

No.MCI-5(3)/2009-Med./**MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA****EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

Minutes of the Executive Committee meeting held on 25th September, 2009 at 1.00 p.m. in the Council Office at Sector 8, Pocket 14, Dwarka, New Delhi.

Present:

Dr. P.C. Kesavankutty Nayar	Vice-President, Medical Council of India, Former Dean, Govt. Medical College, Thiruvananthapuram (Kerala)
Dr. Muzaffar Ahmad	Director, Health Services, Govt. of Jammu & Kashmir, Srinagar (J&K)
Dr. Nirbhay Srivastav	Officiating Dean and Professor & Head, Orthopedics Department, Gandhi Medical College, Bhopal –462001(MP)
Dr. G.K. Thakur	Prof. & HOD cum Superintendent Dept. of Radiology S.K. Medical College, Muzaffarpur-842004 (Bihar)
Dr. V.N. Jindal	Dean, Goa Medical College, Bombolim-403202, Goa
Dr. Baldev Singh Aulakh	Professor of Urology and Transplant Surgery, Head Transplant Unit, Dayanand Medical College, Ludhiana

Lt.Col.(Retd.) Dr. A.R.N. Setalvad -- Secretary

The meeting was chaired by Vice-President as the President of the Council could not attend the meeting.

Apologies for absence were received from Dr. Ketan Desai, Dr. K.P. Mathur, Dr. Ved Prakash Mishra, Dr. D.J. Borah and Dr. P.K. Das.

1. Minutes of the Executive Committee Meetings held on 9th July, 2009 & 27th July, 2009 - Confirmation of.

The Executive Committee of the Council confirmed the minutes of the last meetings held on 9th July, 2009 & 27th July, 2009.

2. Minutes of the last meeting of the Executive Committee – Action taken thereon.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the action taken by the office on the various items included in the agenda of the last meetings held on 9th July, 2009 & 27th July, 2009.

3. Pending items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive Committee.

The Executive Committee noted there is no pending items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive Committee as on date.

4. To note the letters of Intent/ Permission/Renewal of permission issued by the Central Govt. for establishment of medical colleges/increase of seats in Ist MBBS course for the academic session 2009-2010.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the following Letters of Intent/Letter of Permission /renewal of permission for establishment of new Medical Colleges/ increase of seats in 1st MBBS course for the academic session 2009-2010 issued by the Govt. of India:-

Name of the College	Date of issue of Letter of Intent/Permission/Renewal of Permission.
Ahmedabad Muncipal Corporation Medical Education Trust Medical College, Ahmedabad	Letter of Permission dated 13 th July, 2009 for Establishment of new medical college in the name and style of “Ahmedabad Muncipal Corporation Medical Education Trust Medical College, Ahmedabad.
K.J. Mehta General Hospital & College of Medical Sciences, Amargadh	Letter of Permission dated 10 th July, 2009 for Establishment of new medical college in the name and style of “K.J. Mehta Genral Hospital & College of Medical Sciences, Amargadh.
Gujarat Adani Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhuj	Letter of Permission dated 13 th July, 2009 for Establishment of new medical college in the name and style of “Gujarat Adani Institute of Medical Sciences G.K. General Hospital, Bhuj.
Sree Narayana Institute of Medical Sciences, Chalakka, Ernakulam	Letter of Permission dated 10 th July, 2009 for Establishment of new medical college in the name and style of “Sree Narayana Institute of Medical Sciences, Ernakulam, Kerala.
Travancore Medical College, Kollam, Kerala	Letter of Intent dated 13 th July, 2009 and Letter of Permission dated 13 th July, 2009 for Establishment of new medical college in the name and style of “Travancore Medical College, Kollam, Kerala.

L.N. Medical College & Research Centre, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh.	Letter of Intent dated 13 th July, 2009 and Letter of Permission dated 14 th July, 2009 for Establishment of new medical college in the name and style of "L.N. Medical College & Research Centre, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh.
Chennai Medical College & Hospital, Tiruchirapalli, Tamil Nadu.	Letter of Intent dated 13 th July, 2009 and Letter of Permission dated 14 th July, 2009 for Establishment of new medical college in the name and style of "Chennai Medical College & Hospital, Tiruchirapalli, Tamil Nadu.
Karpaga Vinayaga Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Kanchipuram	Letter of Permission dated 9 th July, 2009 for Establishment of new medical college in the name and style of "Karpaga Vinayaga Institute of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Kanchipuram.
Hindustan Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Greater Noida	Letter of Permission dated 13 th July, 2009 for Establishment of new medical college in the name and style of "Hindustan Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Greater Noida.
Hind Institute of Medical Sciences, Barabanki	Letter of Permission dated 10 th July, 2009 for Establishment of new medical college in the name and style of "Hind Institute of Medical Sciences, Barabanki.
Meenakshi Medical College and Research Institute, Kanchipuram	Letter of Permission dated 10 th July, 2009 for increase of seats in MBBS Course from 100 to 150 for Academic year 2009- 2010.
Karnataka Institute of Medical Sciences, Hubli	Letter of Permission dated 10 th July, 2009 for increase of seats in MBBS Course from 100 to 150 for Academic year 2009- 2010.
Surat Municipal Institute of medical Education & Research, Surat	Letter of Permission dated 10.07.2009 for increase of seats in MBBS Course from 100 to 150 for Academic year 2009- 2010.
Pt. J.N.M. Medical College, Raipur	Letter of Permission dated 14.07.2009 for increase of seats in MBBS Course from 100 to 150 for Academic year 2009- 2010.
Nalanda Medical College, Patna	Letter of Intent dated 14 th July, 2009 and Letter of Permission dated 15 th July, 2009 for increase of seats in MBBS Course from 50 to 100 for Academic year 2009- 2010.
Bidar Institute of Medical Sciences, Bidar	Letter dated 14 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 3 rd batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.

Bhaskar Medical College, Yenkapally	Letter dated 13 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 5 th batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Muzaffarnagar Medical College, Muzaffarnagar	Letter dated 13 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 4 th batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
GSL Medical College & General Hospital, Venkatapuram, Rajahmundry, A.P.	Letter dated 13 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 7 th batch of 150 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Rama Medical College, Hospital & Resarch Centre, Kanpur, U.P.	Letter dated 13 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 2 nd batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Saraswati Institute of Medical Sciences, Hapur, Ghaziabad, U.P.	Letter dated 13 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 2 nd batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhubaneswar, Orissa	Letter dated 13 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 3 rd batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Karuna Medical College, Palakkad,	Letter dated 13 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 4 th batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Mandya Institute of Medical Sciences, Mandya, Karnataka	Letter dated 13 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 4 th batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Raichur Institute of Medical Sciences, Raichur, Karnataka	Letter dated 13 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 3 rd batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
KMCT Medical College, Kozhikode, Kerala	Letter dated 13 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 2 nd batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Hassan Institute of Medical Sciences, Hassan	Letter dated 13 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 4 th batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Veer Chander Singh Garwali Government Medical Sciences & Research Institute, Sringer	Letter dated 13 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 2 nd batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Rohilkhand Medical College & Hospital, Bareilly, U.P.	Letter dated 14 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 4 th batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Santhiram Medical College, Nandyal, A.P.	Letter dated 24 th April, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 5 th batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.

Azeezia Institute of Medical Sciences and Research, Kollam	Letter dated 1 st July, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 2 nd batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Dr. Ulhas Patil Medical College & Hospital, Jalgaon	Letter dated 29 th June, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 2 nd batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Index Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Indore	Letter dated 29 th June, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 3 rd batch of 150 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Hi-Tech Medical College & Hospital, Pandara	Letter dated 20 th May, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 5 th batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Sri Lakshmi Narayana Insttt. Of Medical Sciences, Pondicherry	Letter dated 30 th March, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 4 th batch of 150 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Gain Sagar Medical College & Hospital, Patiala	Letter dated 5 th March, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 3 rd batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Geeanjali Medical College, Udaipur, Rajasthan	Letter dated 4 th April, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 2 nd batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Chettinad Hospital & Research Institute, Kanchipuram, T.N.	Letter dated 17 th April, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 4 th batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
SRM Medical College Hospital & Research Centre, Kattankulathur	Letter dated 30 th March, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 5 th batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
U.P. Rural Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Safai, Etawah	Letter dated 5 th March, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 4 th batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Uttranchal Forest Hosptial Trust, Medical College, Haldwani.	Letter dated 31 st June, 2009 for renewal of permission for admission of 6 th batch of 100 MBBS students during the academic year 2009-10.
Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad, U.P.	Letter dated 13 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for the admission of 5 th batch of MBBS students against the increased intake from 50 to 100 for the academic year 2009 – 10
V.S.S. Medical College, Burla, Orissa	Letter dated 15 th July, 2009 for renewal of permission for the admission of 3 rd batch of MBBS students against the increased intake from 107 to 150 for the academic year 2009 – 10

5. Out come analysis of the decisions of the Executive Committee.

Read: The matter with regard to the out come analysis of the decision of the MCI.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the following items are pending at the level of the Central Government as under:-

S.No.	Name of College	Status
1.	Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik in respect of students being trained at Dr. Panjabrao Alias Bhausabeb Deshmukh Memorial Medical College, Amravati.	Recommended to the Central Govt. on 05.06.2009 & 10.08.2009 for withdrawal of recognition and further directed to the institute not to make further admission from the academic year 2009-10.
2.	Common Entrance Test for Admission in MBBS Course.	Recommended to the Central Govt. on 23.06.2009 to accord approval u/s 33 of the IMC Act, 1956.
3.	Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained Dr. B.R. Ambedkar Medical College, Bangalore.	Recommended to the Central Govt. on 23.06.2009 for withdrawal of recognition and further directed to the institute not to make further admission from the academic year 2009-10.
4.	Draft Regulation to conduct the Elections for the Students Union in the medical colleges/institutions in India – Consideration of.	Recommended to the Central Govt. on 10.08.2009 to accord approval u/s 33 of the IMC Act, 1956.

6. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Yenepoya University, Mangalore (Deemed University) in respect of students being trained at Yenepoya Medical College, Mangalore.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (30th & 31st July, 2009) for Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Yenepoya University, Mangalore (Deemed University) in respect of students being trained at Yenepoya Medical College, Mangalore.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (30th & 31st July, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. The shortage of teaching staff required at present stage is as under:-
 - (a) The shortage of teaching faculty is 19.4% (i.e. 28 out of 144) as under :-
 - (i) Associate Professor : 07 (Anatomy -2, Physiology -1, Biochemistry -1, Forensic Medicine -1, Community Medicine -1 & Radio Diagnosis -1)
 - (ii) Assistant Professor : 15 (Anatomy -2, Pharmacology -1, Community Medicine -5, TB & Chest -1, Obst. & Gyane. -5 & Radio Diagnosis -1)
 - (iii) Tutor : 05 (Anatomy -2, Pharmacology -1 & Community Medicine -2)
 - (iv) Pharma Chemist : 01

- (b) The shortage of Residents is 18.8% (i.e. 16 out of 85) as under :-
- (i) Sr. Resident : 9 (General Medicine -1, Paediatrics -1, Psychiatry -1, General Surgery -3, Obst. & Gynae.-2, Radio Diagnosis -1)
- (ii) Jr. Resident : 7 (General Medicine -2, Skin & VD -3, Psychiatry -2,
2. No Lecturer cum Medical Officer having M.D.{P.S.M.} is available at R.H.T.C. at Ullal. The senior faculty from the department is posted in rotation.
3. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give 2 (two) months time to the authorities of Yenopoya Medical College, Mangalore to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of MCI representing the State where the college is located.

7. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by The Tamilnadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of KAP Vishwanathan Government Medical College, Trichy.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (6th & 7th August, 2009) for Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by The Tamil Nadu Dr. MGR Medical University, Chennai in respect of students being trained at KAP Vishwanathan Government Medical College, Trichy.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (6th & 7th August, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. The shortage of teaching staff required at present stage is as under:-
- (a) The shortage of teaching faculty is 21.4%(i.e. 26 out of 121) as under :-
- (i) Professor : 04 (Physiology -1,Biochemistry -1, Pharmacology -1, Community Medicine -1)
- (ii) Associate Professor : 07 (Anatomy-2, Physiology -1, Forensic Medicine -1, TB & Chest -1 & Radio Diagnosis -1 & Dentistry -1)
- (iii) Assistant Professor : 14 (Anatomy -2, Pharmacology -1, Forensic Medicine -1, Community Medicine -6, TB & Chest -1, Radio Diagnosis -3)
- (iv) Tutor : 01 (Pathology-1)
2. There is no Medical Superintendent in the hospital.
3. There is no incinerator. The institution has signed an MOU with the non – governmental agency EXNORA for disposal of biomedical waste.
4. There is no nursing station in the ICU and there is no space to walk between the beds.
5. There is no lecture theatre in the hospital.
6. At RHTC Inamkulathur, other clinical departments like Medicine, Paediatrics, Obstetrics & Gynaecology do not participate in the outreach teaching programmes. No lecturer cum medical officer having M.D.{P.S.M.} is available; the senior faculty from the department is posted in rotation.
7. At U.H.C Woraiyur, no lecturer cum medical officer having M.D.{P.S.M.} is posted.

8. There is no separate hostel for residents, P.G's and nursing staff.
9. Residential Quarters: Total 3 quarters only are available within the campus against the requirement of 50. No quarters are available for non-teaching staff within the campus. The no. of quarters available is not as per Council norms.
10. Medical Education Unit, no medical education course has been conducted in the previous years.
11. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give 2 (two) months time to the authorities of KAP Vishwanathan Government Medical College, Trichy to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of MCI representing the State where the college is located.

8. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik in respect of students being trained at Swami Ramanand Teerth Rural (SRTR) Medical College, Ambajogai (Maharashtra).

Read: The Council Inspectors report (6th & 7th August, 2009) for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik in respect of students being trained at Swami Ramanand Teerth Rural (SRTR) Medical College, Ambajogai, (Maharashtra).

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (6th & 7th August, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. Following faculty members were not accepted: -
 - (a) 1. Dr. A.K. Sinagare, Asstt. Professor (Anatomy) – Declaration form incomplete. Degrees not mentioned. The enclosures also lack photocopies of MBBS, MD Degree Certificates, MCI Registration, Appointment & Joining letters, inspite of repeated requests to complete the declaration form in all respects.
 2. Dr. C.S. Halgarkar has stated in her declaration form that she is posted in HIV and AIDS Department. Cannot be accepted in the department of Pathology.
 3. Dr. Ganesh Dhavaishankh, Assoc. Prof. (Skin & V.D.) – Does not possess requisite 5 yrs experience as Asstt. Professor.
 4. Dr. Ambulgekar Rajesh, Professor (Orthopedics) – Does not possess requisite 5 yrs experience as Asstt. Professor.
- (b) In view of above, the shortage of teaching staff required at present stage is as under:-
 - (a) The shortage of teaching faculty is 13.4% i.e. 14 out of 104 as under: -

(i) Professor	: 1	(Forensic Med-1).
(ii) Associate Professor	: 6	(Anatomy-1, Gen. Medicine -1, Paediatrics -2, Skin & V.D.-1, Ortho-1).
(iii) Assistant Professor	: 5	(Gen. Medicine -1, Psychiatry-1, Gen. Surgery -1, Obst. & Gynae.-2).
(iv) Tutor	: 2	(Anatomy -2).
 - (b) The shortage of Residents is 32% i.e. 24 out of 75 as under: -

(i) Sr. Resident	: 12	(Gen. Surgery -1, Orthopedics- 2, Ophthalmology - 1, Obst. & Gynae. 2, Anaesthesia -4, Radio-diagnosis – 2).
------------------	------	--

- (ii) Jr. Resident : 12 (Paediatrics -2, TB & Chest -1, Skin & V.D. -2, Psychiatry -2, Orthopedics -5).
2. At RHTC accommodation is not available for girls. No mess facility is available.
 3. Medical Education Unit: No training courses were held during the year 2009.
 4. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give 2 (two) months time to the authorities of Swami Ramanand Teerth Rural (SRTR) Medical College, Ambajogai, (Maharashtra) to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of MCI representing the State where the college is located.

9. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Jammu University in respect of students being trained at Govt. Medical College, Jammu.

Read: The Council Inspectors reports (30th - 31st July, 2009 & 10th - 11th September, 2009) for Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Jammu University in respect of students being trained at Govt. Medical College, Jammu.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (30th - 31st July, 2009 & 10th - 11th September, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The shortage of teaching faculty is 13.4%(i.e. 23 out of 171) as under :-
 - (i) Professor : 03 (Biochemistry -1, Pharmacology -1 & Forensic Medicine -1)
 - (ii) Associate Professor : 10 (Physiology -1, Biochemistry – 1, Pharmacology – 1, Community Medicine – 1, Paediatrics -1, TB & Chest– 1, Skin & VD – 1, General Surgery -1, Anaesthesia. -1, Radiology-1)
 - (iii) Assistant Professor : 10 (Pathology.-2, Forensic Medicine-1, Community Medicine -2, TB & Chest-1, General Surgery -1, Obst. & Gynae.-1 & Anaesthesia -2)
 - (iv) Tutor : Nil
- (b) The shortage of Residents is 8.2%(i.e. 7 out of 85) as under :-
 - (i) Sr. Resident : 05 (TB & Chest-1, Skin & VD -1, Psychiatry -1, Orthopaedics.-1, Radio Diagnosis-1)
 - (ii) Jr. Resident : 02 (Psychiatry -2)
2. The number and distribution of beds is not as per Council norms as under:-
 - (i) Department of Medicine – 257 beds in 5 units.
 - (ii) Department of Orthopaedics - 148 beds in 2 units.
 - (iii) Department of Ophthalmology - 75 beds in 1 unit.
 - (iv) Department of ENT – 54 beds in 1 unit.
 - (v) Department of Surgery – 250 beds in 5 units.
3. DNB courses are also run by the institute.

4. Accommodation is available for 377 students against the requirement of 500, which is inadequate.
5. There is no separate hostel of interns.
6. At RHTC, Lecture hall cum seminar room is not available. No audiovisual aids has been provided.
7. Medical Record Section is not computerized. ICD X Classification of diseases is not followed for indexing.
8. Other deficiencies/observations as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give 2 (two) months time to the authorities of Govt. Medical College, Jammu to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period. It was further decided that the institute to be directed to give an undertaking for stoppage of DNB courses run by it prospectively. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of MCI representing the State where the college is located.

10. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Jammu University in respect of students being trained at Acharya Shri Chander Chinar College of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Jammu.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (31^s July, 2009 & 1st August, 2009) for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Jammu University in respect of students being trained at Archarya Shri Chander Chinar College of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Jammu.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (31^s July, 2009 & 1st August, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The following faculty members have not been accepted for the reason mentioned against each

S.No	Name	Designation	Department	Remarks
1.	Dr. Swaran Singh	Assoc.Prof.	Anatomy	Documents not provided in-spite of repeated request.
2.	Dr. Anjali Tikoo	Asso. Prof	Biochemistry	MSc from science faculty
3.	Dr Satish Chander Puri	Asst. Prof	Biochemistry	Both MSc & PhD in Chemistry
4.	Dr J P Singh	Professor	Surgery	Not MS General Surgery. Five yrs MCh Neurosurgery
5.	Dr P R Sharma	Professor	Anesthesia	Above 65 yrs age

- (b) The shortage of teaching faculty is 15.9% (i.e. 22 out of 138) as under :-

- (i) Professor : 02 (Biochemistry -1 & ENT -1)
- (ii) Associate Professor : 07 (Anatomy -2, Physiology -1, Biochemistry -1, Pathology -1, Anaesthesia -1 & Radiodiagnosis -1)
- (iii) Assistant Professor : 09 (Anatomy -3, Biophysics -1, Pharma.Chemist-1, Forensic Medicine -1, Community Medicine -1, General Surgery -1 & Dentistry -1)
- (iv) Tutor : 04 (Pharmacology -1, Community Medicine -1, Anaesthesia -1 & Radio Diagnosis -1)

(c) The shortage of Residents is 17.64% (i.e. 15 out of 85) as under :-

- (i) Sr. Resident : 07 (General Medicine -2, Paediatrics -1, Psychiatry -1, Orthopaedics -2 & Ophthalmology -1)
- (ii) Jr. Resident : 08 (Paediatrics -1, TB & Chest -1, Skin & VD -2, Psychiatry -1, Orthopaedics -1, Ophthalmology -1 & Obst. & Gynae. -1)

2. Clinical material is inadequate in terms of OPD attendance and bed occupancy as under:-

	Daily Average	Day of Inspection
O.P.D. attendance	721	602
Bed occupancy%	86%	74%

3. No lecture theater with a capacity of 250 is available in the hospital.
4. Interns: There is no separate interns' hostel Most of them do their internship at other places. Out of the remaining some stay in their own houses while some are accommodated in boys/girls hostel.
5. Common room for boys and girls are not available.
6. Animal House: Animal House is under construction. Presently as a make shift arrangement it is located in the department of Pharmacology. Facilities for carrying out minor surgical procedures and experimental work are not available.
7. In Health Centers, the lecturer cum medical officer having M.D.{P.S.M.} is not available. Delivery services are not available.
8. Registration and Medical Record Section is not computerized. ICD X Classification of diseases is not followed for indexing
9. In Central Sterilization Department, there are nil bowl sterilizer, glove inspection machine, instrument washing machine and nil racks, trays and nil mixers. The receiving and distribution points are not separate.
10. Anatomy Department :
 - There is only one demonstration room having 35 seats as against two rooms required with 50-60 seats each.
 - There is no band saw available.
 - There is no separate room for departmental seminar and library.
 - The number of books available in the department is only 35 as against 80-100.
11. Physiology Department:
 - The departmental library has 30 books as against 80 to 100 required.
 - The demonstration room has a capacity of 35 as against 50 to 60 seats.
 - Practical rooms have got 20 to 30 work stations as against 60.
12. Biochemistry Department:
 - The demonstration room has 33 seats as against 50 to 60.
 - The practical class has 40 work stations as against 60.
 - The departmental library has 56 books as against 80 to 100.
 - There is no separate seminar room cum departmental library.
13. Pharmacology Department:
 - The practical laboratories have a seating capacity of 25 against requirement of 50-60 seats.
14. Pathology Department:
 - Teaching Facility: No separate laboratory for Clinical Pathology/Haematology.
 - Number of books in departmental library is 40 against requirement of 80-100.
 - Catalogues are not available.
 - There is no research laboratory.

- Renewal of license is awaited.
15. Microbiology Department:
 - The seating capacity of practical lab is 36 against requirement of 60.
 - Departmental library has 30 books against requirement of 80-100.
 - There is no research laboratory & museum.
 16. Forensic Medicine Department:
 - No catalogues are available.
 - Mortuary: Is available but not operational as permission is not available from the Government.
 - No research laboratory & catalogues are available.
 17. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give 2 (two) months time to the authorities of Archarya Shri Chander Chinar College of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Jammu to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of MCI representing the State where the college is located.

11. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at Father Muller Medical College, Mangalore.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (3rd & 4th August, 2009) for Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at Father Muller Medical College, Mangalore.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (3rd & 4th August, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The shortage of teaching faculty is 12.26% (i.e.20 out of 163) as under :-

(i)	Professor	: 02	(Anatomy -1 & Forensic Medicine -1)
(ii)	Associate Professor	: 06	(Anatomy -2, Physiology -1, Biochemistry -1, TB & Chest -1 & Dentistry -1)
(iii)	Assistant Professor	: 09	(Anatomy -1, Physiology -1, Pharmacology -1, Pathology -1, Forensic Medicine -1, Community Medicine -3 & Dentistry -1)
(iv)	Tutor	: 02	(Pharmacology -2)
(v)	Pharmacemistry	: 01	
- (b) The shortage of Residents is 21.1% (i.e. 18 out of 85) as under :-

(i)	Sr. Resident	: 17	(General Medicine -3, Paediatrics -1, Skin & VD -1, General Surgery -4, Orthopaedics -2, ENT -1, Anaesthesia -3 & Radio Diagnosis -2)
(ii)	Jr. Resident	: 01	(General Medicine -1)
2. At U.H.C - No lecturer cum medical officer having M.D. (P.S.M) is posted.
3. Residential Quarters: Residential accommodation is not available within the campus.
4. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give 2 (two) months time to the authorities of Father Muller Medical College, Mangalore to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of MCI representing the State where the college is located.

12. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik in respect of students being trained at Grant Medical College, Mumbai.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (23rd & 24th July, 2009) for Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Maharashtra University of Health Sciences, Nashik in respect of students being trained at Grant Medical College, Mumbai.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (23rd & 24th July, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. (A) The following Teaching Faculty has not been considered because of the reasons mentioned below.

Sr No	Name	Department	Designation	Reason for not considering
1	Dr Premnanad Raikar	Physiology	Assoc. Prof	Does not possess prescribed qualification.
2	Dr Aruna Kulkarni ,	Biochemistry	Prof.	Does not possess prescribed qualification
3	Dr M G Kalekar		Assoc. Prof	
4	Dr Geetha		Asst. Prof.	
5	Dr Kawathale	Medicine	Prof	Does not possess required teaching experience.
6	Dr Hemant Gupta		Assoc. Profs.	
7	Dr Prateet Samdani			
8	Dr N L Juwale ,			Prof
9	Dr Meena Malkani	Pediatics	Assoc. Prof.	Does not possess required teaching experience.
10	Dr S D Jambekar			
11	Dr J M Phadtare	TB	Prof.	Does not possess required teaching experience.
12	Dr Vinaya Ambore	Surgery	Assoc. Prof	Does not possess required teaching experience.
13	Dr T K Sahi		Professor	
14	Dr A S khan			
15	Dr V N Parekh			
16	Dr V G Tapase			
17	Dr S S Uttere			
18	Dr Ajay	Ortho	Prof	Does not possess required teaching experience.
19	Dr Managal Parihar		Assoc. Prof	
20	Dr Z A Parkar		Prof.	Are holding Honorary Posts.
21	Dr Swpnil Keny		Asst. Prof.	
22	Dr M V Jagade ,	ENT	Prof.	Does not possess required teaching experience.
23	Dr V G kaskakar		Asst. Prof	
24	Dr T P Lahane ,	Ophthalmology	Prof	Does not possess required teaching experience.
25	Dr Yasmin Bhagat		Prof	Are holding Honorary Posts.
26	Dr snjeev Shah		Assoc. Prof	
27	Dr Deepak Bhatt ,			
28	Dr Pritam Samant	Asst. Prof.		

29	Dr R G Daver	OBG	Prof.	Does not possess required teaching experience.
30	Dr Hisikar		Asst. Prof.	Does not possess prescribed qualification
31	Dr Kavita Tilwani		Assoc. Prof	Does not possess required teaching experience.
32	Dr S S Lulla	Psychiatry	Asst. Prof.	Does not possess prescribed qualification
33	Dr S P Umate,			

(B) In view of above, the shortage of teaching staff required at present stage is as under:-

a	Teaching Faculty	38 Out of 254	14.96 %
	i	Professor	7 Biochem-1, Ortho-1, ENT-1, Opth-1, OBG-2, Dentistry-1
	ii	Associate Prof.	10 Anatomy-1, Medicine-2, Surgery-3, Ped-1, Psych-1, Ortho-1, Anaesthesia-1,
	iii	Assistant Professor	18 Anatomy-1, AP-RHTC-1, Stat-1, AP UHTC-1, Med-6, OBG-2, Ortho-2, ANMO-1, MWO-1, Dentistry-2
	iv	Tutor	3 PSM-3,
b	Residents	40 of 160	25 %
	i	Sr. Residents	39 Med-8, Ped-4, TB-2, Opth-1, OBG-4, Anaesthesia-10, Derma-2, Psych-2, Surgery-5, Ortho-1
	ii	Jr. Residents	1 Dentistry-1

2. The College buildings are very old and requires face lifting, necessary additions and alterations and upgrading in terms of infrastructural facilities, equipments.
3. In P.H.C., no lecturer cum medical officer having M.D,(P.S.M) is available. Lecture hall cum seminar room is not available. No audiovisual aids have been provided. Investigation facilities for basic investigation, X-ray and ECG are not available.
4. Incinerator is not available.
5. The capacity of three lecture theatres in the college requires to be increased as per norms. The capacity in the Lecture hall in the hospital also requires to be increased as per norms.
6. Living conditions in the hostels requires to be improved for the students and Residents. The sanitary conditions in all the hostels is very bad and requires to be attended . Some of the rooms are not provided with cots and Tables.
7. Central Library - The college has not acquired Medlar facility. Not a single Foreign Journal has been received in the Year 2009 and 2008. The renovation work is going on. The seating capacity is inadequate for staff and students. No new books were added in the year 2008- 09. Internet facility is also not available.
8. Auditorium is not available.
9. Separate examination hall is not available.
10. In the central photography cum audio-visual units, there are no equipments are available.
11. In Central sterilization department, there are no bowl sterilizer, Glove inspection machine and instrument washing machine in the department. No racks, trays and mixers are also available.
12. Central laundry: It is totally manual and no mechanization has been done. It requires to be established and up graded as per norms and strengthened in terms of facilities.

13. In the departments of Physiology & Biochemistry: Departmental Library and Demonstration room are housed in a small partition in a Corridor which is not as per norms.
14. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give 2 (two) months time to the authorities of Grant Medical College, Mumbai to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of MCI representing the State where the college is located.

13. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Nitte University (Deemed University) in respect of students being trained at K.S. Hedge Medical College, Mangalore.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (30th & 31st July, 2009) for Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Nitte University (Deemed University) in respect of students being trained at K.S. Hedge Medical College, Mangalore.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (30th & 31st July, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The following faculty members were not accepted:
 - i) Dr. Remya, Lecturer, Anatomy, does not possess requisite 3 years experience as Tutor (as per declaration form).
 - ii) Dr. Harsha H. N. Assoc. Prof. Physiology, does not possess requisite 5 years experience as Asst. Prof.
 - iii) Mrs. Roopa Rani Bhandary, Lecturer, Bio chemistry; M.Sc. Science faculty.
 - iv) Dr. Deepa B Lecturer, Pharmacology, does not possess requisite 3 years experience as Tutor (as per declaration form).
 - v) Dr. Divya Bhargvan, Lecturer, Pharmacology, does not possess requisite 3 years experience as Tutor (as per declaration form).
 - vi) Dr. J. P. Majra, Assoc. Prof, Community Medicine; does not possess requisite 5 years experience as Asst. Prof.
 - vii) Dr. Ragavendra Prabhu K, Asst. Prof, Paediatrics; Does not possess prescribed academic qualification.
 - viii) Dr. Ramesh Shetty, Senior Resident, TB & Chest, no experience certificate post MBBS.
 - ix) Dr. Abhishek, Senior Resident, Dermatology, two months experience after MBBS (mentioned in the declaration form). No experience certificate.
 - x) Dr. Shubhakar Bhandary, Assoc. Prof, General Surgery; Does not possess prescribed academic qualification.
 - xi) Dr. Gopal Char Sr. Resident, General Surgery, Nil experience mentioned in Declaration Form. No experience certificate.
 - xii) Dr. Vikram Shetty, Asst. Prof, Orthopaedic, Does not possess prescribed academic qualification.
 - xiii) Dr. Suvidha Sood, Professor, Anaesthesia; does not possess requisite 5 years experience as Asst. Prof
 - xiv) Dr. Sumalatha Shetty, Assoc. Prof., Anaesthesia; Does not possess prescribed academic qualification.

(b) The shortage of teaching faculty is 13.2% (i.e. 19 out of 143) as under :-

- | | | | |
|------|---------------------|----|---|
| (i) | Professor | :1 | (Forensic Medicine – 1) |
| (ii) | Associate Professor | :4 | (Anatomy – 1, Physiology – 1, Community |

- (iii) Assistant Professor :11 Medicine – 1 & General Medicine – 1
(Anatomy – 2, Pharmacology–1, Community
Medicine – 3, Paediatrics – 1, TB & Chest – 1,
General Surgery –1 & Obst & Gynae – 2)
- (iv) Pharma. Chemist :1
- (v) Epidemiologist cum :1
Lecturer
- (vi) Tutor :1 (Pathology – 1)

(c) The shortage of Residents is 17.4% (i.e. 15 out of 86) as under :-

- (i) Sr. Resident :13 (TB & Chest – 1, Skin & V.D – 1, General Surgery – 4,
Anaesthesia – 4 & Radio Diagnosis – 3)
- (ii) Jr. Resident :02 (Skin & V.D – 2)
2. At RHTC, audiovisual aids are borrowed from the Engineering faculty nearby, whenever required. No beds are available.
3. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give 2 (two) months time to the authorities of K.S. Hedge Medical College, Mangalore to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of MCI representing the State where the college is located.

14. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Kashmir University in respect of students being trained at Govt. Medical College, Srinagar.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (30th & 31st July, 2009) for Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Kashmir University in respect of students being trained at Govt. Medical College, Srinagar.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (30th & 31st July, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The following faculty members were not counted while computing the faculty:-

S.No.	Name	Designation	Department	Remarks
1.	Dr. Sabiya Majid	Assoc. Prof.	Biochemistry	M.Sc. - Science faculty & Ph.D. - PGI Chandigarh
2.	Dr. Mrs. Roohi Ashraf	Asst.Prof.	Biochemistry	M.Sc. – Science faculty
3.	Mr. Rushail Ahmed	Tutor	Biochemistry	M.Sc. – Science Faculty.
4.	D. Zorawar Singh	Asst.Prof.	Pharmacology	On deputation
5.	Dr. J.B. Singh	Tutor	Pathology	On deputation
6.	Dr. Mohd. Farooq Batt	Asst.Prof.	Orthopaedics	On deputation
7.	Dr. Anwar Hussain	Asst.Prof.	Orthopaedics	On deputation
8.	Dr. Kanwarjit Singh	Asst.Prof.	ENT	On deputation
9.	Dr. Nazir Ahmad Wani	Asst.Prof.	General Surgery	On deputation

10.	Dr. Syed Sajad Nazir	Asst.Prof.	General Surgery	On deputation
11.	Dr. Mushtaq Ahmad Chalkoo	Asst.Prof.	General Surgery	On deputation

b) The shortage of teaching faculty is 26.5% (i.e. 48 out of 181) as under:-

S.No.	Designation	No.	Department
<u>I</u>	Professor	06	(Physiology -1, Biochemistry -1, Pharmacology -1, Microbiology -1, Forensic Medicine -1, Radio Diagnosis -1)
ii	Assoc. Professor	17	(Physiology -1, Biochemistry -1, Pharmacology -1, Pathology -3, Forensic Medicine -1, General Medicine -2, TB & Chest -1, DVD -1, General Surgery -1, Ophthalmology -1, Obst. & Gynae. -3, Radio Diagnosis -1)
iii.	Asstt. Professor	23	(Physiology -1, Lect. Bio. -1, Biochemistry -1, Pharm.Chem.-1, Community Medicine -1, General Medicine -7, General Surgery- 3, ENT -3, & Obst. & Gynae. -5)
iv.	Tutor	02	(Biochemistry -1 & Pathology -1)

c) The shortage of Residents is 67.8% (i.e. 93 out of 137) as under:-

S.No.	Designation	No.	Department
<u>I</u>	Sr. Resident	18	(General Medicine – 6, General Surgery – 2, Obst. & Gynae. – 06, Anaesthesia – 2, Radio Diagnosis – 2)
<u>ii</u>	Jr. Resident	75	(General Medicine – 21, Paediatrics -5, General Surgery – 18, Orthopaedics – 3, ENT -4, Ophthalmology -6, Obst. & Gynae. – 18)

2. In Health Centers, no lecturer/Assistant Professor having MD (PSM) is available. There is no lecture hall cum seminar room is available. Delivery services are not available.
3. The Central workshop is not available.
4. Registration and Medical Record Section:- OPD registration counter, IPD registration counter as well as MRD are not computerized. ICD X Classification of diseases is not followed for indexing.
5. Central Sterilization department: There are no bowl sterilizer, no Glove inspection machine and no instrument washing machine available.
6. Hostel: There is no separate accommodation available for resident doctors. They are being accommodated in U.G. and P.G. Hostels. The hostel accommodation is inadequate for UG students as well as resident doctors.
7. In the department of Physiology, the demonstration rooms are small with the capacity of 30 seats. Labs in the department are small having a capacity of 30 workplaces.
8. In the department of Biochemistry, the demonstration room is small with the capacity of 30 seats. Lab in the department is small having a capacity of 30 workplaces. There is no eligible faculty available in the Department, only one tutor with the required academic qualification as per MCI norms is available.
9. In the department of Microbiology, the demonstration room is small with the capacity of 30 seats. Lab in the department is small having a capacity of 30 workplaces.
10. In the department of Forensic Medicine, the demonstration room is small with the capacity of 30 seats.
11. In the department of Community Medicine, the demonstration room is small with the capacity of 40 seats.
12. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give 2 (two) months time to the authorities of Govt. Medical College, Srinagar to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of MCI representing the State where the college is located.

15. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinayaka Missions University in respect of students being trained at Vinayaka Mission's Medical College, Pondicherry.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (6th & 7th August, 2009) for Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Vinayaka Mission University in respect of students being trained at Vinayaka Mission's Medical College, Pondicherry.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (6th & 7th August, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The following faculty has not been counted for reasons mentioned against each:

SN	Name	Designation	Department	Remarks
1	Dr. M L Jain	Professor	Anatomy	Relieving order from previous employer not attached
2	Dr. Nabakumar Bezbaruaha	Assist. Prof	Anatomy	No relieving order from previous employer not attached because of outstanding car loan
3	Dr.M Azeem	Tutor	Anatomy	Mismatch between letter of appointment , date of joining &date of joining on the declaration form
4	Dr. Saravana Kumar	Assoc Prof	Pharma	No requisite experience as Assist Prof
5	Dr k. R. kumar	Prof	Pathology	Does not have 5 years of experience as Asst. Prof
6	Dr,Mohamed Rafee	Assoc Prof	Medicine	Less than 5 years. experience as Asst. Prof
7	Dr.R.Govarthanan	Prof	Psychiatric	Age above 65 years
8	Dr.P.T.Tamizharasu	Prof	Pediatrics	No relieving order from the previous employer
9	Dr.V.Satyamurthi	Assist Prof	Pediatrics	No relieving order from previous employer
10	Dr. B Srinivas	Assist Prof	Pediatric	No appointment letter, no joining report.
11	Dr.Sambandamurthy	Assoc Prof	Gen.Surgery	No relieving order from previous employer
12	Dr Sujatha	Tutor	Radiology	No requisite experience
13	Dr. K. Cheran	Assist. Prof	Anaesthesia	Does not possess the required academic qualification.
14	Dr. AngayarakanniV	Assist Prof	Obst.&Gynae	Does not possess the required teaching experience.

