No.MCI-5(3)/2005-Med./

MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting of the Executive Committee held on Monday, the 24th April, 2006 at 11.00 a.m. in the Council office at Sector 8, Pocket 14, Dwarka, New Delhi-110 075 where the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed as per the Hon'ble Supreme Court order dated 20.11.2002 were also present.

** ** **

Present:

Dr.P.C. Kesavankutty Nayar]President (Acting),

]Former Dean,

]Govt. Medical College,

]Trivandrum

Prof. P.N. Tandon | Former Prof. & Head of Neuro-

]Surgery,A.I.I.M.S,NewDelhi and]Member, Adhoc Committee

Jappointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court

Dr. (Mrs.) S. Kantha JFormer Vice-Chancellor,

Rajiv Gandhi University of Health

Sciences, Bangalore and Member, Adhoc Committee

Jappointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court

Dr. P.K. Sur]Director,

]I.P.G.M.E.R.,]Kolkatta

Dr. Mukesh Kr. Sharma Deptt. of General Surgery,

S.M.S. Medical College,

]Jaipur

Dr. K.P. Mathur [Former Medical Superintendent,

Ram Manohar Lohia Hospital,

]77, Chitra Vihar,]Delhi-110092

Dr. G.K. Thakur Professor & Head,

Department of Radiodiagnosis, S.K.Medical College, Muzaffarpur

Dr. G.B. Gupta]Professor & Head,

Department of Medicine, Pt.J.N.M. Medical College, Raipur (Chhattisgarh)

Prof. B.C. Das Director,

State Institute of Health & Family

]Welfare, Govt. of Orissa, Nayapalli,

Bhubaneshwar.

Lt.Col. (Retd.) Dr. A.R.N. Setalvad -

Secretary

The apologies for absence were received from Prof. N. Rangabhashyam, Adhoc Committee member and Dr. J.R. Kher member of the Executive Committee.

1. <u>Minutes of the Executive Committee Meeting held on 19.03.2006 – Confirmation of.</u>

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council confirmed the minutes of the meeting of the Executive Committee held on 19.03.2006.

2. Minutes of the last meeting of the Executive Committee – Action taken thereon.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council noted the action taken by the office on the various items included in the agenda of the Executive Committee meeting held on 19.03.2006.

3. Pending items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive Committee.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council noted the list of pending items arising out of the decisions taken by the Executive Committee.

4. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Bhubaneshwar by Sikshya "O"</u> Anusandhan Charitable Educational Society, Bhubaneshwar, Orissa.

Read: The inspection report $(20^{th} \& 21^{st} March, 2006)$ for establishment of new medical college at Bhubaneshwar by Sikshya "O" Anusandhan Charitable Educational Society, Bhubaneshwar, Orissa

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (20th and 21st March, 2006) and noted the following:-

- 1. (a) The shortage of teaching faculty is 9.85% as under:
 - (i) Assoc.Prof. 1 (Biochemistry)
 - (ii) Asstt.Prof.-4 (Anatomy-2, Physiology-1, Dentistry-1)
 - (iii) Tutor-2 (Anaesthesia)
 - (b) Assistant Professors are not having 3 years of teaching experience either as Tutor/Demonstrator/Registrar/Resident. They are having three years' experience during post graduation as P.G.

2. Clinical material is inadequate as under:

	Daily Average		Day of inspection	
OPD attendance	600		721	
Casualty attendance	20-30		0	
No. of Admissions/discharges	27/27		56/Nil	
Bed Occupancy%	79%		56%	
Operative Work				
Number of major surgical operations	8		Nil	
Number of minor surgical operations	11		2	
Number of normal deliveries	1		Nil	
Number of caesarian sections	0-1		Nil	
Radiological investigations	OP	IP	OP	IP
x-ray	89	11	35	21
Ultrasonography	16	4	19	5
Special investigations	0 5		Nil	Nil
CT Scan	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil

Laboratory investigations		
Biochemistry	207	250
Microbiology	40	65
Serology	16	15
Parasitology	20	18
Haematology	191	150
Histopathology	2	1
Cytopathology	2	4
Others		

The observations out of the manual records of the various departments and physical verification are as under:-

- (i) Patients attending the OPDs were not of much clinical importance.
- (ii) Indoor patients many patients admitted were not of much clinical importance. 90% of them were admitted on the eve/day of inspection.
- (iii) Number of patients admitted in the casualty were nil on both the days of inspection. Number of admissions in the casualty submitted in the clinical material is fake. On physical examination of the record, it was found that the number of admissions in the casualty was 1-2/day.
- (iv) The number of deliveries conducted (both normal and cesarian section) are negligible. On both the days of inspection, no normal delivery/cesarian section was there. On checking the records, the following was observed:

Nove	vember December January February		February March		Day of						
										inspect	ion
ND	CS	ND	CS	ND	CS	ND	CS	ND	CS	ND	CS
17	10	09	05	20	10	12	06	04	05	Nil	Nil

- (v) The first clinical material submitted was cooked up when checked. The Dean submitted second list of clinical material. The entries in the Radiology Deptt. were incomplete. The number of X-rays done were not corresponding with the entry record in the Registers. When checked, the HOD disappeared and went to another room and started making the fake entries in the Register (for the months of January, February and March). He was caught Red-handed by the inspection team and the Registers were confiscated (4 Registered submitted to the Council). Number of special investigations done in the deptt. of Radiology are negligible. On the day of inspection, it was nil. The number of clinical investigations in the department of Clinical Pathology were low (on the day of inspection, Histopathology 1 and Cytopathology-4)
- (vi) Number of Major surgeries performed in the 3 main surgical departments (from December, 2005 to March,2006) was found to be negligible (Average 1-2/day). No surgeries were performed on both the days of inspection in all the surgical departments.
- (vii) There was no Anaesthesia Register maintained in the OTs.
- (viii) There was no record of Endoscopy done.
- 3. The external plastering for the college building and the hospital building has not been done.
- 4. In the Central Library, most of the books were not catalogued. Number of Indian and Foreign journals were less as per MCI norms.
- 5. Hostels for the undergraduate students (for boys and girls) are under construction. Presently the special cabins of the hospital wards were shown as the hostels for boys, girls and nurses which is unfurnished and inadequate. Only the ground floor of the undergraduate hostel has been constructed with no flooring and plastering and no interior work. The nurses have been temporarily housed in the hospital wards (24 special cabins) with inadequate furniture. There is no messing facility in all the temporary hostels. The construction work for the nurses hostel and resident hostels has not been still started.
- 6. There are no residential quarters available. They are under construction.

- 7. Sports & recreation facilities are not available. Site for the same has been identified. No Gymnasium facilities are available.
- 8. Dr. Hemant Kumar Sahoo is the Medical Superintendent. He is MD (Forensic Medicine) and has more than 5 years of administrative experience. He is not qualified to hold the post of Medical Superintendent as per Teacher's Eligibility Qualification Regulations.
- 9. Registration and medical record section is computerized but not integrated with the MRD section. There is separate counter for indoor patients but the record is not properly maintained. The records of the indoor and outdoor patients are not available at the registration counter. The MRD section does not have the record of deliveries/deaths, number of major and minor operations. MRD section is not cross linked with the outdoor registration. The medical record section is computerized but not functioning properly. ICD X Classification of diseases is not followed for indexing. Follow up service are not available due to lack of maintenance of record.
- 10. In the Central Casualty, the bed occupancy on the day of inspection was zero.
- 11. In the Central sterilization department, bowl sterilizer, Glove inspection machine, instrument washing machine are not available.
- 12. EPABX was being installed.
- 13. Other deficiencies/remarks in the report.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Bhubaneshwar by Sikshya "O" Anusandhan Charitable Educational Society, Bhubaneshwar, Orissa u/s 10A of the I.M.C. Act,1956.

5. Establishment of new medical college at Theni, Tamilnadu by Govt. of Tamilnadu.

Read : The inspection report $(30^{th} \& 31^{st} March, 2006)$ for establishment of new medical college at Theni by Govt. of Tamilnadu.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (30th & 31st March, 2006) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Theni by Govt. of Tamilnadu u/s 10A of the I.M.C. Act,1956 with an annual intake of 100 (Hundred) students for the academic session 2006-07.

6. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Panikahiti by Down Town Charity Trust, Guwahati.</u>

Read: The inspection report (29^{th} & 30^{th} March, 2006) for establishment of new medical college at Panikahati by Down Town Charity Trust, Guwahati.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (29th and 30th March, 2006) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The following teachers are part time and have certified to this effect on their declaration forms. Hence, they have not been counted while computing faculty deficiency:

S.No.	Name		Designation	Deptt.	No o	of
					days/week	
1	Dr.Prabhash	Chandra	Prof.	Gen. Medicine	2 to 4 days/wk	
	Bhattacharya					

2	Dr.(Mrs.) Anjali Deka	Prof.	Pharmacology	3 days/wk
3	Dr. Panna Deka	Prof.	Pathology	3 days/wk
4	Dr. Vijaya Madhi	Asstt. Prof.	Pathology	3 days/wk
	Hazarika			
5	Dr. Pulin Kumar Deka	Prof.	Microbiology	3 days/wk
6	Dr. Atul ChandraDatta	Prof.	Comm.Med.	2 days/wk
7	Dr. Utapala Das	Prof.	Physiology	3 days/wk
8	Dr. Prabindra Nath Nobis	Prof.	Obst. & Gynae.	4 days/wk

(b) The following teacher has been found to be working at more than one medical college simultaneously:-

#	Name	Designation	Department	Colleges where found to be working	
				simultaneously	
1	Dr. Utpala Das	Professor	Physiology	(a) Sankar Madhab Medical College &	
				Hospital, Guwahati	
				(b) Raja Rajeswari Medical College,	
				Bangalore	

- © In view of above, the shortage of teaching faculty is 27.1% as under:
 - (i) Prof. 2 (Physiology-1, Gen.Medicine-1)
 - (ii) Assoc.Prof.-10 (Anatomy-2, Physiology-2, Biochemistry-1, Pathology-1, Microbiology-1, Pharmacology-1, OBGY-1, Radiology-1)
 - (iii) Asstt.Prof.-3 (Physiology- Lecturer Biochemistry, Comm. Medicine-1, General Surgery-1)
 - (iv) Tutor-1 (Anatomy)
- (b) The shortage of Residents is 22.2% as under:
 - (I) Sr. Resident: 1 (1 General Medicine)
 - (II) Jr. Resident 7 (Gen. Medicine-5, General Surgery-2)
- 2. Clinical material is grossly inadequate as under:

	Daily Average		Day of inspection	
OPD attendance	126		187	
Casualty attendance	5		4	
Bed Occupancy%	25%		30%	
Operative Work				
Number of major surgical operations		-		-
Number of minor surgical operations	4	4		-
Number of normal deliveries		-		-
Number of caesarian sections		-		-
Radiological investigations	OP	IP	OP	IP
X-ray	23	2	19	12
Ultrasonography	14	1	15	13
Special investigations	3	-	-	
CT Scan	-	-	-	-
Laboratory investigations				
Biochemistry	18	4	40	26
Microbiology	14	-	6	4
Serology	-	-	6	7
Parasitology	-	-	20	13
Haematology	14	-	52	27
Histopathology	-	-	-	-
Cytopathology	-	-	-	-
Others	-	-	-	-

3. Land use conversation to N.A. is not available. Position is status quo since last inspection.

- 4. No Medical Education Unit is yet established.
- 5. College Council is not yet constituted.
- 6. Medical College building is under construction. As a result the pre and para clinical departments are located in the hospital building. The hospital building is ground + 5 storied. On the day of inspection, G+4 floors were functional. However, a part of the fifth floor is still under construction. Civil work of most of the building is still not completed viz. the glass panes of the windows yet to be fixed, the fans have yet to be installed. Just in front of the hospital building, in the base of the valley the Anatomy department and Animal House building are located. The roof of this building is made up of Corrugated Tin sheets with no ceiling.
- 7. Library space is not as per MCI norms. Reading rooms for students and staff are very small.
- 8. Only 2 Level type lecture theatres of capacity 90 seats each are available. There are empty spaces left in the wall as windows and door without fittings. Acoustics are not in order. There are no audio-visual aids available.
- 9. Common rooms for boys and girls are available but not furnished. There are no toilets.
- 10. Hostels: The construction of the ground and the first floor of the hostel building is complete. The other floors are still under construction. The residents are proposed to be accommodated on the first floor. The second floor, third and fourth floor will house boys and girls respectively. This hostel is not furnished. Mess is not available. There is no separate nurses hostel. There are 4 staff quarters which are nearing completion, are earmarked for faculty but are presently occupied by security, electrical and housekeeping staffs. There are 20 temporary huts to accommodate 40 employees but these are without any water or electricity supply. Presently, only one floor of the hostel with capacity of 34 is ready for occupation but is not furnished which is inadequate.
- 11. Dr. Ramen Kumar Kalita, Medical Superintendent has no administrative experience. He is not qualified to hold the post of Medical Superintendent.
- 12. OPD: Teaching facilities like x-ray view box, examination tray, etc are not available in any room. Examination couch is not available in majority of the OPDs. On an average 130 patients are registered in the OPD per day. No records of patients examined are available in any of the OPD consulting rooms. Teaching area available in the OPDs have in adequate space (on an average a teaching area could accommodate six students) and are not equipped with teaching aids. E.C.G. room does not have E.C.G. machine. Audiometry room is not air-conditioned.
- 13. Wards: There is over crowding of beds in all wards the beds in the wards are not properly spaced. There are overhead cupboards instead of bedside lockers for 60% of the patients. The clinical departments are established but not in a systematic manner viz. Female Ortho, ENT and Paediatrics have been put together in one ward. Space is allocated for one seminar room on each floor of the hospital building but it is not furnished and not in use. Departmental libraries are located in the respective OPDs but are ill equipped. Doctors duty room, nurse duty room, side lab., procedure room, pantry and teaching areas are available but are not furnished and equipped and are not in use. Nursing stations are outside the wards.
- 14. There is no separate indoor registration counter. OPD and indoor registration counters are common. Random checkup of three indoor case sheets (UTI with pain in abdomen, fever, epistaxis) showed that patients were admitted but not investigated.
- 15. In the Central Casualty Service, the separate casualty services for Obst. & Gynae. are yet to be developed. Only oxygen supply and suction machine, ambu bag are available. There was no endotracheal intubation apparatus available. There are no monitors,

Boyle's machine or emergency cart. The patients examination room and minor OT is common.

- 16. Clinical Laboratories: The work load is negligible. There were only five blood sample for testing only three media plates were available in microbiology deptt. There were only two Westergreen tubes. No sample was available in Pathology Deptt.
- 17. Operation Theatre Unit: One OT is earmarked as minor OT but has no lights. Second O.T. is not equipped. There is one ventilator, no infusion pumps or defibrilators. There is no central oxygen or suction. None of the OTs are air conditioned. Recovery room is available with three beds without any monitors observation room is available with three beds and are not equipped.
- 18. In Intensive care, only one ICCU/ICU (Medical) with six beds is available. There was no patient in the ICU. No other ICUs are available.
- 19. One Labour Room is available just outside the OT complex. It has one bed but there are no facilities for suction and oxygen supply and there is no resuscitation equipment. So far only 7 deliveries have been conducted in last three months.
- 20. Mechanised laundry is not available.
- 21. In Central Sterilization deptt., there are no separate entry and exit points for the supplies. There was no person on duty.
- 22. Paramedical staff is inadequate as under:

Laboratory Asstt.-2 Laboratory Attendants-20

23. Nursing staff is inadequate as under:

Nursing Superintendent/Matron1Dy. Nursing Superintendent1Asstt.Nursing Superintendent1Nursing Sisters5Staff nurses40

- Anatomy department is located in the base of the valley in front of the hospital with corrugated tin sheets roofing/ceiling. Washing facilities in the dissection hall are inadequate with only 3 wash basins. There is a cadaver storage tank with no cadavers. There is no mortuary cooler. There is no embalming room and no injector. There is no band saw and no cadaver section. No students lockers are provided. There are two demonstration rooms which are not furnished. There are no museum except for 7 models and one skeleton. There is no view box and no imaging plates. The library cum seminar room is not furnished. The infrastructure and facilities of the department are not as per MCI norms.
- 25. In the department of Physiology, artificial light is not available in Haematology laboratory. Plastic stools provided are of inadequate height. Experimental physiology and Human Physiology laboratories are nonfunctional. Research laboratory needs to be organized. Number of rooms in the departmental library are inadequate.
- 26. In the deptt. of Biochemistry, the practical laboratory tables are without water facility and reagents. The preparation room is non functional. Research laboratory is not yet established. Instruments in the laboratory are inadequate. There is no audio visual aids. In the departmental library, there are no journals. Two offices for the faculty are part of the practical laboratory.
- 27. Other deficiencies/remarks in the report.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Panikahiti by Down Town Charity Trust, Guwahati u/s 10A of the I.M.C. Act,1956.

7. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Dehradun by Shri Guru Ram Rai Educational Mission, Dehradun</u>.

Read: The inspection report (23^{rd} & 24^{th} March, 2006) for establishment of new medical college at Dehradun by Shri Guru Ram Rai Educational Mission, Dehradun.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (23rd & 24th March, 2006) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Dehradun by Shri Guru Ram Rai Educational Mission, Dehradun u/s 10A of the I.M.C. Act,1956 with an annual intake of 100 (Hundred) students for the academic session 2006-07.

