed by the MCI, which had been approved by this Court, is binding on all concerned. MCI cannot transgress it. The High Court could not have gone beyond the same and issued any direction for conducting an inspection for the academic year 2016-

17. Therefore, the directions issued by the learned single Judge and the affirmation thereof by the Division Bench are wholly unsustainable.

16. Consequently, the appeal is allowed and the judgments and orders passed by the High Court are set aside. It will be open to the Trust to submit a fresh application for the next academic year in consonance with the provisions of the Regulations of the MCI and as per the time Schedule; and in that event, it will be considered appropriately. In the facts and circumstances of the case, there shall be no order as to costs.

6. It is to be noted that the consent of affiliation submitted by the applicant is for the academic **year 2015-16 and not for the academic year 2016-17** for which applications are being processed. Consequently, the application is without a valid consent of affiliation that makes the application incomplete. The law laid down by the Hon'ble Supreme Court as referred above is loud and clear to the effect that incomplete applications are liable to be rejected. Therefore, it would be appropriate to recommend to the Central Government to disapprove the application of Lokmanya Tilak Medical College, Mumbai for increase of seats from 100 to 150 MBBS Admissions annually as the consent of affiliation issued by the MUHS is not valid for academic year 2016-17."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to approve the opinion of Law Officer and decided to return the application to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of scheme for increase of seats from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 at Lokmanya Tilak Medical College & General Hospital, Sion, Mumbai under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences for academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 134. <u>Recognition/approval of Era's Medical College & Hospital, Lucknow</u> for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. R.M.L. Avath University, Faizabad against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Erac Medical College & Hospital, Lucknow for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. R.M.L. Avath University, Faizabad against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment reports (03.03.2016) and (29.04.2016 & 30.04.2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 7.05 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 20.68 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Wards: Psychiatry ward does not have Demonstration room or Pantry. Skin & VD ward does not have pantry.
- 4. Labour Room: There was no woman in labour room at 12 noon at time of visit.
- 5. O.T.: Facilities are in inadequate in Septic, Emergency & Ophthalmic O.T. as detailed in the report.
- 6. ICUs: There are no separate beds for SICU.
- 7. MEU: No programme was conducted last year in the institute on MET.
- 8. Common Room for Girls does not have attached toilet.
- 9. Nursing Hostel: There is no hostel as such. In 2<sup>nd</sup>, 3<sup>rd</sup>& 4<sup>th</sup> floor, there are 2 big halls on each floor; each such hall is divided into 8 cubicles with cloth curtain & in each such cubicle 4 Nursing students are staying which is not permissible.
- 10. RHTC: Vaccines are not available.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognize/approve Erac Medical College & Hospital, Lucknow for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. R.M.L. Avath University, Faizabad against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 100 to 150 MBBS students at Erac Medical College & Hospital, Lucknow, under Dr. R.M.L. Avath University, Faizabad, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

#### 8(3)(1)õ ..

#### (c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that

institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

#### 135. <u>Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhubaneswar – Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session</u> <u>2016-17, in pursuance of the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated</u> <u>16.12.2015 passed in SLP © No. 34856/2015 –MCI Vs. Kalinga</u> <u>Institute of Medical Sciences & Ors.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhubaneswar . Renewal of Permission for admission of  $3^{rd}$  Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17, in pursuance of the Hondple Supreme Court order dated 16.12.2015 passed in SLP © No. 34856/2015 . MCI Vs. Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences & Ors.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (02.05.2016) along with assessment report (7<sup>th</sup>& 8<sup>th</sup> January, 2016) as well as copy of the Judgement dated 06.05.2016 passed by the Honople Supreme Court of India in Civil Appeal No.4914 /2016 (arising out of S.L.P. (C) No. 9997 of 2016 filled by Medical Council of India vs. Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences (KIMS) & Ors.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the Judgement dated 06.05.2016 passed by the Hondple Supreme Court of India in Civil Appeal No.4914 /2016 (arising out of S.L.P. (C) No. 9997 of 2016 filled by Medical Council of India vs. Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences (KIMS) & Ors. In the operative part of the order, the Hondple Supreme Court of India has passed the following order:-

"

33. However, for the fault of KIMS, the students should not suffer nor should KIMS get away scot free. KIMS must pay for its inability to introspect and venture into adventurist litigation. Accordingly, we direct as follows:

1. The admission granted to the 50 students pursuant to the order of the High Court dated 25<sup>th</sup> September, 2015 and the provisional permission granted by the Central Government only on 28<sup>th</sup> September, 2015 shall not be disturbed. How the students will complete their course of studies without putting undue pressure on them is entirely for the MCI and KIMS and other concerned authorities to decide.

2. Costs of Rs. 5 crores are imposed on KIMS for playing with the future of its students and the mess that it has created for them. The amount will be deposited by KIMS in the Registry of this Court within

six weeks from today. The amount of 5 crores so deposited towards costs shall not be recovered in any manner from any student or adjusted against the fees or provision of facilities for students of any present or subsequent batches.

3. KIMS is restrained from increasing the intake of students from 100 students to 150 students for the MBBS course for the academic year 2016-17 and 2017-18. The MCI and the Central Government shall enforce strict compliance of this direction.

4. The MCI or the Central Government will proceed to take action against KIMS (if agreed advisable) under Clause 8(3) of the Medical Council of India Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 (as amended) as mentioned in the communication of 15<sup>th</sup> June, 2015 of the Central Government.

5. During the hearing of the appeal, we were informed that there is no fixed, set or laid down procedure prepared by the MCI for conducting an inspection or assessment as postulated by the Medical College Regulations, 1999. Rather than every Inspection Team following its own procedure for conducting an assessment, the MCI should in consultation with the Central Government prepare a Standard Operating Procedure for conducting an inspection as required by the Medical Council of India Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999. The Standard Operating Procedure should be finalized within a period of six weeks from today and should be accessible on the website of the MCI.

6. To introduce transparency and accountability in the medical colleges, the report or assessment of the Inspection Team should be put up on the website of the concerned medical college as also on the website of the MCI so that potential students are aware of what is likely to be in store for them. Similarly, the decision of the Central Government on the report should be put up on the website of the concerned medical college as also on the website of the MCI.

34. To ensure compliance of Directions 2 and 5 and for an update on Directions 4 and 6 list the appeal in the first week of July, 2016.

35. The appeal is disposed of on the above terms.

The Executive Committee of the Council further noted the legal opinion provided by the Law Officer of the Council which reads as under:-

%ãõ..

- 2. In terms of the above directions, the Honople Supreme Court has:
  - (i) By direction 1, permitted the 50 students admitted pursuant to the order dated 25.09.2015 for academic year 2015-16 to complete their course of studies. MCI and KIMS have been directed to ensure that such studies are completed without putting undue pressure on him.
  - (ii) By direction 2, cost of Rs. 5 crores have been imposed upon KIMS.
  - (iii) By direction 3, KIMS has been restrained from admitting students against the increased intake from 100 students to 150 students for the academic year 2016-17 and 2017-18. MCI and Central Govt. have been directed to ensure strict compliance.
  - (iv) By direction 4, the MCI and Central Government have been permitted to proceed against KIMS (if deemed advisable) under clause 8(3) of the MCI Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulation, 1999 (as amended) as mentioned in the communication of 15<sup>th</sup> June 2015.
  - (v) By direction 5, the Council in consultation with the Central Government has been directed to prepare a Standard Operating Procedure for conducting assessment within a period of 6 weeks from the date of pronouncement of order i.e. 06.05.2016.

- (vi) By direction 6, the Supreme Court has directed that the assessment report along with the decision of the Central Govt. is required to be placed on the website of the MCI as well as on the website of the concerned college so as to ensure that the potential students are aware of what is likely to be in store for them.
- 3. Therefore, the college is debarred from admitting students for two academic years against the increased intake from 100 to 150. Hence, in my considered opinion, it is not open for the Executive Committee to consider the Compliance Verification assessment report dated 02.05.2016 for the purpose of making recommendation to the Central Government for renewal of permission of Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences, as the College stands debarred by the Honople Supreme Court from admitting students for two academic years i.e. 2016-17 and 2017-18.
- 4. The Compliance Verification Report in my opinion is required to be considered by the Executive Committee:
  - Firstly, for the limited extent of decision making in terms of direction (1) as regards the issue of **%** ndue pressure+on students; and
  - Secondly, further course of action in terms of direction (4) as contemplated under Regulation 8(3) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 as mentioned in communication dated 15 June 2015 of the Central Government.
- 5. Furthermore, in terms of directions (5), the Executive Committee may initiate measures as deemed appropriate to prepare the Standard Operating Procedure for all assessments (both UG & PG) that are conducted IMC Act, 1956 and forms the basis for making recommendation by the Executive Committee or Postgraduate Committee of the Council.
- 6. The case is listed for ensuring compliance of direction 2 & 5 and for an update on direction 4 & 6 in the first week of July 2016. Direction 4, 5 & 6 are for Council, therefore, necessary action as directed by the Honople Supreme Court is required to be ensured on the above counts.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council accepted the legal opinion and decided that no recommendations for renewal of permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17 at Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhubaneswar be made.

#### 136. <u>Al-Ameen Medical College & Hospital, Bijapur– Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session</u> <u>2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Al-Ameen Medical College & Hospital, Bijapur. Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (28.04.2016) along with previous assessment report (4<sup>th</sup>& 5<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 18.93 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 17.14 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Many Residents are still not staying in the campus. Many rooms are occupied by II year students.
- 4. Many Senior/Junior residents still do not know each other. Deficiency of not knowing duty hours continues.
- 5. Bed occupancy is 37.64 % (i.e. 256 out of 680 beds) on day of assessment. There was NIL patient in Ophthalmology & very few in Paediatrics.
- 6. OPD: Waiting area is inadequate. Examination rooms are very small cubicles.

- 7. Patients having minor complaints like Bodyache, Joint pain, Backache were admitted in General Medicine, Paediatrics, Orthopaedics wards who did not merit admission.
- 8. Wards: Demonstration rooms are very small in most of the wards with maximum capacity of 10 students. Wards are not as per MSR Requirements. Most of the old wards are divided into cubicles of not more than 6 patients. Nursing staff does not have a view of all the patients in many wards. New wards did not have electric supply. There were no fans.
- 9. There was NIL Ophthalmology & NIL ENT operations at time of visit.
- 10. Histopathology & Cytopathology workload was NIL on day of assessment at 1 p.m.
- 11. ICUs: There was no patient on ventilator support.
- 12. Central research Laboratory facilities are inadequate.
- 13. Audiometry room is small & not properly insulated.
- 14. Lecture Theater: Capacity of Hospital Lecture Theater is only 144 which is inadequate. E class facility &Audiovisual aids are not available in 2 out of 4 Lecture Theaters in the college & also Hospital Lecture Theater.
- 15. Central Library: Air-conditioning is inadequate for space.
- 16. StudentsqHostels: Ancillary facilities are inadequate as detailed in the report.
- 17. Microbiology department: Only 4 Service laboratories are available against requirement of 7.
- 18. Deficiency of inadequate Demonstration rooms remains as such as detailed in the report.
- 19. Deficiency of RHTC belonging to Govt. of Karnataka remains as such. MOU gives dean only supervisory powers but no disciplinary control.
- 20. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to reiterate its earlier decision not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 in respect of Al-Ameen Medical College & Hospital, Bijapur under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Committee further decided to continue the application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18<sup>th</sup> March, 2016.

#### 137. <u>Motilal Nehru Medical College, Allahabad – Renewal of Permission</u> for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Motilal Nehru Medical College, Allahabad . Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (04.05.2016), previous assessment report (28<sup>th</sup>& 29<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) along with an undertaking of the Principal Secretary, Medical Education, Govt. of Uttar Pradesh dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup>batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Motilal Nehru Medical College, Allahabad under King George**c** Medical University, Lucknowfor the academic session 2016-17.

#### 138. <u>Consideration of Compliance Verification Assessment with regard</u> to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv <u>Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of</u> <u>students being trained at Basaveshwara Medical College,</u> <u>Chitradurga.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to consideration of compliance verification Assessment with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at Basaveshwara Medical College, Chitradurga.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (18<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) along with previous assessment reports (10<sup>th</sup> September, 2014) and (2<sup>nd</sup> December, 2015) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at Basaveshwara Medical College, Chitradurga and decided to revoke the clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

The Executive Committee further decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at Basaveshwara Medical College, Chitradurga be continued restricting the number of admission to 100 (One Hundred) students.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

#### 8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for Renewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.+

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

#### 139. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (50 seats) of</u> <u>North Delhi Municipal Corporation Medical College, Delhi under</u> <u>Guru Gobind Singh Indraprastha University, New Delhi u/s 10A of</u> the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (50 seats) of North Delhi Municipal Corporation Medical College, Delhi under Guru Gobind Singh Indraprastha University, New Delhi u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (10<sup>th</sup> February 2016), previous assessment report (7<sup>th</sup>& 8<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) as well as a letters dated 01/02/2016 & 16.03.2016 from the Dean, North DMC Medical College & Hindu Rao Hospital, Delhi alongwith an undertaking of Additional Commissioner, North Delhi Municipal Corporation, Delhi dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to

the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of4<sup>th</sup> batch (50 seats) of North Delhi Municipal Corporation Medical College, Delhi under Guru Gobind Singh Indraprastha University, New Delhi u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

### 140. <u>Recognition/Approval of Malda Medical College & Hospital, Malda</u> for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata, West Bengal u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/Approval of Malda Medical College & Hospital, Malda for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata, West Bengal u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (4<sup>th</sup> May, 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (14<sup>th</sup>& 15<sup>th</sup> March, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Central O<sub>2</sub> and Central Suction are not available.
- 2. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 4 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5.
- 3. Paramedical & Non-teaching staff: Only 100 Paramedical & Non-teaching staff are available against requirement of 179.
- 4. Central Library: It is partially air-conditioned. Available books are 5,200 against 7,000 required. Only 25 Journals are available against requirement of 100.
- 5. Residential Quarters: Only 24 quarters are available in the campus for Non-teaching staff against requirement of 36.
- 6. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Malda Medical College & Hospital, Malda for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata, West Bengal u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Committee considering the undertaking of Principal Secretary, Health & F.W. Deptt., Govt. of West Bengal, dated 13.05.2016 decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 100 MBBS seats at Malda Medical College & Hospital, Malda for the academic year 2016-2017.

## 141. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>Govt. Medical College, Bettiah, West Champaran, Bihar under</u> <u>Aryabhatt Knowledge University, Patna u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956</u> <u>for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Govt. Medical College, Bettiah, West Champaran, Bihar under Aryabhatt Knowledge University, Patna u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (6<sup>th</sup> May 2016) previous assessment report (15<sup>th</sup>& 16<sup>th</sup> October 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 38.54 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 10.17 % as detailed in the report.

- 3. Dr. A.K. Singh, shown as Medical Superintendent does not possess requisite qualification for the post; hence not eligible to hold the post; resultantly deficiency of not having Medical Superintendent remains as it is.
- 4. OPD: Only 1 Examination room is allotted to each department against 4 required for Major departments. There is no Demonstration Room, Plaster room, Dressing room, Injection room.
- 5. Bed occupancy is 63.15 % on day of assessment.
- 6. Histopathology workload is only 03 on day of assessment.
- 7. Wards: There is no Tb & Chest, ENT, Ophthalmology departments in the institute. In 1 Surgery & Psychiatry wards there is no Nursing Station. Ancillary facilities are not available. In some wards, distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. required as per Regulations.</p>
- 8. Teaching beds are inadequate as under:

#	Department	Beds		
		Required	Available	Deficit
1	General Medicine	100	53	47
2	Paediatrics	40	16	24
3	Tb & Chest	10	NIL	10
4	Skin & VD	10	08	02
5	General Surgery	100	87	13
6	Orthopaedics	40	15	25
7	0.G.	50	45	05
8	Ophthalmology	10	04	06
9	ENT	10	02	08
	TOTAL			140

There were only 2 Major operations posted as observed during assessment.

- 10. There was NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 11. MRD: It is manual. ICD X classification of diseases is not followed.
- 12. Casualty: Only 05 beds are available against requirement of 15.
- 13. O.T.: Only 3 Major O.T.s are available against requirement of 5. None of the O.T.s is as per norms. One O.T. has 2 tables without functional lights. In the 2<sup>nd</sup> O.T., there are 4 tables without O.T. lights, air conditioner, suction machine. 3<sup>rd</sup> O.T. has 3 tables without O.T. lights, air conditioner, suction machine.
- 14. ICUs: ICCU is not available. NICU/PICU are available but non-functional as there are no equipment, beds.
- Only 2 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 3. Only 1 mobile X-ray machine is available against requirement of 2.
- 16. CT Scan is not available.
- 17. CSSD is available but not as per norms.
- 18. Central Research Laboratory: It is not available.
- 19. Sound proof & Air-conditioned Audiometry room & Speech Therapy are not available.
- 20. Nursing staff: Only 144 Nurses are available against requirement of 198.
- 21. Paramedical & Non-teaching staff: 140 Paramedical & Non-teaching staff are available against requirement of 160.
- 22. Examination Hall: It is not available.
- 23. Lecture Theaters: 3 Lecture Theaters are available against requirement of 4, out of which capacity of 1 is only 60 against requirement of 120. E class is not available.
- 24. Central Library: Available area is 111 sq.m. against requirement of 1,600 sq.m. Capacity of StudentsqReading room is 75 against requirement of 200. Available books are 1,276 against requirement of 4,000. There are NIL journals of the current or previous year. There is no register for books. There is no Internet facility.
- 25. Studentsq Hostels: They are located outside the campus, except for 1 Girlsqhostel with accommodation for 32. Deficiency remains as it is.

9.

- 26. Residentsq Hostel: Available accommodation is only 10 against requirement of 59. No Resident was found staying there.
- 27. Nursesq Hostel: Accommodation is available for 10 Nurses against requirement of 42.
- 28. Residential Quarters: NIL quarters are available in the campus for Nonteaching staff.
- 29. Academic activities: Integrated teaching programme is not available.
- 30. Deficiencies of Anatomy department remain as they are as detailed in the report.
- 31. Microbiology department: Museum is not available. Media preparation room is not available. None of the laboratories is furnished.
- 32. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Councildecided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Govt. Medical College, Bettiah, West Champaran, Bihar under Aryabhatt Knowledge University, Patna u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 142. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Malla Reddy Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Malla Reddy Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> May, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of Malla Reddy Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 143. Increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at KMCT Medical College, Kozhikode for the academic session 2016-17 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to Increase of seats in MBBS course from 100-150 at KMCT Medical College, Kozhikode for the academic session 2016-17 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The members of the Executive Committee observed that the Principal, KMCT Medical College, Kozhikode had once again submitted the third compliance which was verified by the Council assessors by way of compliance verification assessment on 16.12.2015. The third compliance Verification Assessment report (16.12.2015) alongwith previous assessment report (01.07.2015, 18<sup>th</sup> April, 2015 and 12<sup>th</sup>& 13<sup>th</sup> January, 2015) was considered by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 28.12.2015 and it was decided as under:-

"The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (16.12.2015) along with previous assessment reports (01.07.2015, 18<sup>th</sup> April, 2015 and 12<sup>th</sup>& 13<sup>th</sup> January, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 11.6 % as detailed in report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 29.4 % as detailed in report.
- 3. Bed occupancy is 59.5 % on day of assessment.

- 4. There were only 4 Minor operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
- 5. Institute is maintaining double registers. Register in General Medicine OPD did not match with one of registers having inflated data.
- 6. OPD attendance was only 413 on day of assessment against 800 required.
- 7. Radiological investigation workload is inadequate.
- 8. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and to return the postgraduate applications of KMCT Medical College, Kozhikode, Kerala recommending disapproval of the scheme.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided that since the gross deficiencies of teaching faculty, residents, & infrastructure are still persisting in spite of repeated opportunities being given to the institute to rectify the same over a period of time, why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree granted by Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur in respect of students being trained at KMCT Medical College, Kozhikode, Kerala be not withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956. It was further decided that the institute be directed not to make further admissions from the academic year 2016-17 onwards.

The Committee further decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council."

The Council also noted that in spite of repeated opportunities being given to KMCT Medical College, Kozhikode, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur, it has not rectified the gross deficiencies of teaching faculty, residents, & infrastructure facilities for removal of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), dated 16.04.2010. The Council further noted that in the latest compliance verification assessment report (16.12.2015), the deficiencies are still persisting.

In view of above, the General Body of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. for withdrawal of recognition for the award of MBBS degree granted by Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur in respect of students being trained at KMCT Medical College, Kozhikode, Kerala u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further to request the Central Govt. to ask the institution to stop admissions with immediate effect for the academic year 2016-17."

The above decision of the General Body has been communicated to the Central Government and copy to other concerned authorities on 06.05.2016.

In view of above, as the decision of the General Body shown above has already been communicated to the Central Government, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of scheme for increase of seats from 100 to 150 u/s 10(A) of the IMC Act, 1956 at *KMCT Medical College, Kozhikode, Kerala* under *Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur* for Academic Year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10(A) of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 144. <u>Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Talegaon,</u> <u>Pune – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS</u> <u>students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the</u> <u>academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Talegaon, Pune . Renewal of Permission for admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The members of the Executive Committee observed that the Compliance Verification Assessment was carried out by the Council Assessors on 11.03.2016 for 100 seats.The compliance Verification Assessment report (11.03.2016) alongwith previous assessment report (22<sup>nd</sup> January, 2016, 20.08.2015 & 15<sup>th</sup> April, 2015 & 6<sup>th</sup> & 7<sup>th</sup> January, 2015) was considered by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 22.03.2016 and it was decided as under:-

"The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (11.03.2016) along with assessment report (20.08.2015 & 15<sup>th</sup> April, 2015 & 6<sup>th</sup> & 7<sup>th</sup> January, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 6.68 % as detailed in the report.
- Bed occupancy is 68.30 % on day of assessment.
- 3. In Orthopaedics ward, many patients were admitted who did not merit admission.
- 4. ICUs: In ICCU there was only 1 patient on day of assessment. Not all patients in MICU & MICU needed intensive care.
- 5. OPD: At 09: 30 a.m., very few patients were found at the registration counters. During round of OPDs between 10 & 11 a.m., not many patients were found in various OPDs.
- 6. In O.G. OPD, no separate Cancer Detection clinic & Family Planning clinic was available. In Paediatrics OPD, Dietician's room is used as Child Rehabilitation clinic.
- 7. In Endoscopy room of ENT OPD, Inj. Lignocaine with expiry date of <u>December 2012</u> was kept. Audiometry room is not soundproof. No Speech therapy room, machines, staff are available.
- 8. Out of 6 Major operations mentioned in Orthopaedics OT register in last 3 days, only 1 was present in the ward. Others could not be traced.
- 9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and to return the postgraduate applications of Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Talegaon, Punerecommending disapproval of the scheme.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided that since the gross deficiencies of teaching faculty, residents, & infrastructure are still persisting in spite of repeated opportunities being given to the institute to rectify the same over a period of time, why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree granted by Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik in respect of students being trained at Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Talegaon, Punebe not withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956. It was further decided that the institute be directed not to make further admissions from the academic year 2016-17 onwards.

The Committee further decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council."

The Council also noted that in spite of repeated opportunities being given to Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Talegaon, Pune, it has not rectified the gross deficiencies of teaching faculty, residents, & infrastructure facilities for removal of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), dated 16.04.2010. The Council further noted that in the latest compliance verification assessment report (11.03.2016), the deficiencies are still persisting.

In view of above, the General Body of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. for withdrawal of recognition for the award of MBBS degree granted by Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik in respect of students being trained at Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Talegaon, Puneu/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further to request the Central Govt. to ask the institution to stop admissions with immediate effect for the academic year 2016-17."

The above decision has been communicated to the Central Govt. vide Council letter dated 06.05.2016 with copy to concerned authorities.

In view of above, as the decision of the General Body shown above has already been communicated to the Central Government, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for fresh batch against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 for the Academic Year 2016-2017.

