No. MCI-5(3)/2015-Med.Misc./

MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA NEW DELHI

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting of the Executive Committee held on 21st September, 2015 at 11:00 a.m. in the Council Office at Sector 8, Pocket 14, Dwarka, New Delhi.

Present:

	President
Dr. Jayshree Mehta	Medical Council of India,
	Former Professor of Surgery,
	Govt. Medical College,
	Vadodara, Gujarat.
	Professor and Head, Department of
Dr. Dadha Madhah Triasthu	Community Medicine,
Dr. Radha Madhab Tripathy	MKCG Medical College,
	Berhampur.
	Professor & HOD, General Medicine,
Dr. Anil Mahajan	Government Medical College,
	Jammu, J&K.
	Vice Chancellor,
Dr. V.N. Jindal	S.R.K. University,
	Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh
	Professor of Urology and
	Transplant Surgery,
Dr. Baldev Singh Aulakh	Head Transplant Unit,
CO	Dayanand Medical College,
//~	Ludhiana
169	Vice-Chancellor,
Dr. G.B. Gupta	Ayush & Health Sciences University,
-11 0121 0 up to	Raipur, Chhattisgarh .
112 8	Professor & Head, Department Of
D. Wie Ded ed O'ed	Gastroenterology, Patna Medical
Dr. Vijay Prakash Singh	College,
	Patna, Bihar
	Kalashree Nilaya, Krishna Nagar,
Dr. Ravindra H.N.	Pandavapura, Mandya Distt.,
	Karnataka
	Principal,
	LLRM Medical College Campus, Garh
Dr. K K Gupta	Road,
	Meerut (UP)

Shri A.K. Harit, Deputy Secretary

Apology for absence was received from Dr. C.V. Bhirmanandham.

1. <u>Minutes of the Executive Committee Meeting held on 17th August, 2015 – Confirmation of.</u>

The Executive Committee of the Council while confirming the minutes of the Executive Committee meeting held on 17th August, 2015 directed the office to place the minutes of the Sub-Committees i.e. Ethics, Academic, Administration & Grievance etc. as item nos. 4,5 & 6.

2. <u>Minutes of the last two meetings of the Executive Committee –</u> Action taken thereon.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the action taken on the minutes of the Executive Committee meeting held on 05th August, 2015 & 17th August, 2015.

3. Approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meetings.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meetings.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meetings and approved the item nos. 1,4,5,8,10,11,12,14,17,18,20 & 21.

For rest of the proceedings, the Executive Committee observed item wise as under:

2. <u>APPEAL FILED BY SMT. LEELA ANTONY AGAINST ORDER OF TRAVANCORE COCHIN MEDICAL COUNCIL</u>

Both the original complaint before TCMC & appeal have been disposed off for the reason that the complainant Mrs. Leela Anthony did not appear before them. She may be given a last opportunity to appear before the Ethics Committee or if she is unable to come personally, to file a written statement explaining her submission and decide the matter thereafter.

Referred back with above observation.

3. <u>APPEAL FILED BY DR. MEENA HARISINGHANI & DR. NARAIN HARISINGHANI AGAINST ORDER DT. 23/07/2014 OF DELHI MEDICAL COUNCIL.</u>

Delhi Medical Council has decided to remove names of both Dr. Narain Harisinghani & Dr. Meena Harisinghani for 15 days. In appeal, Ethics Committee has increased duration of removal of name in respect of Dr. Narain Harisinghani for a period of 6 months but nothing is shown in the decision in respect of Dr. Meena Harisinghani.

Referred back with above observation to take a decision in respect of Dr. Meena Harisinghani. The decision of Ethics Committee in respect of Dr. Narain Harisinghani approved.

6. RC 10(A)/2011 OF CBI, CHENNAI FORWARDING OF SELF CONTAINED NOTE 131 DOCTORS (VINAYAKA MISSION MEDICL COLLEGE, PONDICHERRY)

Not approved. The assessors have carried out inspection/assessment in accordance with guidelines & instructions issued by MCI from time to time. It cannot be attributed to their fault that they could not detect regular faculty as they had done verification in accordance with instructions of MCI. It is not the case that they have violated the instructions or they have received any pecuniary benefit from the institute. Even the Hon'ble Court has discharged them from any criminal act. Considering all the factors, no case is made out for taking any action against them.

7. <u>CBI CASE AGAINST SHRI LAXMI NARAYAN INSTITUTE OF MEDICAL SCIENCES, PONDICHERRY.</u>

Not approved. The assessors have carried out inspection/assessment in accordance with guidelines & instructions issued by MCI from time to time. It cannot be attributed to their fault that they could not detect regular faculty as they had done verification in accordance with instructions of MCI. It is not the case that they have violated the instructions or they have received any pecuniary benefit from the institute. Even the Hon'ble Court has discharged them from any criminal act. Considering all the factors, no case is made out for taking any action against them.

9. <u>REPRESENTATION OF SHRI SHISHIR CHAND AGAINST ORDER OF ETHIC</u> COMMITTEE OF MCI

Legal opinion be obtained whether it would be necessary to hear the concerned doctor before increasing quantum of punishment and take action accordingly and resubmit the matter.

13. <u>CERTAIN ISSUES RELATED TO MEDICAL ETHICS & CODE OF CONDUCT RAISED BY DR. KAMAL K. PARWAL, NEW DELHI</u>

Not approved.

- Q. 1. It is not clear from the language of the query what the querist refers to bulk rebate or discounted packages for patients of Govt./PSUs. It is also not clear whether such discounted rate/rebate is passed on to the patients/PSUs/Govt. or whether it is passed on to the doctors. Section 6.4.1 refers to receipt of such gift/gratuity/commission/bonus by the doctor in his personal capacity.
- Q.2 It is also not clear whether such discounted rate/rebate is passed on to the patient or whether it is passed on to the doctor. It is reiterated that Section 6.4.1 refers to receipt of such gift/gratuity/commission/bonus by the doctor in his personal capacity.
- Q.3 In absence of specific details no decision can be made. Charging of professional fees is exclusively between the doctor and patient and the Council cannot enter into it.

Ethics Committee is directed to deliberate upon the issues raised by Dr. K.K. Parwal in view of above observations and resubmit the matter.

15. CONSIDERATION OF CBI, ACU-IX, AC-III, NEW DELHI – SELF CONTAINED NOTE REGARDING BOGUS & FALSE DOCUMENTS AS WELL AS WRONG INFORMATION TO MCI PERTAINING TO FACULTY STRENGTH, NURSING STAFF, BEDS, ETC.

It is stated in the minutes that the matter is still under consideration of Ethics Committee. Why has it been placed before the Executive Committee prematurely before taking any decision?

Further, all the doctors have stated that they were practicing after officer hours. The material on which CBI has come to the conclusion that they were working at other hospitals/clinics during January 2011 to March 2011 along with statements of the concerned faculty before CBI are not shown. The Ethics Committee is advised to bring this material on record. Further, in CBI note it is stated that Dr. Rakesh Pal has admitted that he attended NIMS hospital only on dates of inspections. In his statement before Ethics Committee he has stated that he worked in at other diagnostic centers after office hours. However, the fact of him attending NIMS only on dates of inspection is not examined by Ethics Committee nor has it been brought out in his statement before Ethics Committee.

Ethics Committee is advised to examine the entire material of CBI and cross examine the concerned doctors and to take appropriate decision thereafter.

16. <u>APEEAL FILED BY SHRI AMAR MANNA AGAINST DR. BASUDEB TIWARI, KOLKATA</u>

Not approved. Ethics Committee itself has recorded that when the mother & baby were discharged from Treatwell Nursing Home on 2nd January 2011, blood tests for isoimmunization were not performed. No tests for Rh Antibody Titer were done by Dr. Alok Mukerjee for first 5 days after childbirth. Even Serum Bilirubin was not done on 1st or 2nd January 2011. When the baby was seen for the first time by Dr. Basudeb Tiwari on 5th January 2011, he has immediately advised tests for jaundice. As this was first baby and mother was treated for infertility, there was no reason for him to suspect Rh factor incompatibility as its occurrence in first baby is almost impossible. No case of medical negligence can be made out against him and hence no action is warranted. The Ethics committee is advised the role of treating doctors of Treatwell hospital where baby was born and kept for first2 days.

19. <u>APPEAL FILED BY SHRI MOHD. JEESHAN, AMROHA, U.P. AGAINST ORDER OF U.P. MEDICAL COUNCIL</u>

It is observed that out of 3 experts whose expert opinion was sought, one expert has categorically stated that "there does not seem to be any medical negligence in this case." Second expert has asked for certain clarifications and has merely stated that "It appears that treatment protocols followed were sub-optimal." Third expert has not given any opinion till answers to her queries were available. It would be desirable to obtain answers

to queries asked by these two experts and obtain definitive expert opinion from them before any final decision is reached. Presently the only definitive expert opinion states that ""there does not seem to be any medical negligence in this case." As Dr. Neetu Rastogi is herself a Gynaecologist possessing M.D., D.G.O. qualifications, there is no necessity for her to take any further expert opinion in the matter as she is an expert in her own right.

Further, on P. 151 (internal P. 7), in the 4th line from the top, it is stated that "The histopathology of the specimen was done after 8 months of Surgical procedure for which proper explanation has been given by doctor." This appears to be a typographical error as it should read as <u>no proper explanation has been given by the doctor.</u>

Referred back to Ethics Committee for taking appropriate decision with above observations. Matter should be resubmitted thereafter.

4. Permission to publish an expanded AT-COM module as Handbook and copyright taken in the name of Secretary, MCI:

Recommendation of the Orientation meeting held on June 12-13 and June 26-27, 2015, approved at the Academic Committee meeting held on July 14, 2015.

Read: the matter with regard to permission to publish an expanded AT-COM module as Handbook and copyright taken in the name of Secretary, MCI: Recommendation of the Orientation meeting held on June 12-13 and June 26-27, 2015, approved at the Academic Committee meeting held on July 14, 2015.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to constitute a Sub-Committee of the following members for perusal of the minutes of Orientation meeting held on June 12-13 and June 26-27, 2015 and approved by the Academic Committee at its meeting held on July 14, 2015:-

- 1. Dr. Anil Mahajan, Member, Executive Committee, Professor & HOD, General Medicine, Government Medical College, Jammu, J&K.
- 2. Dr. Vijay Prakash Singh, Member, Executive Committee, Professor & Head, Department Of Gastroenterology, Patna Medical College, Patna, Bihar.
- 5. Recognition/approval of Dr. V.R.K Women's Medical College,
 Aziznagar, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100
 seats) granted by Dr. N.T.R University of Health Sciences,
 Vijayawada u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Dr. V.R.K Women's Medical College, Aziznagar, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. N.T.R University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (25th Aug., 2015) along with compliance verification assessment report(16th April, 2015) and previous assessment report(13th & 14th February, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 11.4 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 40.7 % as detailed in the report. Many Residents have not signed attendance sheet in the entire month.
- 3. Data of investigations provided by the institute do not tally with the observation of assessors during assessment. As per laboratory register, data on previous day of assessment i.e. 24/08/2015 are much less than those provided by the institute for the day of assessment (i.e. 25/08/2015) as under:

7	#	Investigation	Number	
			24/08/2015	25/08/2015
			(As per Registers)	(Data Provided by Institute to Assessors)

1	Biochemistry	279	665
2	Haematology	100	550

4. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend not to recognize/approve Dr. V.R.K. Women's Medical College, Aziznagar, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. N.T.R University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided to grant 01 month time to the institute to submit the compliance on rectification of deficiencies to the Council for further consideration of the matter.

6. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Mahatma Gandhi Mission's Medical College, Navi Mumbai under MGM Institute of Health Sciences, Navi Mumbai.

Read: the matter with regard to Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Mahatma Gandhi Mission's Medical College, Navi Mumbai under MGM Institute of Health Sciences, Navi Mumbai.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (20.08.2015) conducted for verification of available facilities of faculty, Residents, infrastructure and other requirements for recognized intake of 100 students and observed that no deficiencies are observed in the assessment report in terms of facilities required for recognized intake of 100 MBBS students as prescribed under Minimum Standard Requirement Regulations for 100 students annually.

In view of above, the committee decided to revoke the notice issued under clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation as amended in respect of recognized intake of 100 students.

7. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Rama Medical College, Hospital & Research, Kanpur.

Read: the matter with regard to Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Rama Medical College, Hospital & Research, Kanpur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (21.08.2015) conducted for verification of available facilities of faculty, Residents, infrastructure and other requirements for recognized intake of 100 students and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 5.71 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 38.80 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy is 36.38 % on day of assessment. Most of the patients were admitted with insignificant vague symptoms like headache, pain in abdomen, generalized body ache, constipation, etc. Case sheets of many patients did not have provisional diagnosis or any history or clinical findings or progress notes written by faculty or Residents.
- 4. On day of assessment, till 4 p.m. only 7 Major & 6 Minor operations were performed in the whole hospital.
- 5. Tb & Chest, Skin & VD, ENT & Ophthalmology wards have separate sections for males/females with only separating curtains which is not as per norms. Deficiency still persists.

- 6. Data of clinical material like OPD attendance, Laboratory investigations, Cytopathology workload provided by the institute on random dates appear to be inflated. Deficiency still persists.
- 7. No Histopathology specimen was available on day of assessment. Only 3 Cytopathology slides from OPD were available on day of assessment.
- 8. General Medicine & General Surgery wards still do not have pantry.
- 9. Residential Quarters: 32 quarters are available for non-teaching staff against requirement of 36 as per Regulations. Deficiency still persists.
- 10. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 and to give final opportunity to the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

8. <u>Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Bharati Vidyapeeth Deemed University's Medical College, Sangli.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Bharati Vidyapeeth Deemed University's Medical College, Sangli.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (20.08.2015) conducted for verification of available facilities of faculty, Residents, infrastructure and other requirements for recognized intake of 100 students and observed that no deficiencies are observed in the assessment report in terms of facilities required for recognized intake of 100 MBBS students as prescribed under Minimum Standard Requirement Regulations for 100 students annually.

In view of above, the committee decided to revoke the notice issued under clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation as amended In respect of recognized intake of 100 students.

9. <u>Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Talegaon, Pune.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats Maharashtra Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Talegaon, Pune.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (20.08.2015) conducted for verification of available facilities of faculty, Residents, infrastructure and other requirements for recognized intake of 100 students and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 10.65 % (i.e. 13 out of 122) as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 8.95 % (i.e. 6 out of 67)
- 3. Bed occupancy is 62.9 % (i.e. 321 out of 510) as actually observed on day of assessment is as under:

#	Department	Beds Occupied
1	General Medicine	57
2	Paediatrics	30
3	Tb & Chest	23
4	Skin & VD	8

#	Department	Beds Occupied
5	Psychiatry	0
6	General Surgery	69
7	Orthopaedics	27
8	E.N.T.	8
9	Ophthalmology	24
10	Obst. & Gynaec.	75
	TOTAL	321

The data given by the institute are exaggerated. 10-20 % of the patients had been admitted in the wards but did not merit admission. E.g. abdominal pain patients in General Surgery wards& Backache in Orthopaedics wards.

- 4. Wards: Some wards are still congested. Distance between 2 beds is less than required.
- 5. O.T.: Preoperative ward has 4 beds & Postoperative ward has 6 beds which are acutely congested. There were 15 patients in pre & postoperative wards at the time of taking round. There is no Central Nitrous supply. There are 2 tables in Ophthalmology O.T. which is not as per norms.
- 6. Number of C.T. Scan on day of assessment is only 09 which is inadequate.
- 7. The following faculty were found not to be staying in accommodation claimed to have been provided by the college:
- (a) Dr. Mihir Chaudhary, Tutor in Forensic Medicine;
- (b) Dr. Swapnil Thorat, Tutor in Forensic Medicine.
- 8. ICUs: ICU & RICU are amalgamated which has 10 beds; occupancy was only 3 on day of assessment. There was only 1 patient in Surgical ICU.
- 9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 and to give final opportunity to the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to refer the matter with regard to the faculty not staying in accommodation as claimed to have been provided by the college to the Ethics Committee of the Council.

10. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Maharajah's Institute of Medical Sciences, Vizianagaram under NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada.

Read: the matter with regard to Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Maharajah's Institute of Medical Sciences, Vizianagaram under NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (20.08.2015) conducted for verification of available facilities of faculty, Residents, infrastructure and other requirements for recognized intake of 100 students and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 9.2 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 37.9 % as detailed in the report. Many Residents are not staying in the campus.

- 3. No Declaration Forms were submitted by any of faculty & Residents. Form 16 was not available for any employee. Appointment order, Joining Letter, Relieving order, were not available and could not be verified.
- 4. Bed occupancy was 25.9 % on day of assessment.
- 5. OPD attendance was only 620 at end of OPD timing on day of assessment.
- 6. There was only 1 Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 7. Workload of Plain X-rays was only 58 on day of assessment. NIL Ba & IVP investigations were carried out on day of assessment.
- 8. Laboratory investigations workload was inadequate on day of assessment.
- 9. Records of admission in various wards are not properly maintained. Large number of patients admitted in wards appeared healthy normal adults and did not require admission. In General Surgery wards, there was not a single patient on I.V. fluids. Some of the wards which had a few patients in the morning were deserted by afternoon.
- 10. There was not a single delivered lady in Obstetric ward. No newborn was seen. There was no operated lady in O.G. wards.
- 11. In most of the wards, there were no I.V. stands, side lockers, dust bins, suction machine & B.P. instruments.
- 12. Area of Dean's office & Medical Superintendent's office are smaller than required. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 13. Duty room for Doctors, Pantry, Treatment room are not available in wards of General Surgery & Psychiatry. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 14. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 and to give final opportunity to the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

11. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Al-Ameen Medical College & Hospital, Bijapur under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore.

Read: the matter with regard to Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Al-Ameen Medical College & Hospital, Bijapur under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (21.08.2015) conducted for verification of available facilities of faculty, Residents, infrastructure and other requirements for recognized intake of 100 students and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 39.5 % as detailed in the report. As many as 20 Senior Residents & 2 Junior Residents are not staying in the campus.
- 2. Only 4 Major operations were performed by 12:30 p.m. on day of assessment.
- 3. There was only 1 Normal delivery & 1 Caesarean section on day of assessment which are inadequate.
- 4. Wards are not as per MCI norms. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 5. RHTC: Toilet facility is not available in separate blocks for boys & girls. Deficiency is partially rectified.
- 6. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of

Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 and to give final opportunity to the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

12. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 130 MBBS seats at Sri Siddhartha Medical College, Tumkur under Siddhartha University, Tumkur.

Read: the matter with regard to Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 130 MBBS seats at Sri Siddhartha Medical College, Tumkur under Siddhartha University, Tumkur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (20.08.2015) conducted for verification of available facilities of faculty, Residents, infrastructure and other requirements for recognized intake of 100 students and noted the following:

- 1. Bed occupancy was < 50 % on day of assessment.
- 2. OPD attendance: On day of assessment, central computer register showed 871 patients (726 new & 145 old); however, on verification in individual OPDs, this number does not match with individual departmental registers.
- 3. Indoor admissions: Central IPD register showed 62 patients out of which 27 were new Surgical & 14 were new O.G. admissions. However, on verification in the wards, there was neither any admission in either Surgical or O.G. wards nor there was any lady in Labour Room. Record of MRD shows admission of 4 males in Obstetrics & Gynaecology wards.
- 4. There was only 1 Major & 5 Minor operations on O.T. lists on day of assessment. No other patient was found in operating area. Operation Theaters have not maintained any previous records of Surgical work being done by individual faculty or Residents.
- 5. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 6. Casualty: Disaster Trolley was not available. Previous record was not available. There was one patient by name of Shri Puttahanumanth (Regn. No. 18560) who was supposedly admitted on 17/08/2015 but no treatment record was available till day of assessment i.e. 20/08/2015.
- 7. ICUs: In SICU, there was only 1 patient on day of assessment. Previous record was not available.
- 8. Radiodiagnosis department: 800 mA X-ray machine is not available. There were only 8 Plain X-rays till 2 p.m. on day of assessment. Workload of Special Investigations like Ba, IVP was NIL on day of assessment. Resuscitation measures are not available. Previous record is not maintained properly.
- 9. Blood Bank: Previous record is not properly maintained. On day of assessment, no blood unit or component was issued till 1 p.m.
- 10. Wards: In Medical & Surgical wards, Demonstration Rooms were not properly equipped. Nursing station was not available in the wards. Sisters were without ID cards & badges and were less in number. They were unable to show the past record of indoor admissions & treatment. Present case sheets do not show involvement of faculty & Senior Residents. It appears that qualified Nurses are not posted in the wards in general and possibly Student Nurses are looking after wards & they are not aware of patient details & treatment given to them.
- 11. Laboratory Investigations: There were total 63 samples from OPD & 64 samples from wards upto 12 noon on day of assessment. There is mismatch of data in number of samples verified on assessment & those provided by institute.
- 12. FNAC record does not match with Surgical record.

- 13. RHTC: Staff members' attendance register does not show any month. Anganwadi register showed data on 13/04/2015 & another one on 22/07/2015. No one visited afterwards. OPD does not show any report for August 2015. RCH register does not show any dates of various programmes done at RHTC. No ANC census record was found.
- 14. UHC: Registers are not maintained properly. Many dates are missing; many patients appear to be fake. Vaccine storage is not proper.
- 15. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls: On day of assessment, no students were seen. There were spider webs in toilets indicating that these toilets were not being used.
- 16. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision with regard to application of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulations (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 and to give final opportunity to the college authorities for submission of compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

13. Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Navodaya Medical College, Raichur under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore.

Read: the matter with regard to Compliance Verification Assessment of the physical and the other teaching facilities available for 100 MBBS seats at Navodaya Medical College, Raichur under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (24.08.2015) conducted for verification of available facilities of faculty, Residents, infrastructure and other requirements for recognized intake of 100 students and observed that no deficiencies are observed in the assessment report in terms of facilities required for recognized intake of 100 MBBS students as prescribed under Minimum Standard Requirement Regulations for 100 students annually.

In view of above, the committee decided to revoke the notice issued under clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation as amended In respect of recognized intake of 100 students.