8. <u>Shadan Instt. of Medical Sciences Research Centre & Teaching Hospital, Peerancheru, A.P. - Renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of students for the academic session 2006-2007.</u>

Read: The inspection report (17th & 18th March, 2006) of Shadan Instt. of Medical Science Research Centre & Teaching Hospital, Peerancheru A.P. for renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (17th & 18th March, 2006) and noted the following:-

1 (a) In relation to certain Declaration Forms submitted on behalf of the Medical teachers and endorsed by the Principal of the medical college, it was observed/found that teaching experience shown in those Declaration Forms is incorrect and in certain cases, it was seriously doubted. The office of the Council had undertaken the exercise of verifying the individual particulars regarding the claimed teaching experience from the Medical institutions concerned and found their claim to be fake. The following teaching faculty cannot be considered as the experience certificates submitted by them are forged as shown below:

#	Name	Designation	Department	Remarks		
1.	Dr. G	Associate	Radiology	In his declaration form he has		
1.			Kaulology			
	Venkateshwarlu	Prof.		claimed that he has worked at		
				Kasturba Medical College, Manipal		
				from 1994 to 1997 as Tutor/		
				Demonstrator/Registrar/Sr. Resident		
				and from 17.10.1997 to 20.12.2002 as		
				Assistant Prof. In its letter Kasturba		
				Medical Colleg, Manipal has stated		
				that he has not worked at all in the		
				institution. Thus he has submitted a		
				false and forged experience certificate		
				and therefore cannot be accepted as a		
				teacher.		
2.	Dr. Surya	Associate	Pharmacology	In his declaration form he has		
	Devara Sridhar	Prof.		claimed that he has worked at		
				Kasturba Medical College, Manipal		
				from 1990 to 1993 as Tutor/		
				Demonstrator/Registrar/Sr. Resident		
				and from 20.08.1993 to 20.10.1998 as		
				Assistant Prof. & 21.10.1998 to		
				24.4.1999 as Associate Professor at		
				J.S.S. Medical College, Mysore. In		

				their letters Kasturba Medical Colleg,
			N	Manipal and J.S.S. Medical College, Mysore have stated that he has not worked at all in their institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
3.	Dr. Uma Rani Dharmalingam	Associate Prof.	Physiology	In her declaration form she has claimed that she has worked at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal from 1992 to 1995 as Tutor/Demonstrator/Registrar/Sr. Resident and from June 1996 to Dec.,2001 as Assistant Prof. at Raja Muthiah Medical College & Hospital, Annamalainagar. In its letters Kasturba Medical Colleg, Manipal and Raja Muthiah Medical College & Hospital, Annamalainagar have stated that she has not worked at all in the institution. Thus she has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
4.	Dr. V. Sudhakaram	Asstt. Prof.	Pathology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Kurnool Medical College, Kurnool from 2002 to 2005 as Tutor. In its letter Kurnool Medical College, Kurnool has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
5.	Dr. M. Sugatha	Asstt. Prof.	Forensic Medicine	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Osmania Medical College, Hyderabad from 2003 to 2006 as Tutor. In its letter Osmania Medical College, Hyderabad has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
6.	Dr. Suresh Kumar Patro	Assoc.Prof.	Anaesthesia	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Sri Ramachandra Medical College & Research Institute, Chennai from 10.07.1997 to 20.09.2003 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter Sri Ramachandra Medical College & Research Institute, Chennai has stated that he has not worked in any capacity in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
7.	Dr. K. Venkateshwara Rao	Asstt. Prof.	Psychiatry	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Sri Ramachandra Medical College &

				Research Institute, Chennai from 2002 to 2005 as Tutor. In its letter Sri Ramachandra Medical College & Research Institute, Chennai has stated that he has not worked in any capacity in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
8.	Dr. N Ashish Kumar Patro	Assistant Prof.	Medicine	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has obtained M.D. (Medicine) from S.C.B. Medical College, Cuttack from 2001 to 2004. In its letter S.C.B. Medical College, Cuttack has stated that he has not obtained M.D.(Medicine) degree in the year 2004 as verified from the records. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
9.	Dr. K.V. Ramana Gouda	Assoc. Prof.	Pharmacology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at J.S.S. Medical College, Mysore from 1991 to 1996 as Asstt. Prof. and from 12.11.1996 to 08.06.1998 as Associate Prof. In its letter J.S.S. Medical College, Mysore has stated that no teacher by this name was employed in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
10.	Dr. Venkat Vimla K	Assoc. Prof.	Dermatology	In his declaration form she has claimed that she has worked at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal from Jan.,1990 to Oct.,1995 as Asstt. Prof. and at J.J.M. Medical College, Davangere from 20.11.1995 to 20.12.1999 as Associate Prof. and 21.12.1999 to 24.05.2001 as Professor. In their letters Kasturba Medical College, Manipal and J.J.M. Medical College, Davangere have stated that he has not worked at all in their institutions. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
11.	Dr. Yatheeswara Prasad	Assoc. Prof.	Physiology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Dr. B.R. Ambedkar Medical College, Bangalore from 04.05.1990 to 10.12.1995 as Asstt. Prof. and from 11.12.1995 to 22.08.2000 as Reader/Assoc. Prof. In its letter Dr. B.R.Medical College, Bangalore has stated that he was not employed in their institutions. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.

12.	Dr. M. Senthil Kumar	Assoc. Prof.	Pathology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at I.R.T. Perundurai Medical College & Hospital, Tamilnadu from 06.01.1996 to 12.10.2001 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter I.R.T. Perundurai Medical College & Hospital, Tamilnadu has stated that he was not employed in their institution at any time in the past. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
13.	Dr. K.R. Shayamsunder	Assoc. Prof.	T.B. & Chest	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at I.R.T. Perundurai Medical College & Hospital, Tamilnadu from 03.11.1993 to 10.02.1999 as Asstt. Prof. and from 11.02.1999 to 10.08.1999 as Assoc. Prof. In its letter I.R.T. Perundurai Medical College & Hospital, Tamilnadu has stated that he was not employed in their institution at any time in the past. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
14.	Dr. K. Ramaniah	Assoc. Prof.	Anaesthesia	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at J.J.M Medical College, Davangere from Nov.,1993 to Aug.,1999 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter J.J.M. Medical College, Davangere has stated that he was not employed in its institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council were, therefore, were clearly of the view that the Council should take steps for referring these cases to the Police authorities for registration of FIRs and conducting investigations in all such cases. It was observed that in the complaint to be sent to the Police authorities, it should also be clearly requested that all those cases where there is a collusion and conspiracy of such persons with the management of the colleges, the necessary action should also be taken against the management of those colleges. It was further decided that appropriate action be taken against these Doctors and the Principal of the college in accordance with Professional Conduct (Etiquette and Ethics) Regulations, 2002.

(b) The following teachers have been found to be working at more than one medical college during the inspection for academic year 2006-2007:-

1 Dr. Suresh Ponnusamy / 61869

Subject: Physiology

	Name of the College	Date of Joining	Date of Insp.
a)	Shadan Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad	01.10.2005	17.03.2006
b)	Meenakshi Med.Coll.& Research Institute, Kanchipuram	22.11.2004	27.01.2006

2 Dr. Liyakhat Ali Mohammed Omar / 25604

Subject: Microbiology

	Name of the College	Date of Joining Date of Insp.		
a)	Shadan Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad	09.11.2005	17.03.2006	
b)	Kamineni Instt. of Medical Sciences, Narketpally	16.02.2004	01.12.2005	

[c] The following teacher has been found working at more than one medical college simultaneously:-

1 Dr. B Raj Kumar / 41159

Subject: Radiology

	Name of the College	Date of Joining	Date of Insp.
a)	Shadan Institute of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad	01.07.2004	17.03.2006
b)	Navodaya Medical College, Raichur	01.07.2004	09.07.2004

- (d) In view of above, the shortage of teaching faculty is more than 5 % as under:
- (i) Professor 1 (Physiology 1)
- (ii) Assoc.Prof.- 7 (Radiodiagnosis 1, Physiology 1, Skin & V.D. 1, Pathology 1, Tb & Chest 1, Forensic Medicine 1, Anaesthesia 1)
- (i) Asstt.Prof.- 9 (Dentistry-1, Pathology 1, Forensic Medicine 1, Skin & V.D. 1, Anaesthesia 1, Psychiatry 1, Physiology-1, Microbiology-1, Radio-Diagnosis-1)
- (e) The shortage of Residents is 32 % as under:
- (i) Sr. Resident-17 (Medicine-5, Surgery-6, Ortho.-2, ENT-1, Opthalmology-1, Obstetric-1)
- (ii) Jr.Residents-6 (Skin & VD-1, Pediatric-2, Obst. & Gynae.-3)
- 2. OPD: In some of the rooms, facilities like patient couch, revolving stools, x-ray view box, examination/instruments tray etc. are not provided. Source of water is not available in many of the rooms. Resuscitation trolley was lacking in many OPDs. Teaching area is in the passage of the OPD and is common for patient's waiting area and the OPD clerk. The different waste bins of the OPD are also kept in this area. Specialities like TB and Chest, Dermatology and Psychiatry each are provided only one room each for consultant to sit and examine patients. There is no laboratory with dermatology OPD. Looking at OPD attendance, OPD requires more space.
 - 3. Wards: Most of the wards are not provided with duty doctors room, nurse duty room, nursing station, pantry, examination/procedure room, treatment room, teaching area and side laboratory. Separate wards needs to be provided for the male and female patients of Tuberculosis and chest disease, Dermatology and Psychiatry. There is over crowding of beds in Orthopaedics, Surgery, Obstetrics and Gynae Wards. Adequate distance kept between two cots so that stretcher, wheel chair can be move in between and doctors can take rounds and examine the patients in presence of few residence and students. Bed side lockers should be provided to all patients. Adequate electric lighting was also lacking in the wards.
- 4. The OPD attendance and bed occupancy are not commensurate with investigations, number of deliveries and Caesarian. Normally with increasing OPD attendance and bed occupancy, a parallel increase in operations, deliveries, radiological and laboratory investigations is expected.

- 5. Only 8 residential quarters are available within the campus for teaching faculty which is inadequate.
- 6. ETO and instrument washing machine are not available in CSSD.
- 7. At present post mortems are not performed.
- 8. Other deficiencies/remarks in the report.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2nd batch of MBBS students at Shadan Instt. of Medical Sciences Research Centre & Teaching Hospital, Peerancheru, A.P. for the academic session 2006-07.

9. <u>Maharajah's Institute of Medical Sciences, Nellimarla, Vizianagaram – Renewal of permission for admission of 4th batch of students for the academic session 2006-2007.</u>

Read :The inspection report (17th & 18th March, 2006) of Maharajah's Institute of Medical Sciences, Nellimarla, Vizianagaram for renewal of permission for admission of 4th batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (17th & 18th March, 2006) and noted the following:-

In relation to certain Declaration Forms submitted on behalf of the Medical teachers and endorsed by the Principal of the medical college, it was observed/found that teaching experience shown in those Declaration Forms is incorrect and in certain cases, it was seriously doubted. The office of the Council had undertaken the exercise of verifying the individual particulars regarding the claimed teaching experience from the Medical institutions concerned and found their claim to be fake. The following teaching faculty cannot be considered as the experience certificates submitted by them are forged as shown below:

#	Name	Designation	Department	Remarks
1.	Dr. G	Associate	Radiology	In his declaration form he has
	Venkateshwarlu	Prof.		claimed that he has worked at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal from 1994 to 1997 as Tutor/Demonstrator/Registrar/Sr. Resident and from 17.10.1997 to 20.12.2002 as Assistant Prof. In its letter Kasturba Medical Colleg, Manipal has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
2	Dr. Rajkamal Pandian Durai Raj	Asst. Prof.	Community Medicine	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal from 2000 to 2003 as Tutor/Demonstrator/Registrar/Sr. Resident and has acquired degree of M.D. (Community Medicine) from the institute. In its letter Kasturba Medical Colleg, Manipal has stated that he has not acquired degree of M.D.(C.M.) from the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and

				forged degree contificate and
				forged degree certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
3	Dr. B. Mani Karnika	Asst. Prof.	Physiology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal from 2002 to 2005 as Tutor/Demonstrator/Registrar/Sr. Resident and has acquired degree of M.D. (Physiology) from the institution. In its letter Kasturba Medical Colleg, Manipal has stated that he has not acquired degree of M.D. (Physiology) from the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged degree certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
4	Dr. P. Vijay Kumar	Asso. Prof.	Tb & Chest	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at JJM Medical College, Davangere from 1990 to 1993 as Tutor and from 04.08.1993 to 02.10.1999 as Assistant Prof. In its letter JJM Medical Colleg, Davangere has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
5	Dr. B. Sai Krishna	Asso. Prof.	Radiodiagnosis	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal from 1991 to 1994 as Tutor/ Demonstrator/Registrar/Sr. Resident and has acquired degree of M.D. (Radiodiagnosis) from the institute and from 04.07.1993 to 08.02.1999 as Assistant Prof. at Adhichunchungiri Institute of Medical sciences, Belur. In their letters, both Kasturba Medical Colleg, Manipal and Adhichunchungiri institute have stated that he has not worked at all in the institutions. Thus he has submitted false and forged experience certificates and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
7	Dr. Ramesh Sounderrajan	Asst. Prof. Asst. Prof.	Physiology Community	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore from 1990 to 1993 as Tutor/ Demonstrator/Registrar/Sr. Resident and has acquired degree of M.D. (Physiology) from the institute. In its letter Kasturba Medical Colleg, Mangalore has stated that he has not acquired degree from the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged degree certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher. In his declaration form he has

	Rahman		Medicine	claimed that he has worked at Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore from 1999 to 2002 as Tutor and has acquired degree of M.D. (CM) from the institute. In its letter Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore has stated that he has not acquired degree of M.D. (CM) from the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged degree certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
8	Dr. Devendra Nath Tiu	Asst. Prof.	Physiology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Rajendra Institute of Medical Scieneces, Ranchi from 2002 to 2005 as Tutor. In its letter Rajendra Institute of Medical Sciences has stated that he has not worked at all at the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
9	Dr. Ranibdra Nath Mishra	Asso. Prof.	Pharmacology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Kamineni Institute of Medical Sciences, Narketpally from 20.02.2003 to 01.11.2003 as Asso. Prof. In its letter Kamineni Institute, Narketpally has stated that he has not worked at all at the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council were, therefore, were clearly of the view that the Council should take steps for referring these cases to the Police authorities for registration of FIRs and conducting investigations in all such cases. It was observed that in the complaint to be sent to the Police authorities, it should also be clearly requested that all those cases where there is a collusion and conspiracy of such persons with the management of the colleges, the necessary action should also be taken against the management of those colleges. It was further decided that appropriate action be taken against these Doctors in accordance with Professional Conduct (Etiquette and Ethics) Regulations, 2002.

- (b) In view of above, the shortage of teaching faculty is more than 10 % as under:-
 - (i) Professor 1 (Forensic Medicine)
 - (ii) Associate Professor 5 (Pathology 1, Pharmacology 1, Radiodiagnosis 2, Tb & Chest 1)
 - (iii) Assistant Professor 8 (PSM –3, Anatomy –1, Biophysics –1, Physiology 2)
 - (iv) Tutor 3 (Anaesthesia –1, Radio-diagnosis –2)
- © The shortage of Residents is 12% as under:
 - (i) Sr. Resident 9 (Medicine –2, Paediatrics –2, Skin & VD –1, Psychiatry –1, Surgery –3)

2. Clinical material is inadequate as under:-

	Daily Average	Day of
		Inspection
O.P.D. attendance	700-750	830
Bed occupancy%	77-85%	80%

Operative work			
Number of major surgical operations	05-07	04	
Number of minor surgical operations	08-11	04	
Number of normal deliveries	0-1	00	
Number of caesarian Sections	0-1 00		
<u>Laboratory Investigations</u>			
Biochemistry	160-200	200	
Microbiology	09-10	15	
Serology	50-60	40	
Parasitology	01-02	02	
Haematology	300-350	270	
Histopathology	04-06	02	
Cytopathology	06-08	03	
Others	-	-	

Number of laboratory investigations is not commensurate with the number of patients claimed to be attending OPD/Indoor services. Surgical workload and obstetric activity require to be augmented.

- 3. Examination Hall: One big hall with 150 seat capacity is available, which is not as per MCI norms.
- 4. Accommodation for residents is available only for 36 residents, which is inadequate. No accommodation facility is available for lady resident doctors.
- 5. Boys and girls hostels have got dinning hall facility with 30 chairs each but mess facility is not available.
- 6. Accommodation for Nurses is available only for 82 nurses, which is inadequate as per norms.
- 7. There is a deficiency of one unit in General Medicine and one in General Surgery.
- 8. Clinical Pharmacology Lab is not fully equipped.
- 9. The roof of the Mortuary is reported to have flown of in the recent rain and wind and hence remains non functional.
- 10. No separate teaching area is available in the OPD for TB & Chest, Dermatology and Psychiatry departments.
- 11. There is no Clinical Psychologist available in the department of psychiatry.
- 12. There is no technician available in the Audiometry room.
- 13. There is no class room available in the department of Anaesthesia.
- 14. Other deficiencies/remarks in the main report.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4th batch of students at Maharajah's Institute of Medical Sciences, Nellimarla, Vizianagaram for the academic session 2006-07.

10. <u>Rajarajeshwari Medical College & Hospital, Bangalore - Renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of students for the academic session 2006-2007.</u>

Read: The inspection report (17^{th} & 18^{th} March, 2006) of Rajarajeshwari Medical College & Hospital, Bangalore for renewal of permission for admission of 2^{nd} batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (17th & 18th March, 2006) and noted the following:-

In relation to certain Declaration Forms submitted on behalf of the Medical teachers and endorsed by the Principal of the medical college, it was observed/found that teaching experience shown in those Declaration Forms is incorrect and in certain cases, it was seriously doubted. The office of the Council had undertaken the exercise of verifying the individual particulars regarding the claimed teaching experience from the Medical institutions concerned and found their claim to be fake. The following teaching faculty cannot be considered as the experience certificates submitted by them are forged as shown below:

#	Name	Designation	Department	Remarks
1.	Dr. R. Prema	Assoc. Prof.	Paediatrics	In her declaration form she has claimed that she has worked at Sri Devraj Urs Medical College, Kolar from 04.12.1999 to 06.05.2000 as Lecturer. In its letter Sri Devraj Urs. Medical College, Kolar has stated that she has not worked at all at the institution. Thus she has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
2.	Dr. Dhananjaya A. Hiremath	Professor & HOD	Anaesthesia	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at M.R. Medical College, Gulbarga from 01.07.1993 to 30.12.1996 as Asstt. Prof. and from 01.01.1997 to 30.12.2000 as Assoc. Prof. In its letter M.R. Medical College, Gulbarga has stated that he has not worked in this institution as full time teacher. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
3.	Dr. Geeta S.	Assoc. Prof.	Radio- Diagnosis	In her declaration form she has claimed that she has worked at M.R. Medical College, Gulbarga from 01.06.1997 to 31.05.1999 as Lecturer. In its letter M.R. Medical College, Gulbarga has stated that she has not worked as Lecturer in this institution. Thus she has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
4.	Dr. N. Bhaskar Prabhu	Prof. & HOD	Microbiology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal from 20.05.1977 to 09.12.1977 as Tutor and from 10.12.1977 to 17.11.1981 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter Kasturba Medical College, Manipal has stated that he has not worked at all at the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
5.	Dr. K.H.	Assoc. Prof.	Surgery	In his declaration form he has

Manjunath	claimed that he has worked at
	Kempegowda Instt. of Medical
	Sciences, Bangalore from 1987 to
	2004 as Assoc. Prof. In its letter
	Kempegowda Instt. of Medical
	Sciences, Bangalore has stated that he
	has not worked at all in this
	institution. Thus he has submitted a
	false and forged experience certificate
	and therefore cannot be accepted as a
	teacher.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council were, therefore, were clearly of the view that the Council should take steps for referring these cases to the Police authorities for registration of FIRs and conducting investigations in all such cases. It was observed that in the complaint to be sent to the Police authorities, it should also be clearly requested that all those cases where there is a collusion and conspiracy of such persons with the management of the colleges, the necessary action should also be taken against the management of those colleges. It was further decided that appropriate action be taken against these Doctors and the Principal of the college in accordance with Professional Conduct (Etiquette and Ethics) Regulations, 2002.

The Committee further noted that even after excluding the above mentioned teachers, the shortage of teaching faculty is less than 5%.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 2nd batch of 100 MBBS students at Rajarajeshwari Medical College & Hospital, Bangalore for the academic session 2006-07.