#### 145. <u>Maharajah's Institute of Medical Sciences, Nellimarla – Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session</u> <u>2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Maharajahos Institute of Medical Sciences, Nellimarla . Renewal of Permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the third detailed compliance which was verified by the Council assessors by way of compliance verification assessment on 20.01.2016 for 100 seats. The third compliance verification assessment report (20.01.2016) along with previous assessment report (20.08.2015, 20<sup>th</sup> May, 2015 & 5<sup>th</sup>& 6<sup>th</sup> December, 2014) was considered by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 30.01.2016 and it was decided as under:-

"The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (20.01.2016) along with assessment report (20.08.2015, 20<sup>th</sup> May, 2015 & 5<sup>th</sup>& 6<sup>th</sup> December, 2014) conducted for verification of available facilities of faculty, Residents, infrastructure and other requirements for recognized intake of 100 students and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 16.03 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 13.43 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy is 33 % on day of assessment.
- 4. There were NIL patient in SICU & only 2 patients in ICCU on day of assessment.
- 5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided that since the gross deficiencies of teaching faculty, residents, & infrastructure are still persisting in spite of repeated opportunities being given to the institute to rectify the same over a period of time, why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree granted by under NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada in respect of students being trained at Maharajah's Institute of Medical Sciences, Vizianagaram be not withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956. It was further decided that the institute be directed not to make further admissions from the academic year 2016-17 onwards.

The Committee further decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council."

The Council also noted that in spite of repeated opportunities being given to Maharajah's Institute of Medical Sciences, Vizianagaram under NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, it has not rectified the gross deficiencies of teaching faculty, residents, & infrastructure facilities for removal of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II), dated 16.04.2010. The Council further noted that in the latest compliance verification assessment report (20.01.2016), the deficiencies are still persisting.

In view of above, the General Body of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. for withdrawal of recognition for the award of MBBS degree granted by NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada in respect of students being trained at Maharajah's Institute of Medical Sciences, Vizianagaram u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further to request the Central Govt. to ask the institution to stop admissions with immediate effect for the academic year 2016-17."

The above decision has been communicated to the Central Govt. vide Council letter dated 06.05.2016 with copy to concerned authorities.

In view of above, as the decision of the General Body shown above has already been communicated to the Central Government, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for fresh batch against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 for the Academic Year 2016-2017.

#### 146. <u>Shri Krishna Medical College, Muzaffarpur – Renewal of Permission</u> for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Shri Krishna Medical College, Muzaffarpur . Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (04.05.2016), previous assessment report (23<sup>rd</sup>& 24<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) alongwith an undertaking of the Principal Secretary, Health, Patna, Bihar dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 in respect of Shri Krishna Medical College, Muzaffarpur under Aryabhatt Knowledge University, Patnau/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 147. <u>Darbhanga Medical College, Dharbhanga – Renewal of Permission</u> for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 90-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Darbhanga Medical College, Dharbhanga . Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 90-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (06.05.2016) along with previous assessment report (23<sup>rd</sup>& 24<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) alongwith an undertaking of the Principal Secretary, Health, Patna, Bihar dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 90-100 in respect of Dharbhanga Medical College, Dharbhanga under Aryabhatt Knowledge University, Patna u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council however, noted that in General Surgery department there is no Professor & only 3 Asso. Prof.; however they are admitting 16 PG students in a year; resultantly Student: Teacher Ratio is not maintained and this be informed to the Postgraduate Committee for necessary action at their end.

## 148. <u>Lala Lajpat Rai Memorial Medical College, Meerut – Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session</u> <u>2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Lala Lajpat Rai Memorial Medical College, Meerut . Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (06.05.2016) along with previous assessment report (17.03.2016 and 21<sup>st</sup> & 22<sup>nd</sup> September, 2015) along with an undertaking of the Principal Secretary, Medical Education, Govt. of Uttar Pradesh dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Lala Lajpat Rai Memorial Medical College, Meerut under Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerutfor the academic year 2016-17.

### 149. <u>M.G.M. Medical College, Jamshedpur – Renewal of Permission for</u> admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to M.G.M. Medical College, Jamshedpur . Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (06.05.2016), previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) along with an undertaking of the Principal Secretary, Health & F.W. and Medical Education Govt. of Jharkhand dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50 to 100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of M.G.M. Medical College, Jamshedpur under Kolhan University, Jharkhand for the academic year 2016-17.

#### 150. <u>Patliputra Medical College, Dhanbad – Renewal of Permission for</u> admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Patliputra Medical College, Dhanbad . Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (06.05.2016), previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) along with an undertaking of the Principal Secretary, Health & F.W. and Medical Education Govt. of Jharkhand dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup>Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 in respect of Patliputra Medical College, Dhanbad under Vinoba Bhave University, Jharkhandu/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 151. <u>Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Bhagalpur – Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Bhagalpur . Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (06.05.2016) along with previous assessment report (23<sup>rd</sup>& 24<sup>th</sup> November, 2015)alongwith an undertaking of the Principal Secretary, Health, Patna, Bihar dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 in respect of Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Bhagalpur under Aryabhatt Knowledge University, Patnau/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 152. <u>Recognition/approval of Govt. Medical College Kolkata for the</u> <u>award of MBBS degree granted by The West Bengal University of</u> <u>Health Sciences, Kolkata against the increased intake i.e. from 155</u> to 250 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Govt. Medical College Kolkata for the award of MBBS degree granted by The West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata against the increased intake i.e. from 155 to 250 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (06.05.2016) along with previous assessment report (11.03.2016 & 12.03.2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 12.87 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. OPD: Teaching areas are inadequate except in General Medicine, Psychiatry & Pulmonary Medicine departments.
- Wards: Demonstration rooms are not available except in Paediatrics wards. Distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. Pantry is not available in all the wards.
- 4. ETO Sterilizer is not available.

- 5. StudentsqHostels: Except for 25 rooms in Girlsqhostel, all other rooms are 4 seater or more which is not permissible; resultantly, the accommodation is inadequate.
- 6. ResidentsqHostel: Deficiency of inadequate accommodation remains as it is.
- 7. Residential Quarters: Deficiency of NIL quarters for the faculty in the campus remains as it is as the building is still under construction.
- 8. Demonstration Rooms in Forensic Medicine, Physiology, Biochemistry, Microbiology, Pharmacology departments are inadequate as detailed in the report. There is NIL Demonstration room in Pathology.
- 9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Govt. Medical College Kolkata for the award of MBBS degree granted by The West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata against the increased intake i.e. from 155 to 250 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Committee considering the undertaking of Principal Secretary, Health & F.W. Deptt., Govt. of West Bengal, dated 13.05.2016 decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of increase of seats from 155 to 250 at Govt. Medical College Kolkata for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 153. <u>Sri Bhausaheb Hire Govt. Medical College, Dhule – Renewal of</u> <u>Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against</u> <u>the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-</u><u>17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Sri Bhausaheb Hire Govt. Medical College, Dhule . Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (06.05.2016), previous assessment report (05.04.2016 and 12<sup>th</sup>& 13<sup>th</sup> October, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 19.04 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 46.2 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. CT Scan is of 6 slice against 16 slice required.
- 4. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
- 5. Deficiency of inadequacy of Examination Hall remains as it is.
- 6. Deficiency of inadequacy of Lecture Theaters remains as it is.
- 7. Deficiency of inadequacy of Common Rooms for Boys & Girls remains as it is.
- 8. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP is NIL on day of assessment.
- 9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 50-100 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Sri Bhausaheb Hire Govt. Medical College, Dhule under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashikfor the academic year 2016-17.

#### 154. <u>MGM Medical College, Indore – Renewal of Permission for</u> admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to MGM Medical College, Indore . Renewal of Permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (06.05.2016), previous assessment report (18<sup>th</sup>& 19<sup>th</sup> September, 2015) along with an undertaking of the Commissioner, Medical Education, Govt. of Madhya Pradesh dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 140-150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of MGM Medical College, Indore Devi Ahilya Bai Vishwa Vidyalaya, Indore under for the academic year 2016-17.

#### 155. <u>Increase of seats in MBBS course from 150-250 at M.K.C.G. Medical</u> <u>College, Brahmapur for the academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to increase of seats in MBBS course from 150-250 at M.K.C.G. Medical College, Brahmapur for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (03.05.2016), previous assessment report (17<sup>th</sup>& 18<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) as well as a representation dated 05/05/2016 from the Dean/Principal of the college along with an undertaking of the Principal Secretary, Health & F.W. Govt. of Odisha, dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for increase of seats in MBBS course from 150 to 250 u/s 10A of the IMC Act 1956 in respect of M.K.C.G. Medical College, Brahmapur under Berhampur Universityfor the academic year 2016-17.

#### 156. <u>Recognition/Approval of Gold Field Institute of Medical Sciences &</u> <u>Research, Faridabad, Haryana for the award of MBBS degree (100</u> <u>seats) granted by Pt. B.D. Sharma University of Health Sciences,</u> <u>Rohtak, Haryana u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/Approval of Gold Field Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Faridabad, Haryana for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Pt. B.D. Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak, Haryana u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that till date, the Council Office has not received any compliance from the Secretary, Gold Field Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Faridabad, Haryana as sought by the Council vide letters dated 01.03.2016 and 11.04.2016.

However, the Council office has received a letter/proposal dated 29/04/2016 from the Additional Chief Secretary to Government of Haryana, Medical Education & Research Department, Chandigarh with regard to Shifting/Adjustment of 400 MBBS students including the interns from Gold Field Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Village Chhainsa Ballabhagarh, Faridabad, Haryana to other recognized Medical Colleges of Haryana State alongwith the Order dated 29/04/2016 issued by the State Government of Haryana which reads as under:-

"The Essentiality Certificate/NOC issued to Gold Field Shiksha Sansthan, Sector -21-A Faridabad vide Govt. memo No.21/15/09-2HB-IV, dated 30.04.2010 for establishment of New Medical College is hereby withdrawn/cancelled with immediate effect." In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate earlier decision of not recommending recognition/approval of Gold Field Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Faridabad, Haryana for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Pt. B.D. Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak, Haryana u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 100 MBBS students at Gold Field Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Faridabad, Haryana under Pt. B.D. Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak, Haryana,10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Further the Committee also decided to request the State Govt. to invoke the Bank Guarantee by making appropriate application to the Council.

#### 157. <u>Recognition/approval of Malabar Medical College & Research</u> <u>Centre, Calicut, Kerala for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats)</u> <u>granted by the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s</u> <u>11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Malabar Medical College & Research Centre, Calicut, Kerala for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (6<sup>th</sup> May, 2016) alongwith previous assessment reports(4<sup>th</sup> November 2015, 28<sup>th</sup> Aug., 2015, 1<sup>st</sup> June, 2015 and 28<sup>th</sup>& 29<sup>th</sup> April, 15) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 26.36 % as detailed in the report.

- 2. Shortage of Residents is 77.4 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy was 36.15 % on the basis of required beds on day of assessment.
  - There was NIL Normal delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
  - Teaching beds are inadequate as under:

5.

#	Department	Beds		
		Required	Available	Deficit
1	General Medicine	150	145	5
2	Psychiatry	15	05	10
3	General Surgery	150	90	60
4	Orthopaedics	90	58	32
5	0.G.	90	60	30
	TOTAL			137

- 6. O.T.: There are only 7 Major O.T.s available against requirement of 11. O.T. lists are not signed by HOD as well as Anaesthetists.
- 7. Casualty: 21 beds are available against requirement of 25.
- 8. ICUs: There was NIL patient in NICU/PICU. There were only 2 patients in ICCU.
- 9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Malabar Medical College & Research Centre, Kerala for the award of MBBS degree granted by Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 150 MBBS students at Malabar Medical College & Research Centre, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur,10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 158. <u>Recognition/approval of Sri Muthukumaran Medical College,</u> <u>Hospital & Research Institute, Chennai for the award of MBBS</u> <u>degree (150 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical</u> <u>University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Sri Muthukumaran Medical College, Hospital & Research Institute, Chennai for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report(4<sup>th</sup> May, 2016) along with the previous assessment reports(6<sup>th</sup> Jan., 2016, 11<sup>th</sup> Sept., 15, 28<sup>th</sup> April 15, 17<sup>th</sup> April, 2015 and 18<sup>th</sup> & 19<sup>th</sup> Feb., 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. OPD attendance on day of assessment is 735 against 1,200 required.
- 2. Bed occupancy was 37 % on day of assessment.
- 3. Though many beds were occupied, they were of routine ailments which can be treated on OPD basis not requiring admission. Majority of them were admitted only on day of assessment.
- 4. There was NIL Normal Delivery on day of assessment. On 02/05/2016 also there was NIL delivery; there was only 1 LSCS on 01/05/2016. Obstetric workload is inadequate.
- 5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that the Law Officer in his opinion dated 27.04.2016 had stated that ".....In view of the fact that there has been serious allegation leveled in the CBI Enquiry Report the prudent course of action would be to obtain confirmation from the Chennai Metropolitan Development Authority (CMDA). They may also be requested to inform as to whether as on date the Sri Muthukumuran Medical College meets the applicable norms of CMDA regarding building." However, no such approval had been received in the Council till date.

The assessors have however mentioned in the report that *%inal approval* plan by Chennai Metropolitan Development Authority (CMDA) has been received on 12.04.2016 (File No. C 3(S) 14866/2016. Original documents have been shown. Permission has been granted to the building construction according to the notarized authorized plans. Blocks no.9,10,11 & 12 are exclusively for medical college and hospital. These areas have been visited by the assessors."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided that as per opinion of the Law Officer, the documents of building plan approval be verified from Chennai Metropolitan Development Authority (CMDA) and the reply be placed before the Executive Committee at its next meeting.

Further, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Sri Muthukumaran Medical College, Hospital & Research Institute, Chennai for the award of MBBS degree granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter. Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of 100 MBBS students at Sri Muthukumaran Medical College, Hospital & Research Institute, Chennai under The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chenna,10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 159. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of 50 MBBS</u> <u>students at Govt. Medical College, Painav Idukki, Kerala under</u> <u>Kerala University of Health Sciences & Allied Sciences, Thrissur u/s</u> <u>10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of 50 MBBS students at Govt. Medical College, Painav Idukki, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences & Allied Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (2<sup>nd</sup> May 2016), previous assessment report (5<sup>th</sup>& 6<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 59.74 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 78.85 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy is 30 % of required beds on day of assessment.
- 4. OPD: Teaching areas are not available. Dressing rooms for males/females are not available. Plaster room & Plaster cutting room are not available. In Ophthalmology OPD, Dark room & Minor procedure room are not available. Specialty clinics are not available in Paediatrics & O.G. OPD.

#	Department	Beds		
		Required	Available	Deficit
1	General Medicine	72	42	30
2	Paediatrics	24	0	24
3	Psychiatry	8	0	8
4	Tb & Chest	8	2 0	8
5	Skin & VD	8	0	8
6	General Surgery	90	35	55
7	Ophthalmology	10	0	10
8	ENT	10	0	10
9	Orthopaedics	30	0	30
10	0.G.	40	20	20
	TOTAL			203

5. Teaching beds are inadequate as under:

- Wards: Distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. New wards are as yet nonfunctional.
- 7. Radiological & Laboratory investigation workload is inadequate.
- 8. Histopathology & Cytopathology are not done in the institute.
- Casualty: Only 5 beds are available against 10 required. Separate Casualty for O.G. is not available. Central O<sub>2</sub> and Central Suction, Disaster trolley, Crash Cart, Ventilator, Defibrillator are not available.
- 10. Central Clinical laboratory: Separate sections for pathology, Microbiology, Biochemistry are not available.
- 11. O.T.s: Only 3 Major O.T.s are available against 4 required.
- 12. ICUs: ICCU, SICU, PICU/NICU are not available. Only 4 beds are available in MICU. Air-conditioning is not working. ABG Analyzer is not available.
- 13. Labour Room: Eclampsia room is not available.
- 14. Radiodiagnosis department: NIL Mobile X-ray machine is available are available. Only 1 static X-ray machine is available against requirement of

2. CT Scan is not available. Only 1 USG is available against 2 required. (P. 10)

- 15. CSSD: ETO Sterilizer is not available. Receiving & Distribution points are not separate.
- 16. Central Research Laboratory is not available.
- 17. Nursing staff: Only 49 Nurses are available against 175 required.
- 18. Paramedical & Nonteaching staff: Only 25 Paramedical & Nonteaching staff are available against 99 required.
- 19. Examination hall: Capacity is 100 against 250 required.
- 20. Lecture theaters: Hospital Lecture theater is not available. E class facility is not available.
- 21. CME: NIL CME programme is conducted as yet.
- 22. Central library: It is not air-conditioned. Available area is 150 sq.m. against requirement of 750 sq.m. Studentsqreading room (Outside) is not available. Staff reading room is not available. NIL journals are available. Only 1,543 books are available against 2,500 required. Available Internet Nodes are only 9.
- 23. Central Photography Section is not available.
- 24. Residentsq Hostel: Available accommodation is only 12 against 35 required.
- 25. NursesqHostel: It is of Dormitory type which is not permissible.
- 26. Residential Quarters for faculty & Non-teaching staff are not available.
- 27. Pathology, Microbiology & Forensic Medicine departments are under construction & not functional.
- 28. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of admission of 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of 50 MBBS students at Govt. Medical College, Painav Idukki, Kerala under Kerala University of Health Sciences & Allied Sciences, Thrissur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 160. Establishment of new medical college at Dist. Sangli, Maharashtara by Prakash Shikshan Mandal, Urun-Islamapur, Maharashtra with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Maharashtra University of Health Scienecs, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Dist. Sangli, Maharashtara by Prakash Shikshan Mandal, Urun-Islamapur, Maharashtra with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Maharashtra University of Health Scienecs, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (5<sup>th</sup> May 2016) alongwith previous assessment report (15<sup>th</sup>& 16<sup>th</sup> January, 2016) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Dist. Sangli, Maharashtara by Prakash Shikshan Mandal, Urun-Islamapur, Maharashtra with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Maharashtra University of Health Scienecs, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 161. Establishment of new medical college at Ambikapur, Chhattisgarh by Govt. of Chhattisgarh with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Chhattisgarh Ayush and Health Sciences University, Raipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Ambikapur, Chhattisgarh by Govt. of Chhattisgarh with an annual intake of 100

MBBS students under Chhattisgarh Ayush and Health Sciences University, Raipur u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (4<sup>th</sup> May 2016), previous assessment report (9<sup>th</sup>& 10<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) and noted the following: -

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 61.01 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of residents is 48.88 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Adequate space is not provided for Deance office & administrative office. Medical superintendentce office is smaller than required.
- 4. Microbiology, Histopathology, Cytopathology investigations are not yet available.
- 5. ICUs: ICCU has 4 beds against 5 required. SICU is not available.
- 6. AERB approval is not yet available.
- 7. Nursing staff: Only 54 Nurses are available against 175 required.
- 8. College Council is not constituted.
- 9. Pharmaco vigilance Committee is not constituted.
- 10. Lecture Theaters: They are not available.
- 11. Central Library: It is not available.
- 12. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls are not available.
- 13. Central Photography section is not available.
- 14. Studentsq& residentsqHostels are not available.
- 15. Residential Quarters are not available.
- 16. Preclinical departments of Anatomy, Physiology & Biochemistry are nonexistent.
- 17. College building is not existing.
- 18. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Ambikapur, Chhattisgarh by Govt. of Chhattisgarh under Chhattisgarh Ayush and Health Sciences University, Raipur to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

# 162. <u>Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of</u> <u>Employees State Insurance Corporation Medical College, Gulbarga,</u> <u>Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences,</u> <u>Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Employees State Insurance Corporation Medical College, Gulbarga, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (4<sup>th</sup> May 2016) along with previous assessment report (3<sup>rd</sup> & 4<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 15.25 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. OPD attendance is only 345 against 700 required.
- 3. Bed occupancy, as verified by assessors was 26 % (i.e. 99 out of 380 beds) on day of assessment.
- 4. The hospital has started but facilities are totally inadequate.
- 5. OPD: It does not have a properly functioning OPD for all departments. On ground floor, OPDs are functioning from cramped quarters having only 1 or 2 Examination rooms. There are no proper teaching areas.

General surgery & allied branches are functioning form a single large area with 9 rooms designated for different specialties. Dressing room is not available. Injection room is common for male/female. Plaster room & Plaster cutting room were shown in an office with table & chairs. Dentistry OPD does not have Dental chair. Ophthalmology OPD does not have proper dark room or procedure room.

- 6. Radiodiagnosis department: There is only 1 portable X-ray machine available. No other equipment is available. AERB approval is not available.
- 7. O.T.s: There are no functional O.T.s in the hospital.
- 8. Labour Room: There is no functional labour room in the hospital.
- 9. ICUs: ICCU, MICU, SICU, PICU/NICU are not available.
- 10. Wards: They do not have proper facilities. Some wards do not have proper Nursing station. There was no differentiation into male/female in General surgery wards. 6 beds of ENT are with General Surgery department.
- 11. CSSD: It is not functional.
- 12. Blood Bank: It is not functional.
- 13. Casualty: it is not functional.
- 14. Equipment in service laboratories are grossly inadequate.
- 15. There is no functioning generator in the hospital.
- 16. Intercom is not available.
- 17. Histopathology facility is not available.
- 18. MRD: It is not computerized. ICD X classification of diseases is not followed.
- 19. Kitchen, laundry are not available.
- 20. Central Library: Air-conditioning is not functional.
- 21. There were NIL Major & Minot operations on day of assessment.
- 22. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean section on day of assessment.
- 23. Radiological & Laboratory investigation workload is inadequate.
- 24. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch (100 seats) of Employees State Insurance Corporation Medical College, Gulbarga, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

#### 163. <u>Consideration of Compliance Verification Assessment with regard</u> to Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada in respect of students being trained at Konaseema Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Foundation, Amalapuram.

Read: the matter with regard to consideration of Compliance Verification Assessment with regard to Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada in respect of students being trained at Konaseema Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Foundation, Amalapuram.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (3.5.2016) along with the previous assessment reports (2.2.2016 & 10<sup>th</sup>& 11<sup>th</sup> July, 2015) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada in respect of students being trained at Konaseema Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Foundation, Amalapuram be continued restricting the number of admission to 150 (One Hundred fifty) students.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

#### 8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for  $\pm$ Renewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.+

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

## 164. <u>Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by The</u> <u>Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of</u> <u>students being trained at KanyaKumari Government Medical</u> <u>College, Asaripallam.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at KanyaKumari Government Medical College, Asaripallam.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (30.4.2016) along with the previous assessment reports (3<sup>rd</sup> March, 2016, 10<sup>th</sup>& 11<sup>th</sup> June,2015 &5<sup>th</sup> November, 2015) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University,Chennai in respect of students being trained at KanyaKumari Government Medical College, Asaripallam be continued restricting the number of admission to 100 (One Hundred) students.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

#### 8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for  $\pounds$  enewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.+

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

#### 165. <u>Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by</u> <u>Pondicherry University, Pondicherry in respect of students being</u> <u>trained at Sri Manakula Vinayagar Medical College & Hospital,</u> <u>Pondicherry.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Pondicherry University, Pondicherry in respect of students being trained at Sri Manakula Vinayagar Medical College & Hospital, Pondicherry.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> May, 2016) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Pondicherry University, Pondicherry in respect of students being trained at Sri Manakula Vinayagar Medical College & Hospital, Pondicherry be continued restricting the number of admission to 150 (One Hundred fifty) students.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for  $\pm$ Renewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.+

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

#### 166. <u>Compliance verification assessment – assessment of the physical</u> and other teaching facilities available at School of Medical Sciences, Greater Noida under Sharda University.