14. <u>Approval of the Minutes of the Registration & Equivalence committee</u> meeting held on 29th July, 2015.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the Minutes of the Registration & Equivalence committee meeting held on 29th July, 2015.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Registration & Equivalence committee meeting held on 29th July, 2015 with respect to the following items:-

Item Nos. 2,3,4,13,14,15,16,17,18 & 23.

With regard to the rest of the items, the Committee observed as under:

Item No.5 - Not Approved. There is no qualification by nomenclature of "Internal Medicine in Endocrinology, Diabetes and Metabolism" in the schedule or PG Regulations. Hence such additional qualification cannot be registered.

Item No.6 - It is not specifically mentioned whether Dr. Thomas Mathews has obtained MRCOG qualification after passing the examination. However if this candidate has acquired MRCOG qualification after passing the examination the additional registration be granted by the section without further reference to the Executive Committee.

Item No.7 - It is not specifically mentioned whether Dr. Nitin Kumar has obtained MRCP qualification after passing the examination. However if this candidate has acquired MRCP qualification after passing the examination the additional registration be granted by the section without further reference to the Executive Committee.

Item No.8 - It is not specifically mentioned whether Dr. Damodar Tolani has obtained MRCP qualification after passing the examination. However if this candidate has acquired MRCP qualification after passing the examination the additional registration be granted by the section without further reference to the Executive Committee.

Item No.9 - It is not specifically mentioned whether Dr. Ashish Gupta has obtained MRCP qualification after passing the examination. However if this candidate has acquired MRCOG qualification after passing the examination the additional registration be granted by the section without further reference to the Executive Committee.

Item No.10 - It is not specifically mentioned whether Dr. Basak Sambita has obtained MRCOG qualification after passing the examination. However if this candidate has acquired MRCOG qualification after passing the examination the additional registration be granted by the section without further reference to the Executive Committee.

Item No.11- Approved. Further, it may also be obtained from Dr. S. Sunita whether she has obtained this qualification after passing an examination or not.

Item No.12 - It is not specifically mentioned whether Dr. Keerti Kulkarni has obtained MRCPCH qualification after passing the examination. However if this candidate has acquired MRCPCH qualification after passing the examination the additional registration be granted by the section without further reference to the Executive Committee.

Item No.19 – Approved.

Item No.20- It is not specifically mentioned whether Dr. Sreenivas Ramaiah has obtained FRC PATH qualification after passing the examination. However if this candidate has acquired FRC PATH qualification after passing the examination the additional registration be granted by the section without further reference to the Executive Committee.

Item No.21- It is not specifically mentioned whether Dr. Kausalya Shivaji has obtained MRCPCH qualification after passing the examination. However if this candidate has acquired MRCPCH qualification after passing the examination the additional registration be granted by the section without further reference to the Executive Committee.

Item No.22- The committee decided to refer the letter of Mr. B S Mubarak, consul general of India at Saudi Arabia to Ministry of Health and family welfare with a request to take up the matter with ministry of external affairs for necessary action.

Item No.24- Opinion of Law Officer of MCI be obtained and the matter be placed along with such opinion.

The Executive Committee of the Council further observed that the Registration & Equivalence Sub-committee has already been advised in the past and is once again advised to recommend additional registration in respect FRCS, MRCP, etc. qualifications only if such a qualification is obtained after passing an examination and to incorporate the fact of having obtained that qualification after passing the examination in the decision. The Committee further decided that Chairman, Registration & Equivalence Sub-committee be personally called in the office by President MCI and apprised him about the same.

15. <u>Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Ahmedabad Municipal Corporation Medical Education Trust Medical College, Ahmedabad under Gujarat University.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Ahmedabad Municipal Corporation Medical Education Trust Medical College, Ahmedabad under Gujarat University.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Assessment report (31st August & 1st September, 2015) and decided that the Council shall process the applications for starting of postgraduate courses for further necessary action.

16. <u>Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Hind Institute of Medical Sciences, Barabanki under the Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Avadh University, Faizabad.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Hind Institute of Medical Sciences, Barabanki under the Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia Avadh University, Faizabad.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (31st August, 2015) along with previous assessment report (22nd and 23rd July, 2015) and decided that the Council shall process the applications for starting of postgraduate courses for further necessary action.

17. Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Late Shri Baliram Kashyap Memorial NDMC Govt. Medical College, Jagdalpur under Ayush & Health University, Raipur.

Read: the matter with regard to Pre-PG Assessment – Assessment of the physical and other teaching facilities available for starting of PG course at Late Shri Baliram Kashyap Memorial NDMC Govt. Medical College, Jagdalpur under Ayush & Health University, Raipur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (10th July, 2015) along with the previous assessment report 16th & 17th September, 2014) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 37.9 % as detailed in report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 29.1 % as detailed in report.
- 3. Radiological & Laboratory investigations are inadequate.

- 4. Lecture Theaters: Hospital lecture Theater is not of Gallery type. Audiovisual aids are not available.
- 5. OPD: Four examination rooms are not available in major departments. E.g. in General medicine, only 1 room is available. There is no teaching area in any department. Plaster room & Plaster cutting room are one. Injection room for males is available but it is unhygienic & dirty. In Ophthalmology, minor procedure room is common with Surgery OPD. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 6. Wards: Distance between 2 beds is too less. Male Surgery & Male ENT wards are common. Female ENT ward is located in Female Orthopaedics ward. Ancillary facilities like treatment room, pantry, utility room, etc. are not available in many wards. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 7. Histopathology & Cytopathology workload is grossly inadequate only 1 Histopathology & only 9 FNAC in last 10 days.
- 8. MRD is not computerized. OPD registration is not linked with MRD & Casualty. ICD X classification of diseases is not followed for indexing.
- 9. Casualty: Only 15 beds are available. There is no Central Oxygen & Suction facility. No crash cart is available. There is no Obstetric casualty. Deficiency remains as it is.
- O.T.s: There are only 4 Major O.T.s which are grossly inadequate. Central Oxygen & Suction are not available. There is no preoperative & postoperative ward. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 11. ICUs: Resuscitation equipment is inadequate.
- 12. Radiodiagnosis department: Only 2 static & 3 mobile X-ray machines are available which are inadequate. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 13. Intercom is not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 14. RHTC: It is still under control of DHS & not under Dean. Residential facilities are not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 15. UHC: It is still under control of DHS & not under Dean. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 16. Institute is still running DNB course in O.G.
- 17. Teaching Beds: Only 400 beds are available against requirement of 500 beds as per Regulations.
- 18. Workload of Plain X-rays is only 60 on day of assessment. NIL Ba & IVP investigations were carried out.
- 19. Histopathology workload was NIL on day of assessment.
- 20. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to grant 01 month time to the institute to submit the compliance on rectification of deficiencies to the Council for further consideration of the matter.

18. <u>Change of University Affiliation from Utkal University to Siksha</u>
Ó'Anusandhan University in respect of students being trained at
Institute of Medical Sciences and SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar,
Odisha.

Read: the matter with regard to change of University Affiliation from Utkal University to Siksha Ó'Anusandhan University in respect of students being trained at Institute of Medical Sciences and SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar, Odisha.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that at its meeting dt. 05/08/2015, E.C. had decided as under:

"

The Executive Committee observed that the first batch under Shiksha "O" Anusandhan University was admitted in 2009-2010 which appeared for III M.B;B.S. Part II examination in 2013 & completed the internship in 2014-2015. It is an admitted fact by the institute that no formal application was

made by the institute in 2013 when this batch appeared in III M.B.B.S. Part II examination. Now the institute has made the request.

The Committee further noted that Institute of Medical Sciences & SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar is recognized medical college for the award of MBBS degree granted by Utkal University.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided that the institute be asked to submit the certificate / approval from University Grants Commission with regard to formation of Siksha 'O' Anusandhan University, Odisha for further consideration of the matter."

It was further observed that vide eMail letter dt. 21/08/2015, the institute has enclosed letter of UGC dt. 23/08/2007, enclosing therein Govt. of India Gazette Notification dt. 17/07/2007 conferring deemed University status comprising of Technical Education, Business & Computer Studies, Hotel Management, Dental College & Nursing College. It has also enclosed Govt. of India Gazette Notification dt. 17/09/2007 wherein School of Pharmaceutical Sciences has been made a constituent unit of the deemed University.

It was further observed that vide a Gazette Notification dated 19.09.2008 Institute of Medical Sciences & SUM Hospital, Kalinga Nagar, Bhubaneshwar, Odisha has been declared an off-campus centre under the ambit of Siksha 'O' Anusandhan, "Deemed-to-be University", Bhubaneshwar

In view of above, the Executive Committee decided to accept the request of Change of University Affiliation from Utkal University to Siksha O'Anusandhan University in respect of students being trained at Institute of Medical Sciences and SUM Hospital, Bhubaneswar, Odisha and place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

19. <u>Application for Re-admission of MBBS student Sh. Hege Riku</u> <u>Lampung, Indira Gandhi Medical College, Shimla.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to application for re-admission of MBBS student Sh. Hege Riku Lampung, Indira Gandhi Medical College, Shimla.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the letter dated 06.08.2015 from the Principal, Indira Gandhi Medical College, Shimla and observed that the Committee at its meeting held on 02 March, 2015 had decided as under:-

"The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the matter with regard to readmission of Ms. George Nisha TK George, Jubilee Mission Medical College & Research Institute, Thrissur after long leave was placed before the Executive Committee of this Council at its meeting held on 1/10/2014 and the Committee decided as under:-

"The Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter dated 7/6/2014 of the Registrar, University of Calicut with regard to re-admission of Ms. George Nisha TK George, Jubilee Mission Medical College & Research Institute, Thrissur and decided to allow Ms. George Nisha TK in the MBBS course since she was admitted to final MBBS course during 2013 after availing long leave on medical grounds.

Further, the Executive Committee decided that a policy needs to be formulated regarding joining/re-admission of candidates to MBBS course and to obtain legal opinion on what should be the duration of the leave allowed."

The Executive Committee of the Council also perused the opinion of Law Officer, the operative part of which reads as under:

"Clause 12 (1) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 provides as under:-

"ATTENDANCE: 75% attendance in a subject for appearing in the examination is compulsory inclusive of attendance in non-lecture teaching i.e. seminars, group

discussions, tutorials, demonstrations, practicals, hospital (Tertiary Secondary, Primary) posting and bed side clinics etc."

As such the concept of leave of any kind whatsoever was not envisaged in the MBBS course. Further, the Regulations do not provide for any time-limit in which the MBBS course is required to be completed. Hence, for an MBBS student, who owing to an exigency/exceptional circumstances has left the course in between, can be permitted to resume his studies from the point from where he had left the course. The course can be completed by him after meeting the attendance requirement. In this regard, no duration for the gap period is required to be provided for, as the Regulations do not prescribe the time duration in which the MBBS course of four and a half years with an additional internship of one year is required to be completed."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to allow the application of these three (3) candidates and permit them to resume their studies."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to allow Sh. Hege Riku Lampung for resuming his MBBS studies at Indira Gandhi Medical College, Shimla.

20. Approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meeting in the matter of appeal dated 02.07.2014 filed by Dr. Dilip Mathur, Noida against Order dated 10.06.2014 passed by Delhi Medical Council.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meeting in the matter of appeal dated 02.07.2014 filed by Dr. Dilip Mathur, Noida against Order dated 10.06.2014 passed by Delhi Medical Council.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the proceedings of the Ethics Committee meeting in the matter of appeal dated 02.07.2014 filed by Dr. Dilip Mathur, Noida against Order dated 10.06.2014 passed by Delhi Medical Council.

21. Report of the Sub Committee constituted to consider the matter with regard to medical colleges which have been investigated by CBI/CVO.

Read: the matter with regard to report of the Sub Committee constituted to consider the matter with regard to medical colleges which have been investigated by CBI/CVO.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration of the matter.

22. Report of the Sub Committee regarding working out the various modalities in the Gazette Notification dated 28.10.2013 in respect of utilization of the hospital owned by the State Government.

Read: the matter with regard to report of the Sub Committee regarding working out the various modalities in the Gazette Notification dated 28.10.2013 in respect of utilization of the hospital owned by the State Government.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the report of the Sub Committee regarding working out the various modalities in the Gazette Notification dated 28.10.2013 in respect of utilization of the hospital owned by the State Government and decided that the following recommendations of the sub-committee for utilization of the hospital owned by the State Government under PPP mode, as amended be approved:

(1) That the hospital owned and managed by the appropriate Government should be minimum 300 bedded hospital with necessary infrastructural facilities capable of being

- developed into a teaching institution situated on a plot land having area not less than prescribed under the Regulations. The medical college shall provide free transportation facilities for students and staff. The said hospital would be on one piece of the land and the building of the college including library and hostel for the students/inters, PGs/Residents, nurses may be housed on any of the two pieces of land.
- (2) The minimum 300 bedded hospital has to be transferred by the Government to the applicant trust/society/company through an appropriate Memorandum of Understanding by way of lease of 99 years preferably but in any case not less than 33 years or such period of lease as may be prescribed by the State Government provided that the said lease period is not less than 33 years.
- (3) The hospital must be suitably altered through appropriate modifications into a teaching hospital specially with reference to the break up of the 300 beds into 120 beds allocable for Surgical Specialities, 120 for Medical Specialities and 60 for Obst. & Gynae. and also capable of forming clinical units of 30 beds each with required ward size, teaching and training space and other prescribed requirements as per the governing regulations before the application is made by the applicant for starting the new medical college.
- (4) The hospital should have all the feasibility for it being periodically upgraded including the augmentation of the number of beds and commensurate teaching units and teaching compliment as prescribed by the Governing Regulations with respect to the permitted annual intake for the college of 50/100/150/200/250 as the case may be.
- (5) The personnel working in the said hospital, technicians, para clinical staff including nurses and the menial staff), if transferred to medical college, upon their transfer shall be under the administrative control of the Dean of the Medical College ensuring that there is no "duality" of administrative control of any type.
- (6) The administrative control so envisaged would include "Academic", "Clinical" and "Financial" aspect as well.
- (7) The clinical staff working at the said hospital other than those who conform to the prescribed eligibility for being designated as Assistant Professor, Associate Professor, Professor of the concerned subject, as the case may be prescribed by the Teachers' Eligibility Qualification Regulations will have to be replaced by the full time appointment of the requisite number of duly qualified full time medical teachers in accordance with the prescribed requirements under the governing Regulations. In order to ensure that the binding operational dictum that "teaching physician has to be the treating physician" meaning thereby that the "treating" personnel would be the one who would be the "teaching" personnel.

In view of above, it was further decided that Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 shall be further amended by substituting last para in Section 2(5) under the heading "Qualifying Criteria" as under:

"Further provided that the following conditions as set out below are fulfilled and form part and parcel of the Memorandum of Understanding:

- (1) That the hospital owned and managed by the appropriate Government should be minimum 300 bedded hospital with necessary infrastructural facilities capable of being developed into a teaching institution situated on a plot land having area not less than prescribed under the Regulations. The medical college shall provide free transportation facilities for students and staff. The said hospital would be on one piece of the land and the building of the college including library and hostel for the students/inters, PGs/Residents, nurses may be housed on any of the two pieces of land.
- (2) The minimum 300 bedded hospital has to be transferred by the Government to the applicant trust/society/company through an appropriate Memorandum of Understanding by way of lease of 99 years preferably but in any case not less than 33 years or such period of lease as may be prescribed by the State Government provided that the said lease period is not less than 33 years.
- (3) The hospital must be suitably altered through appropriate modifications into a teaching hospital specially with reference to the break up of the 300 beds into 120 beds allocable for Surgical Specialities, 120 for Medical Specialities and 60 for Obst. & Gynae. and also capable of forming clinical units of 30 beds each with required ward size, teaching and training space and other prescribed requirements as per the governing regulations before the application is made by the applicant for starting the new medical college.
- (4) The hospital should have all the feasibility for it being periodically upgraded including the augmentation of the number of beds and commensurate teaching units and teaching compliment as prescribed by the Governing Regulations with respect to the permitted annual intake for the college of 50/100/150/200/250 as the case may be.
- (5) The personnel working in the said hospital, technicians, para clinical staff including nurses and the menial staff), if transferred to medical college, upon their transfer shall be under the administrative control of the Dean of the Medical College ensuring that there is no "duality" of administrative control of any type.
- (6) The administrative control so envisaged would include "Academic", "Clinical" and "Financial" aspect as well.
- (7) The clinical staff working at the said hospital other than those who conform to the prescribed eligibility for being designated as Assistant Professor, Associate Professor, Professor of the concerned subject, as the case may be prescribed by the Teachers' Eligibility Qualification Regulations will have to be replaced by the full time appointment of the requisite number of duly qualified full time medical teachers in accordance with the prescribed requirements under the governing Regulations. In order to ensure that the binding operational dictum that "teaching physician has to be the treating physician" meaning thereby that

the "treating" personnel would be the one who would be the "teaching" personnel.

The matter be placed before the General body of the Council.

23. <u>Consideration of attendance period of Ms. Rushna Bano at J.N. Institute of Medical Sciences, Imphal for the examination of II Prof. examination.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to consideration of attendance period of Ms. Rushna Bano at J.N. Institute of Medical Sciences, Imphal for the examination of II Prof. examination.

The Executive Committee observed that Dean, B.R.D. Medical College, Gorakhpur had requested MCI "to let them know as to whether by considering the period of 4 months of II MBBS Course of J.N. Institute of Medical Sciences, Imphal she can be eligible for appearing in II Prof. examination to be held from 02.04.2015."

It was also observed by the Committee that reply of MCI permitting her to appear at II M.B;B.S. examination of April 2015 is not on record. However, it appears that she has been allowed to appear at the examination without waiting from the reply from MCI & contrary to Regulations and also to specific condition mentioned in MCI letter permitting migration.

It was also observed by the Committee that the Council vide its letter dated 06.08.2015 informed the Principal, BRD Medical College, Gorakhpur under intimation to Ms. Rushna Bano that "in terms of clause 6(5) of Graduate Medical Education Regulation, 19997 with regard to Migration, request of Ms. Rushna Bano cannot be considered."

In above view of the matter, the Executive Committee of the Council decided that the request of Ms. Rushna Bano cannot be considered as it is contrary to Migration Regulations. It was further decided to ask explanation from the Dean as to Ms. Rushna Bano was allowed to appear at II Professional examination of April 2015 contrary to MCI Regulations & specific condition laid down in the letter of MCI permitting migration.

24. <u>Annual Report of Medical Council of India for the academic year 2014-15.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to annual report of Medical Council of India for the academic year 2014-15.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the annual report of Medical Council of India for the academic year 2014-15 and directed to place the same before the General Body of the Council.

25. <u>Padmashree Dr. D.Y. Patil Medical College, Pimpri, Pune – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Padmashree Dr. D.Y. Patil Medical College, Pimpri, Pune – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (1st & 2nd September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the

Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5th batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Padmashree Dr. D.Y. Patil Medical College, Pimpri, Pune under Dr. D.Y. Patil University, Pune for the academic year 2016-17.

26. <u>Prathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Karimnagar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 2nd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Prathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Karimnagar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 2nd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (1st & 2nd September, 2015) and noted the following:

- 1. Lecture Theaters: Facility for E class is not available in any lecture theater of college or hospital.
- 2. OPD: Registration counters are not linked with MRD. Duty list of staff at Registration Counters was not provided. No facility of computer other database is available at enquiry counter.
- 3. Teaching Beds: In Orthopaedics department, only 70 beds are available against 120 required. Demonstration rooms with capacity of only 20 are small than required. There is no display of posters, charts in all the areas.
- 4. O.T.s: There is only 1 Defibrillator amongst all O.T.s in the main O.T. complex. Infusion Pumps & Syringe Pumps are not available. Minor O.T. is not fully equipped.
- 5. ICUs: Details of patients in ICCU are not provided.
- 6. Only 5 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 6.
- 7. Website: Faculty data is old.
- 8. RHTC: Cold chain equipment is not available. Registers of survey & FP are not available. On cross checking, it was found that data entered in ANC register were false. No vehicle log books was shown. No National Health Programme activities are carried out. Interns are not involved in National Health Programmes.
- 9. UHC: It is situated in a commercial complex in leased premises taken on lease for 10 years. No registers for survey & FP activities are available. No specialists' visit register is available. There is no documentary evidence of population covered.
- 10. Departmental Library register of General Medicine department has not been updated since 2007.
- 11. In General Surgery ward of Unit I, no patient is discharged after 17/08/2015 till date of assessment. As per record, there are 51 patients on 30 beds. However, on physical verification, only 23 patients were found. Hence Bed Occupancy Ratio shown by authorities appear to be inflated.
- 12. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2nd batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 200 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Prathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Karimnagar under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada for the academic year 2016-17.

27. <u>Stanley Medical College, Chennai – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Stanley Medical College, Chennai – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (1st & 2nd September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4th batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Stanley Medical College, Chennai under The Tamil Nadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai for the academic year 2016-17.

28. <u>Madras Medical College, Chennai – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 165-250 for the academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Madras Medical College, Chennai – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 165-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (1st & 2nd September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4th batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 165 to 250 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Madras Medical College, Chennai under The Tamil Nadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai for the academic year 2016-17.

29. Gandhi Medical College, Hyderabad – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Gandhi Medical College, Hyderabad – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (1st & 2nd September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4th batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 200 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Gandhi Medical College, Hyderabad under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada for the academic year 2016-17.

30. Vydehi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore - Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Vydehi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bangalore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4^{th} Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (1st & 2nd September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4th batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Vydehi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre,

Bangalore under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore for the academic year 2016-17.

31. <u>Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry – Renewal of Permission for admission of 3rd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (1st & 2nd September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 250 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Institute, Pondicherry under Sri Balaji Vidyapeeth (Deemed University), Pondicherry for the academic year 2016-17.