11. <u>Konaseema Instt. of Medical Sciences & Research Foundation Amlapuram – Renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of students for the academic year 2006-2007.</u>

Read: The inspection report (24th & 25th March, 2006) of Konaseema Instt. of Medical Sciences & Research Foundation, Amlapuram for renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (24th & 25th March, 2006) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The following teacher has been found working at other medical colleges during the inspection carried out by the MCI for the academic year 2006-07: -

#	Name	Designation	Department	Colleges where present during inspection
				for 2006-07
1	Dr. Umesh Chandra	Asstt. Prof.	Pathology	Katuri Medical College, Guntur
	Dash			

(b) The following teacher has been found to be working at more than one medical college simultaneously:-

#	Name	Designation	Department	Colleges where found to be working
				simultaneously
1	Dr. Mary Omon	Professor	Anatomy	i) Konaseema Institute of Medical Sciences,
	Horo			Amalapuram
				ii) Santosh Medical
				College,Ghaziabad
2	Dr. V. Siva	Asstt. Prof.	Biochemistry	i) Konaseema Institute of Medical Sciences,
	Prabodh			Amalapuram
				ii) Santhiram Medical College,

		Nandya	ıl

© In view of above, the shortage of teaching staff is more than 5% as under:-

- (i) Professor 2 (Paediatrics –1, Radio diagnosis 1)
- (ii) Assoc. Prof. 10 (Physiology –1, Pharmacology –1, Pathology –1, Forensic Medicine –1, General Medicine –2, TB & Chest –1, Obst. & Gynae. –1, Anaesthesia –2)
- (iii) Assistant Prof. 6 (Anatomy –2, Bio-Physics –1, Pharmacology –2, PSM –1)
- 2. Clinical material is inadequate in terms of bed occupancy & number of deliveries as under:-

	Daily Average	Day of Inspection
Bed occupancy%	70% to 80%	65%
Operative work		
Number of normal deliveries	00 to 02	00
Number of caesarian Sections	00 to 01	00

- 3. Hostel accommodation for the boys and girls is available only for 224 students against the requirement of 300 at this stage.
- 4. Accommodation is available only for 48 Residents which is inadequate as per norms.
- 5. Accommodation for nurses is available for only 50 nurses is inadequate for present stage.
- 6. Only 10 residential quarters for teaching faculty are available within the campus which is inadequate as per norms.
- 7. Dr. T. Venkateswara Rao, Medical Superintendent has only 8 years of administrative experience. He is not qualified to hold the post of Medical superintendent.
- 8. TB & Chest OPD has no x-ray lobby. Skin and STD OPD has got no procedure room or microscope. Psychiatry OPD has got 1 cubicle and no clinical psychologist. Ortho OPD has no class room available. There is no separate class room available for TB &Chest, Dermatology and Psychiatry in the OPD.
- 9. In Audiometry room no technician available. There is no procedure room available.
- 10. There is no ETO available in CSSD.
- 11. There is no dietician available. The kitchen is maintained in an unhygienic manner and the vegetable cutting area is open to sky.
- 12. In Pharmacology Department, there are nil drug specimens, 15 photographs, Nil laminated charts and 20 graphs. The Museum is under equipped.
- 13. In Pathology Department, the museum has 20 mounted and nil unmounted specimens, which is not adequate as per norms.
- 14. In Forensic Medicine Department, the museum has 8 mounted and nil fire arms, 25 models and nil poisons. Mortuary is not available. Museum is under equipped.
- 15. In Community Medicine, the museum has nil specimens, 30 models and 50 charts. Catalogues are available. Museum is not fully developed.
- 16. There is deficiency of 2 units in General Medicine, one unit in Paediatrics and 1 Unit in Obst. & Gynae.
- 17. There is no functional unit available in TB & Chest.

18. There is no clinical psychologist in the Psychiatry department.

19. Other deficiencies/remarks in the report.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 2nd batch of MBBS students at Konaseema Instt. of Medical Sciences & Research Foundation, Amlapuram for the academic session 2006-07.

12. <u>M.M. Instt. of Medical Sciences & Research Mullana, Ambala – Renewal of permission for admission of 4th batch of students for the academic year 2006-2007.</u>

Read: The inspection report (29th & 30th March, 2006) of M.M. Instt. of Medical Sciences & Research Mullana, Ambala for renewal of permission for admission of 4th batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (29th & 30th March, 2006) and noted the following:-

1. (a) The following faculty cannot be accepted due to reasons shown below:

#	Name	Designation	Department	Remarks
1	Dr. Minati	Prof.	Physiology	In her declaration form she has stated that
1	Sahu	1101.	1 Hysiology	she has experience of only 2 ½ years as
	Sanu			Asso. Professor. She cannot be accepted
				as Professor as she does not have
				experience of 4 yrs. as Asso. Prof.
				required as per Regulations.
2	Dr. Praveen	Tutor	Physiology	MBBS degree and Registration
	K. Goyal	Tutoi	1 Hysiology	certificates not provided
3	Dr. Rajesh K.	Asso. Prof.	Biochemistry	In his declaration form he has not shown
3	Pandey	71330. 1101.	Diochemistry	any experience as Asst. Prof. He cannot
	1 andcy			be accepted as Asso. Prof. as he does not
				possess teaching experience of 5 yrs.
				required as Asst. Prof.
4	Dr. Vinod	Asso. Prof.	Biochemistry	He is having M.Sc. from PGI Chandigarh
	Rattan	11550.1101.	Brothermoury	but has Ph.D. from Science faculty. He
				cannot be accepted as Asso. Prof. as he
				does not possess requisite academic
				qualifications.
5	Dr. Ranjan	Asst. Prof.	Biochemistry	Not accepted as he has M.Sc. & Ph.D.
	Katiyal			degrees from science faculty.
6	Dr. Kamlesh	Asst. Prof.	Pharmacology	Not accepted as she did not have MBBS
	Garg			Degree
7	Dr. Sunil	Asso. Prof.	Pathology	In his declaration form he has not shown
	Alipuria			any experience as Asst. Prof. He cannot
				be accepted as Asso. Prof. as he does not
				possess teaching experience of 5 yrs.
				required as Asst. Prof.
8	Dr. Virender	Professor	Microbiology	Not accepted as he has M.Sc. & Ph.D.
	Singh	_		degrees from life science faculty.
9		Professor	Community	Army teaching experience not as per MCI
	Singh	_	Medicine	norms
10	Dr. A.K.	Professor	Community	Army teaching experience not as per MCI
	Mukerjee		Medicine	norms
11	Dr. Ajay	Asso. Prof.	Medicine	In his declaration form he has shown
	Mittal			experience of 3 years 2 months as Asst.
				Prof. He cannot be accepted as Asso. Prof.
				as he does not possess teaching

					experience of 5 yrs. required as Asst. Prof.
12	Dr.	B.K.	Professor	Obst. Gyn.	In his declaration form he has shown
	Taneja				experience of 1 year as Asstt. Prof. He
					cannot be accepted as Professor as he does
					not possess teaching experience of 4 yrs.
					required as Professor.

(b) The following teacher has been found working at other medical colleges during the inspection carried out by the MCI for the academic year 2006-07: -

#	Name	Designation	Department	Colleges where present during inspection
				for 2006-07
1	Dr. Jaswant Singh	Professor	Psychiatry	Adesh Institute of Medical Sciences &
	Savhor			Research, Bathinda

- © The shortage of Residents is 11.2% as under :-
- i) Sr. Resident 7 (1 Dermatology, 3 Gen. Surgery, 1 Ortho., 1 ENT, 1 Ophthal.)
- ii) Jr. Resident 5 (1 Psychiatry, 4 OBGY)
- 2. Clinical Material is inadequate as under:

	Daily Ave	erage	Day of Inspection	
Bed occupancy%	85%		60)%
Radiological Investigations	O.P.	I.P.	O.P.	I.P.
X-ray	87	58	55	36
-				

- 3. In Central sterilization department, Glove inspection machine and instrument washing machine are not available.
- 4. In Pharmacology Department museum, there are no medicinal plants and graphs.
- 5. Other deficiencies/remarks in the report.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 4th batch of students at M.M. Instt. of Medical Sciences & Research, Mullana, Ambala for the academic session 2006-07.

13. <u>Sree Gokulam Medical College & Research Foundation, Trivandrum – Renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of students for the academic session 2006-2007.</u>

Read: The inspection report (16th & 17th March, 2006) of Sree Gokulam Medical College & Research Foundation, Trivandrum for renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council noted as under:-

- That this Applicant had submitted an application u/s 10A of the Act for seeking permission to start a medical college with an annual intake of 100 admissions in the MBBS course. This application had been considered for the academic year 2005-06. In the inspection held on 11-12 February, 2005 conducted by the MCI, gross deficiencies had been found. Another inspection was held on 10-11 June, 2005. Though, the college had earlier requested for evaluation of their application for 100 admissions annually, however, the college authorities had forwarded through the Central Govt., its request dated 14.06.2005 that their case may kindly be considered by the MCI for reduced intake.

- The statutory regulations of the MCI provide consideration and grant of permission u/s 10A of the Act for either 50,100 or 150 admissions annually. The norms for minimum infrastructural, teaching and other requirements through statutory regulations have been accordingly provided for either 50,100 or 150 admissions annually. Accordingly, pursuant to the request of the college dated 14.6.2005 forwarded to the Mci though the Ministry of Health, Govt. of India to the effect that their original application for 100 admissions annually be considered by the MCI for reduced intake the evaluation was carried out by the MCI for 50 admissions annually. On such an evaluation, it had been observed in the previous year that the college had fulfilled minimum norms for the required infrastructural, teaching and other facilities for 50 admissions only.
- As such, the Executive Committee of the Council, in its meeting held on 15.6.2005, where the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court were also present, had recommended to the Ministry of Health, Govt. of India for grant of Letter of Permission to this college for 50 MBBS admissions only for the academic year 2005-06. The Ministry of Health, Govt. of India vide its letter dated 17.8.2005 granted permission to this college for 50 annual admissions for the academic year 2005-06 for the MBBS course.

For the academic year 2006-07, an inspection for renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of students for the MBBS course at Sree Gokulam Medical College & Research Foundation, Trivandrum was carried out by the Council Inspectors on 16th & 17th March, 2006. The inspection report was considered by the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 24th April, 2006 where the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court were also present and it was decided as under:-

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (16th & 17th March, 2006) and also noted the following:-

- 1. The institute had submitted its application for 100 admissions vide its letter dated 15.06.2005. The Institute had requested for consideration of its application for reduced intake. Accordingly, the application was processed and the members of the Executive Committee at its meeting held on 14th & 15th June,2005 wherein the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court were also present decided to recommend to the Central Govt. for grant of Letter of Permission for 50 admissions. The Central Govt. vide its letter dated 17.08.2005 had issued the Letter of Permission for 50 admissions.
- 2. In relation to certain Declaration Forms submitted on behalf of the Medical teachers and endorsed by the Principal of the medical college, it was observed/found that teaching experience shown in those Declaration Forms is incorrect and in certain cases, it was seriously doubted. The office of the Council had undertaken the exercise of verifying the individual particulars regarding the claimed teaching experience from the Medical institutions concerned and found their claim to be fake. The following teaching faculty cannot be considered as the experience certificates submitted by them are forged as shown below:

#	Name		Designation	Department	Remarks
1	Dr.	Vinod	Assoc. Prof.	Radiology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he
	Dhandy	vate			has worked at Sree Ramchandra Institute,
					Porur as Asst. Prof. from 12.03.1990 to
					24.11.1996 and as Asso. Prof. from 25.11.1996
					to 29.11.1998. Sri Ramchandra Institute in its
					letter has stated that he has not worked in the
					institute at all. Thus he has submitted a false
					and forged experience certificate and therefore
					cannot be accepted as Assoc. Prof.
2	Dr. V.	Gnana	Asst. Prof.	Community	In his declaration form he has claimed that he
	Prakash	ıa		Medicine	has worked at Siddhartha Medical College,
					Tumkur as Tutor/S.R. from 20.07.2002 to
					19.08.2005. Siddhartha Medical College in its
					letter has stated that he has not worked in the

				institute at all. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
3	Dr. B. G. Tilak	Professor	Pathology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at JJM Medical College, Davangrer as Asst. Prof. from 12.09.1984 to 08.12.1991 and as Asso. Prof. from 09.12.1991 to 14.12.1997. JJM Medical College in its letter has stated that he has not worked in the institute at all. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
4	Dr. Mohamed Abdul	Professor	Forensic Medicine	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Osmania Medical College, Hyderabad as Tutor from 1972 to 1975 and as Asst. Prof. from 1978 to 1996. Osmania Medical College in its letter has stated that he has not worked in the institute at all. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
5	Dr. Rajendra Prasad	Assoc. Prof.	Forensic Medicine	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at JSS Medical College, Mysore as Asst. Prof. from 12.09.1989 to 17.10.1995, as Asso. Prof. from 18.10.1995 to 24.12.2000 and as Professor from 25.12.2000 to 29.07.2003. JSS Medical College in its letter has stated that he has not worked in the institute at all. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.

3. The Principal of the College has written to the University of Kerala vide its letter No. GMCRF/19/06 dt. 01.03.2006 for issuing affiliation certificate for the academic year 2006-2007. It was not provided at the time of inspection. The University affiliation for 2005-2006 is for 50 students.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council were, therefore, were clearly of the view that the Council should take steps for referring these cases to the Police authorities for registration of FIRs and conducting investigations in all such cases. It was observed that in the complaint to be sent to the Police authorities, it should also be clearly requested that all those cases where there is a collusion and conspiracy of such persons with the management of the colleges, the necessary action should also be taken against the management of those colleges. It was further decided that appropriate action be taken against these Doctors and the Principal of the college in accordance with Professional Conduct (Etiquette and Ethics) Regulations, 2002.

In view of above, and as the teaching faculty required for the present stage is adequate only for 50 students after excluding the above faculty, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 2nd batch of 50 (fifty) students at Sree Gokulam Medical College & Research Foundation, Trivandrum for the academic session 2006-07.

14. <u>Sri Aurobindo Instt. of Medical Sciences, Indore – Renewal of permission for admission of 3rd batch of students for the academic session 2006-07</u>

Read: The inspection report (3^{rd} & 4^{th} April, 2006) of Sri Aurobindo Instt. of Medical Sciences, Indore for renewal of permission for admission of 3^{rd} batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07 along with additional information supplied by the college vide its letter dated 20.04.2006.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (3rd & 4th April, 2006) along with additional information supplied by the college vide its letter dated 20.04.2006.and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch of 100 MBBS students at Sri Aurobindo Instt. of Medical Sciences, Indore for the academic session 2006-07.

15. <u>Padmashree Dr. D.Y. Patil Medical College, Pune – Renewal of permission for admission of 4th batch of students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 for the academic session 2006-07</u>

Read: The inspection report (13th & 14th March, 2006) of Padmashree Dr. D.Y. Patil Medical College, Pune_for renewal of permission for admission of 4th batch of students against the increased intake i.e. 100 to 150 for the academic session 2006-07.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (13th & 14th March, 2006) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4th batch of students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 at Padmashree Dr. D.Y. Patil Medical College, Pune for the academic session 2006-07.

16. <u>Coimbatore Medical College, Coimbatore – Renewal of permission for admission of 3rd batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. 110 to 150 for the academic session 2006-07</u>

Read: The inspection report (20th & 21st March, 2006) of Coimbatore Medical College, Coimbatore for renewal of permission for admission of 3rd batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. 110 to 150 for the academic session 2006-07 along with letter dated 15.07.2004 from the Joint Secretary, Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & F.W.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (20th & 21st March, 2006) along with letter dated 15.07.2004 from the Joint Secretary, Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & F.W. and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch of students against the increased intake i.e. from 110 to 150 at Coimbatore Medical College, Coimbatore for the academic session 2006-07.

17. <u>Approval of North Bengal Medical college for the award of MBBS degree against the increased intake i.e. 50 to 100</u>

Read: The inspection report (23rd & 24th March, 2006) for approval of North Bengal Medical College, Darjeeling for the award of MBBS degree against the increased intake from 50 to 100.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (23rd & 24th March, 2006) and decided to recommend that North Bengal Medical College, Darjeeling be approved for the award of MBBS degree granted by North Bengal University for the increased number of seats i.e. from 50 to 100.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 6th batch of MBBS students against the increased intake from 50 to 100 for the academic session 2006-07at North Bengal Medical College, Darjeeling.

18. <u>Increase of MBBS seats from 50 to 100 at Govt. Medical College, Kota.</u>

Read: The inspection report (24^{th} & 25^{th} March, 2006) of Govt. Medical College, Kota for increase of MBBS seats from 50 to 100 along with letter dated 17.04.2006 received from the Secretary to the Govt. of Rajasthan, Medical Education Department, Jaipur.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 17.04.2006 received from the

Secretary to the Govt. of Rajasthan, Medical Education Department, Jaipur stating that the matter of filling up of vacant posts and creation of new posts of teaching faculty/residents in MBS Government Hospital, Kota in order to fill the gap as per the MCI norms is under active consideration of the State Govt. and further that the agenda item be deferred till the next meeting of MCI.

Taking note of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to defer the consideration of the matter.

19. <u>Approval of MVJ Medical college, Bangalore for the award of MBBS degree granted</u> by Rajiv Gandhi Unviersity of Health Sciences, Bangalore.

Read: The inspection report (31st March, 1st April, 2006) for approval of MVJ Medical College, Bangalore for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi university of Health Sciences, Bangalore.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (3rd & 4th April, 2006) and noted the following:-

(a) In relation to certain Declaration Forms submitted on behalf of the Medical teachers and endorsed by the Principal of the medical college, it was observed/found that teaching experience shown in those Declaration Forms is incorrect and in certain cases, it was seriously doubted. The office of the Council had undertaken the exercise of verifying the individual particulars regarding the claimed teaching experience from the Medical institutions concerned and found their claim to be fake. The following teaching faculty cannot be considered as the experience certificates submitted by them are forged as shown below:

#	Name	Designation	Department	Remarks
1.	Dr. Alli	Assoc. Prof.	Radiology	In her declaration form she has
1.	Kumaravelu	ASSOC. PTOI.	Radiology	claimed that she has worked at Sri Ramachandra Medical College, Chennai from 08.06.1993 to 25.10.1999 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter Sri Ramachandra Medical Colleg, Manipal has stated that she has not worked at all in the institution. Further on verification from Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai regarding her M.D.(Radiology) degree, the Registrar of the said University vide his letter dated 22.4.2006 has informed that she has not obtained her M.D.(Radiology) from their university. Thus she has submitted a false and forged experience certificate
				and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
2.	Dr. Ramesh Sunder Raj	Assoc. Prof.	Pathology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at the Instt. Of Road Transport Perundurai Medical College, Erode from 10.06.1996 to 21.08.2001 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter the Instt. Of Road Transport Perundurai Medical College, Erode has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Further on verification from Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai

3.	Dr. A Ramaiah	Asstt. Prof.	Anatomy	regarding his M.D.(Pathology) degree, the Registrar of the said University vide his letter dated 22.4.2006 has informed that he has not obtained his M.D.(Pathology) from their university. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher. In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Mamta
				Medical College, Khammam from 18.08.98 to 15.11.01 as Tutor/Sr. Resident. In its letter Mamta Medical College, Khammam has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
4.	Dr. B Bhaskaran	Assoc. Prof.	Physiology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at the Instt. Of Road Transport Perundurai Medical College, Erode from 10.01.94 to 12.10.01 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter the Instt. Of Road Transport Perundurai Medical College, Erode has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
5.	Dr. Ravichandran Doraiswamy	Asstt. Prof.	Community Medicine	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has obtained his M.D.(Community Medicine) degree in 2003 from Rajah Muthiah Medical College, Annamalainagar. In its letter Rajah Muthiah Medical College, Annamalainagar has stated that he has not obtained M.D.(Community Medicine) degree from this institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged degree certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
6.	Dr. Ravirama Swamy	Assoc. Prof.	Biochemistry	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Rajah Muthiah Medical College, Annamalainagar from 05.07.94 to 25.10.99 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter Rajah Muthiah Medical College, Annamalainagar has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Further on verification from Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai regarding his M.D.(Biochemistry) degree, the Registrar of the said University vide his letter dated 22.4.2006 has informed that he has not obtained his M.D.(Biochemistry) from their university. Thus he has

			1	submitted a false and forged
				submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore
				cannot be accepted as a teacher.
7.	Dr. Ramadevi Shiva Subramanyam	Assoc. Prof.	Pathology (Blood Bank)	In her declaration form she has claimed that she has worked at Christian Medical College, Vellore from 03.06.95 to 06.02.02 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter Christian Medical College, Vellore has stated that she has not worked at all in the institution. Further on verification from Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai regarding her M.D.(Pathology) degree, the Registrar of the said University vide his letter dated 22.4.2006 has informed that she has not obtained her M.D.(Pathology) from their university. Thus she has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a
				teacher.
8.	Dr. Ravi Arasappan	Assoc. Prof.	TB & Chest	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Christian Medical College, Vellore from 23.02.1994 to 21.01.2000 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter Christian Medical College, Vellore has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Further on verification from Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai regarding his M.D.(T.B. & Chest) degree, the Registrar of the said University vide his letter dated 22.4.2006 has informed that he has not obtained his M.D.(T.B. & Chest) from their university. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
9.	Dr. Ramesh Shankar Ganeshan	Asstt. Prof.	Community Medicine	In his declaration form he had claimed that he has obtained he M.D.(Community Medicine) degree in 2002 from Stanley Medical College, Chennai. In its letter Stanled Medical College, Chennai has stated that he has not obtained M.D.(Community Medicine) degree from this institution. Further of verification from Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai regarding he M.D.(Community Medicine) degree the Registrar of the said University vide his letter dated 22.4.2006 had informed that he has not obtained he M.D.(Community Medicine) from their university. Thus he had submitted a false and forged degree certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
10.	Dr. Umapathy	Assoc. Prof.	Anatomy	In his declaration form he has
	Neelappan			claimed that he has worked at Deccan