15	Dr. K. P. Nainar	Assoc Prof	ENT	No requisite teaching experience as Asst.Prof.
16	Dr. K Kalaivani	Ophthalmology	Asst. Prof	Does not possess the required academic qualification.

(b) The following Senior Residents have not been counted for reasons mentioned against each :-

SN	Name	Department	Reason
1	Dr. B. Sajeeth Manikanada Prabha	Gen. Medicine	No requisite experience
2	Dr. Devika Rani	Obs.&Gynae.	No requisite experience

(c) In view of above, the shortage of teaching faculty is 31.97% (i.e. 47 out of 147) as under:-

- i) Professor 03 (Biochemistry -1, Pathology -1 & Radiology-1)
- ii) Associate Prof. -13 (Anatomy -2, Physiology -1, Pharmacology -1, Pathology -3, Community Medicine -1, TB & Chest -1, Psychiatry -1, Anaesthesia -2, Radio Diagnosis -1)
- iii) Assistant Prof. -13 (Pharmacology -1, Pharma Chemist -1, Community Medicine -1, TB & Chest -1, Paediatrics -1, Psychiatry -1, General Surgery -3, ENT -3 & Obst. & Gynae. -1)
- iv) Tutor -18 (Anatomy -1, Physiology -2, Pathology -2, Pharmacology -2, Forensic Medicine -1, Community Medicine -1, Anaesthesia -6, Radiology -3)

(d) The shortage of Residents is 35.86%(i.e. 33 out of 92) as under :-

- i) Sr. Resident 17 (General Medicine -3, Paediatrics -2, Dermatology -1, Psychiatry -1, General Surgery -3, Orthopaedics -2, ENT -1, Ophthalmology -2, Obst. Gynae. -2)
- ii) Jr. Resident 16 (General Medicine -4, TB & Chest -3, Dermatology -1, Psychiatry -1, General Surgery -2, ENT -3, Ophthalmology -2)

2. Clinical material is inadequate as under:-

	Daily Average		Day of Inspection	
O.P.D. attendance	822.6		656	
Bed occupancy%	84 %		56.5%	
Operative work				
Number of major surgical operations	6.4		2	
Number of minor surgical operations	13.4		10	
Number of normal deliveries	2		-	
Number of caesarian Sections	6		-	
<u>Radiological Investigations</u>	O.P.	I.P.	O.P.	I.P.
X-ray	76	20	50	16
Ultrasonography	19	7.5	21	7
Special Investigations	4	3.5	2	1
C.T. Scan	4	2.5	5	3

3. At RHTC, no lecturer cum medical officer having MD (PSM) is available. Messing facilities are not available. Lecture hall cum seminar room is not available. No audiovisual aids have been provided and they are brought by the PSM department at the time of the visit. At UHC, no lecturer cum medical officer

having MD (PSM) is available. Delivery services are not available. Immunization services are not available.

4. Central Sterilization department: There is no Glove inspection machine and no instrument washing machine. The receiving and distribution points are not available.
5. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give 2 (two) months time to the authorities of Vinayaka Mission's Medical College, Pondicherry to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of MCI representing the State where the college is located.

16. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Pravara Institute of Medical Sciences, (Deemed University), Loni in respect of students being trained at Rural Medical College, Loni.

Read: The compliance verification inspection report (7th August, 2009) for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Pravara Institute of Medical Sciences (Deemed University), Loni in respect of students being trained at Rural Medical College, Loni.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification inspection report (7th August, 2009) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Pravara Institute of Medical Sciences (Deemed University), Loni in respect of students being trained at Rural Medical College, Loni be continued restricting the number of admission to 125(One hundred twenty five) students.

17. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at M.S. Ramaiah Medical College, Bangalore.

Read: The compliance verification inspection report (23.07. 2009) for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at M.S. Ramaiah Medical College, Bangalore.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification inspection report (23.07. 2009) and noted the following:-

1. The shortage of Residents is 14.7% (i.e. 17 out of 115) as under:-
Sr.Residents-17 (TB & Chest-1, Medicine-1, Psychiatry-1, Paediatric-1, Surgery-1, Obst. & Gynae.-3, Radiology-5, Anaesthesia-4)
2. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give 2 (two) months time to the authorities of M.S. Ramaiah Medical College, Bangalore to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of MCI representing the State where the college is located.

18. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by B.L.D.E.A's Shri B.M. Patil Medical College (Deemed University) in respect of students being trained at Shri B.M. Medical College, Bijapur.

Read: The compliance verification inspection report (24th July, 2009) for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by B.L.D.E.A's Shri B.M. Patil Medical College (Deemed University) in respect of students being trained at Shri B.M. Medical College, Bijapur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification inspection report (24th July, 2009) and noted the following:-

- 1 (a) The following faculty members have not been counted while computing the faculty for the reasons mentioned against each.

Sl.No.	Name	Designation	Department	Remarks
1.	Dr. P.A. Sasanur	Asst.Prof.	General Surgery	Asst.Prof. – Surgical Gastroenterology as per letter of appointment
2.	Dr. Tumbal Shreesh V	Asst. Prof.	Orthopaedics	Does not possess the prescribed academic qualification.
3.	Dr. S.P. Choukimath	Professor	Psychiatry	Does not possess the prescribed academic qualification.

- (b) In view of above, the shortage of teaching faculty is 9% (i.e. 20 out of 212) as under:-

- (i) Professor : 01 (Dentistry -1)
(ii) Associate Professor : 10 (Pharmacology -1, Microbiology -2, Forensic Medicine -1, TB & Chest -1, Psychiatry -1, Orthopaedics -1, Anaesthesia -2 & Dentistry -1)
(iii) Assistant Professor : 08 (Anatomy -2, Community Medicine -1, Pharm.Chem-1 & General Surgery -4)
(iv) Tutor : 01 (Community Medicine -1)

- (c) The shortage of Residents is 6.08% as under :- (i.e. 7 out of 115) as under:-

- (i) Sr. Resident : 07 (TB & Chest -1, Psychiatry -1, ENT -1, Obst. & Gynae. -1, Anaesthesia -2 & Radio Diagnosis -1)

2. Clinical material is inadequate in terms of OPD attendance & bed occupancy as under:-

	Daily Range	Day of Inspection
O.P.D. attendance	1292	1020
Bed occupancy%	86%	74.67%

3. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give last and final 2 (two) months time to the authorities of Shri B.M. Medical College, Bijapur to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned

State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of MCI representing the State where the college is located.

19. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at St. John's Medical College, Bangalore

Read: The compliance verification inspection report (6th August, 2009) for continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at St. John's Medical College, Bangalore.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification inspection report (6th August, 2009) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at St. John's Medical College, Bangalore be continued restricting the number of admission to 60 (Sixty) students.

20. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at Al-Ameen Medical College, Bijapur

Read: The compliance verification inspection report (29th July, 2009) for Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at Al-Ameen Medical College, Bijapur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification inspection report (29th July, 2009) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore in respect of students being trained at Al-Ameen Medical College, Bijapur be continued restricting the number of admission to 100 (One Hundred) students.

21. Inspection of SDM College of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Dharwad to verify the teaching faculty, residence, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (19th & 20th August, 2009) to verify the teaching faculty, residents, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities available at SDM College of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Dharwad.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (19th & 20th August, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The following Teaching Faculty has not been considered because of the reasons mentioned below.

Sr No	Name	Department	Designation	Reason for not considering
1	Dr P Ravikala Rao	Pathology	Prof.	Does not possess required Teaching experience.
2	Dr K R Pravin Chandra	PSM	Assoc. Prof.	Does not possess prescribed Qualification.
3	Dr A K Handigol	Psychiatry	Asst. Prof.	Does not possess prescribed Qualification
4	Dr Venkatesh A	Surgery	Asst. Prof.	Appointed as Asst. Prof.

				in Paediatric surgery
5	Dr Santosh Jeevannavar	Orthopedics	Asst. Prof.	Do not possess prescribed Qualification
6	Dr Ashok Kalamadani		SR	
7	Dr Harshvardan	Anaesthesia	SR	Does not possess required Teaching experience.
8	Dr S K Joshi	Radiology	Prof.	Does not possess required Teaching experience.

- (b) In view of above, the shortage of teaching staff required at present stage is as under:-

a	Teaching Faculty	26 Out of 119	21.84%	
	i	Professor	5	Biochemistry-1, TB-1, Ortho-1, Anaesthesia-1, Radiology-1
	ii	Associate Prof.	6	Physio-1, Biochem-1, Pharmac-1, Forensic-1, Anaesthesia-1, Radiology-1
	iii	Assistant Professor	12	Anatomy-2, Lect.Biophys-1, Pharma-Chem-1, RHTC-1, UHTC-1, Surgery-2, Ortho-1, Anaesthesia-1, Radilogy-2
	iv	Tutor	4	Physio-1, Biochem-1, Forensic-1, PSM-1
b	Residents	61 of 84	72.61 %	
	i	Sr. Residents	12	Med-3, Psych-1, Surg-3, Opth-1, OBG-1, Anaesthesia-3
	ii	Jr. Residents	49	Med-12, Ped-6, TB-3, Derma-3, Psych-3, Surg-10, Orhto-3, Opth-3, OBG-6

2. At RHTC Yadwad, no deliveries are conducted. Investigation facilities for basic investigation, X-ray & ECG are not available Staff as prescribed under norms needs to be appointed. Lecture hall with A.V. aids needs to be provided.
3. At SDM Urban Health Center, duty rosters and records of various activities and investigations are not maintained properly.
4. Bowl sterilizer, Glove inspection machine, instrument washing machine and mixers are not available in CSSD.
5. The renewal certificate for Blood Bank is awaited.
6. Residential Quarters are not available for non-teaching staff.
7. Central library does not have Medlar facility.
8. The website does not include the names of the Teaching faculty and Non Teaching staff working at the college. It does not include the Merit wise list of the students admitted in the college.
9. The Hospital also provides the Super specialty services . There are no separate beds allocated for this super specialty. The General beds are used for admitting these patients which is not as per norms.
10. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to issue a show cause notice to the authorities of S.D.M. College of Medical Sciences & Hospital, Dharwad as to why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree should not be withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit its compliance within a period of 1 month for rectification of the deficiencies of teaching faculty and other deficiencies of infrastructure. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the

University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of the MCI representing the State where the college is located.

22. Inspection of Maharaja Agarsen Medical College, Agroha, Hisar to verify the teaching faculty, residence, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (19th & 20th August, 2009) to verify the teaching faculty, residents, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities available at Maharaja Agarsen Medical College, Agroha, Hisar.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (19th & 20th August, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. [a] Dr. Raghuvanash Sahaya – Prof. – Ophthalmology, not considered as his Date of Birth is 17.04.1944 – thus, more than 65 yrs. of age on the day of inspection.

[b] In view of above, the shortage of teaching staff required at present stage is as under:-

iii

(i) The shortage of teaching faculty is 27.5% (i.e. 24 out of 87) as under:-

- | | | | |
|-------|---------------------|------|---|
| (i) | Professor | : 05 | (Pharmacology -1, Paediatrics -1, Ophthalmology -1, Anaesthesia -1 & Radiology -1) |
| (ii) | Associate Professor | : 08 | (Physiology -1, Pathology -1, Medicine -1, TB & Chest -1, Skin & VD – 1, Orthopaedics -1, Obst. & Gynae. -1 & Dentistry -1) |
| (iii) | Assistant Professor | : 09 | (Community Medicine – 3, TB & Chest -1, ENT -1, Obst. & Gynae. -3 & Radiology -1) |
| (iv) | Tutor | : 02 | (Community Medicine -2) |

(ii) The shortage of Residents is 67.5% (i.e. 50 out of 74) as under:-

- | | | | |
|------|--------------|------|--|
| (i) | Sr. Resident | : 13 | (General Medicine -3, Paediatrics -1, TB & Chest -1, Skin & VD -3, Surgery -1, Obst. & Gynae. -1, Anaesthesia -2, Radiology -1) |
| (ii) | Jr. Resident | : 37 | (General Medicine -8, Paediatrics -6, TB & Chest -3, Skin & VD -3, Psychiatry -3, Surgery -6, Orthopaedics -2, ENT -2, Ophthalmology -2 & Obst. & Gynae. -2) |

2. Clinical Material is inadequate as under:-

	Daily Average	Day of Inspection 19.08.2009
Bed occupancy%	78.1% – 85.4%	50%*
Operative work		
Number of normal deliveries	1 – 2	nil
Number of caesarian Sections	1 – 2	nil

- The bed occupancy given in the above table represents the actual physical occupancy by patients in various wards visited by inspection team on the day of inspection. Though, the Medical Superintendent has provided the occupancy of 78%.

3. Blood Bank License was valid up to 10.07.2007.
4. ICCU does not have ventilator.

5. 4 of the OTs are not adequately equipped and needs to be upgraded in terms of resuscitation and anaesthesia equipments, air-conditioning etc.
6. R.H.T.C. at Barwala is under the control of Haryana Govt. and the college is allowed to use its facilities for teaching purposes which is not as per norms.
7. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to issue a show cause notice to the authorities of Maharaja Agarsen Medical College, Agroha, Hisar as to why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree should not be withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit its compliance within a period of 1 month for rectification of the deficiencies of teaching faculty, clinical material and other deficiencies of infrastructure. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of the MCI representing the State where the college is located.

23. Inspection of Khaja Banda Nawaz Institute of Medical Sciences, Gulbarga to verify the teaching faculty, residence, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (19th & 20th August, 2009) to verify the teaching faculty, residents, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities available at Khaja Banda Nawaz Institute of Medical Sciences, Gulbarga.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (19th & 20th August, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The shortage of teaching faculty is 36.36 % (Shortage of 44 out of 121)
 - i) Professor-7 (1 Anatomy, 1 Physiology, 1 Biochemistry, 1 Pharmacology, 1 Microbiology, 1 For. Med., 1 Ophthalmology)
 - ii) Associate Professor -8 (2 Anatomy, 2 Physiology, 1 Pathology, 1 PSM, 1 TB & Chest, 1 Psychiatry)
 - iii) Assistant Professor 12 (3 Anatomy, 1 Lect. (Bio), 1 Pharm.Chem, 1 PSM, 1 TB & Chest, 1 Psychiatry, 2 Anaesthesia, 2 Radiology)
 - iv) Tutor--17 (3 Anatomy, 4 Pharmacology, 4 Pathology, 1 Microbiology, 1 For. Med., 4 PSM)
- (b) The shortage of Residents is 72.94% :- (Shortage of 62 out of 85)
 - i) Sr. Resident 12 (4 Medicine, 1 TB & Chest, 1 Psychiatry, 4 Surgery, 1 ENT, 1 OBG)
 - ii) Jr. Resident 50 (9 Medicine, 5 Paediatrics, 3 TB & Chest, 3 Skin & VD, 2 Psychiatry, 12 Surgery, 6 Orthopaedics, 3 ENT, 2 Ophthalmology, 5 OBG)

2. Clinical Material is inadequate as under:-

	Daily Average	Day of Inspection
O.P.D. attendance	821	224
Bed occupancy%	82%	16%

Operative work				
Number of major surgical operations	11		2	
Number of minor surgical operations	29		6	
Number of normal deliveries	1		–	
Number of caesarian Sections	1		–	
Radiological Investigations	O.P.	I.P.	O.P.	I.P.
X-ray	23	22	10	2
Ultrasonography	23	11	6	–
Special Investigations	1	–	–	–
C.T. Scan	–	1	–	–
Laboratory Investigations				
Biochemistry	94	41	6	3
Microbiology	22	7	–	–
Serology	68	31	2	2
Parasitology	15	9	–	–
Haematology	70	40	5	3
Histopathology	1	1	–	–
Cytopathology	1	2	–	–
Others	–	–	–	–

3. Hostel accommodation is available only for 33 interns against requirement of 100.
4. Hostel accommodation is available for 62 Residents only against requirement of 114.
5. Accommodation for nurses is inadequate.
6. Central Casualty Service: Central oxygen and Suction is not working. Disaster Trolley and crash cot are not available.
7. Operation theatre equipments are inadequate as under:-

Capnograph	Nil
Respiratory Gas Monitor	Nil
Pulse oxymeter	10
Defibrillators	02
Ventilator	Nil
Boyles' apparatus	10
Boyles' Apparatus with Inbuilt Ventilator	Nil
Infusion Pump	Nil
Drip Infusion Pump	Nil
8. Incinerator is not functional.
9. Radiological facilities: No static unit is having Image Intensifier.
10. Other deficiencies/remarks in the report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to issue a show cause notice to the authorities of Khaja Banda Nawaz Institute of Medical Sciences, Gulbarga as to why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree should not be withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit its compliance within a period of 1 month for rectification of the deficiencies of teaching faculty, clinical material and other deficiencies of infrastructure. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of the MCI representing the State where the college is located.

24. Removal of name of Dr. (Mrs.) Raj Girish from the Indian Medical Register - Registration No. 6074, dt. 17.12.1976.

Read: The letter dated 18.06.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur with regard to removal of name of Dr. Raj Girish from the Indian Medical Register – Registration No. 6074.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 18.06.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur intimating that Dr. (Mrs.) Raj Girish is restrained from practicing medicine for a period of six months or till the enquiry is completed whichever is earlier. Consequently the Registration No.6074, dt. 17.12.1976 shall remain suspended for the said period.

In view of above, the Committee decided to remove the name of above-mentioned doctor for a period of six months or till the enquiry is completed whichever is earlier from the Indian Medical Register and also give intimation in this regard to all the State Medical Councils in the country.

25. Removal of name of Dr. Girish Chandra Agrawal from the Indian Medical Register -Registration No. 6261, dt. 07.03.1977.

Read: The letter dated 18.06.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur with regard to removal of name of Dr. Girish Chandra Agarwal from the Indian Medical Register – Registration No. 6261.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 18.06.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur intimating that Dr. Girish Chandra Agrawal is restrained from practicing medicine for a period of six months or till the enquiry is completed whichever is earlier. Consequently the Registration No.6261, dt. 07.03.1977 shall remain suspended for the said period.

In view of above, the Committee decided to remove the name of above-mentioned doctor for a period of six months or till the enquiry is completed whichever is earlier from the Indian Medical Register and also give intimation in this regard to all the State Medical Councils in the country.

26. Removal of name of Dr. Nabab Singh Beniwal from the Indian Medical Register -Registration No.20859, dt. 20.01.2002.

Read: The letter dated 18.06.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur with regard to removal of name of Dr. Nabab Singh Beniwal from the Indian Medical Register – Registration No. 20859.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 18.06.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur intimating that Dr. Nabab Singh Beniwal is restrained from practicing medicine for a period of six months or till the enquiry is completed whichever is earlier. Consequently the Registration No.20859, dt. 20.01.2002 shall remain suspended for the said period.

In view of above, the Committee decided to remove the name of above-mentioned doctor for a period of six months or till the enquiry is completed whichever is earlier from the Indian Medical Register and also give intimation in this regard to all the State Medical Councils in the country.

27. Removal of name of Dr. Hridaya Narain Singh from the Indian Medical Register -Registration No. 24141, dt. 15.05.2006.

Read: The letter dated 18.06.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur with regard to removal of name of Dr. Hridaya Narain Singh from the Indian Medical Register – Registration No. 24141.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 18.06.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur intimating that Dr. Hridaya Narain Singh is restrained from practicing medicine for a period of six months or till the enquiry is completed whichever is earlier. Consequently the Registration No.24141, dt. 15.05.2006 shall remain suspended for the said period.

In view of above, the Committee decided to remove the name of above-mentioned doctor for a period of six months or till the enquiry is completed whichever is earlier from the Indian Medical Register and also give intimation in this regard to all the State Medical Councils in the country.

28. Removal of Names of Dr. Niranjana Lal Sharma, Dr. Ish Kumar Jawa & Dr. (Mrs.) Prem Yadav from the Indian Medical Register.

Read: The letter dated 04.06.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur with regard to removal of name of Dr. Niranjana Lal Sharma, Dr. Ish Kumar Jawa & Dr. (Mrs.) Prem Yadav from the Indian Medical Register – Registration No. 326, 2514 and 5746.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 04.06.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur intimating that the following doctors have expired and their names have been removed from the Register of Registered Medical Practitioners:-

<u>SL.No.</u>	<u>Name of Doctor</u>	<u>Regn. No.& Date</u>	<u>Date of Expiration</u>
1.	Dr. Niranjana Lal Sharma	326 Dt. 27.03.1961	01.06.2009
2.	Dr. Ish Kumar Jawa	2514 Dt. 01.05.1970	27.05.2009
3.	Dr.(Mrs.) Prem Yadav	5746 Dt.25.02.1976	31.05.2009

In view of above, the Executive Committee decided to remove the names of above-mentioned doctors from the Indian Medical Register and give intimation in this regard to all the State Medical Councils in the country.

29. Removal of name of Dr. Navendra Mathur from the Indian Medical Register -Registration No. 6711, dt. 20.10.1977.

Read: The letter dated 07.07.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur with regard to removal of name of Dr. Navendra Mathur from the Indian Medical Register – Registration No. 6711.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 07.07.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur intimating that Dr. Navendra Mathur bearing Registration No. 6711, dated 20.10.1977 had expired on 03.07.2009 and his name has been removed from the Register of Registered Medical Practitioners. The Committee decided to remove the name of above-mentioned doctor from the Indian Medical Register and also give intimation in this regard to all the State Medical Councils in the country.

30. Removal of name of Dr. Shyam Sunder Kanodia from the Indian Medical Register -Registration No. 3488, dt. 14.04.1972.

Read: The letter dated 15.07.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur with regard to removal of name of Dr. Shyam Sunder Kanodia from the Indian Medical Register – Registration No. 3488.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 15.07.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur intimating that Dr. Shyam Sunder Kanodia bearing Registration No. 3488, dated 14.04.1972 had expired on 11.07.2009 and his name has been removed from the Register of Registered Medical Practitioners. The Committee decided to remove the name of above-mentioned doctor from the Indian Medical Register and also give intimation in this regard to all the State Medical Councils in the country.

31. Removal of name of Dr. Mohan Lal Sharma from the Indian Medical Register.

Read: The letter dated 21.07.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur with regard to removal of name of Dr. Mohan Lal Sharma from the Indian Medical Register – Registration No. 5906.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 21.07.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur intimating that Dr. Mohan Lal Sharma bearing Registration No. 5906, dated 08.10.1976 had expired on 19.07.2009 and his name has been removed from the Register of Registered Medical Practitioners. The Committee decided to remove the name of above-mentioned doctor from the Indian Medical Register and also give intimation in this regard to all the State Medical Councils in the country.

32. Removal of name of Dr. Narayan Parshad Singla from the Indian Medical Register.

Read: The letter dated 30.07.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur with regard to removal of name of Dr. Narayan Parshad Singh from the Indian Medical Register – Registration No. 14684.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 30.07.2009 received from the Registrar, Rajasthan Medical Council, Jaipur intimating that Dr. Narayan Parshad Singh bearing Registration No. 14684, dated 22.04.1993 had expired on 28.07.2009 and his name has been removed from the Register of Registered Medical Practitioners. The Committee decided to remove the name of above-mentioned doctor from the Indian Medical Register and also give intimation in this regard to all the State Medical Councils in the country.

33. Matter with regards to Dr. Madhao G. Raje for working at more than one Medical College, simultaneously – Action taken in view of Code of Medical Ethics – Appeal/Representation by Dr. Madhao G. Raje for re-consideration of the earlier decision of General Body.

Read: The matter with regards to Dr. Madhao G. Raje for working at more than one Medical College, simultaneously – Action taken in view of Code of Medical Ethics – Appeal/Representation by Dr. Madhao G. Raje for re-consideration of the earlier decision of General Body along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

34. Appeal under Section 24(2) of IMC Act, 1956 against the order dated 16.09.2003 passed by the Delhi Medical Council against the Appellant Dr. T.K. Chakraborty - Govt's letter dt. 14/11/2007 regarding.(F.No. 492/2007)

Read: The matter with regard to appeal under Section 24(2) of IMC Act, 1956 against the order dated 16.09.2003 passed by the Delhi Medical Council against the Appellant Dr. T.K. Chakraborty - Govt's letter dt. 14/11/2007 regarding.(F.No. 492/2007) along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

35. The decision of the Ethics Committee vide its meeting dated 06.10.2008 in the case relating to the Appeal by Dr. R.P. Arora against the order dated 31.01.2007 of Delhi Medical Council - Representations dated 11.12.2008 and 24.04.2009 by Sh. Suman Barthwal husband of Mrs. Munni Devi regarding (F.No. 204/2007).

Read: The matter with regard to the decision of the Ethics Committee vide its meeting dated 06.10.2008 in the case relating to the Appeal by Dr. R.P. Arora against the order dated 31.01.2007 of Delhi Medical Council - Representations dated 11.12.2008 and 24.04.2009 by Sh. Suman Barthwal husband of Mrs. Munni Devi regarding (F.No. 204/2007) along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

36. Complaint against Dr. Yash Nigam, Orthopedic Surgeon as alleged by Mr. Sachin Shah (F.No.358/2007).

Read: The matter with regard to complaint against Dr. Yash Nigam, Orthopedic Surgeon as alleged by Mr. Sachin Shah (F.No.358/2007) along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

37. Representation by Dr. Jaideep Bansal against MCI's order dated 16th May, 2008 on the appeal by Sh. Rakesh Sharma against order dated 25.10.2006 of Delhi Medical Council (F.No. 481/2008)

Read: The matter with regard to representation by Dr. Jaideep Bansal against MCI's order dated 16th May, 2008 on the appeal by Sh. Rakesh Sharma against order dated 25.10.2006 of Delhi Medical Council (F.No. 481/2008) along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

38. Fee as prescribed by the General Body for complaint & appeal cases received u/s 8.7 & 8.8 of Indian Medical Council (Professional Conduct, Etiquette and Ethics) Regulations, 2002 – Govt. letter dated 09.03.2009 regarding.

Read: The matter with regard to Fee as prescribed by the General Body for complaint & appeal cases received u/s 8.7 & 8.8 of Indian Medical Council (Professional Conduct, Etiquette and Ethics) Regulations, 2002 – Govt. letter dated 09.03.2009.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

39. Payment of honorarium to the senior consultants for the expert opinions solicited by the Ethics Committee – Proposal regarding.

Read: The matter with regard to Payment of honorarium to the senior consultants for the expert opinions solicited by the Ethics Committee – Proposal regarding along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

40. Matter with regards to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. K. Padma, Medical teacher.

Read: The matter with regard to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. K. Padma, Medical teacher along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

41. Matter with regards to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. Deepakala N., Medical teacher.

Read: The matter with regard to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. Deepakala N., Medical teacher along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

42. Matter with regards to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. Bhavna Chavda, Medical Teacher.

Read: The matter with regard to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. Bhavna Chavda, Medical Teacher along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

43. Matter with regards to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. Yogesh Rathi, Medical Teacher.

Read: The matter with regard to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. Yogesh Rathi, Medical Teacher along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

44. Matter with regards to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. Bijay Kumar Pathnaik, Medical teacher.

Read: The matter with regard to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. Bijay Kumar Pathnaik, Medical teacher along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

45. Matter with regards to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. Anita Chhibba, Medical teacher.

Read: The matter with regard to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. Anita Chhibba, Medical teacher along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

46. Matter with regards to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. C. Vijayalakshmi, Medical teacher.

Read: The matter with regard to supply of alleged forged/fake information/certificate in/with the declaration forms submitted to the MCI by Dr. C. Vijayalakshmi, Medical teacher along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

47. Appeal against the order dated 01.11.2007 of Delhi Medical Council made by Sh. Harishchandra Chavan, Hon'ble Member of Parliament (Lok Sabha).

Read: The matter with regard to Appeal against the order dated 01.11.2007 of Delhi Medical Council made by Sh. Harishchandra Chavan, Hon'ble Member of Parliament (Lok Sabha) along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

48. Complaint-cum-Appeal dt.14.12.06 against Medical Mishaps - Representation/ Private Hospitals as alleged by Mr. P. Raju.

Read: The matter with regard to Complaint-cum-Appeal dt.14.12.06 against Medical Mishaps - Representation/ Private Hospitals as alleged by Mr. P. Raju along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

49. Appeal against the order dated 21/02/2006 passed by the Delhi Medical Council as per order dated 30/11/2007 passed by NCDRC, New Delhi.

Read: The matter with regard to Appeal against the order dated 21/02/2006 passed by the Delhi Medical Council as per order dated 30/11/2007 passed by NCDRC, New Delhi along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

50. Application from Dr. B.B. Chowbey, President, Sonological Society of India seeking information under RTI Act, 2005.

Read: The matter with regard to Application from Dr. B.B. Chowbey, President, Sonological Society of India seeking information under RTI Act, 2005 along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

- 51. (I) Appeal by Dr. Pramod Batra against order dated 04/02/2008 of Delhi Medical Council (F. No. 77/2008).**
(II) Appeal by Dr. Archana Kothari against order dated 04/02/2008 of Delhi Medical Council (F. No. 87/2008).
(III) Appeal by Dr. Pradeep Kharbanda against order dated 04/02/2008 of Delhi Medical Council (F. No. 88/2008).

Read: The matter with regard to (I) Appeal by Dr. Pramod Batra against order dated 04/02/2008 of Delhi Medical Council (F. No. 77/2008).

(II) Appeal by Dr. Archana Kothari against order dated 04/02/2008 of Delhi Medical Council (F. No. 87/2008).

(III) Appeal by Dr. Pradeep Kharbanda against order dated 04/02/2008 of Delhi Medical Council (F. No. 88/2008) along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

52. Appeal by Mr. S.M. Jain against the Order dated 29.05.2007 of Delhi Medical Council.

Read: The matter with regard to Appeal by Mr. S.M. Jain against the Order dated 29.05.2007 of Delhi Medical Council along with the recommendations of the Ethic Committee.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

53. Recommendations of Expert Group to develop programmes for Advanced & Degree Courses in Medical Education Technologies (MET).

Read: The recommendations of Expert Group to develop programmes for Advanced & Degree Courses in Medical Education Technologies (MET).

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

54. Change of name from Hindustan Institute of Medical Sciences & Research to School of Medical & Research and also for award of Degree of MBBS courses 2009-10 batch onwards under Sharda University - reg.

Read: The matter with regard to Change of name from Hindustan Institute of Medical Sciences & Research to School of Medical & Research and also for award of Degree of MBBS courses 2009-10 batch onwards under Sharda University.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed the letter dated 28.07.2009 from the Chief Secretary to the Govt. of Uttar Pradesh, Lucknow which reads as under:-

“उपर्युक्त विषयक वाइस चेयर-मैन शारदा एजुकेशनल ट्रस्ट के पत्र दिनांक 25.7.2009 के संदर्भ में मुझे यह कहने का निदेश हुआ है कि शासनदेश संख्या – 1157/71-3-2005-एन-19/2005 दिनांक 21.3.2006 द्वारा शारदा एजुकेशनल ट्रस्ट, आगरा द्वारा स्थापित हिन्दुस्तान इंस्टीट्यूट आफ मेडिकल साइंसेज एण्ड रिसर्च, ग्रेटर नोएडा को एम.बी.बी.एस. पाठ्यक्रम संजालित किये जाने हेतु अनिवार्यता / अनापत्ति प्रमाण-पत्र प्रदान किया गया था तथा इस संस्थान को चौधरी चरण सिंह विश्वविद्यालय, मेरठ से सम्बद्धता प्रस्तावित की गयी है।

2 - शारदा एजुकेशनल ट्रस्ट ग्रेटर नोएडा में शारदा विश्वविद्यालय उ.प्र. अधिनियम – 2009 (उत्तर प्रदेश अधिनियम संख्या 14 सन 2009) के तहत शारदा विश्वविद्यालय स्थापित किया गया है। इस विश्वविद्यालय के अंतर्गत हिन्दुस्तान इंस्टीट्यूट आफ मेडिकल साइंसेज एण्ड रिसर्च, ग्रेटर नोएडा को समाहित करते हुए इस संस्थान का नाम स्कूल आफ मेडिकल साइंसेज एण्ड रिसर्च, शारदा विश्वविद्यालय, ग्रेटर नोएडा को समाहित करते हुए इस संस्थान का नाम स्कूल आफ मेडिकल साइंसेज साइंसेज एण्ड रिसर्च, शारदा विश्वविद्यालय, ग्रेटर नोएडा रखा गया है। जिसके अंतर्गत वर्ष 2009-10 से एम.बी.बी.एस. पाठ्यक्रम संचालित किया जायेगा तथा इस प्रकार एम0बी0बी0एस0 पाठ्यक्रम में शैक्षणिक सत्र 2009-10 में प्रवेशित धर्तों को डिग्री शारदा विश्वविद्यालय द्वारा प्रदान की जायेगी।

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council noted and approved the changed name of the Institute from Hindustan Institute of Medical Sciences & Research to School of Medical Science & Research and also approved that the institute will be a constituent unit of Sharda University.

55. Approval of Minutes of the Teachers Eligibility Qualifications Sub-committee held on 19th May, 2009.

Read: The Minutes of the Teachers Eligibility Qualifications Sub-committee held on 19th May, 2009.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the minutes of the Teachers Eligibility Qualifications Sub-Committee held on 19th May, 2009 and observed that the following items requires reconsideration and decided to refer the matter back to the Teachers Eligibility Qualification Sub-Committee:-

- Item No.4. Teacher's Eligibility Qualifications – Dr. Manas Kanti Ray, Associate Professor of Physiology at Shadan Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad – Clarifications for eligibility for the respective designated post.
- Item No.5 Teacher's Eligibility Qualifications – Dr. (Mrs.) Suranjana Ray, Assistant Professor of Physiology at Shadan Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad – Clarifications for eligibility for the respective designated post.
- Item No.7 Regarding the research experience required by D.N.B. candidate.
- Item No.8 To prescribe the Eligibility Criteria for Teachers in the Broad Speciality and Super-Speciality Course.

The Executive Committee further decided to approve the remaining items.

56. Appointment of Computer Operator in the Council office.

Read: The matter with regard to appointment of Computer Operator in the Council office.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the following recommendations of the Selection Committee:

“The Selection Committee for the post of Computer Operator (SC) met in the Council Office on 18.6.2009 wherein the following were present:-

<i>Lt.Col.(Retd.) Dr. A.R.N. Setalvad</i>	<i>Chairman</i>
<i>Dr. P. Prasannaraj</i>	<i>Member</i>
<i>Shri Ashok Kumar Harit</i>	<i>Member</i>
<i>Mrs. Madhu Handa</i>	<i>Member</i>

Six (06) candidates were called for interview and all the six candidates attended the same.

The Committee, after interview and discussion, recommends the following for the post of Computer Operator (SC):-

Selected

#	Sr.# in list	Name of candidate	Total Score (Out of 100)
1	6	Sh. Rakesh Kumar	60

57. Approval of Minutes of the Finance Committee held on 25th August, 2009.

Read: The minutes of the Finance Committee Meeting held on 25th August, 2009.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the following minutes of the Finance Committee meeting held on 25th August, 2009:-

“The Minutes of the meeting of Finance Committee held at 25th August, 2009 on 14.30 hours in the Council Office, New Delhi.

Present:-

<i>Dr. S.D. Dalvi</i>	-	<i>Chairman</i>
<i>Dr. Ved Prakash Mishra</i>	-	<i>Member</i>
<i>Dr. Kharangate Anant Y.</i>	-	<i>Member</i>
<i>Dr. Bijoy Mukherjee</i>	-	<i>Member</i>
<i>Dr. D.S. Rana</i>	-	<i>Member</i>
<i>Lt. Col.(Retd.) Dr. A.R.N. Setalvad</i>	-	<i>Secretary</i>

Leave of absence was granted to Dr. O.P. Tiwari.

1. Minutes of the last meeting - Confirmation of.

The Finance Committee Confirmed the minutes of the last meeting held on 29th May, 2009.

2. Minutes of last meeting of Finance Committee – Action Taken thereon.

The Finance Committee noted and approved the action taken by the Office on the various items included in the minutes of the meeting held on 29th May, 2009.

3. Reimbursement of one Residential Land Line & one Mobile Telephone monthly Charges to the office bearers of the Council namely President, Vice President & Chairman of PG Committee.

Read: The matter with regard to consider & approve the Reimbursement of one Residential Land Line & one Mobile Telephone monthly Charges to the office bearers of the Council namely President, Vice President & Chairman of PG Committee

It has been observed that the President, Vice President & the Chairman of PG Committee of the Council, who are the statutory authorities of the Council have to remain in contact with the functionaries & the executives of the Council and Govt. Agencies for smooth running and conduct of business of the Council. They also have to remain in constant with other members of Committees. As this scheduling and planning has to be done when they are on the move, communication is essential to dispose of their duties in the interest of Council.

In view of the above, Finance Committee decided to recommend the reimbursement of one Residential Land Line & one Mobile Telephone monthly Charges to the office bearers of the Council namely President, Vice President & Chairman of PG Committee for consideration & approval by the Executive Committee of the Council.

4. Purchase of a new Car for President of the Council.

Read: The matter with regard to consider the proposal for purchase of a new car for President of the Council.