32. <u>Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Narketpally, Nalgonda – Renewal of Permission for admission of 2nd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Narketpally, Nalgonda – Renewal of Permission for admission of 2nd Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (3rd and 4th September, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Shortage of Residents is 9.9 % as detailed in the report. No evidence of payment of stipend to bank account or bank transfer was provided in respect of some Residents.
- 2. OPD: Dressing rooms & Minor O.T. need upgradation with proper dressing material & necessary equipment. Four patients' entry in Minor O.T. Surgery found at time of assessment were found as wrong entry.
- Wards: In some wards, there are rooms for doctors on duty but lacking furniture, proper fan/cooler, toilets and drinking water facility. Wards need proper stock of medicines, I.V. sets, syringes, B.P. apparatus, emergency medicines, emergency tray, ambu bags, ETI tubes, antiseptic solutions, etc. All patients admitted in Surgical wards were bringing prescribed medicines from hospital pharmacy because same stock was not available in the wards. Ward stocks need proper strengthening.
- 4. On day of assessment, no General Surgery operation was performed. Most of the cases of major operations were of Ophthalmology & ENT.
- 5. ICUs: There were only 2 patients in ICCU on day of assessment.
- 6. Common Rooms for Boys & Girls: Attached toilets are not provided.
- 7. RHTC: Girls' accommodation is having 16 beds in 4 rooms i.e. 4 girls / room which is not permissible. Cold chain equipment is inadequate.
- 8. UHC: It is under partial control of Principal. Survey registers are maintained by staff of Nagar Palika & not by Community Medicine Department. Family folders have not been updated since 2009.
- 9. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2nd

batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 of Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Narketpally, Nalgonda under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

33. <u>JSS Medical College, Mysore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to JSS Medical College, Mysore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150-200 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (1st & 2nd September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4th batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 150 to 200 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of JSS Medical College, Mysore under JSS University, Mysore for the academic year 2016-17.

34. <u>S.V.S. Medical College, Mahabubnagar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to S.V.S. Medical College, Mahabubnagar – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration of the matter for the next meeting.

35. Approval of the Minutes of the Building Committee Meetings held on 07/07/2015 and 26/08/2015.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the Minutes of the Building Committee Meetings held on 07/07/2015 and 26/08/2015.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Building Committee Meetings held on 07/07/2015 and 26/08/2015.

36. <u>Approval of the Minutes of the Administration and Grievance</u> Committee Meeting held on 20/07/2015.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the Minutes of the Administration and Grievance Committee Meeting held on 20/07/2015.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the Minutes of the Administration and Grievance Committee Meeting held on 20/07/2015.

It has been observed by the members of the Executive Committee that the members of Administration & Grievance Committee themselves have been nominated as members of Enquiry Committee to enquire into the complaints of ragging, etc. against medical colleges. Thereafter they, as members of Administration & Grievance Committee also peruse the Enquiry Report and take decision upon such reports. It was felt that this is not proper as no person can be judged in his own cause.

In view of above, it was decided to advise the members of Administration & Grievance Committee not to be part of such Enquiry Committees. Whenever such Enquiry Committee needs to be constituted, it should be done only with approval of President MCI.

The Executive Committee decided to change the name of Committee to "Administration & MCI Staff Grievance Committee".

37. Approval of Minutes of Departmental Promotion Committee for considering the cases of Promotion of U.D.C.'s to the post of Assistant, held on 01/09/2015.

Read: the matter with regard to approval of Minutes of Departmental Promotion Committee for considering the cases of Promotion of U.D.C.'s to the post of Assistant, held on 01/09/2015.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of Departmental Promotion Committee for considering the cases of promotion of the following U.D.C.'s to the post of Assistant, held on 01/09/2015:-

- 1. Shri Hoshiar Singh
- 2. Shri Dinesh Kumar
- 3. Shri Kadam Singh
- 4. Smt. Pushpa Rai

38. Recognition of medical qualifications obtained from Crimea State Medical University.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition of medical qualifications obtained from Crimea State Medical University.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the legal opinion of the Learned Additional Solicitor General of India which states as under:-

- 1. The querist Medical Council of India has sought my opinion in the case of students who had taken admission in the medical colleges affiliated to Crimea State Medical University, Simferopol, Ukraine. In view of the internal disturbance in Ukraine due to civil war, the Embassy of India had suggested to the students to change their institutions to other regions of Ukraine. The issue which required consideration is based upon Regulation 4(3) of the Screening Test Regulation, 2002of the Querist which requires a medical student to undergo the complete primary medical course at the same institution located abroad. In view of the war like situation, which in the present case has occurred in Ukraine, whether the students who had shifted their institutions can be allowed to sit in the Screening Test.
- I have discussed the matter with Mr. Gaurav Sharma and Mr. Tanoodbhav Singhdev, advocates for the querist -Medical Council of India and also gone through the documents forwarded relating to the matter.
- 3. It is appropriate to consider the relevant provision of the IMC Act, 1956 and the Regulations made thereunder. Section 13 of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 deals with the recognition of medical qualification granted by the certain medical institutions whose qualification are not included in the First and Second Schedule to the Act. In the year 2001, in order to deal with the problem of the students who had undergone their primary medical education from Russia, Section 13 of the IMC Act, 1956 was amended by the Parliament and Section 13(4A), 13(4B) & 13(4C) were inserted. The relevant portion of the amendment made to Section 13 is reproduced hereunder:-

"......13. RECOGNITION OF MEDICAL QUALIFICATION GRANTED BY CERTAIN MEDICAL INSTITUTIONS WHOSE QUALIFICATIONS ARE NOT INCLUDED IN THE FIRST OR SECOND SCHEDULE

1. The medical qualifications granted by medical institutions in India which are not included in the First Schedule and which are included in Part I of the Third Schedule shall also be recognised medical qualifications for the purposes of this Act.

4. The Central Government, after consulting the Council, may, by notification in the Official Gazette, amend Part II of the Third Schedule so

..

as to include therein any qualification granted by a medical institution outside India, which is not included in the Second Schedule.

Provided that after the commencement of the Indian Medical Council (Amendment) Act, 2001, no such amendment shall be made in Part II of the Third Schedule to include any primary medical qualification granted by any medical institution outside India:

Provided further that nothing contained in the first proviso shall apply to inclusion in Part II of the Third Schedule any primary medical qualification granted by any medical institution outside India to any person whose name is entered in the Indian Medical Register.

Explanation- For the purposes of this sub-section, "primary medical qualification" means any minimum qualification sufficient for enrolment on any State Medical Register or for entering the name in the Indian Medical Register.

(4A) A person who is a citizen of India and obtains medical qualification granted by any medical institution in any country outside India recognised for enrolment as medical practitioner in that country after such date as may be specified by the Central Government under subsection (3), shall not be entitled to be enrolled on any Medical Register maintained by a State Medical Council or to have his name entered in the Indian Medical Register unless he qualified the screening test in India prescribed for such purpose and such foreign medical qualification after such person qualifies that said screening test shall be deemed to be the recognised medical qualification for the purposes of this Act for that person.

(4B) A person who is a citizen of India shall not, after such date as may be specified by the Central Government under sub-section (3), be eligible to get admission to obtain medical qualification granted by any medical institution in any foreign country without obtaining an eligibility certificate issued to him by the Council and in case any such person obtains such qualification without obtaining such eligibility certificate, he shall not be eligible to appear in the screening test referred to in subsection (4A):

Provided that an Indian citizen who has acquired the medical qualification from foreign medical institution or has obtained admission in foreign medical institution before the commencement of the Indian Medical Council (Amendment) Act, 2001 shall not be required to obtain eligibility certificate under this sub-section but, if he is qualified for admission to any medical course for recognised medical qualification in any medical institution in India, he shall be required to qualify only the screening test prescribed for enrolment on any State Medical Register or for entering his name in the Indian Medical Register.

- (4C) Nothing contained in sub-sections (4A) and (4B) shall apply to the medical qualifications referred to in section 14 for the purposes of that section.
- 5. Any medical institution in India which is desirous of getting a medical qualification granted by it included in Part I of the Third Schedule may apply to the Central Government to have such qualification recognised and the Central Government, after consulting the Council, may by notification in the Official Gazette, amend Part I of the Third Schedule so as to include such qualification therein, and any such notification may also direct that an entry shall be made in the last column of Part-I of the Third Schedule against such medical qualification declaring that it shall be a recognised medical qualification only when granted after a specified
- 4. In accordance with the provisions of the IMC (Amendment) Act, 2001, 'Screening Test Regulations', 2002 and 'Eligibility Requirement for taking admission for an Undergraduate Medical Course in Institutions Abroad Regulations', 2002, were made and were published in the official gazette on 18.02.2002.
- 5. In terms of the Regulations mentioned above, after 15.03.2002, any candidate, prior to taking admission in any foreign medical institution has to approach the MCI for the purpose of procuring an Eligibility Certificate and upon return to India after completing the said foreign medical course, has to qualify the Screening Test. It is only after qualifying

the Screening Test that the said candidate could seek registration for the purpose of practising medicine in the India.

6. The Eligibility Requirement For Taking Admission in an Undergraduate Medical Course in a Foreign Medical Institution Regulations, 2002, under Clause 2(f) and Clause 3, provides that a person who is desirous of joining an undergraduate medical course in any foreign medical institution on or after 15th march, 2002 must fulfill the requisite criteria and is required to approach the Council for issue of an Eligibility Certificate before seeking admission to such foreign medical college. The relevant portion of Eligibility Requirement For Taking Admission in an Undergraduate Medical Course in a Foreign Medical Institution Regulations, 2002 is reproduced as under:-

«

2. Definitions:-

(f) "qualifying examination" means the examination to be qualified to become eligible for admission to MBBS course in India as prescribed in the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997.

......

- **3.** An Indian citizen, who has passed the qualifying examination either from India or an equivalent examination from abroad and is desirous of joining an undergraduate medical course in any foreign medical institution on or after 15th March, 2002 shall approach the Council for issue of an Eligibility Certificate for that purpose......"
- 7. Clause 4 (2) of the Screening Test Regulations, 2002 provides that no person shall be allowed to appear in the screening test if he had not obtained Eligibility Certificate from Medical Council of India as per the 'Eligibility Requirement For Taking Admission in an Undergraduate Medical Course in a Foreign Medical Institution Regulations, 2002' after 15th March, 2002 prior to joining the foreign medical institution. Clause 4 (3) provides that the candidate must have studied for the medical course at the same institute located abroad for the entire duration of the course from where the candidate has obtained the medical degree. The Screening Test Regulation provides a detailed procedure as well as the eligibility criteria for a student who has undergone a primary medical qualification in a foreign medical institute MBBS course in an institution suggested abroad to be eligibility to produce in the screening test the relevant portion of Regulation Act is reproduced hereunder:-

«

2. Definitions:-

(f) "Primary Medical qualification" means a medical qualification awarded by any medical institution outside India which is a recognized qualification for enrolment as medical practitioner in the country in which the institution awarding the said qualification is situated and which is equivalent to MBBS in India.

.....

3. An Indian citizen possessing a primary medical qualification awarded by any medical institution outside India who is desirous of getting provisional or permanent registration with the Medical Council of India or any State Medical Council on or after 15.03.2002 shall have to qualify a screening test conducted by the prescribed authority for that purpose as per the provisions of section 13 of the Act:

Provided that a person seeking permanent registration shall not have to qualify the screening test if he/she had already qualified the same before getting his/her provisional registration.

4 Flimibility quitouis

4. Eligibility criteria:-

No person shall be allowed to appear in the screening test unless:

1.