				College of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad from 02.07.1995 to 25.10.2000 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter Deccan College of Medical Sciences, Hyderabad has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
11.	Dr. Stany Sunder Raj	Assoc. Prof.	Pathology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has obtained his M.D.(Pathology) degree in 1996 from Madurai Medical College, Madurai. In its letter Madurai Medical College, Madurai has stated that he has not obtained M.D.(Pathology) degree from this institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged degree certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
12.	Dr. Alexander G.	Asstt. Prof.	Forensic Medicine	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has obtained his M.D.(Forensic Medicine) degree in 2002 from Madras Medical College, Chennai. On verification from Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai regarding his M.D.(Forensic Medicine) degree, the Registrar of the said University vide his letter dated 22.4.2006 has informed that he has not obtained his M.D.(Forensic Medicine) from their university. Thus he has submitted a false and forged degree certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
13.	Mathew Alexander	Asst. Prof.	Psychiatry	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has obtained his M.D.(Psychiatry) degree in 1996 from Madras Medical College, Chennai. On verification from Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai regarding his M.D.(Psychiatry) degree, the Registrar of the said University vide his letter dated 22.4.2006 has informed that he has not obtained his M.D.(Psychiatry) from their university. Thus he has submitted a false and forged degree certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
14.	Dr. Ramamohana Rao D.	Asstt. Prof.	Physiology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has obtained his M.D.(Physiology) degree in 2002 from Madras Medical College, Chennai. On verification from Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai regarding his M.D.(Physiology) degree, the Registrar of the said University vide his letter dated 22.4.2006 has informed that he has not obtained his M.D.(Physiology)

				from their university. Thus he has submitted a false and forged degree certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
15.	Dr. Raj Kapoor Ramanathan	Asstt. Prof.	Anatomy	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has obtained his M.S.(Anatomy) degree in 2002 from Madras Medical College, Chennai. On verification from Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai regarding his M.S.(Anatomy) degree, the Registrar of the said University vide his letter dated 22.4.2006 has informed that he has not obtained his M.S.(Anatomy) from their university. Thus he has submitted a false and forged degree certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
16.	Dr. Rajesh Lava Kumar	Asstt. Prof.	Anatomy	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has obtained his M.S.(Anatomy) degree in 2001 from Madras Medical College, Chennai. On verification from Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai regarding his M.S.(Anatomy) degree, the Registrar of the said University vide his letter dated 22.4.2006 has informed that he has not obtained his M.S.(Anatomy) from their university. Thus he has submitted a false and forged degree certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council were, therefore, were clearly of the view that the Council should take steps for referring these cases to the Police authorities for registration of FIRs and conducting investigations in all such cases. It was observed that in the complaint to be sent to the Police authorities, it should also be clearly requested that all those cases where there is a collusion and conspiracy of such persons with the management of the colleges, the necessary action should also be taken against the management of those colleges. It was further decided that appropriate action be taken against these Doctors in accordance with Professional Conduct (Etiquette and Ethics) Regulations, 2002.

(b) The following teacher has been found to be working at more than one medical college during the inspection for academic year 2006-2007:-

1 Dr. V Srinivasulu / 17691

Subject: Psychiatry / Forensic Medicine

	Name of the College	Date of Joining	Date of Insp.
a)	M V J Medical College Research Hospital, Bangalore	09.03.2006	03.04.2006
b)	P E S Instt. Of Medical Sciences, Kuppam	26.07.2004	10.04.2006
c)	Medicity Institute of Medical Sciences, Ghanpur	16.10.2005	07.02.2006

Regarding Dr. V Srinivasulu, it is pertinent to mention here that on perusal of the declaration forms and its enclosures of the above mentioned colleges it is noted that in the declaration of MVJMedical College, Bangalore, the registation number and date of issue is different. Similarly, in the declaration of PES Insstt. Of Medical Sciences, Kuppam, the

- department, date of birth and photograph of Dr.Srinivaslu are different However, the enclosures attached with the declaration forms of Dr. Srinivaslu are same.
- [c] The following teachers have been found working at more than one medical college simultaneously:-

1 Dr. G K Prakash / 14222

Subject: Medicine

Name of the College	Date of Joining	Date of Insp.
a) M V J Medical College Research Hospital, Bangalore	02.05.2002	03.04.2006
b) Arogyavaram Institute of Medical Sciences, Arogyavaram	04.04.2004	12.04.2004
c) Raja Rajeshwari Instt. Of Medical Sciences, Bangalore	21.05.2004	15.04.2005

2 Dr. Vijaya Kumar H G / 49910

Subject: Community Medicine

Name of the College		Date of Joining	Date of Insp.
a) M V J Medical Coll	ege Research Hospital, Bangalore	07.12.2002	03.04.2006
b) SVS Medical College	ge, Triupati	01.05.2004	31.05.2004
c) Malankara Orthodo	x Medical College, Kolencherry	29.05.2004	31.05.2004

- (d) Shortage of teaching staff required at present stage is as under:-
 - (a) Faculty: More than 10%
 - (i) Assoc.Prof.- 6 (Biochemistry-1, Anatomy-1, Radio-Diagnosis-1, Pathology-2, Physiology-1)
 - (ii) Asstt.Prof.-7 (Bio-Physics-1, Anatomy-2, Community Medicine-2, Psychiatry-1, Physiology-1)
- 2. The college owns and is in possession of land measuring 26.5 acres located in Hoskote Taluk, Bangalore Rural District as certified by the Revenue Authorities. The land is divided into 3 plots. There is a village road separating the 2 sub-plots and the third sub-plot which is lying vacant is across NH-4 opposite to the Hospital complex. The college is in one sub plot while hospital is in another sub plot separated by the village road.
- 3. Auditorium is available with a capacity of 450 seats which is not as per MCI norms.
- 4. Lecture hall with audio-visual aids needs to be provided in Health Centers.
- 5. Hostel accommodation is available for 441 students which is inadequate as per norms. Boys and Girls hostel are located in two different places-one just behind the college where 51 three seater rooms for boys and 36 three seater rooms for girls are located. Additional 30 three seater rooms for boys and girls separately are made available in the college building on the third floor which are partially furnished.
- 6. Para-medical staff is inadequate as under:-

Laboratory Technicians/Assistants-25 Laboratory Attendants - 20

- 7. In clinical departments, departmental libraries have TB & Chest 60, Skin & VD-72 and Psychiatry-50 books, which is not as per MCI norms.
- 8. In Surgery & Allied Specialities, departmental libraries have Orthopaedics-70, Oto-Rhino Laryngology-60, Ophthalmology-60, Radio-Diagnosis-42 and Anaesthesia-60 books, which is not as per MCI norms.

- 9. In the department of Obst. & Gynae., departmental library has 70 books.
- 10. Other deficiencies/remarks in the report.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to approve MVJ Medical College, Bangalore for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Bangalore.

20. <u>Establishment of new Medical College, Bhubaneshwar by Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhubaneshwar.</u>

Read: The letter dt. 19/01/2006, from the Secretary, Kalinga Institute of Industrial Technology with regard to establishment of Medical College at Bhubaneshwar along with the legal opinion.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter dated 19.01.2006 from the Secretary, Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhubaneshwar along with the opinion of the council advocate on the land documents. The operative part of the legal opinion reads as under:-

"......Since they have failed to send the documents/certificate pertaining to the above mentioned information, despite several opportunities given to them to ascertain their claim for establishment of medical college, therefore, in my opinion, the application for giving approval for establishment of medical college by M/s KIIT, Bhubaneshwar, Orissa may not be considered by the Council at this stage due to non-fulfillment of the provisions of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999."

In view of above and since the applicant has failed to fulfill the mandatory and statutory requirement of the clear ownership and possession of 25 acres of land as laid down in the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999, or to produce requisite documents from revenue authorities, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to reiterate its earlier decision taken at its meeting held on 28.12.2005 to return the application recommending disapproval of the scheme for establishment of new medical college at Bhubaneshwar by Kalinga Institute of Medical Sciences, Bhubaneshwar u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956.

21. Permission to seek Clinical Training of Medical Students in Indian Hospitals.

Read: The letter from the President, St. James School of medicine with regard to permission to seek Clinical Training of Medical Students in Indian Hospitals.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter dated 4th April,2006 received from the President, Saint James School of Medicine, Netherlands, Antilles and decided to form a Sub-Committee consisting of Dr. Sneh Bhargava, Ex-Director, AIIMS, New Delhi and member, PG Committee, MCI; Dr. V.K. Jain, Professor & HOD, Department of Skin & VD, Pt. B.D. Sharma Postgraduate Instt. of Medical Sciences, Rohtak and Dr. (Mrs.) Usha Sharma, Principal, L.L.R.M. Medical College, Meerut and member, PG Committee, MCI to go through the matter and submit the report at the earliest.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to defer the consideration of the matter till then.

22. <u>Removal of name of Dr. Pradip Chhaganlal Mehta from the Indian Medial</u> Registrar.

Read: The letter dt. 01st March, 2006 received from Maharasthra Medical Council, Mumbai intimating that Dr. Pradip Chhaganlal Mehta Reg. No. (26595, dated 02/06/1971) has applied for cancellation of his registration with this Council to enable him to get a "Sanad" to

practice in Bombay High Court, as a Lawyer and his name has been removed from the Register of Registered Medical Practitioners.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 1st March,2006 received from the Registrar, Maharashtra Medical Council intimating that Dr. Pradip Chhaganlal Mehta (Registration No.26595, dated 02.06.1971) has applied for cancellation of his registration to enable him to get a "Sanad" to practice in Bombay High Court as a Lawyer and further that his name has been removed from the register of Registered Medical Practitioners permanently maintained by the Maharashtra Medical Council.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided that the name of Dr. Pradip Chhaganlal Mehta be also removed from the Indian Medical Register and also give intimation in this regard to all the State Medical Councils in the country.

23. Removal of name of Dr. Pankaj Kumar Singh from the Indian Medical Register.

Read: The letter dt. 22nd March, 2006 received from the Registrar, Delhi Medical Council intimating that name of Dr. Pankaj Kumar Singh, under registration no. 16974 dated 31/12/2002 has been permanently removed from the State Medical Register of the Delhi Medical Council who has obtain registration with the Council on forged Uttar Pradesh Medical Council Registration Certificate.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 22nd March,2006 received from the Registrar, Delhi Medical Council intimating that the name of Dr. Pankaj Kumar Singh, (Registration No.16974) has been removed from the register of Registered Medical Practitioners permanently as he has obtained registration with the Council on forged Uttar Pradesh Medical Council Registration Certificate.

In view of above, the Committee decided to remove the name of above-mentioned doctor from the Indian Medical Register and also give intimation in this regard to all the State Medical Councils in the country. The Committee further decided to lodge a FIR in the matter.

24. Request for Voluntary Retirement from the services of the Council.

Read: The request of Ms. Asha Sharma (Asstt.) for Voluntary Retirement from the services of the Council.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the letter dated 21.02.2006 from Mrs. Asha Sharma, Assistant, for voluntary retirement from the services of the Council and decided to accede to the request of Mrs. Asha Sharma.

25. <u>Establishment of New Medical College – Karuna Medical College by Safe Development Alms Trust.</u>

Read : The inspection report (29^{th} & 30^{th} March,2006) for establishment of new medical college Karuna Medical College by Safe Development Alms Trust.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (29th & 30th March,2006) and noted the following:-

- 1. The shortage of teaching staff required for Letter of permission is as under:-
 - (a) Dr.M.Neelayathatchi, cannot be accepted as Prof. of Obst. and Gyn. as she has no experience as Assoc. Prof. She cannot be accepted as Professor as she does not possess experience of 4 years as Assoc. Prof. required as per norms.
 - (b) In view of above, the shortage of teaching Faculty is more than 10% as under:

i) Associate Professor: 3 (Pharmacology –1, Orthopedics –1

Radiodiagnosis –1)

ii) Assistant Professor: 2 (Radiodiagnosis –1 and Dentistry -1)

iii) Tutor: 1 (Radiodiagnosis -1)

© The shortage of Residents is 18% as under:

i) Sr. Resident : 6 (General Medicine – 3, General Surgery – 2,

Ophthalmology -1)

ii) Jr. Resident: 1 (Paediatrics -1)

2. Clinical Material is inadequate as under:

	Daily Average	Day of Inspection
O.P.D. attendance	263 to 814	710
Bed occupancy%	40 to 70	60
Operative work		
Number of major surgical operations	9 to 23/month	4
Number of minor surgical operations	10 to 15/month	12
Number of normal deliveries	0 - 1/day	0
Number of caesarian Sections	10/month	0
<u>Laboratory Investigations</u>		
Biochemistry	150-200	150
Microbiology	25-30	30
Serology	40-50	30
Parasitology	2-6	4
Haematology	150-250	200
Histopathology	not started	-
Cytopathology	not started	-
Others	-	-

- 3. Common room for boys and girls: Only space is earmarked for 30 to 35 seats each.
- 4. Accommodation for students is not available. Boys hostel with capacity of 49 and girls hostel are still under construction. The girls hostel is located at a distance of 1 km. from the hospital building outside the campus which is not as per norms.
- 5. Accommodation is available only for 48 nurses which is not adequate. Nurses and Resident Doctors are only partially furnished.
- 6. Dr. Abdul Jaleel is the Medical Superintendent & has only 5 years of administrative experience. He is not qualified to hold the post as he does not possess the experience required as per norms.
- 7. Registration and Medical Record Section: It is computerised and not cross-linked with computer in the Laboratory and MRD sections. Medical record department is not computerised. ICD X classification is not being followed.
- 8. Resuscitation equipment in O.T. is not adequate.
- 9. Central sterilization department: CSSD is not available in the functional level only space is ear marked. No instruments and equipment are available. The CSSD facility needs to be augmented in terms of proper building, equipment and necessary staff.
- 10. Central laundry: It is not existing as on date.
- 11. Kitchen: No regular permanent arrangement for kitchen are available in Hospital premises, only one transit facility in one of the resident quarters was shown as kitchen without any proper organization, no kitchen trollies, no dietician and kachcha road connecting this transit kitchen to hospital.
- 12. Para medical staff is inadequate as under:

Laboratory Technicians: 5 Laboratory Assistants: 6 Laboratory Attendants: 6

13. In Anatomy department, there are no cadavers.

14. Other deficiencies/remarks in the report.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college - Karuna Medical College by Safe Development Alms Trust.

26. Establishment of Medical College at Barpeta by Society for Medical Education.

Read: The letter received from the Principal, Medical College, Barpeta requesting to defer the inspection of the college to the next academic session.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 27th March,2006 received from the Principal, Medical College at Barpeta informing that the infrastructure and other facilities required for LOI/LOP inspection are not yet ready and would require some more time for completion and further that the inspection of the college be deferred to the next academic session.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of the scheme for establishment of Medical College at Barpeta by Society for Medical Education.

27. Establishment of Medical College at Jorhat by Society for Medical Education.

Read: The letter received from the Principal, Medical College, Jorhat requesting to defer the inspection of the college to the next academic session.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council noted the letter dated 27th March,2006 received from the Principal, Medical College at Jorhat informing that the infrastructure and other facilities required for LOI/LOP inspection are not yet ready and would require some more time for completion and further that the inspection of the college be deferred to the next academic session.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to return the application to the Central Govt. recommending disapproval of the scheme for establishment of Medical College at Jorhat by Society for Medical Education.

28. <u>Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church Medical College, Kolencherry - Renewal of permission for admission of 5th batch of students for the academic session 2006-2007.</u>

Read: The inspection report (3rd & 4th April, 2006) of Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church Medical College, Kolencherry for renewal of permission for admission of 5th batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (3rd & 4th April, 2006) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5th batch of 100 MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07 at Malankara Orthodox Syrian Church Medical College, Kolencherry.

29. <u>Amrita Instt. of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Kochi - Renewal of permission for admission of 5th batch of students for the academic session 2006-2007.</u>

Read: The inspection report $(6^{th} \& 7^{th} April, 2006)$ of Amrita Instt. of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Kochi for renewal of permission for admission of 5^{th} batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07 along with the letter dated 20.04.2006 from the Institute.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (6th & 7th April, 2006) along with the letter dated 20.04.2006 from the Institute and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 5th batch of 100 MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07 at Amrita Instt. of Medical Sciences & Research Centre, Kochi.

30. <u>Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Instt. Pondicherry - Renewal of permission for admission of 6th batch of students for the academic session 2006-2007.</u>

Read: The compliance verification inspection report (7th & 8th April, 2006) of Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Instt. Pondicherry for renewal of permission for admission of 6th batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the compliance verification inspection report (7th & 8th April, 2006) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 6th batch of 100 MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07 at Mahatma Gandhi Medical College & Research Instt. Pondicherry.

31. <u>Kanyakumari Medical College, Asaripallam - Renewal of permission for admission of 3rd batch of students for the academic session 2006-2007.</u>

Read: The inspection report (3rd & 4th April, 2006) of Kanyakumari Medical College, Asaripallam for renewal of permission for admission of 3rd batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07 along with letter dated 15.07.2004 from the Joint Secretary, Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & F.W.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (3rd & 4th April, 2006) along with letter dated 15.7.2004 from the Joint Secretary, Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & F.W. and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch of 100 MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07 at Kanyakumari Medical College, Asaripallam with the request that the Central Govt. may obtain an undertaking from the Govt. of Tamilnadu that the construction and furnishing of the hostels and residential quarters will be completed before the admissions are made.

32. <u>Bharati Vidyapeeth Deemed University Medical College, Pune – Renewal of permission for admission of 3rd batch of students against the increased intake i.e. 120-150 for the academic session 2006-07.</u>

Read: The inspection report (13th & 14th March,2006) of Bharati Vidyapeeth Deemed University Medical College, Pune for renewal of permission for admission of 3rd batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. 120-150 for the academic session 2006-07.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (13th & 14th March, 2006) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 3rd batch of students against the increased intake i.e. from 120 to 150 at Bharati Vidyapeeth Deemed University Medical College, Pune for the academic session 2006-07.

33. <u>Tirunelveli Medical College, Tirunelveli - Renewal of permission for admission of 4th batch of students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 for the academic session 2006-2007.</u>

Read: The inspection report $(6^{th} \& 7^{th} \text{ April}, 2006)$ of Tirunelveli Medical College, Tirunelveli for renewal of permission for admission of 4^{th} batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. 100 to 150 for the academic session 2006-07 along with letter dated 15.7.2004 from the Joint Secretary, Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & F.W.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (6th & 7th April, 2006) along with letter dated 15.7.2004 from the Joint Secretary, Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & F.W. and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 4th batch of students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 at Tirunelveli Medical College, Tirunelveli for the academic session 2006-07.

34. <u>Approval of Karnataka Instt. of Medical Sciences, Hubli for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Karnataka against the increased intake i.e. 50 to 100.</u>

Read: The inspection report (31st March & 1st April,2006) for approval of Karnataka Instt. of Medical Sciences, Hubli against the increased intake from 50 to 100 along with letter dated 15.7.2004 from the Joint Secretary, Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & F.W.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (31st March & Ist April, 2006) along with letter dated 15.07.2004 from the Joint Secretary, Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & F.W. and decided to recommend that Karnataka Instt. of Medical Sciences, Hubli be approved for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Karnataka for the increased number of seats i.e. from 50 to 100.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 6th batch of MBBS students against the increased intake from 50 to 100 for the academic session 2006-07 at Karnataka Instt. of Medical Sciences, Hubli.