Read: the matter with regard to compliance verification assessment . assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available at School of Medical Sciences, Greater Noida under Sharda University.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report ( $11^{th}$  March, 2016) & along with previous assessment report ( $13^{th}$  October, 2015 &  $15^{th}$  &  $16^{th}$  July, 2015) and decided to revoke the clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

### 167. <u>Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by the</u> <u>Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of</u> <u>students being trained at Sree Mookambika Instt. of Medical</u> <u>Sciences, Kanyakumari, Tamil Nadu.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sree Mookambika Instt. of Medical Sciences, Kanyakumari, Tamil Nadu.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> May, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 8.6 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 8.6 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Salary to Junior residents is claimed to have been paid in cash; hence no verification can be made.
- 4. Bed occupancy was 69.05 % at 10 a.m. as observed by assessors.
- 5. In Paediatrics wards, a large number of patients were admitted on day of assessment who did not merit admission. In General Surgery wards, on case sheets of many patients, diagnosis was written which did not match their history. Many patients were shown operated but there was no scar of Surgery at all. In Orthopaedics, a lot of patients with complain of Backache & Osteoarthritis were admitted who did not merit admission. A major chunk of patients did not have a single X-ray in spite of being admitted for several days.
- 6. Data of Clinical material, laboratory investigations provided by institute appear to be inflated.
- 7. A large number of patients in various wards did not have any investigations (Incl. Histopathology) attached to their case sheets. This raises grave doubts about integrity of the data of Laboratory investigations provided by the institute.
- 8. Out of 5 Static X-rays available, 1 was non-functional on day of assessment.
- 9. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls: Facilities are inadequate.
- 10. Studentsq Hostel: Visitorsq room, A.C. Study room with Computer & internet, Recreation room are not available in Boysqhostel.
- 11. Internsq Hostel: Visitorsq room, A.C. Study room with Computer & internet, Recreation room are not available.
- 12. Physiology department: Audiovisual aids are not available in the Demonstration room.
- 13. RHTC: Cold chin equipment is not available. Survey/MCH/FP/Immunization registers are not maintained properly.
- 14. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to recommend continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sree Mookambika Instt. of Medical Sciences, Kanyakumari, Tamil Nadu and further decided that the institute be asked to submit the compliance after rectification of the above deficiencies within one month.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

8(3)(1)õ ..

#### (c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate

courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

#### 168. <u>Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Bharat</u> <u>University Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sri</u> <u>Lakshmi Narayana Institute of Medical Sciences, Puducherry –</u> <u>regarding.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Bharat University Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sri Lakshmi Narayana Institute of Medical Sciences, Puducherry.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> May, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 9.79 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. OPD: IN OPDs of General Medicine & General Surgery, there are only 2 Examination rooms which are divided into 2 cubicles each by partition.
- 3. There were no serious patients in wards of General Medicine. None of the admitted patients had any clinical sign justifying their hospitalization. In Paediatrics ward, all admitted patients had minor complaints like URI, worm infestation which did not need admission. In Tb & Chest, there was no abnormal finding in any patient; there was no X-ray available. In Skin & VD ward, there was no patient of significant skin illness justifying admission.
  - ICUs: ABG Analyzer is not available in any ICU. There was NIL patient of Acute Myocardial Infarction in ICCU. There was no serious/critical patient in MICU. There was no patient on ventilator. There was NIL patient in PICU/NICU.
- 5. Lecture Theater: Capacity of 1 Lecture Theater is 168 against requirement of 200.
- 6. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to recommend continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Bharat University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at Sri Lakshmi Narayana Institute of Medical Sciences, Puducherry and further decided that the institute be asked to submit the compliance after rectification of the above deficiencies within one month.

#### 169. <u>Shifting/Adjustment of 400 MBBS students including the interns</u> from Gold Field Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Village Chhainsa Ballabhagarh, Faridabad, Haryana to other recognized Medical Colleges of Haryana State.

Read: the matter with regard to shifting/adjustment of 400 MBBS students including the interns from Gold Field Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Village Chhainsa Ballabhagarh, Faridabad, Haryana to other recognized Medical Colleges of Haryana State.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the matter with regard to shifting/adjustment of 400 MBBS students including the interns from Gold Field Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Village Chhainsa

Ballabhagarh, Faridabad, Haryana to other recognized Medical Colleges of Haryana State.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the letter dated 29.04.2016 of the Additional Chief Secretary to Govt. of Haryana, Medical mEducation & Research Deptt., Chandigarh stating that the college has closed down and undertaking has been submitted by the State Government dated 29.04.2016 stating that Essentialty Certificate has been withdrawan/cancelled vide Haryana Govt. Memo No. 21/15/09-2HB-IV, dated 30.04.2010.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to inform the State Government of Haryana that:-

- a) Students admitted under Government quota should be transferred to Government Colleges of the State only.
- b) Students admitted under management quota should be transferred to private colleges of the State.+

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided that the bank guarantee be encashed and the amount handed over to the State Government for utilization for adjustment of the students of the academic year 2011-2012, 2012-2013, 2013-2014 and 2014-15.

## 170. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Avadh University, Faizabad in respect of students being trained at Era's Lucknow Medical College, Lucknow.

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Avadh University, Faizabad in respect of students being trained at Eracs Lucknow Medical College, Lucknow.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (29.04.2016 & 30.04.2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 7.05 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 20.68 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Wards: Psychiatry ward does not have Demonstration room or Pantry. Skin & VD ward does not have pantry.
- 4. Labour Room: There was no woman in labour room at 12 noon at time of visit.
- 5. O.T.: Facilities are in inadequate in Septic, Emergency & Ophthalmic O.T. as detailed in the report.
- 6. ICUs: There are no separate beds for SICU.
- 7. MEU: No programme was conducted last year in the institute on MET.
- 8. Common Room for Girls does not have attached toilet.
- Nursing Hostel: There is no hostel as such. In 2<sup>nd</sup>, 3<sup>rd</sup>& 4<sup>th</sup> floor, there are 2 big halls on each floor; each such hall is divided into 8 cubicles with cloth curtain & in each such cubicle 4 Nursing students are staying which is not permissible.
- 10. RHTC: Vaccines are not available.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to recommend continuance of recognitionof MBBS degree granted by Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Avadh University, Faizabad in respect of students being trained at Erac Lucknow Medical College, Lucknow and further decided that the institute be asked to submit the compliance after rectification of the above deficiencies within one month. The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

8(3)(1)õ ..

(c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

#### 171. <u>Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by BLDEA</u> <u>University (Prev. affiliated to Rajiv Gandhi University of Health</u> <u>Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at Shri</u> <u>B.M. Patil Medical College, Bijapur.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by BLDEA University (Prev. affiliated to Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at Shri B.M. Patil Medical College, Bijapur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (28<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) along with previous assessment report (16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> Feb.,2016) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by BLDEA University (Prev. affiliated to Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at Shri B.M. Patil Medical College, Bijapur be continued restricting the number of admission to 150 (One Hundred fifty) students.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

#### 8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for  $\pounds$  enewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.+

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

#### 172. <u>Consideration of Compliance Verification Assessment with regard</u> to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at M.S. Ramaiah Medical College, Bangalore.

Read: the matter with regard to consideration of Compliance Verification Assessment with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at M.S. Ramaiah Medical College, Bangalore.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (29<sup>th</sup> April,2016) along with the previous assessment reports (3.2.2016 & 26<sup>th</sup> Aug,2014) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at M.S. Ramaiah Medical College, Bangalore be continued restricting the number of admission to 150 (One Hundred fifty) students.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for  $\pounds$  Renewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.+

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

#### 173. <u>Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by SRM</u> <u>University, Kancheepuram in respect of students being trained at</u> <u>SRM Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Kancheepuram.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by SRM University, Kancheepuram in respect of students being trained at SRM Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Kancheepuram.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment (27<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) report along with previous assessment report (29<sup>th</sup> Dec., 2015 & 2<sup>nd</sup>& 3<sup>rd</sup> July, 2015) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by SRM University, Kancheepuram in respect of students being trained at SRM Medical College,

Hospital & Research Centre, Kancheepuram and decided to revoke the clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

The Executive Committee further decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by SRM University, Kancheepuram in respect of students being trained at SRM Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Kancheepuram be continued restricting the number of admission to 150 (One Hundred and Fifty) students.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

#### 8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for  $\pm$ Renewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.+

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

#### 174. <u>Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv</u> <u>Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of</u> <u>students being trained at J.J.M. Medical College, Davangere.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at J.J.M. Medical College, Davangere.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment (29<sup>th</sup> April, 2016) report along with previous assessment report (8<sup>th</sup> February, 2016) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at J.J.M. Medical College, Davangere be continued restricting the number of admission to 245 (Two Hundred fortyfive) students.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

#### 8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for  $\pounds$  enewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.+ The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

### 175. <u>Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv</u> <u>Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of</u> <u>students being trained at S S Institute of Medical Sciences &</u> <u>Research Centre, Davangere.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at S S Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Davangere.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (10<sup>th</sup>& 11<sup>th</sup> May,2016) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at S.S. Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Davangerebe continued restricting the number of admission to 150 (One Hundred fifty) students.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated  $16^{th}$  April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) õ

(2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.

(3) The procedure for  $\pm$ Renewalq of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.

(4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in subclause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute.+

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

# 176. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Peoples University, Bhanpur, Bhopal in respect of students being trained at Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur.

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Peoples University, Bhanpur, Bhopal in respect of students being trained at Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (10<sup>th</sup>& 11<sup>th</sup> May,2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of residents is 22.09 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Bed occupancy is 30.90 % (i.e. 238 out of 770 beds) on day of assessment.
- 3. Data of Clinical Material, OPD attendance, Major & Minor operations, Radiological & Laboratory investigations provided by institute are inflated.
- 4. Only 4 Static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6. 600 mA X-ray machines are not available against 2 required. Only 4 Mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6.
- 5. Anatomy department: Available specimens are only 90.

- 6. OPD: Demonstration rooms are small & congested. Instruments were not put to use in Ophthalmology. Specialty clinics registers were not available in Paediatrics. No samples were sent to laboratories from O.G. Specialty clinics.
- 7. Wards: Demonstration rooms/Pantry are not available in many wards. USG machine in O.G. ward was non-functional.
- 8. O.T. lists were not available at time of assessment.
- 9. There were lesser number of patients at OPD counters.
- 10. Records of Kitchen, Laundry, Pharmacy suggest lesser clinical material available.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to recommend continuance of recognition MBBS degree granted by Peoples University, Bhanpur, Bhopal in respect of students being trained at Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur and further decided that the institute be asked to submit the compliance after rectification of the above deficiencies within one month.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

#### 8(3)(1)õ ..

#### (c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by the institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

### 177. <u>Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Ch. Charan</u> <u>Singh University, Meerut in respect of students being trained</u> <u>Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerut in respect of students being trained Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment report (10<sup>th</sup>& 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 14.92 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. There were only 8 major operations for the whole hospital on day of assessment which is inadequate.
- 3. There was only 1 Normal Delivery & 1 Caesarean Section on day of assessment which is inadequate.
- 4. CT Scan was not functional on day of assessment.
- 5. Details of patients admitted in ICCU & ICUs are not provided.
- 6. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
- 7. MRD: It is party manual & partly computerized.
- 8. Forensic Medicine Department: In the museum, prototype firearms are not available.
- 9. RHTC Philkuwa is not attached to the college.
- 10. Website: Information provided is sketchy as detailed in the report. Toll free number to report ragging is not shown.
- 11. Citizensqcharter is not available.
- 12. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to recommend continuance of recognitionof MBBS degree granted by Ch. Charan Singh University, Meerut in respect of students being trained Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad and further decided that the institute be asked to submit the compliance after rectification of the above deficiencies within one month.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 and amended on 18th March, 2016, which reads as under:-

8(3)(1)õ ..

(c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of MBBS degree</u> and/or running postgraduate courses

If it is observed during any inspection/assessment of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, compliance of rectification of deficiency from such an institute will not be considered for issue of renewal of permission in that Academic year and further such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in that Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 along with direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the Institute for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the current Academic year (2017-18) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by the institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to intimate the Postgraduate Section of application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) for this Institute for information and further necessary action.

### 178. <u>Recommendation of MCI in respect of NRI Institute of Medical</u> <u>Science, Visakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh for application of Clause</u> <u>8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recommendation of MCI in respect of NRI Institute of Medical Science, Visakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh for application of Clause 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the letter dated 29.03.2016 whereby the Ministry while accepting the recommendation of the Hearing Committee has referred the case of NRI Institute of Medical Sciences, Vishakhapatnam to the Council for review on imposition of penalty as provided under Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

The Executive Committee noted that the letter dated 29.03.2016 clearly reveals that the Hearing Committee has not considered the matter in accordance with the clear mandate of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 as well as the recommendations of the Council alongwith the inspection reports. It is stated that the Hearing Committee, has ignored that the medical college tried to play fraud with the MCI as well as the Central Govt. by providing fake residence proof of the faculty members (fake telephone bills) during the inspection carried out on 16/17.12.2015. The Hearing Committee has also ignored that even after giving numerous opportunities to the medical college to produce clarification from BSNL in respect of the fake telephone bills, the medical college has failed to furnish the same. The documents now furnished by the medical college before the Hearing Committee on 17.03.2016(wrongly mentioned as 17.03.2015) cannot help the case of the medical college since it has already been established that the medical college during the MCI assessment had presented teaching faulty on the basis of fake / forged residence proofs.

In order to consider the matter the Executive Committee deemed it appropriate to set out the following facts pertaining to the medical college:-

An assessment for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of NRI Institute of Medical Sciences, Vishakhapatnam u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016 was carried out by the Council Assessors on 16<sup>th</sup>& 17<sup>th</sup> December, 2014.The assessment report (16<sup>th</sup>& 17<sup>th</sup> December, 2014) was considered by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 13/01/2015 and it was decided as under:-

*"The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (16<sup>th</sup> & 17<sup>th</sup> December, 2014) and noted the following:-*

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 57 % as detailed in report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 99 % as detailed in report.
- 3. OPD attendance was only 210 on day of assessment.
- 4. Bed occupancy was 10.36 % on day of assessment.
- 5. There was NIL major operation and only 1 minor operation on day of assessment.
- 6. ICUs: There was no patient in SICU & NICU/PICU and only 1 patient in ICCU on day of assessment.
- 7. The following faculty have submitted fake telephone bills as proof of residence. After dialing the number mentioned in the bill, recorded message was heard saying "This is Anil Neelakonda Medical College. Please press the extension number."

#	Name	Designation	Department
1	Dr. Gudurusree Latha	Asso. Prof.	Pathology
2	Dr. C. Madhav Rao	Professor & HOD	Forensic Medicine
3	Dr. Pradeep Vundavalli	Asst. Prof.	ENT
4	Dr. Pandula Revathi	Asst. Prof.	0.G.
5	Dr. Y. Nagatalupula Rao	Asst. Prof.	0.G.
6	Dr. D.K. Chedrolu	Senior Resident	Ophthalmology

- 8. No workshop on Medical Education Technology has been conducted by MEU during the year.
- 9. Pharmaco Vigilance Committee: No meetings have taken place during the year.
- 10. Lecture Theaters: Hospital lecture hall is not of gallery type.
- 11. Students' Hostels: There is no AC, Computer & Internet in the study room.
- 12. Residents' Hostels: Accommodation is available for 120 against requirement of 138. There is no AC, Computer & Internet in the study room.
- 13. Office of Dean and Medical Superintendent in the hospital are smaller in size than required as per Regulations.
- 14. Wards: Wards of Tb & Chest, Skin & VD and Psychiatry departments do not have Nursing station, Examination/Treatment room, Pantry, Duty room, Demonstration room. In other departments, demonstration room is common for 2 wards.
- 15. There was no Caesarean section on day of assessment.
- 16. Radiological and Laboratory investigation workload was grossly on day of assessment.
- 17. Histopathology & Cytopathology workload was NIL on day of assessment.
- 18. Separate casualty for Obstetrics is not available.
- 19. O.T.: Facilities in ENT O.T. are inadequate.
- 20. Anatomy department: Number of specimens are only 70.
- 21. RHTC: Cold chain equipment is not available.
- 22. UHC: Cold chain equipment is not available.
- 23. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4<sup>th</sup> batch (150 seats) of NRI Institute of Medical Sciences, Vishakhapatnam, Andhra Pradesh under Dr. N.T.R. University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

It was further decided to apply clause 8(3)(1)(b) & clause 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 which read as under:-

%Ba(3)(1).....

(b) <u>Colleges in the stage upto III renewal (i.e. Admission of fourth batch)</u> <u>till recognition of the institute for award of MBBS degree</u>.

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 20% and/or bed occupancy is <70%, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission in that Academic Year."

(d) <u>Colleges which are found to have employed teachers with faked/forged</u> <u>documents</u>:

If it is observed during any institute is found to have employed a teacher with faked/forged documents and have submitted the declaration form of such a teacher, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission/recognition for award of MBBS degree/processing the applications

for postgraduate courses for two academic years i.e. that academic year and the next academic year also.

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the institute for renewal of permission/recognition for award of MBBS degree/processing the applications for postgraduate courses for two academic years i.e. that academic year (i.e. 2015-16)and the next academic year (i.e. 2016-2017) also to refer the matter to the Ethics Committee of the Council."

The above decision of the Council alongwith the inspection report was communicated to the Central Government vide MCI letter dated 21.01.2015. In view of above decision of the Executive Committee regarding fake faculty, the matter was referred to the Ethics Committee of the Council for further necessary action against the erring doctors and the medical college.

The Central Govt. had constituted a Committee for granting hearing under Section 10A(4) to the medical colleges who were not recommended by the MCI for grant of renewal of permission on the grounds of persisting deficiencies. Accordingly the hearing was granted to the medical college whereafter the Central Govt. vide its letter dated 20.02.2015 forwarded the compliance dated 09.02.2015 submitted by the Dean, NRI Institute of Medical Sciences, Vishakhapatnam alongwith the recommendations of the Committee constituted by the Ministry of Health, and Family Welfare, New Delhi for review by the MCI.

During that time, the Council had come across a number of medical colleges which were at the various stages of renewal of permissions and were found grossly deficient in providing minimum infrastructure, teaching faculty, clinical material and other physical facilities in their medical colleges thus the Council had to invoke Regulation 8(3)(1)(a), 8(3)(1)(b), 8(3)(1)(c) and also 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999. Accordingly, it was decided by the Council to seek a Legal Opinion from the Ld. Additional Solicitor General regarding whether the applications of such medical colleges could be processed any further in view of the invocation of Regulation 8(3)(1)(a), 8(3)(1)(b), 8(3)(1)(c) and also 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999.

The Ld. Additional Solicitor General vide his Legal Opinion dated 14.03.2015 in respect of the applicability of Regulation 8(3)(1)(a), 8(3)(1)(b), 8(3)(1)(c) had opined that wherein the Council has invoked Regulation 8(3)(1)(a), 8(3)(1)(b) and 8(3)(1)(c) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999, after an inspection by the MCI assessors, there was no Statutory provision either under the Act or under the Regulations authorizing the MCI to process further the applications of such medical colleges. As the said Regulation clearly barred the consideration of any compliance from such medical colleges.

Similarly in respect of the applicability of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d), the Ld. Additional Solicitor General vide his Legal Opinion dated 27.03.2015 had opined that the MCI wasnot obliged to process the application of a medical college for renewal of permission which has been debarred from making admission for two academic years in conformity with Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of aforesaid Regulation.

The case of the medical college was re-considered by the Executive Committee of the MCI in its meeting held on 27.03.2015 along with the Central Govt. letter dated 20.02.2015 and the Legal Opinions dated 14.03.2015 & 27.03.2015 rendered by the Ld. Additional Solicitor General. The Executive Committee of the MCI, in view of the fact that it had after considering the assessment report dated 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> December 2014 in its meeting held on 13.01.2015, had, invoked Regulation 8(3)(1)(b) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999, it was decided by the Council to reiterate its earlier decision to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission to the medical college for admitting 4<sup>th</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students for the academic year 2015-16. So far as the issue with regard to the invocation of Regulation

8(3)(1)(d) on the compliance submitted by the medical college, it was decided that the medical college be asked to submit certain clarifications from the BSNL as well as the Dean of the Medical College to provide an affidavit in respect of certain clarifications as sought for by the Council.

The Council had directed the Dean of the Medical College to provide an affidavit in respect of the following clarifications:-

When did the problem in respect of the telephone connections issued in respect of the following doctors begin ?

Name	Designation	Department
Dr. Gudurusree Latha	Asso. Prof.	Pathology
Dr. C. Madhav Rao	Professor & HOD	Forensic Medicine
Dr. Pradeep	Asst. Prof.	ENT
Vundavalli		
Dr. Pandula Revathi	Asst. Prof.	0.G.
Dr. Y. Nagatalupula	Asst. Prof.	0.G.
Rao		
Dr. D.K. Chedrolu	Senior Resident	Ophthalmology
Rao		

When the complaint was filed by these Doctors to BSNL?

Was the problem limited only to the abovementioned doctors or did it occur with other numbers as well ? If it occurred in other numbers also, a list of those numbers along with names of persons to whom these numbers are allocated may also be furnished.

What was the precise nature of the problem ?

How was the problem resolved ?

When was the problem resolved ?

Was the problem resolved only for these numbers or also for those mentioned in (3) above ?

What is the present status of these connections ?

Where was the precise location of these telephones on day of assessment – i.e.  $16^{th}$  &  $17^{th}$  December 2014 ?

Photocopies of bills of November 2014, December 2014 & January 2015 in respect of these connections may also be provided.

Accordingly, the abovementioned recommendation of the Council was communicated to the Central Govt. vide MCI letter dated 01.04.2015. A copy of the said communication dated 01.04.2015 was also forwarded to the medical college for submitting its clarification in this regard.

The Council had also sent reminder dated 07.05.2015, to the medical college for the submission of the requisite information and clarification from BSNL as sought by the Council vide its letter dated 01.04.2015 on or before 11.05.2015. However no response was received from the medical college.

The Central Govt. vide its letter dated 15.06.2015 had communicated its decision to the college authorities not to renew the permission for admission of  $4^{th}$  batch of 150 MBBS students for the academic year 2015-16 only.

Since the aforesaid decision of the Central Govt. was pertaining to the academic year 2015-2016, the Council has vide its letter dated 06.07.2015, informed the Central Govt. about the fact that the Council had in terms of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 recommended to the Central Govt. for debarring the medical college from admitting students for the academic years 2015-16 & 2016-17 but due to an omission / oversight the Central Govt. by way of its order dated 15.06.2015 had conveyed its decision to the medical college not to grant renewal of permission for admitting 3<sup>rd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students for the academic year 2015-16 only.

The medical college being aggrieved by the recommendations of the MCI and the decision of the Central Government had filed Writ Petition No. 21617 of 2015 titled Anil Neerukonda Educational Society & Ors vs. Union of India & Anr. before the Hondple High Court at Hyderabad, inter alia, challenging the vires of Regulation 8(1) as well seeking certain other reliefs. The Hondple High Court at Hyderabad vide its order dated 16.07.2015 had declined to grant any interim relief in favour of the medical college.

The aforesaid writ petition has been disposed by the Honople High Court at Hyderabad vide order dated 21.01.2016. The relevant portion of the order dated 21.01.2016 is reproduced as under:-

"...At the outset, Mr. D. V. Sitarama Murthy, learned Senior Counsel submits that insofar as first two prayers are concerned, they have rendered infructuous in view of the subsequent events, including pendency of Special Leave to Appeal (c) in the Supreme Court, bearing No. 31535 of 2015. He submit that the petitioner –institutions has independently applied for inspection of their college seeking approval for the next academic year (2016-17) and directions may be issued to respondent No. 2 to inspect the college on or before 31/01/2016.

*Mr.* Nimmagadda Venkateswarlu, learned counsel for respondent No.2, on the other hand, on instructions, submits that the Medical Council of India, in view of clause 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment), 2010 has already decided not to inspect the petitioners' college and they shall send communication to that effect to the petitioners on or before 31.01.2016. His statement is recorded and accepted.

In view thereof, nothing further survives in this writ petition. The writ petition is disposed of keeping it open to the petitioners to challenge the letter of respondent No.2, which they propose to address to the petitioners rejecting their prayer for inspection of the college for the next academic year. All contentions in that behalf are kept open....."