The Finance Committee decided to approve the proposal for purchase of a new car for President of the Council.

Further, the Finance Committee recommended that the same be placed before the Executive Committee of the Council for its consideration and approval.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair.”

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to approve the finance for purchase of one new car i.e. Toyota Innova for President of the Council, as per purchase procedure, immediately.

It was further decided by the Executive Committee that one additional post of Driver in Pay Band of Rs. 5200-20200 + Grade Pay be also sanctioned in the office of the Council.

58. Inspection of Government Medical College, Akola to verify the teaching faculty, residence, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (26th & 27th August, 2009) to verify the teaching faculty, residents, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities available at Government Medical College, Akola.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (26th & 27th August, 2009) and noted the following:-

1.(a) The following faculty has not been considered for the reasons listed as under:-

- Dr. M.R. Kale – Prof. of Orthopaedics – teaching experience on the post of Resident, Asst.Prof. & Assoc.Prof. not as per MCI requirement. Total teaching experience approx. 12 years from Asst.Prof. onwards.
- Dr. Kailash I Moraka – Assoc.Prof. of Orthopaedics – the Pre PG residency experience not provided and Asst.Prof. teaching experience is 3 years 10 months only.
- Dr. P. Vashudev Shekhar – Asst. Prof of Radiology - is DNB & DMRD and 3 years residency experience not mentioned.
- Dr. K.B. Shakyamuni – Prof. of Physiology – post PG teaching experience 13 years. Asst.Prof. teaching experience of 2 years and pre PG residency period has not been mentioned.
- Dr. Abhijit A Adgonkar – Asst.Prof. of Medicine – pre PG residency period of 3 years not provided.
- Dr. Mahesh K Gandhi – Asst.Prof. – Medicine - pre PG residency period of 3 years not provided.
- Dr. Samir S. Maliya – Asst. Prof. of Medicine - pre PG residency period of 3 years not provided.
- Dr. R.S. Chauhan – shown as Sr. Resident – does not have requisite 3 years teaching experience.
- Dr. Rachana A Laul – Asst. Prof. of Skin & VD - pre PG residency period of 3 years not provided.
- Dr. P.P. Thakare – Assoc.Prof. of Psychiatry – Overall teaching experience is not as per MCI requirement.
- Dr. Mohd. Aslam – Sr. Resident of TB & Chest – required 3 years teaching experience not provided.
- Dr. Madhura R Katdare – Asst.Prof. of Surgery - pre PG residency period of 3 years not provided.
- Dr. Vaishali G K. – Asst.Prof. of Surgery - pre PG residency period of 3 years not provided.
- Dr. Rajshree Chaurtagar – Asst.Prof. of ENT - pre PG residency period of 3 years not provided.
- Dr. Parag Doifode – Sr. Resident – not possessing required 3 years experience.
- Dr. Abhay Ladoo Lal Shah – Assoc.Prof. of Surgery – the overall teaching experience is not as per MCI requirement.
- Dr. Dharmendra R Raut – Asst.Prof. of Obst. & Gynae. - pre PG residency period of 2 years 5 months provided.

(b) In view of above, the shortage of teaching staff required at present stage is as under:-

(I) The shortage of teaching faculty is 33.05% (i.e. 40 out of 121) as under :-

- | | | | |
|------|---------------------|------|---|
| (i) | Professor | : 07 | (Physiology -1, Biochemistry -1, Forensic Medicine -1, Community Medicine -1, Orthopaedics -1, Anaesthesia -1 & Radio Diagnosis -1) |
| (ii) | Associate Professor | : 12 | (Anatomy -1, Biochemistry -1, General Medicine -1, Paediatrics -1, TB & Chest -1, Psychiatry -1, General Surgery -1, Orthopaedics -1, Obst. & Gynae. -1, Anaesthesia -2 & Radio Diagnosis -1) |

- (iii) Assistant Professor : 16 (Anatomy -2, Pharmacology -1, Forensic Medicine – 1, General Medicine -3, Skin & VD -1, ENT -1, Orthopaedics -1, Anaesthesia -3, Radio diagnosis -2 & Dentistry -1)
- (iv) Tutor : 03 (Anatomy -1 & Pharmacology -2)
- (v) Lect. Biophysics : 01
- (vi) Pharmachemist : 01
- (II) The shortage of Residents is 54.21% (i.e. 45 out of 83) as under :-
- (i) Sr. Resident : 14 (General Medicine -3, TB & Chest -1, Skin & VD -1, Surgery -3, & Orthopaedics -1, Obst. & Gynae. -1, Anaesthesia -1 & Radio Diagnosis -3)
- (ii) Jr. Resident : 31 (General Medicine -9, TB & Chest -2, Skin & VD -3, Psychiatry -3, General Surgery -11, Orthopaedics -1, Obst. & Gynae. -2)

2. At UHC, no lecture cum seminar room is available.
3. The college is presently utilizing 700 capacity auditorium of Panjabrao Krishi University located at a distance of 1.5 km. from college.
4. Nursing staff is inadequate as under:-
- | | |
|----------------------------|-----|
| Nursing Superintendent | Nil |
| Dy. Nursing Superintendent | Nil |
5. In Central Sterilization department, there are no vertical Autoclaves, bowl sterilizer, Glove inspection machine and ultrasound instrument cleaning machine available.
6. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to issue a show cause notice to the authorities of Government Medical College, Akola as to why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree should not be withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit its compliance within a period of 1 month for rectification of the deficiencies of teaching faculty and other deficiencies of infrastructure. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of the MCI representing the State where the college is located.

59. Inspection of Co-operative Medical College, Kochi to verify the teaching faculty, residence, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (26th & 27th August, 2009) to verify the teaching faculty, residents, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities available at Co-operative Medical College, Kochi.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (26th & 27th August, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The shortage of teaching faculty is 48.76% (Shortage of 59 out of 121) as under :-
 - (i) Professor : 06 (1 Biochemistry, 1 Pharmacology, 1 ENT, 1 Ophthalmology, 1 Anaesthesia & 1 Radiology)
 - (ii) Associate Professor : 14 (2 Anatomy , 2 Physiology , 1 Biochemistry , 1 Pharmacology, 3 Pathology , 1 Forensic Medicine 1 PSM, 1 TB & Chest, 1 Psychiatry, 1 Orthopaedics)
 - (iii) Assistant Professor : 25 (1 Anatomy , 2 Physiology, 2 Pharmacology, 1 Pathology, 1 Microbiology, 1 Forensic Medicine, 2 PSM, 1 Epidemiologist, 1 Statistician, 1 RHTC, 1 UHC, 1 Medicine, 1 Paediatrics, 1 Skin & VD, 2 Surgery, 2 Ortho, 1 OBG, 1 ANMO, 1 MWO, 1 Anesthesia)
 - (iv) Tutor : 14 (4 Anatomy, 1 Physiology, 1 Biochemistry, 2 Pharmacology, 4 Pathology, 1 Microbiology, 1 Forensic Medicine)
- (b) The shortage of Residents is 67.05% (Shortage of 57 out of 85) as under :-
 - (i) Sr. Resident : 12 (2 Paediatrics, 1 TB & Chest, 2 Surgery, 2 Ortho, 3 Anaesthesia, 2 Radiology)
 - (ii) Jr. Resident : 45 (10 Medicine, 6 Paediatrics, 2 TB & Chest, 2 Dermatology, 3 Psychiatry, 11 Surgery, 3 Ortho, 1 ENT, 2 Ophthalmology, 5 OBG)

2. Clinical Material is inadequate as under:

	Daily Average		Day of Inspection	
O.P.D. attendance	402		440	
Casualty attendance	51		25	
Number of admissions / discharge	33/36		15/18	
Bed Occupancy %	40		40	
<u>Operative work</u>				
Number of major surgical operations	4		5	
Number of minor surgical operations	3		2	
Number of normal deliveries	2		1	
Number of caesarian Sections	2		1	
<u>Radiological Investigations</u>				
	O.P.	I.P.	O.P.	I.P.
X-ray	55	70	42	29
Ultrasonography	10	7	6	8
Special Investigations	0	2	0	2
C.T. Scan	2	2	1	2
<u>Laboratory Investigations</u>				
Biochemistry	105	145	63	239
Microbiology	8	20	2	10
Serology	10	7	8	2
Parasitology	2	3	1	1
Haematology	137	206	206	224
Histopathology	0	3	0	2
Cytopathology	4	0	0	1
Others	-	-	-	-

3. Animal House: The following animals are not available on the day of inspection.
 - (a) Rats: Nil
 - (b) Guinea pig: Nil
 - (c) Rabbit: Nil
 - (d) Mice: Nil
 - (e) Large animals: Nil
4. Central Library: There is no separate reading room for student reading with there own books.

5. Health Centres: In P.H.C.:No Assistant Professor having M.D. (P.S.M) is available. L.M.O is not available. No hostel accommodation for Boys and Girls is available. Messing facility are not available. No audiovisual aids have been provided. Minor OT is not available. In U.H.C. : No Assistant Professor having M.D. (PSM) is available. LMO is not available. No room is available for teaching and training of students and interns. Labour Room and a Minor OT is not available. No indoor beds are available. No investigation facilities are available.
6. In Central sterilization department, there are no vertical autoclaves, Bowl sterilizer, Glove inspection machine, ultrasound Instrument Cleaning Machine and E.T.O.
7. Central Laundry: Hydro extractor and Rolley steam press are not available.
8. In the department of Anatomy, there is no Band saw.
9. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to issue a show cause notice to the authorities of Co-operative Medical College, Kochi as to why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree should not be withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit its compliance within a period of 1 month for rectification of the deficiencies of teaching faculty, clinical material and other deficiencies of infrastructure. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of the MCI representing the State where the college is located.

60. Inspection of Basaveswara Medical College and Hospital, Chitradurga, Karnataka to verify the teaching faculty, residence, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (28th & 29th August, 2009) to verify the teaching faculty, residents, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities available at Basaveswara Medical College and Hospital, Chitradurga, Karnataka.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (28th & 29th August, 2009) and noted the following:-

1.(a) The following teaching faculty has not been considered because of the reasons mentioned below:-

Sl.No.	Name	Deptt.	Designation	Reason for not considering
1.	Dr. Mahesh G.M.	Anatomy	Professor	Does not possess required teaching experience.
2.	Dr. Aragya Sur	Physiology	Asstt.Prof.	Does not possess required teaching experience.
3.	Dr. Hemontika Chakraborty	Biochemistry	Assoc.Prof.	Does not possess prescribed qualification.
4.	Dr. Suresh Balu M.T.	Paediatrics	Professor	Does not possess required teaching experience.
5.	Dr. Raghvendra K.	Paediatrics	Asstt.Prof.	Does not possess prescribed qualification.
6.	Dr. Parwathi	Dermatology	Professor	Does not possess prescribed qualification.
7.	Dr. Rajesh MS	Orthopaedics	Professor	Does not possess prescribed qualification.

(b) In view of above, the shortage of teaching staff required at present stage i.e. 72 out of 121 (59.50%) is as under:-

Professor-12	(Anatomy-1, Physiology-1, Biochemistry-1, Pathology-1, Microbiology-1, PSM-1, Medicine-1, Paediatrics-1, TB & Chest-1, ENT-1, Ophthalmology-1, Radio-Diagn.-1)
Assoc.Prof.-17	(Anatomy-2, Physiology-2, Biochemistry-1, Pharmacology-1, Pathology-2, Microbiology1, Forensic Medicine-1, PSM-1, Paediatric-1, Psychiatry-1, Surgery-1, Anaesthesia-2, Radio-Diagn.-1)
Asstt.Prof.-23	(Anatomy-3, Pharmacology-2, Pharma-Chemist-1, Pathology-2, Forensic Medicine-1, PSM-1, Epidem-1, RHTC-1, UHTC-1, Medicine-2, Paediatric-1, TB & Chest-1, Dermatology-1, ENT-1, Anaesthesia-3, Radio-Diagn.-1.
Tutors-20	(Anatomy-3, Physiology-3, Pharmacology-3, Pathology-4, Microbiology-2, Forensic Medicine-1, PSM-4)

(c) The shortage of residents required at present stage i.e. 79 out of 85 (92.94%) is as under:-

Sr.Residents-22	(Medicine-4, Paediatrics-2, TB & Chest-1, Surgery-4, Orthopaedics-2, ENT-1, Ophthalmology-1, OBGY-1, Anaesthesia-3, Radio-3)
Jr.Residents-57	(Medicine-12, Paediatrics-6, TB & Chest-3, Dermatology-3, Psychiatry-3, Surgery-12, Orthopaedics-6, ENT-3, Ophthalmology-3, OBGY-6)

2. Clinical material is grossly inadequate as under:-

Clinical material available	Daily Average 1-2-09 to 31.7.09 (Data verified from the record)	Day of Inspection (Data as observed during inspection round on) 28.8.2009
O.P.D. attendance	150	141
Casualty attendance	52	07
Bed occupancy%	77%	23.20%
Admission/Discharge	-	9/10
Operative work		
Number of major surgical operations	12	06
Number of minor surgical operations	10	07
Number of normal deliveries	03	02
Number of caesarean sections	02	02
<u>Radiological Investigations</u>		
X-ray	25	22
Ultrasonography	18	10
Special Investigations	03	03
C.T. Scan	02	01
<u>Laboratory Investigations</u>		
Biochemistry	62	87
Microbiology	37	41
Serology	35	14
Parasitology	05	16
Haematology	105	115
Histopathology	02	01
Cytopathology	03	01
Others	-	-

3. At PHC, Mallapura, no lecturer cum medical officer having MD (PSM) is available. No students and interns are posted. No hostel facility and audiovisual aids are available. Administrative control from the Dean has been taken back by the State Govt.
4. Common rooms for Boys & Girls with seating arrangement and toilet facilities are not available.
5. Separate ICU & SICU are not available.
6. Seminar rooms are not available in any clinical department.
7. Hostel: Interns and Tutors are accommodated in the Boys hostel. Pharmacy girls are allotted room in the Girls hostel. Lady House Surgeons are also allotted rooms in the hostel. Nurses hostel is located 1 km. away from the campus.
8. Central Library: The college has not acquired Medlar facility. There are no separate toilet inside the library. There is water logging in the library increasing humidity and making it difficult to walk and study.
9. Central Sterilization department: There are no Glove inspection machines, instrument washing machine, ETO available. There are no racks, trays and mixers available.
10. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to issue a show cause notice to the authorities of Basaveswara Medical College and Hospital, Chitradurga, Karnataka as to why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree should not be withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit its compliance within a period of 1 month for rectification of the deficiencies of teaching faculty, clinical material and other deficiencies of infrastructure. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of the MCI representing the State where the college is located.

61. Discharge of 1st year students admitted at Mahatma Gandhi Medical College, Jaipur in the academic year 2008-09.

Read: The matter with regard to discharge of 1st year students admitted at Mahatma Gandhi Medical College, Jaipur in the academic year 2008-09.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Additional Principal, Mahatma Gandhi Medical College, Jaipur vide its letter dated 06.10.2008 had submitted the list of 150 students admitted at their college for the academic year 2008-09.

Perusal of the list revealed that the college had not provided the maximum marks of the RPMT Examination conducted by the State Govt. as well as RPMT marks obtained in respect of 4 students whose admission were shown by the Institute under Residual quota.

Accordingly the Principal of the college vide Council office letter dated 10.11.2008 was requested to provide the required information. As no information was received from the college, a reminder was issued to the college in this regard. Subsequently the Council office has received several complaints against the said college with regard to irregularities in the admission of students at the said college and accordingly the Council office vide its another letter dated 17.07.2009 had sought the information /clarification in the matter.

The Committee further noted that as the institute failed to provide the required inspection/clarification as sought by the Council office from time to time, the Principal, Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Hospital, Jaipur vide Council Office letter dated 06.08.2009 was requested to appear personally in the office of the Medical Council of India on 10.08.2009 along with all the relevant documents, such as, photo copy of the mark

sheet of RPMT – 2008, Caste Certificate, etc. In compliance to this office communication cited above, the Registrar-cum-OSD of the college appeared in the Council office on 10.08.2008 and submitted his explanation and relevant documents in respect of the aforesaid students.

The Committee further noted that on perusal of the documents as submitted by the college, it was noted by the Council office that the following 6 students do not fulfill the eligibility criteria as laid down in the Regulations 5(5) (ii) of Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 and the Council office vide its letter dated 13.08.2009 has issued a discharge notice to the college in respect of the following students.

Sl. No.	Name of the Students	Sub-Category: SC/ST/OBG/GEN/NRI/Others
1)	Mr. Ankit Mehra	SCB
2)	Mr. Anubhuti Bhardwaj	GNG
3)	Ms. Neha Saini	OBG
4)	Ms. Pinky	GNG
5)	Ms. Anju Choudhary	OBG
6)	Ms. Sabiha Naz	GNG

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to ratify the action taken by the Council Office in discharging the above mentioned six (06) students.

62. Discharge of 1st year MBBS student admitted at Index Medical College, Indore after 30.09.2008 in the academic year 2008-09.

Read: The matter with regard to discharge of 1st year MBBS student admitted at Index Medical College, Indore after 30.09.2008 in the academic year 2008-09.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Dean of Index Medical College, Indore vide its letter dated 12.11.2008 had submitted a list of 118 students admitted by them into 1st year of MBBS course upto 30.09.2008 and on scrutiny of the list, the Council office had taken the action as per the Regulations and for the remaining 32 vacant seats as on 01.10.2008 the Council office vide its letter dated 14.11.2008 had invited the attention of the college to the directives of the Hon'ble Supreme Court passed in W.P. © NO. 306/2004 – Mridul Dhar (Minor) & Anr. Vs. UOI & Ors. (2005) 2 SCC 65, dated 12.01.2005 and requested the college not to admit any further students in respect of 32 vacancies as the last date prescribed for admission being 30.09.2008 as prescribed in the Regulation is already over and in view of the directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in Mridul Dhar case, it is not permissible to admit any student beyond 30.09.2008.

Subsequently on 19.06.2009, the Council office had received a letter dated nil from the petitioners who were in W.P. No. 258 of 2009, 15058 of 2008, 103 of 2009 & 361 of 2009 alongwith a copy of the order dated 15.05.2009 passed by the Hon'ble court of Madhya Pradesh at Jabalpur.

Perusal of the copy of the order, it was observed by the Council office that the Hon'ble Court had pleased to pass the following order:-

“.....

Considering the fact that the ten petitioners actually continued their classes pursuant to the interim orders passed by this Court during the Academic year 2008-09 even after cancellation of their admissions and considering the fact that no students were admitted in their place mid stream in excess of the sanctioned intake capacity of the Index Medical College we allow this Writ Petition and direct that the admissions of the ten

petitioners will be treated as admissions for the academic session 2008-09 instead of 2009-2010.”

Accordingly, the Council office vide its letter dated 07.07.2009 had requested the Dean of the college to intimate how many students have been admitted into 1st year MBBS course at their medical college for the academic year 2008-09.

In compliance of the Council office letter cited above, the Dean vide its letter dated 14.07.2009 had intimated that 150 students have been admitted in the academic year 2008-09 at Index Medical College, Indore.

In reference to the aforesaid letter of the colleges, the Council office vide its letter dated 12.08.2009 had requested the Dean of the college to appear personally in the office of the Council on 18.08.2009 alongwith complete list of 150 students and supportive documents, if any.

The Committee further noted that in compliance to the letter of the Council, the college through its representative had submitted a list of 150 students alongwith the supportive documents on 18.08.2009 and on comparison of the list of the students as submitted by the college vide its letter dated 12.11.2008 and 18.08.2009, it was noted that the following students whose names are shown in the list submitted by the college vide its letter dated 12.08.2009 are not shown in the list submitted by the college on 13.11.2008 vide its letter dated 12.11.2008:-

S.No.	Name of Students	Category	Date of Admission
1	Esha Sharma	GEN	25/11/2008
2	Sunita Singh	GEN	25/11/2008
3	Utkarsh Shukla	GEN	25/11/2008
4	Devesh Pratap Singh Tomar	GEN	12/08/2008
5	Nayla Khan	OBC	25/11/2008
6	Neeraj Redhu	GEN	25/11/2008
7	Namita Chandra	GEN	25/11/2008
8	Abhishek Soni	GEN	25/11/2008
9	Shubhangi Jain	GEN	25/11/2008
10	Swarnima Upadhyay	GEN	12/05/2008
11	Ankita Tripathi	GEN	25/11/2008
12	Shubhang Jain	GEN	25/11/2008
13	Shinu Saluja	GEN	25/11/2008
14	Kanupriya Tiwari	GEN	25/11/2008
15	Sumit Pattaiya	OBC	12/05/2008
16	Ekta Rajauria	GEN	25/11/2008
17	Vineet Garg	GEN	25/11/2008
18	Trupti Soni	OBC	25/11/2008
19	Prabhakar Gupta	GEN	25/11/2008
20	Sandeep Panwar	OBC	12/05/2008
21	Sunil Malani	GEN	12/08/2008
22	Gaurav Rabhuvanshi	GEN	25/11/2008
23	Ankit Jain	GEN	12/05/2008
24	Pavan Kumar Gupta	GEN	25/11/2008
25	Heena Sheikh	OBC	25/11/2008
26	Abdul Hafeez	GEN	12/05/2008
27	Mohd. Kaiffee	GEN	12/05/2008
28	Kuldeep Yadav	OBC	25/11/2008
29	Udit Kumar Bhatt	GEN	12/05/2008
30	Shrishti Pandey	GEN	25/11/2008

31	Akanksha Bhale	GEN	12/05/2008
32	Jineet Soni	GEN	25/11/2008
33	Rajbeer Singh Tomar	GEN	25/11/2008
34	Devesh Kumar Vyas	GEN	12/08/2008
35	Anil Kanthali	OBC	25/11/2008
36	Nilesh Patidar	OBC	25/11/2008
37	Shashank Chauhan	GEN	25/11/2008
38	Prashant Choudhary	GEN	25/11/2008
39	Rajesh Kumar Sharma	GEN	25/11/2008
40	Khadija Mehdi	GEN	25/11/2008
41	Arun Pratap Singh	OBC	25/11/2008
42	Gaurav Tiwari	GEN	12/05/2008
43	Rahul Kulthiya	SC	25/11/2008
44	Garvita Singh	GEN	25/11/2008
45	Rajnish Kumar Jha	GEN	25/11/2008
46	Bijendra Singh Lodhi	OBC	25/11/2008
47	Irfan Ali	GEN	25/11/2008
48	Shipra Surin	NRI	30/09/2008

No copy of any order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court/High Court with regard to the counseling made by APDMCMP (DMAT)/MPPMT on 24.11.2008, 5.12.2008 and 07.12.2008 has been submitted by the college.

The Committee further noted that as the admission of the aforesaid students were against the directives of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in W.P. NO. 306/2004 – Mridul Dhar (Minor) & Anr. Vs. UOI & Ors. (2005) 2 SCC 65, dated 12.01.2005 and also Regulation 7.6(B) as prescribed in the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997, the Council office vide its letter dated 26.08.2009 had issued discharge notice to the college in respect of all 48 students with the request to discharge the said students immediately and submit the compliance.

Thereafter, the Dean, Index Medical College, Hospital & Research Centre, Indore had appeared personally in the office of the Council on 01.09.2009 and had also submitted a written submission. Along with these written submission, the Dean of the institute has submitted that the Counseling of the students was carried out in accordance with the Orders of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in W.P. (C) No. 520 of 2008 dated 17.11.2008 and dated 28.11.2008, reading as under:-

17.11.2008

“Students who had already got admission will be subject to the counseling at the instance of the petitioner. College to co-operate with petitioner and is also directed to submit list of all admitted students to the Officer on Special Duty for Admission & Fee Regulatory Committee under the Madhya Pradesh Niji Vyavasayik Shikshan Sanstha ((Pravesh Ka Viniyam Awam Shulk ka Nirdharan) Adhinyam, 2007 (M.P. Act), Dasti Service, in addition, is permitted.”

28.11.2008

“The Petitioner may go on with the counseling of the students and the admission procedure shall be completed on or before 8th December, 2008.”

The Committee further noted that the counseling was carried out at the instance of the Admission & Fee Regulatory Committee who was the petitioner in the Writ Petition before the Hon'ble Supreme Court as per the orders of Hon. Supreme Court and was attended by an observer appointed by the Admission & Fee Regulatory Committee, a

representative of Association of Private Dental and Medical Colleges of MP and the officials of the institute.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to ratify the action taken by the Council Office in revoking the discharge notice in respect of above mentioned 48 students.

63. Recommendations of the Academic Cell.

Read: The minutes of the Academic Cell Meeting held on 14th July, 2009.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

64. Recommendations of the meeting of the Convenors of the Regional Centers on Medical Education Technologies.

Read: The Recommendations of the meeting of the Convenors of the Regional Centers on Medical Education Technologies held on 11th June, 2009.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

65. Recommendations of the Expert Group to develop programmes for Advanced and Degree courses in Medical Education Technologies.

Read: The Recommendations of the Expert Group to develop programmes for Advanced and Degree courses in Medical Education Technologies held on 14th July, 2009.

The Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration to the next meeting.

66. Inspection of Maharajah's Institute of Medical Sciences, Nellimarla, Andhra Pradesh to verify the teaching faculty, residence, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (1st & 2nd September, 2009) to verify the teaching faculty, residents, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities available at Maharajah's Institute of Medical Sciences, Nellimarla, Andhra Pradesh.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (1st & 2nd September, 2009) and noted the following:-

1.(a) The shortage of teaching faculty is 45.45% (Shortage of 55 out of 121) as under :-

- | | | | |
|-------|---------------------|------|---|
| (i) | Professor | : 08 | (1Anatomy, 1 Physiology, 1 FMT, 1 Gen. Med., 1 ENT, 1 Ophthal., 1 Anaesthesia & 1 Radio-Diagnosis) |
| (ii) | Associate Professor | : 15 | (1 Physiology, 1 Biochem, 1 Patho, 1 FMT, 1 PSM, 3 Gen. Med., 1 Pead, 1 TB & Chest, 1 Skin & VD, 1 Psych., 1 Ortho, 1 Anaesthesia & 1 Dentistry) |
| (iii) | Assistant Professor | : 20 | (2 Anatomy, 1 Lect. (Bio), 1 Pharmacology, 1 Pharm. Chemist, 2 Pathology, 1 FMT, 1 Epidem-Lect., 1 Statistician, 1 RHTC, 1 UHC, 1 TB & Chest, 1 Gen. Surg., 1 Ortho, 1 ANMO, 1 MWO, 2 Anaesthe., & 1 Dentistry) |

(iv) Tutor : 12 (1 Physio, 1 Biochem, 2 Pharmacology, 5 Pathology, 1 FMT & 2 PSM)

(b) The shortage of Residents is 83.52% (Shortage of 71 out of 85) as under :-

- (i) Sr. Resident : 23 (3 Gen. Med., 1 Paed, 1 TB & Chest, 1 Sking & VD, 1 Psych, 4 Gen. Surg., 2 Ortho, 1 Ophthal, 2 OBG, 4 Anaesth., 3 Radio – Diagnosis)
- (ii) Jr. Resident : 48 (10 Gen. Med., 5 Pead., 3 TB & Chest, 3 Sking & VD, 3 Psych, 11 Gen. Surg., 5 Ortho., 3 ENT, 1 Ophthal., 4 OBG)

2. Clinical Material is inadequate as under:

	Daily Average	Day of Inspection
O.P.D. attendance	834	650
Bed Occupancy %	80%	60%
Number of normal deliveries	03	00
Number of caesarian Sections	01	01

3. Health Centres: In P.H.C.: No other Clinical departments participate in the outreach teaching programmes. Messing facilities is not available. No audiovisual aids have been provided and they are brought by the PSM department at the time of the visit.
4. In U.H.C₂: Duty roasters and records of various activities and investigations are not maintained.
5. Central sterilization department: ETO and Ultrasound instruments cleaning equipment are not available.
6. Incinerator: There is one incinerator, which is non-functional.
7. Radiological Facilities: No Image Intensifier is available.
8. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to issue a show cause notice to the authorities of Maharajah's Institute of Medical Sciences, Nellimarla, Andhra Pradesh as to why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree should not be withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit its compliance within a period of 1 month for rectification of the deficiencies of teaching faculty, clinical material and other deficiencies of infrastructure. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of the MCI representing the State where the college is located.

67. Inspection of Govt. Medical College, Kolhapur, Maharashtra to verify the teaching faculty, residence, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (1st & 2nd September, 2009) to verify the teaching faculty, residents, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities available at Govt. Medical College, Kolhapur, Maharashtra.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (1st & 2nd September, 2009) and noted the following :-

1. The shortage of teaching staff is as under:-
 - a Teaching Faculty is 23.14% (i.e. 28 Out of 121) as under:-
 - i Professor -7 (Biochem-1, Patho-1, ENT-1, TB-1, Ortho-1, Radio-1, Dentistry-1)
 - ii Associate Prof. 8 (Anatomy-1, Physio-1, Med-1, Ped-1, Derma-1, Psych-1, Ortho-1, Radio-1)
 - iii Assistant Professor -11 (Anatomy-1, Bio-Phys-1, Pharmac-1, MWO-1, Forensic-1, Stat-1, RHTC-1, UHTC-1, Derma-1, Psych-1, Radio-1)
 - iv Tutor -2 (Pharma-1, Patho-1)
 - b Shortage of Residents is 31.76 % (i.e. 27 of 85) as under:-
 - i Sr. Residents -18 (Med-4, Ped-2, Orhto-2, TB-1, Derma-1 , Radio-2, Surg-3, Anaesthesia-3)
 - ii Jr. Residents 9(Med-4, Psych-3, OBG-1, TB-1)
 - c Biochemistry Department: The Non Medical component of the Staff is 60% which is not as per norms.
2. One Lecture hall in the hospital is not available. Two Lecture hall in the Existing College are level type. Third Lecture hall in Existing campus is very small is size with capacity of 75-80. However this hall is full of junk benches and does not appear to be in use.
3. Auditorium: The Plastic Chairs are brought as and when required. No audio visual aids are available.
4. RHTC: No lecturer cum medical officer having M.D.{P.S.M.} is available; the senior faculty from the department is posted on rotation. Lecture hall cum seminar room is not available. No audiovisual aids have been provided and they are brought by the P.S.M. department at the time of the visit. No delivery is conducted
5. UHC: No lecturer cum medical office having M.D.{P.S.M.} is posted. Duty rosters and records of various activities and investigations are not maintained properly. Sign boards and display boards of various rooms also need to be realigned.
6. Registration and Medical Record Section: It is not computerized. Indoor registration counter is not computerised and not cross linked with outdoor registration numbers. There is no MRO. It is not computerised. The Medical Record section is in a disorganized state. It requires to be upgraded and strengthened in terms of Computerization , Required staff , Maintaining Medical Statistics , Preserving records in a proper fashion.
7. Operation theatre unit: Number of 7 Boyles Apparatus are not sufficient to run 15 OT at a Time. Number of defibrillators are less than required. Only One Ventilator is available , which is insufficient. Other equipments are required to be increased as per norms. Pre-operative and post-operative facilities are not adequate.
8. Central sterilization department: There is no bowl sterilizer, no Glove inspection machine and no instrument washing machine in CSSD.
9. Central laundry: no Hydro extractor, no rolley steam press and no pressing machine are available.
10. Anatomy Department : Number of Mounted Specimen are less .
11. Forensic Medicine Department: Observation gallery is not available. Facility for Toilets and Drinking Water for the relatives are not available. The sanitation condition of the area requires to be improved. No Lab. Available. No fire arms in Museum. No separate Library.
12. Community Medicine Department: The demonstration room is converted in to Medical Education Unit. At present the department does not have their own Demonstration room. One demonstration room of Nursing college was shown as demonstration room of the department.
13. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to issue a show cause notice to the authorities of Govt. Medical College, Kolhapur, Maharashtra as to why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree should not be withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit its compliance within a period of 1 month for rectification of the deficiencies of teaching faculty, clinical material and other deficiencies of infrastructure. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of the MCI representing the State where the college is located.

68. Inspection of Dr. Rajendra Prasad Govt. Medical College, Tanda, Himachal Pradesh to verify the teaching faculty, residence, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (7th & 8th September, 2009) to verify the teaching faculty, residents, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities available at Dr. Rajendra Prasad Govt. Medical College, Tanda, Himachal Pradesh.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (7th & 8th September, 2009) and noted the following :-

1.(a) The following faculty has not been counted for reason mentioned against each.

SN	Name	Department	Designation	Reason
1	Dr. Rupali Parlewer	Physiology	Assoc. Prof.	Does not possess the required 5 years teaching experience as Asst. Prof.
2	Ms Shalini Kalia	Biochemistry	Tutor	M.Sc. from science faculty.
3	Dr. Kamlesh Thakur	Microbiology	Professor	Does not possess the required 4 years teaching experience as Assoc.Prof.
4	Mrs. Savita Mahajan	Microbiology	Lecturer	M.Sc.(Zoology) from science faculty.
5	Ms Madhu Chauhan	Microbiology	Lecturer	M.Sc. from science faculty.
6	Ms Aditi Sharma	Microbiology	Tutor	M.Sc. from science faculty.
7	Dr.Sanjeev Chaudhary	Paediatrics	Professor	Does not possess the required 5 years teaching experience as Asst.Prof.
8	Dr. Ramesh Bharti	Gen.Surgery	Professor	Does not possess the required 4 years teaching experience as Assoc.Prof.
9	Dr. Sanjeev Kumar	Gen.Surgery	Professor	Does not possess the required 4 years teaching experience as Assoc.Prof.
10	Dr. Vipin Sharma	Orthopedics	Asstt Prof	Does not possess the prescribed academic qualification.

11	Dr. Suresh Verma	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Professor	Does not possess the required 4 years teaching experience as Assoc.Prof.
12	Dr. Sita Thakur	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Professor	Does not possess the required 5 years teaching experience as Asst.Prof.
13	Dr. R.S.Thakur	Anaesthesiology	Professor	Does not possess the required 4 years teaching experience as Assoc.Prof.
14	Dr. Yash Pal	Radiodiagnosis	Professor	Does not possess the required 4 years teaching experience as Assoc.Prof.

(b) In view of above, the shortage of teaching faculty is 25.28% (i.e. 22 out of 87) as under :-

- (i) Professor : 11 (Physiology -1, Biochemistry -1, Pathology -1, Microbiology -1, Forensic Medicine -1, Paediatrics -1, General Surgery -1, ENT -1, Obst. & Gynae. -1, Anaesthesia -1 & Radiology -1)
- (ii) Associate Professor : 05 (Anatomy -1, Physiology -1, Community Medicine -1, Psychiatry 01 & Dentistry -1)
- (iii) Assistant Professor : 06 (Anatomy -2, Pharma chemist -1, Epidemiology -1, Statistician -1 & Dentistry -1)
- (iv) Tutor : Nil

(c) The shortage of Residents is 18.9%(i.e. 14 out of 74) as under:-

- (i) Sr. Resident : 06 (TB & Chest -1, Psychiatry -1, Orthopaedics -1 & Anaesthesia -3)
- (ii) Jr. Resident : 08 (General Medicine -3, paediatrics -1, Skin & VD -2 & General Surgery -2)

2. Dr. Bhanu Awasthi, Medical Superintendent does not possess the required 10 years of administrative experience and hence is not eligible to hold the post.
3. Clinical material is inadequate in terms of bed occupancy which was 73.13% on the day of inspection.
4. Health Center:- At PHC, no Asstt. Prof having M.D.{P.S.M.} is available. Accommodation for boys and girls is not available. Mess facility is not available. Lecture hall cum seminar room is not available. No audiovisual aids have been provided.
5. At UHC, no lecturer cum medical office having M.D.{P.S.M.} is posted. Duty rosters and records of various activities and investigations are not maintained properly.
6. Incinerator is not available.
7. In the Central Library, college is not subscribing any journal since 2004. Medlar facility is not available.
8. The college does not have any established Medical Education Unit as per Council Regulations.
9. Animal House facility is grossly inadequate as under:-

Rats-Nil
Guinea pig-Nil
Rabbit-Nil
Mice-Nil
Large animals-Nil

10. Registration & Medical Record Section – It is not computerized. ICD X Classification of diseases is not being followed for indexing.
11. No emergency operation theatre is available next to the casualty.
12. In the Central sterilization department, there are no bowl sterilizer, Glove inspection machine or instrument washing machine.
13. In the department of Anatomy, there is no Embalming machine.
14. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to issue a show cause notice to the authorities of Dr. Rajendra Prasad Govt. Medical College, Tanda, Himachal Pradesh as to why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree should not be withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit its compliance within a period of 1 month for rectification of the deficiencies of teaching faculty and other deficiencies of infrastructure. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of the MCI representing the State where the college is located.

69. Inspection of Govt. Medical College, Latur, Maharashtra to verify the teaching faculty, residence, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (1st & 2nd September, 2009) to verify the teaching faculty, residents, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities available at Govt. Medical College, Latur, Maharashtra.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (1st & 2nd September, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The following faculty members/residents not counted while computing:-

Sr.No	Name	Designation	Department	Reasons
1.	Dr. V.W. Patil	Professor	Biochemistry	M.Sc. science faculty.
2.	Dr. S.R. Deshmukh	Assoc. Prof.	Microbiology	M.Sc. science faculty.
3.	Dr. P.N. Suryawanshi	Sr. Resident	General Medicine	Jr. Residency less than 3 year.
4.	Dr. Girish K Mainderkar	Assoc.Prof.	Paediatrics	Does not possess prescribed academic qualification.
5.	Dr. Ajay Keshwani	Assoc.Prof.	Paediatrics	Does not possess prescribed academic qualification.
6.	Dr. S.R. Gawali	Asst.Prof.	Orthopaedics	Does not possess prescribed academic qualification.
7.	Dr. Sudhakar Gulwe	Sr. Resident	Orthopaedics	Jr. Residency less than 3 year.
8.	Dr. R.V. Darde	Assoc.Prof.	Obst. & Gynae.	Does not possess prescribed academic qualification.
9.	Dr. Mahesh Kadam	Asst.Prof.	Radio	Does not possess

			Diagnosis	prescribed academic qualification.
10.	Dr. Sanjivni B Patil	Sr. Resident	Radio Diagnosis	Jr. Residency less than 3 year.
11.	Dr. Aprna Girwalkar	Asst.Prof.	Anaesthesia	Does not possess prescribed academic qualification.
12.	Dr. Walse Anil Kalba	Sr. Resident	Anaesthesia	Jr. Residency less than 3 year.
13.	Dr. Sachin Hulsure	Asst.Prof.	Dentistry	No certificate (original or photocopy) of BDS or MDS degree/ registration.