35. Recognition of Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok for the award of MBBS degree granted by Sikkim Manipal University of Health Medical & Technological Sciences, Gangtok.

Read: The inspection report (20th & 21st March, 2006) of Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok for recognition of the college for the award of MBBS degree granted by Sikkim Manipal University of Health Medical & Technological Sciences, Gangtok

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (20th & 21st March,2006 and noted the following:-

- 1. The shortage of teaching staff required at present stage is as under:-
 - (a) The following faculty was not considered while computing faculty deficiency for reasons shown below:

Sr.	Name of Faculty	Designation	Department	Date of	Remarks
No.				Joining	
1	Dr. D.K. Jha	Assoc. Prof.	Physiology	01.05.02	Experience as Asst. and
					Assoc. Prof. in dental
					colleges cannot be
					counted. Cannot be
					considered as Assoc.
					Prof.

2	Dr. Amlan Gupta	Assoc. Prof.	Pathology	31.03.02	Experience as Asst. Prof. at MCOMS Pokhra from Mar '97 to Aug '01 cannot be counted. Cannot be considered as Assoc. Prof.
3	Dr. Ranbir Pal	Assoc. Prof.	Comm. Med.	08.03.06	No relieving order from MGM Medical College, Bihar where he resigned on 28.02.06. Cannot be considered as Assoc. Prof.
4	Dr. (Col) N.S. RajGopal	Prof.	Medicine	03.11.00	Army experience in non-teaching hospitals, not counted. Cannot be considered as Prof.
5	Dr. Bidita Khandelwal	Assoc. Prof.	Medicine	16.08.00	Experience as Asst. Prof. at SMIMS, Tadong can only be counted from Aug '01, which is the date of LOP. Does not have 5 years experience as Asst. Prof. Cannot be considered as Assoc. Prof.
6	Dr. Parvati Nandi	Assoc. Prof.	Medicine	14.05.02	Does not have 5 years experience as Asst. Prof. Cannot be considered as Assoc. Prof.
7	Dr. Sudip Dutta	Assoc. Prof.	Pediatrics	14.05.02	Does not have 5 years experience as Asst. Prof. Cannot be considered as Assoc. Prof.
8	Dr. V.K.Tewari	Prof.	TB & Chest	24.05.04	Experience as Asst. Prof. for 5 yrs at 'Zambia' cannot be counted. Experience of Assoc. Prof. and Prof. in 'State Tuberculosis and Chest Institute' of 11 yrs cannot be counted. No experience certificate enclosed. Cannot be considered as Prof.
9	Dr. A.K. Sengupta	Prof.	Psychiatry	30.12.03	Army experience in non-teaching hospitals, not counted. Cannot be considered as Prof.
10	Dr. Sanjiba Dutta	Assoc. Prof.	Psychiatry	17.05.00	Experience as Asst. Prof. at SMIMS, Tadong can only be counted from Aug '01, which is the date of LOP. Does not have 5 years experience as Asst. Prof. Cannot be

					considered as Assoc.
11	Dr. Subhajeet Dey	Assoc. Prof.	General Surgery	15.07.98	Prof. Experience as Asst. Prof. at SMIMS, Tadong can only be counted from Aug '01, which is the date of LOP. Does not have 5 years experience as Asst. Prof. Cannot be considered as Assoc. Prof.
12	Dr. Bhim Prasad	Assoc. Prof.	General Surgery	07.02.00	Experience as Asst. Prof. at SMIMS, Tadong can only be counted from Aug '01, which is the date of LOP. Does not have 5 years experience as Asst. Prof. Cannot be considered as Assoc. Prof.
13	Dr. Ved Prakash Lakhanpal	Prof. & HOD	Orthopedics	31.03.05	No experience certificates, degree certificates and medical registration submitted. Cannot be considered as Prof.
14	Dr. Ganesh Kr. Shetty	Sr. Resident	Orthopedics	02.03.06	No experience as resident in Ortho Dept. Cannot be considered as Sr. Resident.
15	Dr. Jodha Chandra Savasam	Prof. & HOD	ENT	04.04.05	No experience certificates and degree certificates submitted. Cannot be considered as Prof.
16	Dr. Ahanthem Santa Singh	Prof.	OBG	28.07.97	Experience of Asst. Prof. at BPKIH, Dharan and Phokra from Feb'94 –July'97 cannot be counted. Experience as Asst. Prof. at SMIMS, Tadong can only be counted from Aug '01, which is the date of LOP. Does not have 5 years experience as Asst. Prof. Cannot be considered as Prof / Assoc. Prof.
17	Dr. Bikram Kishore Kanungo	Prof. & M.S.	OBGY	11.04.05	Army experience in non-teaching hospitals, not counted. Cannot be considered as Prof.

(b)

The shortage of teaching faculty is 33.82% as under:
i) Professor: (5) 1 Bio-Chemistry, 1 General Medicine, 1 Pediatrics, 1 Orthopedics, 1 ENT.

ii) Associate Professor: (21) 2 Anatomy, 2 Physiology, 2 Pathology, 1 Forensic Medicine, 1 Community Medicine, 2 General Medicine, 1 Pediatrics, 1 TB Chest, 3 General Surgery, 1 Orthopedics, 1 OBGY, 2 Anaesthasia, 1 Radio-Diagnosis, 1 Dentistry.

- iii) Assistant Professor: (5) 1 Physiology, 1 Orthopedics, 1 Anaesthasia, 2 Radio-Diag.
- iv) Tutor: (15) 3 Pathology, 2 Forensic, 6 Community Medicine, 2 Anaestasia, 2 Radio-Diagnosis.
- [c] The shortage of Residents is 58% as under :
 - i) Sr. Resident: (12) 4 General Medicine, 1 Pediatrics, 1
 Dermatology, 1 Psychiatry, 3, General
 Surgery, 2 Ortho.
 - ii) Jr. Resident: (32) 7 Gen Med, 2 Pediatrics, 2 TB Chest, 3 Dermatology, 3 Psychiatry, 6 Gen Surgery, 3 Ortho, 1 ENT, 2 Optho, 3 OBGY
- 2. There are four Lecture Theares, all gallery type with a capacity of 2X150 and 1X100 and 1X75, which are not as per norms. The Capacity of one lecture theater is 100 and another is 75 which are not as per Council norms. There is no lecture theatre in the hospital.
- 3. Auditorium is under construction on Level IV of the college building.
- 4. Two Examination Halls, 1 of 125 Capacity located in the ground floor of the Hostel Complex behind the VC's Office and 1 of 124 capacity hall located in Level 2 of the College/Hospital Complex are available. Toilet facilities are located outside the hall.
- 5. Pakyong health centre is under the administrative and financial control of the Government of Sikkim. The students visit the centre once a month. No residential accommodation for students and interns is available. There are 2 medical officers posted in the center, but they were not available at the time of the inspection. A temporary display board with the name of the Centre had been put up. Residential hostel is not available. The mess facility is not available. There was no medical officer available at the time of inspection.
- 6. The Urban Health Center has now been changed from Singtam to Nan-Nang. The inspection team visited Nan-Nang U.H.C. It is located at a distance of 5 km from the college. It covers a population of 3500. It has been adopted by the college 1 month back.
- 7. There is only 1 hostel building which has 2 wings. Boys and girls are accommodated in each wing with a separate entrance. There is a common mess for students. Accommodation is available for 400 boys and girls students which is inadequate for the present stage.
- 8. A new nurse's hostel has been built. It has 92 rooms, with a capacity of 276. Residents, nurses and few faculty members have been allocated this hostel. There is no mess in this hostel.
- 9. There is no separate hostel for interns and residents. The interns, nurses and residents are proposed to be accommodated in the new nurses hostel and on the 9th level of the college building which has 17 two seater rooms. On the 9th level, kitchen facilities are provided but there is no mess.
- 10. Distribution of beds and units are not as per Council norms as under:-

Speciality	Required Beds/Units	Present Beds/Units	Deficiency if any
Medicine & Allied Specialities			
General Medicine			
Paediatrics	120/4	116/3	Deficiency of 4 beds
TB & Chest	60/2	56/2	and 1 unit in
Skin & VD	20/1	18/1	Medicine and 4 beds

Psychiatry	10/1	10/1(06)	in Pediatrics and 2
	10/1	10/1(02)	beds in TB & Chest.
Total			
	220	210/8	
Surgery & Allied Specialities			
General Surgery			
Orthopaedics	120/4	120/3(02)	Deficiency of 1 unit
Ophthalmology	60/2	54/2	in General Surgery.
ENT	20/1	20/1(04)	Deficiency of 6 beds
	20/1	18/1	in Orthopaedics and
Total			2 beds in ENT
	220	212/7	
Obstetrics & Gynaecology			
Obstetrics & ANC	60/2	56/2	Deficiency of 4 beds
Gynaecology	00/2	30/2	in OBGY
o y mace on o g y			obo1
			There is deficiency
			of 22 beds and 2
Total	500	478/19	units, 1 each in
			Medicine &
			Surgery.

- ➤ Clear cut demarcation of the teaching units is not well displayed.
- There is an intermixing of beds of different departments in most wards.
- There is over crowding of beds with less moving space for personnel and trolley.
- 11. There is no child guidance clinic and counseling room available in Paediatric OPD. In Orthopaedics OPD, there is a classroom for 20 students and no X-ray view box. In ENT OPD, Classroom does not have a x-ray view box. Dental OPD has got one dental chair and no class room. OBG OPD has got three cubicles with no x-ray view box and there is no family planning counseling room.
- 12. Only one classroom is available in the wards, individual classroom for the clinical departments is not available. There is no clear demarcation of various Medical and Surgical Units displayed. There is over crowding of cots with less space available of movement of personnel and Trolley. Number of toilets available in all the wards in inadequate. Nursing Station is common for wards having 100 beds located in separate enclosures.
- 13. Clinical material is grossly inadequate as under :-

	Daily Average		Day of Inspection (20/03/06)
O.P.D. attendance	2:	20	363
Casualty attendance	1	4	12
Number of admissions / discharge	16	/17	47/8
Bed occupancy %	2	25	49.4
Operative work			
Number of major surgical operations	C	2	01
Number of minor surgical operations	C	2	01
Number of normal deliveries	C	1	Nil
Number of Caesarian Sections	C	1	Nil
Radiological Investigations	<u>OP</u> 16	<u>IP</u> 16	
X-ray	16	16	57
Ultrasonography	8.3	6.2	10
Special Investigations	-	-	Nil
C.T. Scan	1	0.8	Nil

<u>Laboratory Investigations</u>	<u>OP</u>	<u>IP</u>	
Biochemistry	88.4	74	264
Microbiology	16	15	47
Serology	5.9	5.8	12
Parasitology	1	0.5	2
Haematology	57.3	56.8	104
Histopathology	1.5	2	3
Cytopathology	2	1	4
Others			

There are no beds in ICCU, PICU and OBG ICU.

Note: Govt. of India, Ministry of Health & F.W. vide circular letter No. U.12012/12/94-ME(P), dated 4th May,2000 addressed to Health/Medical Education Secretaries of all State Govts./U.T. Administrations states the following:

"It may be noted that the arrangement to utilize the facilities of other Govt./District Hospitals on the conditions stipulated in the Govt. of India letter shall be for only a specified period of 3 years from the date of grant of permission by the Central Government for establishment of a new medical college. These facilities shall be in addition to the mandatory requirement of the applicant owning and managing a hospital of not less than 300 beds with necessary infrastructural facilities and with a view to mitigate the problem of non-availability of required clinical material for teaching and training of students. It may please be noted the above permission is in no way relaxation of the provision of the Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 which are to be followed scrupulously by all applicants of new medical colleges......"

SMIMS was granted the Letter of Permission for the Academic Year 2001-02. The STNM Hospital is under the administrative and financial control of the District Health Authorities of the Govt. of Sikkim and not under the financial and administrative control of the Dean of the college. It is not owned and managed by the applicant. The staff of the Medical College does not participate in any teaching activities in the STNM Hospital. No separately demarcated teaching beds are available in the STNM Hospital for the faculty of SMIMS. STNM Hospital doctors do not contribute to the patient care management at CR Hospital owned and managed by the applicant. The requirement of having a separate teaching unit in STNM Hospital is not fulfilled.

Considering all the above issues, the staff of STNM Hospital as well as the clinical material at that hospital cannot be considered as on the teaching faculty of the Medical Colleges and therefore has not been considered.

- 14. Clinical lab investigations are mostly done in the departments and the number of investigations are found to be quite inadequate.
- 15. 5 major and 2 major OTs are functional which are inadequate. The operative workload is low.
- 16. No separate labour room is available for septic cases.
- 17. One unit of 500 MA with image intensifier, one 300 MA and one portable 60 MA are available, which are inadequate as per Council norms.
- 18. In Pharmacy, there are no sub-stores located in different parts of hospital.
- 19. CSSD: One horizontal autoclave and 1 portable steam autoclave are available which is inadequate. There are two technician available working for 8 hours daily.
- 20. There is no separate kitchen available. Food is prepared in the canteen and distributed to 30-40 patients daily. No food cart is available. There is no dietician.

21. Paramedical staff is inadequate as under :-

Laboratory Technicians: 17 Laboratory Assistants: 14 Laboratory Attendants: 26

22. Nursing Staff is grossly inadequate as only 107 nurses are available against the requirement of approximately 205 Nurses required at this stage.

Nursing Superintendents: 02

Matron: Nil Staff Nurses: 15 Nursing Sister: 79 Hospital Auxiliary: 1 BSc. Nursing: 10

- 23. In Anatomy Deptt., there are 2 demonstration rooms each having 40 seats each which is inadequate.
- 24. In Physiology Deptt., there is 1 demonstration room having 40 seats, which is inadequate.
- 25. In Pathology Deptt., there is 1 demonstration room having 50 seats, which is inadequate.
- 26. Mortuary is available but not functional. They approach road to the mortuary is still not been made.
- 27. The number of books in the departmental libraries of Psychiatry 28, TB & Chest 34 and Radiodiagnosis 20, are inadequate.
- 28. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the main report.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided not to recognise Sikkim Manipal Institute of Medical Sciences, Gangtok for the award of MBBS degree granted by Sikkim Manipal University of Health Medical & Technological Sciences, Gangtok.

36. <u>Approval of Khaja Banda Nawaz Instt. of Medical Sciences, Gulbarga for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Karnataka</u>

Read: The inspection report (3rd & 4th April, 2006) of Khaja Banda Nawaz Instt. of Medical Sciences, Gulbarga for approval of the college for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Karnataka

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (3rd & 4th April,2006) and decided to recommend that Khaja Banda Nawaz Instt. of Medical Sciences, Gulbarga be approved for the award of MBBS degree granted by Rajiv Gandhi University of Health Sciences, Karnataka with an annual intake of 100 (hundred) students.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council further decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of fresh batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07 at Khaja Banda Nawaz Instt. of Medical Sciences, Gulbarga.

37. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Kanchipuram Distt., Tamilnadu by Rajah</u> Muthiah Chattiar Charitable & Educational Trust, Chennai

Read : The inspection report (5^{th} & 6^{th} April, 2006) for establishment of new medical college at Kanchipuram Distt., Tamilnadu by Rajah Muthiah Chattiar Charitable & Educational Trust, Chennai

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (5th & 6th April, 2006) and decided to recommend to the Central Government to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Kanchipuram Distt., Tamilnadu by Rajah Muthiah Chattiar Charitable & Educational Trust, Chennai u/s 10A of the IMC Act,1956 with an annual intake of 150 students.

38. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Pondicherry by Ramachandra Educational Trust, Chennai.</u>

Read: The inspection report (10th & 11th April, 2006) for establishment of new medical college at Pondicherry by Ramachandra Educational Trust, Chennai.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (10th and 11th April, 2006) and noted the following:-

- 1. The shortage of teaching staff required at present stage.
 - (a) The shortage of teaching faculty is more than 18% as under:-
 - (i) Professor 1 (Pathology 1)
 - (ii) Assoc. Prof. 3 (Physiology –3
 - (iii) Assistant Prof. -1 (Surgery -1)
 - (iv) Tutor 7 (Anatomy 2, Physiology 1, Biochemistry 1, Community Medicine 1, Microbiology 1 & Anaesthesia 1)
 - (b) The shortage of Residents is 23.6% as under:-
 - (i) Sr. Resident 9 (General Medicine 4, General Surgery 2, Orthopadics –1, ENT 1, Obst. & Gynae. 1)

2. Clinical Material is grossly inadequate as under:-

	Daily A	verage	Day of I	nspection	
O.P.D. attendance	60	663		1276	
Casualty attendance	1	6		8	
Number of admissions / discharge	22	/21	27	7/21	
Bed occupancy%	55	5%	94	1.30	
Operative work					
Number of major surgical operations		1		-	
Number of minor surgical operations	,	2		3	
Number of normal deliveries		-		-	
Number of caesarian Sections		-	-		
Radiological Investigations	O.P.	I.P.	O.P.	I.P.	
X-ray	47	2	56	5	
Ultrasonography	-	-	-	-	
Special Investigations	-	-	-	-	
C.T. Scan	-	-	-	-	
<u>Laboratory Investigations</u>					
Biochemistry	27	5	30	15	
Microbiology	3	-	3	-	
Serology	10	-	5	-	
Parasitology	13	3	6	3	
Haematology	49	8	55	22	
Histopathology	-	-	-	-	
Cytopathology	-	-	-	-	
Clinical Pathology	64	11	84	25	

- The Superintendent has reported 94.30% bed occupancy. On actual counting occupancy comes to 51.70%.
- Most of the admitted patients are of little clinical importance.

- 3. In administrative block civil construction is in progress. There is no flooring and plastering on walls. There is no electricity supply, electrical fittings, water supply and toilet facilities. There are no doors and windows fitted. There is no furniture.
- 4. Building:- The medical college occupies a ground floor. Civil work is in progress. In most of the areas flooring is not done. Most of the walls are also not constructed. Even the constructed walls are not plaster. The doors and windows are not fitted in the walls. There is no electric supply, electric fixtures, water supply, toilets and drainage system. All the departments of the college are not established.
- 5. Lecture Theatres: Space is identified for three theatres on ground floor. Civil construction is in progress. In the hospital on the top floor in one ward 40 chairs are kept for lecture hall. Other facilities are not available.
- 6. Common room for boys and girls not established.
- 7. Central Library is not established. However in the research laboratory of the biochemistry department 2454 books are available. Books are kept on the tables in a haphazard manner. 10 chairs are available.
- 8. Central Photography cum audio-visual units not established.
- 9. Hostels: Civil construction of Boys, Girls, Resident & Nurses hostels has just started.
- 10. Residential quarters Civil construction of 6 flats for faculty is in progress. No quarters for class III & IV employees.
- 11. Sports and recreation facilities not available.
- 12. In OPD: Each specialty is provided with teaching area without furniture, black boards, couch, x-ray view box etc. Aucdiometry room commissioning is in progress and is not available.
- 13. In Ward: Most of the wards are without any doctor duty room, nurse duty room, pantry, examination/procedure room, teaching are and side laboratory. Nursing station is not properly placed. It should be placed in such a way that nurse can observe all the patients. In some wards there is over crowding of the beds. Even the beds are not numbered. In medicine and surgery wards male and female patients are put in the same ward. Side lockers are not provided to most of the patients. Most of the offices of the teaching staff are without any furniture. Even the dean, superintendent and administrative block is not provided with any furniture.
- 14. Registration & Medical Record Section: A counter for OPD and Indoor cases in OPD. It is not computerized.
- 15. Central Casualty Service:- There is no permanent Casualty Medical Officer.
- 16. OT Unit: All operation theatres are commissioned but not functional.
- 17. Intensive Care: All intensive care areas are non-functional.
- 18. Labour room is commissioned but non-functional.
- 19. Kitchen: No record of diet supplied to the patients is available. There is no provision to supply special diet as recommended by Physician.
- 20. Para medical staff is grossly inadequate as under:-

Laboratory Technicians: 13 Laboratory Attendants: 10

- 21. In Anatomy Department on the ground floor of the college building space is identified for the various sections of anatomy department. Civil construction work is in progress. There is no flooring and plasters on the walls. Some of the walls are even not constructed. There is no electricity supply, no electrical fittings, water supply and toilet facilities. There are no doors and windows fitted. No furniture is available. The department is non-functional. Dissection rooms construction is in progress. Students lockers are not available. Cadavers are not available. Histology laboratory construction is in progress.
- 22. In Physiology Department, civil construction work is in progress. There is no flooring and plasters on the walls. Some of the walls are even not constructed. There is no electricity supply, no electrical fittings, water supply not toilet facilities. There are no doors and windows fitted. No furniture is available. Demonstration rooms are not available. Research laboratory and departmental library are not available. The construction of students' laboratories is in progress. Offices for the teaching and non-teaching staff are not available. The department is non-functional.
- 23. In Bio-chemistry Department, on the ground floor of the college building space is identified for the various sections of Bio-chemistry department. Civil construction work is in progress. There is no flooring and plasters on the walls. Some of the walls are not even constructed. There is no electricity supply, no electrical fittings, water supply and toilet facilities. There are no doors and windows fitted. No furniture is available.
- 24. Community Medicine Department is not existing.
- 25. Para clinical department are not existing. Teaching staff is not provided.
- 26. Other deficiencies/remarks in the report.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Pondicherry by Ramachandra Educational Trust, Chennai u/s 10A of the I.M.C. Act,1956.