Thereafter the medical college vide letter dated 28.01.2016 requested the Council to consider their application for grant of renewal of permission for the academic year 2016-17 and had also forwarded the order dated 21.01.2016 passed by the Honople High Court.

In view of the order dated 21.01.2016 passed by the Honople High Court, the MCI vide letter dated 30.01.2016 had informed the medical college that since no decision had been taken by the Central Govt. regarding the academic year 2016-17, thus the Council had decided not to process the applications of the medical colleges in view of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 as had been invoked in the case of the medical college since the medical college had tried to mislead MCI as well as the Central Govt. by furnishing fake telephone bills as address proofs of the faculty members.

In view of the above facts and circumstances, the Executive Committee noted it that Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 deals with a situation where a medical college has tried to play fraud with the Council and the Central Govt. by submitting fake / forged documents in relation to teaching faculty employed by it. The conduct of a medical college plays a vital role while evaluating the application of the medical college for grant of permission. Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 categorically provides that, if during an inspection, a medical college is found to have employed teaching faculty on the basis of fake or forged documents, the Council must take a serious view of the conduct of the medical college and medical college will not be considered for permission for the current and the ensuing academic sessions.

The Executive Committee further thought it relevant to state that a medical college while submitting the Declaration Forms of the facultycertifies that they have verified the credentials as well as the experience certificates of the faculty members and are satisfied with the credentials. There is an endorsement to the effect that the Principal / Dean and the Head of the Department of the medical college had satisfied themselves with the correctness & veracity of the contents of the Declaration Form including the fact that the medical teachers were working as full time faculty members in the medical college. The faculty member provides the aforesaid declaration, the Head of the Department and the Dean / Principal of the medical college provide and endorsement certifying that they have satisfied themselves about the correctness / veracity of the contents of the declaration including the certificates / documents submitted by the faculty member. The Head of the Department and the Dean / Principal of the medical college further declare that in the event any information / document is found incorrect or false then in such an event they shall be equally responsible besides the faculty member for such mis-declaration or misleading the MCI.

The Hondple Supreme Court in its judgement dated 06.09.2013 in the case of Rohilkhand Medical College & Hospital, Bareilly Versus Medical Council of India & Another . (2013) 15 SCC 516, has categorically held that MCI can take action under Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 if prima facie it is established that fake teachers were shown by the College to seek permission from MCI.

The Executive Committee considered it relevant to point out that the Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt., in the case of National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur during an inspection observed that the college had mislead the Board of Governors regarding the teaching faculty as there was a variation in the number of faculty members found during the inspection of postgraduate and undergraduate courses of the medical college. The Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. after considering the case of the medical college issued show cause notice and after considering their reply found that the college had employed faculty with fake / forged documents and decided to debar the college from making admissions for increased admission capacity from 100 to 150 in MBBS course for the academic session 2012-13 & 2013-14 under Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

The National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur being aggrieved by the decision of the Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. dated 30.06.2012 had challenged the said decision before the Honople Supreme Court by way of W.P (C) No.272/2012. The Honople Supreme Court after hearing detailed submission on behalf of the college had declined to entertain the said petition therefore the medical college withdrew the same and the writ petition was dismissed as withdrawn vide order dated 10.07.2012 without granting any liberty to college.

Thereafter National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur had filed W.P (C) No.4509/2012 before the Hondple Delhi High Court challenging the same decision of the Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. dated 30.06.2012, when the Hondple Delhi High Court also declined to entertain the said petition which was disposed of vide order dated 30.07.2012 with certain directions.

In the present matter, the Hearing Committee has ignored to consider that NRI Institute of Medical Sciences, Vishakhapatnam had tried to play fraud with the MCI as well as the Central Govt. by providing fake residence proof of the faculty members (fake telephone bills) during the inspection carried out on 16/17.12.2015. The Hearing Committee has also ignored that even after giving numerous opportunities to the medical college to produce clarification from

BSNL in respect of the fake telephone bills, the medical college has failed to furnish the same. The documents now furnished by the medical college before the Hearing Committee on 17.03.2016(wrongly mentioned as 17.03.2015) cannot help the case of the medical college since it has already been established that the medical college during the MCI assessment had presented teaching faulty on the basis of fake / forged residence proofs.

The Executive Committee of the Council further noted the judgement dated 27<sup>th</sup> April, 2016 of the Honople Supreme Court in Civil Appeal No. 4812 of 2016 . MCI Vs. Malla Reddy Instt. Of Medical Sciences & Orr., the operative part of which reads as under:-

#### "

6. The main submission advanced on behalf of the appellant MCI, is to the effect that although the Full Bench did not declare provisos (a) to (d) of Regulations 8(3)(1) ultra vires nor declared any need to read them down still on account of its observations that it is not open to MCI and/or Central Government to deny to the applicant/institute concerned, an opportunity to rectify the deficiencies falling within the ambit of the aforesaid provisos, the Division Bench, on receipt of answer to the reference, allowed the writ petitions with a direction to consider for grant of recognition in disregard of the relevant provisos. In other words, the grievance of the appellant is that the answer to the reference given by the Full Bench is being construed against the appellant as if the relevant provisos of Regulation 8(3)(1) of the Regulations have been declared ultra vires or have been read down so as not to cause any ill effect upon an applicant/institution covered by those provisos.

7. Parties are in agreement that the issue referred to the Full Bench did not require even reading down of the concerned Regulation, much less examining its vires and therefore, the conclusions being drawn by the High Court on account of the impugned judgment of the Full Bench is not warranted in law.

8. Since the Full Bench did not strike down the concerned provisos of Regulation 8(3)(1) nor directed for reading down their effect, its answers must be confined to the peculiar facts and further, in our view, the High Court on receipt of the reference erred in issuing directions contrary to the relevant provisos.

9. In the aforesaid facts and circumstances, it is clarified that the impugned Full Bench judgment does not adversely affect the provisos (a) to (d) of Regulation 8(3)(1) of the Regulations and the Division Bench erred in allowing the writ petitions by issuing directions contrary to the relevant provisos. Consequently, the final order passed by the High Court on the basis of the impugned judgment is held to be bad in law.

10. It is admitted at Bar that the adverse effect of the relevant provisos upon the writ petitioners is over for all practical purposes.

11. The learned senior counsel appearing for the appellant MCI has assured that no further action will be taken against the writ petitioners on the basis of lapses that attracted the concerned provisos and now the institutions belonging to the petitioners shall be subjected to inspection without taking any further punitive action for the past happenings.

12. It goes without saying that if the writ petitioners are so advised and if the need arises, they may challenge the constitutional validity of the concerned Regulations through any appropriate proceeding in future.

13. Both the appeals are allowed to the above extent, but with no order as to costs."

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council after due discussion and deliberation and after considering the entire record pertaining to the medical college decided to reiterate its decision not to consider the institute for renewal of permission for two academic years i.e. that academic year (i.e. 2015-16) and the next academic year (i.e. 2016-2017) in view of invocation of

Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 since the medical college had presented faculty members on the basis of fake / forged documents including residence proof in order to play fraud on the MCI as well as the Central Govt. so as to obtain renewal of permission and also had failed to provide any clarification from BSNL in this regard so as to substantiate its compliance.

#### 179. <u>Recommendation of MCI in respect of RKDF Medical College</u> <u>Hospital & Research Centre, Bhopal for application of Clause</u> <u>8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999.</u>

Read: thematter with regard to recommendation of MCI in respect of RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Bhopal for application of Clause 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the letter dated 29.03.2016 whereby the Ministry while accepting the recommendation of the Hearing Committee has referred the case of RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Institute, Bhopal to the Council for review on imposition of penalty as provided under Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

The Executive Committee noted the letter dated 29.03.2016 clearly reveals that the Hearing Committee has not considered the matter in accordance with the clear mandate of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 as well as the recommendations of the Council alongwith the inspection reports. It is stated that the Hearing Committee, has recorded in its recommendation that the medical college has admitted to the fact that it had presented faculty members with fake / forged Declaration Form & Experience Certificates and also that certain faculty members did not have requisite experience in their respective departments, however instead of rejecting their claim has requested the Council to review their case on the imposition of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999. The relevant portion of the observation of the Hearing Committee is reproduced as under:-

"......The College has admitted that experience certificate issued by Sakshi Medical College in respect of Dr. Navneet Mishra was wrong to the extent that the said medical college is not yet recognised by MCI.

The records relating to work done by the four faculty in question was perused. It was noted that the clinical work done by them was actually inadequate. The college has informed the 3 faculty have already left the college except Dr. Subrat Adhikari.

The Committee notes that if the experience is not accepted on grounds that the college issuing it is not recognised, the faculty may not be considered if found wanting in having requisite experience. The observation regarding low workload in case of the four faculty is also upheld. However, it falls short of a clear finding that fake faculty/documents were employed by the college. The matter may be referred to MCI for review....."

The Executive Committee thought it relevant to mention that the Ministry as well as the Hearing Committee has apart from other deficiencies including other faculty appointed on the basis of fake / forged documents, has totally ignored that the Council while evaluating the Declaration Forms & Experience Certificates of the faculty members found that one Dr. Paresh Ruparel, who was presented as a faculty member of the medical college during the inspection, who was actually working in V.S Hospital, administered and managed by Ahmadabad Municipal Corporation, Ahmadabad and was simultaneously taking salary from both the medical college and the State Govt. Dr. Paresh Ruparel had submitted his affidavit dated 19.05.2015 before the Ethic Committee of the Council wherein he had admitted that he is working as a Surgeon at V.S Hospital, administered and managed by Ahmadabad Municipal Corporation, Ahmadabad and had also appeared before MCI inspection team as a faculty member of RKDF medical college only for the purposes of the MCI inspection to help the medical college procure permission for the academic year 2015-16. The Ministry and the Hearing Committee has also ignored that the Principal of the medical college has verified and counter signed his Declaration Form &Experience Certificate to show his as regular faculty of the medical college and had tried to mislead the Central Govt as well as MCI.

In order to consider the matter the Executive Committee deemed it appropriate to set out the following facts pertaining to the medical college:-

1) An assessment for renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch (150 seats) of RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Jathkhedi, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016 was carried out by the Council Assessors on 23<sup>rd</sup> & 24<sup>th</sup> February, 2015. The assessment report (23<sup>rd</sup> & 24<sup>th</sup> Feb., 2015) was considered by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 02/03/2015 and it was decided as under:-

*"The Executive Committee considered the Council Assessor report (23<sup>rd</sup> & 24<sup>th</sup> February 2015) and noted the following:-*

- 1. Deficiency of teaching faculty is 19.81 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of residents is 49 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy is 48 % on day of assessment.
- 4. There were only 5 Major (which included 4 Cataract operations) & 4 Minor operations on day of assessment.
- 5. There was no normal delivery & 1 Caesarean section on day of assessment.
- 6. There was no patient in ICCU, SICU, PICU/NICU & only 1 patient in MICU on day of assessment.
- 7. With regard to clinical material, the following discrepancies were observed:
  - (a) In Casualty OPD, two fake patients of corneal abrasion were shown. On enquiry, both of them said that their left eye was given eye pads just one hour before. On examination, both of them had no such problem.
  - (b) In Paediatrics ward, most of the patients had no significant illness to be treated as IPD patients. 5 patients from the same family were found in Paediatrics ward. Few other patients were also from the common family.
  - (c) In Obstetrics ward, 2 patients were aged more than 50 years i.e. beyond reproductive age.
  - (d) In Tb & Chest ward, almost all the patients shown were not having any chest complaint at all. Rather, they had other vague complaints like body ache, etc. not requiring admission.
  - (e) Overall, IPD patients were not having significant illness to be treated as IPD patients.
  - (f) Most of IPD patients were not investigated at all. Most of the them were not given any medicine.
  - (g) More than 70 % patients were admitted on only 1 day i.e. 22/02/2015.
- 8. With regard to faculty & Residents, the following discrepancies are observed:
  - (a) Most of the Residents are not actually staying in campus accommodation.

- (b) One Junior Resident in O.G. confessed that he is actually staying in teaching staff quarters but only on paper he was allotted a room in the hostel.
- (c) A few teachers are engaged only periodically as per their teaching schedule.
- (d) Most of the faculty are not actually staying in the quarters allotted to them.
- (e) Significant number of faculty & Residents were unaware of other faculty & Residents of their own departments.
- 9. Dr. Navneet Mishra, Asst. Prof. of General Surgery had attached wrong experience certificate.
- 10. The following faculty were observed not to have done any work in the department:
  - (a) Dr. Sameer Zutshi, Asst. Professor, Anaesthesia;
  - (b) Dr. Subrat Adhikary, Asst. Professor of General Medicine;
  - (c) Dr. Priya Singh, Asst. Prof. of General Surgery;
  - (d) Dr. Avinash Kaundinya, Professor of Ophthalmology.
- 11. In case of as many as 12 faculty, address does not match with Dean's quarters allocation certificate.
- 12. In case of 14 Residents as detailed in the report, there is no signature of HOD on D.F.
- 13. Dr. Milan Pumbhadiya, Junior Resident had D.F. filled on 09/01/2015 while he was appointed on 20/01/2015.
- 14. In case of Dr. Jayesh Dholakiya, Junior Resident in General Medicine, date of joining is contradictory.
- 15. Name of faculty was not mentioned in weekly teaching programmes.
- 16. In Residents' hostel, ground floor is used as Autopsy block.
- 17. Teaching staff quarters are not actually staff quarters but like big sized rooms hostel. They are located on 2nd& 3rd floor above the library and reading room, which means that library is on ground floor, reading room is on I floor of teaching quarters hostel.
- 18. MRD: It is partly manual & partly computerized.
- 19. Nursing staff: 155 Nurses are available against requirement of 175 as per Regulations.
- 20. Paramedical staff: Only 65 are available against requirement of 100 as per Regulations.
- 21. Anatomy department: Embryology models are inadequate.
- 22. Access of RKDF Hospital is through very narrow road passing through slum area which is a major problem for ambulance to reach.
- 23. No separate Nursing hostel is available. I floor of Girls' hostel is utilized as Nursing hostel.
- 24. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch (150 seats) of RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh earlier under Barkatullah University and now under Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan University, Bhopal u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016. It was further decided to apply clauses 8(3)(1)(a) & 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 which read as under:-

"8(3)(1).....

2)

3)

4)

#### Colleges in the stage upto II renewal (i.e. Admission of third batch)

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 30% and/or bed occupancy is <60%, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission in that Academic Year."

(d) <u>Colleges which are found to have employed teachers with</u> <u>faked/forged documents</u>:

If it is observed during any institute is found to have employed a teacher with faked/forged documents and have submitted the declaration form of such a teacher, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission/recognition for award of MBBS degree/processing the applications for postgraduate courses for two academic years i.e. that academic year and the next academic year also.

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the institute for renewal of permission for two academic years i.e. that academic year(i.e. 2015-16) and the next academic year (i.e. 2016-2017

The Executive Committee further decided to refer the matter to the Ethics Committee."

The above decision of the Council was communicated to the Central Government vide MCI letter dated 05.03.2015. In view of above decision of the Executive Committee regarding fake faculty, the matter was referred to the Ethics Committee of the Council for further necessary action against the erring doctors and the medical college who had furnished fake experience certificates and had submitted forged declaration forms.

The Central Govt. had constituted a Committee for granting hearing under Section 10A(4) to the medical colleges who were not recommended by the MCI for grant of renewal of permission on the grounds of persisting deficiencies. Accordingly the hearing was granted to the medical college whereafter the Central Govt. vide its letter dated 17.04.2015 forwarded the compliance dated 09.04.2015 submitted by the submitted by the Dean, RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Bhopal alongwith the recommendations of the Committee constituted by the Ministry of Health, and Family Welfare, New Delhi for review by the MCI.

- During that time, the Council had come across a number of medical colleges which were at the various stages of renewal of permissions and were found grossly deficient in providing minimum infrastructure, teaching faculty, clinical material and other physical facilities in their medical colleges thus the Council had to invoke Regulation 8(3)(1)(a), 8(3)(1)(b), 8(3)(1)(c) and also 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999. Accordingly, it was decided by the Council to seek a Legal Opinion from the Ld. Additional Solicitor General regarding whether the applications of such medical colleges could be processed any further in view of the invocation of Regulation 8(3)(1)(a), 8(3)(1)(b), 8(3)(1)(c) and also 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999.
- 5) The Ld. Additional Solicitor General vide his Legal Opinion dated 14.03.2015 in respect of the applicability of Regulation 8(3)(1)(a), 8(3)(1)(b), 8(3)(1)(c) had opined that wherein the Council has invoked Regulation 8(3)(1)(a), 8(3)(1)(b) and 8(3)(1)(c) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999, after an inspection by the MCI assessors, there was no Statutory provision either under the Act or under the Regulations authorizing the MCI to process further the applications of

160

such medical colleges. As the said Regulation clearly barred the consideration of any compliance from such medical colleges.

- 6) Similarly in respect of the applicability of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d), the Ld. Additional Solicitor General vide his Legal Opinion dated 27.03.2015 had opined that the MCI was not obliged to process the application of a medical college for renewal of permission which has been debarred from making admission for two academic years in conformity with Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of aforesaid Regulation.
- The case of the medical college was re-considered by the Executive 7) Committee of the MCI in its meeting held on 29.04.2015 along with the Central Govt. letter dated 17.04.2015 and the Legal Opinions dated 14.03.2015 & 27.03.2015 rendered by the Ld. Additional Solicitor General. The Executive Committee of the MCI, in view of the fact that it had after considering the assessment report dated 23<sup>rd</sup>& 24<sup>th</sup> February 2015 in its meeting held on 02.03.2015, had, invoked Regulation 8(3)(1)(a) and also 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999, it was decided by the Council to reiterate its earlier decision to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission to the medical college for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students for the academic year 2015-16 and also to debar the medical college for two academic years i.e. 2015-16 and 2016-17 in view of the fact that Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) had been invoked in the case of the medical college; whereafter the case of the medical college could not be processed any further. Accordingly, abovementioned recommendation of the Council was communicated to the Central Govt. vide MCI letter dated 11.05.2015.
  - The Central Govt. vide its letter dated 15.06.2015 had communicated its decision to the college authorities not to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup>batch (150 seats) of RKDF Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh for the academic year 2015-2016.
    - Since the aforesaid decision of the Central Govt. was pertaining to the academic year 2015-2016,the Council has vide its letter dated 06.07.2015, informed the Central Govt. about the fact that the Council had in terms of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 recommended to the Central Govt. for debarring the medical college from admitting students for the academic years 2015-16 & 2016-17 but due to an omission / oversight the Central Govt. by way of its order dated 15.06.2015 had conveyed its decision to the medical college not to grant renewal of permission for admitting 3<sup>rd</sup>batch of 150 MBBS students for the academic year 2015-16 only.
- 10) The medical college being aggrieved by the recommendations of the MCI and the decision of the Central Government, had filed Writ Petition No. 7521 of 2015 titled RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre vs. Union of India & Anr. before the Honople High Court of Madhya Pradesh, Bench at Jabalpur. The Honople High Court of Madhya Pradesh, Bench at Jabalpur vide its order dated 21.05.2015 had directed the Council to comply with the direction issued by the Central Govt. in terms of its letter dated 17.04.2015.
- 11) The MCI being aggrieved by the interim order dated 21.05.2015 passed by the Honople High Court of Madhya Pradesh in W.P. No.7521/2015 had approached the Honople Supreme Court by way of SLP (C) No.16454/2015. The Honople Supreme Court vide its order dated 04.06.2015, while disposing of the Special Leave Petition, had set aside the order dated 21.05.2015 and had allowed the MCI to raise all the pleas before the Honople High Court of Madhya Pradesh as had been raised before the Honople Supreme Court.
- 12) The matter was thereafter heard by the Hondple High Court of Madhya Pradesh. The Hondple High Court of Madhya Pradesh, vide its judgment dated 01.07.2015, while allowing the writ petition being W.P. No.7521/2015 filed by the medical college, had set-aside the MCI recommendations dated 29.04.2015 & 11.05.2015 and had directed the

8)

9)

MCI to review / assess the scheme for yearly renewal as submitted by the medical college in light of the Central Govt. communication dated 17.04.2015.

- 13) It is relevant to mention here that during that time the Council received a complaint dated 25.03.2015 from Dr. A.K Bannergy, Ex. Associate Professor of the medical college alleging that more than 50% faculty members of the medical college who have been presented as full time faculty members at the medical college during the MCI assessment are private practitioners and in this regard the complainant had also forwarded documents of one Dr. Paresh Ruparel who had claimed to be employed as the Professor of Surgery at the medical college. It was alleged by the complainant that Dr. Ruparel owns a private clinic since last 15 year in Gujarat and also works as Surgeon at V.S Hospital affiliated to NHL Medical College, Ahmadabad. In support of his claim Dr. Bannergy had also forwarded the photographs of the clinic owned by Dr. Ruparel.
- 14) Upon receiving the compliant by Dr. Bannergy, the matter was referred to the Ethics Committee of the Council whereafter after initial scrutiny of the Declaration Form & Experience Certificates of Dr. Paresh Ruparel, notices were issued to Principal of the RKDF medical college as well as Dr. Paresh Ruparel as well as Medical Superintendant of V.S Hospital, Ahmadabad. It is important mention that Dr. Paresh Ruparel had submitted his affidavit dated 19.05.2015 wherein he had admitted that he is working as a Surgeon at V.S Hospital, administered and managed by Ahmadabad Municipal Corporation, Ahmadabad and had also appeared before MCI inspection team as a faculty member of RKDF medical college procure permission for the academic year 2015-16.
  - The MCI being aggrieved by the judgment dated 01.07.2015 passed by the Honople High Court of Madhya Pradesh in W.P. No.7521/2015 had approached the Honople Supreme Court by way of SLP (C) No.19513/2015. The Honople Supreme Court vide its order dated 08.09.2015 passed in SLP (C) No.19513/2015, in the facts and circumstances of the case, before deciding the petition, had directed the Council to comply with the directions issued by the Honople High Court of Madhya Pradesh in its judgment dated 01.07.2015 passed in W.P. No.7521/2015 by conducting an inspection of the medical college and to submit its report before the Honople Supreme Court in a sealed cover on or before 21.09.2015. The Honople Supreme Court had also issued notice to Dr. Paresh Ruparel.
  - Accordingly compliance verification inspection of the medical college was carried out by the Council Assessors on 22<sup>nd</sup> September, 2015 when the aforesaid Special Leave Petition being SLP (C) No.19513/2015 was also listed for hearing before the Honople Supreme Court on 22.09.2015. The Honople Supreme Court after hearing the parties vide its order dated 22.09.2015, while leaving the question of law open had dismissed the aforesaid petition had directed that the inspection report be submitted to the Central Govt. by 24.09.2015, who shall provide a hearing to the medical college on 26.09.2015 and take a decision in the matter by 28.09.2015.
- 17) The compliance verification assessment report (22<sup>nd</sup> September 2015) alongwith previous assessment report (23<sup>rd</sup> & 24<sup>th</sup> Feb., 2015) with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch (150 seats) of RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016 was forwarded to the members of the Executive Committee through circulation on 23.09.2015 whereby it was decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch (150 seats) of RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016 in view of the following deficiencies:-

15)

16)

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 15.95 % as detailed in the report. The Dean in his letter has stated that 5 Asst. Prof. have passed in May/June 2015 from MCI recognized colleges who have provisional degree certificate issued by the respective Universities as their final degree certificate would be issued only after convocation. He has further stated that three faculty had gone to attend Hon'ble Courts; however in respect of one of them i.e. Dr. Ashok Meghwal, Asso. Prof. of Surgery, although only 1 Asso. Prof. is available against requirement of 2, no deficiency has been shown in the chart implying he has been considered. The fourth person mentioned in his letter i.e. Dr. Shailendra Pandey is actually a Senior resident in Skin & VD and not a member of faculty. Accepting all such faculty who have not been considered by assessors and considering them, <u>net deficiency still remains at 7.44 %.</u>
- 2. Psychiatry department is running without any faculty.
- 3. Deficiency of Residents is 83 % as detailed in the report. Most of the Residents are not staying in the campus. Only a few rooms seem to be occupied but basic needs & amenities are not available in Residents' hostel. Clothes, books, belongings, etc. were not seen in the rooms. Ration cards, which appear newly issued, have been provided as address proof for most of the residents, which is not acceptable.
  - Many patients who do not require admissions are admitted. In Orthopaedics ward, there were no patients with plaster cast or any operated patient. In Paediatric ward, many patients complained only of Bodyache. One patient was admitted only for investigation purpose. Most of the patients had no significant illness to be treated as IPD patients. In Gynaecology ward, one patient is admitted since 13/09/2015 for complaint of abdominal pain, etc. One patient was admitted for complaints of chest pain & cough. One patient has been admitted since 10/09/2015 (i.e. for 13 days) for Renal Colic. In Obstetric ward, many of the patients did not warrant admission. Basic investigations were not performed at all. Doctors in the Unit had no explanation for the same. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 5. In Casualty, there were only 2 patients out of 18 beds. Details of medical, paramedical staff are not provided.
- 6. In Tb & Chest ward, one of the patients admitted was of Koch's spine which is not as per norms.
- 7. MRD: It is partly computerized. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 8. Access of RKDF hospital is through very narrow road passing through slum area which is a major problem for ambulance to reach. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 9. Data of OPD attendance, IPD, Laboratory investigations, Contrast Radiology investigations & Casualty provided by the institute seem to be inflated. In DVL OPD, there was NIL registration on day of assessment. In Psychiatry OPD, Register is maintained poorly. Last date of entry was 15/09/2015.
- There were NIL Major & NIL Minor operations on day of assessment. O.T. lists were not provided to assessors in spite of repeatedly asking for same.
- 11. There were NIL Normal deliveries & NIL Caesarean Sections on day of assessment as well as on 3 previous days.