2. he/she had obtained 'Eligibility Certificate' from the Medical Council of India as per the 'Eligibility Requirement for taking

admission in an undergraduate medical course in a Foreign Medical Institution Regulations, 2002'. This requirement shall not be necessary in respect of Indian citizens who have acquired the medical qualifications from foreign medical institutions or have obtained admission in foreign medical institution before 15th March, 2002.

3. He/She has studied for the medical course at the same institute located abroad for the entire duration of the course from where he/she has obtained the degree.

.....

- **5.** The purpose of conducting the screening test shall be only to determine the eligibility or otherwise of a candidate for his or her registration with the Medical Council of India or any State Medical Council and qualifying the same shall not confer any other right, whatsoever, on a candidate......"
- 8. I am informed that according to the letter received from the Indian Embassy at Ukraine, around 600 to 1000 students are presently undergoing primary medicine course in Crimea State Medical University, Ukraine in the colleges located at Lugansk and Donetsk. I am also informed that in view of the civil war in Ukraine there is a threat of life to the Indian students studying at the Lugansk State Medical University and Donetsk State Medical University. The Indian Embassy has informed that the Ukraine Govt. has recommended transfer of foreign students to other universities situated in other regions of Ukraine. Accordingly Indian Embassy in Ukraine had requested the Indian students to shift to other region of Ukraine for completion of their primary medical qualification. In this regard a letter dated 25.08.2014 was also received by the Querist from the Indian Embassy. The relevant portion is reproduced hereunder:-

4. In view of the rapidly deteriorating security situation, the Ukrainian Ministry of Education vide letter dated 4 August 2014 (Google transaction attached) had recommended to the Rectors of the Lugansk State Medical University and Donetsk State Medical University that the transfer of foreign students to other universities in other regions of Ukraine should be facilitated as continuation of education was not possible in view of the difficult socio-political situation in the Donetsk and Lugansk regions. The Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine also advised that no foreign student should be admitted in the academic year 2014-15. The Ministry further advised through the Ukrainian Study Centre for International Education website on 6 August 2014 that international students studying in Donetsk and Lugansk should transfer to educational institutions in other regions of Ukraine.

- 5. In view of the fact that the Ukrainian Government itself has recommended foreign students in educational institutions in Donetsk and Luganks to shift to educational institutions in Donetsk Embassy has likewise urged Indian students in these regions to accordingly seek transfer as per the advice of the Ukrainian Ministry of Education and Science.
- 6. From the foregoing it is clear that the Indian students studying in Donetsk State Medical University and the Lugansk State Medical University have no option but to shift in view of the war like conditions obtaining in the regions of their study and seek a transfer to other regions of Ukraine. The Medical Council of India may please be asked to clarify that such Indian students would be exempted from the requirement of completing the entire duration of course from the same educational institute from where they obtain their medical degree.
- 7. I shall be grateful for an early reply as there are more than 1000 anxious Indian students who are seeking this clarification even as they are in the process of shifting to medical universities in other regions of Ukraine. The Embassy has approached the Ukrainian Ministry of Education and Science for a full list of accredited medical colleges / universities whose degrees are recognized by the Ukrainian Government for purposes of medical practice in Ukraine. This would be shared with the Ministry of Health and Family \Welfare and Medical Council of India on receipt.

....."

9. In view of the above I am of the considered opinion that the prime responsibility of the country is to look after its citizens and ensure their safety. Once the Indian Embassy in Ukraine has suggested the transfer of the Indian students to other regions of Ukraine for their safety, the querist will be required to bring a suitable amendment in their Regulations so as to provide for such situations in which the years of education of Indian students studying in foreign medical institutions should be protected. I am informed that the Executive Committee of the querist has considered the matter and proposed an amendment in the Screening Test Regulations, 2002 by adding a proviso under Regulation 4(3) of the said Regulation to take care of above situation. I have also gone through the proposed amendment forwarded by the querist in the Screening Test Regulation, 2002 and I suggest that the querist may take appropriate steps to notify the proposed amendment for the benefit of students who, due to war like situation in Ukraine, were compelled to change their institutions.

In view of the above legal opinion of the Ld. ASG, the Executive Committee of the Council approved the same and further decided that Section 4(3) of the Screening Test Regulations, 2002 be amended by inserting a proviso as under:

"Provided in cases where Central Government is informed of condition of war, civil unrest, rebellion, internal war or any such situation wherein life of Indian citizen is in distress and such information has been received through the Indian Embassy in that country then the Council shall relax the requirement of obtaining medical education from the same institute located abroad in respect of which communication has been received from the Indian Embassy in that country."

It was further decided to place the same before General Body of the Council.

39. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5th batch (100 seats) of BPS Government Medical College for Women, Khanpur Kalan, Sonepat, Haryana under Pt. B.D Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak, Haryana u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 5th batch (100 seats) of BPS Government Medical College for Women, Khanpur Kalan, Sonepat, Haryana under Pt. B.D Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak, Haryana u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (09th & 10th September, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 11.32 % (12 out of 106) as detailed in the report.
- 2. 4 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5. Out of these 4 available machines, 2 are of 500 mA capacity against requirement of 600 mA.
- 3. CT scan is not available.
- 4. Lecture Theaters: One lecture theater is under construction. Therefore there is deficit of 1 Lecture Theater.
- 5. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission for MBBS course for 5th batch (100 seats) of BPS Government Medical College for Women, Khanpur Kalan, Sonepat, Haryana under Pt. B.D Sharma University of Health Sciences, Rohtak, Haryana u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

40. Osmania Medical College, Hyderabad – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 200-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Osmania Medical College, Hyderabad – Renewal of Permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 200-250 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (3rd & 4th September, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Examination Halls: Two examination halls of capacity 280 are available against requirement of 3 of capacity 250 each.
- 2. Lecture Theaters: No lecture theater has required capacity of 300. Hospital lecture is of capacity 110 against requirement of 300 and is of flat type.
- 3. Central Library: Available area is 2,000 sq.m. against requirement of 4,000 sq.m. There is no separate staff reading room or PG/Resident reading room. Total 82 journals are available against requirement of 100. Air conditioners in areas other than computer section are not in working order.
- 4. Students' Hostels: Available accommodation is 491 against requirement of 938. Study rooms are not air-conditioned.
- 5. Interns' Hostel: Available accommodation is 144 against requirement of 250. There is no separate hostel for female interns. Study room is not airconditioned.
- 6. Nurses' Hostel: It is overcrowded.
- 7. Residential quarters: No quarters for faculty & non-teaching staff are available in the campus. They are allotted accommodation from general Government pool.
- 8. OPD: Waiting area is small and congested. Dressing room is not separate. It is done in Minor O.T. which is not as per norms.
- 9. There is no qualified speech therapist.
- 10. Wards: General Medicine & General Surgery wards are very close and congested. Examination/Treatment room is not available. Pantry is not available in many wards. Demonstration room of Orthopaedics ward is small.
- 11. Casualty: There is no Ventilator available.
- 12. O.T.s: Majority of O.T.s have 2 tables each which is not as per norms.
- 13. Website: it is not updated.
- 14. Anatomy department: MRI & CT films are not available in the museum. Number of cadavers available are only 4 which is inadequate for number of students admitted.
- 15. Community Medicine department: Available Demonstration rooms are 3 against requirement of 4.
- 16. RHTC: It is not under full control of Dean. Residential facilities are not available. UG students are not posted as transport is not provided by the college.
- 17. UHC: UG students are not posted as transport is not provided by the college. Specialists' visits are not organized.
- 18. Demonstration rooms in paraclinical departments are smaller having capacity of 65 against 75-100 required.
- 19. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4th batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 200-250 of Osmania Medical College, Hyderabad under Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

41. Kempegowda Institute of Medical Sciences, Bangalore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 120-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

Read: the matter with regard to Kempegowda Institute of Medical Sciences, Bangalore – Renewal of Permission for admission of 5th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 120-150 for the academic session 2016-17.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Assessors report (8th & 9th September, 2015) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5th batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 120 to 150 u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 in respect of Kempegowda Institute of Medical Sciences, Bangalore under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore for the academic year 2016-17.

42. <u>Extension of contractual services of Dr. M. Rajalakshmi, Chief Consultant (Academic Cell).</u>

Read: the matter with regard to extension of contractual services of Dr. M. Rajalakshmi, Chief Consultant (Academic Cell).

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to extend the contractual services of Dr. M. Rajalakshmi, Chief Consultant (Academic Cell) for a further period of six months.

43. Extension of Service of Dr. Srikanta Barik.

Read: the matter with regard to extension of service of Dr. Srikanta Barik.

The Executive Committee of the Council ratified the decision taken by the President, MCI to extend the services of Dr. Srikanta Barik, Consultant for a further period of six months.

44. Engagement of Dr. Chandana Dass, Consultant.

Read: the matter with regard to engagement of Dr. Chandana Dass, Consultant.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to regularize the appointment of Dr. Chandana Das as per the same terms and conditions as applicable to other consultants so appointed by the Council and further decided that her appointment will be considered for a period of six months as in the case of other consultants appointed in the Council..

45. <u>Ex-post facto approval to Mr. Hans Raj for undergone internship training from 11.11.2013 to 07.11.2014 at Narinder Mohan Hospital and Heart Centre, Ghaziabad.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Ex-post facto approval to Mr. Hans Raj for undergone internship training from 11.11.2013 to 07.11.2014 at Narinder Mohan Hospital and Heart Centre, Ghaziabad.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that the candidate Mr. Hans Raj has not submitted No Objection Certificate from the College & University, as required. The Committee further noted that he has completed internship at Narinder Mohan Hospital & Heart Center without obtaining NOC from the college, University or MCI.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided that his request cannot be considered and directed to call an explanation from Medical Superintendent as to how Dr. Hans Raj was allowed to do internship at the hospital without any NOC or permission from the concerned authorities.

46. <u>Admission of 1st year MBBS students at Rohilkhand Medical College, Bareilly for the Academic year 2013-14.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to admission of 1st year MBBS students at Rohilkhand Medical College, Bareilly for the Academic year 2013-14.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that in spite of repeated reminders institution has not replied and instead dodged the query.

In view of the above it was decided to issue show cause notice as to why the processing of their applications for renewal of permission/continuance of recognition be not stopped for the academic year 2016-17 and why recommendation should not be made to the Central Government to withdraw the recognition for award of MBBS degree. The Committee therefore decided that the same may be intimated to DME of the State and State Medical Council also.

47. <u>Admission of MBBS student at Pt. JNM Medical College, Raipur, Chattisgarh for the Academic Year 2014-15.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to admission of MBBS student at Pt. JNM Medical College, Raipur, Chattisgarh for the Academic Year 2014-15.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 09/09/2015 from the Secretary of the Government of Meghalaya, Health & Family Welfare Department informing that Ms. Pringniatchi S Momim has obtained 55.37% marks in Common Entrance Examination.

In view of above letter, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to revoke discharge notice issued to Ms. Pringniatchi S Momim.