39. <u>Establishment of new medical college at Bhatinda, Punjab by Adesh Foundation, Muktsar</u>

Read: The inspection report (10th & 11th April, 2006) for establishment of new medical college at Bhatinda, Punjab by Adesh Foundation, Muktsar

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (10th & 11th April, 2006) and decided to recommend to the Central Government to issue Letter of Permission for establishment of new medical college at Bhatinda, Punjab by Adesh Foundation, Muktsar u/s 10A of the IMC Act,1956 with an annual intake of 150 students for the academic session 2006-07.

40. Establishment of new medical college at Beed by Aditya Educational Trust, Beed.

Read: The application received on 20-3-2006 for establishment of new medical college at Beed by Aditya Educational Educational Trust, Beed.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council observed that the proposal for establishment of new medical college at Beed by Aditya Educational Trust, Beed was received in the office of the Council on 20th March, 2006. The statutory time schedule as per Regulations is as under:-

SCHEDULE FOR RECEIPT OF APPLICATIONS FOR ESTABLISHMENT OF NEW MEDICAL COLLEGES AND PROCESSING OF THE APPLICATIONS BY THE CENTRAL GOVERNMENT AND THE MEDICAL COUNCIL OF INDIA.

Stage of processing	Last date
Stage of processing	Last date

days inclusive) of any year. 30th September Receipt of applications by the MCI from 2. Central Govt. 31st December. Recommendations of Medical Council of India to Central Government for issue of Letter of Intent. Issue of Letter of Intent by the Central 31st January. 4. Government. 28th February Receipt of reply from the applicant by the Central Government requesting for

Letter of permission.

6. Receipt of Letter from Central Government by the Medical Council of India for

Receipt of applications by the Central Govt.

1.

 Receipt of Letter from Central Governmen by the Medical Council of India for consideration for issue of Letter of Permission. 15th March

From 1st August to 31st August (both

7. Recommendation of Medical Council of India to Central Government for issue of Letter of Permission.

15th June.

8. Issue of Letter of Permission by the Central Government.

15th July.

Note: (1) The information given by the applicant in Part-I of the application for setting up a medical college that is information regarding organization, basic infrastructural facilities, managerial and financial capabilities of the applicant shall be scrutinized by the Medical Council of India through an inspection and thereafter the Council may recommend issue of Letter of Intent by the Central Government.

(2) Renewal of permission shall not be granted to a medical college if the above schedule for opening a medical college is not adhered to and admissions shall not be made without prior approval of the Central Government....."

As per the above-mentioned mandatory time schedule prescribed for establishment of new medical colleges, the last date for receipt of applications by the MCI from the Central Government is 30th of September of the previous year. Thereafter, the process for consideration, the recommendations and issuance of Letter of Intent (LOI) has been prescribed in different stages, for all those applications which are received by the MCI from the Central Government by 30th September of the previous year. The Letter of Intent is to be issued by 31st January of the year subsequent to the previous year in which the applications had been received.

The last date of 15th of March in the subsequent year has been prescribed only for receiving the letter from the Central Government by the MCI for consideration of the case for issuance of Letter of Permission in respect of only such colleges whose applications had been received under section 10A of the Act by the MCI from the Central Government by 30th September of the previous year and in respect of which the Letter of Intent had been issued by 31st January, after following different stages for the purpose of LOI as laid down in the statutory Regulations mentioned above.

In the light of the above statutory time schedule, it is stated that the application of this college under section 10A of the Act has been received by the office of the Council from the Central Government only on 20.3.2006 i.e. after the prescribed last date under the Regulations for sending the applications u/s 10A for establishment of new medical colleges, by the Central Government and which for the present purpose is 30.9.2005. Accordingly, since it was not permissible for the Council to consider that application u/s 10A as per the statutory Regulations,

the MCI was required to return the application in original. Vide its letter dated 30.3.2006 this application u/s 10A was returned by the office of the Council to the Central Government.

The Central Government vide its letter dated 10.4.2006 has requested the Council to accept the proposal for evaluation for grant of Letter of Permission (LOP)

The following directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court in Mridul Dhar's case dated 12.1.2005 were also noted:

- 14. Time schedule for establishment of new college or to increase intake in existing college, shall be adhered to strictly by all concerned.
- 15 Time schedule provided in Regulations shall be strictly adhered to by all concerned failing which defaulting party would be liable to be personally proceeded with.

In view of the above mentioned statutory time schedule for Establishment of Medical College Regulations, 1999 and of the directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court, it is stated that for considering any case for grant of permission u/s 10A of the Act for the academic year 2006-07, the applications were required to be received by the Council from the Central Government by 30.9.2005.

With reference to the letter of the Govt. of India received on 20.3.2006, it is seen that as the application has been received in the office of the Council after the prescribed last date as indicated above and consideration whereof for this year is not permissible as per the statutory regulations and the directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court, the application in original be sent back to the Govt. of India.

41. <u>Inspection of the medical colleges for permission/renewal of permission for establishment of new medical colleges/increase of seats – utilization of services of Retd. Inspectors of the Council/Senior Professors as members of Inspection team.</u>

Read: The matter with regard to utilization of services of Retd. Inspectors of the Council/Senior Professors as members of Inspection team.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council in view of the Govt. of India letter dated 17.04.2006 decided that some of the Deans/Senior Professors who have very wide experience of conducting the inspections on behalf of the Council may be appointed as Council Inspectors for the purpose of carrying out the inspections to cater to such situation as under:-

- 1. Dr. G.K. Sharma, Dean, Lady Hardinge Medical College, New Delhi.
- 2. Dr. Arun Aggarwal, Dean, Maulana Azad Medical College, New Delhi.
- 3. Dr. A.K. Dutta, Vice-Principal & Professor & HOD Paediatrics, Lady Hardinge Medical College, New Delhi.
- 4. Dr. Achal Gulati, Professor of ENT, Maulana Azad Medical College, New Delhi.
- 5. Dr. Sharad Vyas, Professor & Head, Department of Surgery, B.J.Medical College, Ahmedabad.
- 6. Dr. Bakul Leuva, Professor of Obst. & Gynae., B.J. Medical College, Ahmedabad.
- 7. Dr. S.V. Patel, Dean, Medical College, Bhavnagar.
- 8. Dr. J.V. Hardikar, Professor & Head, Department of Surgery, Seth G.S. Medical College, Mumbai.

42. <u>Clarification as requested by Col. Hafiz Khan, Commanding Officer, APO Reconvening/Reassembling of Court of Inquiry.</u>

Read: The letter dated 25-11-2005 from Commanding Officer, APO along with the decision of the Ethics Committee.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the matter and decided to approve the following decision of the Ethics Committee dated 20th & 21st March,2006:-

"The Ethics Committee after detailed discussion decided to reply the letter dated 25.11.2005 from Col. Hafiz Khan, Commanding Officer, APO, 152 Air Defence Regiment, C/o 99 AP, as follows:-

"A Specialist in Obst. & Gynae. shall confine his treatment to his own field and specialization only. It appears that the particular Gynaecologist in question is practicing in areas which are beyond the scope of his training and area of specialization."

43. Appeal against the Order passed by the Andhra Pradesh Medical Council on the Complaint made Dr. K. Srikar Reddy, Third Secretary in Embassy of India, Berlin with regard to death of Mrs. Srilatha Reddy.

Read: The appeal against the Order passed by the Andhra Pradesh Medical Council on the Complaint made Dr. K. Srikar Reddy, Third Secretary in Embassy of India, Berlin with regard to death of Mrs. Srilatha Reddy along with the decision of the Ethics Committee.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the matter and decided to approve the following decision of the Ethics Committee dated 19th & 20th January,2006:-

"The Ethics Committee received a letter dated 31.3.2004 alongwith its enclosures from Dr. K. Srikar Reddy, Third Secretary in Embassy of India, Berlin with regard to appeal against the Order passed by the Andhra Pradesh Medical Council in the matter of death of Mrs. Srilatha Reddy.

The matter was considered by the Ethics Committee at its meeting held on 19th & 20th April, 2004 and it was decided as under:-

"The Ethics Committee considered the matter and decided to request Andhra Pradesh Medical Council to provide the particulars of registration and qualification as well as addresses of the concerned doctors alongwith enquiry report and all other relevant documents to this Council at the earliest. A copy of the same may be marked to the complainant."

The above decision was communicated to the Registrar, A.P.Medical Council vide Council's letter dated 6.05.2004 with a request to provide the information as desired by the Ethics Committee.

In reference to above, the Registrar, A.P.Medical Council has sent a letter dated 20.05.2004 alongwith the particulars of registration and qualification and other relevant documents.

The Registrar, A.P. Medical Council vide his letter dated 22.05.2004 has also forwarded a copy of the report of the Ethical and Malpractices Committee.

The matter was considered by the Ethics Committee at its meeting held on 2^{nd} & 3rd September, 2004 and it was decided as under:-

"The Ethics Committee considered the matter with regard to appeal against the Order passed by the Andhra Pradesh Medical Council on the complaint made by Dr. K. Srikar Reddy, Third Secretary in Embassy of India, Berlin regarding death of Mrs. Srilatha Reddy and decided that an appeal was made against the order passed by Andhra Pradesh Medical Council. This appeal was received at the MCI office on 05.04.2004 before the Section 8.7 and 8.8 of Professional Conduct (Etiquette and Ethics) Regulations 2004 came into force. Subsequently, the Registrar of Andhra Pradesh Medical Council was

requested to provide information and the Registrar, AP Medical Council had submitted all the documents pertaining to this case.

The Ethics Committee considered the documents and felt that an expert opinion from Gynecologist need to be obtained before a final decision could be arrived at. Therefore, it was decided to refer this case to Professor Neera Aggarwal, Professor and HOD, Deptt. of Gynae. & Obst., GTB Hospital, Shahdara, Delhi for her opinion in this particular case whether there was any negligence in the part of the Doctors. This case may also be referred to Dr. Rakesh Kumar, Professor of Anaesthesiology, Maulana Azad Medical College, New Delhi, for his opinion in this particular case whether there was any negligence in the part of the doctors."

The above decision was communicated to Prof. Neera Agarwal, GTB Hospital and Dr. Rakesh Kumar, MAMC, New Delhi vide Council's letter dated 20.09.2004.

The matter was considered by the Ethics Committee at its meeting held on 29^{th} & 30^{th} November, 2004 and it was decided as under:-

"The Ethics Committee unanimously decided that another reminder may be sent to Professor Neera Aggarwal, GTB Hospital, New Delhi and Dr. Rakesh Kumar, Professor of Anesthesiology, MAMC, New Delhi to submit their views latest by 15th December, 2004. The office may contact them personally over the telephone and make the request to submit this report at the earliest."

The above decision was communicated to Dr. Neera Agarwal and Dr. Rakesh Kumar, MAMC, New Delhi vide Council's letter dated 29.12.2004.

In response to above, Dr. Rakesh Kumar, MAMC, New Delhi has sent a letter dated 19.01.2005 .

The matter was again considered by the Ethics Committee at its meeting held on 1st & 2nd April, 2005 and it was decided to call Dr. P. Malathi to appear before the Ethics Committee on 10.05.2005 at 3.00.p.m. as well as to the complainant Dr. K. Srikar Reddy to appear before the Ethics Committee on 11.05.2005 at 11.00.a.m.

The above decisions were communicated to Dr. P. Malathi as well as Dr. K. Srikar Reddy vide Council's letter dated 29.04.2005. Another letters dated 4.05.2005 were also been sent to them wherein requested to appear before the Ethics Committee on 19.05.2005 & 20.05.2005.

The matter was considered by the Ethics Committee at its meeting held on 19th & 20th May, 2005 and it was decided as under:-

"The Ethics Committee noted that complainant Dr K. Srikar Reddy was asked to appear before the Ethics Committee on 20.05.2005 but he failed to do so without any prior intimation. However, Dr. P. Malathi appeared before the Ethics Committee and submitted her statement which is as follows:-

Statement of Dr.P.Malathi

I, Dr.P.Malathi, did my MBBS from Kakatiya Medical College, Warangal in the year 1987 and did my MD (Obst. & Gynae.) in the year 1991 from Gandhi Medical College, Hyderabad. My date of birth is 3.12.1963. My registration Number is 12096 of A.P. Medical Council.

I attended on Mrs.Sreelatha Reddy w/o Dr. K.Srikar Reddy on humanitarian grounds because of the repeated requests made by Dr. Rajesh Khanna and Dr. Srikar Reddy to attend on Mrs.Sreelatha who was in labour. I never examined Mrs.Sreelatha Reddy before. I examined her for the first time only after she seeked admission to Shalini Maternity Hospital. Labour analgesia was demanded.

Epidural Analgesia was given by the Anesthetist Dr. Sudhakar only after counselling the patient, verifying the consent and after pre-anesthetic check up. Dr. Sudhakar was monitoring her continuously for all the likely complications of anaesthesia. I was monitoring the progress of labour and foetal heart with CTG monitor as well as with stethoscope.

For foetal indication caesarean section was decided and accordingly I explained it to Dr.Srikar Reddy. Mrs.Sreelatha and after convincing the need we shifted her to the theatre. She was haemodyanamically stable with fetal heart 120-110 per minute before shifting to theatre. Suddenly she became breathless developed cyanosis and hypotension sudden foetal collapse occurred and foetal heart disappeared after shifting to theatre. All the team members resuscitated her to their best but unfortunately could not save her. To the best of my knowledge the clinical picture suggests Amniotic fluid Embolism.

After given the statement, the Ethics Committee put some questions to Dr.P.Malathi, which is as under:-

Q.1 Whether patient received any pre-loading of IV fluids before giving the labour analysia.

Ans. Yes, she received 2 bottles of RL. It is also documented in the case sheet.(pg.24).

Q.2 The monitors used during labour analysia.

Ans. I have used CTG monitor to assess the foetal heart. Other monitors were used by Anaesthetist.

Q.3. The labor pain status of the sensory level w.r.t. the top-up of epidural drug.

Ans. The patient was complaining of pain and discomfort in between. The anaesthetist was taking care of it. Regarding the sensory level w.r.t the top up of epidural drug I am not competent to comment on it.

- Q.4. Position of the patient during the period of of labor analgesia.
- Ans. She was lying on the lateral position with head end propped up.
- Q.5. The hemodynamic status of the patient from 2.30 a.m. to 4.00 a.m.
- Ans. She was haemodynamically stable conversing well.
- Q.6. Whether resuscitative equipment and drugs were available or not in the area where labor analysis was given?
- Ans. I am sure that Boyles apparatus oxygen cylinders facilities for intubations defibrillator was available. But I do not know if any other further equipment is needed for resuscitation and regarding the drugs for resuscitation. Anesthetist will be in a better position to answer as they are often used by them.
- Q.7. Whether precautions were taken to ascertain the position of the epidural catheter at the time of the initial injection and then subsequent top-ups of the epidural drug?
- Ans. I know that he was checking for the levels above that I am not efficient to make any comments.

Q.8. What lead to the sudden deterioration in the patient's condition at 4.00 a.m.?

Ans. To the best of my knowledge and experience the sudden onset of breathlessness followed by cyanosis, hypotension sudden foetal collapse leading to foetal death, in the peripartum period resistant to the resuscitative measures make me diagnose the antecedant cause as amniotic fluid embolism.

Q.9. If any continuous monitoring was available and used anytime during resuscitation?

Ans. Yes.

Q.10. Whether defibrillator was available or not in the OT, although the rhythm mentioned during resuscitation is highly unlikely to respond to DC shock?

Ans. Defibrillator was available.

(Dr.P.Malathi) Dated: 19th May, 2005.

The Ethics Committee also felt that it will be necessary to call Dr. Shyam Sunder, Consultant of Anesthesiology. Therefore, the Committee decided to ask Dr. Shyam Sunder to appear before the Ethics Committee on the first day of its next meeting at 3.00 p.m. Dr. K. Srikar Reddy may be asked to appear before the Ethics Committee on the second day of its next meeting at 11.00 a.m. failing which it will be presumed that he is no more interested to peruse in this matter."

Dr. Shyam Sunder, Consultant of Anesthesiology has been requested to make it convenient to appear before the Ethics Committee on 24.06.2005 at 11.30 a.m.

The Council has also received a letter dated 22.05.2005 from Dr. K. Srikar Reddy in which it is stated as under:-

"I could not appear before the Ethics Committee meeting on May 20,2005 as the above mentioned letters reached me on May 21,2005.

It is requested that my appearance before the Ethics Committee may be kindly scheduled in the month of August when I would be in India on Home leave. I cannot take leave and visit India in the months of June and July due

to proposed visits of Hon'ble Foreign Minister and Hon'ble Finance Minister to Germany in June and Hon'ble Prime Minister in July.

Further it is requested that the information to me may kindly also be sent through e-mail and Fax to avoid unnecessary postal delay and to give me reasonable time to make travel arrangement to reach India. My e-mail address is **srikarkoppula@yahoo.com** and Fax No. is 0049-30-25795102."

The above matter was considered by the Ethics Committee at its meeting held on $23^{\rm rd}$ & $24^{\rm th}$ June, 2005 and it was decided as under:-

"The Ethics Committee noted that the letter addressed to Dr. Shyam Sundar consultant Anesthesiologist of Shalini Medical Centre has returned back undelivered.

The Ethics Committee decided the following:-

- 1. To obtain an expert opinion from Prof. & Head, Deptt. of Anaesthesia, UCMS, New Delhi and Prof. & Head, O & G, MAMC, New Delhi whether there was any negligence on the part of the Gynecologist or the Anesthesiologist in this particular case with the request to send their expert opinion preferably within 21 days on receipt of this communication.
- 2. Dr.Neera Agarwal & Dr.Rakesh Kumar may be requested to send their expert opinion at the earliest.
- 3. A.P. Medical Council may be requested to provide the present address of Dr.Shyam Sundar and in that address, he may be asked to appear before the Ethics Committee at 11.30 a.m. on the 2nd day at its August meeting.
- 4. Dr. K. Srikar Reddy may be requested to appear before the Ethics Committee at 4.30 p.m. on the first day of August meeting."

The above decisions were communicated to Prof. & Head, Deptt. of Anesthesia, University College of Medical Sciences, Delhi & Prof. Head ,Deptt. Obst. Gynae. MAMC, New Delhi, Dr. Neera Agarwal and Registrar, A.P.Medical Council as well as Dr. K. Srikar Reddy and vide Council letters dated 8.07.2005.