(b) In view of above, the shortage of teaching faculty is 16.5%(i.e. 20 out of 121) as under :-

- (i) Professor : 02 (Biochemistry -1, ENT -1)
(ii) Associate Professor : 09 (Anatomy -1, Physiology -1, Biochemistry -1, Microbiology -1, General Medicine -1, Paediatrics -1, TB & Chest -1, Skin & VD -1, Dentistry -1)
(iii) Assistant Professor : 07 (Anatomy -1, Forensic Medicine -1, General Medicine -1, Orthopaedics -1, ENT -1, Radio Diagnosis -1 & Dentistry -1)
(iv) Lect. Biophysics : 01
(vi) Pharma Chemist : 01

2. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to issue a show cause notice to the authorities of Govt. Medical College, Latur, Maharashtra as to why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree should not be withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit its compliance within a period of 1 month for rectification of the deficiencies of teaching faculty and other deficiencies of infrastructure. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of the MCI representing the State where the college is located.

70. Inspection of Shri Krishna Medical College, Muzaffarpur to verify the teaching faculty, residence, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (25th & 26th August, 2009) to verify the teaching faculty, residents, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities available at Shri Krishna Medical College, Muzaffarpur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (25th & 26th August, 2009) and noted the following :-

1(a) The following faculty/ have not been counted for reason mentioned against each:-

S.No.	Name	Designation	Department	Reason
1	Dr. Jiteshwar Pd. Mandal	Lect. Biophysics	Physiology	Does not possess the prescribed academic qualification.
2.	Dr. Bireshwar Prasad	Statistician	Community Medicine	Does not possess the prescribed academic qualification.

- (b) In view of above, the shortage of teaching faculty is 40.2%(i.e. 35 out of 87) as under:-
- | | | | |
|-------|---------------------|------|--|
| (i) | Professor | : 05 | (General Surgery -1, Orthopaedics -1, Ophthalmology -1, Obst. & Gynae. -1 & Anaesthesia -1) |
| (ii) | Associate Professor | : 08 | (Anatomy -1, General Medicine -2, Microbiology -1, TB & Chest -1, Anaesthesia -1, Radiology -1 & Dentistry -1) |
| (iii) | Assistant Professor | : 20 | (Anatomy -1, Biophysics -1, Biochemistry -1, Pharmacology -1, Community Medicine -3, Statistician -1, General Medicine -2, Paediatrics -2, Psychiatry -1, Orthopaedics -2, Ophthalmology -1, Obst. & Gynae. -1, Anaesthesia -1, Radio Diagnosis -1 & Dentistry -1) |
| (iv) | Tutor | : 02 | (Anatomy -1 & Biochemistry -1) |
- (c) The shortage of Residents is 56.7% (i.e. 42 out of 74) as under:-
- | | | | |
|------|--------------|------|---|
| (i) | Sr. Resident | : 07 | (TB & Chest -1, Dermatology -1, Psychiatry -1, Orthopaedics -1, Radio Diagnosis -2 & Dentistry -1) |
| (ii) | Jr. Resident | : 35 | (General Medicine -1, Paediatrics -3, TB & Chest -3, Dermatology -3, Psychiatry -3, General Surgery -8, Orthopaedics -5, ENT -3, Ophthalmology -1, Obst. & Gynae. -5) |
2. Health Centre: At PHC, no lecturer cum medical officer having M.D.{P.S.M.} is available. Hostel accommodation and mess facility is not available for interns. Lecture hall cum seminar room is not available. No audiovisual aids have been provided and they are brought by the P.S.M. department at the time of the visit. No beds have been provided. The labour room has no beds and no tables. Investigation facilities for basic investigation, X-ray & ECG are not available.
 3. At UHC, No lecturer cum medical officer having M.D.{P.S.M.} is posted. Delivery services are not available. Duty rosters and records of various activities and investigations are not maintained properly. Sign boards and display boards of various rooms also need to be realigned.
 4. Nurses hostel is a makeshift arrangement. New 100 room hostel for nurses is under construction. Residents are adjusted in intern hostels.
 5. In the Central library, college has no medlar facility.
 6. Animal House is grossly inadequate as under:-

Rats	Nil
Guinea pig	Nil
Rabbit	Nil
Mice	Nil
Large animals	Nil
 7. Workshop: The central workshop is not available in the College for maintenance and repair of furniture. The maintenance and the repairs are being done through the PWD.
 8. Registration and Medical Record Section: Medical record department is not computerised. ICD X Classification of diseases is not followed for indexing. Follow up service is available.
 9. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to issue a show cause notice to the authorities of Shri Krishna Medical College, Muzaffarpur as to why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree should not be withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC

Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit its compliance within a period of 1 month for rectification of the deficiencies of teaching faculty and other deficiencies of infrastructure. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of the MCI representing the State where the college is located.

71. Inspection of Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Bhagalpur to verify the teaching faculty, residence, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (28th & 29th August, 2009) to verify the teaching faculty, residents, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities available at Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Bhagalpur.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (28th & 29th August, 2009) and noted the following:-

1.(a) The following faculty members have not been counted for the reasons mentioned against each.

Sl. No.	Name	Designation	Department	Remark
1	Dr. Aloka Sharma	Assoc. Prof.	Anatomy	Does not have required teaching experience.
2	Dr. Himanshu Parmeshwar Dube	Assist. Prof.	Physiology	Appeared in MCI inspection on 4 th & 5 th Jun. 2009 at Govt. Medical College, Madhepura
3	Dr. Subhash Chandra Jha	Assist. Prof.	Physiology	Appeared in MCI inspection on 2 nd & 3 rd Jun 2009 at Govt. Medical College, Beettiah.
4	Dr. Ranjan Kr. Rajan	Assist. Prof.	Physiology	Appeared in MCI inspection on 2 nd & 3 rd Jun 2009 at Govt. Medical College, Beettiah.
5	Dr. Ashok Kr. Singh	Assoc. Prof.	Microbiology	Does not have required teaching experience as Assist. Prof. became Assoc. Prof. direct from tutor.
6	Dr. J. Prasad	Prof.	Pharmacology	Appeared in MCI inspection at VIMS, Pawapuri (Nalanda) on 2 nd & 3 rd Jun. 2009.
7	Dr. A. K. Jaiswal	Prof.	P. S. M.	Appeared in MCI inspection at VIMS, Pawapuri (Nalanda) on 2 nd & 3 rd Jun. 2009.
8	Dr. Amrendra Chaudhary	Assoc.Prof.	P.S.M.	Does not possess the requisite experience.
9	Dr. Uma Kant Pd. Singh	Prof.	Radiology	Appeared in MCI inspection on 2 nd & 3 rd Jun 2009 at Govt. Medical College, Beettiah.
10	Dr. Avilesh Kumar	Asst.Prof.	TB & Chest	Does not possess the prescribed academic qualification.

- (b) The following Senior Residents have not been counted for the reasons mentioned against each.

Sl. No.	Name	Designation	Department	Remark
1	Dr. Anil Kr.	Tutor	Anesthesia	Appointed not as Tutor.
2	Dr. Dilip Kr. Singh	Tutor	Anesthesia	Appointed not as Tutor.

- (c) In view of above, the shortage of teaching faculty is 37.9% (i.e. 33 out of 87) as under:-

- (i) Professor : 08 (Anatomy -1, Physiology -1, Paediatrics -1, General Surgery -1, Orthopaedics -1, Ophthalmology -1, Anaesthesia -1 & Radio Diagnosis -1)
- (ii) Associate Professor : 10 (Anatomy -1, Microbiology -1, Community Medicine -1, General Medicine -1, TB & Chest -1, General Surgery -1, Obst. & Gynae. -1, Anaesthesia -1, Radio Diagnosis -1 & Dentistry -1)
- (iii) Assistant Professor : 15 (Anatomy -1, Physiology -1, Lect. Biophysics -1, PharmChemist -1, Pathology -1, Community Medicine -3, TB & Chest -1, Orthopaedics -2, Obst. & Gynae. -3, Dentistry -1)

- (d) The shortage of Residents is 58.1% (i.e. 43 out 74) as under :-

- (i) Sr. Resident : 06 (General Medicine -1, Psychiatry -1, Anaesthesia -2, Radio Diagnosis -1 & Dentistry -1)
- (ii) Jr. Resident : 37 (General Medicine -7, Paediatrics -3, TB & Chest -3, Skin & VD -3, Psychiatry -1, General Surgery -10, Orthopaedics -4, Ophthalmology -2, ENT -3, Obst. & Gynae. -1)

2. Clinical material is inadequate in terms of x-ray & laboratory investigation as under:-

	Daily Average		28.08.09 Day of Inspection	
	O.P	I.P	O.P	I.P
<u>Radiological Investigations</u>				
X-ray	19		34	
Ultrasonography	13		18	
Special Investigation	0.5		0	
C.T. Scan	6.2		10	
<u>Laboratory Investigations</u>				
Biochemistry	31	13	45	41
Microbiology	-		-	-
Serology	4.1		10	8
Parasitology	-		-	-
Haematology	69	15	90	30
Histopathology	-		-	-
Cytopathology	-		-	-
Others	100		55	2

3. Health Center:- In PHC, no lecturer cum medical officer having M.D.{P.S.M.} is available. No audiovisual aids have been provided and they are brought by the P.S.M. department at the time of the visit. X-ray & ECG are not available. Staff as prescribed under norms needs to be appointed.
4. At UHC, no lecturer cum medical officer having M.D.(P.S.M.) is posted.
5. There are no residential quarters available within the campus.

6. Animal House is inadequate as under:-
 Rats Nil
 Rabbit Nil
 Mice Nil
7. The staff in the Central Library is inadequate as under:-
 Librarian Nil
 Deputy/Asstt. Librarian Nil
8. Workshop: The central workshop is not available. The maintenance and repair of furniture etc is being done by out side agency. The building is maintained by P.W.D.
9. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to issue a show cause notice to the authorities of Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Bhagalpur as to why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree should not be withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit its compliance within a period of 1 month for rectification of the deficiencies of teaching faculty, clinical material and other deficiencies of infrastructure. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of the MCI representing the State where the college is located.

72. Inspection of Sh. Bhausaheb Hire Govt. Medical College, Dhule, Maharashtra to verify the teaching faculty, residence, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities.

Read: The Council Inspectors report (7th & 8th September, 2009) to verify the teaching faculty, residents, clinical material, hostels and other infrastructural facilities available at Sh. Bhausaheb Hire Govt. Medical College, Dhule, Maharashtra.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (7th & 8th September, 2009) and noted the following :-

1(a) The shortage of teaching faculty is 24.13% (Shortage of 21 out of 87)

- i) Professor 4 (1 Medicine, 1 Ophthalmology, 1 Anaesthesia, 1 Radiodiagnosis)
 ii) Associate Prof.-3 (1 Paediatrics, 1 Psychiatry, 1 Orthopaedics)
 iii) Assistant Prof.-14 (2 Anatomy, 1 Lecturer Bio. 1 Pharm. Chemist, 1 Forensic Medicine, 2 P.S.M., 1 Medicine, 1 Paediatrics, 1 T.B. Chest, 2 Ob. & Gynae., 1 ANMO, 1 MWO)

(b) The shortage of Residents is 35.13% as under: - (26 out of 74)

- i) Sr. Resident -8 (1 T.B.Chest, 1 Dermatology, 2 Surgery, 1 ENT, 1 Ophthalmology, 1 Anaesthesiology, 1 Radiodiagnosis)
 ii) Jr. Resident-18 (4 Medicine, 3 Psychiatry, 4 Surgery, 3 Orthopaedics, 2 ENT, 1 Ophthalmology, 1 Dentistry)

2. Clinical material is inadequate as under:-

<u>Radiological Investigations</u>	O.P.	I.P.	O.P.	I.P.
X-ray	36	25	25	05
Ultrasonography	10	10	11	10
Special Investigations	02	01	01	02
C.T. Scan	02	06	02	05

3. Space available for OPD is grossly inadequate. Registration counters are located in a small independent building. Waiting area is not available near these counters. Each speciality is provided with small 1 or 2 rooms for examination of patients and accommodation for the doctors. There is no teaching area in outpatient department. A common OPD teaching area is available on 1st floor of the hospital. Teaching facilities like patient couch, stools, x-ray, view box, examination tray are not provided in each room. There is no minor OT in OPD's.
4. Health Center: At PHC, messing facilities are not available. LMO is not available.
5. At UHC, no indoor beds have been provided. Delivery services are not available. No minor O.T. is available.
6. Operation Theatre: Central oxygen, suction and nitrous oxide supply are not available. The following equipments are not available in the OT Block:-
Respiratory Gas Monitor
Infusion Pump
Drip Infusion pump
7. Canteen is not available.
8. Hostel: There are no earmarked rooms for interns/residents. There is no warden room, visitor room, recreation room and mess. The food is supplied through "dabba system". This hostel is in the civil hospital campus.
9. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to issue a show cause notice to the authorities of Sh. Bhausahab Hire Govt. Medical College, Dhule, Maharashtra as to why the recognition for the award of MBBS degree should not be withdrawn u/s 19 of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the institute be asked to submit its compliance within a period of 1 month for rectification of the deficiencies of teaching faculty, clinical material and other deficiencies of infrastructure. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of the MCI representing the State where the college is located.

73. Invitation to attend the International conference on basis "Recent Trends and Future Perspectives Towards The Protection of Health" at First World Hotel, Genting Highlands, Malaysia – Reg.

Read: The matter with regard to Attending of International conference on basis "Recent Trends and Future Perspectives Towards The Protection of Health" at First World Hotel, Genting Highlands, Malaysia – Reg.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Council has received an email dated 26.08.2009 from School of Therapeutic Sciences, Masterskill University College of Health Sciences, (MUCH), Malaysia informing therein that Masterskill University College of Health Sciences, (MUCH), Malaysia is going to organize an International Conference on "Recent Trends and Future Perspectives Towards The Protection of Health" at Malaysia from 6th to 8th November, 2009. The Council has been invited to participate in the said conference which is an avenue for the National community to exchange ideas and develop a common vision for the future of the global healthcare.

After due deliberations, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to nominate Dr. Muzaffar Ahmad, Member Executive Committee, MCI and Director, Health Services, Govt. of Jammu & Kashmir, Srinagar (J&K) to attend the International Conference on "Recent Trends and Future Perspectives Towards The Protection of Health" at First World Hotel, Genting Highlands, Malaysia from 6th to 8th November, 2009 on behalf of the Council.

74. Request for change of affiliating university of Teerthanker Mahaveer Medical College & Research Centre, Moradabad, U.P.

Read: The matter with regard to request for change of affiliating university of Teerthanker Mahaveer Medical College & Research Centre, Moradabad, U.P.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the letter dated 7.8.2009 received from Shri Suresh Jain, Chairman, Teerthanker Mahaveer Medical College & Research Center reading as under:-

“We have the honor to submit that Teerthanker Mahaveer Medical College & Research Centre, Moradabad become functional from session 2008-09 affiliated with MJP Rohilkhand University Bareilly, Medical College has been established by Teerthanker Mahaveer Institute of Management & Technology, Society, Moradabad.

Teerthanker Mahaveer Institute of Management & Technology, Society, Moradabad established Teerthanker Mahaveer University at Moradabad duly enacted by U.P. State Legislation vide no. 30 of year 2008.

Since the University and Medical College has been established by the same Society in the same campus hence now Medical College is an incampus college of the University and the Medical College has become a constituent self affiliated college of Teerthanker Mahaveer University, Moradabad.

Teerthanker Mahaveer University vide its letter no. TMU/V.C./08-09/TMMCRC/08 dated 23.10.2008 had already intimated your good office regarding the functionality of University from session 2008-09 (copy attached). University also submitted the list of first year MBBS students admitted in Teerthanker Mahaveer Medical College through the University.

Since, in the website of the Medical Council of India, New Delhi MJP Rohilkhand University, Bareilly is being shown as the affiliating University of Teerthanker Mahaveer Medical College & Research Centre, Moradabad you are requested to please replace Teerthanker Mahaveer University, Moradabad as affiliating University of Teerthanker Mahaveer Medical College & Research Centre, Moradabad in place of MJP Rohilkhand University, Bareilly and obliged.”

After due deliberations, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to approve the request of the institute to change the affiliation of the institute from MJP Rohilkhand University, Bareilly to be a constituent unit of Teerthanker Mahaveer University, Moradabad.

75. W.P. No. 9274/2005 – P. Ilamparithi Vs UOI & Ors in the High Court of Judicature at Madras – Admission of P. Ilamparithi at P.S.G. Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Coimbatore in the Academic Year 2002-2003.

Read: The matter with regard to W.P. No. 9274/2005 – P. Ilamparithi Vs UOI & Ors in the High Court of Judicature at Madras – Admission of P. Ilamparithi at P.S.G. Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Coimbatore in the Academic Year 2002-2003.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that at its meeting held on 9.7.2009, the Committee decided as under:-

“The Executive Committee of the Council observed that Ms. P. Ilamparithi was admitted at P.S.G. Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Coimbatore in the Academic Year 2002-03 in excess of its annual intake by creating one additional seat as per directions of the Hon’ble High Court in W.P. No. 31954 of 2002 dated 22.10.2002.

It was further observed that on perusal of the documents submitted by the institute vide its letter dated 23.06.2009, it is noted by the Council as under:-

“The said college sent the letter dated 19.11.2002 to the Council to grant one (1) additional seat in MBBS course and accordingly the Council communicated to the said institute that no medical college has permitted to increase its admission capacity in any course of study of training except with the previous permission of the Central Government and hence advised them to approach the first respondent. The Ministry of Health & Family

Welfare vide its letter dated 07.02.2003 requested the Council to grant approval for creation of additional seat in MBBS course for the academic year 2002-03 in the said institute.

Thereafter, vide letter dated 11.11.2003, requested the University to confirm the Provisional Registration and permit her to write the Ist year MBBS examination during February 2004.

In the meantime, the petitioner filed the Contempt Petition No. 1088/2003 and the Hon'ble Court vide its order dated 24.04.2003 and 23.01.2004 allowed the petitioner to write the examination without prejudice to the contempt of the parties. Since the approval for additional seat was getting delayed, the petitioner once again filed writ petition bearing no. 3741/2003 before the Hon'ble High Court seeking approval of one (1) additional seat as per the order passed by the Hon'ble High Court in W.P. No. 31954/2004 and the Hon'ble Court vide its order dated 16.03.2004 directed MCI to pass the order in terms of Section -10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, within a period of 8 weeks from the date of passing order and send a report to the first respondent, who in turn shall pass orders on merits and in accordance with law, within four weeks thereafter. The Medical Council of India in its proceedings dated 12.06.2004, has stated that a prior permission from the Central Government on the recommendation of the Medical Council of India towards satisfaction for proportionate increase in the minimum infrastructure, teaching and other facilities, is a must and without providing the same, no college is entitled for seeking permission for admission in any additional student over and above its annual intake capacity and if any such admission is made, it is not valid. Therefore, the third respondent has indicated that it is not permissible for them to increase annual intake capacity of any medical college without proportionate increase and minimum infrastructure and facilities required as per the regulations without prior approval of the Central Government under section 10-A of the Indian Medical Council Act.

The petitioner once again filed writ petition bearing no. 21970/2007 being aggrieved by the action of the respondent no. 1 & 3 i.e. Union of India & Medical Council of India after completing her academic course of MBBS and after considering the reply of the Council. The Hon'ble Court was pleased to pass the following order:-

“.....

62. It is not denied that the 5th respondent institution is one of the premier private medical colleges in this country and that it is having all necessary infrastructure to accommodate one more student in the form of the petitioner. The submission made by the learned standing counsel appearing for the 5th respondent that it has already applied for additional intake of 50 students at an earlier point of time, has also been taken into account by this court.

63. In view of the peculiar circumstances of the case and that the petitioner is not at all at fault, and she had also successfully completed the MBBS academics by virtue of the various orders passed by this court in writ petitions, she cannot be denied the fruits of hard labour and sincerity put in by her. The interest of justice also requires that the relief to be granted in favour of the petitioner. Hence the following order is passed:

- (a) The respondents 1 and 3 in W.P. No. 9274 of 2005, in the light of the recommendations made by the second respondent in letter No. 55757/MCA2/2002/2007 Health, dated 18.05.2004 and the letter No. 55757/MCA2/2002/2007 Health dated 29.10.2004 and the orders dated 22.10.2002 in W.P. No. 31954 of 2002 are requested to once again consider the request of the 5th respondent for creation of one additional seat for the academic year 2002-2003 in MBBS course pertaining to the petitioner and pass appropriate orders after affording reasonable opportunity to the 5th respondent within a period of four weeks from the date of receipt of copy of this order.*
- (b) The respondents 4 and 5 in W.P. No. 9274 of 2005/ respondents 1 and 2 in W.P. No. 29170/07 are directed to publish the result of fourth MBBS examination held during 2007 with registration NO. 52024325 of the petitioner and issue mark sheets for 1st, 2nd and 4th year MBBS course to the petitioner within a period of two weeks from the date of receipt of copy of this order.”*

In view of above, the matter was placed before the Retainer/Advocate of the Council for his opinion in the matter. On 08.07.2009, the Retainer has given its opinion on this issue of which the operative part is being reproduced as under:-

“.....

It is not disputed that the candidate has successfully completed her MBBS course in view of the various orders passed by the Hon'ble High Court in the above mentioned case and the earlier orders passed by the Hon'ble Court in the year 2003-04 were not challenged by any of the respondents including MCI, therefore, in my opinion, the present case of the candidate shall be considered by the Council regularizing her admission in view of the various orders passed by the Hon'ble High Court and the same shall not be treated as an precedent in other cases. The Council shall also communicate to the said institute its decision regarding reduction of one (1) seat for the current academic session by admitting 149 students against the intake of 150 students due to the undue advantage taken by the said college/institute in the present case by allowing the admission of the aforesaid candidate in the MBBS course.”

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to obtain the legal opinion of the Additional Solicitor General of India in the matter.”

It was further observed that the opinion of the learned Additional Solicitor has been received in the office of the Council, the operative part of which reads as under:-

“.....

The Hon'ble Supreme Court in its 2009 judgment in Guru Nanak Dev University case held that after four years if the candidate is not entitled to admission, four years of his career would be irretrievably lost and it would be unfair unless the student is given the benefit of admission. The judgment of the High Court was affirmed, keeping in view the peculiar facts and circumstances of the case. The Delhi High Court also had an occasion to consider the case of a medical student, who represented that he had passed his 12th standard from Delhi. His admission was sought to be cancelled on the ground that his declaration that he had passed his 11th & 12th classes from Delhi, is false. By that time, the student had already completed four years of his MBBS course and the Hon'ble Court held that ruining the career of the student would benefit none and he was allowed to complete his course.

From the foregoing, it is clear that the student has completed successfully her course of study, passed the final examination and has been granted provisional registration for the compulsory internship. The sorry state is that the student has to seek intervention of the court at regular intervals for accession to the next session and taking her examinations. The Hon'ble Court considered the case from all angles, the peculiar situation and circumstances, and after hearing both the parties has directed admission by way of creating an additional seat, just for a particular candidate for a particular year. After everything has ended well, directing the proboscis for unwanted procedural lapses or implications, or expired compliances, would serve no purpose.”

After due and detailed deliberations, the Executive Committee of the Council accepted the opinion of the Learned Additional Solicitor General and further decided that in view of the peculiar facts and circumstances of the case, P.S.G. Institute of Medical Sciences & Research, Coimbatore may be allowed to create an additional seat for the academic year 2002-2003 in view of the order of the Hon'ble High Court at Madras dated 12.03.2002.

76. Discharge of 1st Year MBBS Students who were admitted at Amala Institute of Medical Sciences, Thrissur in the Academic Year 2007-2008 and found not eligible in terms of Regulation 5 (5) (2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 – Consideration of.

Read: The matter with regard to the 1st Year MBBS Students who were admitted at Amala Institute of Medical Sciences, Thrissur in the Academic Year 2007-2008 and discharged by the Council office in terms of Regulation 5 (5) (2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Council vide its letter dated 03.07.2008 had issued a discharge notice in respect of the following 15 (fifteen) students of Amala Institute of Medical Sciences, Thrissur who were found not eligible in terms of Regulation 5 (5) (2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997:-

S.No.	Name of candidate	Category	Sub-category	Marks in PMT
1	Linu Baby	Management	Xian Commu.	126
2	Merlin Verghese	Management	Xian Commu.	132
3	Anitha Francis	Management	Xian Commu.	141
4	Mahima Antony	Management	Xian Commu.	135
5	Nithya Ann Jacob	Management	Xian Commu.	138
6	Anjana Jose	Management	Xian Commu.	126
7	Allwin James Kunnamkumarath	Management	Xian Commu.	141
8	Ajay Babu	Management	Catho Comm.	132
9	Anita Sebastian	Management	Catho Comm.	144
10	Ann Maria Sunny	Management	Catho Comm.	132
11	Rose Mary Joseph	Management	Catho. Comm.	132
12	Sherin P.J.	Management	Catho. Comm.	147
13	Sweety Joy E.	Management	Catho. Comm.	132
14	Lesly Sebastian	Management	Catho. Comm.	141
15	Ansu Elizabeth Alex	Management	Xian . Comm.	141

In reference to the Council office letter cited above, a Writ Petition was filed by the concerned students in the High Court of Kerala at Ernakulum against the discharge Order dated 03.07.2008 and the Hon'ble High Court vide its Order dated 08.07.2009 in W.P. (C) No. 15671 of 2009(D) have passed an Order whereof the operative part reads as under:-

“

14. Accordingly, there will be a direction to the Medical Council of India to treat Exhibits P5 and P11 in relation to the petitioners as show cause notices. Petitioners shall be heard in person or through an authorized representative by the Secretary will be treated as a hearing by the Medical Council of India itself. The hearing notes prepared by the Secretary shall be conveyed to the Executive Committee which will not be required to independently to hear the petitioners. A representative of the Management shall also be heard by the Secretary and any requisition by the Secretary to produce the details regarding the marks obtained by the petitioners, in the competitive entrance test, shall be complied with by the Management. The Secretary of the Medical Council of India shall issue a notice to the University and if the University so desires, a representative of the University shall also be heard. It is also open to the University to communicate their version to the Secretary of the M.C.I. The Secretary shall conduct a hearing within four weeks from the date of receipt of a copy of this judgment and a final decision shall be taken by the Executive Committee within four weeks from the date of conclusion of the hearing. It is

open to the petitioners to submit a detailed representation before the Medical Council of India detailing their arguments.

In compliance to the aforesaid directives of the Hon'ble Court, the Secretary, MCI vide letter dated 28.08.2009 had requested the Principal, Amala Institute of Medical Sciences, Thrissur, Registrar, University of Calicut, Calicut and all the petitioners, to submit their written submission and supportive documents on 08.09.2009 before the Competent Authority of the Council in person or through their representative.

In compliance to the aforesaid communication cited above, Fr. Francis Kurissery, Joint Director and Mr. K. P. Francis, Liaison Officer of Amala Institute of Medical Sciences, Thrissur appeared before the Secretary, MCI and submitted the written submission and supportive documents made on behalf of the institute which reads as under:

“All the Private Self Financing Medical Colleges in Kerala were under a common umbrella called the Kerala Private Medical College Management association (KPMCMA).

It was this Association, which was in charge of the conduct of the Entrance Test up to 2007-08.

After the test in 2007, there was a difference of opinion among the Managements on some serious policy issues relating to admissions, and thereafter 4 Medical Colleges (Amala Institute Sciences, Jubilee Mission Medical College and Research Institute, Malankara Orthodox Syrain Church Medical College and Pushpagiri Institute of Medical Sciences and Research (Centre) and 10 Engineering Colleges formed an Association called the Kerala Christian Professional College Management Federation, hereinafter called the Federation.

All other Medical Colleges, including the new Medical Colleges established after 2007, still continue with the original K.P. M.C.M.A and all the documents relating to admissions in the colleges till the new Federation was formed are with the former Association and we have no access to the same.

We therefore submit the following explanation, with information available with us.

The Kerala Private Medical College management Association published a Common prospectus and invited applications for admissions for MBBS, in 2007, for all the colleges which were then under the Association. A copy of the prospectus is enclosed herewith.

As per the Prospectus, “Admission will be on the basis of marks obtained in the entrance examination and marks obtained for Physics, Chemistry and Biology in the qualifying examination. The Marks will be apportioned in the ratio of 50:50 after the entrance test, the marks obtained for the Physics, Chemistry and Biology at the qualifying examination will be added to the marks obtained at the entrance test and a combined merit list will be published. Separate merit list also will be published for categories for which seats are reserved. Allotment to colleges and admission will be on the basis of centralized counseling.

Altogether, around 3700 candidates had applied.

In Kerala, we have an Admission Supervisory Committee, constituted under our State Law, as Act 19/06. one of the retired judges of the Hon'ble High Court, viz: Hon'ble justice P.A. Mohammed is the Chairman, and the Principal Secretary Higher Education, government of Kerala and the Commissioner fro Entrance Exams, Government of Kerala are members.

The entire process of admission like conducting the entrance test (PMT), etc. was taken over by the committee, including setting of question paper and printing the same, appointing examiners and values, till the final publication of the results.

Initially the test was fixed on 21/06/2007. The “left” sponsored Youth and student factions physically attacked and disrupted the test venue and therefore the test could not be conducted, that day.

The Association moved the Hon'ble Supreme Court and the Supreme Court ordered police protection for conducting the test and for the purpose of security ordered the test to be conducted in the Kendriya Vidyalaya in the Naval Base Cochin.

This time the test was conducted on 07/08/2007. But owing to the earlier incident, the number of participants was very much less.

The Admission Supervisory Committee, after valuation handed over the results to the Federation. The Federation, then added the marks of the qualifying exam to the marks obtained by candidates in the written test, prepared a rank list accordingly and resubmitted the same to the admission Supervisory Committee.

From this rank list allotments were made strictly in the order of merit.

In this process, candidates who had very high marks in the qualifying exams, scored much higher position in the rank list than those who got good marks in the written test, since the marks in the qualifying examination and entrance test were apportioned in the ratio of 50: 50. the marks scored by individual candidates in the written test were not communicated to individual colleges, at that time.

Copies of the mark lists of all candidates from our college, who are now found ineligible by the MCI, are enclosed herewith. All of them are really brilliant and meritorious students, who did really well in their qualifying exams.

Late, when the essential details had to be furnished to the MCI, since all particulars were necessary, we asked the KPMCMA for details and the same was furnished them. It was this data that we have furnished to the MCI.

The marks obtained at the test was never communicated to the students either by the Association or by the colleges.

We were also under a genuine bonafide impression that while calculating the 50% marks as eligibility fixed by the MCI Regulations, it was sufficient that candidates need have only 50% of the combined total –ie: of the PMT as well as the qualifying exams. This was a consequence of a misunderstanding of the MCI norms.

We are enclosing the relevant documents and the list of 15 students. We have already made two representations to the MCI, copies of which are enclosed (Encl. 4)

In these circumstances, we humbly request the MCI to ratify the admissions given to the 15 students mentioned in your notice, in the academic year 2007-08.

The management is willing to surrender equal member of seats (15) to the government in the next year's admission (2010) and to teach them at the fee fixed by the government.”

Further, the candidates also appeared before the Secretary and submitted their written submission and supportive documents in person or through their representative.

Perusal of the submission made by the respective petitioners/students, it is noted by the Council office that none of the candidate belongs to the Reserved Category and not secured more than 50 % marks in the entrance conducted by Kerala Private Medical College Management Association (KPMCMA).

The Committee further noted that neither the Registrar of University of Calicut, Calicut nor their representative appeared before the Secretary, MCI on 08.09.2009 in the matter.

In this context, it is further stated that the Council office has received a letter dated 09.09.2009 from the Principal, of Amala Institute of Medical Sciences, Thrissur whereof the operative part reads as under:-

“.....

We understand that in a similar case, the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India has permitted the students to continue the MBBS Course, on condition that equal number of seats be reduced from the management quota in the subsequent admission.

We quote the order from the said judgment: (Vide: Hon'ble Supreme Court of India: Civil Appellate Jurisdiction 219828 of 2008, Civil Appeal No. 5518-5519 of 2008, SLP Civil No. 17990-17991 of

2008. *Monika Ranka & Ors (Appellants) V/s MCI and Ors (Respondents) with Civil Appeals 5520-5521/2008 O SLP (C) Nos. 17995-17996 of 2008).*

“In the Regulations published it was stated that the candidates should have secured more than 50 % marks in the entrance examination. There is nothing on record to show that these appellants were informed of the marks secured by them in the entrance examination. As these appellants have already completed one year of their course, equities are in favour of the appellants. But, however, we maintain the judgment of the High Court, as regards, the principle laid down, but we direct that these appellants may be allowed to continue their MBBS Course as a special case and their results of the 1st Year MBBS Course may also be declared so that they may continue with their studies.

The management of the R.D. Gardi Medical College was not justified in giving admission to these students. Certainly, they must be aware of the fact that the candidates should have secured at least 50 % marks in the entrance examination but the learned senior counsel appearing for the college says that they were not aware of the marks secured by these candidates as the entrance examination was held by a different association as the marks were not furnished to them by the association. However, as the admission is found to be irregular, equal number of students shall be reduced from the management quota for the year 2009-2010.”

The Hon’ble High Court of Delhi (Vide: W.P. (C) No. 3109/08 dated 21.01.2009) also has passed an order in the light of the Supreme Court Judgement, allowing the MBBS Students of Maharashtra to continue their studies since they were found victims of circumstances.

In this context, we declare that Amala Institute of Medical Sciences is willing to surrender equal number of seats of management quota to the All India quota in the admission for 2010-2011, so that students from all over India can benefit from that”

It was further observed that none of the above mentioned 15 students had secured the minimum %age of marks i.e. 50% for open category and 40% for reserved category at the entrance test examination conducted by Kerala Private Medical College Management Association (KPMCMA).

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council after due and detailed deliberations observed that as the above mentioned students whose names are listed in the aforesaid writ petition and to whom discharge notices have been issued, are not eligible in terms of Regulation 5(5)(2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 as they have secured less than the required percentage of marks in the entrance examination conducted by KPMCMA and decided to reiterate the decision of the Council dated 3.7.2008 to issue discharge notice in respect of the above mentioned students of Amla Institute of Medical Sciences, Thrissur.

77. Discharge of 1st Year MBBS Students who were admitted at Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church Medical College, Kolencherry in the Academic Year 2007-2008 and found not eligible in terms of Regulation 5 (5) (2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 – Consideration of.

Read: The matter with regard to the 1st Year MBBS Students who were admitted at Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church Medical College, Kolencherry in the Academic Year 2007-2008 and discharged by the Council office in terms of Regulation 5 (5) (2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that Council vide its letter dated 17.06.2008 had issued a discharge notice in respect of following 8 (Eight) students of Malanakara Orthodox Syrian Church Medical College, Kolencherry who were found not eligible in terms of Regulation 5 (5) (2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997:-

Sl. No.	Name of the student	Category	Sub-category	Marks (Out of 300)
1	Deepthi Mary Sobha	Management	Orthodox Syrian Christian	141
2.	Karun Thomas	Management	Orthodox Syrian Christian	126
3.	Santosh Phillip Mathew	Management	Orthodox Syrian Christian	147
4.	Sonia M	Management	Christian Community	141
5.	Blessy Abraham	Management	Christian Community	135
6.	Remya Alice Jacob	Management	Christian Community	132
7.	Dipin, J.P.	Management	Christian Community	111
8.	Anjana Babu	Management	S.C.	111

In reference to the Council office letter cited above, a Writ Petition was filed by the concerned students in the High Court of Kerala at Ernakulum against the discharge Order dated 17.06.2008 and the Hon'ble High Court vide its Order dated 08.07.2009 in W.P. (C) No. 18234 of 2009(Y) passed an Order whereof the operative part reads as under:-

“.....

10. In these circumstances, the writ petitions are disposed of with the following directions:

- (a) The decision taken by the Medical Council of India, impugned in each one of these writ petitions, shall be treated, provisionally, as a show cause notice. The petitioners shall file their objection to the same within six weeks from today.
- (b) The Secretary of the Medical Council of India shall hear the petitioners or their authorized representative and the hearing notes of the Secretary shall be forwarded to the Committee of the Medical Council of India.
- (c) The Executive Committee shall take a decision within four weeks from the date on which the hearing is conducted.
- (d) The Secretary of the Medical Council of India shall issue notice of hearing to the University as also to the management and permit the University or the Management, either to appear or submit their version, before the Secretary of the Medical Council of India.
- (e) The petitioners and the management shall contemporaneously forward copies of their representations or versions, as the case may be, to the University, simultaneous to them being dispatched to the Secretary of the Medical Council of India
- (f) It is open to the Medical Council of India to verify the correctness of the details given by the petitioners, as regards the marks claimed to have been obtained by the petitioners in the competitive Entrance Examination of Kerala Self-Financing Private Management association in the year 2007.
- (g) The Medical Council of India shall advert to the other contentions, if any, raised by the petitioners.”

In compliance to the aforesaid directives of the Hon'ble Court, the Council vide letter dated 28.08.2009 had requested the Principal, Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church Medical College, Kolencherry, Registrar, Mahatma Gandhi University College, Kottayam and all the petitioners, to appear before the Secretary, MCI on 11.09.2009 for personal hearing and submit written submission and supportive documents to the Council in person or through their representative.