- 12. Number of Plain X-rays on day of assessment is only 49 which is inadequate.
- 13. Histopathology & Blood Bank records are not matching with O.T. record.
- 14. Most of the wards like Paediatrics, Tb & Chest Diseases, Obstetrics & Gynecology, Skin & VD, Psychiatry, Ophthalmology, ENT, Orthopaedics, General Surgery, General Medicine, are not as per Minimum Standard Requirement Regulations. ENT ward did not have Emergency tray and basic instruments.
- 15. Mess facility is not available in the hostels.
- ICUs: There was only 1 patient each in MICU & SICU and NIL 16. patient in ICCU, PICU/NICU on day of assessment.
- 17. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.
- 18) It is pertinent to mention here that, apart from the above, the medical college in any event has already been debarred for two academic years i.e. 2015-16 and 2016-17 in view of the fact that Regulation 8(3)(1)(d)had already been invoked in the case of the medical college. The above decision of the Council was communicated to the Central Govt. vide letter dated 24.09.2015.
- 19) The Central Govt. upon receiving the recommendation from the MCI, had provided a hearing to the medical college on 26.09.2015 in terms of the order dated 22.09.2015 passed by the Honople Supreme Court in SLP (C) No. 19513/2015. Thereafter Central Govt. vide its order dated 28.09.2015 decided to not to renew the permission for admission of 2<sup>nd</sup> batch for MBBS course (150 seats) of RKDF Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh for the academic year 2015-16.
- 20) The medical college being aggrieved by the Central Govt. decision dated 28.09.2015 had approached the Honople Supreme Court by filing an application bearing I.A. No.3/2015 in SLP (C) No.19513/2015 on 29.09.2015. It is pertinent to mention that the aforesaid application being I.A. No. 3/2015 in SLP (C) No. 19513/2015 was listed before the Hondele Supreme Court on 01.10.2015, when the Hondole Supreme Court vide order dated 01.10.2015, directed the same to be listed on 06.10.2015. The Hondple Supreme Court vide its order dated 06.10.2015, recorded that the Senior Advocate appearing on behalf of the medical college was not ready to argue the matter on that day thus the case was adjourned to 08.10.2015. The arguments were heard by the Honople Supreme Court on the aforesaid application filed by the medical college on 08.10.2015 and when it became evident to the medical college that the Honople Supreme Court was not inclined to grant any indulgence to the medical college thus permission was sought to withdraw the application bearing I.A. No.3/2015 filed in SLP (C) No.19513/2015.
- 21) The Honople Supreme Court vide its order dated 08.10.2015, without expressing any opinion in this regard permitted the medical college to withdraw the application. The said application was dismissed as withdrawn.
- 22) The medical college thereafter approached the Honople Delhi High Court by way of W. P. (C) No. 9663/2015. Honople Delhi Court, after hearing the medical college in W. P. (C) No. 9663/2015 vide order dated 09.10.2016, while issuing notice in the matter, had permitted the medical college to provisionally admit students for academic year 2015-2016.
- 23) The MCI being aggrieved by the interim directions passed by the Honople Delhi High Court in W. P. (C) No. 9663/2015 had approached the Hondple Supreme Court by way of SLP (C) No. 29443 of 2015. The Honople Supreme Court after hearing the parties vide its order dated 15.10.2015 while allowing the SLP filed by the MCI had quashed the

interim relief granted by the Honople Delhi High Court, vide its order dated 09.10.2015 passed in W. P. (C) No. 9663/2015 and had cancelled the admissions.

- 24) Whereafter, the Hondple Delhi Court vide its judgement dated 29.12.2015 had disposed off the aforesaid writ petition being W. P. (C) No. 9663/2015 with a directed the Central Govt. to pass a fresh decision for grant renewal of permission to the medical college for admitting 2<sup>nd</sup>batch of 150 MBBS students for the academic year 2015-16. The MCI being aggrieved by the aforesaid judgement dated 29.12.2015 passed in W.P. (C) No. 9663/2015 has challenged the same before the Hondple Division Bench of the Hondple Delhi High Court by way of LPA No.14/2016 and the same is pending adjudication.
- 25) In the meanwhile, the Central Government in compliance of the directions issued by the Honople Delhi High Court vide its judgement dated 29.12.2015 passed in W. P. (C) No. 9663/2015, the Central Govt. vide its detailed letter dated 01.01.2016 had once again conveyed its decision to the medical college not to grant renewal of permission to admit 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of 150 MBBS students for the academic session 2015-16. The medical college has now challenged the said decision of the Central Govt. by way of W.P. (C) No. 66/2015 which is also pending adjudication before the Honople Delhi High Court.

In view of the above facts and circumstances, the Exective Committee thought it pertinent to mention that Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 deals with a situation where a medical college has tried to play fraud with the Council and the Central Govt. by submitting fake / forged documents including Declaration Forms and Experience Certificates in relation to teaching faculty employed by it. The conduct of a medical college plays a vital role while evaluating the application of the medical college for grant of permission. Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999categorically provides that, if during an inspection, a medical college is found to have employed teaching faculty on the basis of fake or forged documents, the Council must take a serious view of the conduct of the medical college and medical college will not be considered for permission for the current and the ensuing academic sessions.

The Executive Committee thought it relevant to state that a medical college while submitting the Declaration Forms of the facultycertifies that they have verified the credentials as well as the experience certificates of the faculty members and are satisfied with the credentials. There is an endorsement to the effect that the Principal / Dean and the Head of the Department of the medical college had satisfied themselves with the correctness & veracity of the contents of the Declaration Form including the fact that the medical teachers were working as full time faculty members in the medical college. The faculty member provides the aforesaid declaration, the Head of the Department and the Dean / Principal of the medical college provide and endorsement certifying that they have satisfied themselves about the correctness / veracity of the contents of the declaration including the certificates / documents submitted by the faculty member. The Head of the Department and the Dean / Principal of the medical college further declare that in the event any information / document is found incorrect or false then in such an event they shall be equally responsible besides the faculty member for such mis-declaration or misleading the MCI.

The Hondple Supreme Court in its judgement dated 06.09.2013 in the case of Rohilkhand Medical College & Hospital, Bareilly Versus Medical Council of India & Another . (2013) 15 SCC 516, has categorically held that MCI can take action under Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 if prima facie it is established that fake teachers were shown by the College to seek permission from MCI.

The Committee considered it relevant to point out that the Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt., in the case of National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur during an inspection observed that the college had mislead the Board of Governors regarding the teaching faculty as there was a variation in the number of faculty members found during the inspection of postgraduate and undergraduate courses of the medical college. The Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. after considering the case of the medical college issued show cause notice and after considering their reply found that the college had employed faculty with fake / forged documents and decided to debar the college from making admissions for increased admission capacity from 100 to 150 in MBBS course for the academic session 2012-13 & 2013-14 under Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

The National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur being aggrieved by the decision of the Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. dated 30.06.2012 had challenged the said decision before the Honople Supreme Court by way of W.P (C) No.272/2012. The Honople Supreme Court after hearing detailed submission on behalf of the college had declined to entertain the said petition therefore the medical college withdrew the same and the writ petition was dismissed as withdrawn vide order dated 10.07.2012without granting any liberty to college.

Thereafter National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur had filed W.P (C) No.4509/2012 before the Hondple Delhi High Court challenging the same decision of the Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. dated 30.06.2012, when the Hondple Delhi High Court also declined to entertain the said petition which was disposed of vide order dated 30.07.2012 with certain directions.

In the present matter, the RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Institute, Bhopal, during the hearing granted to it on 17.03.2016(wrongly mentioned as 17.03.2015) by the Hearing Committee constituted by the Ministry, has clearly admitted to the fact that it had presented faculty members with fake / forged Declaration Forms & Experience Certificates and also that certain faculty members did not have requisite teaching experience in their respective departments. The hearing Committee failed to consider the recommendations of the Council as well as the inspections reports which are very vital to come to any conclusion in this regard.

The Ministry as well as the Hearing Committee has also totally ignored that the Council while evaluating the Declaration Forms & Experience Certificates of the faculty members found that one Dr. Paresh Ruparel, who was presented as a faculty member of the medical college during the inspection.Dr. Paresh Ruparel had submitted his affidavit dated 19.05.2015 before the Ethics Committee of the Council wherein he had admitted that he is working as a Surgeon at V.S Hospital, administered and managed by Ahmadabad Municipal Corporation, Ahmadabad and had also appeared before MCI inspection team as a faculty member of RKDF medical college only for the purposes of the MCI inspection in order to help the medical college procure permission for the academic year 2015-16. Thus the Ministry and the Hearing Committee had clearly also ignored that the Principal of the medical college has verified and counter signed his Declaration Form &Experience Certificate to show his as regular faculty of the medical college.

In the meanwhile the Council has received the order dated 11.05.2016 passed by the Honople High Court of Madhya Pradesh at Jabalpur passed in W.P No. 21223/2015 . RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre Vs. UOI & Anr., wherein the Honople High Court has quashed the letter dated 29.03.2016 issued by the Central Govt. and has further directed the Council to

conduct an inspection of the medical college and to submit its recommendations to the Central Govt. before 15.05.2016. It was also informed that since the order dated 11.05.2016 passed by the Honople High Court of Madhya Pradesh is contrary to law as laid down by the Honople Supreme Court since there was an absence of surprise element to the inspection of the MCI as well as various other grounds, thus the Council has approached the Honople Supreme Court by way of a SLP which is likely to be listed shortly.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council after due discussion and deliberation and after considering the entire record pertaining to the medical college decided to defer the consideration of the matter to await the outcome of the SLP filed by the Council against the order dated 11.05.2016 passed by the Honople High Court of Madhya Pradesh at Jabalpur in W.P No. 21223/2015 . RKDF Medical College Hospital & Research Centre Vs. UOI & Anr.

# 180. <u>Recognition/approval of Govt. Medical College, Kozhikode for the</u> <u>award of MBBS degree granted by Kerala University of Health</u> <u>Sciences, Thrissur against the increased intake i.e. from 200 to 250</u> <u>seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and Continuance of Recognition</u> <u>of the college for award of MBBS degree (200 seats)-reg.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Govt. Medical College, Kozhikode for the award of MBBS degree granted by Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur against the increased intake i.e. from 200 to 250 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and Continuance of Recognition of the college for award of MBBS degree (200 seats).

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the assessment reports (26.04.2016) and (09 &10<sup>th</sup> May,2016) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 17.52 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Examination Hall: Capacity of available Examination hall is only 300 against requirement of total capacity of 750 (i.e. 3 Examination halls of 250 capacity each.)
- Central Library: capacity of Reading room for students (Outside) is only 50 against 250 required. Only 24 Journals are available against 100 required.
- 4. MRD: It is partly manual & partly computerized.
- 5. Anatomy Department: Dissection tables available are only 18 against 30 required. Capacity of cold storage is of 3 cadavers only which is inadequate.
- 6. RHTC: Accommodation available is of Dormitory type with 8 beds in 1 room each for Boys & Girls which is not permissible.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Govt. Medical College, Kozhikode for the award of MBBS degree granted by Kerala University of Health Sciences, Thrissur against the increased intake i.e. from 200 to 250 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Committee considering the undertaking of the Secretary (Health), Govt. of Kerala dated 13.05.2016 decided to recommend to the Central Government to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of increase of MBBS seats from 200 to 250 at Govt. Medical College, Kozhikode for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Committee further decided not to recommend for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree of Govt. Medical College, Kozhikode for 200 seats.

#### 181. Establishment of new medical college Coimbatore, at Tamilnadu(Government Medical College & ESIC Hospital, Coimbatore) by Govt. of Tamilnadu with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under The Tamilnadu Dr. M.G.R Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Coimbatore, Tamilnadu(Government Medical College & ESIC Hospital, Coimbatore) by Govt. of Tamilnadu with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under The Tamilnadu Dr. M.G.R Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that the Council had received a D.O. letter dated 2<sup>nd</sup> May, 2016 from Sh. Ali R. Rizvi, Joint Secretary, Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, New Delhi stating therein as under:-

‰his is regarding recommendations of MCI for disapproving the schemes for establishment of new Medical Colleges at Paripally, Kollam, Kerala and at Coimbatore, Tamilnadu by the respective State Governments.

MCI vide its recommendation dated 31.12.2015 reiterated its earlier decision to return the application for establishment of new Medical College at paripally, Kollam, Kerala (ESIC Medical College) for the academic year 2016-17 by Government of Kerala citing the reason that the Essentiality Certificate and other documents submitted at the time of application were in the name of ESIC Medical College but not in the name of the applicant i.e. Govt. of Kerala adding that the fresh Essentiality Certificate and Consent of Affiliation in the name of the present application were issued after the last date for submission of applications. As per the documents available on our record, the Govt. of Kerala approved the final terms and conditions of take over and Memorandum of Understanding(MoU) to be executed between the ESIC and State Government vide their G.O. dated 11.09.2015. which was prior to the date for submission of UG applications for 2016-17 i.e. 15.09.2015 (extended date). Since, this is a case involving transfer of Institution from ESIC to State Government, the Central Government is of the opinion that the documents standing in the name of ESIC at the time of application needs to be accepted for considering the application of the State Government to whom the Institution has been transferred and subsequently revised Essentiality Certificate and Consent of Affiliation have been issued.

In case of the application for establishment of new Medical College at Coimbatore. Tamilnadu for the academic year 2016-17 by Government of Tamilnadu, MCI vide its recommendation dated 01.03.2016 returned the application taking the stand that the application was incomplete at the first instance though MCI earlier conducted inspection at the proposed Medical College on 18th & 19th December, 2015 and conveyed deficiencies to the Central Government vide letter dated 31.12.2015. The recommendation dated 01.03.2016 was sent after the Central Government recommended to MCI for review since the deficiencies of faculty and residents was not very high and the MoU was signed between ESIC and the State Government on 11.01.2016. From the information provided by State Government, it is observed that on the request of Ministry of Labour & Employment, the State Government conveyed its consent for taking over the ESIC Medical College project in Coimbatore and issued necessary Essentiality Certificate. It is,

therefore, clear that the State Government was vested with the required authority to run the Medical College and the hospital at the time of making applications. though, formal MoU was signed at a later date. It clearly indicate the date of commencement as 01.07.2015, the date which was much prior to last date for making applications. Subsequently, Hon'ble Prime Minister inaugurated and handed over the ESIC Medical College project to the Government of Tamilnadu on 02.02.2016.

It needs to be mentioned that the schemes were submitted by the State governments consequent to a decision taken by the ESIC to hand over ongoing Medical Colleges and other Medical Education Institutions to the State Governments who are willing to take over such institutions. It also needs to be appreciated that the transfer was between a Central Government organisation and State Governments where decision were taken before closing date of applications, though there may be some delay in completion of formalities. The Central Government is of the opinion that recommending disapproval by MCI in these two cases merely on technical grounds is not reasonable.

#### <u>I shall be grateful if you could cause re-consideration of both</u> the schemes, after inspection wherever necessary."

The Executive Committee of the Council further noted that in view of the above letter, the President had decided to assess the college immediately since the time schedule was nearing completion.

The Executive Committee of the Council ratified the above decision of the President and considered the compliance verification assessment report (11<sup>th</sup> May, 2016), assessment report (18<sup>th</sup> & 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2015) as well as letter dated 12/05/2016 received from the college authorities along with an undertaking of the Secretary, Medical Education and Spl. Secretary, Health & FW, Govt. of Tamil Nadu dated 13.05.2016 and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Coimbatore, Tamilnadu(Government Medical College & ESIC Hospital, Coimbatore) by Govt. of Tamilnadu with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under The Tamilnadu Dr. M.G.R Medical University, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 182. <u>Recommendations of Medical College of India for application of clause 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to recommendations of Medical College of India for application of clause 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the letter dated 21.04.2016 whereby the Ministry while accepting the recommendation of the Hearing Committee has referred the case of Sri Aurobindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indoreto the Council for review on imposition of penalty as provided under Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

The Executive Committee noted that the letter dated 29.03.2016 clearly reveals that the Hearing Committee has not considered the matter in accordance with the clear mandate of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 as well as the recommendations of the Council alongwith the inspection reports. It is stated that the Hearing Committee, has recorded in its recommendation that the

medical college has admitted to the fact that the faculty members of the college while being employed as full- time teachers in the college were also involved in private practice, however, instead of rejecting their claim has requested the Council to review their case on the imposition of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999. The relevant portion of the observation of the Hearing Committee is reproduced as under:-

%õ

The college submitted that private practice by faculty is permissible in the State of Madhya Pradesh. They have submitted individual affidavits by faculty in question, affidavits by the heads of the concerned department and Director stating that the faculty concerned was available during inspection and that they do not indulge in private practice during college hours

The Committee examined some sheets submitted by the college. It could be inferred from the clinical notes recorded in the file that the treatment has been started without seeing the clinical reports which has been asked before starting treatment. The gap suggests that the patients were not under continuous supervision of the doctors concerned.

The Committee is not satisfied with the explanation offered by the college. However the affidavits submitted by the college may be considered by MCI for decision in the matter. $\tilde{0}$  +

The Executive Committee thought it relevant to mention that the Ministry as well as the Hearing Committee, apart from other deficiencies, has totally ignored that the assessors of the Council while evaluating the Declaration Forms of the faculty members found that one Dr. G.S. Gehlot, Asst. Professor of Medicine, who was presented as a faculty member of the medical college during the inspection, had declared in the Declaration Form that he was not doing private practise. In fact, during the assessment conducted by the MCI, Dr. G.S. Gehlot had admitted that he was doing private practise while being employed as a full- time faculty member of the medical college. The Ministry and the Hearing Committee has also ignored that the Principal of the medical college has verified and counter signed his Declaration Form &Experience Certificate to show his as regular / full-time faculty of the medical college and had tried to mislead the Central Govt as well as MCI.

In order to consider the matter the Executive Committee deemed it appropriate to set out the following facts pertaining to the medical college:-

An assessment for renewal of permission for increase in intakefrom 100 to 150 for 2<sup>nd</sup> batch of MBBS studentsat Sri Aurobindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indoreu/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016 was carried out by the Council Assessors on 29<sup>th</sup>&30<sup>th</sup> December, 2014.The assessment report (29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> December, 2014) was considered by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 13/01/2015 wherein it was decided as under:-

‰he Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (29<sup>th</sup> & 30<sup>th</sup>December, 2014) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 32.22 % as detailed in report.

2. Shortage of Residents is 41.67 % as detailed in the report.

3. Dean & Medical Superintendent were on leave. Charge was not given to any faculty. Dean¢ office was locked at 09:45 a.m. on 29/12/2014 (i.e. first day of assessment). Dean reached institute at 12:30 p.m. & Medical Superintendent came at 11:45 a.m. Faculty & Residents (around 100) along with Dean who came to the institute after 11:00 a.m. on 29/12/2014 forcibly entered College Council hall at 05:00 p.m. where verification on D.F. was going on and started arguing for accepting them for attendance. They misbehaved with assessors and stalled

the process for more than 2 hours. On 30/12/2014, the representative of the management of the institute and the dean met the assessors and tendered unconditional apology for the incident.

- 4. Wards: Ancillary facilities like pantry, store room, duty room & demonstration room are not available .
- 5. OPD attendance: Data given by the institute is grossly inflated and manipulated on computer. Assessorsq estimated it to be not more than 800.
- 6. Casualty attendance: Data given by the institute is grossly inflated and manipulated on computer. There were 9 patients till 1:30 p.m. on 29/12/2014 & 3 patients when visited on 30/12/2014 at 10:30 a.m.
- 7. Admissions & Discharge: Data given by the institute is grossly inflated and manipulated on computer.
- 8. There were only 3 major & 4 minor operations in the hospital on day of assessment. No other O.T. list was available at that time.
- 9. Radiological & Laboratory Investigations: Data given by the institute is grossly inflated and manipulated on computer.
- 10. Eight faculty have not been considered as teachers due to reasons mentioned in the report. 5 Senior Residents have not been considered as they are not staying in campus. 4 other Senior Residents have not been considered due to reasons mentioned in the report.
  - Seven faculty have been found doing private practice whose timings of private practice mentioned on his clinic overlap with the institute¢ timings. They cannot be considered as faculty as practice during institute working hours is not permitted.
- 12.

11.

- Dr. G.S. Gehlot, Asst. Prof. of Medicine, agreed doing private practice though this fact was not mentioned on his Declaration Form. He has not submitted a written statement in spite of being asked to do so.
- 13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 of Sri Aurobindo Instt. of Medical Sciences, Indore, MP under under Devi Ahilya Vishwa Vidyalaya, Indore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016 and further decided to apply clauses 8(3)(1)(c) & 8(3)(1)(d) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2010 which reads as under:-

#### 8(3)(1)õ ..

#### (c) <u>Colleges which are already recognized for award of</u> <u>MBBS degree and/or running postgraduate courses</u>

If it is observed during any regular inspection of the institute that the deficiency of teaching faculty and/or Residents is more than 10% and/or bed occupancy is <80%, such an institute will not be considered for processing applications for postgraduate courses in the Academic year and will be issued show cause notices as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956 alongwith direction of stoppage of admissions in permitted postgraduate courses.+ (d) <u>Colleges which are found to have employed teachers with</u> faked/forged documents:

If it is observed during any institute is found to have employed a teacher with faked/forged documents and have submitted the declaration form of such a teacher, such an institute will not be considered for renewal of permission/recognition for award of MBBS degree/processing the applications for postgraduate courses for two academic years i.e. that academic year and the next academic year also.

In view of above, it was decided not to consider the institute for renewal of permission/recognition for award of MBBS degree/processing the applications for postgraduate courses for two academic years i.e. that academic year (i.e. 2015-16) and the next academic year (i.e. 2016-2017) and to issue show cause notice as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the courses run by that institute should not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act,1956õ.+

The above decision of the Council alongwith the inspection report was communicated to the Central Government as well as the college vide MCI letter dated 21.01.2015. By letter dated 21.01.2015, the Council also called upon the college to show cause as to why the Council should not recommend to the Central Govt. to withdraw the recognition granted to the college for MBBS as well as Post Graduate courses in view of the gross deficiencies.

In response to above MCI letter dated 21.01.2015, the Dean, Sri Aurobindo Medical College & PG Institute, vide letter dated 16.02.2015 had submitted the reply of the show cause notice.