On perusal of the documents it is noted that the reply of Dr. Rakesh Kumar has already been sent vide his letter dated 19.01.2005.

In response to above, the Registrar, A.P. Medical Council has been sent the present address of Dr. T. Shyamsunder vide letter dated 19.07.2005.

Dr. Shyamsunder has been requested to appear before the Ethics Committee on 12.08.2005 at 11.30.a.m vide Council's letter dated 28.07.2005.

The reply of Prof. & HOD, Anesthesia, UCMS, Prof. & HOD, Gynae., MAMC and Dr. Neera Agarwal are still awaited.

The above matter was considered by the Ethics Committee at its meeting held on $11^{\rm th}$ & $12^{\rm th}$ August, 2005 and it was decided as under: -

"The Ethics Committee decided to call Dr.Shyam Sunder, Consultant of Anesthesiology at 3.30 p.m. on the first day of its next meeting on 5^{th} September, 2005 and further decided to request two Gynecologist & two Anesthesiologist of UCMS, Delhi & LHMC, New Delhi to be present as experts at 2.30 p.m. on 5^{th} September, 2005.

Statement of Dr. K. Srikar Reddy

I Dr. K. Srikar Reddy did my MBBS from Kakatiya Medical College, Warangal in 1996. I joined Indian Foreign Service in 2001 and at present posted as Second Secretary in Indian Embassy, Berlin.

I was not satisfied with the procedural aspects followed by the A.P. Medical Council. The APMC did not follow principles of natural justice and the Judgement was given in my absence. So I filed an appeal with the Hon'ble Medical Council of India to review the decision of APMC.

I strongly feel that doctors should be regulated by the Medical Councils rather than Courts. At the same time I feel people go to the Courts because they feel that their grievances are not properly heard by the Medical Councils. I also state that if I get satisfactory outcome from the Hon'ble MCI, I would take back the criminal proceedings against the doctors namely Dr. P. Malathi and Dr. Sudhakar.

I feel that the complications were because of High Spinal due to epidural analgesia as the patient was not properly monitored and not Amniotic fluid embolism. When the complications arose, the

attending anesthetist did not attend the deceased properly and 100% oxygen by way of endotracheal intubation was not given. The deceased was put in trolley in supine position and proper dosages of resuscitation drugs were not given according to the standard protocol. Inspite of repeated appeals by myself, Dr. Rajesh Khanna and Dr. Shyam Sunder, the consultant Obstetrician Dr. Malathi did not perform perimortem cesarean delivery to take out the baby which would have saved both. I would also add that excess dosages of drugs were given for inducing delivery and epidural analgesia was given with out ascertaining the need by the patient.

I appeal to the Hon'ble Ethics Committee that proper decision based on the facts may be taken. The decision shall send a clear message to our colleagues in the medical profession, so that practicing doctors shall feel that there is a impartial regulator watching them and if they do not act prudently, they have to face the punishment. I feel that when India is being promoted as a destination for health tourism, the MCI should send proper and clear message that the patient's rights in India are protected."

Sd/-(Dr. K. Srikar Reddy) 11.08.2005

The above decision has been communicated to Dr. T. Shyamsunder as well as four consultants of Anesthesia and Gynae. , UCMS & LHMC vide Council's letter dated 29.08.2005.

It is further stated that Council has received a letter dated 8.8.2005 from Prof. A.K. Sethi, UCMS, Shahdra.

The matter was considered by the Ethics Committee at its meeting held on 5^{th} & 6^{th} September, 2005 and it was decided as under:-

"The Ethics Committee considered the appeal against the order passed by the A.P. Medical Council on the complaint made by Dr. K. Srikar Reddy, Second Secretary in Embassy of India, Berlin with regard to death of Mrs. Srilatha Reddy. The Ethics Committee invited Prof. & HOD, Obst. & Gynae., & Anaesthesiast of UCMS & LHMC.

The Ethics Committee discuss the matter in detail alongwith the three Prof. & HOD of UCMS & LHMC. They analyzed parawise complaints lodged by Dr. Srikar Reddy as well as the replies received and deposition submitted by the alleged doctors. After detailed deliberation, the following points emerged:-

- 1. The consent form was a generalized form taken during the time of admission but not taken later on prior to epidural analysis.
- 2. No record for pre-anaesthetic check up was found in the case sheet.
- 3. No record of pre Loading was done or not could be substantiated in the records.
- 4. Record of Motor / Sensory level block whether adequate or inadequate- not mention in the case sheet.
- 5. There is no mention whether standard doze was given before the Epidural Analgesia.
- 6. Fatal heart rate could not be checked regularly/monitored properly.
- 7. It was not understood why dopamine was given and not Nor-Epinephrine.
- 8. It is not found from the record whether calcium Gluconate was given or not.
- 9. Three obstetric drugs were administered in combination reason for which could not be explained by the experts. These drugs were also given at frequent intervals and in the higher doze.
- 10. Atropin was administered in a lower doze and should have been about one milligram. An effort could not be taken by administering high doze of Cortico-Steroids about 500 to 1000mm. Perhaps there was a scope of repeat epidural for effective and good spere perimotam could have been done.
- 11. No record was found of Pulse oximeter and oxygen Saturation and whether it was monitored or not.
- 12. No record was found whether two bottles of Ringer-Lactate were given.
- 13. Possibility of high spinal / high epidural was ruled out by the experts.
- 14. The cause of death in this case was very difficult to state. At this point of time however, a rare probability of Amniotic Fluid Emisolism.

After detailed deliberation, the Ethics Committee decided to direct the following doctors namely Dr. P. Malathi, Dr. B.Thejeswari, Dr. L. Sudhakar, Dr. M. Padmanabh Reddy to appear before the Ethics Committee at 2.30 p.m. on 6th October, 2005.

Ethics Committee further decided to request Dr. Neelam Bala Vid, Prof. & HOD, Obst. & Gynae. of UCMS to be present in the Ethics Committee meeting at the same time as an expert to help in this case."

As per above decisions Dr. P. Malathi, Dr. B.Thejeswari, Dr. L. Sudhakar, Dr. M. Padmanabh Reddy have been requested to appear before the Ethics Committee at 2.30 p.m. on 6th October, 2005 vide Council's letter dated 23.09.2005.. Another letter dated 23.09.2005 has been sent to Dr. Neelam Bala Vaid consultant of Obst.& Gynae of UCMS to make it convenient to attend the Ethics Committee meeting on 6th October, 2005 at 2.30.p.m. as an expert.

The following 5 doctors appeared before the Ethics Committee on 6th October, 2005 and their statements are as follows:-

Dr. M. Padmanabh Reddy

I, Dr. M. Padmanabh Reddy did my MBBS from Osmania Medical College in the year 1983 and did my D.Ch. from Kasturba Medical College, Manipal in 1987 and MD (Paed.) in 1989 from the same institute. My registration no. is 11166 of A.P Medical Council. My date of birth is 02.01.1962.

I am a practicing Neonatology's and also the owner of Shalini Maternity Hospital. This Hospital is a well-equipped maternity hospital with all the equipment needed to tackle complications arising out of labour and delivery.

The whole team of doctors namely anesthetists and obstetricians did their best to save the patient. Inspite of their best efforts they could not save the patient and there was no negligence on the part of the anesthetists, obstetricians and the hospital in this case.

Sd/

(Dr. M. Padmanabh Reddy) 06.10.2005

Statement of Dr. L. Sudhakar

- I, Dr. L. Sudhakar did my MBBS from Kakatiya Medical College, Warangal in 1997 and did my Diploma in Anaesthesia from Osmania Medical College in May, 2001. My registration no.is 40224 of A.P. Medical Council. My date of Birth is 25.07.1973.
- Q.1 Whether patient received any pre-loading of IV fluids before giving the labour analgesia.
- Ans. Yes, she received 2 bottles of RL i.e. 1000 ml.
- Q.2 The monitors used during labor analysia.
- Ans.: Yes, I have connected the patient to Multi Channel monitor. It is critic are 8100 monitor which has SPO2, ECG, NIBP, Temp. and respiratory rate probes. I have used SPO2, ECG & NIBP for this patient.
- Q.3 The labor pain status of the sensory level w.r.t. top-up of epidural drug.
- Ans. Sensation to pinprick was monitored after giving the test dose. 10 minutes after the loading dose, and 10 minutes after each top-up dose.
- Q.4 Position of the patient during the period of labor analgesia.
- Ans. She was lying on the lateral position with headend propped up.
- Q.5 The hemodynamic status of the patient from 2.30 a.m. to 4.00 a.m.
- Ans. She was haemodynamically stable and was conversing well.
- Q.6 Whether resuscitative equipment and drugs were available or not in the area where labor analgesia was given.
- Ans. All the emergency drugs and resuscitation equipments were present in the labor room where labor analysis was given.

- Q.7 Whether precaution were taken to ascertain the position of the epidural catheter all the time of the initial dose and then subsequent top-ups of the epidural drug?
- Ans. Before giving the loading dose a test dose of 3 ml of 1.5% lignocaine with adrenaline was given. I waited for 5 minutes and observed that there were no hemodynamic or sensory changes then only I administered the loading dose. Before giving each top-up, I aspirated and confirmed that there was no CSF or Blood in the epidural catheter.
- Q.8 What lead to the sudden deterioration in the patient's condition at 4.00 a.m?
- Ans. To the best of my knowledge the sudden events which occurred in the O.T. leading to foetal collapse followed by maternal collapse and which was refractory to the aggresive treatment given make me diagnose the antecendant cause as amniotic fluid embolism.
- Q.8 Why so many top-ups were given?
- Ans. I followed the technique of low volume intermittent on demand boluses. It is usual practice to give 10 ml. of loading dose followed by 10 to 15 ml. per hour in intermittent technique. In this case I have given lignocaine total dose 100 mg.which was far less than the total amount i.e. 200 mgs. I have given bupivacaine 32.5 mgs. in this case. But the total amount that can be given is 2 mg. Per kg. Bodyweight, which amounts to 120 mgs. in this patient.
- Q.9 No record of Pulse oxymeter and oxygen saturation was found from the case sheet whether it was monitored or not.
- Ans. Oxygen saturation was monitored with pulse oxymeter continuously and it is a usual practice or our team that while patient is on automated monitors, as a safeguard vital stastics are checked manually intermittently and those measures are only documented.
- Q.10 Why Atropine was given in such lower dose.
- Ans. Maximum dose of atropine is 0.03 to 0.04 mgs. per kg bodyweight. In this case I have given 2.4 mgs. which is sufficient for her bodyweight.
- Q.11 Why Corticosteroid was not administerd.
- Ans. Its role is controversial in AFE. After 4.25 a.m. my chief Dr. Shyam Sunder, who was present in the O.T. has taken over the resuscitation and I was helping him
- *Q.12* Why you will not take this case as a High Spinal or High epidural.
- Ans. Symptoms and signs of high spinal or high epidural or high block occur immediately or they would appear not later than 10 minutes after administering the analgesia drugs. Above mentioned events appeared well after last dose (2.30 am.) of drug administered for epidural analgesia. These events appeared at about 3.55 am. Whereas the concentration and quantity of the drugs given to the deceasesd during epidural analgesia is very small that the effect would last at the most for 45 minutes from 2.30 to 3.55 a.m. patient was conversing with her husband. At 3.30 a.m. she was put in lithotomy position and was asked to beardown which she has done 3 or 4 times. Which shows that motor power was intact. Hence, the possibility of above mentioned events due to local anesthetic drugs that were used on the deceased is absolutely ruled out.
- Q.14 Why Lignocaine was administered.
- Ans. Lignocaine is a drug which acts faster than Bupavacaine. As the patient was already in labor with 3 to 4 cms. dilatation I administered Lignocaine so that she could have immediate relief from labor pains which was observed in this case.
- Q.15 Why not post-mortem was done.
- Ans. Post-mortem was suggested to them by my chief Dr. Shyam Sunder, consultant Dr. Malthi and Dr. M.: Padmanabh Reddy but they refused.
- Q.16 Whether you have ACLS certificate or not.
- Ans. Though formally I don't have a ACLS certificate I was trained in ACLS protocols as a postgraduate and later I was working under Dr. Shyam Sunder who is an ACLS instructor and who trains not only resident doctors but even para-medical staff and he is a visiting faculty to Gulf Medical College, Ajman UAE as ACLS instructor.

As a responsible prudent anesthesiologist and as a friend of Dr. K. Srikar Reddy and Dr. Rajesh Khama I alongwith Dr. Shyam Sunder, Dr. Malthi, Dr. Tejeshwari have done every thing that was possible to save life of the deceased and we have professionally behaved as prudent doctors.

Statement of Dr.Shyam Sunder

I, Dr.Shyam Sunder did my MBBS from Gandhi Medical College, Hyderabad in the year 1993 and did my MD (Anaesthesia) from Aurangabad Medical College, Aurangabad in the year 1997. My date of birth is 9.9.1958. My Registration number is 10618 of A.P. Medical Council.

I am working as a consultant (Anaesthesia) Critical Care. In this particular case, I received a phone call on 6th March, 2003 at 4.05 a.m. from Shalini Hospital, Hyderabad saying one patient who came for Epidural Anaesthesia for labour had Cardiac arrest come for help. I reached at 4.30 a.m. and found the patient in the operation theatre of Shalini Hospital on the stretcher. She was in comatose condition and being ventilated with ET tube and Cardiac message is being done by two Anesthetists and two Obst. & Gynaecologist who were present in the O.T. The ECG showed a straight line. I have resuscitated the patient with defibrillator and drugs like Atropine and Adrenaline. There was no change in the ECG rhythm. The patient's pupils were fixed and dilated and pulse and BP never improved. Resuscitation was continued for one hour and the patient was declared dead at 5.30 a.m.

- *Q.* What is the probable cause of death in this particular case.
- A. The first probable cause is amniotic fluid embolism and probably high epidural anaesthesia.
- Q. Why Anesthetist was given in the labour room.
- A. Because it is the routine practice.

Sd/

(Dr.Shyam Sunder)

Statement of Dr. Thejeswari. B

I, Dr. Thejeswari.B did my MBBS from Kasturba Medical College, Manipal in the year 1991 and did my MD (Obst. & Gynae.) from Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Belgaum in the year 1996. My date of birth is 9.8.1967. My registration number is 20501 of A.P. Medical Council.

I am a Resident doctor working at Shalini Hospital, Hyderabad since 2001. My role is to take care of inpatients and out patients of Shalini Hospital and also assist the consultants who admit their patients from time to time at Shalini Hospital.

Mrs.Srilata Reddy (patient) was admitted at Shalini Hospital under care of Dr.Malathi on 5.3.2003 at 11.45 p.m. with complaints of draining P.V since morning. Patient was admitted at another hospital at 8.00 a.m. and was administered syntocinon drip. Syntocinon drip was stopped in the evening. As the husband of the patient was not happy with the facilities he met Dr.Malathi through a common friend and shifted the patient. Patient was given epidural analgesia on demand by Anesthetist, Dr.Sudhakar. All through Dr.Malathi, Dr.Sudhakar and myself were present with the patient. At 3.40 a.m. as there was fetal distress patient was decided for emergency LSCS. In the theatre just before patient could be shifted to the OT table, patient became restless, hypotension and cynosis. At this juncture, fetal heart was absent and the same was confirmed with CTG. Cynosis improved transiently with IV Fluid and Oxygen. Immediately patient threw convulsion and had cardiac arrest. Despite of all efforts till 5.30 a.m. patient could not be revived. Looking at the events and their rapid progress and not recovered with treatment, amniotic fluid embolism diagnosis was made.

Sd/

(Dr. Thejeswari B)

Statement of Dr. P. Malathi

I, Dr. P. Malathi, did my MBBS from Kakatiya Medical College, Warangal in the year 1987 and I did my Postgraduation in MD (Obst. & Gynae.) in the year 1991 from Gandhi Medical College, Hyderabad. My registration No. is 12096 of Andhra Medical Council. My Date of Birth 03.12.1963.

I am working as Assistant Professor/CAS in the Government Maternity Hospital attached with the Osmamia Medical College, Hyderabad as an Obstetrician joined the service in January, 1992.

As per the previous rule of the Government any doctor who has joined after 1987 is not permitted to practice in private capacity. I took up the responsibility of this particular case on the request of a doctor's friend on humanitarian grounds without any monitory consideration.

So far as my knowledge goes Shalini Maternity Hospital, got most of the equipment to tackle emergency situation. I am not sure where ventilator or ABG is available or not.

In so far as the administration of a combination of 3 drugs namely Drotin/Epidosin/Buscopan this combination was given in labour as the labour was more than 12 hours h/o draining since 8 a.m. with partially effaced cervix. There were no side effects and optimal cervical response was observed during their usage. These drugs are routinely used at my working place at Govt. Maternity Hospital. A protocol of combination of drugs is practiced in our hospital.

Though, I have hardly attended 10 to 12 labour cases in the Shalini Maternity Hospital during the period 2001-03 and all these cases were relatives and friends of mine from whom I have not taken any monitory consideration.

However to my knowledge I am not aware of any rules and regulations prohibiting a government doctor in service from attending upon a patient who either is a relative or friend when it does not involve any monitory consideration of fees or consultancy.

On a question from the members of the Ethic Committee about whether a very experienced Anesthetist in this course of the condition of the patient could have been different or not or the treatment part is different or not I am to say that generally the approach of any anesthetist with experience always depends on the given situation exigency with minor variations as per their own individual protocols.

The foetal monitoring by me was done continuously. Two bottles of ringer lactate was given which has been recorded in the case sheet.

On the question from the Ethic Committee about the working with this particular Anesthetist earlier I am to state that I exactly do not remember if I have worked with this particular Anesthetist.

I have suggested alongwith other attending doctors regarding conduction of Post mortem but they have refused.

A question was put forwarded by the Ethics Committee regarding the probable cause of death in this particular case. I am to state that apart from AFE(Amniotic Fleud Embolism) a possibility of total spinal cannot be surely ruled out.

Sd. (Dr. P. Malathi) 06.10.2005

The Ethics Committee decided to take action in this regard at its next meeting.

The Ethics Committee considered the appeal against the Order passed by Andhra Pradesh Medical Council in the complaint made by Dr. K. Srikar Reddy, Third Secretary in Emabassy of India, Berlin, and after perusal of the records available and deposition of specialists mentioned in the complaints and also the experts (Gynaecologists and Anaesthesiasists) whose opinion was sought by the Ethics Committee of MCI along with all other relevant papers, documents, files, including the documents provided by Andhra Pradesh Medical Council as well as the explanations submitted by the respective parties,

which were placed before the Ethics Committee, the Ethics Committee deliberated and discussed all these in detail and came to the unanimous opinion that –

- (a) Dr. L. Sudhakar, Anaesthesiasist is found to be guilty so far as the professional negligence is concerned in the instant case. Therefore, taking this into account, the Ethics Committee of MCI recommends that his name be stuck off from the Indian Medical Register for a period of 3 months.
- (b) Negligence could not be substantiated against Dr. P. Malthi, Gynaecologist, however, she may be cautioned to be very careful in the future in treating serious patients.
- (c) With regard to the deficiencies of the equipment and monitoring of the critically ill patients in the Nursing Home, the matter may be brought to the notice of DHS, Andhra Pradesh for taking necessary action under the Clinical Establishment Act."

44. Clarification as requested by Dr. H.S. Kalra.

Read: The letter dated 30-10-2004 from Dr. H.S. Kalra seeking some clarifications along with the decision of the Ethics Committee.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council noted the following decision of the Ethics Committee dated 19th & 20th January,2006:-

"The Ethics Committee considered the clarification requested by Dr.H.S.Kalra and decided to request him to consult Indian Medical Council (Professional conduct, Etiquette and Ethics) Regulations, 2002 as amended from time to time as well as Medical Council of India Regulations on Graduate Medical Education, 1997.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council deliberated upon the matter and was of the opinion that in emergency situation where no qualified/trained specialist is available a registered graduate (MBBS) is entitled to perform a caesarean as life saving measure.