In compliance to the aforesaid communication cited above, Sh. Joy P. Jacob, Secretary of Malankara Orthodox Medical College, Kolencherry appeared before the Secretary, MCI on behalf of the institute for personal hearing and submitted the written submission and supportive documents. The submission made by the institute reads as under:-

“We wish to bring to your kind attention the chronological events that led to the MBBS admissions for the academic year 2007-08. A common prospectus was published by the Kerala Private Medical College Management Association and the said Association invited applications for admission for 2007-08 in all 9 Private Self Financing Medical College in Kerala. Our institution was also a member of the Association. As per the Prospectus, the merit of the candidates was to be decided on the basis of the marks obtained in the common entrance examination and the marks obtained in Physics, Chemistry and Biology in the qualifying examination, apportioned in the ratio of 50 :50. The said association was in charge of the conduct of the common entrance examination. Responding to the advertisement released in the newspaper, 3700 candidates applied for admission.

In the State of Kerala, we have an Admission Supervisory Committee constituted under our State Law, as Act, 19 of 2006. Hon’ble Mr. Justice P.A. Mohammed, a retired Judge of the High Court of Kerala is the Chairman of the Committee. The Principal Secretary, Higher Education Department and Commissioner for Entrance Examinations, Govt, of Kerala are its members. The entire process of conduct of common entrance examination for admission to the self financing colleges, including setting of question paper, printing of the same, appointment of invigilators and evaluators, till the final publication of the results, was taken over by the said Committee.

The test was initially fixed on 21-06-2007. However, the conduct of the test was disrupted by the violent activities resorted by the leftist student’s organizations at the test venue. Consequently, the association moved the Hon’ble court of India and as per orders of the Hon’ble Court the test was conducted on 07-08-2007 under Police protection in the Kendriya Vidyalaya inside Cochin Naval Base. But because of the unruly incident that took place earlier, the number of candidates who took the test was only about 1700.

The Admission Supervisory Committee supervised the conduct of the test and after evaluation of the answer scripts, forwarded the results to the association added the marks of the qualifying examination to the marks secured in the entrance test and based on that prepared a rank list. This rank list was submitted to the admission Supervisory Committee.

Subsequently, admissions were made for the year 2007-08 strictly in the order of merit as per the rank list.

It may please be noted that the marks obtained by the candidates in the Entrance Examination were not communicated by the association to the candidates or to the college authorities. The college was under the belief that the admissions made were faultless since the rank list published by the association was verified by the admission supervisory committee. Later, it was only when the MCI directed us to submit the marks obtained by the candidates in the entrance examination also, we obtained the same from the association. We submitted the same to the MCI. At that time we were under the genuine bonafide trust that the 50% marks prescribed as the eligibility criteria was the combined total of the qualifying examination marks and the entrance examination marks.

In this connection, we wish to submit that all the 8 candidates in question had secured 86.7 to 95.3 percent marks in their qualifying examinations. Copies of their qualifying examination marks lists are enclosed herewith.

It may also be noted that all the 8 students passed the 1st Professional examination conducted by the Mahatma Gandhi University in October 2008 with more than 60% marks, 6 of them in first class. Copies of their 1st MBBS examination marks lists are also enclosed for your kind perusal.

Under the above circumstances, we pray that the council may kindly consider the above facts and humbly plead that the admission of the 8 candidates may be ratified on humanitarian grounds.

We further wish to reiterate that in all subsequent admissions made, we have strictly enforced 50% marks in the entrance examination and in the qualifying examinations separately.”

In this regard, it is further stated that the Secretary of Malanakara Orthodox Syrian Church Medical College, Kolencherry vide its letter dated 11.09.2009 has further submitted that they are ready and willing to surrender equivalent No. of seats in the next academic year 2010-11 for utilization at thought fit by the Council .

Further, the candidates also appeared before the Secretary and submitted their written submission and supportive documents in person or through their representative.

The Committee further noted that neither the Registrar, Mahatma Gandhi University, Kottayam nor their representative appeared before the Secretary, MCI on 11.09.2009 in the matter.

It was further observed that none of the above mentioned 08 students had secured the minimum %age of marks i.e. 50% for open category and 40% for reserved category at the entrance test examination conducted by Kerala Private Medical College Management Association (KPMCMA).

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council after due and detailed deliberations observed that as the above mentioned students whose names are listed in the aforesaid writ petition and to whom discharge notices have been issued, are not eligible in terms of Regulation 5(5)(2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 as they have secured more than 50% marks in the entrance examination conducted by KPMCMA and decided to reiterate the decision of the Council dated 17.06.2008 to issue discharge notice in respect of the above mentioned students of Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church Medical College, Kolencherry.

78. Discharge of 1st Year MBBS Students who were admitted at Jubilee Mission Medical College, Thrissur in the Academic Year 2007-2008 and found not eligible in terms of Regulation 5(5)(2) of th Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 – Consideration of.

Read: The matter with regard to the 1st Year MBBS Students who were admitted at Jubilee Mission Medical College, Thrissur in the Academic Year 2007-2008 and discharged by the Council office in terms of Regulation 5 (5) (2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Council vide its letter dated 08.08.2008 had issued a discharge notice in respect of following 5 (five) students of Jubilee Mission Medical College, Thrissur who were found not eligible in terms of Regulation 5 (5) (2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997:-

<i>Sl. No.</i>	<i>Name of the student</i>	<i>Category</i>	<i>Sub-category</i>	<i>Marks (Out of 300)</i>
1	Deepa Thomas	Catholic Merit	Christian	135
2.	Laveena V. Antony	Catholic Merit	Christian	111
3.	Jisha Jeev K	SC/ST	SC	117
4.	Joby Jose	Religious Merit	Christian	90
5.	Nidhi Girvasis	Religious Merit	Christian	75

In reference to the Council office letter cited above, a Writ Petition was filed by the concerned students in the High Court of Kerala at Ernakulum against the discharge Order dated 08.08.2008 and the Hon'ble High Court vide its Order dated 13.07.2009 in W.P. (C) No. 15733 of 2009(J) passed an Order whereof the operative part reads as under:-

“

10. In these circumstances, the writ petitions are disposed of with the following directions:

- (a) The decision taken by the Medical Council of India, impugned in each one of these writ petitions, shall be treated, provisionally, as a show cause notice. The petitioners shall file their objection to the same within six weeks from today.
- (b) The Secretary of the Medical Council of India shall hear the petitioners or their authorized representative and the hearing notes of the Secretary shall be forwarded to the Committee of the Medical Council of India.
- (c) The Executive Committee shall take a decision within four weeks from the date on which the hearing is conducted.
- (d) The Secretary of the Medical Council of India shall issue notice of hearing to the University as also to the management and permit the University or the Management, either to appear or submit their version, before the Secretary of the Medical Council of India.
- (e) The petitioners and the management shall contemporaneously forward copies of their representations or versions, as the case may be, to the University, simultaneous to them being dispatched to the Secretary of the Medical Council of India
- (f) It is open to the Medical Council of India to verify the correctness of the details given by the petitioners, as regards the marks claimed to have been obtained by the petitioners in the competitive Entrance Examination of Kerala Self-Financing Private Management association in the year 2007.
- (g) The Medical Council of India shall advert to the other contentions, if any, raised by the petitioners.”

The Committee noted that in compliance to the aforesaid directives of the Hon'ble Court, the Council vide letter dated 28.08.2009 had requested the Principal, Jubilee Mission Medical College, Thrissur, Registrar, Calicut University, Calicut and all the petitioners, to appear before the Secretary, MCI on 11.09.2009 for personal hearing and submit written submission and supportive documents to the Council in person or through their representative.

In compliance to the aforesaid communication cited above, the Principal of Jubilee Mission Medical College, Thrissur appeared before the Secretary, MCI and submitted the written submission and supportive documents. The submission made by the institute reads as under:-

“

After the test in 2007, There was a difference of opinion among the Managements on some serious policy issues relating to admissions, and thereafter 4 Medical College (Amala Institute of Medical Sciences, Jubilee Mission Medical College & Research Institute, Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church Medical College and Pushpagiri Instt. Of Medical Sciences and Research Centre) and 10 Engineering Colleges formed an Association called the Kerala Christian Professional College Management Federation, hereinafter called the Federation. Our College Jubilee Mission Medical College 7 Research institute comes under the Federation.

All other Medical Colleges, including the new Medical Colleges established after 2007, still continue with the original K.P.M.C.M.A. and all the documents relating to admissions in the colleges till the new Federation was formed are with the former Association and we have no access to the same.

We therefore submit the following explanation, with information available with us.

The Kerala Private Medical College Management Association published a common prospectus and invited applications for admissions for MBBS, in 2007, for all the colleges which were then under the Association. A copy of the prospectus is enclosed herewith.

As per the prospectus, “ Admission will be on the basis of the marks obtained in the entrance examination and marks obtained for Physics, Chemistry and Biology in the qualifying examination. The marks will be apportioned in the ratio of 50:50. After the entrance test, the marks obtained for the physics, Chemistry and Biology at the qualifying examination will be added to the marks obtained at the entrance test and a combined merit list will be published. Separate merit list also will be published for categories for which seats are reserved. Allotment to colleges and admission will be on the basis of centralized counseling.

Altogether, around 3700 candidates had applied to the Association for admission.

In Kerala, we have an Admission Supervisory Committee, constituted under our State Law, As Act 19/06. One of the retired Judges of the Hon'ble High Court, namely Hon'ble Justices P.A. Mohammed is the Chairman, and the Principal Secretary for Higher Education, Government of Kerala and the Commissioner of Entrance Exams, Govt. of Kerala are members.

The entire process of admission like conducting the entrance Test (PMT), etc. was taken over by the Committee, including setting the question papers and printing the same, appointing examiners and values till the final publication of results.

Initially the test was fixed on 21st June 2007. The "Leftist" sponsored youth and student factions physically attacked and disrupted the test venue and therefore the test could not be conducted, on that day.

The Association moved the Hon'ble Supreme Court and the Supreme Court ordered police protection for conducting the test and for the purpose of security ordered the test to be conducted in the Kendriya Vidyalaya in the Naval Base at Cochin.

This time the test was conducted on 7th August 2007. But owing to the earlier incident, the number of participants was much less.

The Admission Supervisory Committee, after valuation handed over the results to the Federation. Then Federation then added the marks of the qualifying exam to the marks obtained by the candidates in the written test, prepared a rank list accordingly and resubmitted the same to the Admission supervisory Committee.

Form this rank list allotments were made strictly in the order of merit.

In this process, candidates who had very high marks in the qualifying exams, scored much higher position in the rank list than those who got good marks in the written test, since the marks in the qualifying examination and the entrance test were apportioned in the ratio of 50 : 50. The marks scored by individual candidates in the written test were not communicated to individual colleges, at that time.

Copies of the marks lists of all candidates from our college, who are now found ineligible by the MCI, are enclosed herewith. All of them are really brilliant and meritorious students, who did really well in their qualifying examinations.

Later, when the essential details had to be furnished to the MCI, since all particulars were necessary, we asked the KPMCMA for details and the same was furnished then. It was this data that we have furnished to the Medical Council of India.

The marks obtained at the test were never communicated to the students either by the Association or by the Colleges.

We were also under a genuine bona fide impression that while calculating the 50% marks as eligibility fixed by the MCI Regulations, it was sufficient that candidates need to have only 50% of the combined total-i.e of the PMT as well as the qualifying exams. This was a consequence of the a misunderstanding of the MCI norms.

In this connection we wish to submit that all the candidates in question secured high marks in the qualifying examination. The copies of their qualifying examinations marks lists are enclosed herewith. One of the students – Joby Jose secured 50% marks in the entrance examination conducted by St. Johns Medical College, Bangalore. The mark list is enclosed herewith for your reference.

It may also be noted that three of the students passed 1st Professional Examination in the first appearance and two in the additional exam. All the 3 students secured high marks in the I MBBS (Deepa Thomas 70% Joby Jose 66.25%) and Lalveena V Antony 64.83%) The results of the additional batch of students though passed is pending declaration.

Under the above circumstances we pray that the Council may kindly consider the above facts and humbly plead that the admission of 5 candidates may be ratified on humanitarian grounds.

We are enclosing the relevant documents and the of five students. We have already made representations to the MCI, copies of which are enclosed.

We understand that in a similar case, The Hon'ble Supreme Court of India has permitted the students to continue the MBBS Course, on condition that equal number of seats be reduced from the management quota in the subsequent admission. The Hon'ble Court of Delhi (Vide WP (c) No: 3109/08 dated 21.01.2009 also has passed an order in the light of Supreme Court Judgment, allowing the MBBS students of Maharashtra to continue their studies they were found victims of Circumstances.

In this connection we declare that Jubilee Mission Medical College & Research Institute is willing to surrender equal number of sets of management quota to the All the India Quota in the admission for 2010-2011, so that students from all over India can benefit from that.

We further wish to reiterate that in all subsequent admissions made, we have strictly enforced 50% marks in the entrance examination and in the qualifying examination separately."

Further, the candidates also appeared before the Secretary and submitted their written submission and supportive documents in person or through their representative.

The Committee further noted that neither the Registrar of University of Calicut, Calicut nor their representative appeared before the Secretary, MCI on 11.09.2009 in the matter.

It was further observed that none of the above mentioned 05 students had secured the minimum %age of marks i.e. 50% for open category and 40% for reserved category at the entrance test examination conducted by Kerala Private Medical College Management Association (KPMCMA).

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council after due and detailed deliberations observed that as the above mentioned students whose names are listed in the aforesaid writ petition and to whom discharge notices have been issued, are not eligible in terms of Regulation 5(5)(2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 as they have secured more than 50% marks in the entrance examination conducted by KPMCMA and decided to reiterate the decision of the Council dated 08.08.2008 to issue discharge notice in respect of the above mentioned students of Jubilee Mission Medical College, Thrissur.

79. Discharge of 1st Year MBBS Students who were admitted at Pushpagiri Instt. of Medical Sciences, Thrivalla in the Academic Year 2007-2008 and found not eligible in terms of Regulation 5 (5) (2) of th Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 – Consideration of.

Read: The matter with regard to the 1st Year MBBS Students who were admitted at Pushpagiri Instt. of Medical Sciences, Thrivalla in the Academic Year 2007-2008 and discharged by the Council office in terms of Regulation 5 (5) (2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that Council vide its letter dated 20.08.2008 had issued a discharge notice in respect of following 24 (twenty four) students of Pushpagiri Instt. of Medical Science, Thrivalla who were found not eligible in terms of Regulation 5 (5) (2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997:-

<i>Sl. No.</i>	<i>Name of the student</i>	<i>Category</i>	<i>Sub-category</i>	<i>Marks (Out of 300)</i>
1	Abbay Babu	Management	General	75
2	Alan George	Management	General	117
3	Ancy Elsa Thomas	Management	General	96
4	Anitha Sara Oommen	Management	General	138
5	Annu M.S.	Management	General	123
6	Babisha Chinnu Thomas	Management	General	117

7	Christo Jacob Varghese	Management	General	141
8	Godly Sara Babu	Management	General	138
9	Jasie Jacob	Management	General	141
10	John Abraham Tharayil	Management	General	135
11	Jomcy Chacko Thittel	Management	General	93
12	Lizann Elizabeth Thomas	Management	General	102
13	Nigi Ross Phillip	Management	General	135
14	Nikhila Paulose	Management	General	90
15	Reshma Susan Mathew	Management	General	147
16	Resmy John Varghese	Management	General	111
17	Rinku Mariam George	Management	General	114
18	Ronald Zachariah Chacko	Management	General	138
19	Ruby Samuel	Management	General	129
20	Shelene Ann Babu	Management	General	111
21	Sherry Thomas	Management	General	135
22	Shintu Philip	Management	General	138
23	Shone Thomas Babu	Management	General	138
24	Tudymol Devasia	Management	General	132

In reference to the Council office letter cited above, a Writ Petition was filed by the concerned students in the High Court of Kerala at Eranakulum against the discharge Order dated 20.08.2008 and the Hon'ble High Court vide its Order dated 13.07.2009 in W.P. (C) No. 16454 of 2009(B) have passed an Order whereof the operative part reads as under:-

“.....

10. In these circumstances, the writ petitions are disposed of with the following directions:

- (a) The decision taken by the Medical Council of India, impugned in each one of these writ petitions, shall be treated, provisionally, as a show cause notice. The petitioners shall file their objection to the same within six weeks from today.
- (b) The Secretary of the Medical Council of India shall hear the petitioners or their authorized representative and the hearing notes of the Secretary shall be forwarded to the Committee of the Medical Council of India.
- (c) The Executive Committee shall take a decision within four weeks from the date on which the hearing is conducted.
- (d) The Secretary of the Medical Council of India shall issue notice of hearing to the University as also to the management and permit the University or the Management, either to appear or submit their version, before the Secretary of the Medical Council of India.
- (e) The petitioners and the management shall contemporaneously forward copies of their representations or versions, as the case may be, to the University, simultaneous to them being dispatched to the Secretary of the Medical Council of India
- (f) It is open to the Medical Council of India to verify the correctness of the details given by the petitioners, as regards the marks claimed to have been obtained by the petitioners in the competitive Entrance Examination of Kerala Self-Financing Private Management association in the year 2007.
- (g) The Medical Council of India shall advert to the other contentions, if any, raised by the petitioners.”

In compliance to the aforesaid directives of the Hon'ble Court, the Secretary, MCI vide letter dated 28.08.2009 had requested the Principal, Pushpagiri Instt of Medical Sciences, Thrivalla, Registrar, Mahatama Gandhi University, Kottayam and of all the petitioners, to appear before the Secretary, MCI on 11.09.2009 for personal hearing and submit written submission and supportive documents to the Council in person or through their representative.

In compliance to the aforesaid communication cited above, K.P. Francis, Asstt. Administrator of Pushpagiri Instt. of Medical Sciences, Thriuvalla appeared before the Secretary, MCI on behalf of the Institute for personal hearing and submitted the written submission and supportive documents. The submission made by the institute reads as under:-

“.....

All the private self financing Medical Colleges in Kerala were under a common umbrella called the Kerala Private Medical College Management association (KPMCMA).

It was this association which was in charge of the conduct of the entrance Test up to 2007-08.

After the test in 2007 there was a difference of opinion among the Management on some serious policy issues relating to admissions and thereafter 4 Medical College & research institute Malankara Orthodox Syrian church Medical college and Pushpagiri institute. Of Medical Sciences & research centre) and 10 Engineering colleges formed an association called the Kerala Christian Professional Colleges management federation, hereinafter called the federation. Our college comes under the federation.

All other medical colleges, including the new medical colleges established after 2007, still continue with the original KPMCMA. And all the documents relating to admissions in the colleges till the new federation was formed are with the former association and we have no access to the same.

We therefore submit the following explanation, with information available with us.

The Kerala Private Medical College Management Association published a common prospectus and invited applications for admission for MBBS, in 2007, for all the colleges which were then under the association. A copy of the prospectus is enclosed herewith.

As per the prospectus, “ Admission will be on the basis of marks obtained in the entrance examination and marks obtained for Physics, Chemistry, and Biology in the qualifying examination. The marks will be apportioned in the ratio of 50 : 50. After the entrance test , the marks obtained for Physics, Chemistry and Biology at the qualifying examination will be added to the marks obtained at the entrance test and a combined merit list will be published. Separate merit list also will be published for categories for which sets are reserved. Allotment to colleges and admission will be on the basis of centralized counseling.

Altogether, around 3700 candidates had applied.

In Kerala, we have an Admission Supervisory Committee, constituted under our state, Law, as Act 19/06. one of the retire judges of the Hon'ble High Court viz: Hon'ble Justice PA. Mohammed is the Chairman, and the Principal Secretary, Higher Education, Govt. of Kerla and the Commissioner for Entrance Exams, Govt. of Kerala are member.

The entire process of admission like conducting the entrance test (PMT), etc. was taken over by the committee, including setting of question papers and printing the same, appointing examiners and values, till the final publication of the results.

Initially the test was fixed on 21.06.2007. The “left” sponsored Youth and student faction physically attacked and disrupted the test venue and therefore the test could not be conducted on that day.

The Association moved the Hon'ble supreme court and the supreme Court ordered police protection for conducting the test and for the purpose of security ordered the test to be conducted in the Kendriya Vidyalaya in the Naval Base, Cochin.

This time the test was conducted on 07.08.2007. But owing to the earlier incident the number of participants was very much less.

The admission supervisory committee, after valuation handed over the results to the association. The association then added the marks of the qualifying exam to the marks obtained by the candidates in the written test, prepared a rank list accordingly and resubmitted the same to the Admission Supervisory Committee.

Form this rank list allotments were made strictly in the order of merit.

In this process, candidates who had very high marks in the qualifying exams scored much higher position in the rank list than those who got good marks in the written test, since the marks in the qualifying examination and entrance test were apportioned in the ratio of 50 : 50. The marks scored by individual candidates in the written test were not communicated to individual colleges, at that time.

Copies of the marks lists of all candidates from our college, who are now found ineligible by the MCI, are enclosed herewith. (Enclosure -2) All of them are really brilliant and meritorious students, who did really well in their qualifying exams.

Later, when the essential details had to be furnished to the MCI, since all particulars were necessary, we asked the KPMCMA for details and the same was furnished then. It was this data that we have furnished to the MCI.

The marks obtained at the test were never communicated to the students either by the association or by the colleges.

We were also under a genuine bonafide impression that while calculating the 50% marks as eligibility fixed by the MCI Regulations, it was sufficient that candidates need have only 50% of the combined total- i.e. of the PMT as well as the qualifying exams. This was a consequence of a misunderstanding of the MCI norms.

We are enclosing the relevant documents and the list of 24 students.(Enclosure-3) The 24 students have appeared for the 1st Prof. MBBS examination of the Mahatma Gandhi University and out to them 21 students passed with high marks(1 destination and 8 first classes). Now they have completed 3rd semester and the end posting exams are going on.

We have already made two representations to the MCI, copies of which are enclosed. (Enclosure-4)

We understand that in a similar case the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India has permitted the students to continue the MBBS course, on condition that equal numbers of seats are reduced from the management quota in the subsequent admission. We quote the order from the said judgement (Vide: Hon'ble Supreme Court of India : Civil Appellate jurisdiction 219828 of 2008. Civil appeal No. 5518- 5519 of 2008 SLP civil No. 17990-17991 of 2008. Monika Ranka and ORS (Appellants) V/s MCI and ORS(Respondents) with civil appeals 5520-5521/2008-SLP (C) Nos. 17995-17996 of 2008)

“In the Regulation published it was stated that the candidates should have secured more than 50% marks in the entrance examination. There is nothing on record to show that these appellants ere informed of the marks secured by them in the entrance examination. As these appellants have already completed one year of their course, equities are in favour of the appellants. But however we maintain the judgement of the High Court, as regards the principal laid down, but we direct that these appellants may be allowed to continue their MBBS course as a special case and their results of the 1st year MBBS course may also be declared so that they may continue with their studies.

The management of the R.D. Gardi Medical College was not justified in giving admission to these students. Certainly, they must be aware of the fact that the candidates should have secured at least 50% marks in the entrance examination but the learned senior counsel appearing for the college says that they were not aware of the marks secured by these candidates as the entrance examination was held by a different association as the marks were not furnished to them by the association. However, as the admission is found to be irregular equal number of students shall be reduced from the management quota for the year 2009-10. The appeal are disposed of accordingly. No costs

The Hon'ble High Court of Delhi (vide: WP (c) No. 3109/08 dated 21/01/2009, also has passed an order in the light of the Supreme Court judgement, allowing the MBBS students of Maharashtra to continue their studies since they were found victims of circumstances.

In this context we declare that the Pushpagiri Instt. Of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, is willing to surrender equal number of seats of management quota to the all India quota in the admission for the year 2010-11 so that students from all over India can benefit from that.

In these circumstances we humbly request the MCI to ratify the admission given to the 24 students mentioned in your notice in the academic year 2007-08.”

Further, the candidates also appeared before the Secretary and submitted their written submission and supportive documents in person or through their representative.

The Committee further noted that neither the Registrar of Mahatma Gandhi University, Kottayam nor their representative appeared before the Secretary, MCI on 11.09.2009 in the matter.

It was further observed that none of the above mentioned 24 students had secured the minimum %age of marks i.e. 50% for open category and 40% for reserved category at the entrance test examination conducted by Kerala Private Medical College Management Association (KPMCMA).

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council after due and detailed deliberations observed that as the above mentioned students whose names are listed in the aforesaid writ petition and to whom discharge notices have been issued, are not eligible in terms of Regulation 5(5)(2) of the Graduate Medical Education Regulations, 1997 as they have secured more than 50% marks in the entrance examination conducted by KPMCMA and decided to reiterate the decision of the Council dated 20.08.2008 to issue discharge notice in respect of the above mentioned students of Pushpagiri Instt. of Medical Sciences, Thrivalla.

80. Establishment of new medical college at Chennai, Tamil Nadu by Deen Dayal Medical and Educational Trust, Chennai, Tamil Nadu u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: The Council Inspectors Report (8th & 9th September, 2009) for grant of Letter of Permission for Establishment of new medical college at Chennai, Tamil Nadu by Deen Dayal Medical and Educational Trust, Chennai, Tamil Nadu u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Central Government vide its letter dated 17.08.2009 had forwarded a copy of the letter dated 17.08.2009 received from the Chairman, Deen Dayal Medical and Educational Trust, Chennai forwarding certified copy of the order dated 13.08.2009 (in W.P. No. (C) No. 235 of 2009 Muthukumaran Educational Trust & Ors. Vs. Union of India) passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India. The operative part of the Judgement reads as under:-

“The petitioners in these petitions proposes to have medical colleges in the State of Tamil Nadu. According to them, they have obtained the essentiality certificate and their applications for necessary permission are pending with the Union of India.

Heard both sides.

We direct the MCI to conduct the inspection of these colleges and give recommendation to the Union of India.”

Accordingly, an inspection for grant of Letter of Permission for Establishment of new medical college at Chennai, Tamil Nadu by Deen Dayal Medical and Educational Trust, Chennai, Tamil Nadu was carried out by the Council Inspectors on 8th & 9th September, 2009.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Inspection report (8th & 9th September, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. [a] The following teaching faculty has not been considered because of the reasons mentioned below:-

Sr. No.	Name	Department	Designation	Reason for not considering
1	Dr. Rajkanth Thambiram	Biochemistry	Professor	He has 3 years teaching experience as Associate Professor as against requirement of 4 yrs.
2.	Dr. Vivek Babu Rao	PSM	Asstt. Prof.	In the declaration form no experience has been shown as Resident against the requirement of 3 years as per regulation.
3.	Dr. M.K. Nirmal	Dentistry	Dentist	Does not possess teaching post.
4.	Dr. Mahadev K.	Anaesthesia	SR	In the declaration form no experience has been shown as Resident against the requirement of 3 years as per regulation.

- [b] In view of above, the shortage of teaching staff required for Letter of Permission is as under:-

a	Teaching faculty	26 out of 66	36.36%
	i Professor	4	Biochem-1, Medicine-1, Surgery-1, Radiology-1
	ii Associate Prof.	4	Physio-1, Forensic-1, PSM-1, Anaesthesia-1
	iii Assistant Prof.	8	Patho-1, Med.-1, Surg.-1, Ortho.-1, ENT-1, Opth.-1, Anaesthesia-1, Dentistry-1
	iv Tutor	8	Anatomy-3, Physio-1, Pharma-3, Forensic-1
b	Residents	24 of 43	55.81%
	i Sr. Residents 19	10	Med.-3, Ped.-1, Surg.-2, Ortho.-1, Opth-1, OBG-1, Anaesthesia-1
	ii Jr. Residents 24	14	Med.-4, Ped.-2, Surg-6, Ortho.-2

- [c] Dr. L. Vengadassalpathy is the Medical Superintendent. He is M.S., M.Ch. and has 9 years of administrative experience which is less than 10 years required as per regulation. Therefore he is not accepted as Medical Superintendent.

2. Clinical material available is inadequate as under:-

Clinical material available		Daily Average 1-1-09 to 30-6-09		Day of inspection Data supplied by institute on 8.9.2009		Data as observed during inspection round on 8.9.2009
O.P.D. attendance		1109		755		359
Casualty attendance		40		25		1
Bed occupancy%		75%-88%		92%		15%
Admission/Discharge		-		-		4/5
Operative work						
1	Major surgical operations	--	2	--	--	Nil
2	Minor surgical operations	3	--	--	--	Nil
3	Normal deliveries	4/week		Nil		Nil
4	Caesarian sections	2/week		Nil		Nil
Radiological Investigations						
1	X-ray	20	16	15	12	15
2	Ultra-sonographys	9	8	8	6	4
3	C.T.Scan	--	--	--	--	--
4	Special Investigations	--	--	--	--	--
Laboratory Investigations						
1	Biochemistry	233	122	165	106	5
2	Microbiology	24	22	26	18	2
3	Serology	8	5	4	2	Nil
4	Parasitology	15	6	14	8	4
5	Hematology	436	103	275	227	10
6	Histopathology	--	8	--	6	Nil
7	Cytopathology	8	5	7	7	Nil
8	Others	--	--	--	--	--

- Though the number of persons lying on the beds in the different wards were to occupy all the available beds. The genuine patients requiring hospitalization were approximately 15%. This observation was made after interrogating number of persons who were lying on the beds in the wards.
- The operative work is nil on the day of inspection and the number of delivery and caesarean section are also nil on the day of inspection as certified by the Dean.
- Date and Registration number was not seen on many case sheets.
- Date of admission on some of the case sheets and history on the case sheets were not matching in accordance with persons' own version.
- X-ray Investigations and Laboratory workload is too less as certified by the Dean and does not commensurate with the number of the patients claimed to be attending the hospital.
- Clinical diagnosis was different than the condition patient was suffering, eg. Patient with Club foot was shown having no deformity.
- Registration number on the case sheet and entry in the Nursing register were not matching.
- Some persons revealed that they were made to sit from morning and no food was served.
- Many of the labourers working in premises were found in the OPD queue without any complaint.
- OPD case paper of one speciality was issued and person was sent to other OPD.
- Dr. Sangamesh was Asstt. Prof. in Surgery ward but was totally unaware of any patient.
- Dr. Dinesh was Asstt. Prof. in ENT ward but was totally unaware of any patient.

- Many patients sitting in OPD did not have any complaint regarding respective subject.
- Many case sheets were found with overwriting on Date of Admission and Name.
- During the revisit of Female Ortho Ward on the ground floor, it was observed that wards were closed and no patient was found in the ward.

Conclusion: Looking to all types of discrepancies described above it appears that number of patients having genuine complaints were too less. Thus the actual OPD appeared to be approximately 359 and Bed Occupancy 15%.

3. There is a deficiency of 29 teaching beds at this stage as under:-

Speciality		Required Beds/Units	Present Beds/Units (Data provided by the institution)	Deficiency as verified during inspection on 08.09.2009
Medicine & Allied Specialities	General Medicine	80	76/3	4
	Pediatrics	30	23/1	7
	TB & Chest	-	6	-
	Skin & VD	-	2	-
	Psychiatry	-	3	-
	Sub-Total	110	110/4	11
Surgery & Allied Specialities	General Surgery	90	93/3	-
	Orthopaedics	30	28/1	2
	Ophthalmology	10	11	-
	ENT	10	10	-
	Sub-Total	140	142/4	2
Obstetrics & Gynaecology	Obstetrics & ANC	30	21	9
	Gynaecology	20	13	7
	Sub-Total	50	34/1	16
Grand Total		300	286	29

- The OPD is housed on the ground floor of the new hospital building under construction.
- Total 2 O.Ts. are available against the requirement of 4 OTs at this stage and are poorly equipped with Anaesthesia equipment and ceiling and portable lights. TV with camera attachment is not available.
- Paediatric ICU and Neonatal ICU have no beds.
- No 'C' arm is available in the O.T. The required space is not provided for Radio-Diagnosis department. Facility for Radiation Protection needs to be provided as per AERB regulation.
- Blood Bank is available but totally non functional. None of the equipment is working. No facility for screening available.
- CSSD, mechanized laundry, EPABX, central kitchen & canteen are not available.
- The hospital does not have an incinerator.
- There is no lecture theatre in the hospital and 2 lecture theatres (of semi gallery type) are under construction as finishing, electrification and furnishing are not complete in the college.
- No staff quarters available for teaching or non-teaching staff.
- Hostels for Boys, Girls, Residents are not furnished and mess facility is also not available in Boys and Girls hostels.
- Nurses hostel is under construction. Actually 20 wooden half partitions are created on the different side of one block on different floors for Girls and Boys. These partitions are not suitable for Hostels. There is no facility for drinking water. There

- is no adequate facility for Toilets. There is no facility for Mess, Recreation and Guest room.
15. The department of Anatomy is not adequately equipped to hold the classes, dissection, Practical and Theory Classes. The space is provided for all the areas, in which civil work is under progress and electrification, finishing, furnishing and providing equipments is yet to be completed. It is non-functional.
 16. The department of Physiology is not adequately equipped to hold the classes, dissection, Practical and Theory Classes. The space is provided for all the areas, in which civil work is under progress and electrification, finishing, furnishing and providing equipments is yet to be completed. No equipments available for operations in the Mammalian Lab. No couches available in the human clinical lab. It is non-functional.
 17. The department Biochemistry of is not adequately equipped to hold the classes, dissection, Practical and Theory Classes. The space is provided for all the areas, in which civil work is under progress and electrification, finishing, furnishing and providing equipments is yet to be completed. No reagents are provided in the lab. Exhaust fans are not provided in the lab. It is non-functional.
 18. The areas to be provided for departments of Pharmacology, Pathology, Microbiology, Forensic Medicine and Community Medicine are under construction. At present no rooms are available for any of the department. The departments are non-existence and non-operational.
 19. Back volumes are not available in the Central library. Internet facility is non-functional. The college has no medlar facility. Seating facility is not sufficient.
 20. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.”

In view of above, whereby it has been found that the applicant has failed to fulfill the mandatory and statutory precondition at Sr. No. 2(5) of the qualifying criteria of owning & managing of a functional hospital of not less than 300 beds, laid down in the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of the scheme for establishment of new medical college at Chennai, Tamil Nadu by Deen Dayal Medical and Educational Trust, Chennai, Tamil Nadu received u/s 10A of the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council further decided to write a letter to the State Govt. of Tamil Nadu requesting to intimate as to how they have issued the Essentiality Certificate certifying that the applicant owned and managed a functional hospital of 300 beds having adequate clinical material when on inspection it has been found that the hospital was not functional and further decided to direct the institute to submit revised Essentiality Certificate in the format prescribed in the Regulations.

81. Establishment of new medical college at Chennai, Tamil Nadu by Muthukumar Educational Trust, Chennai, Tamil Nadu u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: The Council Inspectors Report (8th & 9th September, 2009) for grant of Letter of Permission for Establishment of new medical college at Chennai, Tamil Nadu by Muthukumar Educational Trust, Chennai, Tamil Nadu u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee of the Council observed that the Central Government vide its letter dated 20.08.2009 had forwarded a copy of the letter dated 18.08.2009 received from the Managing Trustee, Shree Muthukumar Educational Trust, Chennai forwarding certified copy of the order dated 13.08.2009 (in W.P. No. (C) Nos. 215 of 2009 Muthukumar Educational Trust & Ors. Vs. Union of India) passed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India. The operative part of the Judgement reads as under:-

“The petitioners in these petitions proposes to have medical colleges in the State of Tamil Nadu. According to them, they have obtained the essentiality certificate and their applications for necessary permission are pending with the Union of India.

Heard both sides.

We direct the MCI to conduct the inspection of these colleges and give recommendation to the Union of India.”

Accordingly, an inspection for grant of Letter of Permission for Establishment of new medical college at Chennai, Tamil Nadu by Muthukumaran Educational Trust, Chennai, Tamil Nadu was carried out by the Council Inspectors on 8th & 9th September, 2009.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Inspection report (8th & 9th September, 2009) and noted the following:-

1.(a) The following Faculty/Residents were not counted while computing faculty/residents deficiency for reasons given as under:-

S.No	Name of faculty / Resident	Designation	Department	Reason for not counting
1	Dr. Kattamanchi Sambasivan	Assoc.Prof	Anatomy	Experience as Asst.Prof less than 5 years
2	Dr. Uchuru. Anija	Assoc.Prof	Biochemistry	Experience as Asst.Prof less than 5 years
3	Dr. R. Ravinathan	Assoc.Prof	Microbiology	Experience as Asst.Prof less than 5 years
4	Dr. A.R. Malathy	Assoc.Prof	General Medicine	Experience as Asst.Prof less than 5 years.
5	Dr. J. Kokilavani	Junior Resident	General Medicine	No residence proof
6	Dr. Muthu	Professor	General Surgery	Associate Professor Experience less than 5 years
7	Dr. C. Vijay Anand	Senior Resident	Dentistry	Junior Residency less than 3 years

(b). The following Faculty were not counted while computing faculty deficiency for forged signatures:-

S.No	Name of faculty / Resident	Designation	Department	Reason for not counting
1	Dr. Zahid Bashir	Asst.Prof.	Anatomy	Signature was different on different pages of declaration form. The candidate accepted that he had not signed one of the pages. No explanation has been furnished by the teachers or the Dean about this occurrence.

2	Dr. M.G. Sekar	Asst. Prof	General Surgery	Signature was different on different pages of declaration form. The candidate accepted that he had not signed one of the pages. No explanation has been furnished by the teachers or the Dean about this occurrence.
3	Dr. Y. Sadhath Khan	Asst.Prof	Ophthalmology	Signature was different on different pages of declaration form. The candidate accepted that he had not signed one of the pages. No explanation has been furnished by the teachers or the Dean about this occurrence.