48. Recognition/approval of Sri Muthukumaran Medical College, Hospital & Research Institute, Chennai for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Sri Muthukumaran Medical College, Hospital & Research Institute, Chennai for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (18th Sept., 15) along with the previous compliance verification assessment reports(28th April & 17th April, 2015) and assessment report(18th & 19th Feb., 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 23.48 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 100 %. No Resident doctor is staying in the campus. Even if attendance report is considered, shortage of Residents is 41.17 %.
- 3. OPD attendance was 500-600 against requirement of 1,200 as per Regulations. Data given by the institute are highly inflated.
- 4. There were only 3 patients in casualty at time of assessment.
- 5. Bed occupancy on physical verification was 49.38 % (i.e. 321 out of 650 beds) on day of assessment. Many patients were not genuine. Such

- patients had no medicines, no relatives and apparently made to sit for head count.
- 6. There were NIL Major operations & only 7 Minor operations on day of assessment.
- 7. There is only 1 patient each in PICU/NICU & RICU on day of assessment.
- 8. In the last report, a remark was "Radiology registers had plenty of blank serial numbers allotted in between regular patient names." On this assessment on 11/09/2015, it was observed that register record of 27/04/2015 had no blank serial numbers and these had probably been filled up subsequently.
- 9. Planning & building permission is not issued by CMDA. The Govt. Order cited by the institute in compliance is only a conditional order asking CMDA to issue planning permission upon fulfillment of certain conditions and obtaining NOCs from various agencies which process has not yet been completed.
- 10. There was only 1 Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
- 11. Most of faculty & Residents are not involved in patient care as is evident from patient case which bear daily notes by mostly Interns.
- 12. Dean & Medical Superintendent were absent on first day of assessment.
- 13. Some of the employees/ workers were shown as patients in different wards for Inspection purpose. These patients left the wards after the Inspection team visit and when the team came to the same ward shortly afterwards, the patients were not present on their beds. They, however, rushed inside the Ward in the presence of the Inspection team. These patients were fake as the medical case sheets bore different names than those who had rushed to occupy the beds. Some of these patients also presented as indoor patients in other wards to the Inspection team.
- 14. Three different OT lists (of 12 patients) were found submitted for 11th Sept 2015 by General Surgery Deptt. Seven of these patients were not found admitted in the surgical wards at all. No major surgery was done by General Surgery Deptt. on 11th Sept 2015. The remaining patients of the list had undergone minor procedures few days ago. No major surgery was done by Obst. & Gynae. Deptt or by any other Deptt. on 11th Sept 2015.
- 15. In case paper record of patient Rajima admitted on 7th Sept 2015 (OP No.-781325, IP No. 20150907108) no morning round notes for 11th Sept 2015 were charted in the file. The OPD card of the patient was blank and no investigation had been carried.
- 16. In case paper record of patient Ambika (Hospital No. 782146, IP No.-90592) admitted on 5th Sept 2015, the OPD record book is totally blank, no investigations have been advised. The oral iron therapy has been advised but not received by patient.
- 17. In the case paper record of patient Renuka (OP No. 782157, IP No. 20150905121) is admitted in Unit I of Obst. & Gynae. Deptt., there are no notes of daily rounds for 6th and 7th Sept 2015. Investigations were also not found in the record.
- 18. In the case paper record of patient Saroja (Hospital No. 782016, IP No. 2015090582) is admitted in Unit II of Obst. & Gynae. Deptt., the OPD patient record is blank. Investigations were also not done. Dose of drug Amikacin prescribed and charted is wrong and the same wrong dose has been prescribed daily in the round notes.
- 19. In the case paper record of patient Suguna (IP No. 2015090895, OP No. 781885) admitted in Medicine Deptt., no medicines or any relative was available with the patient and patient entered after the Inspectors along with many other women patients. The patients name on her medical case file was different from her actual name and there were no doctor's name or signature on her case record.
- 20. Some of the patient case papers were partly blank with no laboratory data or recent treatment notes.

- 21. There is no proper playground for medical college in the campus. There is a large ground which is full of overgrown vegetations and cannot be used as a playground.
- 22. In this campus, there are two Engineering Colleges, one Arts and Science College, one Nursing College and one Nursing School run by same Management. There is no separate earmarked boundary for Medical College.
- 23. No Intern Girls Hostel is available but they are staying in Nursing Students Hostel for B. Sc Nursing, ANM and GNM students.
- 24. No separate Nursing quarter/ hostel for Medical College Hospital nursing staff. The Authorities have shown us Nursing College students Hostel for Nursing staff also.
- 25. No mess facility in resident boys hostel.
- 26. No mess facility / warden/ recreation room in Interns Boys Hostel.
- 27. Dean's chamber and College Council room are situated in Physiology Deptt. There is no administrative office/ setup in College building.
- 28. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend not to recognize/approve of Sri Muthukumaran Medical College Hospital & Research Institute, Chennai, Tamilnadu for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956, and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

49. Recognition/Approval of Bundelkhand Medical College, Sagar, Madhya Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree(100 seats) granted by Dr. Hari Singh Gaur University, Sagar u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Bundelkhand Medical College, Sagar, Madhya Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree(100 seats) granted by Dr. Hari Singh Gaur University, Sagar u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report(9th Sept., 2015) along with previous compliance verification assessment reports(27th April, 2015 & 2nd March, 2015) and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 21.90 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 34.32 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Only 48 Paramedical staff are available against requirement of 182 as per Regulations.
- 4. C.T. Scan: It is outsourced to third party outside the campus which is not permissible.
- 5. Workload of Special investigation like IVP was NIL on day of assessment.
- 6. O.T.s: 5 Major O.T.s are available against requirement of 7 as per Regulations.
- 7. ICUs: ICCU & NICU are still not functional.
- 8. Only 2 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5 as per Regulations. AERB approval is not available. Workload of Plain X-rays is only 41 which is grossly inadequate.
- 9. CSSD is partly functional.
- 10. Histopathology is not done. Cytopathology workload was only 1 on day of assessment.
- 11. Animal House: It is not registered with CPCSEA. There are no animals.
- 12. Pharmacovigilance Committee is non-functional.
- 13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend not to recognize/approve Bundelkhand Medical College, Sagar, Madhya Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. Hari Singh Gaur University, Sagar u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

50. Recognition/Approval of Chennai Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Irungalur, Trichy for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. M.G.R Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Chennai Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Irungalur, Trichy for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. M.G.R Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report(11th Sept., 2015) along with the previous compliance verification assessment reports (6th Aug., 15 and 30th April, 2015) and decided to recommend recognition/approval of Chennai Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Irungalur, Trichy for the award of MBBS degree (150 seats) granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. M.G.R Medical University, Chennai and decided to recommend to the Central Government for approval u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16th April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

- 8 (3) ...
- (2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.
- (3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.
- (4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

51. Recognition/Approval of Pt. Jawahar Lal Nehru Memorial Medical College, Raipur, Chhattisgarh for the award of MBBS degree granted by Ayush University of Health Sciences, Raipur, Chhattisgarh against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Pt. Jawahar Lal Nehru Memorial Medical College, Raipur, Chhattisgarh for the award of MBBS degree granted by Ayush University of Health Sciences, Raipur, Chhattisgarh against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 seats u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (09.09.2015) along with assessment report (30.04.2015, 02.03.2015 and 11^{th} & 12^{th} December, 2013) and decided to

recommend recognition/approval of Pt. Jawahar Lal Nehru Memorial Medical College, Raipur, Chhattisgarh for the award of MBBS degree granted by Ayush University of Health Sciences, Raipur, Chhattisgarh against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 seats and decided to recommend to the Central Government for approval u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee further decided that the attention of the institute be drawn to Sections 8(3)(2), 8(3)(3) & 8(3)(4) of the Establishment of Medical Colleges Regulations (Amendment), 2010 (Part II) dated 16th April 2010 and act accordingly at appropriate time, which reads as under:-

8 (3) ...

- (2) The recognition so granted to an Undergraduate Course for award of MBBS degree shall be for a maximum period of 5 years, upon which it shall have to be renewed.
- (3) The procedure for 'Renewal' of recognition shall be same as applicable for the award of recognition.
- (4) Failure to seek timely renewal of recognition as required in sub-clause
- (a) supra shall invariably result in stoppage of admissions to the concerned Undergraduate Course of MBBS at the said institute."

The Committee decided to place the matter before the General Body of the Council.

52. Invocation of Clause 8.5 of the Indian Medical Council (Professional Conduct, Etiquette and Ethics) Regulations, 2002, due to non-appearance of doctors before the Ethics Committee of the Council.

Read: the matter with regard to invocation of Clause 8.5 of the Indian Medical Council (Professional Conduct, Etiquette and Ethics) Regulations, 2002, due to non-appearance of doctors before the Ethics Committee of the Council.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter dated 16.09.2015 of the Chairman, Ethics Committee of the Council and perused Section 8.5 of the Ethics Regulations which states as under:-

"8.5 During the pendency of the complaint the appropriate Council may restrain the physician from performing the procedure or practice which is under scrutiny."

In view of above, the Executive Committee agreed upon the proposal submitted by the Chairman, Ethics Committee and decided to invoke the provisions of the section 8.5 of the Ethics Regulation if the doctor or his authorized representative does not appear for three times without giving valid reasons to the satisfaction of the Ethics Committee.

53. <u>Election of a Member of MCI under section 3(1)(c) of IMC Act, 1956</u> <u>i.e.</u> Registered Medical Graduate Constituency Proposal Submitted <u>by Dr. Sudipto Roy, Member, MCI.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to election of a member of MCI under section 3(1)(c) of IMC Act, 1956 i.e. Registered Medical Graduate Constituency Proposal submitted by Dr. Sudipto Roy, Member, MCI.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused and approved the legal opinion of the Law Officer, operative part of which reads as under:-

4. Be that as it may, the Council is a stakeholder in the process of its constitution under section 3 of the IMC Act, 1956. Therefore, in order to

ensure that the elections from the State Medical Council for a nominee to the MCI are conducted in free, fair, impartial and transparent manner, the Council is well within its right to make a suggestion in this regard for law reform to the appropriate authorities of the Central Government."

In view of above legal opinion, the Executive Committee of the Council affirmed the decision taken at the meeting dt. 05/08/2015 with regard to amendment of the definition of "Returning Officer" in clause 2 (d) of the Indian Medical Council Rules, 1957 decided to approve the following proposal submitted by Dr. Sudipto Roy, Member, MCI:-

Existing	Proposed
2(d) 'Returning Officer' means any	2(d) 'Returning Officer' means any
officer appointed as such by the	officer appointed as such by the
Central Government for the purposes	Central Government from a panel of
of these rules;	such officers maintained by MCI.

The Committee decided to place the above before the General Body of the Council.

54. Recognition/approval of Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (12th September, 2015) along with previous compliance verification assessment reports (06th May 2015 & 9th July, 2015) and assessment report (26th & 27th February, 2015) and letter dated 01/09/2015 from the Central Govt. enclosing therewith a representation/compliance dated 27/08/2015 of the Principal, Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa and noted the following:-

- 1. Deficiency of faculty is 57.54 % as detailed in the report.
- 2. Shortage of Residents is 85.07 % as detailed in the report.
- 3. Bed occupancy on day of assessment as verified by assessors is 33.40 %.
- 4. Patients were enquired for their illness & hospital stay. There is mismatch of their date of admission & their hospital stay. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 5. There was only 1 Major & 2 Minor Surgeries for the whole hospital on day of assessment.
- 6. Regarding Histopathology workload, only 1 sample could be verified. Professor & HOD Pathology said that they are not keeping duplicate copies of reports which is highly irregular & against Rules & Regulations. Data are grossly manipulated. Histopathology samples were not provided in spite of repeated requests. HOD was also requested to come and explain the registers provided but she failed to come in spite of repeated requests. Perusal of Histopathology register reveals poor quality of Surgeries performed and appears to be manipulated.
- 7. Data of clinical material and Laboratory & Radiological investigations provided by the institute is highly inflated.
- 8. It was shown there were 10 CT scans done on day of assessment. However on verification it was found that CT Scan was not in working order on day of assessment.
- 9. MRD is partly computerized. Deficiency remains the same.