45. <u>Complaint against doctors of Landour Community Hospital, Mussoorie as alleged</u> by Dr. Avinash Shastry.

Read: The complaint against doctors of Landour Community Hospital, Mussoorie as alleged by Dr. Avinash Shastry alongwith the decision of the Ethics Committee.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the matter and decided to approve the following decision of the Ethics Committee dated 19th & 20th January,2006:-

"The Ethics Committee considered the matter of complaint lodged by Dr. Avinash Shashtri against the doctors of Landour Community Hospital, Mussoorie and noted the following:-

- 1. It appears that two foreign doctors worked in Landour Community Hospital, Mussoorie. They are
 - a. Dr. Caryn Wilson, Obstetrician and Gynaecologist from South Africa
 - b. Dr. Games P. Handersion from USA
- 2. It appears that Dr. Caryn Wilson is a citizen of Republic of South Africa, is an Obstetrician and Gynaecologist who came to India on 30.6.2003 and had valid Visa till 29.06.2006. She has apparently left India in December 2005.
- 3. It also appears that Dr. James P. Handerson is a USA citizen who entered India on 28.05.2003 and has a Visa valid till 27.05.2013 and is still in India.
- 4. It appears that both doctors were offering voluntary health consultation and leading in Landour Community Hospital from the time immediately after their entry. This fact is

- revealed by the letter sent by Landour Community Hospital dated 10.01.2006, received by the Council on 15.1.2006.
- 5. It appears that both the above doctors were practicing as Medical Consultants in voluntary capacity at Landour Community Hospital without any valid permission from Medical Council of India. There are no records available in the Registration Section of MCI (as informed by MCI to Ethics Committee) that they have applied for permission to practice in India after they had arrived at India and were working at Landour Community Hospital. In fact, the Landour Community Hospital authorities has sent a Xerox Copy of the application of Dr. James P. Handerson for permission to service/practice in India u/s 14(1) of the IMC Act, 1956 on 13.10.2005 only. However, the original application has not yet reached MCI.

The Ethics Committee after detailed deliberation took a serious note of the matter under consideration and was of the unanimous opinion that:

- a. Dr. Caryn Wilson of South Africa and Dr. James P. Handerson of USA was doing unauthorized medical practice at Landour Community Hospital without any valid permission to practice medicine in India in any capacity from competent authorities.
- b. Thus, they have intentionally violated Indian Law and are liable to be prosecuted and punished.
- C The Landour Community Hospital, Mussoorie authorities represented by Dr. San Thomas, Medical Superintendent are accomplices in violating established laws and procedures of Republic of India and are liable to be prosecuted and punished.
- d. Dr. San Thomas, Medical Superintendent, Landour Community Hospital may be called to present before the Ethics Committee at 11.00 AM on the 2nd Day of its next meeting and to explain why measures under Ethics Regulations may not be initiated against him.
- E. The District Magistrate, DHS Uttaranchal, D.G. Uttaranchal, Health Secretary, Uttaranchal Govt. be informed about this matter of violation of Law of the land by foreigners with a request to take necessary steps in accordance with law at their end.
- F. The DGHS, Health Secretary, Govt. of India (Secretary, M. Ed. Of GOI) be informed regarding this case.
- G The South African Medical Council and Medical Council of USA /Health related Boards, State of Tennessee, USA be informed regarding this violation.

Clarification of the term "medical geneticist" appearing at Rule 2 (g) of the Preconception and Pre-natal Diagnostic Techniques (Prohibition of Sex Selection) Act, 1994 & amendments thereto –Sought for.

Read: The letter dated 23-09-2005 from Dr. Shushil Chandra Pal seeking clarification of the term "medical geneticist" appearing at Rule 2 (g) of the Pre-conception and Pre-natal Diagnostic Techniques (Prohibition of Sex Selection) Act, 1994 & amendments thereto along with the decision of Ethics Committee.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council noted the following decision of the Ethics Committee dated 20th & 21st March,2006:-

"The Ethics Committee considered the letter of Dr. Sushilchandra Pal wherein he has requested to clarify him whether he is eligible to act as a medical geneticist as per PC & P.N.D.T. Act, 1994 because of the qualification and experience he has already acquired.

The Ethics Committee after detailed deliberation decided to inform him that he is eligible to be termed as Medical Geneticist for all intends and purposes and terms applies according to Section 2(g) of the P.C. and P.N.D.T. Act, 1994.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to refer the matter to the P.N.D.T. Cell of the concerned State.

47 <u>Appeal against the Order passed by the Delhi Medical Council as requested by Dr. Col. V.K. Mehta.</u>

Read: The Appeal against the Order passed by the Delhi Medical Council as requested by Dr. Col. V.K. Mehta alongwith the decision of the Ethics Committee.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the matter and decided to approve the following decision of the Ethics Committee dated 19th & 20th January,2006:-

"The Ethics Committee considered the matter and noted the statement of Dr.V.K. Mehta which reads as under:-

STATEMENT OF DR. V.K. MEHTA

Further Dr.Mehta could not produce the original/certified copy of the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi order regarding referring this matter to the MCI.

Submission of Col. V.K. Mehta, Ethics Committee put forward some questions which were replied by Dr.V.K. Mehta which are as follows:-

Who actually performed the operation?

- A. Dr.Divya Sharma performed the operation and I actively assisted her alongwith Dr.Arti Mittal.
- *R.* What type of operation was performed?
- A. Sub-total Hysterectomy.
- Q. Was there any interference done before the operation to the Sub-total Hysterectomy?
- A. Since the patient had retained placenta and was having PPH. Manual Evacuation of placenta was done and the placenta was adherent to the fundus of the uterus. Since patient continued to bleed, uterine packing was resorted to by Dr.Arti Mittal.
- Q. Whether there was any uterine rupture during this interference stated above?
- A. No.
- Q. What was the reason for such heavy bleeding in that case which led to sub-total Hysterectomy?
 - A. Since the patient had retained placenta and was adherent to fundus leading to atonic PPH.
 - Q. The patient was ultimately referred to Safdarjung Hospital. Why it was not done earlier when the patient was suffering from such massive PPH as stated by you?
 - A. The patient was in the operation theatre in shock being managed effectively. Blood was being arranged. Transferring the patient in shock at mid night can lead to fatal accident and the patient was being managed by four doctors and it was a joint decision to tackle this patient in the Nursing Home in the best interest of the patient.
 - Q. Is there any document available with you in this regard?
 - A. Yes, it is mentioned in the case sheet.
 - *Q* Why the patient was ultimately sent to Safdarjung Hospital lateron?
 - A. On review in the morning patient was haemodynamically unstable inspite of four pints of blood and two haemecl. A possibility of reactionary heomarrage/coagulopathy was considered and team consulted and it was decided to transfer the patient to Safdarjung Hospital.
 - Q. Is there any document available to you who took the decision regarding this case to Safdarjung Hospital?

- A. I took the decision after consulting the other treating doctors.
- Q. Were you having the basic facilities in your Nursing Home to manage this case?
- A. Yes.
- Q. Was Coglopathy was a clinical diagnosis only?
- A. Yes, it was clinical suspicion.
- Q. Is Dr. Divya Sharma, Gynecologist is working with you?
- A. Yes, she was working with me.
- Q. Is there any note of Dr.Divya Sharma that she performed the operation or she took the decision or any advise of treatment?
- A. She has not written note since it was late night and early morning. The notes by the Anaesthetist/Asstt. Surgeon Dr.V.K. Mehta say that Dr.Divya Sharma was there in the Surgery.
- Q. Dr. Mehta have not submitted the the original/certified copy of the order of the Hon'ble High Court regarding referring this matter to the MCI from which you are requested to submit by you long back. Any information regarding this?
- A. I had taken the High Court order to my Civil Writ Petition No.19695 of 2004 from case status information system. However a certified copy of the same will be submitted as early as possible.

Sd/-(Dr.V.K. Mehta)

The Ethics Committee went through all the documents and disposition pertaining to this case and has observed that :-

- a) Dr.V.K. Mehta is a general surgeon and M.Ch. Urology but has got no formal training, experience of Obst. & Gynae. Operations. No documents were profaned by Dr.V.K. Mehta in this regard.
- b) It was seen that in the operation that was carried out on the patient, the operation note or hospital records do not contain any noting or signature of the Obst. & Gynaecologist at any place. Signifying her consent, agreement or physical involvement in the operation treatment procedure.
- c) It was also seen that in the treatment of the patient, the patient was not referred to Safdarjung Hospital in the first place, but was subsequently referred to the Safdarjung Hospital after the operation.

In view of the above, it appears beyond doubt that, Dr.(Col.) V.K. Mehta, has clearly crossed the boundary and is treating in areas where he is not having competence. The Ethics Committee feels that the observations made by DMC in the instant case that "Dr.V.K. Mehta is practicing in areas which are beyond the scope of this training, qualification and experience" is valid and upholds the steps taken by DMC in this case.

48. <u>Confirmation of Doctorate Title Conferred Upon Shri K.C. Meren Physiotherapist regarding.</u>

Read: The letter dated 14-12-2005 from the Joint Secretary Govt. of Nagaland seeking confirmation weather a person who has completed three years diploma course in Physiotherapy alongwith 6 months internship from National Instt. of Orthopaedically Handicapped, Calcutta can use the title of "Doctor" or not along with the decision of the Ethics Committee.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the matter and decided to approve the following decision of the Ethics Committee dated 20th & 21st March,2006:-

"The Ethics Committee noted the clarification asked by the Joint Secretary, Govt. of Nagaland, Health and Family Welfare Department and decided to reply as under:-

Question: Kindly clarify us specifically whether a person who has completed 3 years

Diploma course in Physiotherapy along with 6 months internship from National Institute for Orthopaedically Handicapped, Calcutta can use the

title of "Doctor" or not.

Answer: No"

49. <u>P.E.S Instt. of Medical Sciences & Research, Kuppam – Renewal of permission for admission of 5th batch of students for the academic session 2006-2007.</u>

Read: The inspection report (10th & 11th April, 2006) of P.E.S Instt. of Medical Sciences & Research, Kuppam for renewal of permission for admission of 5th batch of MBBS students for the academic session 2006-07.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (10th & 11th April,2006) and noted the following:-

1(a) In relation to certain Declaration Forms submitted on behalf of the Medical teachers and endorsed by the Principal of the medical college, it was observed/found that teaching experience shown in those Declaration Forms is incorrect and in certain cases, it was seriously doubted. The office of the Council had undertaken the exercise of verifying the individual particulars regarding the claimed teaching experience from the Medical institutions concerned and found their claim to be fake. The following teaching faculty cannot be considered as the experience certificates submitted by them are forged as shown below:

#	Name	Designation	Department	Remarks
1.	Dr. M Ramaswamy	Asstt. Prof.	Community Medicine	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal from 01.04.2001 to 30.03.2004 as Tutor and has acquired dgree of M.D. (SPM) in 2004. In its letter Kasturba Medical Colleg, Manipal has stated that he has not acquired degree of M.D. (SPM) from the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged degree certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
2.	Dr. P. Mallikarjuna Rao	Assoc. Prof.	Physiology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Kasturba Medical College, Manipal from 1990 to 1993 as Tutor and from 10.06.1993 to 10.01.2002 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter Kasturba Medical Colleg, Manipal has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
3.	Dr. T. Suresh Kumar	Asstt. Prof.	Physiology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at

				Instt. of Road Transport,
				Perundurai Medical College, Erode from 30.01.2001 to 10.10.2004 as Lecturer. In its letter Instt. of Road Transport, Perundurai Medical College, Erode has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
4	Dr. M.S. Sridhar	Asso. Prof.	Surgery	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at M.S. Ramaiah Medical College, Bangalore from 01.09.1988 to 30.09.1993 as Asst. Prof. and from 01.10.1993 to 30.09.2006 as Asso. Prof. In its letter M.S. Ramaiah Medical College, Bangalore has stated that he has worked only as Asst. Prof. upto 06.05.1996 and has not worked as Asso. Prof. at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
5.	Dr. Radesh S.	Asstt.Prof.	Radio- Diagnosis	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at M.S. Ramaiah Medical College, Bangalore from 1998 to 30.12.2001 as Asso. Prof. In its letter M.S. Ramaiah Medical College, Bangalore has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
6.	Dr. Prakash B.C.	Assoc. Prof.	Anaesthesia	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at J.S.S. Medical College, Mysore, from Dec.,1996 to April,1998 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter J.S.S. Medical College, Mysore has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
7.	Dr. S.V. Chinnappa	Prof. & Head	Anatomy	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Kempegowda Instt. of Medical Sciences, Bangalore from 1993 to 1996 as Tutor, 1996 to 2001

		1	T	T
				as Asstt. Prof. and 2001 to Aug.,2005 as Assoc. Prof In its letter Kempegowda Instt. of Medical Sciences, Bangalore has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
8.	Dr. C.N. Krishnamoorthy	Prof. & HOD	Psychiatry	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Kempegowda Instt. of Medical Sciences, Bangalore from Aug.,2001 to Oct.,2005 as Assoc. Prof In its letter Kempegowda Instt. of Medical Sciences, Bangalore has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
9.	Dr. G.N. Byra Reddy	Prof. & Head	ENT	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Kempegowda Instt. of Medical Sciences, Bangalore from 26.04.1985 to 10.09.1995 as Asstt. Prof. and 11.09.1995 to 05.12.1996 Professor and 06.12.1996 to 30.09.2000 as Professor & HOD. In its letter Kempegowda Instt. of Medical Sciences, Bangalore has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
10.	Dr. Gopinath Rajesh	Asstt. Prof.	Pathology	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Govt. Medical College, Mysore, from 1999 to 2002 as Tutor. In its letter Govt. Medical College, Mysore has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
11.	Dr. Sangle Manikrao Prabhakar	Professor	Forensic Medicine	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore from 15.06.1993 to 08.06.1999 as Asstt. Prof In its letter Kasturba Medical College, Mangalore has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has

				submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.
12.	Dr. Vivek Shenoy	Asstt. Prof.	Community Medicine	In his declaration form he has claimed that he has worked at Sri Devraj Urs Medical College, Kolar from 02.01.1996 to 30.05.2003 as Asstt. Prof. In its letter Sri Devraj Urs Medical College, Kolar has stated that he has not worked at all in the institution. Thus he has submitted a false and forged experience certificate and therefore cannot be accepted as a teacher.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council were, therefore, were clearly of the view that the Council should take steps for referring these cases to the Police authorities for registration of FIRs and conducting investigations in all such cases. It was observed that in the complaint to be sent to the Police authorities, it should also be clearly requested that all those cases where there is a collusion and conspiracy of such persons with the management of the colleges, the necessary action should also be taken against the management of those colleges. It was further decided that appropriate action be taken against these Doctors in accordance with Professional Conduct (Etiquette and Ethics) Regulations, 2002.

(b) The following teacher has been found to be working at more than one medical college during the inspection for academic year 2006-2007:-

#	Name	Designation	Department	Colleges where present during
				inspection for 2006-2007
1	Dr. D. Negen Kumar	Professor	Microbiology	(a) P.E.S. Institute of Medical
				Sciences, Kuppam
				(b) Institute of Medical Sciences,
				Bhubaneshwar
2	Dr. V. Srinivasulu	Assoc. Prof.	* Forensic	(a) MVJ Medical College, Bangalore
			Medicine	(b) P.E.S. Institute of Medical
				Sciences, Kuppam
				(iii) Mediciti Institute of Medical
				Sciences, Ghanpur

^{*} Regarding, Dr. V. Srinivasulu, on perusal of the declaration forms and its enclosures of the above mentioned colleges, it is noted that in the declaration of MVJ Medical College, Bangalore, the registation number and date of issue are different. Similarly, in the declaration of PES Insstt. Of Medical Sciences, Kuppam, the department, date of birth and photograph of Dr.Srinivaslu are different. However, the enclosures attached with the declaration forms of Dr. Srinivaslu are same.

(c) The following teacher has been found to be working at more than one medical college simultaneously:-

#	Name	Designation	Department	Colleges where present during
				inspection for 2006-2007
1	Dr. Vinod Kumar	Assoc. Prof.	Orthopaedics	(a) P.E.S. Institute of Medical
				Sciences, Kuppam
				(b) Dr. B.R. Ambedkar Medical
				College, Bangalore

(d) In view of above, the shortage of teaching staff is as under

- i) The shortage of teaching faculty is more than 10% as under :
 - i) Professor: 1 (ENT-1, Radiodiagnosis-1, Anaesthesia-1)
 - ii) Assoc. Prof.: 14 (Anatomy-1, Physiology-1, Pathology-1, Microbiology-1, Forensic Med.-1, PSM-2, Psychiatry-1, Paediatrics-1, TB & Chest-1, DVL 1, Surgery-1, Radiodiagnosis-2)
 - iii) Asst. Professor : 2 (General Surgery-1, Pathology-1)
 - iv) Tutor: 7 (Physiology-1, Biochemistry-1, Pathology-1, Microbiology-1, Forensic Medicine-1, PSM-2)
- b) The shortage of Residents is more than 5% (7 out of 103) as under :
 - i) Sr. Resident: 2 (General Medicine-1, Paediatrics-1)
 - ii) Jr. Resident: 5 (TB & Chest-1, Ophthalmology-1, Orthopaedics-3)
- 2. The books in the departmental libraries are inadequate as under :-

Skin & VD – 65, Psychiatry-65 Orthopaedics-64 ENT – 62 Ophthalmology-65 Radiodiagnosis – 72

- 3. PHC is under the control of the Govt. and the college is allowed to use its facilities for teaching purposes.
- 4. There is one part time Veterinary Officer.
- 5. Other deficiencies/remarks are in the main report.

In view of above, the members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of 5th batch of MBBS students at P.E.S Instt. of Medical Sciences & Research, Kuppam for the academic session 2006-07.

50. <u>Krishna Instt. of Medical Sciences, Karad - Renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of students against the increased intake i.e. 100 to 150 for the academic session.</u>

Read: The inspection report (10th & 11th April, 2006) of Krishna Instt. of Medical Sciences, Karad for renewal of permission for admission of 2nd batch of MBBS students against the increased intake i.e. 100 to 150 for the academic session 2006-2007.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the Council Inspectors report (10th & 11th April, 2006) and decided to recommend to the Central Govt. to renew the permission for admission of 2nd batch of students against the increased intake i.e. from 100 to 150 at Krishna Instt. of Medical Sciences, Karad for the academic session 2006-07.

51. <u>Approval of Subharati Medical College, Meerut for the award of MBBS degree</u> granted by Dr. Bhim Rao Ambedkar University, Agra

Read: The inspection report (6th & 7th April, 2006) of Subharati Medical College, Meerut for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. Bhim Rao Ambedkar University, Agra.

The members of the Adhoc Committee appointed by the Hon'ble Supreme Court and of the Executive Committee of the Council considered the matter with regard to approval of Subharati Medical College, Meerut for the award of MBBS degree granted by Dr. Bhim Rao Ambedkar University, Agra and decided to form a Sub-Committee comprising of following members to look into the matter:-

- 1. Dr. (Mrs.) Sneh Bhargava, Ex-Director, AIIMS and Member, PG Committee, MCI
- 2. Dr. C.V. Bhirmanandham, Vice-Chancellor, the Tamilnadu Dr. M.G.R. Medical University, Chennai
- 3. Dr. (Mrs.) Alka Kriplani, Professor of Obst. & Gynae., AIIMS, New Delhi.
- 4. Dr. Mukesh Kumar Sharma, Member, Executive Committee, MCI.

The Committee further decided to defer the consideration of the matter till the report is submitted by the Sub-Committee.

Lt. Col. (Retd.) Dr. A.R.N. Setalvad) Secretary

New Delhi, dated the 24th April,2006

APPROVED

(Dr. P.C. Kesavankutty Nayar) President (Acting)