(c) In view of above, the shortage of teaching staff required for Letter of Permission is as under:-

The shortage of teaching faculty is 30.3% (20 out of 66) as under:-

(i)	Professor	: 1	(Anatomy – 1)
(ii)	Associate Professor	: 5	(Anatomy – 2, Physiology – 1, Biochemistry – 1 & Microbiology – 1)
(iii)	Assistant Professor	: 9	(Anatomy – 2, Astt.Prof. Biophysics -1, Microbiology – 2, General Medicine – 1, General Surgery – 1, Orthopaedics – 1 & Ophthalmology –1)
(v)	Tutor	: 5	(Anatomy – 2, Physiology – 2 & Microbiology – 1)

(d) The shortage of Residents is 30.2%(i.e. 13 out of 43) as under :-

(i)	Sr. Resident	: 8	(General Medicine – 3, General Surgery – 1, Orthopaedics – 1, Ophthalmology – 1, Anaesthesiology – 2)
(ii)	Jr. Resident	: 5	(General Medicine – 4 & General. Surgery – 1)

2. Clinical Material is grossly inadequate as under:-

	Daily Average (As given by the College)	Day of Inspection 8.9.2009	
		As given by the college	As per observation of the inspection team
O.P.D. attendance	592	572	200
Casualty attendance	35	18	8
Number of admissions / discharge	39/44	33/17	25/8
Bed occupancy%	77%	89%	42%
Operative work			
Number of major surgical operations		4	4
Number of minor surgical operations	9	4	4
Number of normal deliveries	6	-	-
Number of caesarian Sections	2	-	-
	1		

Radiological Investigations			
X-ray	122	137	60
Ultrasonography	21	8	4
Special Investigations	5	1	1
C.T. Scan	-	-	-
Laboratory Investigations			
Biochemistry	343	534	50
Microbiology	32	22	12
Serology	147	176	50
Parasitology	3	-	-
Haematology	404	683	120
Histopathology	3	5	-
Cytopathology	3	5	-

3. The boys and resident have been accommodated in one common building which is inadequate. The food is supplied from the common kitchen to the dinning area of all hostels.
4. Residential Quarters: One G + 5 storied building of staff quarters is under construction within the campus. Only the Ground floor is complete and total Four quarters are available for the teaching faculty which is inadequate. So far these quarters are not occupied. No quarters are available for non-teaching staff. No other building / Quarters are available.
5. Sports and recreation facilities: Gymnasium is not available.
6. In Wards: There is no seminar hall in the major departments. All these areas have not been provided with audiovisual aids and other teaching facilities.
7. Central sterilization department: Bowl sterilizer, Glove inspection machine or mixers are not available in CSSD.
8. Pharmacology, Pathology, Microbiology, Forensic Medicine & Community Medicine Departments is under construction.
9. Blood Bank is not functional.
10. Other deficiencies/remarks as pointed out in the inspection report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application for establishment of new medical college at Chennai submitted by Muthukumar Educational Trust, Chennai, Tamil Nadu to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of the scheme as there is no provision u/s 10A of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 or the regulations framed therein to keep the application pending in the Council office.

82. Continuance of recognition of MBBS course at Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore granted by Manipal Academy of Higher Education(Deemed University).

Read: The Compliance Verification Inspection Report (7th & 8th May, 2009) along with the Council Inspectors Report (2nd & 3rd August, 2007) for Continuance of recognition of MBBS course at Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore granted by Manipal Academy of Higher Education(Deemed University).

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Compliance Verification Inspection Report (7th & 8th May, 2009) along with the Council Inspectors Report (2nd & 3rd August, 2007) and observed as under:-

“The General Body of the Council at its meeting held on 10.03.2007 approved the recommendations of the Adhoc Committee/Executive Committee and Postgraduate Committee of withdrawal of recognition of MBBS degree and various postgraduate courses u/s 19 of the I.M.C. Act,1956.

Thereafter the Central Govt. vide its letter dated 25.04.2007 had requested the institute to rectify the deficiencies pointed out by the MCI before the admission of next batch of MBBS students for the academic year 2007-2008 starts. Vide another letter dated 27.04.2007, the Central Govt. directed the institute not to admit students for the MBBS course for the academic year 2007-2008 till such time the deficiencies were rectified and the rectification report was accepted by the Govt. However, vide letter dated 15.06.2007, the Central Govt. decided to allow the colleges to admit MBBS students for the academic year 2007-2008 without receiving any recommendation from the Council in this regard. The Central Govt. in its letter dated 05.06.2007 had referred to the compliance received from the Dean, Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore further requesting the Council to verify the compliance report and submit its recommendation at the earliest. However, on scrutiny, it was observed that neither such compliance was attached with this letter nor any compliance was received in the office of the Council. The attention of the Central Govt. was drawn to this fact vide Council letter dated 21.06.2007. Thereafter, the compliance was received in the office of the Council on 24.06.2007. Vide letter dated 28.06.2007 the Council had informed the Central Govt. that in view of the deficiencies remaining as they are, the compliance submitted by the institute is completely unsatisfactory. The detailed report with the remarks of the Council on each point of the compliance was also enclosed with this letter.

Accordingly, as per the Central Govt. letter dated 05.06.2007, an inspection to verify the compliance submitted by the institute was carried out by the Council Inspectors on 2nd & 3rd August, 2007. The compliance verification inspection report was placed before the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 24th August, 2007 where the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court were also present. After due deliberations, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council observed as under:-

- “1. During inspection video recording of inspection was carried out by the authority of the college without the permission of the Inspectors. They have taken selective video recording of the areas which they wanted to show instead of taking recording of entire inspection. The copy of the video record was not given to inspector's inspite of inspector's request.

2. The shortage of teaching faculty is as under:-
 - (a) Faculty 8.53%

Professor :	03 (Forensic medicine-2, Community medicine – 1)
Associate Professor:	06 (Anatomy -3, Physiology -2, Forensic medicine – 1)
Assistant Professor:	15 (Community Med.-3 Paediatrics – 3, TB chest – 2, Orthopaedics – 4, OBGY – 1, ANMO-1, MWO-1).
Tutor:	05 (Anatomy-1, Community Medicine – 4,)

 - (b) The shortage of Resident is 20.87% as under:-

Sr. Resident:	43 (General medicine – 10, Paeditrics –1, TB & Chest- 3, Skin & VD–2, Psychiatry – 1, General surgery –2, Ortho.– 4, Ophthalmology–1, Anaesthesiology-12, Radiology-6, Comm.Med.-1)
---------------	---

2. Clinical Material is inadequate at the hospital owned by the college i.e. KMC Hospital, Attavar:

	Daily Average		Day of Inspection	
O.P.D. attendance	523		435	
Casualty attendance	24		16	
Number of admissions/discharge	59/51		64/40	
Bed occupancy%	64%		71%	
Operative work				
Number of major surgical operations	7		7	
Number of minor surgical operations	5		4	
Number of normal deliveries	0		0	
Number of caesarian Sections	0		0	
<u>Radiological Investigations</u>	O. P.	I. P.	O.P.	I.P.
X-ray	40	21	22	27
Ultrasonography	15	12	9	08
Special Investigations	0	0	0	01
C.T. Scan	6	12	11	04
<u>Laboratory Investigations</u>				
Biochemistry	876	179	1491	273
Microbiology	54	14	43	06
Serology	78	05	64	34
Parasitology				
Haematology	552	130	812	156
Histopathology	5	08	3	4
Cytopathology	11	1.2	2	0
Others				

On the second day of inspection, during inspection occupancy in Attavar hospital was 52% which is much lower than the first day of inspection.

No deliveries are conducted at the college own hospital.

3. The institution is running Dental College in the same campus. Dean of the college has given a note stating that "Dental college students (BDS course) are being trained by the staff of Medical College in departments where required e.g. Anatomy, Physiology, Microbiology, Pharmacology, Medicine & Surgery and the same departmental infrastructure including labs. and wards are being used to train the students for practical/clinicals." This is contrary to Regulations as separate teaching faculty and infrastructure are required for Dental College.
4. A lecture hall of 300 seating capacity is available which is inadequate as per the norms, as it should have 1 lecture hall of a capacity of 375 seats. Examination hall has 250 seats which is inadequate.
5. RHTC–Moodabidri RHTC is under the control of the Govt. of Karnataka and the college is allowed to use its facilities for teaching purposes which is contrary to Regulations. Students are not staying or visiting this centre. No audio visual aids have been provided. Lecturer cum medical officer having MD(PSM) is not available.
6. There is no separate hostel for interns. They are accommodated in undergraduate hostels. Specific number of interns staying in the hostel are not available.
7. Nurses hostel is inadequate. The PG Hostel, Interns hostels and Nurses hostels are having inadequate capacities.
8. The following two hospitals have been permitted by the Deptt. of Health, Govt. of Madras for the purpose of clinical training to medical students vide letter No.3048 health dated 25th September, 1952. However these two hospitals have no financial or administrative control by the Dean of KMC and are administered exclusively by the District Medical Officer of Govt. of Karnataka. District Medical Officer informed that Dean has no direct control on the hospital. Dean never visits these hospitals. There is no office for Dean to sit and work in Govt. hospitals.

Govt. Wenlock Hospital (Govt. hospital) it is one km away from the Medical College. It has 654 teaching beds.

Govt. Lady Goschen Hospital (Govt. Hospital) It is 1 km away from the Medical College. It has 250 teaching beds.

9. Distribution of teaching beds is as per council recommendation except in Paediatrics where there is deficiency of 27 beds.
10. In Govt. Lady Goschen hospital 250 beds are available. Patients are put on the beds as per the availability of beds. Although 5 units have been shown on paper, during inspection it appeared these units were not functioning as the beds are not distributed unit wise.
11. In the department of Paediatrics during inspection, it is found that there is no unitwise distribution of beds. Patients are put on the beds as per the availability of beds. It seems that they function like one unit.
12. In the department of Obst. & Gynae. – on paper they have shown 5 units each having more than 30 beds. During inspection, it is found that there is no unitwise distribution of beds. Patients are put on the beds as per the availability of beds. It seems that they function like one unit.
13. Govt. Wenlock district hospital – OPD space is inadequate. There is over crowding of patients. In OPD for each speciality one big common room is provided in which in all Senior and Junior doctors sit and take history of patients. There is no privacy while taking history. Male and female patients are put together. Teaching facilities like patient couch, stools, X-rays view box, examination trays etc. are not available in most of the places. Small teaching area having capacity of 15-20 students with only one examination couch is available. Teaching facilities are not available in OPD area. Most of the wards are over crowded. Space between the 2 beds is not sufficient. There is no unitwise distribution in Paediatric wards. Most of the wards are not having teaching area, nursing station, side laboratory, pantry & doctors duty room.
14. Govt. Lady Goschen Hospital – OPD is also having more or less same facilities as Govt. Wenlock District Hospital and are inadequate. It has no unitwise distribution of beds. Most of the wards are not having teaching area, nursing station, side laboratory, pantry & doctors duty room. Most of the wards are designed in the form of cubicles having incomplete walls or the rooms having six beds in each. Position of the nursing stations is not proper. In the hospital most of the nursing stations are outside the ward. Wards are either not having side laboratories or having non functional side laboratories.
15. In Central Casualty Service have no regular designated Casualty Medical Officers. Both the Govt. hospitals the casualty services are not properly organized. There are no regular designated Casualty Medical Officers.
16. There are 7 operation theatres which is inadequate against the requirement of 10 as per Regulations. There is no separate ICCU, Surgical ICU or Burns ICU.
17. Obstetrics ICU is not available. Labour room is available only in Govt. Lady Goschen hospital.
18. In Radiological department 2 static units (1 of 640 mA, 1 of 300 mA) are available which are inadequate as per Regulations. There is no hospital pharmacy available.
19. There is no central laundry available at the college own hospital. Laundry services are being outsourced.
20. Kitchen is not available at the college own hospital.
21. Anatomy department –Histology practical laboratory should have 150 work places.
22. Physiology department – There is one demonstration room having 100 seats which is inadequate against the requirement of 2 demonstration rooms each of 125 seats. All practical laboratories should have 150 work places.

23. Biochemistry department – There is one demonstration room with a capacity of 125 seats against the requirement of 2 demonstration rooms each of 125 seats. All practical laboratories should have 150 work places.
24. Pharmacology department - There is one demonstration room having 150 seats against the requirement of 2 demonstration rooms each of 125 seats.
25. Pathology department – There are 2 demonstration rooms with capacity of 75 seats against the requirement of two demonstration rooms of 125 seats.
26. Microbiology department – There are 2 demonstration rooms each of 125 seats are required. Practical laboratory should have 150 work places.
27. Comm.Med.department - There are 2 demonstration rooms each of 125 seats.
28. Books in the departmental libraries TB & Chest (6), Skin & VD(28), Psychiatry (15), Orthopaedics(34), Ophthalmology(43) & Radio-diagnosis(19) are inadequate.
29. Other deficiencies as pointed out in the inspection report.”

The statutory position that the Ministry of Health, Govt. of India can pass orders under the Act for grant of recognitions only on the recommendations of the MCI in this behalf – which is an imperative statutory precondition, as has also been held by the Hon’ble Apex Court in its pronouncements including in the case of MCI Vs. State of Karnataka – (1998) 6 SCC 131 and has also been specifically stipulated in the statutory regulations also. It is necessary to refer to the following observations of the Hon’ble Supreme Court in the case of MCI Vs. State of Karnataka:-

“.....A medical student requires gruelling study and that can be done only if proper facilities are available in a medical college and the hospital attached to it has to be well equipped and the teaching faculty and doctors have to be competent enough that when a medical student comes out, he is perfect in the science of treatment of human beings and is not found wanting in any way. The country does not want half-baked medical professionals coming out of medical colleges when they did not have full facilities of teaching and were not exposed to the patients and their ailments during the course of their study.....”

It is reemphasized that upon grant of recognition, the students passing out from a college recognized and included in the first schedule – become entitled for registration under the Act, necessarily required practicing medicine in India without any further restriction or limitation. For the protection of the patients, the law provides that the students who are not exposed to the adequate teaching and training with required infrastructural, teaching and other facilities, their degrees cannot be recognized and they cannot be granted registration for practicing medicine.

If the students are being trained in an institution which does not have adequate teaching faculty or clinical material even after being in existence for a period of 6 years it would lead to a situation in which they would not be properly and adequately trained and taught in the practice of clinical medicine. Exposing the population at large to treatment by such students who have not been adequately trained because of paucity of teaching faculty and clinical material in the affiliated teaching hospital and qualified teaching faculty is not conducive for good quality medical treatment.

It has been the consistent stand of the Council that it is one of the basic theme of the statutory scheme of the Act that adequacy of clinical material and qualified teaching faculty is of paramount importance in continuing to recognize the degree awarded by any medical institution. In such cases, action under Section 19 of the Act for withdrawal of the recognition also becomes necessary. It is also reiterated that as the inspection report itself had shown gross deficiencies of teaching faculty, residents, clinical material and other infrastructural facilities, the quality of the education provided in such an institute wherein there are gross deficiencies as outlined above, would not only be substandard but such an

institute would be producing doctors who would not have received education as per the standards which are applied to all the institutes in India.

In view of above and as the deficiencies of teaching faculty, teaching beds, distribution of units, availability of paramedical staff and other infrastructure are still persisting, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decisions taken at its meeting held on 22.5.2002 and as approved by the General Body of the Council presided over by the Administrator at its meeting held on 27.8.2002 and by the Executive Committee on 02.12.2006 wherein the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court were also present to recommend to the Central Government to initiate action u/s 19 of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956 for withdrawal of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Manipal Academy of Higher Education in respect of students being trained at Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore and further decided to request the Central Government to recall the permission given by the Central Govt. vide letter dated 15.06.2007 to admit the students for MBBS course during the current academic year 2007-2008 and to direct the institute not to make any further admissions in the MBBS course for the academic year 2007-08. It was further decided to request the Central Govt. to direct the institute not to teach and train the students of Dental College.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to record and convey to the concerned authorities its strong exception to the manner in which the University authorities tried to interfere with the inspection and also the manner in which the video recording of the inspection was done by the University authorities in spite of clear cut denial of permission for the same by the Inspectors and by the Secretary of the Council. It was further decided to request the Central Govt. not to take cognizance of video recording, if any, submitted by the institute as not only the video recording was not authorized, but also, as has been mentioned specifically by the Inspectors that only selective video recording was done as much as the video recording was not purposely done where there were glaring deficiencies and neither any copy of the video recording was given to the inspection team in spite of several requests made by the inspection team to the Vice-Chancellor of the University and to the Dean of the Institute.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council directed the office of the Council to send a copy of the communication to the Ministry of Human Resource Development, University Grants Commission, Health Secretary of Govt. of Karnataka and Director, Medical Education, Govt. of Karnataka for necessary action.”

The decision of the Committee was communicated to the Central Govt. vide Council office letter No. Kar.31(2)/2007-Med./15552, dated 17.09.2007 for its information & necessary action.

In this context, the Council office had received the copy of Notification dated 25.06.2008 issued by the Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & FW, New Delhi & published in Part-II, Section 3, Sub-Section (ii) of the Gazette of India. The contents of the Notification are as under:-

“.....

In the said first Schedule against “Manipal University (Formerly known as Manipal Academy of Higher Education)(Deemed University), Manipal, Karnataka under the heading “Recognised Medical Qualification’ (in column (2)) and under the heading ‘Abbreviation for Registration’ (in column(3)), the following shall be inserted, namely:-

(2)

(3)

Bachelor of Medicine and
Bachelor of Surgery

This shall be a recognized medical qualification when granted by Manipal University (Formerly known as Manipal Academy of Higher Education)(Deemed University) Manipal, Karnataka when granted in or before the year 2008 in respect of students trained as Kasturba Medical College, Manipal, Karnataka and Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore, Karnataka

(No.U.12012/379/2006-ME(P-II))

(N. Barik)

Sd/-

Under Secretary to the Govt. of India.

Subsequently, the Council office had received a corrigendum dated 23.09.2008 issued by the Government of India, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhavan, New Delhi. The contents of the notification may be read as under: -

“[TO BE PUBLISHED IN PART II, SECTION 3, SUB-SECTION (ii) OF THE
GAZETTE OF INDIA]

Government of India

Ministry of Health & Family Welfare

(Department of Health & Family Welfare)

Nirman Bhavan, New Delhi

23rd Sept., 2009

CORRIGENDUM

s.o. In partial modification to this Ministry's Notification No. U.12012/379/2006-ME(P-II) dated 25th June, 2008 under the heading “Abbreviation for Registration” (in column (3)), the conditions mentioned therein may be replaced by the following namely:-

“This shall be a recognized medical qualification when granted by Manipal University (Formerly Known as Manipal Academy of Higher Education (Deemed University) Manipal, Karnataka when granted in or before the year 2009 in respect of students trained at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal, Karnataka and Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore.”

[No.U.12012/379/2006-ME(P-II)]

--Sd./--

(N. Barik)

Under Secretary to the Govt. of India

Further, the Council office had received a copy of another notification dated 15.10.2008 issued by the Government of India, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhavan, New Delhi. The contents of the notification may be read as under: -

“[TO BE PUBLISHED IN PART II, SECTION 3, SUB-SECTION (ii) OF THE
GAZETTE OF INDIA]

Government of India
Ministry of Health & Family Welfare
(Department of Health & Family Welfare)
Nirman Bhavan, New Delhi
Dated the 15th October, 2008.

NOTIFICATION

S.O. In exercise of the powers conferred by sub-section (4) of the section 19 of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956(102 of 1956) and in supersession of Notification dated 25th June 2008 and corrigendum dated 23rd September 2008, the Central Government, after consulting the Medical Council of India and considering the representations made by the concerned medical institutions on the notices served upon them, hereby makes the following further amendments in the First Schedule to the said Act, namely:-

In the said First Schedule against “Manipal University(Formerly known as Manipal Academy of Higher Education)(Deemed University), Manipal, Karnataka under the heading ‘Recognized Medical Qualification’ [in column (2)] and under the heading ‘Abbreviation for Registration’ [in column (3)], the following shall be inserted namely: -

(2)	(3)
-----	-----
<p>Bachelor of Medicine and Bachelor of Surgery</p>	<p>M.B.B.S.</p> <p>This shall be a recognized medical qualification granted by Manipal University(Formerly known as Manipal Academy of Higher Education)(Deemed University) Manipal, Karnataka when granted in or before the year 2013 for intake capacity of 250 seats each at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal and Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore, Karnataka.</p> <p>This shall be a recognized medical qualification granted by Manipal University(Formerly known as Manipal Academy of Higher Education)(Deemed University) Manipal, Karnataka when granted from the year 2014 for intake capacity of 150 sets at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal and 100 seats at Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore, Karnataka.</p> <p>Continued recognition of MBBS degrees after the year 2014 and restoration of seats will be subject to rectification of all the deficiencies within a period of one year.</p> <p>[No.U.12012/379/2006-ME(P-II)]</p> <p style="text-align: right;">--Sd./-- (N. Barik) Under Secretary to the Govt. of India</p>

In reference to above, the Central Govt. vide its letter dated 13.03.2009 had forwarded the compliance report received from the Manipal University vide letter dated 18.02.2009. The Compliance report has been verified by way of inspection on 7th & 8th May, 2009”.

The members of the Executive Committee while perusing the inspection report (7th & 8th May, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The following faculty cannot be accepted due to reasons mentioned hereunder:-

#	Name	Designation	Department	Remarks
1.	Dr. Benedicta D'Souza	Professor	Biochemistry	M.Sc. & Ph.D. from Science faculty.
2.	Dr. Nirupama M	Asst.Prof.	Pathology	Presented herself at AJ Instt. of Medical Sciences in the headcount in the MCI inspection held in Oct. 2008.
3.	Dr. Shaila T Bhat	Asst.Prof.	Pathology	Does not possess prescribed academic qualifications.
4.	Dr. Nagesh Kr. G Rao	Professor	Forensic Medicine	Has MD (Pathology)
5.	Dr. Sonu Hangma Subha	Assoc.Prof.	Community Medicine	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.
6.	Dr. Venugopala D	Assoc.Prof.	General Medicine	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.
7.	Dr. R. Raghava Sharma	Assoc.Prof.	General Medicine	Does not possess prescribed academic qualifications.
8.	Dr. Krishna Prasad	Assoc. Prof.	General Medicine	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.
9.	Dr. Sandeep Gopal Krishna N R	Asst. Prof.	General Medicine	Does not possess prescribed academic qualifications.
10.	Dr. Rathika D Shenoy	Assoc.Prof.	Paediatrics	Does not possess prescribed academic qualifications.
11.	Dr. Janardhan Shenoy A	Assoc.Prof.	Paediatrics	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.
12.	Dr. Anand R	Assoc.Prof.	TB & Chest	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst. Prof.
13.	Dr. Vishak Acharya K	Assoc.Prof.	TB & Chest	Does not possess prescribed academic qualifications.
14.	Dr. Kocikar Ganesh Pai	Professor	General Surgery	Has teaching experience as Asst. Prof. and Assoc. Prof. in Paediatric Surgery and not in General Surgery.
15.	Dr. Sadashiva Rao P	Assoc.Prof.	General Surgery	Has teaching experience as Asst. Prof. in Paediatric Surgery and not in General Surgery.
16.	Dr. Ranjit Shetty	Assoc.Prof.	General Surgery	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.

17.	Dr. Narayan Bhat	Assoc.Prof.	General Surgery	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.
18.	Dr. Ramesh B. S.	Assoc.Prof.	General Surgery	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.
19.	Dr. Venkatesh K S	Assoc.Prof.	General Surgery	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.
20.	Dr. B Seetharam Rao	Professor	Orthopaedics	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof. & 4 years as Assoc.Prof.
21.	Dr. Surendra Umesh Kamath	Assoc.Prof.	Orthopaedics	Does not possess prescribed academic qualifications.
22.	Dr. Ronald Joseph Menezes	Assoc.Prof.	Orthopaedics	Does not possess prescribed academic qualifications.
23.	Dr. Ramachandra Kamath K	Assoc.Prof.	Orthopaedics	Does not possess prescribed academic qualifications.
24.	Dr. Amarnath D Savur	Assoc.Prof.	Orthopaedics	Does not possess prescribed academic qualifications.
25.	Dr. M Panduranga Kamath	Professor	ENT	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof. & 4 years as Assoc.Prof.
26.	Dr. T Bhaskar Alva	Assoc.Prof.	ENT	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.
27.	Dr. Suja Sreedharan S	Assoc.Prof.	ENT	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.
28.	Dr. Anand H Kulkarni	Assoc.Prof.	Anaesthesia	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.
29.	Dr. padmanabha K	Assoc.Prof.	Anaesthesia	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.
30.	Dr. Amritha Bhandary	Professor	Obst. & Gynae.	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.
31.	Dr. Prema D'Cunha	Assoc.Prof.	Obst. & Gynae.	Does not possess required teaching experience of 5 years as Asst.Prof.
32.	Dr. Anupama Suresh Y	Asst.Prof.	Obst. & Gynae.	Does not possess prescribed academic qualifications.

(b) In view of above, the shortage of teaching faculty is 16.6%(i.e. 54 out of 324) as under :-

- (i) Professor : 02 (Forensic Medicine -2)
- (ii) Associate Professor : 08 (Anatomy -1, Forensic Medicine -1, Community Medicine -1, TB & Chest -1, Paediatrics -2 & Orthopaedics -2)
- (iii) Assistant Professor : 38 (Lect. Bio. -1, Pathology -2, General Medicine -4, TB & Chest -1, Paediatrics -2, General Surgery -7, Orthopaedics -4, ENT -1, Obst. & Gynae. -7, Anaesthesia -5 & Radiology -4)
- (iv) Tutor : 06 (Pathology -1 & Pharmacology -5)
- (c) The shortage of Residents is 30.9%(61 out of 197) as under :-
- (i) Sr. Resident : 26 (General Medicine -3, TB & Chest -3, Psychiatry -2, Paediatrics -4, General Surgery - 3, Orthopaedics -1, ENT -1, Radiology -7 & Anaesthesia -2)
- (ii) Jr. Resident : 35 (General Medicine -15, TB & Chest -2, Psychiatry -1, Paediatrics -1, General Surgery - 8 & Obst. & Gynae. -8,
2. The following two hospitals have been permitted by the Dept. of Health, Govt. of Karnataka for the purpose of clinical training to medical students vide letter No.3048 health dated 25th September, 1952. However these two hospitals have no financial or administrative control by the Dean of KMC and are administered exclusively by the District Medical Officer of Govt. of Karnataka. District Medical Officer informed that Dean has no direct control on the hospital. Dean never visits these hospitals. There is no office for Dean to sit and work in Govt. hospitals.
- (i) Govt. Wenlock Hospital (Govt. hospital) it is one km away from the Medical College. It has 630 teaching beds & 21 clinical units.
- (ii) Govt. Lady Goschen Hospital (Govt. Hospital) It is 1 km away from the Medical College. It has 150 teaching beds & 5 clinical units.
3. Available clinical material is as under :- (at KMC Hospital, Attavar)

	Day of Inspection
O.P.D. attendance	392
Casualty attendance	23
Bed occupancy%	44.7%
Operative work	
Number of major surgical operations	10
Number of minor surgical operations	05
Number of normal deliveries	0
Number of caesarian Sections	0
<u>Radiological Investigations</u>	
X-ray	80
Ultrasonography	24
Special Investigations	-
C.T. Scan & MRI	12+4
<u>Laboratory Investigations</u>	
Biochemistry	1547
Microbiology	81
Serology	166
Parasitology	20
Haematology	808
Histopathology	5
Cytopathology	14
Others	-

- This Attavar Hospital has 495 teaching beds and 17 clinical units.
- The hospital is attached with the Medical College and is under the administrative and financial control of the institution.
- It is located at a distance of 2 kms. from the college.
- There is no Skin & VD department and Obst & Gynae. in this hospital.
- Clinical material is inadequate in terms of OPD attendance, bed occupancy, casualty attendance, number of major & minor surgeries, radiological investigations and lab. investigations.
- There is no central lab. in the hospital. All the samples obtained for clinical investigations are being sent to KMC Hospital Ambedkar Circle which is located at a distance of 0.5 km. from the college, which is under the administrative and financial control of the institution.
- All the beds in different wards are located in cubicles of 12 beds each. One ward is split into two portions for male and female patients on either side. The nursing station is located on one side (male side) with the result that the patients placed on the female side can not be observed.

Available clinical material is as under :- (at Wenlock Hospital)

	Day of Inspection
O.P.D. attendance	396
Casualty attendance	11
Bed occupancy%	34.1%
Operative work	
Number of major surgical operations	8
Number of minor surgical operations	8
Number of normal deliveries	-
Number of caesarian Sections	-
<u>Radiological Investigations</u>	
X-ray	109
Ultrasonography	20
Special Investigations	0
C.T. Scan	2
<u>Laboratory Investigations</u>	
Biochemistry	0
Microbiology	0
Serology	0
Parasitology	0
Haematology	48
Histopathology	0
Cytopathology	0
Others	-

- Wenlock hospital – it has 630 teaching beds & 21 clinical units
- It is split into two hospital viz. Wenlick District Hospital & Regional Advance Paediatrics Care Hospital
- Both these hospitals are under the administrative and financial control of Govt. of Karnakata. The Medical Superintendent as well as 25 Assistant Surgeons are employed by the Govt. and the institution is using the hospital for teaching purposes.
- The hospital does not have OBG, TB & Chest & Psychiatry departments
- The MRD Section is located in dingy and condemned building(under demolition), which has one computer and the hospital records are not properly maintained. It has only record of OPD attendance upto the month of April, 2009. No other records are available.
- Clinical material is inadequate in terms of OPD attendance, bed occupancy, casualty attendance, number of major & minor surgeries, radiological

investigations. The lab. investigations other than routine Heamatology are not conducted in the hospital.

- There is no central lab. in the hospital. All the samples obtained for clinical investigations are been sent to KMC Hospital Ambedkar Circle which is located at a distance of 0.5 km. from the college, which is under the administrative and financial control of the institution.
- There is no CSSD, mechanized laundry in the hospital.

Available clinical material is as under :- (At Lady Goschen)

	Day of Inspection
O.P.D. attendance	88
Casualty attendance	0
Bed occupancy%	94%
Operative work	
Number of major surgical operations	-
Number of minor surgical operations	4
Number of normal deliveries	12
Number of caesarian Sections	06
<u>Radiological Investigations</u>	
X-ray	3
Ultrasonography	2
Special Investigations	-
C.T. Scan	-
<u>Laboratory Investigations</u>	
Biochemistry	28
Microbiology	-
Serology	-
Parasitology	-
Haematology	38
Histopathology	-
Cytopathology	-
Others	

- Lady Goschen hospital – it has 150 teaching beds and 5 clinical units. It is under the administrative and financial control of Govt. of Karnakata. The Medical Superintendent as well as 5 Assistant Surgeons are employed by the Govt. and the institution is using the hospital for teaching purposes.
- The hospital has only OBG department.
- There is no MRD Section. There is no computerization in the hospital.
- The hospital is overcrowded with no adequate distance between the beds.
- The patients are kept in extremely unhygienic condition.
- The labour rooms are very dirty with no proper ventilation.
- There is no CSSD, mechanized laundry in the hospital. The sterilization is done in one room which is located adjacent to the labour room. (one horizontal and one vertical autoclave and no separate receiving and distribution windows. No hygiene is being maintained in this room.
- Clinical material is inadequate in terms of OPD attendance, casualty attendance, number of major & minor surgeries, radiological investigations. The lab. investigations other than routine Heamatology are not conducted in the hospital.
- There is no central lab. in the hospital. All the samples obtained for clinical investigations are been sent to KMC Hospital Ambedkar Circle which is located at a distance of 0.5 km. from the college, which is under the administrative and financial control of the institution.

4. A lecture hall of 300 seating capacity is available which is inadequate as per the norms, as it should have 1 lecture hall of a capacity of 375 seats. Examination hall has 250 seats which is inadequate.
 5. RHTC–Moodabidri RHTC is under the control of the Govt. of Karnataka and the college is allowed to use its facilities for teaching purposes which is contrary to Regulations. Students are not staying or visiting this centre. No audio visual aids have been provided. UHC & RHTC should be under the administrative and financial control of the college, which is the case not here.
 6. There is no separate hostel for interns. They are accommodated in undergraduate hostels. Specific number of interns staying in the hostel are not available.
 7. Nurses hostel is inadequate. Interns are being accommodated in the UG hostels. Accommodation available for 120 nursing staff as against the requirement of 100% nursing staff.
 8. The entry to the hospital had strong smell of putrefying material. The wards are located on cramped spaces and they are dark and lack ventilation with no windows for light or air. The space between the two beds is about 2 feet with no circulation space between them. No duty roster was available in the hospital.
 9. The number of surgeries performed in the 3 hospitals is inadequate. These hospitals being the teaching hospital.
 10. In Govt. Lady Goschen hospital 150 beds are available. Patients are put on the beds as per the availability of beds. Although 5 units have been shown on paper, during inspection it appeared these units were not functioning as the beds are not distributed unit wise.
 11. In the department of Obst. & Gynae. – on paper they have shown 5 units each having more than 30 beds. Patients are put on the beds as per the availability of beds. It seems that they function like one unit.
 12. Govt. Wenlock district hospital – OPD space is inadequate. There is over crowding of patients. In OPD for each speciality one big common room is provided in which all senior and junior doctors sit and take history of patients. Teaching facilities like patient couch, stools, X-rays view box, examination trays etc. are not available in most of the places. Small teaching area having capacity of 15-20 students with only one examination couch is available. Teaching facilities are not available in OPD area. Most of the wards are over crowded. Space between the 2 beds is not sufficient. Most of the wards are having inadequate teaching area, side laboratory, pantry & doctors duty room. Nursing station is not as per MCI norms in the wards as the wards are split into cubicles and the patients cannot be supervised by the nursing staff as the nursing station is located on one side of the ward. (male side.)
 13. Govt. Lady Goschen Hospital – OPD is also having more or less same facilities as Govt. Wenlock District Hospital and are inadequate. It has unitwise distribution of beds. Most of the wards are not having, nursing station, side laboratory, pantry & doctors duty room. Most of the wards are designed in the form of cubicles having incomplete walls or the rooms having six beds in each. Position of the nursing stations is not proper. In the hospital most of the nursing stations are outside the ward. Wards are either not having side laboratories or having non functional side laboratories.
 14. In Central Casualty Service have no regular designated Casualty Medical Officers. Both the Govt. hospitals the casualty services are not properly organized. Casualty Medical Officers were not available.
- ii
- Obstetrics ICU is not available. Labour room is available only in Govt. Lady Goschen hospital.
15. There is no hospital pharmacy available.
 16. There is no central laundry available at the college own hospital as well as other 2 Govt. hospitals. In the Lady Goschen dirty cloths were being washed with dirty water in the open space. Laundry services are being outsourced.
 17. Anatomy department –Histology practical laboratory has 100 work places instead of 150 workplaces.

18. Physiology department – There is one demonstration room having 100 seats which is inadequate against the requirement of 2 demonstration rooms each of 125 seats. All practical laboratories should have 150 work places. (available workplaces – 125).
19. Kitchen is not available at the college own hospital.
20. Biochemistry department – There is one demonstration room with a capacity of 125 seats against the requirement of 2 demonstration rooms each of 125 seats. All practical laboratories should have 150 work places. (available workplaces 125)
21. Pharmacology department - There is one demonstration room having 150 seats against the requirement of 2 demonstration rooms each of 125 seats.
22. Pathology department – There are 2 demonstration rooms with capacity of 75 seats against the requirement of two demonstration rooms of 125 seats.
23. Microbiology department – Practical laboratory should have 150 work places.(available workplaces 125).
24. Comm.Med.department - There is 1 demonstration room of 125 seats as against the required of 2 demonstration rooms of 125 seats of each
25. Books in the departmental libraries TB & Chest (6), Skin & VD(28), Psychiatry(15), Orthopaedics(34), Ophthalmology(43) & Radio-diagnosis(19) are inadequate.
26. Common hostel for the use of MBBS, postgraduate and interns are located in different buildings spread over various locations in the city.
 - The hostel (Sturrock Boys hostel) has a capacity of 45 of which 25 rooms have been allotted to postgraduate students including MDS students.
 - Similarly Kapriguda Main Block Boys Hostel is being shared by MBBS and few BDS students.
 - The total hostel capacity for boys is for 600 students whereas for girls it is for 535 students (Total hostel facility available is for 1135 UG students) as against the requirement of 1250 UG students and 250 interns (1500).
 - The hostels for boys are spread over in 4 blocks i.e. (i) Kapriguda Main Block (ii) Kaprigudda Annex C Block (iii) Lalbagh Bosy (iv) Sturrock Bosy Block and for girls in 3 blocks i.e. (i) Bejai Girls, (ii) Nandagiri Ladies (iii) Sturrock Girls Block. All these blocks of hostels are spread over in the city at various distances from the college in different directions.
 - Hostels rooms are inadequate in number for UG students and there is no separate hostel for interns.
 - The residential accommodation for the faculty is also located away from the college outside the campus.
 - There is no accommodation are available for non-teaching staff.
 - The para medical and nursing staff are under the Govt. of Karnataka in these two govt. hospitals and doctors including Medical Superintendent are also posted here.
 - The emergency services are being catered by the Govt. doctors.
 - The nursing and para medical staff was found to be grossly inadequate in the NICU and PICU in Govt. Wenlock Hospital as well as Lady Goschen Hospital. Only one doctor and nursing staff was looking after the NICU as well as PICU in Govt. Wenlock Hospital.
 - On an average one staff nurse is available for 40 beds, who was also taking care of NICU as well as postnatal ward.
 - Overall there is deficiency of nursing and para medical staff in the Wenlock Hospital as well as Lady Goschen Hospital, no appointment of fresh staff has been done in the recent past.
 - No duty roster was put up in the KMC Hospital showing the name of the duty doctors.
 - Quite a few faculty members are having super specialty degrees and re posted as faculty members in the Department of Surgery & Medicine.
 - The Animal House which was located on the ground floor alongwith the research lab. for various pre clinical departments and hostels, has been shifted in a bungalow

belonging to the institution which is located opposite to the residential area, which is not appropriate. No Veterinary Officer/Para Medical Staff was available.

27. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, as the gross deficiencies of teaching faculty, teaching hospital, clinical material and important infrastructure are persisting in spite of the institute being given several opportunities to rectify them, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate the earlier decision of the Council taken at its meeting on 29.03.2007 to recommend to the Central Government to withdraw the recognition of M.B;B.S. qualification granted by the institute under MAHE University, Manipal.

83. Continuance of recognition of MBBS course at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal granted by Manipal Academy of Higher Education(Deemed University).

Read: The Compliance Verification Inspection Report (7th & 8th May, 2009) along with the Council Inspectors Report (2nd & 3rd August, 2007) for Continuance of recognition of MBBS course at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal granted by Manipal Academy of Higher Education(Deemed University).

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Compliance Verification Inspection Report (7th & 8th May, 2009) along with the Council Inspectors Report (2nd & 3rd August, 2007) and observed as under:-

“The General Body of the Council at its meeting held on 10.03.2007 approved the recommendations of the Adhoc Committee/Executive Committee and Postgraduate Committee of withdrawal of recognition of MBBS degree and various postgraduate courses u/s 19 of the I.M.C. Act,1956.

Thereafter the Central Govt. vide its letter dated 25.04.2007 had requested the institute to rectify the deficiencies pointed out by the MCI before the admission of next batch of MBBS students for the academic year 2007-2008 starts. Vide another letter dated 27.04.2007, the Central Govt. directed the institute not to admit students for the MBBS course for the academic year 2007-2008 till such time the deficiencies were rectified and the rectification report was accepted by the Govt. However, vide letter dated 15.06.2007, the Central Govt. decided to allow the colleges to admit MBBS students for the academic year 2007-2008 without receiving any recommendation from the Council in this regard. The Central Govt. in its letter dated 05.06.2007 had referred to the compliance received from the Dean, Kasturba Medical College, Manipal further requesting the Council to verify the compliance report and submit its recommendations at the earliest. However, on scrutiny, it was observed that neither such compliance was attached with this letter nor any compliance was received in the office of the Council. The attention of the Central Govt. was drawn to this fact vide Council letter dated 21.06.2007. Thereafter, the compliance was received in the office of the Council on 24.06.2007. Vide letter dated 28.06.2007 the Council had informed the Central Govt. that in view of the deficiencies remaining as they are, the compliance submitted by the institute is completely unsatisfactory. The detailed report with the remarks of the Council on each point of the compliance was also enclosed with this letter.

Accordingly, as per Central Govt. letter dated 05.06.2007, an inspection to verify the compliance submitted by the institute was carried out by the Council Inspectors on 2nd & 3rd August,2007. The compliance verification inspection report was placed before the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 24th August,2007 where the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon’ble Supreme Court were also present. After due deliberations, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon’ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council observed as under:-

- “1. For the first time in the history of MCI inspection carried out by the inspection teams a video recording of the entire inspection was insisted by the University authorities. The reason given for this recording is lack of faith in Medical Council of India which was repeatedly mentioned by the Pro Chancellor and Pro Vice Chancellor named Dr.H.S.Ballal and Brig SS Pabla, respectively. The inspection team appraised them that such type of video recording was never done to the best of our knowledge. Inspection team told them that if at all they wanted to proceed in this regard then they should seek the MCI’s written permission. The college authorities later on came along with the personnel carrying video cameras. They mentioned that they have spoken to the Council and Council has not taken any objection for the same. To verify this claim the inspection team contacted the Council. We were told that this permission was never given and we should continue with our inspection. In spite of this the University officials continued with video recording with the help of 4 personnel each having video camera. It was also shocking note that the video recording was conveniently selective. The recording was not purposely done where there were glaring deficiencies. The recording was also done when the inspection work was not being done and the team was having a cup of tea.

The manner in which the entire video was done was extremely humiliating to the inspection team. There was constant interference in the work particularly from the Pro Vice chancellor. He was constantly arguing and was interfering with the Council’s work. The inspection team repeatedly mentioned to him that the team is supposed to interact with only the Dean of the institution.

The most shocking and painful incident occurred on 3rd August, 2007 in the afternoon. The confidential work after finishing the faculty and infrastructure verification was carried out in the hall adjacent to the Board Room. A Video camera person has suddenly entered in this room without taking the permission of the inspection team and started recording. On refusing the recording on confidential work Brig. Pabla, Pro Vice Chancellor of the Manipal University also entered in the room without permission started arguments, insulted the inspection team and used undemocratic language.

Since the video recording was done by the University in spite of refusal for the same by MCI, a copy of the same recording was requested by the inspection team as a matter of right in such hostile situation. The inspection team feared that this recording may be edited conveniently and may be misused for the selfish advantage of the college and university. Therefore the copy of the same was requested several times. In spite of these several requests the college/university showed total disregard to this simple request.

2. Shortage of staff is as under:-
- (a) The shortage of teaching faculty is 9.43% (25 out of 263)
 - (i) Professor – 3 (1F.Med., 2 Radiology)
 - (ii) Associate Professor 13 (1 Anat, 1 Phy, 1 Pharm, 3 Patho, 1 Micro, 1 For.Med, 1 Oph, 2 RD, 1 Ortho, 1 Anaes)
 - (iii) Assistant Professor 8 (1 Anat, 1 Lect.(Bio), 1 Pharm. Chem, 1 Micro, 2 TB, 2 Ortho)
 - (iv) Tutor 1 (Pharm)

- (b) The shortage of Residents is 79.51% as under (163 out of 205)
- (i) Sr. Resident 61 (10 Med, 5 Paed, 3 TB, 2 Derm, 1 Psy, 10 Surg, 5 Ortho., 2 ENT, 3 Oph, 7RD, 11 Anaes, 2 Gynae)
- (ii) Jr. Resident 102 (30 Med, 13 Paed, 5 TB, 1 Derm, 4 Psy, 26 Surg, 15 Ortho, 2 Oph, 3 ENT, 3 Gynae)

The inspection team asked Dean to give the details of the Faculty which have been appointed for rectifying the deficiency. In spite of the repeated request the details were not provided till about 2345 Hrs. on 3rd Aug.,07.

3. Melakka Manipal Medical College, Malaysia is a constituent institute of Manipal Academy of Higher Education admitting 125 students every six months. The students study pre and para clinical subjects at Manipal and clinical subjects in the Melakka campus. The students admitted in that college are provided training and teaching at Manipal.

Registrar, Manipal University vide their reference no.MU/REG/MCI dated May 19, 2007 has certified that Melaka Manipal Medical College (Manipal Campus), Manipal is a constituent college of Manipal University. The college has its own faculty and infrastructure and conducts its own academic programme.

The MCI inspection team has requested the University through Dean, Kasturba Medical College to provide the list of faculty teaching the students of Melaka Manipal Medical College at Manipal and show the infrastructure. The request was not considered. The University has said that this inspection is for Kasturba Medical College only. The MCI can ask directly regarding Melaka Manipal Medical College.

The MCI inspection team during its screening of the faculty observed that 3 staff members named Dr.Shripad Hebbar, Associate Professor, OBG, Dr.A.P.Manjunath, Associate Professor, OBG and Dr.Vinayak G, Assistant Professor, Paediatrics are going to Melaka Manipal Medical College, Malaysia for giving training in clinical subjects.

As per IMC Act, all the activities pertaining to the medical education in the country, falls in purview of this Act. This institution is carrying out medical teaching activity for 250 students from Malaysia for imparting preclinical, para clinical and even clinical training to these students. All this training is carried out in this campus and also in Mangalore campus of the same trust. The same infrastructure and the faculty is being utilized for the same. However, the college claims that there is separate staff and infrastructure for this activity. To verify this claim, the inspection team requested the college to show the separate infrastructure and the list of the separate faculty. The college refused to show the same. During the verification of faculty, three staff members had agreed that they were posted at Melaka campus in Malaysia for imparting training to the students of this program. Inspection team requested Dean to show the passport of the faculty for the verification. The Dean flatly refused to comply with this request. When probed, with some of the faculty, it was mentioned by them that they also teach Malaysian students. Since it was not possible to verify the separate infrastructure and the faculty for this program, due to the refusal from the college, documentary proof could not be obtained. However, since the inspection team found three faculty members working for this college and were also posted in Melaka campus. It is evident that most likely there is no separate staff and infrastructure. The college has shown total disregard to the IMC Act and wants to exploit the situation. Some of the faculty members and pro vice chancellor mentioned that there are other

programs are of similar nature. This matter is extremely serious and must be investigated.

4. There is a deficiency of 295 teaching beds & 10 units in the hospital owned by college as under:-

Speciality	Required Beds/Uni	Present Beds/Units	Deficiency if any
Medicine & Allied Specialities			
General Medicine	300/10	210/7	90/3
Paediatrics	150/5	120/4	30/1
TB & Chest	50/2	25/1	25/1
Surgery & Allied Specialities			
General Surgery	300/10	210/7	90/3
Obstetrics & Gynaecology			
Obstetrics & ANC	150/5	51/3	60/2
Gynaecology		39/3	
Total		90/3	
Grand Total	1280/43	985/33	295/13

Remarks: 1. The beds in each Unit in wards are not in continuity and there is no display.

- The distribution of beds and units are not as per Council norms.
- The deficiency of beds and units is indicated above.
- The college also utilizes 295 beds of the District Hospital, Udupi of which 90 beds are located in Govt. Maternity & Child Hospital, Udupi as per the GO No. 805 GM 2004 Bangalore dated 17.05.05. This hospital is located 4 kms away from the Medical College. This Distt. Hospital was not utilized by the college before May,2005. The terms of MoU are as under:-

“As mentioned in reasons cited above, Kasturba Medical College is permitted clinical training facilities for its students in Govt. Distt. Hospital, Udupi on condition that the said college provides 25% seats for the Govt. C.E.T.

1. Permission for clinical training facilities granted is for duration of 3 years.
2. For the present year clinical fees payable as per total number of seats may be paid in advance.
3. If the clinical facilities thus permitted are not utilized within 3 months, this order would stand cancelled.”

There is no financial or administrative control of the college over the hospital. There is no patient care control of the college in this hospital. The district hospital is located about 5 km away from the college.

It has been further observed that –

1. The infrastructure available as of today is not adequate for the consideration of the teaching hospital.
2. There is over crowding of beds with no teaching facilities/teaching area as per MCI norms.
3. There is no Medical Record department.
4. There are no records available of the students postings.

5. Patients are admitted with only unit number and department. There is no name of clinicians as indoor case paper under whom the patient has been admitted. Therefore, it is not clear that the Faculty from this college is responsible for the unit/patients.
6. Only basic investigations are done and the record is not maintained properly.
7. There are no teaching areas either in the OPD or Wards.
8. Residents postings was not available for the verification.
9. There were no offices given to the teaching staff.
10. There is another Hospital housing Gynae. and Pediatric sections is located at a distance of more than 1 kilometer away from this District Hospital.
11. Only 4 patients were there out of 30 beds in pediatric ward.
12. There is no clear cut demarcation of units in the Govt. Dt. Udupi Hospital.
13. In view of the above the District Hospital is not considered as a Teaching hospital.

In view of above, the beds at District Hospital, Udupi cannot be considered as teaching beds as no permission has been taken for utilization of District Hospital, Udupi either u/s 10A at the time of utilization or u/s 11(2) at the time of recognition of award of MBBS degree.

5. Health Centres : The College utilizes a NGO running center under the name of FPAI (Family Planning Association of India) located 3 kms away from the college as UHC which is not as per Regulations. One MD (PSM) is posted from the department and on the day of inspection he was present in the college. One medical officer from Rotary is running the OPD which is not as per Regulations. LMO is not available. Labour room, operation theatre, indoor beds, lab facility and lecture cum seminar room are not available. Occasionally students are posted at UHC. No posting records of the students and interns are available.
6. Hostels for Boys, Girls, Interns, Residents & Nurses: Separate Hostels for Boys, Girls, Interns, Residents and Nurses are not ear marked. There is a common pool of hostels for each of the above category with the name of "Hostels for Health Sciences" and include Medical, Dental, Physiotherapy, Pharmacy, Life Sciences and Nursing College.
7. Burns and Obstetrics ICUs. are not available.
8. Paramedical staff is grossly inadequate as under:-
Laboratory Technicians: 39
Laboratory Assistants: NIL
Laboratory Attendants: NIL
9. Central sterilization department has no Vertical Autoclaves, no bowl sterilizer, no Glove inspection machine and Ultrasound Instrument Cleaning Machine is non functional.
10. In the departments of Anatomy, Physiology, Pharmacology Pathology, Forensic Medicine and Community Medicine, the capacity of demonstration rooms is inadequate as 2 demonstration rooms of capacity of 125 each are required in all these departments.
11. Number of books in the Departmental libraries of Paediatrics, TB & Chest, Skin & VD, Psychiatry, Orthopaedics, Oto-Rhino-Laryngology and Radio-Diagnosis are inadequate.
12. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report."

The statutory position that the Ministry of Health, Govt. of India can pass orders under the Act for grant of recognitions only on the recommendations of the MCI in this behalf – which is an imperative statutory precondition, as has also been held by the Hon'ble Apex Court in its pronouncements including in the case of MCI Vs. State of Karnataka – (1998) 6 SCC 131 and has also been specifically stipulated in the statutory regulations also.

It is necessary to refer to the following observations of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in the case of MCI Vs. State of Karnataka:-

“.....A medical student requires gruelling study and that can be done only if proper facilities are available in a medical college and the hospital attached to it has to be well equipped and the teaching faculty and doctors have to be competent enough that when a medical student comes out, he is perfect in the science of treatment of human beings and is not found wanting in any way. The country does not want half-baked medical professionals coming out of medical colleges when they did not have full facilities of teaching and were not exposed to the patients and their ailments during the course of their study.....”

It is reemphasized that upon grant of recognition, the students passing out from a college recognized and included in the first schedule – become entitled for registration under the Act, necessarily required practicing medicine in India without any further restriction or limitation. For the protection of the patients, the law provides that the students who are not exposed to the adequate teaching and training with required infrastructural, teaching and other facilities, their degrees cannot be recognized and they cannot be granted registration for practicing medicine. A college which fails to continuously provide minimum required infrastructural, teaching and other facilities does not remain any more entitled to continue to make admissions in the medicine courses and is to be prohibited from doing so. In such cases, action under Section 19 of the Act for withdrawal of the recognition also becomes necessary.

If the students are being trained in an institution which does not have adequate teaching faculty or clinical material even after being in existence for a period of 6 years it would lead to a situation in which they would not be properly and adequately trained and taught in the practice of clinical medicine. Exposing the population at large to treatment by such students who have not been adequately trained because of paucity of teaching faculty and clinical material in the affiliated teaching hospital and qualified teaching faculty is not conducive for good quality medical treatment.

It has been the consistent stand of the Council that it is one of the basic theme of the statutory scheme of the Act that adequacy of clinical material and qualified teaching faculty is of paramount importance in continuing the recognition of the degree awarded by any medical institution. It is also reiterated that as the inspection report itself had shown gross deficiencies of teaching faculty, residents, clinical material and other infrastructural facilities, the quality of the education provided in such an institute wherein there are gross deficiencies as outlined above, would not only be substandard but such an institute would be producing doctors who would not have received education as per the standards which are applied to all the institutes in India.

In view of above and as the deficiencies of teaching faculty, teaching beds, distribution of units, availability of paramedical staff and other infrastructure are still persisting, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decisions taken at its meeting held on 22.5.2002 and as approved by the General Body of the Council presided over by the Administrator at its meeting held on 27.8.2002 and by the Executive Committee on 02.12.2006 wherein the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme court were also present to recommend to the Central Government to initiate action u/s 19 of the Indian Medical Council Act,1956 for withdrawal of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Manipal Academy of Higher Education in respect of students being trained at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal and further decided to request the Central Government to recall the permission given by the Central Govt. vide letter dated 15.06.2007 to admit the students for MBBS course during the current academic year 2007-2008 and to direct the institute not to make any further admissions in the MBBS course for

the academic year 2007-08. It was further decided to request the Central Government to direct the institute not to teach and train the students of Malekka Manipal Medical College, Malaysia unless evidence of creating additional facilities for training such students is submitted to the Central Government and prior permission of the Central Government is obtained for such an arrangement.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to record and convey to the concerned authorities its strong exception to the manner in which the University authorities tried to interfere with the inspection and also the manner in which the video recording of the inspection was done by the University authorities inspite of clear cut denial of permission for the same by the Inspectors and by the Secretary of the Council. It was further decided to request the Central Govt. not to take cognizance of video recording, if any, submitted by the institute as not only the video recording was not authorized, but also, as has been mentioned specifically by the Inspectors that only selective video recording was done as much as the video recording was not purposely done where there were glaring deficiencies and neither any copy of the video recording was given to the inspection team inspite of several requests made by the inspection team to the Vice-Chancellor of the University and to the Dean of the Institute.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council directed the office of the Council to send a copy of the communication to the Ministry of Human Resource Development, University Grants Commission, Health Secretary of Govt. of Karnataka and Director, Medical Education, Govt. of Karnataka for necessary action.”

The decision of the Committee was communicated to the Central Govt. vide Council office letter No. Kar.31(2)/2007-Med./15552, dated 17.09.2007 for its information & necessary action.

In this context, the Council office had received the copy of Notification dated 25.06.2008 issued by the Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & FW, New Delhi & published in Part-II, Section 3, Sub-Section (ii) of the Gazette of India. The contents of the Notification are as under:-

“.....
 In the said first Schedule against “Manipal University (Formerly known as Manipal Academy of Higher Education)(Deemed University), Manipal, Karnataka under the heading “Recongised Medical Qualification’ (in column (2)) and under the heading ‘Abbreviation for Registration” (in column(3)), the following shall be inserted, namely:-

(3)

(3)

Bachelor of Medicine and
 Bachelor of Surgery

This shall be a recognized medical qualification when granted by Manipal University (Formerly known as Manipal Academy of Higher Education)(Deemed University) Manipal, Karnataka when granted in or before the year 2008 in respect of students brained as Kasturba Medical College, Manipal, Karnataka and Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore, Karnataka

(No.U.12012/379/2006-ME(P-II))

(N. Barik)

Sd/-

Under Secretary to the Govt. of India.

Subsequently, the Council office had received a corrigendum dated 23.09.2008 issued by the Government of India, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhavan, New Delhi. The contents of the notification may be read as under: -

“[TO BE PUBLISHED IN PART II, SECTION 3, SUB-SECTION (ii) OF THE GAZETTE OF INDIA]

Government of India
Ministry of Health & Family Welfare
(Department of Health & Family Welfare)
Nirman Bhavan, New Delhi
23rd Sept., 2009

CORRIGENDUM

s.o. In partial modification to this Ministry's Notification No. U.12012/379/2006-ME(P-II) dated 25th June, 2008 under the heading “Aabbrevaiaion for Registration” (in column (3)), the conditions mentioned therein may be replaced by the following namely:-

“This shall be a recognized medical qualifiction when granted by Manipal Unviersity (Formerly Known as Manipal Academy of Higher Education (Deemed University) Manipal, Karnataka when granted in or before the year 2009 in respect of students trained at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal, Karnataka and Kastruba Medical College, Mangalore.”

[No.U.12012/379/2006-ME(P-II)]

--Sd./--

(N. Barik)

Under Secretary to the Govt. of India

Further, the Council office had received a copy of another notification dated 15.10.2008 issued by the Government of India, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Nirman Bhavan, New Delhi. The contents of the notification may be read as under: -

“[TO BE PUBLISHED IN PART II, SECTION 3, SUB-SECTION (ii) OF THE GAZETTE OF INDIA]

Government of India
Ministry of Health & Family Welfare
(Department of Health & Family Welfare)
Nirman Bhavan, New Delhi
Dated the 15th October, 2008.

NOTIFICATION

S.O. In exercise of the powers conferred by sub-section (4) of the section 19 of the Indian Medical Council Act, 1956(102 of 1956) and in supersession of Notification dated 25th June 2008 and corrigendum dated 23rd September 2008, the Central Government, after consulting the Medical Council of India and considering the representations made by the concerned medical institutions on the notices served upon them, hereby makes the following further amendments in the First Schedule to the said Act, namely:-

In the said First Schedule against “Manipal University(Formerly known as Manipal Academy of Higher Education)(Deemed University), Manipal, Karnataka under the heading ‘Recognized Medical Qualification’ [in column (2)] and under the heading ‘Abbreviation for Registration’ [in column (3)], the following shall be inserted namely: -

(2)	(3)
<p>Bachelor of Medicine and Bachelor of Surgery</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">M.B.B.S.</p> <p>This shall be a recognized medical qualification granted by Manipal University(Formerly known as Manipal Academy of Higher Education)(Deemed University) Manipal, Karnataka when granted in or before the year 2013 for intake capacity of 250 seats each at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal and Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore, Karnataka.</p> <p>This shall be a recognized medical qualification granted by Manipal University(Formerly known as Manipal Academy of Higher Education)(Deemed University) Manipal, Karnataka when granted from the year 2014 for intake capacity of 150 sets at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal and 100 seats at Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore, Karnataka.</p> <p>Continued recognition of MBBS degrees after the year 2014 and restoration of seats will be subject to rectification of all the deficiencies within a period of one year.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">[No.U.12012/379/2006-ME(P-II)]</p> <p style="text-align: right;">--Sd./-- (N. Barik) Under Secretary to the Govt. of India</p>

In reference to above, the Central Govt. vide its letter dated 13.03.2009 had forwarded the compliance report received from the Manipal University vide letter dated 18.02.2009. The Compliance report has been verified by way of inspection on 7th & 8th May, 2009”.

The members of the Executive Committee of the Council while perusing the Compliance Verification Inspection Report (7th & 8th May, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. The TMA Pai Hospital cannot be counted for additionality of beds for reasons given as under:-
 - (i) The hospital is located 5 kms away from the college.
 - (ii) This hospital which was earlier a 60 bedded hospital was discontinued for teaching and training in the year 2000 and was not shown as a teaching hospital in the subsequent MCI inspections.
 - (iii) The infrastructure available presently is not adequate for consideration as a teaching hospital.

- (iv) There is over crowding of beds. The space between two beds is 2 ft. or less with no circulation space between them.
- (v) The teaching facilities are not as per MCI norms. Most of the wards are not having nursing stations, side laboratories, pantry and doctors duty room. Position of nursing stations is not proper in the wards where they are available.
- (vi) Only basic investigations are carried out.
- (vii) No records of students posting was available.
- (viii) Schedule of faculty posting was not displayed and duty rosters were not available.

2. Resultantly, there is a deficiency of 150 teaching beds as under:-

Speciality	Required Beds/Units	Present Beds/Units	Deficiency
Medicine & Allied Specialities			
General Medicine	300/10	240/8	60 /2
Paediatrics	150/5	120/4	30/1
TB & Chest	50/2	50/2	-
Skin & VD	25/1	30/1	-
Psychiatry	25/1	30/1	-
Total	550/19	470/16	
Surgery & Allied Specialities			
General Surgery	300/10	270/9	30/1
Orthopaedics	150/5	150/5	-
Ophthalmology	50/2	60/2	-
ENT	50/2	60/2	-
Total	550/19	540/18	
Obstetrics & Gynaecology			
Obstetrics & ANC			
Gynaecology	150/5	120/4	30/1
Total			
Grand Total	1250/43	1130/38	150/5

3. The following teaching members cannot be counted due to reasons given hereunder:-

#	Name	Designation	Department	Remarks
1.	Dr. Rama Chandra Bhat	Professor	Anatomy	He is M.Sc. from science faculty. Smart Card has not been issued. Not counted.
2.	Dr. S S Karanth	Professor	Anatomy	M.Sc. from science faculty & Ph.D from London. Smart Card has not been issued. Not counted.
3.	Dr. Biswabina Ray M	Assoc. Prof.	Anatomy	Was absent.
4.	Dr. Muddanna S Rao	Assoc.Prof.	Anatomy	He is M.Sc. from science faculty. Smart Card has not been issued. Not counted
5.	Dr. Vanisri Nayak	Lecturer	Anatomy	She is teaching BDS students. Not counted.
6.	Dr. Lydia S Quadros	Lecturer	Anatomy	She is teaching BDS students. Not counted.
7.	Dr. R Huban Thomas	Lecturer	Anatomy	She is teaching BDS students. Not counted.

8.	Dr. Anjali Rao	Professor	Biochemistry	M.Sc. & Ph.D. from science faculty. Not counted.
9.	Dr. Sanjay Kumar K R	Asst. Prof.	Obst. & Gynae.	Does not possess the prescribed academic qualifications. Not counted.
10.	Dr. Ganesh Pai C	Professor	Medicine	Does not have the requisite 5 years teaching experience as Asst. Prof. and 4 years experience as Assoc.Prof. Not counted.
11.	Dr. Deepak Suvama	Assoc.Prof.	Medicine	Does not have the requisite 5 years teaching experience as Asst. Prof. Not counted.
12.	Dr. Nagaraj M V	Professor	Medicine	Does not have the requisite 5 years teaching experience as Asst. Prof. Not counted.
13.	Dr. Sathish Pai B	Professor	Skin & VD	Does not have the requisite 4 years teaching experience as Assoc. Prof. Not counted.
14.	Dr. Rahul Magazine	Asst.Prof.	TB & Chest	He is MD (Medicine) and Dip. in TB & Chest. Not counted.
15.	Dr. Manumohan K	Asst. Prof.	TB & Chest	Does not possess the prescribed academic qualifications. Not counted.
16.	Dr. Prasanth Kumar M	Professor	Radio Diagnosis	Does not possess the prescribed academic qualifications. Not counted.
17.	Dr. Smiti S	Asst.Prof.	Radio Diagnosis	Does not possess the prescribed academic qualifications. Not counted.
18.	Dr. Lavanya G Rao	Professor	Ophthalmology	Does not possess the requisite 5 years teaching experience as Asst.Prof. Not counted.
19.	Dr. Suresh Pillai	Assoc. Prof.	ENT	Does not possess the prescribed academic qualifications. Not counted.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give 2 (two) months time to the authorities of Kasturba Medical College, Manipal to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period.

84. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Sri Ramachandra Medical College and Research Institute (Deemed University) in respect of students being trained at Sri Ramachandra Medical College, Porur, Chennai.

Read: The Compliance Verification Inspection Report (2nd June 2009) along with the Council Inspectors Report (19th & 20th March, 2009) for Continuance of recognition of MBBS course at Sri Ramachandra Medical College, Porur, Chennai granted by Sri Ramachandra Medical College and Research Institute (Deemed University).

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Compliance Verification Inspection Report (2nd June 2009) along with the Council Inspectors Report (19th & 20th March, 2009) and decided to recommend that recognition of MBBS degree granted by Sri Ramachandra Medical College and Research Institute (Deemed University) in respect of students being trained at Sri Ramachandra Medical College, Porur, Chennai be continued restricting the number of admission to 150(One Hundred Fifty) students.

85. Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Annamalai University, Annamalai Nagar in respect of students being trained at Rajah Muthiah Medical College, Annamalai.

Read: The Council inspector report (1st & 2nd September 2009) for Continuance of recognition of MBBS degree granted by Annamalai University in respect of students being trained at Rajah Muthiah Medical College, Annamalai.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council inspector report (1st & 2nd September 2009) and noted the following:-

1. The shortage of teaching staff required at present stage is as under:-
 - (a) The shortage of teaching faculty is 9.8% (i.e. 24 out of 244) as under:-
 - (i) Professor : Nil
 - (ii) Associate Professor : 07 (Anatomy -2, Forensic Medicine -2, Surgery -1, Anaesthesia -2)
 - (iii) Assistant Professor : 17 (Anatomy -1, Pharmacology -2, Pathology -1, Microbiology -1, Surgery -1, Orthopaedics -1, Community Medicine -1, Anaesthesia -5, Radiology -4)
 - (iv) Tutor : Nil
 - (b) The shortage of Residents is 27.8% (i.e. 32 out 115) as under :-
 - (i) Sr. Resident : 28 (General Medicine -6, TB & Chest -1, Skin & VD -1, Psychiatry -1, General Surgery -5, ENT -1, Ophthalmology -1, Obst. & Gynae. -3, Anaesthesia -5, Radiology -4)
 - (ii) Jr. Resident : 04 (TB & Chest -2 & Psychiatry -2)
2. Registration and Medical Record Section: Registration counter is not computerized.
3. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to give 2 (two) months time to the authorities of Rajah Muthiah Medical College, Annamalai to rectify the above deficiencies and submit the compliance within the stipulated period. Copy of the letter be also marked to Secretary (Medical Education), DME of the concerned State Govt., Registrar of the University to which the college is affiliated and also to the member of MCI representing the State where the college is located.

86. Admissions of excess students under Management quota at various private Medical colleges in the State of Kerala in the academic year 2008-09.

Read: The matter with regard to excess admission made by various Medical Colleges/Institutions in the State of Kerala in the academic year 2008-09.

The Executive Committee of the Council noted that the matter with regard to admissions of excess students under Management quota at various private medical colleges in the State of Kerala for the academic year 2008-09 was considered by the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council at its meeting held on 10.11.2008 and the operative part of the decision is as under:-

“

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council after detailed deliberations decided that suitable communication be sent to the concerned State Govt. for the respective medical colleges/institutions where the admission have been made by them in excess for the academic year 2008-09 by calling upon them to correspondingly reduce the admissions in Management quota for such colleges for the academic year 2009-10 and for corresponding increased allocation of the free seat candidates by the concerned State Govt. for the academic year 2009-10 so as to set off the undue advantage gained by such medical colleges/institutions by making excess admissions in the management quota in the academic year 2008-09.”

The decision of the Executive Committee was communicated on 08.12.2008 to the Secretary (Health) & DME, Thiruvananthapuram with the copy to the concerned college authorities.

The Council office has received a letter No. 25899/Ss/09/H&FWD, dated 11.08.2009 from the Secretary, Govt. of Kerala, Health FW (S) Deptt. Thiruvananthapuram forwarding therewith a copy of its earlier letter NO. 25899/Ss/09/H&FWD, dated 03.07.2009 whereof the contents of the letter dated 03.07.2009 reads as under:-:-

“I am to invite your attention to the reference cited. As per the agreement entered into with the Private Medical College Management Association, Management concerned shall be entitled to fill those seats remaining unfilled on a particular date and Govt. have no claim over such seats after that particular date. But later Government have directed those colleges to surrender such seats to Government during the next academic/ year, if any, such excess admission is done.

As the above direction of Govt. is against the agreement entered into with the Private Medical college Association, the direction of the Govt. to surrender such seats to Government is hereby cancelled.”

In view of above, the Executive Committee of the Council noted the communication from the State Govt. of Kerala and decided to apprise the Secretary, Health & F.W. Department of the decision of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in Mridul Dhar's case for further necessary action by the Government of Kerala.

87. Amendments in “Minimum Standard Requirements for the Medical College for 50/100/150 Admissions Annually Regulations, 1999” – consideration of.

Read: The matter with regard to amendments in “Minimum Standard Requirements for the Medical College for 50/100/150 Admissions Annually Regulations, 1999”.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the matter with regard to amendments in “Minimum Standard Requirements for the Medical College for 50/100/150 Admissions Annually Regulations, 1999 and noted the following:-

The Council after obtaining the approval from the Central Government, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, New Delhi u/s 33 of the IMC Act, 1956 has notified the Amendments pertaining to Land Requirement, which reads as under:-

“The medical college or medical institution shall be housed in a unitary campus of not less than 25 acres of land. However, this may be relaxed in a place especially in Urban areas where the population is more than 25 lakhs, hilly areas, and notified tribal areas where the land shall not be in more than two pieces and the distance between the two pieces shall not be more than 10 kms. The hospital, college building including library and hostels for the students, interns, PGs/Residents and nurses shall be in one piece of land which shall not be less than 10 acres. Other facilities may be housed in the other piece of land. Proper landscaping should be done.”

Thereafter, there was a meeting held on 19.08.2009, chaired by the Hon'ble Health & Family Welfare Minister with the President and officials of the Medical Council of India, wherein it was decided as under:-

- “1. *Minimum Standard Requirements for the Medical Colleges Regulations, 1999.*
 - i. *Land requirement for the campus: Instead of having uniform land requirement throughout the country, there may be the following separate categories of cases.*
 - a. *Category I: The minimum land requirement may be fixed at 20 acres throughout the country, except in the case of Category II. In North-Eastern states, Hill States, EAG states under NRHM and Union Territories of Andaman & Nicobar Islands, land may be divided in not more than two parcels with a distance of less than 10 kms separating them. Land separated by a road or canal, connected with a bridge, would be treated as one piece of land.*
 - b. *Category II: In metropolitan and A-grade cities the permissible FAR would be the criterion for allowing medical colleges. MCI would propose the total built up (floor) area required for adequate infra-structure including hostels, hospitals, libraries etc. in an area of not less than 10 acres.*
 - ii. *Public Private Partnership (PPP) model: The Council has worked out a PPP model for NRHM States, North-Eastern States, Hill States and Hilly districts of other States and the proposal in this regard has been submitted to the Central Government vide letter dated 05.05.2009. Keeping in view the recommendations of the Mudaliar Committee, it was decided that such PPP model as proposed by the Council be allowed in North-Eastern States, Hill States and in those States where the number of medical colleges are less than the ratio prescribed by the Mudaliar Committee Report (i.e. one medical college per 50 lakh population) and in the Union Territories of Andaman & Nicobar Islands, Lakshadweep, Dadra & Nagar Haveli and Daman & Diu.*
 - iii. *Bed Strength: It was decided that for North-Eastern States and Hill States, the bed strength of teaching hospitals may be amended as under:-*
 - a. *For 50 Seats Medical College: 200 beds at the time of LOP which shall be increased to 400 beds at the time of recognition. The bed occupancy will be 60 per cent at the time of LOP which will increase up to 80 per cent in subsequent yearly renewals.*
 - b. *For 100 Seats Medical College: 250 beds at the time of LOP, which shall be increased to 500 beds at the time of recognition. The bed occupancy would be 70 per cent at the time of LOP and will increase to 80 per cent in subsequent yearly renewals.”*

In view of above, after due and detailed deliberations, the Executive Committee decided to approve the following amendments in “Minimum Standard Requirements for the Medical College for 50/100/150 Admissions Annually Regulations, 1999” and “Establishment of Medical college regulations, 1999”.

(A) Amendment in Minimum Standard Requirement Regulations, 1999:

- (I) In Schedule I Clause A.1.1. under the heading 'Campus' shall be substituted with the following:

“The medical college or medical institution shall be housed in a unitary campus of not less than 20 acres of land except in metropolitan and A grade cities. However, this may be relaxed in a place especially in Urban areas where the population is more than 25 lakhs, hilly areas, notified tribal areas, North Eastern States, Hill states and Union Territories of Andoman & Nicobar Islands, Daman & Div & Dabra & Nagar Haveli, where the land shall not be in more than two pieces and the distance between the two pieces shall not be more than 10 kms. The hospital, college building including library and hostels for the students, interns, PGs/Residents and nurses shall be in one piece of land which shall not be less than 10 acres. Other facilities may be housed in the other piece of land. Proper landscaping should be done.

However, in metropolitan cities and “A” grade cities, the permissible FAR/FSI would be the criterion for allowing the medical colleges provided that the total built up area required for adequate infrastructure including medical college, hospital, hostels, residential quarters, and other infrastructure required as per Minimum Standard requirement Regulations is made available in an area of not less than 10 acres based upon the permissible FAR/FSI allowed by the competent authority.”

- (II) In Schedule I Clause B.1.1. as amended vide notification dated 1.12.2008, under the heading “General Remarks”, the following shall be added:

“ In North-Eastern States, Hill States and in those States where the number of medical colleges are less than the ratio prescribed by the Mudaliar Committee Report (i.e. one medical college per 50 lakh population) and in the Union Territories of Andaman & Nicobar Islands, Lakshadweep, Dadra & Nagar Haveli and Daman & Diu, Public Private Partnership shall be allowed to utilize the Government Hospitals, District Hospitals or the Civil Hospital owned by the Central or State Government or by the Public Sector Undertakings, Local Bodies etc. as teaching hospital attached to the medical college on Public Private Partnership basis provided that the clinical, administrative, financial and academic control of the teaching beds in such hospitals shall be vested with the Dean of the concerned medical college and the ‘teaching doctor’ shall also be the ‘treating doctor’. However, this arrangement shall not relax any norms of land requirement for establishment of a new medical college. This should be clearly spelt out in the MoU between the applicant institution and the concerned government/local bodies which otherwise owns the hospital and which should not be for a period of less than 33 years. All the departments of the affiliated teaching hospital should be covered under the MoU and brought under the control of the Dean/Principal of the medical college”.

(III) Clause B.1.8 in the General Remarks under the heading “Teaching Hospital” shall be substituted as under:-

“ Indoor beds occupancy – Average occupancy of indoor beds shall be a minimum of 80% ,
 Provided that it shall be minimum 60% at the time of inception which shall be increased to 80% for subsequent annul renewals for a college having annual intake of 50 students in North Eastern States and Hill States and it shall be minimum 70 % at the time of inception which shall be increased to 80% for subsequent annul renewals for a college having annual intake of 100 students in North Eastern States and Hill States.”

(B) Amendment in Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999:

- (I) In Qualifying Criteria 2(5) prescribed in the scheme for obtaining permission of the Central Government to establish a medical college the following shall be substituted as under:

“ That the person owns and manages a hospital of not less than 300 beds with necessary infrastructural facilities capable of being developed into teaching institution in the campus of the proposed medical college.

Provided that in North Easterns State and Hill States, the beds strength required at the time of inception shall be 200 beds, which shall be increased to 400 beds at the time of recognition for a medical college having annual intake of 50 students and it shall be 250 beds at the time of inception which shall be increased to 500 beds at the time of recognition for a medical college having annual intake of 100 students.”