- 10. Around 01:25 p.m. Dean had given letter requesting the Assessors for not conducting assessment as the institute had declared a holiday on day of assessment i.e. 12/09/2015 being second Saturday & last Saturday of Sravan masan. However, till that time most of the assessment was completed. It was further observed that last Saturday of Sravan masan is not in the list of Gazetted holidays declared by State Govt.
- 11. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend not to recognize/approve Fathima Institute of Medical Sciences, Kadapa, Andhra Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. NTR University of Health Sciences, Vijayawada, Andhra Pradesh u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

55. <u>Approval of the Minutes of the Administration and Grievance Committee Meeting held on 08/09/2015.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to approval of the Minutes of the Administration and Grievance Committee Meeting held on 08/09/2015.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration of the matter for the next meeting.

56. <u>Minutes of the Academic Committee meeting held on September 18, 2015.</u>

Read: the matter with regard to Minutes of the Academic Committee meeting held on September 18, 2015.

The Executive Committee of the Council deferred the minutes of the Academic Committee meeting held on September 18, 2015 except the following requirements:

- Item 9. The Executive Committee observed that a similar item has been placed by the office as item No. 57.
- Item 14. Office Note from PG Section regarding Inclusion of Master of Hospital Administration degree as essential qualification for faculty of Hospital Administration/Health Administration recognized by the Medical Council of India, in the schedule of MCI.: Approved.

Matter be placed before General Body.

57. Regulations of Minimum Standard Requirements for the medical colleges for 50/100/150 MBBS admissions – Amendments regarding.

Read: the matter with regard to Regulations of Minimum Standard Requirements for the medical colleges for 50/100/150 MBBS admissions – Amendments

The Executive Committee approved the amendments in the Regulations of Minimum Standard Requirements for the medical colleges for 50/100/150 MBBS admissions and further decided to place the same before the General Body of the Council.

58. Consideration of representations dated 08.04.2015 and 27.04.2015 of Father Muller's Medical College, Mangalore in compliance of the Hon'ble High Court order dated 18.09.2015 for renewal of permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

Read: the matter with regard to consideration of representations dated 08.04.2015 and 27.04.2015 of Father Muller's Medical College, Mangalore in compliance of the Hon'ble High Court order dated 18.09.2015 for renewal of permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 for the academic session 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the representations dt. 08/04/2015 & 27/04/2015 as had been submitted by the medical college, in accordance with the order of Hon'ble High Court of Delhi in Writ Petition (Civil) No. 8317 of year 2015 and observed as under:

"The Executive Committee perused the representations dated 08/04/2015 & 27/04/2015 of the College authorities. The college vide its letter dated 8/4/15 has stated that in the assessment held on 17/03/2015, all the deficiencies had been complied with. However, the deficiencies of staff was not complied with as many staff were on leave for valid reason like examination duty, conference leave, posting in the out reach centers/ activities. Further, it had stated that those who were operating in theater could not sign. The Committee also noted that the college authorities in this regard has given a list of 26 faculty member vide (Annexure -1) and of 16 Residents (Annexure - 2) and a list of 10 Jr. Residents who have been promoted as Sr. Resident and 3 who have been newly appointed (Annexure-3). The Executive Committee recalled that vide decision dated 21.08.2014, the Executive Committee had only approved the following types of leave as acceptable during the inspection of medical colleges:-

- "(1) The faculty who is on leave due to following reasons would be accepted:
- (a) For attending International / National conferences organized by the respective International / National Associations or Societies:
- (b) For attending any work assigned by Medical Council of India, either at headquarters or for assessment of a medical college;
- (c) For conducting examination of the concerned subject in a medical college in a Central / State University;
- (d) For attending Courts.

Provided that appropriate documents certifying the same which are countersigned by the dean are furnished.

(2) The faculty who is on sanctioned Maternity leave would be accepted provided the appropriate leave sanction order issued by the sanctioning authority and countersigned by the Dean is furnished with all necessary certificates."

The Executive Committee noted that in the details provided the faculty is either stated to be on commuted leave, privilege leave, emergency call, sick leave, periphery posting. Only 3 of them are stated to be on university exam duty. This in view of the aforesaid decision dated 21/08/2014 of Executive Committee is not acceptable. Hence the deficiencies as regard faculty persist.

The same is the case with Sr. Residents/Jr. Residents either they are on casual leave or post off leave or in periphery posting. Hence, the deficiencies as regards residents persist."

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision taken at its meeting dt. 13/05/2015 to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4th Batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. from 100-150 of Father Muller's Medical College, Mangalore under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

59. Renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3rd batch of 100 seats of ESIC Medical College, Gulbarga, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore, Karnataka u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-16.

Read: the matter with regard to renewal of permission for MBBS course for 3rd batch of 100 seats of ESIC Medical College, Gulbarga, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore, Karnataka u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-16.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification assessment report (19th September, 2015) along with previous compliance verification assessment report (4th March, 2015) and assessment report(12th & 13th November, 2014) and Order dated 18/09/2015 passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi in CM No. 20214/2015 in W.P.(C) No. 6928/2015 filed by Employees State Insurance Corporation and Ors. and noted the following:-

- 1. New 300 bedded hospital which has been handed over on 09/09/2015 is not functional. No OPD is run, no patients are admitted in wards, no O.T. is functioning or any other laboratory is functional.
- 2. As hospital is not functioning, there is no clinical material.
- 3. Medical Education Unit is not functioning. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 4. Lecture Theaters: Facility for E class is not available. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 5. Radiological facilities like mobile X-ray, USG are not available. AERB approval is not available.
- 6. Histopathology & Cytopathology laboratories are not functional as the hospital has not yet started.
- 7. Casualty: There are no beds, no equipment. Clinical material is not available.
- 8. MRD: ICD X classification is not followed. Deficiency remains as it is.
- 9. Paramedical & Non-teaching staff: Deficiency still remains as no new appointments have been made.
- 10. Hospital staff are still working at old Govt. District hospital and not yet shifted to this hospital.
- 11. On being asked during head count where the staff were working, it was stated that they are working in old ESI building which now is under the control of State Govt.
- 12. Deficiency of faculty is 10.1 % as detailed in the report.
- 13. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the assessment report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch (100 seats) of ESIC Medical College, Gulbarga, Karnataka under Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore, Karnataka u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2015-2016.

60. Recognition/ approval of Melmaruvathur Adhiparasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Melmaruvathur for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the students admitted in the academic year 2008-2009 and 2009-2010.

Read: the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Melmaruvathur Adhiparasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Melmaruvathur for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the students admitted in the academic year 2008-2009 and 2009-2010.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the matter with regard to recognition/approval of Melmaruvathur Adhiparasakthi Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Melmaruvathur for the award of MBBS degree granted by the Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 for the students admitted in the academic year 2008-2009 and 2009-2010 along with the legal opinion received from the Council Advocate which reads as under:-

"I am of the opinion that the students admitted after formal permission by Central Govt. u/s 10A for ac academic year 2008-09 and 2009-10 have already suffered for 2 academic session on the ground of failure of the institute to provide complete infrastructure.

Therefore in the best interest of the students it is advisable for the Council to recognize the MBBS degree of the students who were admitted in academic year 2008-09 and 2009-10.

However, the observation of the Hon'ble High Court to consider all similarly placed medical colleges is contrary to the IMC Act,1956 and the Regulations made thereunder, hence it is appropriate to file an appeal in this regard."

The Committee decided to accept the opinion of the Council Advocate and decided to recognize the MBBS degree of the students who were admitted in academic year 2008-09 and 2009-10 only in accordance with the permissions issued by the Central Govt. and matter be placed before the General Body of the Council.

61. Review of suspension of Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj, Deputy Secretary (Under Suspension).

Read: The matter with regard to review of suspension of Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj, Deputy Secretary (Under Suspension).

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Review Committee dated 21.09.2015 to continue the suspension of Dr. Anshu Sethi Bajaj, Deputy Secretary (U/s) for a further period of 90 days w.e.f. 26.09.2015.

62. Review of suspension of Dr. Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (Under Suspension).

Read: The matter with regard to review of suspension of Dr. Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (Under Suspension).

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Review Committee dated 21.09.2015 to continue the suspension of Dr. Davinder Kumar, Joint Secretary (U/s) for a further period of 90 days w.e.f. 30.09.2015.

63. Review of suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Addl. Secretary (Under Suspension) in the matter of Dr. Somervell Memorial CSI Medical College, Kerala.

Read: The matter with regard to review of suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Addl. Secretary (Under Suspension) in the matter of Dr. Somervell Memorial CSI Medical College, Kerala.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Review Committee dated 21.09.2015 to continue the suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Addl. Secretary (U/s) for a further period of 90 days w.e.f. 23.09.2015.

64. Review of suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Addl. Secretary (Under Suspension) in the matter of Sardar Rajas Medical College, Kalahandi, Odisha.

Read: The matter with regard to review of suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Addl. Secretary (Under Suspension) in the matter of Sardar Rajas Medical College, Kalahandi, Odisha.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the minutes of the Review Committee dated 21.09.2015 to continue the suspension of Dr. P. Prasannaraj, Addl. Secretary (U/s) for a further period of 90 days w.e.f. 26.10.2015.

65. Appointment of Lawyer for Ethics Committee of MCI

The members of Ethics Committee observed that the Board of Governors nominated by the Central Government while reconstituting the Ethics Committee had nominated an advocate to be a member of Ethics Committee who would advise the Ethics Committee on legal issues related with the complaints/appeals being decided and disposed off by the Ethics Committee.

The executive Committee decided to nominate Shri Ruchin Midha, Advocate, Hon'ble Supreme Court to be a member of Ethics Committee on the same terms and conditions laid down by the Board of Governors nominated by the Central Government.

66. Functioning of Medical Council of India.

Read: The letter No. H.11021/5/2014-MEP-I (Vol.II) dated 19.08.2015 from the Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & F.W. forwarding therewith views/suggestions of 41 medical colleges (both Govt. & Private) on questionnaire (containing 13 questions) which was sought by the Rajya Sabha Secretariat.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter No. H.11021/5/2014-MEP-I (Vol.II) dated 19.08.2015 from the Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & F.W. and decided to constitute a Sub-Committee of the following members to look into the matter and to send appropriate reply to the Ministry.

Dr. Ved Prakash Mishra, Chairman, Academic Committee, MCI

Dr. D.J. Borah, Chairman, Ethics Committee

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

(Shri A.K. Harit) Deputy Secretary

New Delhi, dated 21st September, 2015

APPROVED