The Central Govt. had constituted a Committee for granting hearing under Section 10A(4) to the medical colleges which were not recommended by the MCI for grant of renewal of permission on the grounds of persisting deficiencies. Accordingly the hearing was granted to the medical college whereafter the Central Govt. vide its letter dated 20.02.2015 forwarded the compliance as submitted by the Dean, Sri Aurobindo Institute of Medical Sciences, Indore for review / reconsideration by the Council in light of the documents submitted by the college. The Council was requested to submit its recommendation to the Central Govt. by 15.04.2015.

During that time, the Council had come across a number of medical colleges which were at the various stages of renewal of permissions and were found grossly deficient in providing minimum infrastructure, teaching faculty, clinical material and other physical facilities in their medical colleges thus the Council had to invoke Regulation 8(3)(1)(a), 8(3)(1)(b), 8(3)(1)(c) and also 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999. Accordingly, it was decided by the Council to seek a Legal Opinion from the Ld. Additional Solicitor General regarding whether the applications of such medical colleges could be processed any further in view of the invocation of Regulation 8(3)(1)(a), 8(3)(1)(b), 8(3)(1)(c) and also 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation at the council to seek a Legal Opinion from the Ld.

The Ld. Additional Solicitor General vide his Legal Opinion dated 14.03.2015 in respect of the applicability of Regulation 8(3)(1)(a), 8(3)(1)(b), 8(3)(1)(c) had opined that wherein the Council has invoked Regulation 8(3)(1)(a), 8(3)(1)(b) and 8(3)(1)(c) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999, after an inspection by the MCI assessors, there was no Statutory provision either under the Act or under the Regulations authorizing the MCI to process further the applications of such medical colleges. As the said Regulation clearly barred the consideration of any compliance from such medical colleges.

Accordingly, the case of the medical college was re-considered by the Executive Committee of the MCI in its meeting held on 27.03.2015 along with the Legal Opinion dated 14.03.2015 rendered by the Ld. Additional Solicitor General. The Executive Committee of the MCI, in view of the fact that it had after considering the assessment report dated 29<sup>th</sup>& 30<sup>th</sup> December, 2014in its meeting held on 13.01.2015, had invoked Regulation 8(3)(1)(c) and 8(3)(1)(d)of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999, it was decided by the Council to reiterate its earlier decision to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew grant of permission for admission of 5<sup>th</sup> batch of MBBS students against increased intake from 100 to 150 students in the college for the academic year 2015-2016 and also not to consider the institute for renewal of permission / recognition of MBBS degree / processing the applications for postgraduate courses for two academic years i.e 2015-16 & 2016-17. It was also decided to issue show cause notice to the medical college as to why the recommendation for withdrawal of recognition of the course run by the institute be not be made for undergraduate and postgraduate courses which are recognized under Section 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956, alongwith a direction for stoppage of admissions in postgraduate courses. The Executive Committee further decided to refer the matter to the Ethics Committee of the Council in respect of the submission of fake Declaration Forms.

Accordingly, the abovementioned recommendation of the Council was communicated to the Central Govt. vide MCI letter dated 01.04.2015.

In order to verify the compliance as had been submitted by the college, a compliance verification assessment of the college for 100 MBBS seats with Postgraduate componenet was conducted by the assessors of the Council on 20.04.2015. The Compliance Verification Assessment report dated 20.05.2015 as well as the assessment report dated 29<sup>th</sup> & 30<sup>th</sup> December, 2014 was considered by the Executive Committee of the Council in the meeting held on 04.06.2015, wherein the Executive Committee in view of the gross deficiencies persisting in the medical college decided to reiterate its earlier decision to invoke Regulation 8(3)(1)(c) and 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulation, 1999. It was further decided to grant one final opportunity to the medical college to submit a compliance after rectifying the deficiencies within one month.

The above decision of the Council was communicated to the Central Govt. as well as the college vide MCI letter dated 11.06.2015. By the said letter, the Council also called upon the college to submit a detailed point wise compliance report on or before 11<sup>th</sup> July, 2016.

The Central Govt., after accepting the recommendation of the Council, vide its letter dated 15.06.2015 communicated its decision to not to grant permission for increase of intake from 100 to 150 MBBS for academic year 2015-16. The college was also directed not to admit any students as against the increased intake from 100 to 150 MBBS students and any admission for further batches could be done only after obtaining prior permission of the Central Govt..

In view of the above facts and circumstances, the Executive Committee thought it pertinent to mention that Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 deals with a situation where a medical college has tried to play fraud with the Council and the Central Govt. by submitting fake / forged documents in relation to teaching faculty employed by it. The conduct of a medical college for grant of permission. Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999categorically provides that, if during an inspection, a medical college is found to have employed teaching faculty on the basis of fake or forged documents, the Council must take a serious view of the conduct of the medical college and

medical college will not be considered for permission for the current and the ensuing academic sessions.

The Executive Committee considered it relevant to state that a medical college while submitting the Declaration Forms of the facultycertifies that they have verified the credentials as well as the experience certificates of the faculty members and are satisfied with the credentials. There is an endorsement to the effect that the Principal / Dean and the Head of the Department of the medical college had satisfied themselves with the correctness & veracity of the contents of the Declaration Form including the fact that the medical teachers were working as full time faculty members in the medical college. The faculty member provides the aforesaid declaration, the Head of the Department and the Dean / Principal of the medical college provide and endorsement certifying that they have satisfied themselves about the correctness / veracity of the contents of the declaration including the certificates / documents submitted by the faculty member. The Head of the Department and the Dean / Principal of the medical college further declare that in the event any information / document is found incorrect or false then in such an event they shall be equally responsible besides the faculty member for such mis-declaration or misleading the MCI.

The Hondple Supreme Court in its judgement dated 06.09.2013 in the case of Rohilkhand Medical College & Hospital, Bareilly Versus Medical Council of India & Another . (2013) 15 SCC 516, has categorically held that MCI can take action under Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 if prima facie it is established that fake teachers were shown by the College to seek permission from MCI.

The Executive Committee thought it relevant to point out that the Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt., in the case of National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur during an inspection observed that the college had mislead the Board of Governors regarding the teaching faculty as there was a variation in the number of faculty members found during the inspection of postgraduate and undergraduate courses of the medical college. The Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. after considering the case of the medical college issued show cause notice and after considering their reply found that the college had employed faculty with fake / forged documents and decided to debar the college from making admissions for increased admission capacity from 100 to 150 in MBBS course for the academic session 2012-13 & 2013-14 under Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999.

The National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur being aggrieved by the decision of the Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. dated 30.06.2012 had challenged the said decision before the Honople Supreme Court by way of W.P (C) No.272/2012. The Honople Supreme Court after hearing detailed submission on behalf of the college had declined to entertain the said petition therefore the medical college withdrew the same and the writ petition was dismissed as withdrawn vide order dated 10.07.2012without granting any liberty to college.

Thereafter National Institute of Medical Sciences, Jaipur had filed W.P (C) No.4509/2012 before the Hondple Delhi High Court challenging the same decision of the Board of Governors nominated by the Central Govt. dated 30.06.2012, when the Hondple Delhi High Court also declined to entertain the said petition which was disposed of vide order dated 30.07.2012 with certain directions.

In the present case, the Hearing Committee has ignored that the Council while evaluating the Declaration Forms of the faculty members found that one Dr. G.S. Gehlot, Asst. Professor of Medicine, who was presented as a faculty

member of the medical college during the inspection, had declared in the Declaration Form that he was not pursuing private practise. In fact, during the assessment conducted by the MCI, Dr. G.S. Gehlot had admitted that he was pursuing his private practise while being employed as a full . time faculty member of the medical college. The Ministry and the Hearing Committee has also ignored that the Principal of the medical college has verified and counter signed his Declaration Form &Experience Certificate to show his as regular / full- time faculty of the medical college and had tried to mislead the Central Govt as well as MCI.

The Executive Committee thought it relevant to point out that the college has sought to justify their aforesaid act by contending that the doctors employed in the college do not practise in their private clinics during college hours. It is further contended that pursuing private practise while being employed in a medical college as faculty is permissible in the State of Madhya Pradesh. The aforesaid contentions are incorrect and misconceived since under the IMC Act, 1956 and the Regulations framed thereunder, a full time faculty member of a medical college is prohibited from pursuing any private practise. Further, the provisions of the Act and the Regulations framed thereunder will have an overriding effect over any State Legislation as has been repeatedly held by the Hondple Supreme Court in a number of cases. In view thereof, even assuming there is any provision of law in the State of Madhya Pradesh which permits faculty members of a college to engage in private practise the same will be of no consequence as the IMC Act and the Regulations framed thereunder will override such provisions.

The Executive Committee of the Council further noted the judgement dated 27<sup>th</sup> April, 2016 of the Honople Supreme Court in Civil Appeal No. 4812 of 2016 . MCI Vs. Malla Reddy Instt. Of Medical Sciences & Orr., the operative part of which reads as under:-

"

6. The main submission advanced on behalf of the appellant MCI, is to the effect that although the Full Bench did not declare provisos (a) to (d) of Regulations 8(3)(1) ultra vires nor declared any need to read them down still on account of its observations that it is not open to MCI and/or Central Government to deny to the applicant/institute concerned, an opportunity to rectify the deficiencies falling within the ambit of the aforesaid provisos, the Division Bench, on receipt of answer to the reference, allowed the writ petitions with a direction to consider for grant of recognition in disregard of the relevant provisos. In other words, the grievance of the appellant is that the answer to the reference given by the Full Bench is being construed against the appellant as if the relevant provisos of Regulation 8(3)(1) of the Regulations have been declared ultra vires or have been read down so as not to cause any ill effect upon an applicant/institution covered by those provisos.

7. Parties are in agreement that the issue referred to the Full Bench did not require even reading down of the concerned Regulation, much less examining its vires and therefore, the conclusions being drawn by the High Court on account of the impugned judgment of the Full Bench is not warranted in law.

8. Since the Full Bench did not strike down the concerned provisos of Regulation 8(3)(1) nor directed for reading down their effect, its answers must be confined to the peculiar facts and further, in our view, the High Court on receipt of the reference erred in issuing directions contrary to the relevant provisos.

9. In the aforesaid facts and circumstances, it is clarified that the impugned Full Bench judgment does not adversely affect the provisos (a) to (d) of Regulation 8(3)(1) of the Regulations and the Division Bench erred in allowing the writ petitions by issuing directions contrary to the relevant provisos. Consequently, the final order passed by the High Court on the basis of the impugned judgment is held to be bad in law. 10. It is admitted at Bar that the adverse effect of the relevant provisos upon the writ petitioners is over for all practical purposes.

11. The learned senior counsel appearing for the appellant MCI has assured that no further action will be taken against the writ petitioners on the basis of lapses that attracted the concerned provisos and now the institutions belonging to the petitioners shall be subjected to inspection without taking any further punitive action for the past happenings.

12. It goes without saying that if the writ petitioners are so advised and if the need arises, they may challenge the constitutional validity of the concerned Regulations through any appropriate proceeding in future.

13. Both the appeals are allowed to the above extent, but with no order as to costs."

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Councilafter due discussion and deliberation and after considering the entire record pertaining to the medical college decided to reiterate its decision not to consider the institute for renewal of permission for two academic years i.e. that academic year (i.e. 2015-16) and the next academic year (i.e. 2016-2017) in view of invocation of Regulation 8(3)(1)(d) of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 since the medical college had presented faculty members on the basis of fake / forged documents including Declaration Forms in order to play fraud on the MCI as well as the Central Govt. so as to obtain renewal of permission.

# 183. Establishment of new medical college at Kolar Gold Field (KGF), Kolar District, Karnataka (Sambharam Institute of Medical Sciences & Research) by Sambharam Charitable Trust, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Kolar Gold Field (KGF), Kolar District, Karnataka (Sambharam Institute of Medical Sciences & Research) by Sambharam Charitable Trust, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the opinion of Law Officer which reads as under:

"The file of Undergraduate Section for establishment of new Medical College at Kolar, Karnataka by Sambharam Charitable Trust, Bangalore for establishment of new Medical College has been referred for my opinion in context of letter dated 11.05.16 of the Central Government. The Central Government has vide this letter which is quoted on pre-page note has informed that the applicant has been issued re-validated consent of affiliation for the year 2016-17 by the RGUHS and therefore the case has been recommended for review by MCI.

2. In this regard, the Hon'ble Supreme Court in its judgment dated 20.08.15 in Royal Medical Trust & Anr. vs. Union of India & Anr. reported in (2015) 10 SCC 19 has in paragraph 27 of the judgment laid down the mode and manner in which the application for establishment of new Medical College, renewal of permission of existing and increase in intake capacity has to be processed, at all stages. It reads as under:-

27. The MCI and the Central Government have been vested with monitoring powers under Section 10A and the Regulations. It is expected of these authorities to discharge their functions well within the statutory confines as well as in conformity with the Schedule to the Regulations. If there is inaction on their part or

non-observance of the time Schedule, it is bound to have adverse effect on all concerned. The affidavit filed on behalf of the Union of India shows that though the number of seats had risen, obviously because of permissions granted for establishment of new colleges, because of disapproval of renewal cases the resultant effect was net loss in terms of number of seats available for the academic year. It thus not only caused loss of opportunity to the students' community but at the same time caused loss to the society in terms of less number of doctors being available. The MCI and the Central Government must therefore show due diligence right from the day when the applications are received. The Schedule giving various stages and time limits must accommodate every possible eventuality and at the same time must comply with the requirements of observance of natural justice at various levels. In our view the Schedule must ideally take care of:

(A) <u>Initial assessment</u> of the application at the first level should comprise of checking necessary requirements such as essentiality certificate, consent for affiliation and physical features like land and hospital requirement. If an applicant fails to fulfill these requirements, the application on the face of it, would be incomplete and be rejected. Those who fulfill the basic requirements would be considered at the next stage.

5. Further, the Hon'ble Supreme Court in its recent judgment in the case of Medical Council of India vs. V.N. Public Health & Educational Trust & Anr. in Civil Appeal No. 3964 of 2016 (arising out of SLP (C) No. 5326 of 2016) dated 18.04.16 has held as under:

14. In this context, we may profitably refer to the decision in **D.Y. Patil Medical College v. Medical Council of India &Anr 2015** (10) SCC 51 wherein the controversy had arisen due to rejection of the application of the institution on the ground that Essentiality Certificate was not filed along with the application form. The Court dwelled upon the principles stated in

Educare Charitable Trust v. Union of India & Anr AIR 2014 SC 902: (2013) 16 SCC 474, Royal Medical Trust (supra) and various other decisions and, after analyzing the scheme of the Act, has held:-

"It is apparent from the aforesaid decision and the regulations that the application at the first instance is required to be complete and incomplete applications are liable to be rejected. Thereafter, there has to be an inspection and other stages of decision-making process."

15. The impugned order passed by the High Court is to be tested and adjudged on the anvil of the aforesaid authorities. The application for grant of approval was filed with the Essentiality Certificate which was a conditional one and, therefore, a defective one. It was not an Essentiality Certificate in law. In such a situation, the High Court could not have directed for consideration of the application for the purpose of the inspection. Such a direction, we are disposed to think, runs counter to the law laid down in **Educare Charitable Trust** (supra) and **Royal Medical Trust** (supra). We may further proceed to state that on the date of the application, the Essentiality Certificate was not in order. The Schedule prescribed by the MCI, which had been approved by this Court, is binding on all concerned. MCI cannot transgress it. The High Court could not have gone beyond the same and issued any direction for conducting an inspection for the academic year 2016-

17. Therefore, the directions issued by the learned single Judge and the affirmation thereof by the Division Bench are wholly unsustainable.

16. Consequently, the appeal is allowed and the judgments and orders passed by the High Court are set aside. It will be open to the Trust to submit a fresh application for the next academic year in consonance with the provisions of the Regulations of the MCI and as per the time Schedule; and in that event, it will be considered appropriately. In the facts and circumstances of the case, there shall be no order as to costs.

6. It is to be noted that in accordance with the time-schedule for establishment of new Medical College, an applicant is required to submit a complete application to the Central Government. An application without a valid consent of affiliation at the time of making an application is incomplete. Therefore, the submission of revalidated consent of affiliation by RGUHS issued on 02.05.2016, by the applicant at this juncture is of no consequence and cannot form the basis for any review. The law laid down by the Hon'ble Supreme Court as referred above is loud and clear to the effect that incomplete applications are liable to be rejected. Therefore, it would be appropriate to recommend to the Central Government to disapprove the application of Sambharam Charitable Trust, Bangalore for establishment of new Medical College as the consent of affiliation issued by the RGUHS on 02.05.16 cannot be considered for processing the application for academic year 2016-17."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Kolar Gold Field (KGF), Kolar District, Karnataka (Sambharam Institute of Medical Sciences & Research) by Sambharam Charitable Trust, Bangalore to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

#### 184. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Gurawar, Jhajjar, Haryana</u> by Amma Chandravati Educational & Charitable Trust, New Delhi with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Pandit B.D Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak, Haryana u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Gurawar, Jhajjar, Haryana by Amma Chandravati Educational & Charitable Trust, New Delhi with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Pandit B.D Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak, Haryana u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Councilperused the opinion of Law officer which reads as under:

"The file of Undergraduate Section for establishment of new Medical College at Gurawar, Jhajjar, Haryana by Amma Chandrawati Educational and Charitable Trust, New Delhi for establishment of new Medical College has been referred for my opinion in context of Central Government letter dated 11.05.16. The Central Government has in view of the compliance and documents furnished by the college, recommended for review by Medical Council of India.

2. It may recalled that the Council vide communication dated 31.01.2016 has recommended to the Central Government to disapprove the application as the applicant had failed to meet the qualifying criteria under Regulations 3(2)(5) of Establishment of New Medical College Regulations, 1999 pertaining to the person owing and managing a hospital of not lets then 300 beds.

3. In this regard, it may be noted the Hon'ble Supreme Court in its judgment dated 20.08.15 in Royal Medical Trust & Anr. vs. Union of India & Anr. reported in (2015) 10 SCC 19 has in paragraph 27 of the judgment laid down the mode and manner in which the application for establishment of new Medical College, renewal of permission of existing and increase in intake capacity has to be processed, at all stages. It reads as under:-

27. The MCI and the Central Government have been vested with monitoring powers under Section 10A and the Regulations. It is expected of these authorities to discharge their functions well within the statutory confines as well as in conformity with the Schedule to the Regulations. If there is inaction on their part or non-observance of the time Schedule, it is bound to have adverse effect on all concerned. The affidavit filed on behalf of the Union of India shows that though the number of seats had risen, obviously because of permissions granted for establishment of new colleges, because of disapproval of renewal cases the resultant effect was net loss in terms of number of seats available for the academic year. It thus not only caused loss of opportunity to the students' community but at the same time caused loss to the society in terms of less number of doctors being available. The MCI and the Central Government must therefore show due diligence right from the day when the applications are received. The Schedule giving various stages and time limits must accommodate every possible eventuality and at the same time must comply with the requirements of observance of natural justice at various levels. In our view the Schedule must ideally take care of:

(A) <u>Initial assessment</u> of the application at the first level should comprise of checking necessary requirements such as essentiality certificate, consent for affiliation and physical features like land and hospital requirement. If an applicant fails to fulfill these requirements, the application on the face of it, would be incomplete and be rejected. Those who fulfill the basic requirements would be considered at the next stage.

5. Further, the Hon'ble Supreme Court in its recent judgment in the case of Medical Council of India vs. V.N. Public Health & Educational Trust & Anr. in Civil Appeal No. 3964 of 2016 (arising out of SLP (C) No. 5326 of 2016) dated 18.04.16 has held as under:

14. In this context, we may profitably refer to the decision in D.Y. Patil Medical College v. Medical Council of India &Anr 2015 (10) SCC 51 wherein the controversy had arisen due to rejection of the application of the institution on the ground that Essentiality Certificate was not filed along with the application form. The Court dwelled upon the principles stated in

*Educare Charitable Trust v. Union of India & Anr AIR 2014 SC 902: (2013) 16 SCC 474, Royal Medical Trust (supra) and various* 

other decisions and, after analysing the scheme of the Act, has held:-

"It is apparent from the aforesaid decision and the regulations that the application at the first instance is required to be complete and incomplete applications are liable to be rejected. Thereafter, there has to be an inspection and other stages of decision-making process."

15. The impugned order passed by the High Court is to be tested and adjudged on the anvil of the aforesaid authorities. The application for grant of approval was filed with the Essentiality Certificate which was a conditional one and, therefore, a defective one. It was not an Essentiality Certificate in law. In such a situation, the High Court could not have directed for consideration of the application for the purpose of the inspection. Such a direction, we are disposed to think, runs counter to the law laid down in Educare Charitable Trust (supra) and Royal Medical Trust (supra). We may further proceed to state that on the date of the application, the Essentiality Certificate was not in order. The Schedule prescribed by the MCI, which had been approved by this Court, is binding on all concerned. MCI cannot transgress it. The High Court could not have gone beyond the same and issued any direction for conducting an inspection for the academic year 2016-

17. Therefore, the directions issued by the learned single Judge and the affirmation thereof by the Division Bench are wholly unsustainable.

16. Consequently, the appeal is allowed and the judgments and orders passed by the High Court are set aside. It will be open to the Trust to submit a fresh application for the next academic year in consonance with the provisions of the Regulations of the MCI and as per the time Schedule; and in that event, it will be considered appropriately. In the facts and circumstances of the case, there shall be no order as to costs.

It is to be noted that in accordance with the time-schedule for 6. establishment of new Medical College, an applicant is required to submit a complete application to the Central Government. An applicant is required to own and manage a hospital of 300 beds at the time of making application. The Assessment conducted on 12-13 January 2016 and the recommendation of the Executive Committee dated 31.01.16 to the Central Government brings out that the applicant has failed to meet the qualifying criteria regarding owning and managing Hospital of 300 beds at the time of making application. Therefore, on this count of Hospital alone, apart from the deficiencies as stated in the earlier communication of the Council the application is liable to be rejected. The law laid down by the Hon'ble Supreme Court as referred above is loud and clear to the effect that Hospital is part of qualifying criteria and thus when during assessment Hospital is found to be under construction/development the application becomes incomplete and such applications are liable to be rejected. Therefore, it would be appropriate to recommend to the Central Government to disapprove the application of for establishment of new Medical College by Amma Chandrawati Educational and Charitable Trust, New Delhi as it has failed to fulfill the qualifying criteria of owning and managing 300 bed Hospital at the time of making application."

Further , the Committee also observed that the Council Office has also requested the State Government of Haryana to intimate as to how the State Govt. has issued the Essentiality Certificate dated 08/09/2014 in favour of the

applicant when the hospital is still under construction. The Reply of the State Govt. in this regard is still awaited.

In view of above and as the applicant has failed to meet the qualifying criteria u/s 3(2)(5) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 pertaining to the person owning and managing a hospital of not less than 300 bedswhile making an application, the Executive Committee of the Councildecided to reiterate its earlier decision to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Gurawar, Jhajjar, Haryana by Amma Chandravati Educational & Charitable Trust, New Delhi under Pandit B.D Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak, Haryana to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

# 185. Extension of Service of Dr. Seema Madan.

Read: the matter with regard to extension of Service of Dr. Seema Madan.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to extend the contractual services of Dr. Seema Madan, Consultant (PG) for a further period of six months.

#### 186. Extension of Service of Sh. Praveen Rawat.

Read: the matter with regard to extension of Service of Sh. Praveen Rawat.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to extend the contractual services of Sh. Praveen Rawat for a further period of six months.

### 187. <u>Status of reallocation of students of Sardar Rajas MCH & RC Jaring,</u> <u>Kalahandi – Permission for one time increase of seats of 3 medical</u> <u>colleges.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to status of reallocation of students of Sardar Rajas MCH & RC Jaring, Kalahandi . Permission for one time increase of seats of 3 medical colleges.