The minutes of this item were read out and confirmed in the meeting itself and it was decided that the decision be sent to the members of the General Body of the Council by circulation immediately for consideration and sending their decision within 10 days.

88. Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur - Renewal of permission for admission of 5th batch of students for the academic session 2009-2010.

Read: The matter with regard to Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur - Renewal of permission for admission of 5th batch of students for the academic session 2009-2010.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the matter with regard to renewal of permission for admission of 5th batch of students in Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur (MP), for academic session 2009-10 and observed as under :-

The Executive Committee of the Council had considered the matter with regard to renewal of permission for admission of 5th batch of students for the academic session 2009-2010 at Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur at its meeting held on 10-11 June, 2009 and had decided as under:-

An inspection for renewal of permission for admission of 5th batch of students for the academic session 2009-2010 at Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur was carried out by the Council Inspectors on 6th & 7th March, 2009. The inspection report was considered by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 13.03.2009 and it was decided as under:-

“The Executive Committee considered the Council Inspectors report (6th & 7th March, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. Clinical material: The OPD attendance as submitted by the Medical Superintendent and recorded in the registration counter on the day of inspection was 1280. However, on physical verification of the same by the inspection team, it was found that the OPD attendance was 500.
2. RHTC Ratua : Mess facilities are not available.
3. Hostels : One block of 48 double seater rooms each for boys hostel and girls hostel are under construction. The hostel accommodation for

undergraduate students is available for 576 against the requirement of 750 as per Regulations.

4. Interns hostel for 80 boys and 80 girls is under construction.
5. Number of books in the departmental libraries of Skin & V.D. are inadequate.
6. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5th batch of MBBS students for the academic year 2009-10 at Peoples College of Medical Sciences, Bhanpur.”

The above decision of the Executive Committee was communicated to the Central Govt. vide Council letter dated 13.03.2009 with copy to the college authorities with the request to submit the compliance in respect of the deficiencies pointed out as above within two weeks.

In reference to above, the college authorities vide letter dated 02.04.2009 had submitted the compliance on rectification of the deficiencies pointed out in the Council inspectors report (6th & 7th March, 2009) which was verified by the Council inspectors by way of inspection on 15th April, 2009.

The compliance verification inspection report was considered by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 27th April, 2009 and it was decided as under:-

“The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification report (15th April, 2009) along with the Council Inspectors report on (6th & 7th March, 2009) and noted the following:-

1. The shortage of teaching staff is as under:-

- (a) Faculty 11.9% (i.e. 20 out of 168) as under:-

Sl. No.	Designation	Numbers	Department
i).	Professor	02	(ENT -1 & Obst. & Gynae. -1)
ii).	Assoc. Prof.	06	(Pharmacology -1, General Medicine -2, Orthopaedics -1, Anaesthesia -1 & Radio Diagnosis -1)
iii).	Asst. Prof.	03	(Lect. Bio. -1, Pharma.Chemist-1, Statistician -1)
iv).	Tutor	09	(Anatomy -1, Physiology -6, Biochemistry -1 & Community Medicine -1)

- (b) Resident 42.1% (i.e. 48 out of 114) as under:-

Sl. No.	Designation	Numbers	Department
i)	Sr. Resident	13	(General Medicine -5, Paediatrics -1, General Surgery -2, Orthopaedics -2, Anaesthesia -3)
ii)	Jr. Resident	35	(General Medicine -13, Paediatrics -2, TB & Chest -2, Psychiatry -1, General Surgery -12, Orthopaedics -1, ENT-1 & Obst. & Gynae. -3)

2. Clinical material is inadequate in terms of bed occupancy, radiological investigations and OPD attendance as under:-

	Day of Inspection
O.P.D. attendance	803
Bed occupancy%	59.7%
<u>Radiological Investigations</u>	
X-ray	60
Ultrasonography	02
Special Investigations	04
C.T. Scan	06

- The OPD attendance as submitted by the Medical Superintendent and recorded in the registration counter on the day of inspection was 1224. However, on physical verification of the same by the inspection team, it was found that the OPD attendance was 803.
- Clinical material is inadequate in terms of OPD attendance, casualty attendance, bed occupancy, operative work (number of minor surgeries, normal deliveries and LSCS) & radiological & laboratory investigations. Total number of samples collected on the day of inspection were 110 sample of blood, 98 sample of urine, 3 units of body fluids. The number of unit of blood issued on the day of inspection were only 3.
- The faculty members/resident doctors in all clinical departments do not maintain any register about the number of patients examined by them as well as their provisional diagnosis.

OPD attendance & bed occupancy on the day of inspection as physically verified by the inspection team.

DEPARTMENT	OPD ATTENDANCE	BED OCCUPANCY
General Surgery	71	97/180
Orthopaedics	91	54/90
ENT	64	16/30
Ophthalmology	83	17/30
Obst. & Gynae.	94	61/90
General Medicine	201	108/180
Paediatrics	94	57/90
TB & Chest	40	22/30
Skin & VD	42	12/15
Psychiatry	23	04/15
Total	803	448/750 = 59.7%

The OPD attendance & bed occupancy was recorded from various OPD and IPD Registers in the presence of Medical Superintendent. However, he refused to sign the data which was recorded in his presence.

3. The hostel accommodation is available for 576 students against the requirement of 750 beds at this stage. Deficiency remains as it is. The new hostel is under construction and not functional at present.
4. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the main report.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of

5th batch of MBBS students for the academic year 2009-10 at Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur.”

The decision of the Executive Committee was communicated to the institute by email dated 27th April, 2009 and by courier on 28th April, 2009 further requesting the institute to submit the compliance with documentary evidence in respect of deficiencies pointed out on or before 8th May, 2009 positively in person. It was once again sent by email on 29th April, 2009. It was confirmed that the email was displayed on the recipient computer on 29th April, 2009 at 2.08 p.m. However, the institute instead of submitting the compliance vide its letter dated 1.5.2009 had submitted that it has not received email due to certain technical problems. The institute further requested to hand over the inspection report to Mr. Ambrish Sharma, Director, Administration or to Col. Ashok Khurana, Director, Planning & Development. Accordingly, copy of the inspection report was handed over personally to the representatives of the institute who came to the office of the Council. The receipt of the inspection report was confirmed by the institute vide its letter dated 6th May, 2009 stating that the duly signed inspection report of the MCI was received on 4th May, 2009.

Vide letter dated 2nd May, 2009, the institute had raised certain issues and reiterated by their letters dated 7th and 8th May, 2009. The Council vide its letter dated 9th May, 2009 had clarified all those issues and further requested the Institute to submit its compliance on 13.5.2009. The Dean of the Institute Dr. V.K. Pandya alongwith Col. Ashok Khurana attended the office on 13th May, 2009 wherein instead of submitting the compliance, they submitted a copy of the letter dated 12th May, 2009. Vide another letter dated 25th May and 26th May, 2009, stating that there does not exist deficiencies in the college.

After considering the submissions made by the institute in its communications as cited above, the Council Office vide its letter dated 30th May, 2009 once again clarified the matter and thereafter once again requesting the institute to submit its detailed pointwise compliance in respect of deficiencies pointed out by the Council Inspectors in-person by 2nd June, 2009. This communication was sent by fax, courier and email. In response, the institute vide its letter dated 1st June, 2009 reiterated its submission and has not submitted its compliance.

Meanwhile, three notices from the office of the S.H.O., Nishatpura Police Station, District Bhopal, MP in the name of Dr. Kamlesh Kohli, former Professor, Lady Hardinge Medical College, New Delhi and Whole Time Inspector, MCI, Dr. Sushma Vashisht, former Professor of AIIMS and Whole Time Inspector, MCI & Dr. R.C. Siwach, Prof. & Head of Orthopaedic, Pd. BD Sharma PG Instt. of Medical Sciences, Rohtak have been delivered personally in the office of the Council. As per notices, it has been alleged that during the inspection on 15th April, 2009 at People's Medical College and Hospital, Bhanpur, Bhopal, the above said three inspectors have misbehaved with the Doctors, patients and Safai-karamcharis by speaking abusive language and by threatening them and also to prepare a false report. These allegations against the eminent medical professionals comprising of the inspection team are entirely untrue and are false.

It was further observed that on verification of experience as shown by the teaching faculty in his/her Declaration Forms, the following teachers have shown false teaching experience as under :-

Sl. No.	Name of Doctor	Design & Department	Experience submitted in Declaration Forms	Experience stated by the respective institute.
1.	Dr. Rakesh Bishwas	Prof. of Medicine	25.3.2004 – 25.5.2004 as Asstt.Prof. and 26.5.2004 to 7.1.2006 as Assoc.Prof. at Vydehi Institute.	25.3.2004 to 7.1.2006 as Assoc.Prof.
2.	Dr. Suresh V. Kulkarni	Prof. of TB & Chest Diseases	1. 29.7.2002 – 1.2.2005 as Professor at MIMSR, Latur. 2. 7.7.2007 to 5.7.2008 as Prof. at SS Institute, Davangere. 3. 1.4.79 to 10.5.1984 as Asstt.Prof. and 11.5.84 to 25.6.88 as Assoc.Prof. at Govt. Medical College, Miraj..	29.7.2002 to 1.2.2002 as Lecturer 7.7.2007 to 30.11.2007 as Prof at SS Instt., Davangere. He has not worked at the institute on the dates
3.	Dr. Satish Pathak	Prof. of Radio-Diagnosis	21.11.2005 – 2.3.2006 as Prof. at Somaiya Medical College, Mumbai	21.11.2005 to 28.2.2006 as Prof.
4.	Dr. Subhash N. Lulay	Prof. of ENT	14.1.2007-23.7.2007 as Prof. at CIMS, Bilaspur	24.1.2007 to 23.7.2007 as Prof.
5.	Dr. Nandkishore Kachru Lal Agrawal	Assoc. Prof. of Anaesthesiology	9.10.89 to 31.03.2001 as Asstt. Prof. at GMC, Nagpur.	10.10.89 to 1.3.2001
6.	Dr. Arindam Kanta Banerjee	Assoc. Prof. of Surgery	28.12.06 to 31.01.2008 as Asstt.Prof. at CARIMS, Karimnagar.	02.01.2007 to 31.01.2008

The Executive Committee of the Council was, therefore, clearly of the view that the Council should take steps for referring these cases to the concerned authorities for taking necessary action after conducting investigations in accordance with law in all such cases. With the management of the colleges, the necessary action should also be taken against the management of those colleges. It was further decided that appropriate action be taken against these Doctors and the Principal of the college in accordance with Professional Conduct (Etiquette and Ethics) Regulations, 2002.

In view of above and Govt. of India letter dt. 15/3/2005 issued after the directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in case of Mridul Dhar V/s. UOI & Ors. directing the Council to strictly adhere to the time schedule prescribed under the regulations, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision taken at its meeting held on 27th April, 2009 to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5th batch of MBBS students for the academic year 2009-10 at Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur." The above decision was communicated to the Central Govt. vide Council letter dated 14.06.2009.

Subsequently, the Council office had received a fax/letter No.V. 12025/7/2009-DE/ME dated 23.06.2009 from the Central Government, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, New Delhi wherein it was mentioned as under:-

“A number of recommendations have been received from MCI/DCI for non-renewal of permission in certain medical/dental colleges for the academic year 2009-2010. Consequently any stoppage of admissions of new batches in existing medical/dental colleges can lead to medical/dental manpower loss and under utilization of financial/non-financial resources in both government & private sectors.

2. It has been further observed that the deficiencies pointed out by the Councils in some medical/dental colleges are marginal and by now these deficiencies would, perhaps have been rectified. It was, therefore, felt that the colleges are to be given an opportunity to show the preparedness for admitting fresh batch of students.

3. Keeping in view the fact that there is severe shortage of medical/dental personnel in the country and the time constraint in re-inspection of these colleges, it has been decided by the competent authority in the Ministry that MCI/DCI may re-inspect all the renewal cases/obtain and verify compliance report where Councils have given recommendations for non-renewal / cases where reduced intake has been recommended, and send their recommendations to this Ministry by **Wednesday, the 8th July, 2009** positively. The Ministry will, however, take final decision on the revised recommendations by 15.7.2009 which is the last date for grant for permission.”

The matter was discussed with the President, Medical Council of India and as per his directions, the college authorities vide letter dated 24.06.2009 were requested to submit the compliance on rectification of all the deficiencies by 25th June, 2009.

The above letter was also considered by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 26.06.2009. The operative part of the decision of the Executive Committee reads as under:-

“..... It was further observed that upon receipt of the letter from the Central Government, Ministry of Health & F.W. dated 23rd June, 2009, the Council Office had initiated action of inviting the compliances from the concerned medical colleges.

After due deliberations and keeping in view the fact that there is a severe shortage of medical personnel in the country, the members of the Executive Committee decided to accede to the request of the Central Government and to carry out inspections in respect of medical colleges where negative recommendations have been sent by the Council to the Central Government, Ministry of Health & F.W. and the colleges have submitted their compliances which are satisfactory.”

In reference to above, the college authorities vide letter dated 24.06.2009 had submitted the compliance on rectification of the deficiencies pointed out in the Council inspectors report (6th & 7th March, 2009) and for the verification whereof, inspection by the inspection team of the Council was conducted on 27th June, 2009.

Meanwhile, on 9th July, 2009 – i.e. on the day of meeting of the Executive Committee, the Council office received from the Central Govt. a complaint made by Shri Kailash Joshi, Member of Parliament (MP) against Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhanpur forwarded by the Central Govt. vide letter dated 7th July, 2009, stating as under:-

“I am directed to enclose herewith a copy of letter dated 02.06.2009 received From Shri Kailash Joshi, M.P. alongwith its enclosures regarding People’s Medical College, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh.

You are, therefore, requested to enquire into the matter and submit its report to this Ministry at the earliest.”

“The matter alongwith the compliant of Sh. Kailash Joshi was placed before the Executive Committee for its consideration at its meeting held on 9th July, 2009 and decided as under:-

In view of above, the members of the Executive Committee decided to defer the consideration of the inspection report (27th June, 2009) carried out by the Council Inspectors and further decided to enquire into the matter with regard to the allegations made out in the Govt. of India letter dated 7th July, 2009.”

The above decided was communicated to the Central Govt. vide Council letter dated 11.07.2009.

In reference to above, Deputy Secretary, Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, New Delhi vide letter dated 15.07.2009 requesting the Council “to send the recommendations based on the inspection carried out on 27th June, 2009 for the academic year 2009-10 in respect of People’s College of Medical Sciences, Bhopal, M.P. today by 3.00 p.m. so that the Ministry can take a decision in the matter today itself as 15th July, 2009 is the last date.

He had further requested the Council to continue to hold an enquiry to complaint sent by the Central Govt. on 9th July, 2009. A report on the compliant to be sent to the Ministry subsequently.”

Subsequently, an inspection to verify the teaching faculty and residents and further to verify the complaint, was carried out on 17th July, 2009. The perusal of the inspection report dated 17.7.09 reveals as under : -

1. The following faculty members have not been counted as they have been found practicing during college hours : -

Sl. No.	Name	Designation	Department
1.	Dr. Virendra Singh Chowdhury	Asst. Prof.	Medicine
2.	Dr. Rajesh Govind Gattani	Assoc. Prof.	Surgery
3.	Dr. Preeti Rajesh Gattani	Assoc. Prof.	Obst. & Gynae.
4.	Dr. Santosh K. Gokul Prasad Gupta	Professor	Pathology
5.	Dr. Yagnesh Shirish Thakor	Professor	Microbiology

2. The following residents have given the undertaking that they are practicing and, therefore, they cannot be considered : -

#	Name	Designation	Department
1.	Dr. Depak Kumar Jain	Senior Resident	Anaesthesia
2.	Dr. Nitin Shrivastava	Junior Resident	ENT
3.	Dr. Supriya Rai	Senior Resident	Obst. & Gynae.
4.	Dr. Harpal Singh	Senior Resident	Ophthalmology
5.	Dr. B.L. Sharma	Junior Resident	Ophthalmology
6.	Dr. Manish Dwivedi	Senior Resident	Orthopaedics
7.	Dr. Santosh Anand	Senior Resident	Orthopaedics
8.	Dr. Syed Tariq Mahmood	Senior Resident	Orthopaedics
9.	Dr. Kavindra Singh Thakur	Junior Resident	Orthopaedics
10.	Dr. Vikas Singh	Junior Resident	Orthopaedics
11.	Dr. Nalini Bhardwaj	Senior Resident	Radio Diagnosis
12.	Dr. Rajesh Lomare	Senior Resident	General Surgery
13.	Dr. Rahul Sharma	Senior Resident	General Surgery
14.	Dr. Nitin Pandya	Senior Resident	Skin & VD

The matter was placed before the Executive Committee of this Council at its meeting held on 27th July, 2009 along with the letter dated 24.07.2009 received from the Council Advocate with regard to intervention application filed by Shri Abhilash Pandey in W.P. No. 10263/08 (PIL) before the Hon'ble High court of M.P. the committee decided as under:-

“The Court has directed me to reply to the intervention application. We had already submitted the medical report of the inspection conducted on People's College on 17th July, 2009. I have submitted the copies before the Court. On the basis of that report kindly prepare parawise comments and send it to me before 18th August, 2009, on that date the case is again listed for further hearing.

Meanwhile the Court has directed the petitioner's counsel to make the College as one of the Respondents. After hearing the Counsel for the College as well as the petitioner the Court may direct to place the inspection report of the 17th July, 2009 conducted by MCI before the Central Government for permitting the students to be admitted in this year. The petitioner's counsel submitted that there is a stay for admission of students in the current year.

The Court has taken the report on record.

Dr. (Mrs.) Malti Mehra has appeared along with me and explained to the Court how the inspection committee does the inspection job. She has specifically mentioned the status of the infrastructure as well as the staff position of June 2009 as well as 17th July, 2009 position.

As you are aware this is a Public Interest Litigation pertaining to 4 private colleges. We have conducted the inspection of the other colleges also during January 2009 and the report has already been submitted in another case. The Court has asked me specifically what action MCI has taken after identifying the Doctors who had falsely represented before the inspection committee and gave false declaration to the effect that they are working only in that particular college and nowhere else. I have submitted that we have taken steps to take action against them in as much as in 76 cases or so we have filed FIR and other matters are referred to Ethics Committee. The Court opined that the Court is anxiously waiting to see the outcome of the action taken by MCI towards the defaulting Colleges.

It is also to bring to your kind notice that during the argument the Court is of the view that this report will be placed directly before the Central Govt. admittedly this has not come in his order sheet. Under such circumstances I am of the view that

you may not place this inspection report before the Executive Committee which is to be convened soon and await for the Court order.

It is also bring to your kind notice that the petitioner has also made amendment to the petition, application of which is handed over to Mr. Jagtar Singh. We have also been directed to file reply to the same also before 18.08.2009.”

Under these circumstances, the members of the Executive Committee of the Council had decided to defer the consideration of the matter.

It is also to point out here that the Hon’ble Supreme Court of India in WP(C) No.327-329/2009 filed by the Institute, had passed the order dated 21.08.2009, which is as under:-

“The petitioner’s college People’s College of Medical Sciences and Research Centre, Bhanpur, Bhopl was earlier inspected by Council of India. Learned counsel for the medical Council of India submits that the process of inspection is not over and as soon as the inspection is over, the report will be sent to the Union of India. The Union of India after receiving the Report will take appropriate decision within a reasonable time.”

The Council office vide letter dated 24.08.2009 addressed to the Institute, had stated that 15 teachers were absent at the MCI inspection of the Institute on 17.7.09 and, therefore, the complaint with regard to these medical teachers could not be verified. Further, the details of 5 teachers who had submitted false teaching experience at the time of previous inspection of the Institute, and who were absent during the inspection on 17.7.09, and therefore the details of experience with regard to these 5 teachers also could not be verified. The Institute was requested to send comments and the present status of these teachers at the earliest.

The Institute vide its letter dated 29.08.2009 had submitted its comments and the present status of the medical teachers mentioned in MCI letter dated 24.8.09. A perusal of the reply revealed that although it was mentioned that annexures 1 to 18 are enclosed with the reply of the Institute dated 29.8.09; no such annexures were received in the office of the Council alongwith the said letter dated 29.8.09.

Meanwhile, the Hon’ble High Court of Jabalpur, Madhya Pradesh in W.P. No. 10263/2008 had passed an order dated 27.08.2009, inter-alia, observing that the Hon'ble M.P. High Court had required the MCI to consider the case of the petitioner and other colleges on their own merits which will include all relevant aspects. The Hon'ble High Court had also referred to the order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court dated 21.8.09 wherein it had been observed that the as soon as the inspectin of the MCI is over, the report will be sent tot eh Union of India and the Union of India will pass the order. The Hon'ble High Court further observed that the MCI and Union of India are to be guided by the order of the Hon'ble Supreme Court dated 21.8.09. The operative part of the order dated 27.8.09 passed by the Hon'ble High Court is reproduced as under:-

“.....This is an application filed by the Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhopal for appropriate direction to Medical Council of India to send the recommendations to the Central Government within a period of one week from today.

This writ petition (W.P. No. 10263/2008) has not been filed by the Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhopal but by Shri Arvind Mishra as a P.I.L. As already clarified in the order passed on 19.08.2009 as well as in the order passed today, this Court has at no stage restrained the Medical Council of India or the Central Government to consider the cases of the Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhopal for renewal of permission for M.B.B.S. course for the academic year 2009-2010. Hence, we fail to appreciate how we can pass this order in a writ petition not filed by the Peoples College of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Bhopal. In case the aforesaid college is aggrieved by any order or any action of the Medical Council of India, it is open for aforesaid College to move the Court in a fresh writ petition.

With the aforesaid observation, the I.A. stands disposed of.”

It was further observed that the Central Government vide letter dated 17.09.2009 forwarded another complaint against the Institute received from Smt. Sumitra Mahajan, M.P. pertaining to its faculty members who were doing full-time private practice outside the college and only their names were used for the purpose of inspection and further requesting that strict action should be taken against these faculties and also against the college who are deteriorating the standards of medical education in our country, these colleges should be strictly investigated by the Medical Council of India and then only permission should be granted to them so that level of medical ethics should be maintained. On receipt of this complaint, it was decided to verify the status of the faculty and residents and also to verify the complaint. Accordingly, an inspection was scheduled for 22.09.2009.

The Institute had filed another Writ Petition No. 9438/2009 in the Hon'ble High Court of Madhya Pradesh at Jabalpur. The writ petition was taken up by the Hon'ble MP High Court on 22.09.2009, when the Hon'ble High Court was pleased to, inter-alia, direct that the MCI will send its recommendations to the Central Govt. for issue of letter of permission for MBBS for the academic year 2009-10 by 25.9.09 and the Central Govt. will consider the report / recommendations of the MCI. The Central Govt. will pass the final order by 29.9.09. The Hon'ble High Court has further directed as under :-

“.....In the meanwhile, the Counselling Authority and the State of Madhya Pradesh will ensure that the Petitioner College is allowed to participate in the counselling for admission to the MBBS seats in the Petitioner College for the academic year 2009-2010 subject to the order that may be passed by the Central Government on the report of the MCI.

List of matter on 5th October, 2009. Return, if any, be filed by the Respondents, in the meanwhile.”

Upon consideration of the inspection verification report dated 17.7.09, the comments of the college furnished through its letter dated 29.8.09 and the complaint received by the MCI from the Ministry of Health, Govt. of India alongwith the Ministry's letter dated 17.9.09, it was observed that the minimum required teaching faculty is shown to be available in this college and there would not be any deficiency having regard to the response of the college authorities dated 29.8.09.

In view of the above, the members of the Executive Committee after due and detailed deliberations and in pursuance of the above-mentioned directions of the Hon'ble Courts decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5th

batch of 150 MBBS students in the People's College of Medical Sciences for academic year 2009-10."

89. Approval of Minutes of the Migration Sub-Committee held on 7th September, 2009.

Read: The minutes of the Migration Sub-Committee held on 07th September 2009.

The Executive Committee of the Council approved the following minutes of the Migration Sub-Committee meeting held on 07th September, 2009:-

"Minutes of the meeting of the Migration Sub-Committee held on 07.09.2009 at 11.00 a.m. in the Council office at Sector - 8, Pocket - 14, Dwarka, New Delhi – 110 077.

Present:

Dr. Vijay Prakash Singh	-	Chairman
Dr. Ramchander Siwach	-	Member
Dr. Pawar Vasanth Nivrutti	-	Member
Dr. Sheo Narayan Chaudhury	-	Member
Dr. Asim Kumar Bardhan	-	Member
Dr. G. B. Gupta	-	Member

Apologies for absence were received from Dr. P. K. Jain & Dr. J. L. Sahni, Members, Migration Sub-Committee.

1. Minutes of the Migration Sub-Committee held on 31.03.2009 – Confirmation of.

The minutes of the last Migration Sub-Committee meeting held on 31.03.2009 were read and confirmed.

2. Minutes of the last meeting of the Migration Sub-Committee–Action taken thereon.

The Migration Sub-Committee approved the action taken on the minutes of the meeting of the Migration Sub-Committee meeting held on 31.03.2009.

3. Migration of Ms. Seemakumari Singh from Indira Gandhi Govt. Medical College, Nagpur (Maharashtra State) to Pt. B.D. Sharma Postgraduate Institute of Medical Sciences, Rohtak (Haryana State)

Read: the matter with regard to migration of Ms. Seemakumari Singh from Indira Gandhi Govt. Medical College, Nagpur (Maharashtra State) to Pt. B.D. Sharma Postgraduate Institute of Medical Sciences, Rohtak (Haryana State).

The Migration Sub-Committee considered the matter with regard to migration of Ms. Seemakumari Singh from Indira Gandhi Govt. Medical College, Nagpur (Maharashtra) to Pt. B. D. Sharma Postgraduate Institute of Medical Sciences, Rohtak (Haryana) alongwith all the related documents and request & reasons for migration and noted that the case of Ms. Seemakumari Singh for migration does not fall under compassionate grounds/genuine grounds criteria as laid down in the Council Regulations/Government of India, Gazette Notification dated 20th October, 2008 and 22nd December, 2008.

4. **Migration of Ms. Saumya Singh from Pt. Jawaharlal Nehru Memorial Medical College, Raipur, C.G. to Govt. Medical College, Surat**

Read: the matter with regard to Migration of Ms. Saumya Singh from Pt. Jawaharlal Nehru Memorial Medical College, Raipur, C.G. to Govt. Medical College, Surat.

The Migration Sub-Committee considered the matter with regard to Migration of Ms. Saumya Singh from Pt. Jawaharlal Nehru Memorial Medical College, Raipur, C.G. to Govt. Medical College, Surat alongwith all the related documents and request & reasons for migration and noted that the disability condition of Ms. Saumya Singh's father (Mr. Anil Kumar Singh) vide dis-ability certificate No. Nil issued on 22nd June, 2007 by Commander, Staff Officer(GB), States, certified that disability of Mr. Anil Kumar Singh occurred before 19.7.1995 and Ms. Saumya Singh was admitted in medical college on 10.9.2007, moreover admission of Ms. Saumya Singh was on the basis of disability of her father Mr. Anil Kumar singh.

After considering all these facts, Migration Sub-Committee arrived at the conclusion that Ms. Saumya Singh's case does not fall under criteria for transfer as laid down by Medical Council of India and Govt. of India vide its Gazette Notification dated 20th October, 2008 and 22nd December, 2008.

5. **H & FWD-Academic- Guidelines for migration of MBBS students - fixed Government Order forwarding of - reg.**

Read: the matter with regard to H & FWD - Academic - Guidelines for migration of MBBS students - fixed Government Order forwarding of.

The Migration Sub-Committee considered the letter sent to Secretary, Medical Council of India by Under Secretary to Govt. of Kerala, Health & Family Welfare Department, Thiruvananthapuram. The Sub-Committee suggested the following modifications in the framed guidelines regarding migration of MBBS students as suggested in the letter:

1. *"On extreme compassionate grounds only "should be replaced by" any genuine grounds".*
2. *Should be retained.*
3. *"List" should be replaced by "sheet".*
4. *Should be retained.*
5. *Word 'Government' should be deleted and after the college "within the State and both the recognized by Central Government u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956", should be added.*
6. *Should be deleted*
7. *Should be deleted*
8. *Should be deleted*

A fresh clause -9 should be added stating that Migration in the medical colleges of the same city is not allowed.

They should further see and comply with the guidelines adopted by the Medical Council of India.

6. **Guidelines for Migration.**

Read: the matter with regard to guidelines for migration.

The Migrations Sub-Committee considered that matter with regard to guidelines for migration and gave their opinion that:

"New Migration Regulations"

Preface - The Old Migration Regulations have been completely changed.

- (a) *All subclauses have been substituted on 20th Oct. 2008(Published in the gazette of India Extraordinary).*
- (b) *Subclauses (1) and (4) have been substituted twice first on 20th Oct. 2008(alongwith other subclauses) and then on 22nd Dec. 2008 (Published in the Gazette of India, Extraordinary)*

New Migration regulations - will now read as the following:

6 (1) Migration of students from one medical college to another medical college may be granted on any genuine ground subject to the availability of vacancy in the college where migration is sought and fulfilling the other requirements laid down in the Regulations, Migration would be restricted to 5% of the sanctioned intake of the college during the year. No Migration will be permitted on any ground from one medical college to another located within the same city."

(2) Migration of students from one College to another is permissible only if both the colleges are recognized by the Central Government under section 11(2) of the Indian Medical Council Act 1956 and further subject to the condition that it shall not result in increase in the sanctioned intake capacity for the academic year concerned in the respect of the receiving medical college.

(3) The applicant candidate shall be eligible to apply for migration only after qualifying in the first professional MBBS examination. Migration during clinical course of study shall not be allowed on any ground.

(4) "6(4) For the purpose of migration an applicant candidate shall first obtain "No Objection Certificate" from the college where he is studying for the present and the university to which that college is affiliated and also from the college to which the migration is sought and the university to it that college is affiliated. He/She shall submit his/her application for migration within a period of 1 month of passing (Declaration of result of the 1st Professional MBBS examination) along with the above cited four "No Objection Certificates" to: (a) the Director of Medical Education of the state, if migration is sought from one college to another within the same state or (b) the Medical Council of India, if the migration is sought from one college to another located outside the state".

(5) A student who has joined another college on migration shall be eligible to appear in the IInd professional MBBS examination only after attaining the minimum attendance in that college in the subjects, lectures, seminars etc. required for appearing in the examination prescribed under Regulation 12(1).

Note - 1: The State Governments/Universities/Institutions may frame appropriate guidelines for grant of No Objection Certificate or migration, as the case may be, to the students subject to provisions of these regulations.

Note - 2: Any request for migration not covered under the provision of these Regulations shall be referred to the Medical Council of India for consideration on individual merits by the Director(Medical Education) of the State or the Head of Central Government Institution concerned. The decision taken by the Council on such request shall be final.

Note - 3: The College/Institution shall send intimation to the Medical Council of India about the number of students admitted by them on migration within one month of their joining. It shall be open to the Council to undertake verification of the compliance of the provisions of the regulations governing migration by the College at any point of time".

Suggested Guidelines by the Members of the Sub-Committee.

- A. Genuine Grounds:
Any one of the following situations to have arisen after the admission of the concerned student in the MBBS course:-
- (a) Death of the supporting guardian.
 - (b) Death of a parent.
 - (c) Illness of the candidate occurring after the admission in the medical college and causing disability (and change of place would result in better functioning of the candidate/remission of illness) to be certified by the State Medical Board of the place from where the candidate is seeking transfer.
 - (d) Threat to life under adverse social circumstances (to be certified by competent police authority not below the rank of Superintendent of Police of the concerned district).
 - (e) Any other ground which the migration Sub Committee deems to be genuine.
- B. Vacancy:
(a) "Vacancy in any batch, in any medical college for the purpose of migration is that number of seats which when filled after migration shall not result in increase in the sanctioned intake capacity for the academic year concerned in the respect of receiving Medical College (as indicated in subclause 2 of the Regulation)."
- C. No Objection Certificate:
(i) From the college allowing transfer - It should include that, the total number of migrating students does not exceed 5 % of sanctioned intake capacity of the college during a year.
(ii) From the college accepting transfer would include both of the following:-
a) Migration does not exceed 5% of sanctioned intake capacity
b) Migration is against the vacant seat(as defined above).
- D. The college concerned(accepting the transfer) must send intimation to the Medical Council of India about the number of students admitted by them on migration within one month of their joining.
- E. The Council through Migration Sub-Committee will undertake verification of compliance of the provision of Regulations governing migration by the colleges at any point of time.
- F. The State Government/Universities/Institutions should frame appropriate guidelines for grant of No Objection Certificate for migration as the case may be and send a copy to Medical Council of India for perusal."

90. Memoranda issued to the officials of the Council

Read: The matter with regard where no reply has been received from the Council employees in reference to the Memoranda issued by the office of the Secretary time to time.

The Executive Committee of the Council perused the matter with regard where no reply has been received from the Council employees in reference to the Memoranda issued by the office of the Secretary time to time and directed the office to obtain the replies from the concerned officer/employee before the next meeting of the Executive Committee and decided to defer the consideration of the matter till then.

91. Story “Capitation fees in 2 U.P. Medical Colleges” telecast on Sahara Samay news on 15.09.2009 & 16.09.2009

Read: The matter with regard to the Story “Caption fees in 2 U.P. Medical Colleges” telecast on Sahara Samay news on 15.09.2009 & 16.09.2009.

The members observed that TV Channel “Sahara Samay” had telecast a story “Sale of Seats in 2 medical colleges of U.P.” 15.09.2009 & 16.09.2009 showing the details of a sting operation having been conducted in (1) Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad & (2) Saraswathi Institute of Medical Sciences, Hapur. The Council had requested the Chief Editor of Sahara Samay Channel, Mr. A. Brangta to provide full unedited transcripts, video clips and other material vide letter dated 16.09.2009. As no material was received in the office of the Council, a reminder was also sent on 24.09.2009. However, the required material has not been sent by the channel till date.

It was observed that in an earlier episode involving two medical colleges in Chennai, the Council had appointed three member enquiry committee to inquire into the episode of a sting operation telecast on a TV channel showing demand for capitation fee being made on the screen on behalf of (1) Sri Ramachandra Medical College & Research Institute and (2) Sri Balaji Medical College & Hospital of Chennai.

In view of above, the members of the Executive Committee decided to constitute a 3 members committee comprising of:-

- (1) Dr. Indrajit Ray, Pro-Vice Chancellor, West Bengal University of Health Sciences, Kolkata and Chairman, Postgraduate Committee, MCI- Chairman of the Committee.
- (2) Dr. D.J. Borah, Principal, Jorhat Medical College, Jorhat (Assam) & Member, Executive Committee, MCI- Member of the Committee
- (3) Dr. Muzaffar Ahmed, Director, Health Services, Govt. of Jammu & Kashmir, & Member, Executive Committee, MCI - Member of the Committee

to inquire into the episode of a sting operation telecast on a TV channel showing demand for capitation fee being made on the screen on behalf of (1) Santosh Medical College, Ghaziabad & (2) Saraswati Institute of medical Sciences, Hapur. The Committee will commence its equiery after the required material is received in the office of the Council and will submit its report within 3 weeks.

92. Establishment of New Medical College at Sagar, Madhya Pradesh by Government of Madhya Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

Read: The compliance verification inspection report (24th September, 2009) along with the Council Inspectors Report (5th & 6th June, 2009 and 9th July, 2009) for establishment of New Medical College at Sagar, Madhya Pradesh by Government of Madhya Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

The Executive Committee observed that the Hon’ble Supreme Court in a batch of petitions filed by the State Government medical colleges had observed at the hearing on 18.09.2009 that for the government colleges, the Medical Council of India would submit its report to the Union of India and upon receipt of the report, the Government will pass

appropriate orders. Further, the Advocate for the Council appearing in Hon'ble Supreme Court in the above cases in his letter dated 19.08.2009 had stated as under:

“

When the matter was taken up for hearing yesterday on 18.09.2009 before the bench of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India comprising of Hon'ble the Chief Justice, Hon'ble Mr. Justice P. Sathasivam and Hon'ble Mr. Justice B.S. Chauhan – Mr. Maninder Singh, Ld. Sr. Advocate – appearing on behalf of the Council, submitted before the Hon'ble Court that with due deference to the observations of the Hon'ble Supreme Court for conducting the inspection of this Govt. Medical College where the seats will become available only to the merit students and also having regard to the request of the Ministry of Health, Govt. of India for conduct of the inspection and sending of the recommendations – that the inspection has been carried out and the recommendations of the Executive Committee of the council shall be sent to the Ministry of Health, Govt. of India expeditiously.

It may also be mentioned here that the Ld. Standing Counsel of the State of Madhya Pradesh was also present in the Court and when he mentioned that a similar case of a Govt. Medical College at a place at Sagar in Madhya Pradesh also deserves a similar action by the MCI and the Govt. of India.

It is stated that in the event any such case is pending with the Council, on the same premise, the Council may consider conduct of inspection/sending recommendation to the Ministry of Health, Govt. of India for any such Govt. Medical College where on the grant of renewal of permission the MBBS seats will become available only to merit students.”

In this regard, an inspection to verify the compliance submitted by the college authorities for grant of Letter of Permission for Establishment of new medical college at Sagar, Madhya Pradesh by Government of Madhya Pradesh u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 was carried out by the Council Inspectors on 24th September, 2009.

The Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification inspection report (24th September, 2009) along with the Council Inspectors report (5th & 6th June, 2009 and 9th July, 2009) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Sagar, Madhya Pradesh by Government of Madhya Pradesh with an annual intake of 100 (one hundred) MBBS students for the academic session 2009-10 u/s 10A of the I.M.C. Act, 1956.

(Lt. Col. (Retd.) Dr. A.R.N. Setalvad)
Secretary

New Delhi, dated the
25th September, 2009

APPROVED

(Dr. P.C.Kesavankutty Nayar)
Vice – President