The Executive Committee of the Councilperused opinion from Council Advocate which reads as under:

"I have perused the file and the documents forwarded to me. In the present case on the failure on the part of Sardar Rajas Medical College to continue the MBBS course, the Hon'ble Supreme Court vide order dated 12.01.2016 had directed that the 124 students pursuing MBBS at Sardar Rajas Medical College shall be transferred and admitted in three private medical colleges, namely, Hi Tech Medical College, IMS & SUM and KIMS Medical College. In view of the above directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court, the students of Sardar Rajas Medical College have already been transferred. Since the transfer of the students was in pursuance of the Order passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court, I am of the view that the MCI may issue appropriate directions that the degree of the 124 students transferred from Sardar Rajas Medical College shall be recognized medical qualification once they complete their MBBS course as well as internship as per the provisions of the IMC Act, 1956 and the Regulations made their under from their respective medical colleges."

The Committee decided to approve the opinion from Council Advocate and inform State Govt. accordingly.

Further the Committee also decided to request the State Govt. of Odisha to initiate proceeding for revocation of Bank Guarantee furnished by the institute.

## 188. <u>Establishment of New Medical College at Dehradun, Uttarakhand by</u> Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust, Dehradun, Uttarakhand u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of New Medical College at Dehradun, Uttarakhand by Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust, Dehradun, Uttarakhand u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Councilperused the opinion of law Officer which reads as under:

"The file of Undergraduate Section for establishment of new Medical College at Dehradun, Uttrakhand by Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust, Dehradun for establishment of new Medical College has been referred for my opinion in context of Central Government letter dated 11.05.16. The Central Government has referred back the matter to Medical Council of India to verify the land deed and property card of the trust and with consultation of Legal Cell called upon the Council to take further suitable action.

2. In this regard the representation dated 06.05.2016 of the authorized representative of the Principal and Dean of the college has been also forwarded. The applicant has refuted the Council objections that a part of land that the applicant Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust is claiming to be owned and possessed by it is in the name of Sri Sri 1008 Narayan Swami Charitable Trust. It has stated that the land is either in the name of Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust and Sri Sri 1008 Narayan Swami Charitable Trust belongs to the applicant. In this regard reliance is placed on the certificates dated 16.12.2014 of Tehsildar (Enclosure No. 3 of the representation) and 17.11.2015 of the District Magistrate (Enclosure No. 9 of the representation).

3. The first certificate of Tehsildar contains details in respect of 44 pieces of land in Table – A and Eight pieces of land in Table – B. Nine pieces of land in Table – A are shown to be registered in the name of Sri Sri 1008 Narayan Swami Charitable Trust. It also contains a line to the effect that the land is registered in the name of Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust and in the name of its previous name Sri Sri 1008 Narayan Swami Charitable Trust. Further in the letter dated 17.11.2015 of the District Magistrate that is addressed to Secretary, Medical Education, Government of Uttrakhand, details of land are provided in a Table as under:

Sr. No.	Name of the Village	Ownership as per records	Area (in Hect.)
1.	Kotda Santaur	Sri Sri 1008 Narayan Swami Charitable Trust	2.6058
		Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust	2.3161
2.	Kolhupani Jhajhra	Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust	0.855
3.	Jhajhra	Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust	2.3335
		Total	8.1108Hect.

4. Both above certificates are clear to the effect that ownership in respect of 2.6058 Hectare of land is vested with Sri Sri 1008 Narain

Swami Charitable Trust. Thus, partly the land is registered in the name of another Trust.

5. Further, the applicant has also enclosed certificate dated 01.03.2016 issued by the District Magistrate, Dehradun and addressed to the Administrative Officer of the applicant Trust wherein the table in respect of land in the certificate issued by the Tehsildar referred above are reproduced. Further the District Magistrate has also stated in his letter that the Administrative Officer of the applicant had appeared on 27.02.2016 in his office and produced before him registered "Amended Trust Deed" dated 15.09.2011 In paragraph 6(A) of this trust deed it is stated that the name of Sri Sri 1008 Sri Narain Swami Charitable Trust has been changed to Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust. Therefore, as per amended trust deed dated 15.09.2011 the total extent of land in the name of the trust is 8.1108 Hectare or 20 Acre of land. Furthermore, the said certification also states that as per revenue records the land is free from any encumbrance.

The Council office is also in receipt of complaint dated 06.05.2016 6. made by Sh. Manish Verma addressed to Joint Secretary, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi with copies marked to President, Secretary, Medical Council of India and Director, CBI. The complaint contains various allegations and as regards land there is reference that the dispute between the two trusts is pending in the court of Hon'ble District Judge, Dehradun. Further, it is alleged that till date any application for mutation in respect of land registered in the name of Sri Sri 1008 Narain Swami Charitable Trust has not been made by the trustees of Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Trust. The complainant has also annexed copy of note sheet dated 27.01.2016 in which the Joint Secretary, Home and Medical Education Department Govt. of Uttrakhand has stated that 2.6058 Hectare land is not entered in revenue records in the name of Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust. It is in the name of Sri Sri 1008 Narain Swami Charitable Trust. Further, in the said note sheet there is a reference to Suit No. 60/2012 between the two trusts is pending in the Hon'ble District Court.

7. The Council is a respondent in the litigation pending in the Hon'ble District Court. It is represented by Sh. Rajpal Singh, Advocate who has informed that the case between the two trusts is as on date pending.

8. After perusal of the above documents, it is evident that land to the extent of 2.6058 Hectare is registered in the name of Sri Sri 1008 Narain Swami Charitable Trust i.e. evident from the certificate issued by Tehsildar as well as District Magistrate. The contention of college that the Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust owns the land of Sri Sri 1008 Narain Swami Charitable Trust is unacceptable in view of the pending litigation between the parties as well as the fact, it has till date not been entered in the revenue records in the name of Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust.

9. In this regard, it may be noted the Hon'ble Supreme Court in its judgment dated 20.08.15 in Royal Medical Trust & Anr. vs. Union of India & Anr. reported in (2015) 10 SCC 19 has in paragraph 27 of the judgment laid down the mode and manner in which the application for establishment of new Medical College, renewal of permission of existing and increase in intake capacity has to be processed, at all stages. It reads as under:-

27. The MCI and the Central Government have been vested with monitoring powers under Section 10A and the Regulations. It is expected of these authorities to discharge their functions well within the statutory confines as well as in conformity with the Schedule to the Regulations. If there is inaction on their part or non-observance of the time Schedule, it is bound to have adverse effect on all concerned. The affidavit filed on behalf of the Union of India shows that though the number of seats had risen, obviously because of permissions granted for establishment of new colleges, because of disapproval of renewal cases the resultant effect was net loss in terms of number of seats available for the academic year. It thus not only caused loss of opportunity to the students' community but at the same time caused loss to the society in terms of less number of doctors being available. The MCI and the Central Government must therefore show due diligence right from the day when the applications are received. The Schedule giving various stages and time limits must accommodate every possible eventuality and at the same time must comply with the requirements of observance of natural justice at various levels. In our view the Schedule must ideally take care of:

(A) <u>Initial assessment</u> of the application at the first level should comprise of checking necessary requirements such as essentiality certificate, consent for affiliation and physical features like land and hospital requirement. If an applicant fails to fulfill these requirements, the application on the face of it, would be incomplete and be rejected. Those who fulfill the basic requirements would be considered at the next stage.

10. Further, the Hon'ble Supreme Court in its recent judgment in the case of Medical Council of India vs. V.N. Public Health & Educational Trust & Anr. in Civil Appeal No. 3964 of 2016 (arising out of SLP (C) No. 5326 of 2016) dated 18.04.16 has held as under:

14. In this context, we may profitably refer to the decision in D.Y. Patil Medical College v. Medical Council of India &Anr 2015 (10) SCC 51 wherein the controversy had arisen due to rejection of the application of the institution on the ground that Essentiality Certificate was not filed along with the application form. The Court dwelled upon the principles stated inEducare Charitable Trust v. Union of India & Anr AIR 2014 SC 902: (2013) 16 SCC 474, Royal Medical Trust (supra) and various other decisions and, after analyzing the scheme of the Act, has held:-

"It is apparent from the aforesaid decision and the regulations that the application at the first instance is required to be complete and incomplete applications are liable to be rejected. Thereafter, there has to be an inspection and other stages of decision-making process."

15. The impugned order passed by the High Court is to be tested and adjudged on the anvil of the aforesaid authorities. The application for grant of approval was filed with the Essentiality Certificate which was a conditional one and, therefore, a defective one. It was not an Essentiality Certificate in law. In such a situation, the High Court could not have directed for consideration of the application for the purpose of the inspection. Such a direction, we are disposed to think, runs counter to the law laid down in Educare Charitable Trust (supra) and Royal Medical Trust (supra). We may further proceed to state that on the date of the application, the Essentiality Certificate was not in order. The Schedule prescribed by the MCI, which had been approved by this Court, is binding on all concerned. MCI cannot transgress it. The High Court could not have gone beyond the same and issued any direction for conducting an inspection for the academic year 2016-

17. Therefore, the directions issued by the learned Single Judge and the affirmation thereof by the Division Bench are wholly unsustainable.

16. Consequently, the appeal is allowed and the judgments and orders passed by the High Court are set aside. It will be open to the Trust to

submit a fresh application for the next academic year in consonance with the provisions of the Regulations of the MCI and as per the time Schedule; and in that event, it will be considered appropriately. In the facts and circumstances of the case, there shall be no order as to costs.

11. It is to be noted that in accordance with the time-schedule for establishment of new Medical College, an applicant is required to submit a complete application to the Central Government. An applicant is required to own and possess clear and undisputed title to the land. In this case the facts as stated as above brings out the title is not clear and it is disputed.

12. Therefore, in my considered opinion the applicant has failed to fulfill the qualifying criteria regarding land as required in accordance with the Regulations. Hence, on this count of the application is liable to be rejected. The law laid down by the Hon'ble Supreme Court as referred above is loud and clear to the effect that Land is part of qualifying criteria and thus when the title of land is not clear and disputed the application becomes incomplete and such applications are liable to be rejected. Therefore, it would be appropriate to recommend to the Central Government to disapprove the application of for establishment of new Medical College by Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust as it has failed to fulfill the qualifying criteria of owning and possessing land as required by Regulations at the time of making application.

13. It is also brought to notice that the applicant trust has filed writ petition bearing no. 1125 of 2016 before the Hon'ble High Court of Uttrakhand. In this petition the petitioner has inter-alia prayed for directions to conduct assessment by independent observers appointed by the Hon'ble High Court and processing of its application uninfluenced by complaints regarding land. Sh. Parikshit Saini, Standing Counsel of Medical Council of India in the Hon'ble High Court of Uttrakhand has telephonically informed of the order passed on 12.05.2016, that reads as under:

"Learned counsel for respondent no. 2-MCI has come up with the instructions that the MCI will hold the meeting, and then decide what to do with the directions issued by the Central Government vide letter dated 06.05.2016 in respect of the petitioner.

The only direction, which the Court deems fit is that the decision, if any taken up MCI shall be communicated to the Union of India as well as to the petitioner, at an earliest possible, keeping in view the time schedule prescribed by the authority concerned.

Let a certified copy of this order be supplied to the learned counsel for the petitioner, today itself, on payment of usual charges."

14. In view of the above order of the Hon'ble High Court, the decision taken by the Executive Committee on the directions of Central Government is required to be communicated to the Central Government as well as to the petitioner keeping in view the time schedule regarding processing of application.

The Executive Committee of the Councildecided to approve the opinion of law officer and it was further decided to reiterate earlier decision to return the application as the applicant has failed to meet the qualifying criteria u/s 3(2)(2) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 for establishment of a new medical college at Dehradun, Uttarakhand by Dr. Jagat Narain Subharti Charitable Trust, Dehradun, Uttarakhand to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

# 189. Establishment of new medical college at Gondia, Maharashtra by Govt. of Maharashtra with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Gondia, Maharashtra by Govt. of Maharashtra with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the representation dated 12/05/2016 from the Dean, Govt. Medical College, Gondia and noted that at its earlier meeting dated 28.04.2016 the Council had already returned the application recommending disapproval of the scheme for establishment of new medical college at Gondia, Maharashtra by Govt. of Maharashtra with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 vide communication dt.30.04.2016. The Committee further noted that the request/representation of the college had not been forwarded through the Central Government and therefore decided to reiterate its earlier decision.

# 190. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Paripally Kollam Distt.</u> <u>Kerala (ESIC Medical College, Paripally, Kollam) by Govt. of Kerala</u> <u>u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Paripally Kollam Distt. Kerala (ESIC Medical College, Paripally, Kollam) by Govt. of Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that the Council had received a D.O. letter dated 2<sup>nd</sup> May, 2016 from Sh. Ali R. Rizvi, Joint Secretary, Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, New Delhi stating therein as under:-

‰his is regarding recommendations of MCI for disapproving the schemes for establishment of new Medical Colleges at Paripally, Kollam, Kerala and at Coimbatore, Tamilnadu by the respective State Governments.

MCI vide its recommendation dated 31.12.2015 reiterated its earlier decision to return the application for establishment of new Medical College at paripally, Kollam, Kerala (ESIC Medical College) for the academic year 2016-17 by Government of Kerala citing the reason that the Essentiality Certificate and other documents submitted at the time of application were in the name of ESIC Medical College but not in the name of the applicant i.e. Govt. of Kerala adding that the fresh Essentiality Certificate and Consent of Affiliation in the name of the present application were issued after the last date for submission of applications. As per the documents available on our record, the Govt. of Kerala approved the final terms and conditions of take over and Memorandum of Understanding(MoU) to be executed between the ESIC and State Government vide their G.O. dated 11.09.2015, which was prior to the date for submission of UG applications for 2016-17 i.e. 15.09.2015 (extended date). Since, this is a case involving transfer of Institution from ESIC to State Government, the Central Government is of the opinion that the documents standing in the name of ESIC at the time of application needs to be accepted for considering the application of the State Government to whom the Institution has been transferred and subsequently revised Essentiality Certificate and Consent of Affiliation have been issued.

In case of the application for establishment of new Medical College at Coimbatore, Tamilnadu for the academic year 2016-17 by Government of Tamilnadu, MCI vide its recommendation dated 01.03.2016 returned the application taking the stand that the application was incomplete at the first instance though MCI earlier conducted inspection at the proposed Medical College on 18<sup>th</sup>& 19<sup>th</sup> December, 2015 and conveyed deficiencies to the Central Government vide letter dated 31.12.2015. The recommendation dated 01.03.2016 was sent after the Central Government recommended to MCI for review since the deficiencies of faculty and residents was not very high and the MoU was signed between ESIC and the State Government on 11.01.2016. From the information provided by State Government, it is observed that on the request of Ministry of Labour & Employment, the State Government conveyed its consent for taking over the ESIC Medical College project in Coimbatore and issued necessary Essentiality Certificate. It is, therefore, clear that the State Government was vested with the required authority to run the Medical College and the hospital at the time of making applications. though, formal MoU was signed at a It clearly indicate the date of commencement as later date. 01.07.2015, the date which was much prior to last date for making applications. Subsequently, Hon'ble Prime Minister inaugurated and handed over the ESIC Medical College project to the Government of Tamilnadu on 02.02.2016.

It needs to be mentioned that the schemes were submitted by the State governments consequent to a decision taken by the ESIC to hand over ongoing Medical Colleges and other Medical Education Institutions to the State Governments who are willing to take over such institutions. It also needs to be appreciated that the transfer was between a Central Government organisation and State Governments where decision were taken before closing date of applications, though there may be some delay in completion of formalities. The Central Government is of the opinion that recommending disapproval by MCI in these two cases merely on technical grounds is not reasonable.

<u>I shall be grateful if you could cause re-consideration of both</u> the schemes, after inspection wherever necessary."

The Executive Committee of the Council further noted that in view of the above letter, the President had decided to assess the college immediately since the time schedule was nearing completion.

The Executive Committee of the Council ratified the above decision of the President and considered theassessment report (11<sup>th</sup>& 12<sup>th</sup> May, 2016)and noted the following:-

- 1. Dean, medical Superintendent are not appointed.
- 2. Deficiency of faculty is 65.51 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Shortage of residents is 97.70 % as detailed in the report.
- 4. OPD attendance is 276 on day of assessment which is inadequate.
- 5. Bed occupancy is 30 % on day of assessment.
- 6. OPD: Injection room is common for males/females. Dressing room is common for males/females.
- 7. Audiometry & Speech therapy are not available.
- 8. Wards: Demonstration room in some wards are smaller than required. Pantry is not available in some wards.
- 9. There was only 1 Major & 1 Minor operation on day of assessment.
- There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.

188

- 11. Workload of Histopathology, Microbiology investigations is NIL on day of assessment.
- 12. MRD: it is manual ICD X classification of diseases is not maintained.
- 13. Casualty: Separate Casualty for O.G. is not available. Mobile unit is not functional.
- 14. Central Clinical laboratory is not under the control of any department.
- 15. O.T.s: Only 2 O.T.s are functional against requirement of 4.
- 16. ICUs: ICCU, SICU, PICU/NICU are not available.
- 17. Labour Room: Eclampsia room, Septic labour room are not available.
- Radiodiagnosis department: NIL Mobile X-ray unit is available. Only 1 USG machine is available against 2 required.
- 19. Blood Bank: It is not functional.
- 20. ETO Sterilizer is not available.
- 21. Intercom is not available.
- 22. Lecture Theaters: One Lecture Theater is not furnished. Audiovisual aids are not displayed.
- 23. Central library: It is not air-conditioned. Books available are 1,153 against requirement of 1,500. No Indian journals are available.
- 24. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls: They are partially furnished & nonfunctional.
- 25. Central Photography Section: Staff & Equipment are not available.
- 26. StudentsqHostels: They are partially furnished. Toilets are nonfunctional. Visitorsqroom & Study room are not functional.
- 27. ResidentsqHostel: It is not furnished.
- 28. NursesqHostel: It is not furnished.
- 29. Residential Quarters: They are not ready for occupancy.
- 30. Gender Harassment Committee: It is not constituted.
- 31. Nursing staff: Only 84 Nurses are available against 175 required.
- 32. Paramedical & Non-teaching staff: Only 5 paramedical & Non-teaching staff are available against 101 required.
- 33. Website: Information provided is sketchy. Toll free number to report ragging is not available.
- 34. Preclinical departments of Anatomy, physiology, Biochemistry are not functional.
- 35. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Paripally Kollam Distt. Kerala (ESIC Medical College, Paripally, Kollam) by Govt. of Kerala to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

### 191. Establishment of new medical college at Thiruvananthapuram, Kerala by Govt. of Kerala with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Kerala University of Health & Allied Scieces, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act,1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Thiruvananthapuram, Kerala by Govt. of Kerala with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Kerala University of Health & Allied Scieces, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act,1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Council had already returned the application of new medical college at Thiruvananthapuram by Govt. of Kerala vide Council letter dated 30.04.2016. The Executive Committee of the Council further noted the letter dated 13<sup>th</sup> May, 2016 received from the Central Govt., Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi stating therein as under:-

"I am directed to refer to the Council's letter No. MCI-34(E-44)/20150 Med. 105953 dated 30.04.2016 thereby the Council has recommended the Ministry to disapprove the scheme of Establishment of New Medical College (100 seats) at Thiruvananthapuram, Kerala by the Govt. of Kerala for the academic year 2016-17 and to say that the Director, Medical Education, Govt. of Kerala vide its letter dated 12.05.2016 (copy enclosed) has informed that the State Government has created Faculty, Residents, Infrastructures and other facilities for the proposed Medical College and they are ready to give the Undertaking in this regard.

2. The MCI is therefore, requested to re-consider the scheme of Establishment of New Medical College (100 seats) at Thiruvananthapuram, Kerala by the Govt. of Kerala for the academic year 2016-17 in light of submission made by the Director, Medical Education, Govt. of Kerala and make recommendation to the Central Govt."

In view of undertaking received from the Secretary (Health), Govt. of Kerala dated 13.05.2016, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Thiruvananthapuram, Kerala by Govt. of Kerala with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Kerala University of Health & Allied Scieces, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

# 192. Establishment of new medical college at Sanath Nagar, Hyderabad, Telangana by ESIC, New Delhi with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Sanath Nagar, Hyderabad, Telangana by ESIC, New Delhi with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter dated 13<sup>th</sup> May, 2016 received from the Central Govt., Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi stating therein as under:-

"I am directed to refer to the Council's letter No. MCI-34(41)(E-75)/2015/-Med. 105992, dated 30.04.2016 thereby ;recommending this Ministry to disapprove the scheme of Establishment of new Medical College (100 seats) at Santhnagar, Hyderabad by the ESI Corporation for the academic year 2016-17. The Ministry has received a D.O. letter dated 13.05.2016 (Copy enclosed) from Shri Deepak Kumar, Director General, ESIC, New Delhi informing that the ESI Corporation has met the requirement of Faculty, Residents, Infrastructures and other facilities for the proposed Medical College at Sanathnagar.

2. The MCI is therefore, requested to re-consider the scheme of Establishment of New Medical College (100 seats) at Santhnagar, by the ESIC for the academic year 2016-17 in light of submission made by Shri Deepak Kumar, Director General, ESIC, New Delhi and make recommendation to the Central Govt."

The Executive Committee of the Council further noted that at its earlier meeting dated 28.04.2016 had decided as under:-

"The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (11<sup>th</sup> April, 2016), previous assessment report (8<sup>th</sup> & 9<sup>th</sup> Jan., 2016) alongwith additional information received from the Deputy Medical Commissioner, ESI Corporation HQ Office, New Delhi dated 18.4.2016 and noted the following:

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 74 %.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 42 %.
- 3. MRD: It is partly computerized.
- 4. Nursing staff: Only 68 Nurses are available against requirement of 175.
- 5. College Council is not yet constituted.
- 6. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Sanath Nagar, Hyderabad, Telangana by ESIC, New Delhi under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Sanath Nagar, Hyderabad, Telangana by ESIC, New Delhi under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

# Dr. Reena Nayyar recused herself from the meeting

## 193. <u>Matter with regard to visit of Dr.P.Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary</u> (U/s) without taking No Objection Certificate from MCI.

Read: the matter with regard to visit of Dr.P.Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary (U/s) without taking No Objection Certificate from MCI.

The Executive Committee of the Council discussed the reply furnished by Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary (U/s) in response to show cause notice issued to him on 22.04.2016. The Committee noted that Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary (U/s) has filed his reply vide letter dated 02.05.2016. The Committee being the Disciplinary Authority considered his reply and concluded that his reply/explanation is not satisfactory at all and he did not bother to take prior approval from CBI and MCI and went to USA. His arguments are not convincing to grant him ex-post facto approval. He has violated CCS (CCA) Rules for leaving the country without permission of the Medical Council of India. In view of this, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to initiate disciplinary proceedings under Rule 14 of CCS (CCA) 1965.

### 194. <u>Complaint of Sh.Hemant Kalra regarding the appointment of</u> <u>Dr.Davinder Kumar to the post of Deputy Secretary in the office of</u> <u>MCI.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to complaint of Sh.Hemant Kalra regarding the appointment of Dr.Davinder Kumar to the post of Deputy Secretary in the office of MCI.

The Executive Committee of the Council being the disciplinary authority, deliberated the matter at length, the reply filed by Dr. Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (U/s) in response to the Show cause notice issued to him. After considering the detailed facts of the case and all the relevant documents, The Executive Committee of the Council decided to initiate disciplinary proceedings under Rule 14 of the CCS (CCA) 1965 against him.

Read: the matter with regard to reimbursement of unauthorized All India LTC Claim by Dr.Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (U/s).

The Executive Committee of the Council being competent authority/ disciplinary authority, deliberated at length the details of the case relating to unauthorized claim/reimbursement of All India LTC claim by Dr. Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (U/s) and the reply furnished by him vide letter dated 19.04.2016 in response to the Show cause notice issued to him by the MCI on 10.03.2016. The reply furnished by Dr. Davinder Kumar is not supported by any Rule and his arguments are devoid of any force and merits, rejection. After considering all the documents, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to initiate disciplinary proceedings under Rule 14 of CCS (CCA) 1965 against Dr. Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (U/s).

### 196. <u>Migration of Shri Harmanjot Singh from Adesh Institute of Medical</u> <u>Sciences and Research, Bhatinda to Govt. Medical College, Patiala.</u>

Read: the matter of migration of Shri Harmanjot Singh from Adesh Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Bhatinda to Govt. Medical College, Patiala.

The Executive Committee of the Council deliberated the matter in detail regarding the migration of Sh. Harmanjot Singh from Adesh Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Bhatinda to Govt. Medical College, Patiala and the role of two senior officers of the Council in the case i.e. Dr. Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (U/s) and Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Additional Secretary (U/s), letter received from CVC and other relevant documents of the case and decided to initiate disciplinary proceedings under Rule 14 of the CCS (CCA) 1965 against both the officers. The Executive Committee of the Council also decided that first stage advice of CVC may also be obtained.

# Dr. Reena Nayyar re-joined the meeting

### 197. <u>Approval of Minutes of the Departmental Promotion Committee for</u> <u>considering promotion to the post of Joint Secretary.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to approval of Minutes of the Departmental Promotion Committee for considering promotion to the post of Joint Secretary.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the following minutes of the Departmental Promotion Committee meeting held on 13.05.2016 for considering promotion to the post of Joint Secretary:-

"The Committee after going through the Recruitment Rules of the Council for the post of Joint Secretary noted that the post is to be filled by way of promotion from the feeder grade *i.e.* Deputy Secretary with 5 years regular service failing which by direct recruitment. The Committee also perused the other documents submitted.

#### List of eligible candidates:

The Committee after scrutiny found that only one (01) officer is eligible against the three (03) vacant posts:

(i) Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj, Deputy Secretary (U/s)

The Committee perused the DoPT OM prescribing the benchmark for promotion to the post which is "Very Good". In all 6 ACR's are to be taken into account i.e. from 2010-11 to 2015-16.

#### Candidate Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj

It has been observed that Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj has been placed under suspension and as per rules the Govt. Servant who has been placed under suspension, the DPC shall assess the suitability of Govt. Servant and the proceedings of the DPC should be kept in the sealed cover.

Therefore, the findings of DPC in respect of Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj be placed under sealed cover.

The Committee further observed that as Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj is under suspension and disciplinary proceedings have been initiated against her and the finding of the Committee are placed in sealed cover. The MCI can fill the post by direct recruitment after giving advertisement. However, a permanent vacant should be reserved for Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj as her case is placed in sealed cover.'

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to issue an advertisement for the post of Joint Secretary at the earliest.

The Committee further decided to constitute a Selection Committee comprising of the following members for the posts of Joint Secretary:-

- 1. President
- 2. Vice President
- 3. Dr. G.B. Gupta
- 4. Dr. K.K. Gupta
- 5. Dr. V.N. Jindal

The Committee further decided to constitute a Selection Committee comprising of the following members for the posts of Deputy Secretary:-

- 1. President
- 2. Vice President
- Dr. G.B. Gupta
   Dr. K.K. Gupta
- 5. Dr. V.N. Jindal

#### Establishment of new medical college at Chittoor, Andhra Pradesh 198. by Apollo Hospitals Educational & Research Foundation, Telangana with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Chittoor, Andhra Pradesh by Apollo Hospitals Educational & Research Foundation, Telangana with an annual intake of 150 MBBS students under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the fax letter dated 13<sup>th</sup> May, 2016 of the Central Government, Ministry of Health & F.W. for reconsideration of the case on the basis of inspection conducted by MCI as well as Ministryos letters No. 12012/577/2015-ME-I(Pt.3 & pt.ii) dated 16.03.2016 and 05.04.2016 and decided to reiterate its earlier decision dated 28.04.2016 which is as under:-

"......The Executive Committee also perused the opinion of Law Officer which reads as under:

"The file of M/S. Apollo Hospitals Educational and Research Foundation for establishment of new Medical College has been referred for my opinion on the issue as to whether the MOU entered into between the Government of Andhra Pradesh and the Apollo Hospitals Educational and Research Foundation is as per the requirement of MCI Regulations.

In this regard, it may be noted that the terms and conditions that terms 2. and conditions that has to form part and parcel of the MOU between the Appropriate Government and Person/Agency has been set out in the Amendment to the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 notified in the official gazette on 14.01.2016 and 02.02.2016.

3. The copy of the MOU regarding utilization of Hospital of the State Government that has been submitted with the Compliance Report furnished by the College and received through Central Government's letter dated 12.04.16 as noted on pre-page note 16 are Annexure 3 (a) and 3 (b). The documents that have been submitted are:

(i) Government of Andhra Pradesh, Abstract – Permission for utilizing the facilities of Government District Hospital, Chittoor on lease basis for establishment of a Unique Integrated Campus 'The Apollo Health and Knowledge City'- Orders -Issued' Health, Medical and Family Welfare (D) Department dated 04.01.2016. Paragraph 4 of this Order brings out that the Apollo Hospitals Educational and Research Foundation (AHERF) has sought the permission of the State Government to use the existing Chittoor district Government Hospital as a Teaching Hospital for Clinical Training for a period of 3 years through a Memorandum of Understanding as required by the Medical Council of India. Further, perusal of paragraph 8, shows that the "Govt. after careful examination hereby accord permission for lease of the Government District Hospital, Chittoor to Apollo Hospitals Educational and Research Foundation for upgradation facilities and utilization in response to their unsolicited offer on lease basis for a period of (5) years (one full-fledged batch) from the date of entering into MOU to enable to start Medical College from 2016 academic year, extendable by mutual consent." Further, the recommendations are required to be incorporated in the MOU that is be entered into by the Commissioner, A.P. Vaidya Vidhana Parishad, Hyderabad on behalf of the Govt. of AP with AHERF.

(ii)

The second document is the Memorandum of Understanding dated 18.01.16 entered between the Government of AP and AHERF. This documents is analyzed herein below in terms of Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 as under:

S.No.	Position in Regulations	PositionasinMOUbetweenStateGovernmentofAndhraPradesh and M/SAHERF	Remarks
1.	MOU between the appropriate Government and the "person" for allowing the utilization of the facilities of a hospital owned and managed by an appropriate Government for establishing a Medical College by a person/agency should be in existence at the time of making application.	The MOU between the Government of Andhra Pradesh and M/S AHERF for the utilization of District Headquarters has been entered into on 18.01.2016. Further, paragraph 1 of the MOU states that the State Government has agreed to allow the utilization of services of the Hospital by M/S AHERF from 01.02.16.	This is not as per the requirement of Regulations.
	That the Hospital owned and managed by the appropriate Government should be minimum 300 bedded hospital with necessary infrastructural facilities capable of being developed into a teaching institution situated on a plot of land having an area not less that prescribed under the Regulations. The medical college shall provide free transportation facilities for students and staff. The	Paragraph 4 of the Preamble provides that "District Headquarters Hospital Chittoor" is a 320 bedded Hospital which is wholly managed and financed by the State Government. Paragraph 1 of the MOU states that the State Government has agreed to has agreed to allow the utilization of services of the Hospital by M/S AHERF from 01.02.16 including permitting AHERF to	Resolve of the Parties to develop the Hospital into a teaching Institution appears to be in consonance with the requirement of MCI norms, provided they meet the requirement of MCI Regulations for facilities required by the Hospital at the time of establishment.

194	
-----	--

S.No.	Position in Regulations	Position as in MOU between State Government of Andhra Pradesh and M/S AHERF	Remarks
	said Hospital would be on one piece of land and the building of the College including library and hostel for students/interns, PGs/Residents, nurses may be housed on any of the two pieces of land.	develop the existing infrastructure, thereby meeting the requirement of running a teaching Institution. By same clause M/S. AHERF have inter alia undertaken to create and strengthen all ICUs like AMC, CCU, RICU and casualty departments and equip with state of art infrastructure and facilities; strengthen OTs by providing additional equipment and monitoring facilities – the total number of OTs shall be increased to meet the requirement of MCI; strengthen the trauma care services by providing additional facilities for Neurosurgery, Intensive Care, Critical Care and reconstructive surgery; provide and maintain the unit with around hemodialysis 10 machines; strengthen the wards of existing broad specialities like General Medicine, Orthopaedics, ENT, Ophthalmology, and OBG by providing good cots, bedside lockers etc. By paragraph 7 of the MOU M/s AHERF has undertaken to provide separate OTs and Labour Rooms for OBG and strengthen the diagnostic facilities.	Meets the requirement of land for Hospital being above 5 acres, however, the MOU is silent on the aspect of land for the other piece as also the provision of free transportation facilities for
		Paragraph 7 of the MOU provides that Hospital is constructed in 6.3 Acres land and there is vacant area of 9.8 Acres.	
	The minimum 300 bedded hospital has to be transferred by the Government to the applicant Trust/Society/company through an appropriate MOU of minimum of 33 years or by way of lease upto 99 years, preferably but in any case not less than 33 years. While		provides for the minimum period of 33 years. Hence, hence it is not permissible. The MOU is silent as to the seat sharing between
	transferring the Hospital facility, the State Government may	is 05 years and the MOU cannot be terminated during the lock-in period of	

S.No.	Position in Regulations	PositionasinMOUbetweenStateGovernmentofAndhraPradesh and M/S AHERF	Remarks
	safeguard the interest of State particularly in respect of admission of students under Government Quota in the medical College and patient care in affiliated Hospital(s) of the Medical College.	terminated with 06 months' notice by either parties after the minimum lock in period. Paragraph 11 of the MOU provides that "all services so provided by the hospital should be made available free of cost to the public"	
	The hospital must be suitably altered through appropriate modifications into a teaching hospital specially with reference to the breakup of 300 beds into 120 beds for Surgical Specialities and 60 for OBG and also capable of forming clinical units of 30	Paragraphs 2 to 8 of the MOU set out the modalities through which the State Government and AHERF have agreed on the modalities for converting the District Headquarters Hospital into a teaching institution, including upgradation of the facilities,	This aspect is subject to physical verification by Assessors.
	beds each with required ward size, teaching and training space and other prescribed requirements as per the Governing Regulations before the	so as to conform to the requirements of MCI Regulations.	It is clear that at the time of making application there is
	application is made for starting the new Medical College.	18.01.2016 and the utilization of the services by AHERF commences from 01.02.16.	no MOU for the utilization of the District Hospital between the State Government and M/S AHERF.
	The hospital should have all the feasibility for it being periodically upgraded including the augmentation of the number of beds and commensurate teaching compliment as prescribed by the Governing Regulations with respect to the permitted annual intake for the College of 50/100/150/200/250 as the case may be.	MOU set out the modalities through which the State Government and AHERF have agreed on the modalities for converting the District Headquarters Hospital into a teaching institution, including upgradation of the facilities, so as to conform to the requirements of MCI Regulations.	
	The personnel working in the said hospital, technicians, para clinical staff including nurses and the menial staff, if transferred to the medical college, upon their transfer shall be under the administrative control of the Dean of the Medical College ensuring that there is no "duality" of administrative control of any type.	By paragraph 9 of the MOU the State has constituted a committee consisting with one from Dr. NTRUHS representative, Director of Medical Education, Commissioner of Andhra Pradesh Vaidya Vidhana Parishad, Medical Superintendent, DH, Chittoor and One Representative from AHERF. The Committee will monitor the progress of developmental activities of the hospital and functioning	There is no reference to the role of the Dean of the Medical College in the MOU.

S.No.	Position in Regulations	Position as in MOU between State Government of Andhra Pradesh and M/S AHERF	Remarks
		of hospital and eventual conversion of this hospital into a teaching hospital. Suitable remedial action will be initiated by the Committee if there are any deviations regarding time line, maintenance of standards of teaching hospital and delivery of quality services throughout the lease period. The service problem of all government staff shall be dealt with by the committee.	
	The administrative control so envisaged would include "Academic", "Clinical" and "Financial"	unci	The MOU is silent on this aspect.
	aspects as well. The clinical staff working at the said hospital other than those who conform to the prescribed eligibility for being designated as Assistant Professor, Associate Professor, Professor of the concerned subject, as the case may be prescribed by the Teachers' Eligibility Qualifications Regulations will have to be replaced by full time appointment of the requisite number of duly qualified full time medical teachers, such replacement will not apply to non-teaching position like Casualty Medical Officer, Hospital Administrators etc. in accordance with the prescribed requirements under the governing Regulations. In order to ensure that the binding operational dictum that "teaching physician has to be the treating physician" meaning thereby that the "treating" personnel would be the one who would be the "teaching" personnel.		The MOU is silent on this aspect.

The above comparative study brings out that the MOU entered between the Govt. of Andhra Pradesh and AHERF is not in accordance with the provisions of Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 that set out the condition for Memorandum of Understanding between the Government and Private entity for utilization of Hospital owned and managed by the Government."

*The Committee also perused the opinion of Law Officer dated* 28.04.2016 which reads as under:

"The file of M/S. Apollo Hospitals Educational and Research Foundation for establishment of new Medical College has been referred for my opinion on the issue of availability of Hospital at the time of making application by the Apollo Institute of Medical Sciences & Research. In this regard, it is pertinent to point out that the Essentiality Certificate dated 28.08.2015, inter alia states that the "applicant owns Ac. 40 land and manages a 320 bedded hospital."

The Hospital on the basis of which the applicant is seeking to establish 2 the Medical College is the District Hospital Chittoor. The permission for entering into an MOU to hand over the said Hospital was granted by the Government of Andhra Pradesh on 04.01.2016. Subsequently, on 18.01.2016, the State Government and M/S. AHERF have entered into an MOU. The date of commencement of MOU is stated in the MOU as 01.02.2016. Thus, it is evident that at the time of making application the applicant does not fulfill the gualifying criteria regarding Hospital as required in the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999. Further, while Regulations provide that the MOU should be for a minimum period of 33 years, whereas in this case it is for a period of 05 years only. Moreover, as per Regulations, the Dean of the Medical College is required to have the administrative control over the personnel working in the said Hospital, herein this case a Committee has been constituted by the State to look into the service problems of the employees. There is no mention in the MOU about the administrative control of the Dean.

3. It may be recalled that the Hon'ble Supreme Court in its judgment dated 20.08.15 in Royal Medical Trust & Anr. vs. Union of India & Anr. reported in (2015) 10 SCC 19 has in paragraph 27 of the judgment has laid down as under:-

27. The MCI and the Central Government have been vested with monitoring powers under Section 10A and the Regulations. .... (A) <u>Initial assessment</u> of the application at the first level should comprise of checking necessary requirements such as essentiality certificate, consent for affiliation and physical features like land and hospital requirement. If an applicant fails to fulfill these requirements, the application on the face of it, would be incomplete and be rejected. Those who fulfill the basic requirements would be considered at the next stage.

4. Further, the Hon'ble Supreme Court in its recent judgment in the case of Medical Council of India vs. V.N. Public Health & Educational Trust & Anr. in Civil Appeal No. 3964 of 2016 (arising out of SLP (C) No. 5326 of 2016) dated 18.04.16 has held as under:

14. In this context, we may profitably refer to the decision in D.Y. Patil Medical College v. Medical Council of India &Anr 2015 (10) SCC 51 wherein the controversy had arisen due to rejection of the application of the institution on the ground that Essentiality Certificate was not filed along with the application form. The Court dwelled upon the principles stated in Educare Charitable Trust v. Union of India & Anr AIR 2014 SC 902: (2013) 16 SCC 474, Royal Medical Trust (supra) and various other decisions and, after anaylsing the scheme of the Act, has held:-

"It is apparent from the aforesaid decision and the regulations that the application at the first instance is required to be complete and incomplete applications are liable to be rejected. Thereafter, there has to be an inspection and other stages of decision-making process."

15. The impugned order passed by the High Court is to be tested and adjudged on the anvil of the aforesaid authorities. The application for grant of approval was filed with the Essentiality Certificate which was a conditional one and, therefore, a defective one. It was not an Essentiality Certificate in law. In such a situation, the High Court could not have directed for consideration of the application for the purpose of the inspection. Such a direction, we are disposed to think, runs counter to the law laid down in **Educare Charitable Trust** (supra) and **Royal Medical Trust** (supra). We may further proceed to state that on the date of the application, the Essentiality Certificate was not in order. The Schedule prescribed by the MCI, which had been approved by this Court, is binding on all concerned. MCI cannot transgress it. The High Court could not have gone beyond the same and issued any direction for conducting an inspection for the academic year 2016-

17. Therefore, the directions issued by the learned single Judge and the affirmation thereof by the Division Bench are wholly unsustainable.

16. Consequently, the appeal is allowed and the judgments and orders passed by the High Court are set aside. It will be open to the Trust to submit a fresh application for the next academic year in consonance with the provisions of the Regulations of the MCI and as per the time Schedule; and in that event, it will be considered appropriately. In the facts and circumstances of the case, there shall be no order as to costs.

5 The above factual matrix clearly brings out that at the time of making application there was no MOU in existence between the Government of Andhra Pradesh and Apollo Hospitals Educational and Research Foundation for establishment of new Medical College for establishment of new Medical College at Chittoor. The judgment of the Hon'ble Supreme Court are loud and clear to the effect that an applicant is required at the time of making application to fulfil the qualifying criteria. As per MCI Regulations Hospital is a necessary requirement at the time of making application and an application that does not meet the necessary requirement of Hospital is to be rejected. Therefore, it would be appropriate in my considered view to recommend to the Central Government to disapprove the application of M/s Apollo Hospitals Educational and Research Foundation for establishment of new Medical College at Chittoor amongst other grounds on the ground that it has failed to meet the qualifying criteria regarding owning and managing Hospital at the time of making application. Further, the MOU on which the applicant has placed reliance is also not in accordance with the norms laid down in Regulations."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision taken at its meeting held on 30.01.2016 recommending to the Central Government for disapproval of the scheme and to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Chittoor, Andhra Pradesh by Apollo Hospitals Educational & Research Foundation, Telangana under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year."

## 199. <u>The Ninety Second report of the Department related Parliamentary</u> <u>Standing Committee on Health & F.W. on the "Functioning of</u> <u>Medical Council of India (MCI).</u>

Read: The Ninety Second report of the Department related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Health & F.W. on the ‰unctioning of Medical Council of India (MCI).

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the report of the Sub-Committee on The Ninety Second report of the Department related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Health & F.W. on the ‰unctioning of Medical Council of India (MCI) and decided to refer back the same to the Sub-Committee to make it more comprehensive and include more details and further authorized the President to take necessary action upon receipt of the revised report.

# 200. Establishment of new medical college at Konni, Pathanamthitta, Kerala by Government of Kerala with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to establishment of new medical college at Konni, Pathanamthitta, Kerala by Government of Kerala with an annual intake of 100 MBBS students under Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, Thrissur, Kerala u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered letter dated 13<sup>th</sup> May, 2016 received through e-mail from the Central Govt., Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi stating therein as under:-

"I am directed to refer to the Council's letter No. MCI-34(41)(E-43)/2015/-Med. 163525, dated 31.03.2016 thereby recommending this Ministry to disapprove the scheme of Establishment of new Medical College (100 seats) at Konni, Kerala by the Govt. of Kerala for the academic year 2016-17. Sh. Oommen Chandy, Hon'ble Chief Minister, Govt. of Kerala, vide its D.O. letter dated 29.04.2016(copy enclosed) has informed this Ministry that the State Govt. has created faculty, residents, infrastructures and other facilities for the proposed Medical College, Konni.

2. The MCI is therefore, requested to re-consider the scheme of Establishment of New Medical College (100 seats) at Konni, by the Govt. of Kerala for the academic year 2016-17 on the basis of undertaking of the State Govt. and make its recommendation to the Central Govt."

The Executive Committee of the Council further noted that at its earlier meeting dated 30.1.2016 had decided as under:-

*"The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (6<sup>th</sup> and 7<sup>th</sup> January, 2016) and noted the following:* 

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 77.50 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 91.10 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Hospital is under Health department.
- **4.** Teaching beds are deficient as under:

#	Department	Beds		
		Required	Available	Shortage
1	General Medicine	72	55	17
2	Paediatrics	24	21	03
3	Tb & Chest	08	NIL	08
4	Skin & VD	08	NIL	08
5	Psychiatry	08	NIL	08
6	General Surgery	90	55	35
7	Orthopaedics	30	NIL	30
8	ENT	10	NIL	10
9	Ophthalmology	10	NIL	10
	TOTAL			129

- 5. Bed occupancy was 59.40 % on day of assessment.
- 6. There was NIL Major & NIL Minor operation on day of assessment.
- 7. USG workload was NIL on day of assessment.
- 8. Dr. Sajith Kumar, Medical Superintendent has NIL administrative experience and hence not eligible to hold the post.

- 9. *Medical Superintendent's office & Administrative office as required are not available.*
- 10. OPD: Staff for Registration Counters is inadequate. Waiting area is not available. Enquiry desk is not available. Teaching area is not available. Minor O.T. is not available. In Ophthalmology OPD, Refraction room, Dark room, Minor Procedure room are not available. Special clinic facilities are inadequate in Paediatrics & OG OPDs.
- 11. Audiometry & Speech therapy are not available.
- 12. Wards: Distance between 2 beds is < 1.5 m. There is no Unitwise distribution. There are no separate beds for Orthopaedics, Eye, ENT wards. Demonstration rooms, Pantry are not available. Duty room is not available in all the wards. In no ward, bed sheet was supplied by hospital.
- 13. Workload of Microbiology, Histopathology, Cytopathology is NIL.
- 14. MRD is not available.
- 15. Casualty: 8 beds are available against requirement of 10. Separate Casualty for OG is not available. Central O₂ and Central Suction are not available. Disaster Trolley is not available. Resuscitation equipment is inadequate.
- 16. O.T.: All O.T.s are closed for renovation.
- 17. ICUs: MICU, SICU, NICU/PICU are not available. ICCU has 4 beds against requirement of 5. There were only 2 patients in ICCU on day of assessment. It is not well equipped.
- 18. Labour Room: Separate room for Eclampsia, Septic Labour are not available.
- 19. Radiodiagnosis department: 1 Mobile & NIL static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 2 each. 1 USG is available against requirement of 2. AERB/PNDT approval is not available for X-ray/USG machines.
- 20. CSSD is not available.
- 21. Laundry: MOU is stated to have been done but no documents were supplied.
- 22. Canteen is not available.
- 23. Nursing staff: Only 78 Nurses are available against requirement of 175.
- 24. Paramedical & Non-teaching staff: Only 13 Paramedical & Non-teaching staff are available against requirement of 101.
- 25. Dean's office is much smaller (12 sq.m.) than required (36 sq.m.).
- 26. College Council room is not available.
- 27. College Council, Pharmaco Vigilance Committee are not constituted.
- 28. Lecture Theaters: They are not available.
- 29. Central Library, Common Rooms for Boys & Girls, Central Photography Section are not available.
- 30. Students', Residents' & Nurses' Hostels are not available.
- 31. Residential Quarters are not available.
- 32. Recreational facilities are not available.
- 33. Preclinical departments of Anatomy, Physiology, Biochemistry are under construction.
- 34. Gender Harassment Committee as required as per order of Hon'ble Supreme Court is not yet constituted.
- 35. Website is not available.
- 36. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above and as the applicant has failed to meet the qualifying criteria u/s 3(2)(5) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 pertaining to the person owning and managing a hospital of not less than 300 beds, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Konni, Pathanamthitta, Kerala by Government of Kerala under Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, Thrissur, Kerala to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year." In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision to return the application for establishment of a new medical college at Konni, Pathanamthitta, Kerala by Government of Kerala under Kerala University of Health & Allied Sciences, Thrissur, Kerala to the Central Government recommending disapproval of the scheme u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-17 as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office for the next academic year.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

• The minutes were read out and confirmed in the meeting itself and the office was directed to send the communications pertaining to Section 10A to the Central Government immediately within the time limit prescribed under the Regulations.

New Delhi, dated 13<sup>th</sup> May, 2015 (Dr. Reena Nayyar) Secretary I/c

(Dr. Jayshree Mehta) President

APPROVED